University of Huddersfield Repository

Jarvis, Christine and Gouthro, Patricia

The Role of the Arts in Professional Education: Surveying the Field

Original Citation

Jarvis, Christine and Gouthro, Patricia (2015) The Role of the Arts in Professional Education: Surveying the Field. Studies in the Education of Adults, 47 (1). pp. 64-80. ISSN 0266-0830

This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/23538/

The Role of the Arts in Professional Education: Surveying the Field

Christine Jarvis, University of Huddersfield; Patricia Gouthro, Mount St. Vincent University.

Abstract

Many educators of professionals use arts-based approaches, but often explore this within the confines of their own professional disciplines. This paper consists of a thematic review of the literature on arts and professional education, which cuts across professional disciplines in an attempt to identify the specific contribution the arts can make to professional education. The review identified five broad approaches to the use of the arts in professional education: exploring their role in professional practice, illustrating professional issues and dilemmas, developing empathy and insight, exploring professional identities and developing self-awareness and interpersonal expression. Woven through these approaches we found that the development of a more sophisticated epistemology and a critical social perspective were common outcomes of art-based work in professional education. Arts-based approaches may help learners to make a critical assessment of their own roles and identities within professions, and to consider the impact of professions in shaping the broader society.

Purpose of the review

Professional studies programs have grown in importance in adult and higher education. The emphasis has historically been pragmatic, with learners expected to develop clearly articulated skills related to workplace needs. The impact of globalisation, rapidly evolving technologies and shifting workplace contexts has led, however, to what Barnett (2008) refers to as a time of supercomplexity. Educators need to prepare professionals to develop the capacity to work in fluid, changing, and uncertain circumstances. Education that is characterised by a

technical-rational framework (Habermas, 1972) does not prepare learners adequately to deal with ambiguity and complexity. The use of the arts in professional studies may be one way to engage learners in developing the creative, critical and self-reflective capabilities they will need.

We are aware than adult educators have enthusiastically and critically explored how the arts inform various learning contexts (Butterwick, 2012; Clover and Sandford 2013, Jarvis, 2012a; Prins, 2010; Tett, Anderson, McNeill, Overy and Sparks, 2012; Tisdell & Thompson, 2007) but there is scope for further work exploring the contribution arts can make to *professional* education specifically, at a time of global change and challenge to the work of professionals. Although many educators discuss using arts in their individual professional contexts (Harrison and Akinc, 2000; Corcos, 1993; Joseph and Mertez, 2000; Kinsella, 2007; Muroaka, 2009), the contribution of the arts to professional education more generally is rarely addressed. We believe that reviewing this work across a range of professional disciplines will assist in disseminating the multifarious uses of the arts in professional education, and in exploring the nature of their distinctive contribution.

We organised the material we reviewed into five categories reflecting their use in professional education:

1. Learning to use arts in professional practice

2. Using arts to illustrate complex concepts and dilemmas

3. Arts for empathy and insight

4. The role of the arts in the construction of professional identities and discourses

5. Arts, self-awareness and interpersonal skill development

Two related themes – epistemological challenge and critical social perspectives cut across these categories. First, the arts support professionals to develop a more sophisticated

epistemological understanding that helps them recognise that knowledge is constructed; that there can be many right solutions to professional challenges. In this way the arts appear to help professionals cope with change and uncertainty. Second, some educators consciously use arts to help professionals develop a critical understanding of their work, unmask oppressive practices and understand and express their own concerns about injustice. Others use their work in a more humanistic framework to develop empathy and insights into the needs of marginalised populations, but do not have an explicitly political intent. We discuss these two inter-related themes, epistemological challenge and critical social perspective, before going on to outline the conduct of the review and to summarise each of the five categories.

Epistemological Challenge: Questions of knowledge and identity

There is a substantial literature on the professions, which we cannot address fully, but which needs some discussion to secure the case for the particular value of the arts at this time and in this global context. Definitions of classical/ ideal-type professions (Freidson, 2001) focus on their self-regulatory, autonomous nature; others discuss the changing nature of professional occupations, including the loss of those properties of autonomy and self-regulation often considered integral to professionalism (Halsey, 1992; Crook, 2008; Whitty, 2008). We use the term profession to refer to a changing range of occupational categories such as accountancy, law, management, engineering and health and education professions, requiring specific expertise as a result of high level specialised education and training (usually regulated by a professional, statutory or government body), the exercise of a degree of autonomy and decision making power, engagement with ethical issues and codes of practice and the management of unclear/ ill-structured problems. Barnett (2008) argues:

> …the hard-pressed professional is faced with an identity crisis. Is professionalism a matter of being a knowledgeable expert or of meeting clients' wants or of managing resources efficiently or of entrepreneurial nous? Is it a private, a public, a bureaucratic or a performative mode of being that is called for? (p.195).

He contends that professionals have to operate within multiple discourses of professionalism. This suggests that effective professionals must recognise how such discourses construct the many, often contradictory expectations placed on them. Moreover, as the certainties that characterised professional knowledge and expertise become ever more challengeable, a higher proportion of professional work is 'ill-structured'. Professionals are faced with a range of solutions to the challenges their expertise is meant to address. Multiple, even contradictory solutions could be characterised as right, depending on the perspective taken, the discourses in operation and the ethical framework adopted.

The arts challenge our epistemological perspectives by developing tolerance for ambiguity (Eisner, 2002), which facilitates the management of those multiple discourses and ill-structured problems. In his discussion of symbolic and figurative processes, Eisner argues that the arts stimulate the imagination, which 'engenders images of the possible' and 'enables us to try things out' (2002, p.5). When we engage with or create art we use our senses to make one thing represent another – things are not always what they seem and our interpretive faculties can produce many meanings from one work of art. Art can break through our preconceptions and enable us to accept that there may be multiple interpretations of an apparently simple object or situation.

Artistic practice is often inherently experimental, having an infinite array of possible outcomes and through art one is also encouraged to explore complex and diverse situations.

4

Eisner (2002, p. 77-78) identifies the capacity of the arts to enable people to develop 'the improvisational side of their intelligence' because they need to respond and react with insight to the immediate situation, making judgements as they go along – there is no final rule book to work by. The various elements of arts work, Eisner argues, build in people a 'disposition to tolerate ambiguity, to explore what is uncertain' (2002, p.10). Arts expose them to the constructive nature of meaning making, so that they recognise how individuals read the world differently from within their own frame of reference.

Professionals need to work closely and effectively with groups and individuals with varying, often contradictory, world views and value systems. For example, Taylor and Alfred (2010) discovered that nurses found 'caring for culturally diverse clients' … 'challenging and frustrating' and identified lack of training and understanding of cultural differences as significant contributory factors. This suggests that a capacity to accept and identify differing interpretations of reality is central to successful professional practice, given the increase in diversity in workplaces. Arts based education is integral to the development of cognitive and affective orientations that facilitate this precisely because openness to multiple perspectives, contradictory meaning and the creative processes involved in making meaning is central to critical engagement with the arts.

Reviewing the field indicated that the arts' capacity to stimulate professionals to think about knowledge more inclusively often underpinned the educative process. This development of an open and interpretive approach, of a more inclusive epistemology, was important with respect to the second cross-cutting theme – critical social perspectives. Kinsella (2007) powerfully articulates the relationship between the two themes: She argues that education for health professionals needs to avoid promoting a 'false sense of certainty' and demonstrates how

5

narrative art opens professionals' eyes to multiple ways of seeing the world, which in turn enables them to challenge 'conventional work practices and the hegemony of urban work environments', unmasking and subverting oppressive power in the process (p. 43).

Brookfield's (2005) work also reflects the relationship between the two themes we identified. He draws upon Marcuse (1978) to discuss the revolutionary potential of art. The value of the arts is perceived to be linked to the dissonance or sense of estrangement that is part of a deep aesthetic experience. Revolutionary or critical thought is difficult to engender without this openness to alternative perspectives. When one is immersed in music, enthralled by a play, buried in a novel, or captivated by an artistic masterpiece, mental space opens up that creates the possibility for deeper, critical thought.

Critical Social Perspectives

One of the first scholars to take up Habermasian theory and apply it to the field of adult education was Jack Mezirow (1981), whose seminal article draws on his framework to organise learning into three domains; technical, practical, and emancipatory. These categories are useful in considering the different strategies used in professional educational programs. Technical-rational learning is characterised by a means-end approach that is predominant in many professional educational contexts as it is outcome driven, with an emphasis on measurement and accountability. Learning that addresses interpersonal understanding, or more humanistic approaches, fits into the second category of 'practical' learning. Educators in the professions often use arts to evoke empathy and to enhance professionals' understanding of different perspectives in their workplaces. The arts may be used to foster better insights into the circumstances of people in marginalised positions, or create awareness of issues pertaining to

6

equity and fairness. Such educators may not label their work as having a social justice orientation or link it to the idea of initiating broader social change. The intent is to create deeper personal insights to inform the role of professional health care provider, educator, or social worker and to shape their practice in the field.

The third level is a critical or emancipatory approach to learning that involves a deepening of communicative understanding and has a more political orientation. There is a well-established tradition in adult education of using the arts to challenge oppression and inequalities and effect social change (Clover and Stalker, 2007). This last level is the one that is the least developed in the area of professional studies. Garcia (2009) illustrates this when he uses Habermas' (1972) framework categorising knowledge-constitutive interests at these three levels to explore how MBA programs prepare business leaders to think critically. At the instrumental, technical-rational level, 'the common belief is that leadership effectiveness is synonymous with market performance and hence, can be measured in terms of maximising revenues' (Garcia, 2009, p. 119). The objective is for learners to think critically about meeting corporate goals.

At the second level, which explores the intersubjective nature of human communication, Garcia (2009) notes that leadership is perceived as a 'social practice'. Students are encouraged to understand the complexity of human interaction, to reflect upon their own experiences and understanding of leadership, and focus on learning effective communication.

In the final category, which involves a more radical form of criticality, learners must think of themselves as critical beings, in the world, and what this means in terms of democracy, social justice, and sustainability. From this perspective 'the topic of leadership is used as a catalyst, through which participants can rethink their expectations about business life and role as

business leaders with the aim of significantly improving the world in which we live' (Garcia, 2009, p. 120).

Garcia's (2009) work provides an interesting breakdown of how scope for critical thinking is often muted in professional educational contexts. While there is often support for developing critical capacities at an instrumental level that connect to corporate goals, there is less interest in humanistic concerns, and often resistance to more radical critical agendas for learning.

This is not surprising to critical adult educators who argue that neoliberalism shapes current learning environments, emphasising individualism, competition, and marketplace values. The dominant educational discourse, frequently embodied in policy, has been the production of immediately employable, 'job ready' graduates. Policy in the UK, for example, has focused on employer-led vocational and professional education (Thompson, 2009), accompanied by a marginalisation of professionals themselves and the education community that trains them in decision making about professional roles and standards.

In our review we found that many papers did have a critical social perspective, albeit not always fully articulated. Many of the strategies or perspectives discussed would be located more in the humanistic framework, but the potential for broader social changes was identifiable.

Conducting the review

We realised that a straightforward literature search, using a range of search terms across a set of databases, would be insufficient. We began by using combinations of terms: arts and professional education, named arts e.g. (literature, music, film) and professional education, and named professions (nursing, teaching, law etc.) and the arts. While this highlighted hundreds of possibilities, follow-up scrutiny revealed only 26 items that focused primarily on arts and

professional education. We knew there would be many pieces this approach would miss. We knew that titles, abstracts and keywords referenced specific arts or particular sub-branches of professions and we could not determine all the permutations of profession and artistic method or product that might be used for educational purposes. Other literature reviews we admire, such as Wright and Sandlin's (2009) comprehensive critical review of popular culture and adult education, have concentrated successfully on key adult education journals and conference proceedings, supplemented by additional searches. Although professional education is addressed by adult educators, research and experimental practice in professional education is also often conducted within specific professional disciplines and reported in specialist publications relating to those professions. We could not do individual searches of each of the hundreds of professional journals published. In addition, therefore, to searching six leading adult education journals (Adult Education Quarterly, Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education, International Journal of Lifelong Education, Journal of Vocational Education and Training, Studies in the Education of Adults) from 2001- 2013 for articles dealing with the arts and professional education, we sampled a wide range of journals, which between them covered education for nursing, business, management, law and teaching. We narrowed these down to seven which addressed the arts and professional education with some regularity over a period of time: Nurse Education in Practice, Nurse Education today, Business Education Innovation Journal, Leadership and Organisation Development, Journal of Business Ethics Education, Teaching and Teacher Education and European Journal of Teacher Education. We also selected three journals dealing with teaching in Higher Education that offered a range of articles on using the arts. Material reviewed also included work we came across from reference lists and in our own reading, including books, chapters in books and conference papers.

9

Our focus was not on being comprehensive, therefore. We aimed for representativeness by ensuring we looked at journals that focused on a range of professions. We considered that we had achieved saturation in our reading when we stopped finding rationales, methods and outcomes that were significantly different. In one sense, saturation could never be achieved. Each individual work of art contributes to the learning of students studying it in its own particular way, and each group of students responds differently. We did find, however, that we could identify five broad approaches to arts-based professional education and that eventually, new approaches did not emerge. The final number of articles, books, papers and chapters we read and analysed came to 112.

We undertook an inductive thematic analysis (Braun and Clarke, 2006) of the finally selected material. Braun and Clarke focus on psychology, but acknowledge that their approach is appropriate for qualitative research generally. They offer a systematic approach without being overly prescriptive. We followed the five broad steps they outline – familiarising ourselves with the literature, generating initial codes, identifying themes and revising themes. This iterative approach is well established in qualitative research "In many cases, qualitative researchers who use written texts as their materials do not try to follow any predefined protocol in executing their analysis. By reading and rereading their empirical materials, they try to pin down their key themes and, thereby, to draw a picture of the presuppositions and meanings that constitute the cultural world of which the textual material is a specimen." (Perakyla & Russuvuori , 2011 p.530). In the case of a literature review, the literature itself is the data; by looking at these publications as a whole, we sought to identify patterns and themes across a wide range of materials. The approach we took to coding and categorisation was interpretive and conceptual, rather than semantic; we looked for underlying ideas and concepts guiding the use of the arts,

rather than commonalities in method or client group. Our theoretical position acknowledges that this is our interpretation of this material, in line with our own personal and theoretical orientations. We believe, with Denzin (1989), that 'all scholars are caught in the cycle of interpretation. They can never be free of the hermeneutical situation' (p.23). The systematic approach we took to reading, re-reading and reviewing themes aimed to ensure that our interpretations had validity in that we could demonstrate that the patterns we identified were firmly based in the materials themselves. We categorised the articles under broad headings, which shifted and reformed as we read more and discussed the approaches we encountered. For example, at one point we had a category, 'teaching as an art', but decided that this was outside the focus of the review, which is concerned with how arts are used to develop professionals, rather than the nature of teaching itself.

We indicate the number of examples in each category as we explicate the categories themselves. Not surprisingly educators often identified multiple benefits from arts work, and used arts for multiple purposes, so the total number across all categories comes to more than the total number of examples. Space constraints make discussing every example impossible; we use a sample from a range of different professions and sources.

Learning to use arts in professional practice

We looked at 23 examples in this category. Fourteen focused on showing teachers, including adult educators, how they might use arts in their work. Seven addressed medical and health care professionals; one addressed youth workers, and one addressed marketing students. Of the 23, nine were exclusive to this category. The two overarching themes we discuss in this paper,

epistemological challenge and social justice, were evident in that the arts challenged limited, technical constructions of the professionals' roles.

Educators encourage trainee professionals to experience and practise the arts to develop a deep understanding of the potential of the arts in their professional work and to build confidence in working with arts and artists. Both Davies (2010) and Donahue and Stuart (2008) consider the use of arts in pre-service teacher-training. Davies discusses the incorporation of an arts week into the curriculum. His experience suggests that trainee professionals need to experience arts directly in order to be confident enough to use arts in their practice. Their experience 'strengthened their self-image as artistic individuals who recognise the value of the arts in children's education and have enhanced confidence in working with different professionals to teach the arts in a cross-disciplinary way' (p. 635). He identifies the importance of this in the context of what he calls a 'culture of fear' that inhibits teachers' courage to innovate in the UK, because of the high stakes judgements made about the performance of trainee teachers, schools and ITT (Initial Teaching Training) providers by government and statutory bodies using narrow, tightly defined criteria (p. 636). Mark (2013) is also concerned that educators move beyond skills-based approaches and supports literacy educators in using creative arts to explore inequality and injustice and engage the whole person. In adult and community education, Clover and Stalker's (2007) edited collection addresses a wide range of projects in which educators have used and researched the arts in adult education, providing a source of inspiration for other professionals.

Nurse educators support nurses to explore how art can promote health and recovery in patients. (Coghlan and Igo, 1996; Gersie and King, 1990; Robinson, 2007). Ting, Chen, Ho and Gaufberg (2012) reported on incorporating analyses of hospital art into their work with medical students to help them develop a deeper understanding of the impact of environment on patients.

Mckie, Adams, Gass and McDuff (2008) describe a module 'the expressive arts in a caring context' in which students engage with artistic products and practices (p. 156). In so doing they re-evaluate their own profession, review the experiences of their clients and patients, and learn to understand their own feelings, which helps them realise the potential the arts have for their work with others. Wikstrom (2003) discusses how student nurses, focusing on their own positive memories of aesthetic experiences in a structured way, learned how such memories evoked happiness and awareness, and could be of value to patients in clinical settings. Aspects of the principles and practice of art therapy find their way into the work of professionals such as teachers, youth workers, educational psychologists and education professionals specialising in behaviour management and support. Cumming and Visser (2009) evaluated the impact of arts workshops run by the Devon Behaviour Support Team on the self-esteem and social skills of refugee children from countries affected by war.

Using arts to illustrate complex concepts and dilemmas

 Educators discuss their use of the arts to illustrate, deepen and challenge professionals' understanding of complex ideas and issues. We found 40 examples, of which eight had this as their exclusive focus. Most reflected one or both of the overarching themes of challenging epistemologies and social justice: professionals understood their practice afresh when they were able to engage deeply with theoretical perspectives and this exploration of concepts; issues and dilemmas often had a critical dimension, challenging the role of professionals and their relationship to wider global and political issues.

The study of the narrative arts was common. The rich and complex detail found in stories (fiction, film, television) help professionals understand how theoretical and abstract concepts

play out in social situations and how individuals might experience them (Jarvis, 2012b). Narratives were sometimes used like detailed, nuanced case-studies. The Journal of Leadership Education's (2008) special issue on teaching leadership through popular media, includes an examination of the television series Grey's Anatomy to explore leadership styles (Torock, 2008) and Joseph and Mertez (2000) use popular culture to help students understand the complexities of legal practice. White (2008) commented on the potential for using medical dramas to help nursing and medical students explore ethical dilemmas, because they could see them in a real and human context. Poirier, Colarusso, Bischoff and Robertson (2007) ask trainee teachers to apply developmental theory to three non-fiction novels to promote understanding of theories of adolescent development, motivation, identity and marginalisation. The authors value both the complexity and accessibility of the texts and their potential for introducing students to issues of race, class and achievement. Brown (2011) uses films with adult educators because they are able to present complex global issues relating to identity, class and diversity in a personal context and offer scope for significant cognitive challenges in terms of identity critique.

While reading/ viewing narrative as a basis for discussion was very common, educators also engaged participants in making narrative in order to engage them with complex ideas. Heyward (2010) involves pre-service teachers in the production of role-plays examining controversial issues relating to their profession, moving them towards a deeper understanding of these topics. Hakkarainen and Vapalahti (2011) support students on a civic activities and youth work degree to develop video-supported forum theatre sessions, based on Boal's Theatre of the Oppressed, about elderly people's use of alcohol. Students record the sessions, leading to an enhanced understanding for themselves and for social work students who participated in the audience.

Art for Empathy and Insight

We identified 28 incidences in this category, all of which overlapped with other categories, particularly categories two and five. The strong affective powers of the arts and their capacity to influence people on multiple levels encouraged educators to use arts to help professionals understand the experiences and perspectives of their clients. The capacity to see through another's eyes, while often rooted in the emotions, led to epistemological challenges, as professionals acknowledged the legitimacy of different perspectives on the world, and to criticality when they identified the marginalisation of particular perspectives. Wikstrom (2001), using the visual arts with student nurses, suggests that the art enabled students to take 'a mental walk, perceiving the feeling in what was depicted' (p. 29) and that this led to an enhanced valuing of care, involvement, and concern in the nursing relationship. Hoggan (2009) examines the transformative potential of creative writing, metaphors, and literature for enabling professionals to engage imaginatively and authentically with those with whom they work. Parsons and Boydell (2012) report on various ways in which artistic expression has been used to convey knowledge and understanding generated through research to medical and health care professionals. Heyward (2010) uses drama and role play in teacher education to help pre-service teachers experience some of the multiplicity of perspectives and strong emotions of various stakeholders in education. Teachers had to inhabit different characters, which enabled them to develop insights into different perspectives. Walsh and Crumbie (2011) draw on narrative pedagogy to design a virtual community where trainee nurses become emotionally engaged with the lives of the community and imagine the implications of their practice for individuals.

This category often included diversity training (Guy, 2007), reflecting the need for professionals to understand the needs of the whole community, something to which adult educators examining a wide range of professional contexts have drawn attention. For example, Johnson-Bailey, Valentine, Cervero and Bowles' (2009) research found that black alumni from predominantly white HE institutions reported 'isolation, loneliness, disconnection and discrimination' (p. 192) and identify the need for education that will make all faculty understand the experiences of black students. MacDonnell & Macdonald (2011) use various arts practices (journaling, narrative and poetry writing and the interpretation of visual images) to 'foster development of empathic understanding' by 'walking in the shoes' (p.208) of individuals from socially diverse groups. Gouthro and Holloway (2013) discuss how through fiction 'difficult moral choices, unfamiliar cultural values, alternative social mores, and different personalities can all be explored' (p. 45). Encounters with the arts will not necessarily lead to critical thinking, however. Tisdell and Thompson (2007), working with adult educators, discuss how popular arts such as film and television fictions, sometimes challenge, but sometimes reinforce, traditional views of society and social groups. They advocate critical media literacy as a counter to the more hegemonic aspects of popular culture.

If educators of professionals use the arts to enhance learning that fits into a critical/emancipatory framework, they must encourage learners to question taken-for-granted assumptions and recognise that individual troubles are often linked with broader social, cultural, economic and political contexts. McGregor's (2012) work spans several of our categories and is a good example of the way that using the arts to develop insight into different perspectives leads to critical understanding and cognitive change. She uses 'designs for provocation' to develop community leaders, using narrative texts to explore the different roles leaders might take and the

implications these have for social justice, personal relationships and identities as leaders (p. 310).

She argues that 'aesthetic modes' invite more 'open' interpretation, essentially leaving spaces

through which discursive meanings can be taken up, re-created or altered (p. 313). The

development of knowledge about leadership emerges through working with others to develop

creative responses and to understand alternative perspectives. This collaborative aesthetic work

helps leaders understand that knowledge is contingent and has an important political dimension.

The Role of the Arts in the Construction of Professional Identities and Discourses

Art helps construct dominant discourses about professions (Joseph and Burnaford, 2001;

Weber and Mitchell, 1995). Fisher, Harris and Jarvis (2008) argue that a 'critical consideration

of representations from popular culture' has a valuable place in teacher education, offering

trainee teachers 'a potent source of both contemporary and historical thinking on education' (p.

177-178). Guenther and Dees (1999) discuss how using a school-based sitcom as the basis for

critical discussion presents students with multiple, competing discourses about teaching: just as

in the media there is no one final reading, in their own teacher self, there is no final "real" or

ideal teacher that they should become (p. 48). We found 19 examples in this 'Professional

identities and discourses' category, of which all but two had elements of the other categories we

discuss.

A discussion of these multiple discourses almost inevitably challenged professionals'

own beliefs about their professions, opening them to new ways of seeing their roles and in some

cases to the development of a more radical and critical perspective on their work. Scholars

exploring the concept of public pedagogy (Giroux, 2004, Sandlin, O'Malley and Burdick, 2011)

discuss how popular culture can entrench existing belief systems, but also open up opportunities

17

for critical adult learning experiences. Sandlin, Schultz and Burdick's (2010) edited collection

has a section on 'Pedagogies of popular culture and everyday life' and we think artistic

representations of professionals often operate as forms of everyday public pedagogy. Many arts

(such as film, television, public art) address issues, dilemmas and contexts of great relevance to

professionals and represent those professions to the public. In some cases, that representation of

education, law, health and business can serve a hegemonic function, but it can also offer counter-

narratives that challenge received wisdom about professions, as Sandlin, Wright and Clark

(2013) demonstrate in their discussion of popular culture and its reconfiguration of narratives of

adult learning and development. Incorporating a critical approach to examining such texts can

enable professionals to engage with the extent to which the values and expectations of their

professions, and indeed their own professional identities, are shaped by these public pedagogies.

Jubas and Knutson (2012) discuss popular television set in teaching hospitals with medical and

nursing students and report that 'participants clarified that watching these shows helped them

reflect on their formal education programmes, and engaging in a professional education

programme helped them reflect more critically on familiar cultural texts' (p. 98). They suggest

these texts both challenge and reinforce professional inequalities and the intersection between

race, class and gender in the construction of professional identifies and hierarchies. Wright

(2011) uses horror to help develop a critical workplace pedagogy by considering how it

represents theories of adult learning and development.

Engaging professionals in artistic expression can also be used to stimulate discussion and

reflection about the nature of the profession itself. Sengupta-Irving, Redman and Enyedy (2013)

discuss using the re-storying of maths teachers' stories about student learning, as a means for

expanding teachers' discourses about educational reform. Stacey and Hardy (2011) used digital

stories from newly qualified nurses to offer insights to student nurses to expand their view of their role as nurses and help them to consider the difficulties of becoming part of the nursing profession.

Arts, self-awareness and interpersonal skill development.

The literature in this category considers how aesthetic engagement and expression enable students to understand themselves better, communicate difficult ideas and explore feelings and emotions about their profession (MacDonnell and Macdonald, 2011). This was the most popular category, with 52 incidences, of which 9 focused exclusively on the development of these specific attitudes and skills.

Wagenheim, Clark, and Crispo (2009) describe using the identification and analysis of personal metaphors to help teachers develop 'insights into previously hidden assumptions in their teaching practice' so that 'they will develop better self-awareness and ultimately become better teachers' (p. 29). Loads (2010), who uses art workshops with nurse educators, is explicit about the need for educators to 'hold, examine and develop tolerance for uncertainty' (p. 410). Her participants create collages, masks and drawings as visual metaphors of their work as teachers. She explores the importance of managing competing metaphors about the teaching profession, arguing that this 'provides an antidote to the discourses of certainty and performativity that are powerful throughout the academy' (p.412). Her work suggests arts work has radical potential: it helped professionals to recognise understandings about teaching on the 'margins of awareness', thus challenging simplistic, dominant models about teaching.

Snyder, Heckman and Scialdone (2009) demonstrate that developing artistic approaches to knowing can be valuable for all professionals, not just those working in professions such as

nursing, community work or teaching, where the complexities of human behaviour and interaction are self-evident. Working with information professionals, they adopted studio-based approaches to their work to teach technical trainees skills of interpretation and critique. Although trainees were engaged in technical tasks, Snyder *et al* focused on the importance of engaging in making meaning by reviewing the work of others in the creation of solutions to technical challenges. Developing skills of interpretation and sharing in the interpretations of others encouraged students to recognise that multiple interpretations have value. Snyder and colleagues argue that this will provide a counter to the 'more familiar rational, scientific model that currently informs technical professional education' p.1923), and help trainees to see instead the complexities and multiple-possibilities in problem solving.   .

The transformative education literature and literature on presentational knowing contributes substantially to the discussion of the arts in professional education. Davis-Manigaulte, Yorks and Kasl (2006) describe Davis-Manigaultes' use of expressive activities, such as drawing, collage, guided visualisation and clay work to support student interns learning about community-based roles. Interns recognise and express feelings about their work, themselves and each other, in a holistic way that can transform their approach to their work. Kokkos (2011) draws on his work with adult educators and trainers to describe his development of a seven stage process for using aesthetic experiences to encourage deeper critical reflection and connection with the feelings and emotions of others and oneself.

Conclusion

This review suggests that the arts are used extensively to train professionals in a wide range of disciplines, but most of this work is located within the context of specific professional

disciplines and there is little that attempts to identify, in more general terms, the unique contribution of the arts to professional education. We found it useful to begin by recognising types of use, which formed the basis of our five categories. However, these reflected the aims and overt uses of the arts in each case; they did not help us to understand whether the arts affected professionals in unique ways. Reviewing the material indicated that whether or not educators directly referred to the impact of arts on students' epistemologies, it was frequently this that enabled educators to achieve their goals. Engagement with multiple ways of seeing and knowing, including those that operated at a more intuitive and affective level, moved students towards different understandings of their work. In some instances, this in turn encouraged the development of a critical perspective on that work; seeing beyond the norms of their organisation, recognising perspectives of marginalised clients, challenging hegemonic assumptions. Developing a coherent theoretical framework that draws upon these themes of epistemological challenge and critical social perspective provides added insights for our own research on the use of fiction to foster empathy (Author 1) and to develop critical and creative capacities amongst learners (Author 2).

In considering critical social perspectives, using the three levels of learning outlined by a Habermasian framework demonstrates that the arts can contribute significantly to developing professionals who are more than technicians. While not diminishing the value of technical skills, today's professionals need a broader repertoire of knowledge and capabilities to participate effectively in a diverse, globalised workplace.

The use of the arts in professional studies challenges learners to think about their clients/ patients, as well as colleagues, as complex human beings, and helps them to deal with the uncertainty and ambiguity that characterises modern workplaces. Through arts-based approaches

professionals may become more self-reflective about their roles and identities, and develop more empathetic or humanistic approaches to everyday practices in the workplace.

The arts may also be used at a more radical or critical level, to explore how professionals can collectively influence broader social, political and economic structures. Professionals have a role in civil society that goes beyond the day-to-day practice of their profession. They need to participate at the highest levels in dialogue about education, health, law and business, to take the lead in political debate and discussion and to stake their claim, as experts, to a proper role in policy making in those areas relevant to their professions. Learning in the professional sector is not just about engagement in the paid workforce, but should also take up issues pertaining to citizenship, equality, and social responsibility. The scrutiny of artistic representations of professions, as discussed in the section on the construction of professional identities and discourses, can stimulate professionals to think critically about their roles and identities within professions, and the impact of their profession on broader society as Jubas and Knutson, 2012, Wright (2012), and Kinsella (2011), discuss.

If professionals are to work within shifting and multiple discourses and at the same time sustain a critically informed perspective on those disciplines, then the arts, with their powerful capacity to disrupt, refocus and represent that world, have a great deal to offer educators of professionals. We have tried to map out a preliminary field here to demonstrate that there is potential for developing a critical and integrated theory of the arts in professional education.

References

Barnett, R. (2008) 'Critical professionalism in an age of super-complexity'. In B. Cunningham (ed), *Exploring Professionalism*. London: Institute for Education, pp. 190-209.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006) 'Using thematic analysis in psychology', *Qualitative Research in Psychology,* 3, pp.77-101. doi: 10.1191/1478088706qp063oa.

Brookfield, S. (2005) *The Power of Critical Theory for Adult Learning and Teaching*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Butterwick, S. (2012) 'The politics of listening: The power of theatre to create dialogic spaces'. In L. Manicom & S. Walters (eds), *Feminist popular education in transnational feminist Debates: Building pedagogies of possibility.* New York: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 59-75.

Brown, T. (2011) 'Using film in teaching and learning about changing societies', *International Journal of Lifelong Education,* 30(2), pp. 233- 247. doi: 10.1080/02601370.2010.547615.

Clover, D., & Stalker, J. (2007) *The Arts and Social Justice: Re-crafting Activist Adult Education and community leadership*. Leicester, England: NIACE.

Clover, D. (2010) 'A Contemporary Review of Feminist Aesthetic Practices in Selective Adult Education Journals and Conference Proceedings', *Adult Education Quarterly,* 60(3), pp.233-248.

Clover, D. & Sanford, K. (2013) *Lifelong Learning, The Arts and Community Cultural Engagements in the Contemporary University.* Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Coghlan, S., & Igo, L. (1996) 'Learning from literature: Novels, plays, short stories, and poems in nursing', *Nurse Educator,* 21(5), pp.16-19.

Corcos, C. (1993) 'Columbo goes to law school: Or, some thoughts on the uses of television

in the teaching of law', *Loyola of Los Angeles Entertainment Law Journal*, 13, pp.499-544.

Crook, D. (2008) Some historical perspectives on professionalism. In B.Cunningham (ed), *Exploring Professionalism* (pp.10-28). London: Institute for Education.

Cumming. S. & Visser, J. (2009) 'Using art with vulnerable children', *Support for Learning,* 24(4), pp. 1-158. doi: 10.1111/j.1467-9604.2009.01418.x.

Davies, D. (2010) 'Enhancing the role of the arts in primary pre-service education', *Teaching and Teacher Education,* 26, pp.630-638. doi: 10.1016/j.tate.2009.09.011.

Davis-Manigaulte, J., Yorks, L., & Kasl, E. (2006) 'Expressive ways of knowing and transformative learning', *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 109, pp. 27-37. doi: 10.1002/ace.205.

Denzin, N. (1989). *Interpretive Interactionism*. London: Sage Publications.

Donahue, D. & Stuart, J. (2008) 'Working towards balance: Arts integration in pre-service education in an era of standardisation', *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 24, pp.343-355. doi: 10.1016/j.tate.2006.11.016.

Eisner, E. (2002) *Arts and the Creation of Mind*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Fisher, R., Harris, A., & Jarvis, C. (2008) *Education and Popular Culture*. London: Routledge.

Freidson, (2001) *Professionalism, the Third Logic*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Garcia, E. (2009) 'Raising leadership criticality in MBAs', *Higher Education,* 58(1), pp.110-130. doi: 10.1007/s10734-008-9185-6.

Gersie, A., & King, N. (1990) *Storymaking in Education and Therapy*. London: Jessica Kingsley.

Giroux, H. (2004) 'Cultural studies, public pedagogy and the responsibility of intellectuals', *Communication and Critical/Cultural studies*, 1(1), pp.57-79.

Gouthro, P., & Holloway, S. (2013) 'Reclaiming the radical: Using fiction to explore adult learning connected to citizenship', *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 45(1), pp.41-56.

Guenther, D. & Dees, D. (1999) 'Teachers reading teachers: Using popular culture to reposition the perspective of critical pedagogy in teacher education', In T. Daspit & J. Weaver (eds), *Popular Culture and Critical Pedagogy* . New York: Garland Publishing. pp. 33-55.

Guy, T., (2007)'Learning who we (and they) are: popular culture as pedagogy'. In E. Tisdell and P. Thompson (eds), Popular culture and entertainment media in adult education, *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*.115). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, pp. 15-24.

Habermas, J. (1972). *Knowledge and human interests*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Hakkarainen, P. & Vapalahti, K. (2011) 'Meaningful learning through video-supported forum Theatre', *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in HE,* 2(3), 314-328.

Halsey, A. (1992). <u>*Decline of donnish dominion*</u>. Oxford: Clarendon.

Harrison, J., & Akinc, H. (2000) 'Lessons in leadership from the arts and literature: A liberal arts to management education through fifth discipline learning', *Journal of Management Education,* 24(3), pp.391-413.

Heyward, P. (2010) 'Emotional engagement through drama: strategies to assist learning through role-play', *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education,* 22(2), pp.197-203.

Hoggan, C. (2009) 'The power of story. Metaphors, literature and creative writing'. In

C. Hoggan., S., Simpson & H. Stuckey (eds), *Creative Expression in Transformative Learning.* Malabar, Florida: Krieger, pp. 51-75.

Jarvis, C. (2012a). 'Fiction, film and transformative learning'. In E. Taylor & P. Cranton (eds), *The Handbook of Transformative Learning: Theory, Research, and Practice.* San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, pp. 486-502.

Jarvis, C. (2012b) 'Fiction, empathy and lifelong learning', *International Journal of Lifelong Education,* 31(6), pp.743-758. 10.1080/02601370.2012.713036

Johnson-Bailey, J., Valentine, T., Cervero, R., and Bowles, T. (2009) 'Rooted in the soil: The social experiences of black graduate students at a southern research university', *The Journal of Higher Education.* 80(2), pp.178-203.

Joseph, P., & Mertez, G. (2000) 'Law and pop culture: teaching and learning about law using images from popular culture', *Social Education,* 64(4), pp.206-211.

Joseph, P., & Burnaford, G. (eds) (2001) *Images of School Teachers in America.* Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Jubas, K., & Knutson, P. (2012) 'Seeing and be(liev)ing. How nursing and medical students understand representations of their professions', *Studies in the Education of Adults,* 44(1), 85-100.

Kinsella, E. (2007). 'Educating socially responsive practitioners: What can the literary arts offer health professional education?' In D. Clover & J. Stalker, (eds), *The Arts and Social Justice. Re-crafting Activist Adult Education and Community Leadership.* Leicester: NIACE, pp. 39-58.

Kokkos, A. (2011) 'Transformative learning through aesthetic experience. Towards a comprehensive method', *Journal of Transformative Education,* 8(3), pp.155-177.

Loads, D. (2010). 'I'm a dancer' and 'I've got a saucepan stuck on my head': metaphor in helping lecturers to develop being-for-uncertainty,' *Teaching in Higher Education*, 15(4), pp. 409-421.10.1080/13562510903560044

MacDonnell, J., & Macdonald, J. (2011) 'Arts-based critical inquiry in nursing and interdisciplinary professional education: Guided imagery, images, narratives, and poetry', *Journal of Transformative Education*, 9(4), pp.203-221.

McGregor, C. (2012) 'Art-informed pedagogy: tools for social transformation', *International Journal of Lifelong Education,* 31(3), pp.309-324. 10.1080/020601370.2012.683612

McKie, A., Adams, V., Gass, J., & Macduff, C. (2008) 'Windows and mirrors: Reflections of a module team teaching the arts in nurse education', *Nurse Education in Practice,* 8, pp.156-164.

Marcuse, H. (1978) *The Aesthetic Dimension: Toward a Critique of Marxist Aesthetics*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Mark, R. (2013) 'Empowering literacy educators and learners in Northern Ireland'. University-community engagement for peace.' In D. Clover & K. Sanford (eds), *Lifelong Learning, The Arts and Community Cultural Engagement in the Contemporary University.* Manchester: Manchester University Press. pp.148-161.

Mezirow, J. (1981). 'A Critical Theory of Adult Learning and Education', *Adult Education,* 32(1) pp. 3-24.

Parsons, J., & Boydell, K. (2012) 'Arts based research and knowledge translation: some key concerns for health care professionals', *Journal of Interprofessional Care,* 26(3), pp.170-172 doi: 10.30109/13561820.2011.647128.

27

Perakyla, A., & Ruusuvuori, J. (2011) 'Analysing talk and text.' In N. Denzin, & Y. Lincoln, (eds), *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research.* pp.529-545.

Poirier, R., Colarusso, E., Bischoff, A., & Robertson, E. (2007) 'Exploring adolescent development through the use of popular non-fiction novels', *Teaching and Teacher Education,* 23, pp.1345–1349 doi: 10.1016/j.tate.2006.11.017

Prins, E. (2010) 'Participatory photography: A tool for empowerment or surveillance?' *Action Research*, 8(4), pp.426-443 doi: 10.177/14750310374502

Robinson, S. (2007). 'Using art in pre-registration nurse education', *Health Education,* 107(4), pp.324-342**.**

Sandlin, J., O'Malley, M., & Burdick, J. (2011) 'Mapping the complexity of public pedagogy scholarship: 1894-2010', *Review of Educational Research,* 81(3), pp.338-375

Sandlin, J., Schultz, B., & Burdick, J. (2010) *Handbook of public pedagogy. Education and Learning beyond Schooling.* New York: Routledge doi: 10.3102/0034654311413395

Sandlin, J., Wright, R. & Clark, C. (2013) 'Re-examining theories of adult learning and adult development through the lenses of public pedagogy', *Adult Education Quarterly,* 63(1), 3-23 doi: 10.1177/07413611415836

Sengupta-Irving,T., Redman, E., & Enyedy, N. (2013) 'Re-storying practice: Using stories about students to advance mathematics education reform', *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 31,pp.1-12 doi: 10.1016/0741713611415836

Snyder, J., Heckmann, R., & Scialdone, M. (2009) 'Information studios: integrating arts-based learning into the education of information professionals', *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology,* 60(9), pp.1923-1932.

Stacey, G., & Hardy, P. (2011) 'Challenging the shock of reality through digital story-telling',
    Nurse Education in Practice, 11, pp.159-164.

Taylor, A., & Alfred, M. (2010).'Nurses perceptions of the organizational supports needed
    for the delivery of culturally competent care', *Western Journal of Nursing Research*,
    32(5), pp.591-609 doi: 10.1177/0193945909354999.

Tett, L., Anderson, K., McNeill, F., Overy, K. & Sparks, R. (2012)'Learning, rehabilitation and
    the arts in prisons: a Scottish case study', *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 44(2), pp.
    171-185.

Thompson, R. (2009) 'Creativity, knowledge and curriculum in further education: A
    Bernsteinian perspective', *British Journal of Educational Studies,* 57(1), pp.37-54 doi:
    10.1111/j.1467-8527.2008.00424.x.

Ting, S., Chen, Y., Ho, M., & Gaufberg, G. (2012) 'Using hospital art in medical student
    Reflection', *Medical Education,* 46(5), pp.505-506 doi: 10.1111/j.1365-
2923.2012.04225.x.

Tisdell, E., & Thompson, P., (2007) '"Seeing from a different angle": The role of pop
    culture in teaching for diversity and critical media literacy in adult education'.
    International Journal of Lifelong Education, 26(6), pp.651-673.

Torock, J. (2008) **'**Bringing the emergency room to the classroom: Using Grey's Anatomy to
    simplify situational leadership', *Journal of Leadership Education,* 7(2), pp.69-78.

Wagenheim, G., Clark, R., & Crispo, A. (2009) 'Metaphorical mirror: reflecting on our
    personal pursuits to discover and challenge our teaching practice assumptions',
    International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education, 20(3), pp.503-509.

Walsh, M., & Crumbie, A. (2011) 'Initial evaluation of Stilwell: A multimedia virtual

Community', *Nurse Education in Practice,* 11, pp.136-140.

Weber, S., & Mitchell, C. (1995) *That's Funny, You Don't Look Like a Teacher: Interrogating images and identity in popular Culture*. London: Falmer Press.

White, G. (2008). 'Capturing the ethics education value of television medical drama', *The American Journal of Bioethics,* 8(12), pp.13-14 doi: 10.1080/15265160802568782.

Whitty, G. (2008) 'Changing modes of teacher professionalism: traditional, managerial, collaborative and democratic'. In B. Cunningham (ed), *Exploring Professionalism.* London: Institute for Education, pp.28-50.

Wikstrom, B. (2001)'Works of art: a complement to theoretical knowledge when teaching nursing care', *Journal of Clinical Nursing,* 10,pp.25-32.

Wikstrom, B. (2003) 'A memory of an aesthetic experience transferred to clinical practice', *Education for Health,* 16(1), pp.40-50.

Wright, R. & Sandlin, J. (2009). 'Cult TV, hip hop, shape-shifters, and vampire slayers: A review of the literature at the intersection of adult education and popular culture', *Adult Education Quarterly,* 59(2), pp.118-141.

Wright, R. (2011) Vampires and Zombies as Critical Public Pedagogy: Using Horror for Critical Adult Education and HRD Instruction. *Proceedings of the 30th National Conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education (CASAE) and the 52nd Annual Adult Education Research Conference (AERC) conference*, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto, June, 2011.