



University of HUDDERSFIELD

University of Huddersfield Repository

Deery, Ruth

Engaging with clinical supervision in a community midwifery setting: an action research study

Original Citation

Deery, Ruth (2003) Engaging with clinical supervision in a community midwifery setting: an action research study. Doctoral thesis, University of Sheffield.

This version is available at <http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/6913/>

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

<http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/>

**ENGAGING WITH CLINICAL SUPERVISION IN A COMMUNITY
MIDWIFERY SETTING**

AN ACTION RESEARCH STUDY

RUTH DEERY

**A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy**

**WOMEN'S INFORMED CHILDBEARING & HEALTH RESEARCH GROUP
SCHOOL OF NURSING AND MIDWIFERY**

**THE UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD
UK**

NOVEMBER 2003

ABSTRACT

The main aim of this research study was to explore midwives' views and experiences of their support needs in clinical practice and then to identify how they would wish to receive such support. There was much literature to support the existence of stress and burnout in midwifery but no research that addressed ways of alleviating this. Further aims were to redress that imbalance by planning and facilitating a model of clinical supervision devised by the participating midwives.

The study took an action research approach that involved working with a group of eight National Health Service (NHS) community midwives in a collaborative, non-hierarchical and democratic way in order to achieve change. This accorded with a woman-centred approach to working with clients that was being encouraged within midwifery. The midwives were typical of many community-based midwives in the United Kingdom (UK) who were working in increasingly stressful, complex and changing environments.

Wider organisational and cultural issues are considered that affect working relationships. The nature of the way the midwives worked when they were offered and received support, and how they reacted and coped when their work team and work situation was threatened, was also explored.

Each midwife was interviewed twice; before and after the experience of clinical supervision. They also participated in two focus groups before clinical supervision. In-depth individual interviews lasted up to two hours, as did the focus groups. The interviews and the focus groups were taped, transcribed and then analysed using a relational voice-centred methodology.

The main findings were that recent and ongoing change plus the organisational demands placed on the midwives by the NHS and their managers were detrimental to working relationships with their colleagues and clients. This also inhibited the process of change. A discourse of denigration became apparent within the interviews and the midwives behaviour and coping strategies revealed some well developed defence mechanisms, as well as an apparent lack of understanding on their part and that of their midwifery managers in relation to emotion work. Resistance to change was a key defence mechanism used by the midwives.

Strong messages emerge about certain 'performances' being available to midwives and the use of defence mechanisms as a way of 'getting the work done'. There are also messages about the cultural legacy of midwifery and how this can inhibit autonomous behaviour by midwives. Developing and increasing self awareness is still not viewed as being intrinsic to the work of the midwife and midwives are being asked to undertake a level of work that they have not been adequately prepared for. Neither do there appear to be effective role models for midwives. The bureaucratic pressures of working in a large maternity unit are also addressed where the system is seen as more important than the midwives.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many, many people who have unknowingly contributed to the successful completion of this study. I sincerely thank them all, but in particular I would like to take this opportunity to thank the following people.

My gratitude to my husband Patsy and my mother Teresa, who have provided endless support throughout the life of the study, is beyond words. They have been a tower of strength and encouragement for me as have my children, Nick, Laura and Emily who have 'studied with me'. Nick became a Police Officer during the course of the study, Laura has taken her A levels and is preparing to go to University and Emily has taken her GCSEs...and they were only 'babies' when I started my research journey. My father Frank, who was very proud that I was studying for my doctorate died during the course of the research.

Professor Mavis Kirkham, as my research supervisor, has provided infinite support, constantly reinforcing my ability to undertake this research as well as write the thesis. She has inspired me, trusted me, been patient with me and above all, valued me and my contributions to midwifery. Her calming presence has helped me throughout this research journey.

I would like to thank Joss, Dawn, and all the midwives who participated in the study. Without their help and time this study would not have been possible. Joss and Dawn especially have helped me to think differently. I am also grateful to the midwifery managers for providing access to the participating midwives and the maternity unit.

Deborah Hughes has stayed with me every bit of the way on my research journey, reading endless drafts, often at short notice. She has listened patiently and helped to keep me grounded, as well as providing friendship and scholarly guidance for which I will always be grateful.

I also thank Christine Horrocks who joined me at the later stages of my research journey. Her encouragement, friendship and willingness to comment on drafts have been enormously helpful and motivating. She provided a certain 'structure' that was necessary for me at this crucial stage of my research journey.

The West Yorkshire Education and Training Consortium (now known as West Yorkshire Workforce Development Confederation) provided funding through a small grant. Without this funding the study might not have proceeded to completion. I am also grateful to the University of Huddersfield who provided funding for my studies at the University of Sheffield.

Table of Contents

	PAGE
Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of Tables	xii
List of Figures	xiii
Chapter One: INTRODUCTION	1
The need for the study	2
Aims of the study	3
Setting the scene	4
Key theoretical issues	6
Feminist theory	6
Humanistic psychology	7
Counselling theory	8
Group Work theory	9
Psychotherapeutic theory	10
Sociological theory	11
Transforming the local maternity services	12
Glendale Work Team	14
Dawn's influence on my study	15
Joss' influence on my study	16
The organisation of the thesis	16
Chapter Two: VOICES AND ISSUES FROM PAST AND PRESENT MIDWIFERY	19
The move from 'disordered' to 'ordered' practice	20
Achieving professional status or a means to control practice?	21
Dominant doctors and 'disabled' midwives	22
Statutory compliance: 'supervising' or 'policing' midwifery work?	23
Medicalisation of childbirth	24
Who knows?	24
The subjugation of midwifery knowledge	28
Invisible midwifery expertise and invisible women	29
Technological surveillance and intervention	30
Adapting to, and changing ways of working	31
The effects of changing approaches to care	33
The impact of changing work patterns on the midwifery workforce	34

Chapter Three:	CHANGE, CULTURE, 'CARING' AND RELATIONSHIPS	36
Part 1: Culture and change in the NHS		36
The culture of midwifery in the NHS		36
The context of change in the NHS		39
Differing approaches to change		41
Sowing the seeds of change		43
Culture as a key influence on change		44
Midwives as obedient technicians		45
Change managing midwives		47
Detachment as a monitoring process		49
'Militating organisational imperatives'		50
Key points emerging		51
Part 2: The midwife-mother relationship		52
First relationship crucial to subsequent relationships		54
Providing a holding environment		55
Providing a secure base		56
Community-based work as a refuge		57
The slipperiness of care.....		58
.....makes caring complex		59
The balancing act....becoming emotionally involved		60
Staying connected despite differences		61
Reciprocity: mutual aims and aspirations		62
Mediating between 'connectedness' and 'detachment'		64
Picking the right balance		65
Different levels of engagement		66
Women as 'natural carers'		69
The sentimental order of midwifery		70
Midwives' 'composure work' – a form of task orientated care		72
Identity work – attending to nurturance, growth and healing		73
Therapeutic midwifery: being a 'skilled companion'		75
Midwives as 'gravy'		76
The consequences of partnership...devolving power		77
Key points emerging		79
Chapter Four:	CLINICAL SUPERVISION – A POTENTIAL SOURCE OF SUPPORT	81
Strengthening or policing professional practice?		82
Learning lessons from other professions		83
Social work – 'discussing cases' or 'anxious caseload management'		85
The concept of 'supervisor' – confusion and 'definition quagmire'		86
'Big sister is watching you': supervision of midwives		88
The two hats – contradictions in midwifery supervision		89
Challenging midwifery supervision		90

The nature and range of clinical supervision	91
‘Doing’ clinical supervision	93
Individual supervision	94
Group supervision	94
Peer supervision	95
Frameworks for clinical supervision	96
The focus of clinical supervision	96
Hunt’s three approaches to supervision	102
Double Matrix Model	103
Triadic model of supervision	104
Six Category Intervention Analysis	105
Cyclical Model of Counsellor Supervision	106
Growth and Support Model	107
Guided Reflection or ‘professional narcissism’	108
Interactive Model	109
Nicklin’s six-stage supervision cycle	111
Problem orientated supervision	112
A hybrid model of clinical supervision	112
Practical route to successful clinical supervision	115
Key points emerging	116
Chapter Five: ACTION RESEARCH: OPENING NEW DIALOGUES FOR ENQUIRY	118
The beginnings...action research in the making	119
Valuing process and outcomes	121
Contextualising ‘real-world practice’	122
Defining action research	122
The nature of reality	127
‘Learning is rooted in experience’	129
Rejecting the search for truth	131
Prescription and the imposition of control	132
What about complex, messy clinical practice situations?	133
Naturalistic research: Subjectivity and shedding light on complex problems	134
Whose knowledge.....whose practice counts?	135
Critical theory research: challenging politically constructed situations	136
Models...approaches...typologies...traditions?	140
Cycles and steps as repressive and mechanical	142
Struggling in the swampy lowlands	144
Accepting certainty and valuing uncertainty	145
Feminisms and action research	150
The living theory approach	151
Mapping imagined frameworks’ onto clinical practice	152
Putting values “up-front”	153
Active versus passive participation	157

Research 'with' rather than 'on': a conjoint experience	159
The balance of power...	160
Becoming a political entrepreneur!	161
Blurred boundaries – dealing with political behaviour	163
Key points emerging	165
Chapter Six: METHODS	167
Placing 'the self' at the centre of the inquiry	167
Shaping the research with social, political and critical insight	167
A story of myself (6.12.00)	169
Childhood lasts a lifetime	169
Phase One	174
Gaining access	174
Gatekeeping access	174
Old habits die hard	175
Silencing mechanisms at play	176
Recruitment to the study	177
Excluding 'others' from the research	178
Phases One, Two and Three	179
Interviews as complex, social interactions	179
The influence of reciprocity	181
Listening to midwives' voices	182
Listening to the voices of Susan, Sarah and Stella	183
Seeking spontaneous storytelling	184
The interviewer as a therapeutic resource	185
Is it necessary to draw a line in the sand?	186
Choosing the venue – feeling safer on your own patch	187
Coping with distractions and interruptions	188
Articulating 'unarticulated experience': helping each other out	189
The co-production of data within interviews	191
Phase Two	192
Hearing Joss' voice	192
Focus groups as 'natural social networks'	193
Interaction as synergism	193
Focus groups equate with 'time-efficiency'	195
Silent voices...remaining an outsider	196
Focus groups as a forum for change	197
Facilitating focus groups	197
Observing interactions within focus groups	198
Issues of ethics and rigour	199
The appropriateness of reliability and validity in action research	202
Exercising professional imagination	203

Phase Three	206
Analysing the midwives' accounts	206
'Starting up terror' – leaping into the unknown	207
The process of making sense	208
Facing myself....again	209
The principles of voice-centred relational methodology	210
First reading: focusing on the plot by losing my own plot	211
Second reading: being with midwives	212
Third reading: achieving a sense of balance in relationships	213
Fourth reading: some voices are louder than others	214
Fifth reading: expressing emotion through metaphors	215
Metaphors as a form of expression	216
Chapter Seven: PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS THE CHALLENGE OF CHANGE: CONFRONTING CRISIS AND PAIN	220
The roller coaster of constant change: onerous or exciting?	221
The tyranny of team midwifery: an unfair imposition.	223
Idealising past ways of working.	226
Coping with stress: feeling uptight, depressed and unable to go to work.	227
Habitual ways of working...collusive interaction and refusal to talk.	232
Bad care days...no time to listen and a fear of complex situations.	234
The rudderless ship...pulling differently and needing direction!	236
Pseudo-cohesion as a mask for unsupportive behaviour.	237
Ladylike saboteurs... 'flies in the ointment' or 'doing good by stealth'.	238
Self denigration as a learned response and a way to discount needs.	242
'Shared' or 'clash' of personal philosophies.	244
Generations of dinosaurs...the birth and death of oppressors.	245
Key points emerging	247
Chapter Eight: PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS: MIDWIVES AS 'EMOTIONAL LABOURERS'	249
'Framing' the story...midwifery work as 'performance'	251
Emotional labour	254
Longer client interactions = feeling 'psychologically drained'	256
Burnout syndrome	256
'Professional closeness' or detachment	260
Relating to, and developing partnerships with women	262
'Psyching one's self up' – a coping strategy	262
Self presentation; coping and performance	263
Being 'their friend'; feeling safe and suffering pain	264
Emotional engagement: a source of energy or a stressor	266

Practical and intellectually challenging performances	268
Finite energy: running on empty	269
Down and worn out	271
Defining relationships: holding on to professional power	272
Expecting nothing other than what is received	273
The organisational demands of the maternity service	278
Protocolisation inhibiting the spontaneous performance of midwifery	278
Feeling overwhelmed by their relationships with each other	281
Unequal workloads despite being 'all the same'	284
Increasing workloads	285
'The cult of busyness'...self protection or avoiding too much work	285
Differentiating between clients: rejection and acceptance	288
The need to be needed	289
Key points emerging	293

**Chapter Nine: PHASE TWO - FOCUS GROUPS:
CLARIFYING SUPPORT NEEDS
AND PLANNING FOR CHANGE** 294

Focus group one: A forum to reflect on support needs and change	294
Observing group interaction	295
Silent voices huddling together	296
Getting started...different forms of anxiety	297
Keeping 'team spirit' alive...despite obvious differences	300
Pussyfooting and 'smoothing over' as alternatives	302
Conversational rituals...trying to restore balance	303
Fear of exposing feelings...letting colleagues 'see inside'	304
Attempting to meet support needs	306
Taking things further...new style of clinical support!	308
Fear of a new hierarchy	310
Celebrating midwifery versus use of a 'black book'	311
Key points emerging from focus group one	314
Dawn's input following the first focus group	315
Focus group two: Working towards a supportive framework	317
'Them' and 'us' – pseudo-collusion as a defence mechanism	318
'Punching lights out': no power, anger and dissatisfaction	319
'Jumping on board' or resisting collaboration and responsibility	320
Managing change...or not...through the study findings	323
Collaborating or colluding: yet another contradiction!	324
Different ways of working really means 'double visits'	325
The way forward for the work team	328
Even researchers get hurt...'emotional pebbles and potholes'	329
Key points emerging from focus group two	330

Making time to meet with the midwifery manager	330
No answers.....yet!	331
Making time to meet with the new Head of Midwifery	331

Chapter Ten: PHASE THREE - FINAL INTERVIEWS
CHALLENGES AHEAD: DEVELOPING AN
AWARENESS OF REALITY 333

An 'opportunity' or a 'different space'	334
Cohesiveness as a means of keeping problems hidden	336
'Pseudo-cohesion' as a means of masking	
unsupportive behaviour	338
A challenge: time for reflection and possible change	342
Too great a challenge: no time and no support	
during turbulent change.	343
The need to feel safe: negotiating a safe environment	344
'Contract setting': working together towards a clinical supervision	
framework.	345
Making time for clinical supervision	347
Buying time: money makes midwives!	348
Time out to talk: spending valuable time	350
Time as a finite commodity...it costs money!	352
Time as a 'sacrifice': encroaching on others' time	354
Taking time that is needed elsewhere	358
Group supervision: feeling safer in numbers	360
Feeling valued through equality and consistency	362
Imposing boundaries: limiting involvement or avoiding	
responsibility.	364
Feeling elitist: better to exclude than include	367
The dumping ground: a place for unloading distress	369
Help rejecting complainers: a means of expressing resentment	
or a reflection of reality	370
Different ways of acknowledging endings	374
The empty chair: avoidance behaviour or a call for help	376
Facing the challenge: presenting clinical material of concern	379
Towards a new understanding	384
Avoidance of issues	384
'Pit-head time' – an opportunity to discuss 'casework moments'	386
Key points emerging	390

Chapter Eleven: CONCLUDING THOUGHTS.....
AND BEYOND 392

The rhetorical challenge of midwifery	393
'Cultures of conflict'	393
Insights into the performance of midwifery	395
Performances as bound by the clock	397
Insights into working relationships	398

Clinical supervision as an ‘unshackling process’	398
Midwives who balance well	400
Pseudo-cohesion as a defence mechanism	401
Struggles and contradictions within action research	401
The way forward	404
Implications for midwifery education and further research	405
Recommendations for midwifery practice	408
Recommendations for further research	411
REFERENCES	413
APPENDICES	443
1. Description of the midwives	443
2. Interview Schedule (preliminary interviews)	450
3. Interview Schedule (focus group 1)	451
4. Interview Schedule (focus group 2)	452
5. Interview Schedule (final interviews)	453

List of Tables

	PAGE
Chapter Four: Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’	81
Table 1: Schools of psychotherapy or counselling as applied to clinical supervision	98
Table 2: Models of clinical supervision	99-100
Chapter Five: Action research: opening new dialogues for Enquiry	118
Table 3: The position of the researcher	162
Chapter Eight: Midwives as ‘emotional labourers’	249
Table 4: Summary of the spectrum of ‘performances’ (as described in preliminary interviews)	253
Table 5: Midwives’ ways of emotional engagement in a bureaucratic context and their subsequent effects	292

List of Figures

		PAGE
Chapter One:	Introduction	1
Figure 1:	Flow Chart signposting phases and progress of study	5
Chapter Four:	Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’	81
Figure 2:	Hawkins & Shohet’s Double Matrix Model of Supervision.	101
Figure 3:	Hybrid Model of Clinical Supervision.	113
Figure 4:	The route to successful and effective clinical supervision.	116
Chapter Five:	Action research: opening new dialogues for enquiry	
Figure 5:	Different approaches to action research in critical theory paradigm.	140