Planting Sounds: re-framing the acoustic environment in Tree People (2014), the story of the Colne Valley Tree Society.

Abstract
In 1997, I moved to the Colne Valley in West Yorkshire and began volunteering with a local voluntary group, the Colne Valley Tree Society, who plant trees in the valley most winter Saturday mornings. A few years later I began working as a music technology lecturer at the University of Huddersfield and gravitated slowly towards digital filmmaking in my own practice and research with a particular emphasis on documentary film sound. Around 2010 these two activities were brought together as I began filming the activities of the Society for what was to become the documentary film, Tree People. Consequently, I began to explore the history of the Society and the local area itself as I became aware of just how much of a difference their tree-planting activities over many years had made to the valley’s landscape. This article explores the relationship between my own aesthetic ideas and goals in terms of documentary film and its associated digital techniques, especially as it relates to the sonic, the subject matter of the film itself, and the historical and social context of the Society and its location.

Dr Geoffrey Cox, Senior Lecturer in Music, The University of Huddersfield
Email: g.m.cox@hud.ac.uk
Keywords: music, sound, image, ecology, trees, video, documentary
Password for film clips is arborealagenda

Introduction
Tree People is a 45-minute film documenting the origins, development, activities and achievements of the Colne Valley Tree Society (CVTS), a local voluntary group that has been planting trees in the Colne Valley since 1964. The valley, lying to the west of Huddersfield in West Yorkshire, UK, is some seven miles long and flanked by the Pennine hills. The film highlights the major transformation to the valley landscape the Society has brought about. It was filmed over a period of about four years, was completed in early 2014 and premiered at an event to mark the 50th anniversary of the Society in April 2014. A primary focus in the film is the creative use and manipulation of location sound and the musical score, performed by me on piano, and local brass band, Slaithwaite Band. This aesthetic thrust has underpinned much of my work in recent years, and has involved developing strategies for the creative use of sound and music in documentary film (see No Escape, 2009, A Film About Nice, 2010 and Cider Makers, 2007). This article will outline the artistic context and practice of the filmmaking process and thus its aesthetic and ‘political’ stance, and
will detail some of the key features of the film itself including its inherent ecological subject matter and how that is couched. These aspects will all be related to the digital technologies employed in its creation. A brief history of the valley in terms of its people and landscape will be discussed to give important context regarding the formation of the Society, and to highlight the poetry of that history, inherent in some of the key sonic strategies employed in the film.

Once a relatively barren and scarred post-industrial area, the Colne Valley is, in its lower reaches, now quite heavily wooded, a ‘green lung’ for what is an increasingly densely populated area. This transformation is in no small measure due to the 300,000 trees planted by the Society since 1964; documenting this work is therefore of considerable local historical importance. Though there is a strong implicit ecological and environmental message in the film that may well provide possible encouragement for other groups anywhere in the world, it is not explicitly about this. Rather, it shows what can be done by a group of dedicated local volunteers over many decades who wanted, and continue to want, to make a difference to the environment in which they live – to soften it, to ‘green it up’ and mitigate the ravages of the industrial revolution by planting trees. Thus the film also concentrates on the detail of the landscape of the valley itself, as well as being a kind of audio-visual poem to the beauty of trees themselves.

My own background is as a musician and composer, originally as a popular music practitioner, then developing via a deep interest in twentieth-century modernism, electronic music and especially musique concrète, with its notion of the abstraction and use of everyday ‘environmental’ sounds in a musical context. The allied concept of soundscape or ‘anecdotal’ composition originated by Luc Ferrari (Caux 2012: 129), where those environmental sounds’ context and source-meaning is maintained within the musical context, is also very important and has not only formed the basis of my approach to creating film soundtracks but also informed the very basis of filmmaking processes and film structures. In general I view all the sounds used in films I have been involved with from a musical standpoint. I have written about this approach to sound in documentary elsewhere in some detail (Cox 2011, 2013) but mention this to draw attention to the musical concerns that are at the heart of this article (and to some extent the film itself).

Ecology, Film and Music

The notion of ecology, of that which constitutes ‘the web of relationships of all living organisms, including humans, with their contextual physical environments’ (Allen 2011: 392), has in recent years seen a growing alliance with musicology, originating perhaps through Schafer’s work in the 1970s on acoustic ecology and soundscape
Planting Sounds

design (Schafer 1994 [1977]) and continued through the work of field recordist / composers such as Chris Watson and ethnographers like Steven Feld. Feld’s ‘acostemology’, an ‘exploration of [the] sonic sensibilities’ of the people he has studied, is deeply concerned with the relationship of people to their particular sonic environment (Feld 1996: 97). I will return to Feld later to discuss the idea of ‘sense of place’ in relation to Tree People. In 2011 an edition of the Journal of the American Musicological Society was dedicated to the idea of ‘ecomusicology’, which ‘considers the relationship of music, culture and nature […] the study of musical and sonic issues, both textual and performative, as they relate to ecology and the environment’ (Allen 2011: 392). Ecomusicology can be seen as a ‘socially engaged’ musicology, a form of ecocriticism, a ‘field of literature studying cultural products [e.g. film] that imagine and portray human-environment relationships variously from scholarly, political, and / or activists’ viewpoints’ (ibid: 393). Tree People is one of those cultural products; the relationship between its protagonists and their environment is central to the film, highlighted and pointed up by musical / sonic ideas throughout. In simple terms the approach to the ecological concerns in the film might be termed nostalgic. Alexander Rehding notes that ecological topics are often couched in apocalyptic terms, especially in literature and film: ‘this orientation toward crisis makes sense, as it endows the literary products with political relevance, powerful realism, and – in a very literal sense – sublime terror. The earth needs to be saved, right now’ (2011: 410). Musicology, on the other hand, is a ‘discipline that is often reluctant to make political commitments’, begging the question of how music studies and composition can respond to this ‘sense of crisis in a way comparable to the other arts’ (ibid: 412). Appealing to the power of memory, an ‘area in which music is known to excel’, is a fruitful potential approach since

the nostalgic imagination has always been a part of the environmental movement: on the political level, Green parties were long difficult to classify on the traditional left-right spectrum, since despite their progressive politics, a conservative streak […] often ran through them, which was fed by a romantic idea of a simpler holistic past (ibid).

Furthermore, ‘the commemorative and community-building powers of music in the service of ecological approaches, offer exciting prospects’ (ibid: 413) as opposed to the ‘attention grabbing apocalyptic route’ (ibid: 414). The use of a local brass band in the score for Tree People is aimed at community building and commemoration but this also adds to the nostalgia since Slaithwaite Band, formed as a wind band in 1819, was probably the first in the area (Russell 1992: 662). The nostalgia the film draws on is not quite so straightforward as evoking romantic notions of a ‘simpler
holistic past’ however, since the more immediate cultural and indeed living memory of the valley is one of a heavily industrialised, polluted and indeed, largely treeless place and it is from this time that the brass band movement grew and flourished. So this memory is combined with a very different, idealised one of the pre-industrial, rurally idyllic wooded landscape, forming a quite complex interplay between the two.

**Nostalgic Complexities in *Tree People***

The transformation of the natural landscape of the area should not be underestimated: once a densely wooded area, the vast forest of Elmet, the last stronghold of the Romano-Britons in England, stretched from York to beyond the Pennines, which before the formation of the peat c5,000 BC were themselves covered in birch-hazel scrub woodland (Beresford and Jones 1967: 44). Climatic change, the pressure of population growth in the middle-ages and then the industrial revolution laid total waste to the majority of this woodland and by 1800, there were over one hundred large multi-purpose mechanised woollen mills in the Colne Valley, deemed at the time as some of the largest in the world (Brook 1968: 71). The smoke from hundreds of mill chimneys coupled with domestic coal fires led to a fairly poisonous atmosphere at times and older CVTS members talk of dense smogs and poisoned soils even in the early 1960s when the woollen industry was already in rapid decline. The still-blackened stone walls in the area are testament to this pollution. There is a nostalgic longing for this industrial past locally as it represents a time of great endeavour, full employment and a thriving, bustling community (in the film, part of the nostalgia is actually inherent in the showing of archive film footage of that industrial era). The development of numerous co-operative, voluntary societies is another key element of this nostalgia: for two-hundred years or more the Huddersfield area, and particularly the Colne Valley, has seen the formation of many dozens of amateur sporting, musical, naturalist and political societies and the numerous brass bands of the area earned it the name of the ‘land of puff and blow’. Importantly, these societies acted ‘as an important force for social integration’, bringing ‘together a broad spectrum of social classes’ (Russell, 1992: 660). Matt Cole describes the valley as ‘inspiring’, its citizens positive, active and critical (and quoting one time local MP, Richard Wainwright), with ‘a deep understanding of the needs of the individual citizen as against the state and big business’ (2013: 82).

This nostalgic view is heavily tempered however by an understanding that the industrial revolution brought with it great poverty, class exploitation, harsh and short lives, terrible pollution and indeed, a total destruction of the naturally wooded environment. So the first tree planters were, in 1964, facing a sense that that rural idyll was indeed almost mythical, the Kingdom of Elmet where, as a local legend tells,
a squirrel could travel the seven miles from Huddersfield to Marsden, at the head of the valley, leaping from branch to branch without touching the ground (Bentley 1947: 10), is indeed just that, a myth, its cultural memory all but destroyed by hundreds of years of arboreal denudation. So their pragmatic approach was simply to plant trees, to see what would happen. They found that the trees grew. Thus the Society’s ideology of re-foresting the valley was not especially motivated by wider ecological concerns that were in 1964, somewhat politically nascent in any case. Nor was it particularly motivated by other political concerns since the independent mindedness described by Cole and Wainwright above meant the people of the valley were ‘more resistant […] to the stirrings of class consciousness […] with] a distaste for class conflict […] The professional, the employer, the waged labourer, the aged and the disadvantaged, all were part of the same community’ (Cole 2013: 83-4). It is, of course, against this background and the history of amateur endeavour in the valley generally that a society such as CVTS came into being and indeed whose various members down the years fulfil Cole’s description: current CVTS membership is indeed made up of all of the above, including those new to the area and from different ethnic backgrounds.

Part of the nostalgia in the film thus lies in the power of memory harnessed for the early tree-planters themselves, in their endeavour, belief against the odds, and in the Yorkshire ‘no nonsense’ trait of just getting on with it. As Jack Duce said in 1964, the Society came together with the simple aim to do something about the comparative ‘treelessness’ of the valley: ‘co-operation, not conflict, will solve the problems of the world today. The treelessness of Colne Valley is a problem that can be solved […] it merely needs a start to be made here and to watch the results grow’. Many of those early CVTS members have now died including Jack Duce himself who also said that ‘even if hundreds and thousands [of trees] are planted this year we ourselves will not live to see them reach maturity and beautify our valley, but that is no reason at all for not planting them’ (Colne Valley Guardian, 14th February, 1964: 6). The very apparent tree cover in the valley today is testament to the vision and truth contained in these words, spoken in the film over shots of newspaper cuttings of the Society’s achievements, including the ceremonial planting of the 200,000th tree in 1996, and accompanied by layered sounds of current planting activity and valley ambience. This is a conscious attempt to evoke the ‘power of memory’ and ‘nostalgic imagination’ (link to clip 1). It is worth noting that the attitude of local people to this in 1964 was sceptical, the ‘common sense’ view being that ‘trees will not grow here’. It was not hostile however and though there has been occasional vandalism and opposition to tree planting schemes by those whose own nostalgic vision sees the barren hillsides as the natural look of the landscape, as well as a gradual
accommodation by the Society of the ecological concerns of bio-diversity, the work has been supported and encouraged by the local community and local authorities alike.

CVTS tree planters dissolving into an archive image of the valley in its industrial heyday.

‘Equipment for Contact with the World’

Having laid down some context to both the subject matter of the film and to some of its theoretical and philosophical foundations, I will now turn to the notion of sonic and visual digital creativity and strategy and how it relates to this context, its specific relation to techniques used in *Tree People* and to its ecological concerns.

On a simple level, I see digital creativity as divided into two very broad, overlapping areas: first where the digital tools used are mainly functional (such as a digital video camera capturing images) and second, interpretively functional, where the capacities of the digital tools are intrinsic to the detail of the creative act itself (such as a specific software process that *suggests* or *engenders* a creative outcome). Both approaches feature in *Tree People*. The film was made almost entirely by me – filming, audio recording, editing, composing, sound designing and researching — using mostly a small camcorder mounted with an external microphone, a separate audio field recorder, a digital non-linear editor, an audio sequencer and a specific software tool for creatively manipulating audio field recordings.

---

1 I had some assistance from Keith Marley with one extended interview, and from Pierre Alexandre Tremblay with the brass band recording and at the final soundtrack mixing and mastering stage. Ruth Ellen Brown did some still photography of newspaper cuttings.
Filming at Butterley reservoir for Tree People.

With the exception of the final tool, all were used in a generally conventional way to produce a fixed, linear audio-visual product. What is important from a documentary film perspective is the freedom those tools can engender. Imagine the scene (featured about a quarter of the way into the film and again towards the end): I am slowly ascending a steep hill about a mile long; wet snow is beginning to fall heavily and I’m carrying my planting mattock in my left hand whilst cradling the camera in the other, filming other planters ahead of me and the scenery generally as I walk. The microphone mounted on top of the camera picks up my heavy breathing as I tire as well as the distant voices of my colleagues; the camera lens dapples with snow. I eventually arrive at the planting site, high on the moor and a good two miles from the nearest road, just as someone is jokily berating a friend – I slowly zoom in on his face as he finishes talking, hold it for a few seconds, thinking of the edit point, then stop recording. I put the camera away temporarily, pick up my mattock and begin planting trees as I have done with the group every winter since 1997. Later I might get the camera out again or a separate audio recorder to capture the atmosphere, the planting sounds, then return to planting again (link to clip 2). This pattern was repeated numerous times and in several different planting sites over several years. The point here is that the high quality, portability and ease of use of such audio-visual digital tools enables not only spontaneity, but for that single person to be completely
Planting Sounds

embedded within the scene itself and free from any of the normal ‘circus’ that goes along with making a film. Concomitantly, standardised industry practices can be deemed almost irrelevant. In terms of documentary style *Tree People* thus becomes, in Bill Nichols’ terms, ‘interactive’ where the filmmaker observes but also becomes actively involved with the subject (1991: 33, see also Cox 2013: 99). This also begins to push the notion of documentary film into the realm of ethnography since as Feld suggests cameras and audio recorders can be seen as equipment for contact with the world, equipment for interchange with the world, equipment for enhancing a way of living with the world. The real joy and pleasure of recording is an enhanced sociality, an enhanced conviviality, an enhanced way of engaging with listening to people, to places, to objects, to all manner of sound-making things, including the sound of myself breathing, myself walking, the sound of my heart beat, the sound of myself recording (Lane and Carlyle 2013: 209).

*The long ascent up Huck Hill to a moorland planting site.*

**A Sense of Place**

1. **Sounding Objects**

Feld’s idea of ‘listening to places, to objects’ should be emphasized here since the sonic aspect of *Tree People* is designed to combine with the images in an evocation of a sense of place as well as focusing on the intrinsic nature of local sounds, for their own ‘musical’ pleasure. This relates to the earlier point about the importance to the soundtrack of both *musique concrète* with its notion of the abstraction of everyday sounds as well as that of the soundscape where those sounds’ context and meaning is retained. Some examples are the deployment of the sound of a mattock
digging into the ground or the banging of a tree stake: they are of course used synchronously with their source image in numerous places in the film but are also used over different images but where comprehension of the sounds’ sources are still key, such as a section that uses voice-over to describe planting activities but does not show them. In addition a more tightly edited mattock thump or stake bang ‘sound object’, perhaps layered in light reverberation, is deployed in a much more abstracted sense to articulate image edit points that may have much less to do with the original meaning of the sound. This continuum of uses of the sounds associated with planting trees, including the actual voices of those doing it, is a feature throughout *Tree People*; it re-frames those sounds in a variety of ways, embedding the activity throughout whilst also forming part of the sense of the place in which it is happening. Another example, used in a similar fashion, is the sound of passing trains and their whistles. The TransPennine railway line runs down the length of the valley and these sounds have a particular physical resonance related to the physical geography as they echo down the valley, day and night, as well as a virtual resonance evoking a quite specific sense of place.

I regard these uses of mattock, stake and train sounds as intrinsically musical especially when considered in the light of the notion of perceptual ecology that Eric Clarke defines as explaining and interpreting sounds ‘in terms of “the relationship between a perceiver and its environment”’ (Watkins 2011: 405). Clarke makes no distinction in this context between musical and non-musical sounds. In ecomusicological terms, when combined with actual music, these timbres ‘constitute a virtual environment related in subtle ways to actual environments [...] fictionaliz[ing] those places to create many layered musical environments’ (ibid: 415) (link to clip 3).

*A train rushes through CVTS woodland planted in the early 1970s*
2. Musical Evocation

The music in *Tree People* comes in two forms – scored music for piano that opens the film, later transcribed for brass band, and electronic drone chords often derived from piano recording resonances, stretched and isolated using software analysis/re-synthesis techniques. Sometimes the drones are made from digitally atomised and subsequently tightly streamed vocal fragments (the tiny fragments are compacted then considerably sped up), adding a certain roughness to their smooth evolution. In the scene described above for example, gentle, long and steadily evolving drones underpin the ascent up the hill and the planting activity itself; they evolve harmonically in a similar fashion to the opening piano music but far more slowly. They have a certain melancholy; they evoke the longevity of the task, of the slow growth of trees, of the long and momentous history of the valley, and even the memory of those Society members who have died. Like trees themselves, the drones have a symbolic quality. This quality relates directly to the idea of a nostalgic approach to ecological concerns mentioned earlier, appealing to the power of memory, an ‘area in which music is known to excel’. So, in a section that juxtaposes archive images of the valley in the late 1950s with the same sites today, the transformative images dissolving from barren to wooded landscapes is accompanied by an isolated, swelling electronic drone and commented on by a reverberated voice of one of the early planters from an archive audio recording, discussing the site shown. So, the echoing memory of the past is evoked then replaced with a surprisingly positive present, suggesting this time that nostalgia can be misplaced, at least in terms of the landscape itself. At the same time, the memory evoked of those who made those early plantings is heightened (link to clip 4).

![An archive still of the Colne Valley in the late 1950s](image-url)
The piano music itself is mostly built of gentle, slow-moving homophonic chords, tonal but in places quite chromatically convoluted (revolving around the key of Eb); the music ranging across the piano, sometimes quite dramatically. The block chord approach was also there from the start as I had always imagined brass forces playing it at some point.

The opening page of the piano score for Tree People

The music was recorded in my home studio as I looked across the valley and is a straightforward attempt to evoke what I saw – steep cloughs and hills, trees (of course), beauty and ugliness, the rural and the urban, light and shade, rain and sun. At the risk of cliché, the valley really is a place of contrasts and so inscribing that sense of place in the music was important. When transcribed and augmented for the quite large forces of brass band (also recorded on location in the bandroom, which
overlooks the valley) it inevitably took on a more dramatic form, which deepened both its nostalgic quality as well as a sense of place. As has been mentioned, brass and wind bands have been part of the bedrock of amateur music making in the valley for 200 years so can be immediately related to, by local residents at least, as being very much of the place, with a cultural memory of them extending deep into the past. On a more generic level, the importance of musical ideas in Tree People chimes with the importance, historically and currently, of music making in the valley. Thus the music evokes past and present simultaneously.

The opening of the main theme of Tree People scored for brass band.
3. Resounding Voices
Running concurrently in those sections of the film that include the brass and piano music can be found the most overt example of the functionally interpretive use of digital tools to evoke both a sense of place and nostalgia as well as ecological concerns. The opening section of the film, which lasts about five minutes, features a montage of close-up and wider shots of tree species and woodlands in the valley, with occasional glimpses of the protagonists. It is an overtly poetic opening, showing the locations and central 'characters' whilst emphasising the detail, beauty and poetry of trees. It also sets the tone for the film, indicating this is not a conventional documentary, it is a poetic evocation seeking to go beyond pure naturalism to find 'larger implications than the surface realities may suggest' (Anderson in Sussex 1969: 12); it will show more than it tells, it is about pleasurable viewing and listening as much as information; it is deeply concerned with nature and our relationship to it. The pacing and length of the section is determined by the piano music that articulates and flows across edits and reaches its conclusion as the section ends. Unadulterated location sound is mixed in subtly to create a basic sense of space and place, occasionally dropping out completely to draw the listener into a more abstract world. At the same time an almost independent and crucial audio layer is in operation. Whilst filming short interviews on camera with various tree planters I asked them to say the names of the trees planted – 'oak, ash, Scott’s pine ... alder; whitebeam, occasionally; I plant the trees that I’m told to plant' their voices reflecting the varied make up of the Society in both accent and diction. I then edited these words into isolated fragments and inputted them to a software process that randomly selected them for playback whilst I manipulated the randomising parameters live. These parameters controlled the rate of change, the range of samples drawn on and whether the whole sample fragment was played or just part of it. Running simultaneously was another software process that took these same samples and sometimes other spoken fragments and tree planting sounds and performed a much more radical deconstruction of the sounds, rapidly chopping them up into isolated phonemes or sonic gestures, reversing them, and changing amplitude and equalization parameters quite dramatically. Again, I controlled these parameters live as well as the mix between the two processes. The output of both processes was then fed through some subtle delay, reverberation and modulation effects to smooth and help gel the whole output. I ran these processes several times, recording my efforts. The final version was then layered into the mix, with further subtle amplitude...
Planting Sounds
tweaking, under the piano music. The final result is a bed of disembodied fragmented voices of the tree planters reciting the names of trees they plant and the planting sounds they make as a result, that mostly flows independently of all the other audio and image material. Sound and image are linked though by the fact that the images seen during this section are of those trees and people but any actual specific congruence of tree species and person is completely arbitrary and random. Also since all the sounds were recorded outdoors at tree planting sites, their ambience allows them to bed into the location sounds associated directly with the images already present in the mix (link to clip 5).

Later in the film this section returns, in somewhat different form, with the brass band music coming to the fore as the fruits of the Society’s fifty-year endeavours are made more apparent with panoramic shots of the valley as well as more close detail of bantering, humorous interactions of the members. Crucially, this time the tree species are augmented by some archive audio of a founding Society member, Wilf Procter, reciting the names of places that the Society has planted in, ‘Broad Oak, Leymoor, Slaithwaite, Paddock … Netherwood; the steep land, facing the valley which runs along below Crosland Moor’; also subject to the same randomised processing. His is a single voice with a distinctive Yorkshire accent and, combined with the lower quality audio timbre inherent in the old recording, enables these fragments to be distinct. So here the collage of voices evokes both place and species, the present and the past, continuity and heterogeneity. They exist in a slightly surreal space separate from the specifics of the locations and people depicted but still obviously connected, sitting somewhere between them and the
brass band music that exists in a more conventional musically abstracted space though of itself still evoking the valley as described earlier (link to clip 6). Driven by the ‘overwhelming multisensory character of perceptual experience’, we end up with what Feld describes as a ‘multisensory conceptualization of place’ and here, history and ecology also. It is place as both heard, viewed and felt, ‘sounding and resounding’ (Feld 1996: 94).

Looking west down the valley to Marsden village showing tree cover, much of which has resulted from planting since 1964

*Tree People* is a positive film, showing how dedicated human action can engender recovery in a ravaged landscape. It draws on nostalgia to show how the power of memory can be both a positive force for change as well as a complex conundrum. It uses digital techniques to enable the embedding of the very actions of making the film into its subject matter as well as to evoke a sense of place, history and nostalgia, and the natural world. The film places emphasis on the power of sound design and music to not only aid, but potentially lead in all these aspects. Trees are symbolic in many ways, not least because of their long lives, often outstripping our own and by hundreds of years. Thus there is a certain melancholy note in the film, especially towards the end, as it becomes clear that many of the pioneering tree people themselves have died and only saw the fruits of their tree-planting labours partially, if at all. This melancholy is present despite their understanding that this was ‘no reason at all to not plant them’. But those fruits of their and continuing Society members’ labours are obvious today and though it cannot be said that a squirrel can now jump from tree branch to tree branch down the valley’s entire length, as in the days of Elmet, with the exception of the sprawl of the valley’s larger villages, it almost can.
Bibliography

A Film About Nice, Keith Marley and Geoffrey Cox, UK, 2010.


Lane, Cathy and Angus Carlyle (2013) In the Field: the Art of Field Recording, Axminster: Uniform Books.


Tree People, Geoffrey Cox, UK, 2014.