University of Huddersfield Repository

Leeming, Dawn and Marshall, Joyce

The concept of shame and how understanding this might enhance support for breastfeeding mothers

Original Citation


This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/23973/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/
The concept of shame and how understanding this might enhance support for breastfeeding mothers

DAWN LEEMING & JOYCE MARSHALL
UNIVERSITY OF HUDDERSFIELD
Aims

- To explore the usefulness of the literature on shame and shame management for understanding the experiences of women who struggle to establish breastfeeding
- To consider what this literature might suggest re. good practice when supporting breastfeeding mothers
  - illustrated with data from two previous empirical studies (Marshall et al., 2007; Marshall & Godfrey, 2011; Williamson et al., 2012; Leeming et al., 2013)
potential for shame: experiencing breastfeeding as a test of good mothering

I was really nervous because I remember thinking, this isn’t going to work, and Gordon [husband] was there, all sort of excited to watch, and I felt really on display, even though I was still sort of overwhelmed..... How am I going to succeed in this? And I felt really like, this is a sort of test. (Talking about first feed following birth)

From: Leeming et al. (2013)
The potential for shame

I felt tense because I felt I was being observed to some degree to see what I was like, if I was coming up to scratch. … and they also made a big deal every time he was grouchy like ‘oo babies don’t cry for no reason there must be something wrong with him’ and …saying to me ‘have you fed him, have you fed him, he’s hungry, have you fed him?’ … I found that all a bit undermining really


It [‘topping up’ with a bottle of formula milk] also made me feel very, um, just like a really crap mother, to be honest . . . I just felt that I couldn’t um, produce what she was needing . . . It just made me feel very inadequate.

From Williamson et al., (2012)
The potential for shame

- Breasts as taboo – sexualisation, disgust
- Difficulties establishing breastfeeding can have powerful emotional consequences:
  - Sense of ‘failure’, ‘inadequacy’, guilt, self-doubt, low self-esteem... (e.g. Guyer et al., 2012; Mozingo et al., 2000; Thomson et al., 2014; Williamson et al., 2012)
Invisibility of shame

- Shame has become a taboo within the West
  - We are ashamed of our shame (Scheff, 2003)
  - Sometimes referred to as ‘embarrassment’ or ‘guilt’

- Some recent attention to shame in breastfeeding literature e.g. Thomson et al. (2014)

- Taylor & Wallace (2012) - Distress around difficulties breastfeeding / decisions not to breastfeed has often been treated as ‘guilt’
Shame vs. guilt

Many attempts by emotion theorists to tease out differences:

- Extent of concern with own / others’ views of self
- Negative focus on behaviour / self

We draw on Gilbert’s (1994, 2003) model:

- Highlights differing experience of relations with others
Guilt

**Self (able)**
- Source of hurt / let down
- Intact and capable
- Focus on own actions
  - Wrong doing
  - Putting it right

**Other (unable)**
- Needful, hurt
- Incapable, needing
- Focus on let down / injury

Shame

Self (unable)
- Self in focal awareness
- Object of scorn, ridicule
- Paralysed, helpless, passive, inhibited
- Inferior, smaller, weaker
- Involuntary body response (rage, blush..)
- Functioning poorly (mind blank, desire to hide..)

Other (able)
- Other in focal awareness
- Source of scorn, ridicule
- Laughing, rejecting, active, uninhibited
- Superior, bigger, stronger
- Adult & in control
- Functioning well but experiencing contempt

(Gilbert et.al, 1994 p. 26, - adapted from Lewis, 1986)
Nathanson’s ‘Compass of shame’

We can respond to shame in quite problematic ways:

- **Withdrawal**:
  - isolating oneself
  - running and hiding

- **Attack Other**:
  - "turning the tables"
  - blaming the victim
  - lashing out verbally or physically

- **Attack Self**:
  - self put-down
  - masochism

- **Avoidance**:
  - denial
  - abusing drugs and alcohol
  - distraction through thrill-seeking
Possibilities for managing & repairing shame

Recent empirical findings tell us that what is useful is:

- Connection
- Articulating & acknowledging shame
- Empowerment & redefining ideals
- Acceptance, validation, compassion
- Normalisation & contextualisation of experiences

(Artwork credit: Hero-in-shame, Deviantart.com)

(Brown, 2006; Dayal, Weaver & Domene, 2015; Gilbert & Proctor, 2006; Leeming & Boyle, 2013; van Vliet, 2008)
Connection vs withdrawal

**Connection:**
if you can get the midwife that you’re used to that you feel less erm self-conscious in front of then perhaps you might be more likely to allow somebody to show you more techniques, because it’s quite intrusive having people touching your breasts and watching you when you already probably feel a little bit new to things (diary – 5 weeks)

**Withdrawal:**
... she said ring me if you need me tomorrow. And I thought well, I’d like you to come tomorrow, but it makes me feel inadequate if I have to ring you. (interview – week 1, talking about midwife)

From Williamson et al., (2012); Leeming et al., (2013)
Validation through contextualisation and normalisation:

it [breastfeeding] just wasn’t happening at all that first night, the first few hours. And I wish um, actually it was only when one of them said he’s probably feeling full because of the mucus, it’s not anything you’re doing wrong, sort of thing. (Diary – looking back on day 1)

you sort of lack confidence about whether you are doing it right or not and when you get painful nipples, and you think, well I must be doing it wrong. I got some help from one of the ladies at the Baby Café and she said first of all that he has got a very small lower jaw [uh hm] and wasn’t latching on completely properly (interview – one week)

From Williamson et al., (2012); Leeming et al., (2013)
Implications for midwifery, health visiting and peer support practice

- Promotion of breastfeeding - less problematic antenatally but potential cause of shame for women experiencing challenges breastfeeding
- There is a need to listen to women’s stories and explore their individual beliefs and expectations of infant feeding and motherhood
  - Not assuming women will ask for help – some women will need proactive support
- Value women as mothers (rather than breastfeeding per se) and help to build self-esteem during the transition to motherhood
They came in, listened to you and, you know you were an individual, you didn’t feel like they were saying ‘Right you should be doing this, you’re doing it wrong’. Nobody ever said to me ‘Don’t do that, you’re doing it wrong’, you know with anything so, you know I felt like I did have quite a lot of support. And they kind of, also gave you like the encouragement and say ‘Well yeh, you know you’re doing really well’. Kind of, you know ‘hang in there’, which was nice to hear.

“Some of them [women] don’t realise that it can be incorrect fixing and they might only be 2mm out. I think they think ‘god I am crap at this’ because you say ‘the baby is not fixed’. If you just went ‘this baby is not fixed on properly’, its ‘oh I am not good at this’. Instead of saying ‘well do you know you have got it 85% right there, all you need is that little bit more in the baby’s mouth’”

Implications for midwifery, health visiting and peer support practice

- Emotional support cannot be separated from practical/technical support
- Help women to connect with others - to talk, socialise and ‘find allies’
- Shame resilience is likely to be important for good maternal mental health
Publications from datasets quoted:


Other key references


Acknowledgements

We would like to thank:

- All the women who took part in both studies
- The following people who supported and advised or collaborated with the original studies
  - **Mary Renfrew** – MIRU, University of Dundee
  - **Mary Godfrey** – University of Leeds
  - **Iain Williamson** & **Steven Lyttle** – De Montfort University, Leicester
  - **Sally Johnson** – Bradford University
Contacts

Dawn Leeming
D.leeming@hud.ac.uk

Joyce Marshall
Joyce.marshall@hud.ac.uk