

# **University of Huddersfield Repository**

McInnes, Louise

The social, political and religious contexts of the late Medieval carol

## **Original Citation**

McInnes, Louise (2013) The social, political and religious contexts of the late Medieval carol. Doctoral thesis, University of Huddersfield.

This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/23404/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/

## The Social, Political and Religious Contexts of the Late Medieval Carol: 1360-1520

Louise McInnes

A thesis submitted to the University of Huddersfield in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

May 2013

# **Dedication**

This thesis is lovingly dedicated to my children, husband, and parents for their unconditional love and support. My great thanks must also go to Dr Lisa Colton and Professor John Bryan for their sage advice and endless patience.

# **Abstract**

This thesis examines the late medieval English carol, an important indigenous musical form that is abundant in a number of sources from the late fourteenth to the early sixteenth century, both with and without extant musical notation. Carols with musical notation have been favoured by musicologists in previous research. This thesis however, provides a new context for the study of the carol by also including a close investigation of those carols without extant musical notation; thus presenting a fuller picture of the genre than that of previous musicological studies. The carol has been somewhat neglected in terms of recent, detailed, published research, therefore this study addresses the reasons for its neglect, and reveals a broader understanding of the genre. It applies a combination of traditional and modern methodologies: empirical research, gender study and ethnomusicological research, in order to place the carol genre in clearer social, political and religious contexts and better understand its place and use in late medieval society.

Through the application of these methodologies, this thesis provides an important perspective on the place of women, not only in the carols, but also within broader social and musical contexts, revealing a complex picture of their place in medieval music as subjects, performers and composers. Suggestions for the use of carols in sermons and other forms of worship are also made, and the carol's value as a vehicle for political commentary and English nationalism in this period is demonstrated. By approaching the carol in this manner, this study takes us beyond the popular perception of it as a genre merely for the amusement of educated clerics, instead revealing an important, popular musical form that was found in all strata of society.

# **Contents**

	Page
Tables	7-8
Introduction	9-12
Chapter 1: The Carol: Musical Features and Previous Scholarship	
i. Introduction	13-15
ii. Manuscript Sources	
a. London, British Library, Sloane 2593	15-18
b. London, British Library, Additional 5666	18-20
iii. Text and Language	20-21
iv. Musical and Textual Structure	21-37
v. Voices	37-38
vi. Voice Pitches	38-41
vii. Melodic Behaviour	41-47
viii. Sections/Phrasing	48
ix. Mensuration	48-50
x. Use of Pre-Existent Material	51
xi. Monophonic Carols	51-53
xii. The Carol and the Carole	53-58
xiii. Previous Scholarship: the need for a multidisciplinary approach	58-68
xiv. Conclusion	68-69

## Chapter 2: The Carol: an isolated genre?

i.	Introduction		70-72
	The Carol an	d the Motet	72-73
	a.	Voices	73-74
	b.	Melodic Behaviour	74-75
	с.	Text Setting	75-76
	b.	Egerton-A Comparative Study	76-81
ii.	The Carol an	d Earlier Genres	81-85
iii.	Conductus		86-87
iv.	The Ritson N	Nanuscript and the Hymn	87-93
v.	Possible reas	sons for the Isolation of the Carol in Current	93-95
	and Past Res	search	
vi.	Conclusion		95-96

Chapter 3: The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?

i. Introduction	97
ii. The Author's Voice	97-103
iii. Authorship in the Carols	103-107
iv. Who is the Composer? Musical Borrowing Within the Carols	108-110
v. Authorship in the Ritson Manuscript	110-111
vi. The Henry VIII Manuscript and the Fayrfax Manuscript	111-114
vii. The 'J.D.' Carol	114-119
viii. Other Named Carol Composers	120
ix. Conclusion	120-121

# Chapter 4: 'That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth- century carol, a music of the people?

i.	Introduction	122
ii.	Lost Melodies and the Oral Tradition	122-124
iii.	Monophonic Carols	124-135
iv.	The Agincourt Carol	135-138
٧.	Drama and the Carol	139-145
vi.	Conclusion	145

### Chapter 5: Women in the Late Medieval Carols

i.	Introduction	146-150
ii.	Female Authorship or Female Voice?	151-156
iii.	Humour in the Female Carol	156-159
iv.	'Comidentes Convinete': A Carol to Women Feasters	160-166
v.	The Henry VIII Manuscript	166-174
vi.	Sex, Seduction and Shame	174-180
vii	. MS 54: Saints and Sinners	180-183
vii	i. Carols by Women?	183-189
ix.	Conclusion	189-190

## Chapter 6: The Medieval Carol: a vehicle for political commentary and English nationalism

i.	Introduction	191-193
ii.	Political Carols in Manuscripts with Musical Notation	193-195
iii.	Carols to Saint George and Saint Thomas of Canterbury	196-203
iv.	The Political Carols of Egerton 3307	203-208

i.	Political Carols in the Ritson Manuscript: the Political Carol in	
	the Celebration of Christmas	209-214
ii.	Henry V and Agincourt	214-215
iii.	The Political Carols of the Fayrfax Manuscript	216-218
iv.	Language in the Political Carols	218-221
v.	The Henry VIII Manuscript and the Political Carol	221-227
vi.	Music of the Political Carols	228-233
vii.	Political Carols with no Musical Notation	233-234
viii	Conclusion	234

# Chapter 7: 'But here the greatest melody arises without any physical instrument, when the angels minister and sing to Christ': The Carol in Sermons and Late Medieval Worship.

i	i.	Introduction	235
i	ii.	Sermon Manuscripts	235-243
i	iii.	A Carol within a Sermon?	244-250
i	iv.	A Second Carol?	251-252
,	v.	Vernacular Carols within Latin Sermon Manuscripts	253
,	vi.	The Ritson Manuscript: Understanding Carols in Worship	254-258
,	vii.	Liturgical Quotations in the Carols of the Ritson Manuscript	258-263
,	viii.	The Use of Latin and Liturgical Quotations in the Carol/Sermon	
		Manuscripts	263-266
i	ix.	A Benedicamus Substitute and Processional Hymn?	266-269
2	x.	The 'Unsuitable' Carol in Sermon Manuscripts	269-280
2	xi.	Conclusion	280-281
Con	clu	sion	282-285

Appendix (Primary Sources)	286-312
Bibliography	313-324

#### Word Count: 83331

# **Tables**

Chapter 1:	Page
1. Manuscripts containing carols that are addressed within this thesis	13-14
2. The use of language within the carols of the main notated carol manuscripts	20
3. Voice scoring for the carols with double burdens	27-29
4. Percentage of carols with double burdens within the main notated	
carol manuscripts	30
5. Number of voices used in the fifteenth-century carol manuscripts	37
6. Alternation of voice number within the carols	38
7. Voice Ranges in the Carols of the Trinity Roll	39-40
8. Voice ranges from a selection carols of carols from Ritson	40
9. Overall voice compass of the four main manuscripts of the 15 <sup>th</sup> century	40
10. Extant Monophonic Carols	52
11. Text and Language in the Monophonic Carols	52
12. Manuscripts transcribed in Stevens, John, ed., Mediaeval Carols (London, 197	70)
	59-60
13. The main monographs from 1935-2011 that contain commentary on carols	63-64
Chapter 2:	
14. Musical genres within carol manuscripts	71
15. Pitch range of the Egerton motet in comparison to three voice carols	79
16. Voice texture in the Ritson manuscript	93
<u>Chapter 3:</u>	
17. Named Authors of Carols	104
Chapter 4:	
18. Extant monophonic carols	125
19. Voice ranges within the monophonic carols	133-134
Chapter 5:	
20. Carols with a Woman's Voice	147
21. Carols of Female Saints/Saint Carols Addressed to Women	147
22. Carols with some female narrative	148
23. Carols about women in some form/love of a woman	148-150

24. Carols in which women are directly addressed	150
25. The use of Language in Egerton	161
26. Pitch Ranges in 'Blow thy horn hunter'	174

# Chapter 6:

27. Extant notated carols with political lyrics, or lyrics associated with	
St Thomas or St George in notated carol manuscripts 194-1	95
28. The number and percentage weighting of political carols in musically	
notated manuscripts 195	
29. The order of carols in the Egerton manuscript208-2	09
30. Language of the political carols218-2	19
31. Use of single and double burdens in political carols229	
32. Musical features of the political carols232	
33. Political carols extant with no musical notation233	

# Chapter 7:

34. Carol manuscripts containing sermons, theological material or material	
in relation to members of the clergy	237
35. Carols in the Ritson Manuscript attributed to Richard Smert and John	
Trouluffe.	226
36. Liturgical quotations in the carols of the Ritson manuscript	259-260
The inclusion of Latin lines within the Ritson manuscript	263-264
Latin lines within the carols of Table 34(carol manuscripts containing sermons,	
theological material or material in relation to members of the clergy)	265-266
Sermon manuscripts containing secular carols	271-272

# **Introduction**

The late medieval carol, abundant in a wealth of sources both with and without musical notation, is an important musical form that, in terms of detailed, published, academic research, has been greatly neglected for many years; most of the main studies of the genre were undertaken in the middle of the twentieth century by literary specialists such as R. L. Greene, and musicologist John Stevens.<sup>1</sup> The reason for this gap is certainly not due to saturation of research in this area, as there is still much to learn about the importance of this musical form and its diverse uses in medieval life, but more likely a combination of factors such as: the carol only being found in English sources, and therefore seen as divorced from the perceived 'mainstream' of continental music developments; the perception of it as a form in the main for the amusement of educated male clerics; and the seeming finality of both Steven's and Greene's publications.<sup>2</sup> This thesis therefore, will initially examine the carol in terms of its key elements: form, language, text, subject, musical devices and its placement in manuscript sources in order to fully understand what is meant by the term 'carol', followed by a thorough examination of those factors that may have contributed to its neglect. In addition to being side-lined in terms of published research, the carol has also been conventionally separated by academics into musically notated and nonmusically notated carols. This approach, as will be demonstrated throughout this thesis, will not allow for a full and thorough investigation of the genre. Therefore, a more detailed investigation of carols without musical notation will shed new light on those that do.

In order to explore the carols in this way, this thesis will examine a number of aspects of the genre using traditional and modern musicological methodologies: empirical research,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Greene, R.L., The Early English Carols (Oxford, 1935), Stevens, J., ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), Stevens, J., ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), Stevens, J., ed., *Early Tudor Songs and Carols* (London, 1975). Stevens was a professor of medieval and renaissance literature: his interest in carols was sparked originally by the texts, which then led him to explore the music in greater detail, resulting in his three editions for Musica Britannica containing carol repertoire.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> There has been a recent publication on the origins of the Agincourt Carol: Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music*, 35/1 (2007), 23-38. There have also been some recent PhD dissertations written upon the subject but with no resulting publication of the research: Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa, 2000), Smaill, Adele Margaret, *Medieval Carols: Origins, Forms, and Performance Contexts* (PhD from Michigan, 2003), and Palti, Kathleen, 'Singe we now alle and sum': Three Fifteenth-Century Collections of Communal Song (PhD from University College London, 2008).

gender study and ethnomusicological approaches. This combination of approaches should allow the carol to be seen in the wider contexts of time and place; viewing the carols as part of a larger scheme, and moving them away from the commonly held view that they were merely an amusement for educated clerics. Instead, this thesis will reveal a far more multifaceted genre. Greene's publication, although forming a strong foundation on which to build, will be challenged here in order to break down previous preconceptions of the form; an approach that has not been attempted in carol research thus far. A readdressing of Greene's methodology for the exclusion of certain carols from his publication, and his general categorisation of carol subjects, is necessary in order to place the carols within a modern musicological framework.

The carol will also be examined in context with other musical forms of the late medieval period, and analysed on equal terms with genres such as the motet and the hymn- both genres that are found in manuscripts alongside the carol. Previously, the carols have tended to be treated in isolation from other musical forms. This is a misconception that will be challenged in this study, instead revealing, through the examination of manuscript evidence, that the carol was written and performed alongside many other musical genres in the late medieval period, and should therefore be treated similarly in current research and performance. In doing this, the carol can then be seen as part of a larger medieval corpus and placed in a more thoroughly representative context than previous approaches. In order to achieve this, it is important to distance oneself from the composer-centred approach in the examination of the genre due to the small number of extant named carol composers. It is imperative therefore that one avoids being fixed upon these few named composers, instead concentrating on the wider, largely anonymous whole. This approach will facilitate a fair and balanced approach to the carol material.

Musicological research has tended to favour the polyphonic carol of the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries for study, however, there also exist a significant number of monophonic carols. These monophonic survivors have previously been thought, by scholars such as Stevens, to be a small window into lost popular song melodies that were more generally transmitted orally rather than in notated form. This thesis will develop this argument, and ultimately discuss the possibility of a large body of lost popular song melodies. These lost melodies

10

may point to an oral carol tradition used amongst the less educated classes of society that is now lost to us, again moving the carol away from the general preconception of the carol and the educated cleric.

The involvement of women in music of the Middle Ages is generally still unclear; however, this thesis will present evidence that may explain their association with the carols in some capacity, whether as subject, audience, performers or composers. There are a large number of carols that speak directly to women, speak in a female voice, are about women or contain an amount of female narrative. By exploring these, this study will aim to place women more clearly within the music of this period, challenging Greene's categorisation of these particular carols and ultimately revealing a far larger corpus of 'carols of women' than has previously been realised. This will demonstrate a far more complex picture of women in the medieval carol.

The political carol, as classified by Greene, will also be addressed in detail. The definition of what makes a 'political carol' will be clarified, and an important case for the addition of carols, namely those for the Saints George and Thomas of Canterbury, to this category will be made, thus allowing a re-examination of what is perceived as political in this period. GB-Lbl Egerton 3307 is central to this research, as this thesis will demonstrate that the grouping of the political carols in this manuscript shows their strength and importance as a collection, something not previously noted, and will further validate the inclusion of carols to St Thomas of Canterbury in this political category. This should show that politics had a stronger influence and impetus than has previously been considered in this genre. By analysing the political carols of the period it will also be shown that a politically texted carol was equally at home in the celebrations of the Christmas season as those of the nativity, and importantly, that a strong sense of English nationalism was emerging from within their texts.

Finally, this study will address the possible use of the carols in worship. Carols are found in a substantial number of manuscripts alongside sermons, theological material and instructional devices, or in manuscripts that originated in the hands of priests, clerics and friars and contain within them lines from hymns and liturgical texts. This may point to their use as a preaching tool or perhaps other possible uses in medieval worship. By examining

11

the carols within these manuscripts, this thesis will aim to explore possible uses for the carol in worship, and examine their connection to the liturgy.

By employing these methodologies, this thesis will disclose a more complex picture of the carol than has previously been portrayed, revealing a musical form that was not only for the use of educated male clerics, but one that found its way into all strata of society in one practice or another.

# Chapter 1

# The Carol: Musical Features and Previous Scholarship

The late medieval carol is abundant in a wealth of English manuscripts of the period. Approximately 500 texts survive from 1360-1520; over 130 of which have extant musical notation. The carols with musical notation and without survive in approximately 138 manuscripts that vary greatly in terms of provenance, size and content.<sup>1</sup> Table 1 illustrates the extant manuscripts that are particularly explored within this thesis, detailing their approximate dates and whether or not they contain carols with musical notation.<sup>2</sup> This chapter aims to clarify the textual and musical characteristics of the carol, and investigate theories pertaining to its origins. An evaluation of past and current research into the carol will also be undertaken in order to illustrate the ways in which the genre has been previously defined.

Manuscript	Date	Carols including musical notation
GB-Bbcm 123	15 <sup>th</sup> century	x
GB-Cgc MS 383/603	14 <sup>th</sup> -15 <sup>th</sup> century	$\checkmark$
GB-Cjc S.54	Late 15 <sup>th</sup> century	x
GB-Ctc O.3.58 (Trinity)	Early 15 <sup>th</sup> century	$\checkmark$
GB-Ctc 0.9.38	15 <sup>th</sup> century/second half (carol layer)	x
GB-Ctc R.4.20	15 <sup>th</sup> century/second half	x
GB-Ctc R.14.26	Early 15 <sup>th</sup> century	x
GB- Cu Additional 5943	15 <sup>th</sup> century/ first quarter	$\checkmark$

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The period of 1360 -1520 has been established as important in order to take in the earliest non- musically notated carols of the late fourteenth century, to the latest notated manuscript source, the Henry VIII manuscript of c.1520.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> For a full and up to date table of all of the extant carol manuscripts see: Smaill, Adele Margaret, *Medieval Carols: Origins, Forms, and Performance Contexts* (Michigan, 2003), 464-467. Table 1 lists the manuscripts alphabetically in order of sigla. Some dates are necessarily broad due to the nature of the manuscripts. All dates are as accurate as possible and have been compared with Greene, R.L., The Early English Carols (Oxford, 1935), individual Library Catalogues, The Digital Image Archive of Medieval Music (www.diamm.ac.uk) and RISM (www.rism.org) as well as individual publications.

c. 1492	٧
15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half	x
1372	x
1475-1500	٧
16 <sup>th</sup> century (carol layer)	x
15 <sup>th</sup> century	٧
14 <sup>th</sup> century	x
15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half	x
Late 15th or early 16th century	٧
c.1425-40 (carol layer)	٧
16 <sup>th</sup> century/first half	x
15 <sup>th</sup> century/ second half (carol layer)	x
15 <sup>th</sup> century	x
c.1500	٧
c. 1460-1510	٧
Early 15 <sup>th</sup> century	٧
15 <sup>th</sup> century	x
Mid-15 <sup>th</sup> century	x
c.1510-20	٧
16 <sup>th</sup> century/first quarter	x
c. 1450	٧
c. 1455	٧
16 <sup>th</sup> century/first half	x
15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half	x
15 <sup>th</sup> century (carol layer)	x
	15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half 1372 1475-1500 16 <sup>th</sup> century (carol layer) 15 <sup>th</sup> century 14 <sup>th</sup> century 15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half 15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half 15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half 15 <sup>th</sup> century/second half (carol 16 <sup>th</sup> century/second half (carol 15 <sup>th</sup> century 15 <sup>th</sup> century 15 <sup>th</sup> century 2.1500 c. 1460-1510 Early 15 <sup>th</sup> century 15 <sup>th</sup> century/first quarter c. 1450 c. 1455

Table 1: Manuscripts containing carols that are addressed within this thesis.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> With the exception of GB-Lca 1.7 and GB-Bbcm 123, sigla used is in concordance with RISM. A full table of the manuscripts used in this study with full references and contents can be found in Appendix A.

In order to place the carol in wider social, political and religious contexts within this thesis, it is first imperative to understand the manuscripts and the musical and textual forms and devices that identify the genre.

## **Manuscript Sources**

There is no 'typical' fifteenth-century source in which carols, with or without musical notation, are located. They are found in courtly manuscripts and simple pocket books; in manuscripts dedicated to music and those found nestled amongst accounts and recipes. In order to better understand the diversity of carol sources, it is useful to examine two sources: one non- musically notated manuscript, and one with musical notation.

## London, British Library, Sloane 2593

London, British Library, Sloane 2593 (henceforth known as Sloane 2593), is an interesting manuscript that dates from the early fifteenth century. It particularly stands out in the non-musically notated carol manuscript collection in the sense that approximately 80% of its contents are carols.<sup>4</sup>

The manuscript itself is unassuming, measuring 150 x 110 mm and made from paper, it contains no illumination or embellishment. It is, however, very neatly, and densely, written in a consistent hand throughout its 37 folios, with the exception only of folios 35v-37v which contain some scribbles, a note and medical recipes in three other hands. The insertion of carols within seemingly unrelated content, or indeed unrelated content inserted alongside the carols is a common occurrence in many of the extant manuscripts containing this genre. Commonly, manuscripts containing carols are often found bound together with other manuscripts, or seem to have originally been a part of something larger. Sloane 2593 falls in to the latter category, as it contains previous folio numbering that shows the present f.2 to have formerly been f.49 '.<sup>5</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> For a complete list of the carols found in this manuscript see: Appendix 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.* (Oxford, 1977), 306

The carols are particularly easy to identify visually within this manuscript due to their written arrangement. This technique is described by Palti thus:

The burdens are written as 'prose' at the top, with a paraph mark in the margin to their left. Each stanza begins with a slightly less elaborate paraph mark in the margin. A brace connects the lines of the stanza, and the final line of each stanza is written to the right of this brace. A plain line is drawn between each song.<sup>6</sup>

This method of carol notation is echoed throughout the fifteenth-century, often enabling the initial visual identification of carols within manuscripts of this period. Another commonality is the inclusion of other material alongside the carols. In Sloane 2593, carols are found together with other Latin and English songs, fourteen in total. They include: 'Three Latin songs: the famous 'Meum est propositum in taberna mori', a rondeau, 'Procedenti puero'...and a cantelina, 'Non pudescit corpore', in praise of St. Thomas of Canterbury, which is undefaced and shows that the MS. did not continue in a secular house.' <sup>7</sup> English songs are also present, namely: ''I syng of a mayden'; 'I have a gentil cook'; 'I haue a newe gardyn'; 'Robin lyth in grene wode bowdyn' (ballad); 'As I wnet throw a gardyn grene'; 'Be the way wandering as I went'; 'Seynt Steuene was a clerk' (ballad); 'Aue maris stella'; 'If I synge ye wyl me lakke'; 'Enmy Herowde, thou wokkyd kyng'; 'As I me lend to a lend'.<sup>8</sup> The subject matter for both the Latin and English songs varies considerably, as does the subject matter of the carols, which are listed in appendix one. They range in classification from those centred on religious events, particularly the nativity, to the celebration of saints and texts that discuss women and marriage. The religious songs are, however, the most abundant.<sup>9</sup> The grouping together of subject matter is equally eclectic, although the carol genre is particularly well defined in the manuscript layout. Palti notes that:

While patterns in subject matter are difficult to trace, ribald jokes on occasion sharing a page with Marian praise, the first part of the manuscript can be divided

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Palti, Kathleen, 'Singe we now alle and sum': Three Fifteenth-Century Collections of Communal Song (PhD from University College London, 2008), 70

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.* (Oxford, 1977), 306

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols*, (Oxford, 1935), 330

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Wright, Thomas, *Songs and Carols Printed from a Manuscript in the Sloane Collection in the British Museum* (London, 1856), vi

into two sequences of songs sharing similar formal patterns. The first twenty-four texts are all carols with quatrain stanzas and couplet burdens [with one exception]...The next seven songs are written in long couplets...only one of which has a burden...After these two groupings the pattern is less clear, consisting of short sequences of carols, punctuated by songs of different types, sometimes in pairs.<sup>10</sup>

Despite its seeming loss of defined structural layout latterly, this manuscript does show some initial degree of organisation, and its grouping together of carols in this manner is typical of manuscripts that hold a significant number of this genre.

The provenance of this manuscript, as with the majority of manuscripts containing carols from this period, is unproven. Various hypotheses have been presented. David Fowler suggests:

The matter has been disputed, but it may well be that this collection is representative of popular minstrelsy in the fifteenth century, and is therefore one of the best manuscripts available for the study and the emergence of the popular ballad from folk song tradition.<sup>11</sup>

Greene however suggests a more precise provenance for the manuscript. He argues that:

This important MS. is from Bury St. Edmunds, almost certainly from the great Benedictine monastery there. It contains the only preserved English carol in honour of St. Edmund...It also offers the only two known carols in honour of St. Nicholas...The boy-bishop who was rewarded at Bury...was there known as 'the bishop of St. Nicholas'...There was an altar dedicated to St. Nicholas in the monastery church...The whole MS. is written in a specifically East Anglican form of language.'

Greene also cites the name 'Bardel', which is included in the manuscript as more evidence of its roots in Bury St. Edmunds due to its commonality in that area. Palti however, disagrees with this assertion, claiming that the mane 'Bardel' may well help to place the manuscript in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Palti, Kathleen, 'Singe we now alle and sum': Three Fifteenth-Century Collections of Communal Song (PhD from University College London, 2008), 70

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Fowler, David, 'The Ballad' in, *A Manual of the Writings in Middle English, 1050-1500*, vol. 6 ed. Albert Hartung (New Haven, 1980), 1765

the East Anglian region, but not specifically in Bury St Edmunds itself.<sup>12</sup> Lisa Colton suggests that the Bury St Edmunds connection is in fact correct but places the manuscript in the hands of the town chaplains. She writes:

The fifteenth-century carol *Synge we now*...is preserved in its single source alongside the only two carols to have survived in honour of St Nicholas, indicating that the manuscript is of Bury provenance. I would argue that the manuscript belonged to the chaplains working in the town rather than to the monks of the abbey. The *Douzeguild* comprised burgesses and twelve secular priests, who were responsible for the running of the grammar school and the song school; there are payments recorded to this effect in a rental of 1386.<sup>13</sup>

Other theories include a connection to the Lynn due to the mention of this place name in the carol 'Thynk man gwerof thou art wrout'.<sup>14</sup>

#### London, British Library, Additional 5666

London, British Library, Additional 5666 (henceforth known as Additional 5666) also has its roots in a similar period to Sloane 2593, the early part of the fifteenth century, and therefore provides a comparative study in terms of chronology. In contrast to Sloane however, Additional 5666 contains only three carols, all of which survive with musical notation. These three carols are: 'Lullay my child', 'This ender day' and 'Lullay: I saw'. 'Lullay I saw' is the only polyphonic carol, scored for two voices, the others are monophonic. Unlike the carols of Sloane 2593, the carols in this manuscript all follow a lullaby theme, perhaps chosen by the compiler specifically for this reason. This is especially likely due to the existence of a further lullaby fragment that has unfortunately faded, the song 'Now has Mary born' that follows a similar theme and a further piece, the Latin nativity motet 'Puer natus in bethlehem unde gaude'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Palti, Kathleen, 'Singe we now alle and sum': Three Fifteenth-Century Collections of Communal Song (PhD from University College London, 2008),73

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Colton, Lisa, 'Music and identity in medieval Bury St Edmunds', in Anthony Bale ed., St Edmund: Images of Royalty, Martyrdom and Masculinity (Woodbridge, 2009), 109

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See: Wakelin, Daniel, 'Lightening at Lynn: The Origins of a Lyric in Sloane 2593', *Notes and* Queries, 48 (2001), 382-385

Like Sloane 2593, this manuscript also contains a selection of material unrelated to the songs and carols, found grouped together at the start of the manuscript, including a: Latin grammar treatise in prose and the expense accounts of John White which is dated '12 Henry IV' and therefore places the expenses in 1410/ 1411. It would seem that there are three scribal hands at work throughout, of which the songs, carols and Latin grammatical treatise are in one, the notes (which include three lines of French verse and a hand drawn tree with a pierced heart that includes the motto 'Pur vere amur je su mort' and 'Fuit homo') in a second, and later notes in a third.<sup>15</sup>

The songs and carols are written in landscape, with the remainder of the material in portrait. The manuscript, measuring 133 mm x 95.25 mm, compiled of 22 folios, and constructed of paper, is slightly smaller than Sloane 2593, and doesn't have the latter's consistent neat construction and written style. The staves are drawn freehand, and lack uniformity. This may suggest that this was originally a pocket book, it is certainly the right size for this purpose, and that the carols and other songs were simply being recorded for the owner's personal use. The carols are inserted in this manuscript in such a way that suggests they were not merely an afterthought slotted in to fill spaces in the remaining paper, but a valued content of the volume

Provenance for this source, like many of the manuscripts that contain carols, is difficult to ascertain. Greene points out the uncertainty of one clue within the source:

The note written on f. 1v of the volume is certainly erroneous. It states that the volume is in the hand of Friar John Brackley of Norwich, the friend and advisor of the Paston family. None of the hands, however, is that of Brackley as represented in his preserved holograph letters.<sup>16</sup>

Other names also appear within the manuscript: John White and Robert Brouugham. Again, these do little to help establish provenance.

These two manuscripts, although both offering examples of carol sources, cannot hope to demonstrate any great typicalities in extant manuscripts containing the genre as there is no standard non musically notated or musically notated sources. They range from the neatly

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.* (Oxford, 1977), 308

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.* (Oxford, 1977), 308

written, non-notated Sloane 2593, to the pocket book style notated form of Additional 5666, to the large, impressive and beautifully executed institutional manuscript, London, British Library, Egerton 3307, with its 33 polyphonic carols in choirbook format.<sup>17</sup> The diversity of carol sources will be demonstrated throughout this thesis; the exploration of which will help to place the carol in clearer social, historical and religious contexts than previous scholarship has provided.

#### Text and Language

Carol texts are English, Latin or macaronic (mixing English, Latin and French in various combinations).<sup>18</sup> The combination of these varies from manuscript to manuscript. Table 2 illustrates the use of language in the main manuscripts with musical notation.

Manuscript	English	Latin	English and Latin	English Latin and French	Un-texted
Trinity Selden Egerton Ritson Fayrfax Henry VIII	6 (46%) 10 (33%) 4 (12%) 14 (32%) 18 (100%) 12 (92%)	0 4 (13%) 22 (67%) 7 (16%) 0 0	7 (54%) 15 (50%) 6 (18%) 23 (52%) 0 1 (8%)	0 1 (3%) 0 0 0	0 0 1 (3%) 0 0

Table 2: The use of language within the carols of the main notated carol manuscripts Although generally thought of as genre for the celebration of Christmas themes, surviving lyrics challenge that view. Indeed, the majority of extant carols are intended for the celebration of the nativity, but a large quantity also survive that focus upon many other subjects; women, annunciation, humour, the celebration of saints, and political themes, to name but a few: contrary to popular belief, it is not the subject of Christmas that defines a carol.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> This manuscript is also discussed in relation to monophonic carol settings in Chapter 4: 'That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth- century carol, a music of the people?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Greene does not categorise the entirely Latin texted carols as carols, instead he labels them cantilenas. From a musicological perspective however, the musical structure is not altered by text choice and therefore the Latin carols are still relevant to this study.

There are certainly a number of liturgical quotations within the carol texts.<sup>19</sup> In the main notated carol manuscripts of interest in this chapter,<sup>20</sup> there are no fewer than 45 of carols from the Trinity Roll, Selden, Egerton and Ritson manuscripts that show liturgical quotation.<sup>21</sup>

#### **Musical and Textual Structure**

It is the unmistakable fixed structure of the late medieval carol that really defines it as a genre: burden, verse, and burden. This form is particularly well illustrated by Richard L Greene:

It is generally recognized on the basis of musical as well as literary and historical evidence that in England in the fourteenth to sixteenth centuries the word 'carol' denotes a poem for singing, on whatever subject, in uniform stanzas and provided with a burden, a choral element which is sung at the beginning of the piece and repeated after every stanza.<sup>22</sup>

The use of 'choral' is important here, as a small number of carols indicate the use of solo voices in the stanzas by placing the word 'chorus' next to particular sections of the carol. This is seen sometimes when a third voice is added at the start of the stanza, or sometimes the second burden which most probably indicates its referral to the added voice. However, the rubric is also found at the start of sections in carols that have not altered the number of voices in use, although less often, perhaps pointing to the general increase of voices at these points; an example of this being the carol 'Lauda salvatorem'.<sup>23</sup> The crucial distinguishing feature is of course, this consistent use of a burden. The burden is most often found to be two or three lines long, and as Greene explains, mostly follows a pattern of 'a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Chapter 7, "But here the greatest melody arises without any physical instrument, when the angels minister and sing to Christ': The Carol in Sermons and Late Medieval Worship" explores the liturgical quotations found in the carols in more detail.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> The main musically notated carol manuscripts are labelled thus purely due to numerical considerations. These manuscripts contain the largest extant collations of carols with musical notation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> This information has been collated from research presented in Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa) 2000, and is explored in greater detail in Chapter 7, "But here the greatest melody arises without any physical instrument, when the angels minister and sing to Christ'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Greene, A Selection of Early English Carols (Oxford, 1962), 1

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> For a full musical and textual transcription of this carol see: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 62

couplet burden rhyming with the last line of a tail-rhyme stanza of the form aaab and with four measures to the line'. This is illustrated in the carol 'Worship we this holy day'.

Worship we this holy day, That all innocentes for us pray.

Mary with Jesu forth y-frought, As the angel her taught, To flee the lond till it were sought, To Egypt she took her way.

Worship we this holy day, That all innocentes for us pray

Herod slew with pride and sin, Thousands of two year and within, The body of Christ he thought to win And to destroy the Christen fay.

Worship we this holy day, That all innocentes for us pray

Now, Jesu, that diest for us on the rood And christendest innocents in their blood, By the prayer of thy mother good Bring us to bliss that lasteth ay.

Worship we this holy day,

#### That all innocentes for us pray<sup>24</sup>

A number of carols, as well has having the obligatory repeated burden, also contain refrain lines within their verses. These are usually used as the final line as each stanza, and often echo the final line of the burden as seen in the carol 'War yt, war yt, war yt wele':

> War yt, war yt, war yt wele: Wemen be as trew as stele.

Stele is gud, I say no odur; So mown wemen be Kaymys brodur; Ylk on lere schrewdnes at odur; Wemen be as trew as stele.

Stel is gud in eury knyf; So kun thes women both flyt and stryfe; Also thei cun ful wele lye; Wemen be as trew as stele.<sup>25</sup>

The refrain line is often in Latin, despite the rest of the verse being written in the vernacular, and frequently echoes the final line of a Latin burden. This is seen in the carol 'Of thy mercy':

### Of thy mercy lete vs not mys,

Fili Marie virginis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> This carol for the innocents is taken from the late fifteenth-century manuscript GB-Lbl Add. 5665 ff. 24v-25. For a complete transcription with accompanying musical notation see: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 82

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup>This carol originates from the late fifteenth-century manuscript GB-Cjc S.54 f.9v. It has a total of five stanzas, of which only two are shown here. For a full transcription of this carol with the remaining three verses see: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 266-7

O King of Grace and Indulgence, By whome alle thing hath existence, Forsake not man for his offence, Fili Marie virginis.

Haue mercy, Lorde, haue mercy on me, For thi mercyes that so grete be, For why my soule dothe trust in the, Fili Maries virginis.<sup>26</sup>

Refrain lines seem not to be favoured in any particular period but are seen equally throughout the carol repertory; from the earliest extant manuscripts of the period to those of the early sixteenth century.

There are a large number of carols that are written with what John Stevens describes as a 'double burden'. With the inclusion of a second burden, the structure of the carol changes from, 'burden, verse, burden, verse, etc.' to 'burden I, burden II, verse I, burden I, burden II, verse II, etc.' This structure is generally accepted as correct and it would seem unlikely that these second burdens were solely alternatives rather than part of the structure due to the large amount of carols, across a number of manuscripts that contain them; there would seem no need for so many carols to offer alternatives to an initial burden. Rather than being an alternative setting however, they were perhaps optional, particularly as the carol form would have stayed perfectly intact with their removal; thus providing a way of altering the carols for performance. The latter half of double burdens are generally found to be textually identical to the first burden, but change in their musical scoring, and/or alter their melodic lines for the textual repetition. 'Man, be joyful' is a clear example of such a technique. Burden one is scored for two voices and is followed by a second burden containing a third voice; both seen in Example 1. This additional voice then repeats the same text.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> This late fifteenth-century carol originates from the manuscript GB-Cul Ee.1.12 f.46v. It contains a total of five stanzas. For a full transcription of this carol, including the remaining three verses see: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 195



Example 1: Burdens 1 and 2 of 'Man, be joyful'27

There are however, some inevitable exceptions to this pattern; occasionally small sections of three voice settings are found in the middle, or ends of verses, and in the case of 'O Blessed Lord', a two voice burden is followed by a four voice second burden. Burden one and two of 'O Blessed Lord' can be seen in Example 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 69



Example 2: Burden one and two of 'O Blessed Lord'<sup>28</sup>

The pieces with a double burden are usually found with subsequent verses scored for two voices. Table 3 illustrates the scoring patterns found within these pieces, highlighting the two/three voice burden followed by the two part verse. A number of carols that contain three voices within the second burden, often include a small section either in the middle, or at the end of the verse also scored for a third voice. In these instances, Stevens, in his

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> This carol originates from the late fifteenth-century Ritson Manuscript. A full transcription of both text and music is found in: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 106

edition of the fifteenth-century carols, chooses to give the direction 'Voice II Tacet'.<sup>29</sup> This is a purely editorial decision on his part, and it may therefore be the case that voice two simply doubles one of the two continuing voices rather than being rendered entirely silent.

No. of carol in	Manuscript	Approximate	Voices in Burden	Voices in Burden	Voices in verse
Stevens' edition <sup>30</sup>		Date	1	Ш	
8	GB-Ctc 0.3.58	c. xv 1/2	2	3	2
10	GB-Ctc 0.3.58	c. xv 1/2	1	3	2
20	GB-Ob Selden b.26	c.1425-40 (carol	2	3	2
		layer)			
23	GB-Ob Selden b.26	c.1425-40 (carol	2	3	2
-		layer)			
25	GB-Ob Selden b.26	c.1425-40 (carol	1	3	3
		layer)			-
30	GB-Ob Selden b.26	c.1425-40 (carol	2	3	2/3
		layer)	-	Ū	_, 0
38	GB-Ob Selden b.26	c.1425-40 (carol	2	3	2
50		layer)	-	5	-
39	GB-Ob Selden b.26	c.1425-40 (carol	2	3	2
55	GD-OD Seiden b.20	layer)	2	5	2
41	GB-Ob Selden b.26	c.1425-40 (carol	2	3	2
41	GD-OD Seiden b.20	layer)	2	5	2
42	GB-Ob Selden b.26	c.1425-40 (carol	1	3	2/3
42	GB-OD Seiden b.20	layer)		5	2/5
45	CD Lbl Egorton	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
45	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	C. 1450	Z	5	2/3
10		- 1450	2	2	2/2
46	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
40	3307	- 1450	-	2	2/2
49	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
F4	3307	. 1150	-	2	-
51	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2
F2	3307	- 1450	3	2	2
52	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	3	3	3
52	3307	- 1450	-	2	2/2
53	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
	3307				
54	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2
	3307		a /a		
55	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2/3	3	2
	3307		-	-	- /-
56	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
	3307				
59	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
	3307				
64	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
	3307				
67	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
	3307				
70	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2
	3307				
71	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
	3307				

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> For Stevens's editorial policies, see: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), xvi-xvii
<sup>30</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), there are no carols with double burdens in Stevens, John, ed. 'Early Tudor Songs and Carols' (London, 1975)

73	GB-Lbl Egerton	c. 1450	2	3	2
74	3307 GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
75	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	c. 1450	2 <sup>31</sup>	3	3
76	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	c. 1450	2	3	2/3
77	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
78	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
79	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
80	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
81	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
82	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
83	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
84	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
85	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
86	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
87	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
88	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
89	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
90	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
91	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	3?
92	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
93	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
94	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
95	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
96	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
97	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
98	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
99	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
100	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
101	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> The initial two- voice burden of this carol has been erased from the manuscript.

\_\_\_\_\_

102	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
	5665				
103	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
	5665				
104	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
	5665				
105	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
	5665				
106	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
	5665				
108	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
	5665				
109	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
	5665				
110	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
	5665				
111	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
	5665				
112	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
	5665				
113	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
	5665				
114	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
	5665				
115	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
	5665				
116	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	4	2
	5665				
117	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2
	5665		_		
119	GB-Lbl Additional	c.1460-1510	2	3	2/3
	5665				

Table 3: Voice scoring for the carols with double burdens

The carols containing only a single burden predominantly follow the structure of a burden scored for two voices, followed by a verse scored for the same.

There are only two carols in the earliest manuscript, GB-Ctc 0.3.58, henceforth known as the Trinity Roll, which contain double burdens.<sup>32</sup> However, by the time we reach the manuscript GB-Lbl Add. 5665, henceforth known as the Ritson Manuscript, 41 of 44 carols are structured this way. Table 4 illustrates the increasing popularity of the double burden structure.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> 'Deo Gracias' and 'Abide, I hope it be the best'. For a full musical and textual transcription of 'Deo Gracias', see: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 6. For a full textual and musical transcription of 'Abide, I hope it be the best', see: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 8.

Manuscript	Approximate Date	Polyphonic Carols	Double Burdens	Percentage
Trinity	c. xv 1/2	13	2	15%
Selden	c.1425-40	26	11	42%
Egerton	c. 1450	32	11	46%
Ritson	c.1460-1510	44	41	93%

Table 4: Percentage of Carols with Double Burdens within the Main Notated Carol Manuscripts.

Although the second burden always uses the same text as the first burden, the music is, more often than not, different. Sometimes the second burden is a direct quotation of the first, but when this happens, there has usually been a change in the texture with the addition of another voice. Some carols have elements of quotation of the first burden within the second burden without entirely repeating the melody; the carol 'Princeps pacis' is a good example. Example 3 below illustrates the quotation of burden one in burden two. Burden one employs more florid melodic flourishes than burden two. Burden two, although using a number of directly quoted phrases from burden one (seen particularly in the direct quotation of the first burden at the beginning of burden two), elongates the melody at points, and simplifies it; something also echoed in the lowest voice.

E, ff. 49v-50 BURDEN Prin - ceps pa - cis stre - nu Prin - ceps pa - cis stre - nu Prin - ceps pa - cis stre - nu
$ \begin{array}{c} 10 \\ \hline \\ pu & cem no \\ pa & cem no \\ \hline \\ \\ pa & cem no \\ \hline \\ \\ \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \\ \hline \\ \\ \hline \\ \\ \hline \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \hline \hline \hline \hline \\ \hline \hline \hline \hline \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \hline$
PERSE 20   26     A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   mi - ri   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   mi - ri   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   mi - ri   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   mi - ri   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   mi - ri   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   mi - ri   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   mi - ri   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   mi - ri   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   mi - ri   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res   am - pli   fi - ca, ma - jes   tas   ma - ci   fi - ca   De - i     I A - mo - res
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$
45 ma - nu sub mu - ni - fi - ca pa - cem no - bis tri - ma - nu sub mu - ni - fi - ca pa - cem no - bis tri - ma - nu sub mu - ni - fi - ca pa - cem no - bis tri - sum - mi pro - les pro - vi - da, lux lu cis egre - gi - a,
55 BURDEN II   60   0u
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $

Example 3: 'Princeps Pacis', GB-Lbl Egerton 3307, ff. 49v-50<sup>33</sup>

The important structural device of the burden is described by Greene as:

A line or group of lines, most often a couplet, repeated after every stanza, often linked to the stanza by rime, but essentially independent of and external to it. Such a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 34

burden or any part of it does not ordinarily appear within a stanza, although one of the burden-lines will often be found as the last line of a stanza, as a refrain. The carol, then, consists of an alternation of two organic units, stanza and burden, the first changing its text, the second invariable.<sup>34</sup>

An example of burden and verse with a repeated burden line as a refrain is found in the nativity carol 'Y-blessed be that Lord' from the notated manuscript GB-Ob Selden B.26 (henceforth known as 'Selden'). The burden and first stanza read:

# Yblessid be that Lord in majesty Qui natus fuit hodie.

That Lord that lay in asse stalle Cam to die for us all, To mak us free that erst were thralle, Qui natus fuit hodie.<sup>35</sup>

The refrain line repeats almost exactly the music, with the exception of a tiny rhythmic decoration in the verse's version, in the second corresponding line of the burden, as can be seen in Example 4. This surprising change at the end of bar nine in comparison to bar 34 is very slight, and could perhaps be down to scribal error.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), xlix-l

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Stevens, J. ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 29



Example 4: 'Y-blessed be that Lord' <sup>36</sup>

This repetition of musical material when repeating the refrain line of a burden is a commonplace structural device in the carols; close to half of the carols in the main notated manuscripts containing textual repetition of some of the material in the burden also contains the equivalent musical repetition as demonstrated in 'Y-blessed be that Lord'. Very occasionally the repeated music is merely an inflection of the original material in the burden, and, as demonstrated in 'I pray you all' from the Ritson Manuscript in Example 5, can even vary in terms of voice texture.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 29





Example 5: 'I pray you all' 37

One could even go so far as to say these loose interpretations of previous material could be copying an improvisatory style of performance, with a sense of the original tune being embellished or altered by the performer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 88-89
The carols are a relatively compact genre textually as well as musically. Generally, we don't find carols with exceptionally long stanzas. In fact, as Greene notes,

Only twenty-one carols are written in stanzas of more than seven lines. These more complicated rime-patterns are represented as a rule by only one or two carols apiece, and may pass as isolated experiments with the general carol-type. The standard of the carol-writers remained the simpler stanza with separate burden.<sup>38</sup>

Number of stanzas varies considerably from only one or two up to as many as thirty seven in the case of 'Lullay, lullay, la lullay'<sup>39</sup> from the late fourteenth century. However, the carols in the main notated manuscripts of the fifteenth century tend not to exceed nine; only one notated carol actually contains nine stanzas, the remainder tending to range from two to eight, with the majority favouring a smaller rather than greater amount. It is a possibility that this was due to only selected verses being included in notated manuscripts where there was perhaps less room; or that fewer verses were required. There is also the possibility that many of the texts were known from memory and therefore they did not need to be written into manuscripts in their entirety. Indeed, GB-LbI-31922 (henceforth known as the 'Henry VIII' manuscript) contains a number of carols with notation only for the burdens, suggesting the melodies for the verses were already well known; this principle could also be applied to the texts.<sup>40</sup> The general rhyme scheme is the distinctive aaab, as demonstrated here in two of the stanzas of 'Hail Mary, full of grace' from the Trinity Roll.

The Holy Ghost is to thee sent, From the Father omnipotent, Now is God within thee went, When the Angel said Ave.

When the angel Ave began,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), xl

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> GB- Ed. Advocates 18.7.21, folio 3v. Full transcription found in Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 103-105

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> A detailed discussion of the Henry VIII manuscript is found in Chapter 3: 'The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?' which also discusses the possibility of lost popular carol melodies.

Flesh and blood together ran; Mary bore both God and man Through virtue and through dignity.<sup>41</sup>

The subject of the texts of the notated carols tends to be either sacred or political on the whole, with the non-notated carols consisting of the same, but with additional subjects such as the sexual, amusing or female centred carols. <sup>42</sup>

#### Voices

The earlier carol manuscripts tend to favour two-voice settings more than three, and then as the century progresses we find a significant increase in three-voice settings, and by the time we reach the Ritson manuscript c. 1500 all the settings are for three, with the exception of one four-voice carol (the only one extant from this period). Voice textures can be seen in Table 5.

MS	Approximate Date	2 vo	ices	3 voices		4 voices	
Trinity	c. Early 15 <sup>th</sup> C.	10	(77%)	3	(23%)	0	(0%)
Selden	c. 1425-40	19	(61%)	12	(38%)	0	(0%)
Egerton	c. 1450	15	(46%)	18	(54%)	0	(0%)
Ritson	c. 1460-1510	0	(0%)	44	(98%)	1	(2%)
Fayrfax	c. 1505	0	(0%)	14	(77%)	4	(22%)
Henry VIII	c. 1510-20	0	(0%)	13	(100%)	0	(0%)

Table 5: Number of voices used in the fifteenth-century carol manuscripts.<sup>43</sup>

The carol voices are fewer than those of the standard fifteenth- century English motet, although in terms of voice expansion throughout the century, the carol also increases voice texture chronologically, until the two-voice carol eventually becomes obsolete.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> For a full transcription see: Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> For more discussion as to the reasons behind this inconsistency see: Chapter 5: 'Women in the Carols'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> This table lists the original source voices and does not include the editorial third voices that are added to a number of the two-voice carols by Stevens in his edition: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970)

The earlier carols, such as those in the Trinity Roll, tend to favour a single texture throughout, but as the carol develops, this becomes less and less common until we find that alternating scorings are standard practice; this is illustrated in Table 6.

MS	Approximate Date	No \	oice Alternation	Voice Alternation	
Trinity Selden Egerton	c. Early 15 <sup>th</sup> C. c. 1425-40 c. 1450	10 19 17	(77%) (61%) (51%)	3 12 16	(23%) (38%) (49%)
Ritson	c. 1460-1510	0	(0%)	45	(100%)

Table 6: Alternation of voice number within the carols<sup>44</sup>

It is not until the later manuscripts that we start to see any three-voice texture followed throughout an entire piece; it is generally more expected that those carols with three voices use reduced scoring to distinguish between burden, verse and second burden sections.

# Voice Pitches

The carols employ an expected range of individual voice pitches for this period; each voice using the span of just less, or just over an octave and sometimes extending to an 11<sup>th</sup> in range. In terms of overall voice compass, the carols range from a ten note to a seventeen note range, which is as expected in relation to other music of this period. As Roger Bowers notes:

Analysis of a large proportion of English sacred music surviving from the period c. 1350- 1450...reveals that not a single piece employs an overall compass of 18 notes or more. Any piece which exceeds two octaves is a rarity; five reach 17 notes, and 27 reach 16 notes. However, 103 reach 15 notes; 113 reach 13 notes, and 120 reach 14. Meanwhile, only 30 items are limited to 12 notes or fewer. Thus two octaves emerges as the normal practical working limit of overall compass.<sup>45</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> The Fayrfax manuscript and the Henry VIII manuscript have not been included in this table. The carols of these manuscripts all treat voice alternation in a more fluid manner, rather than in the distinct sections we find in the earlier manuscripts. Additionally, four of the thirteen carols identified by John Stevens in: Stevens, John, *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), have no musical notation for the verses, only the burden. This therefore makes comparison impossible in such a table.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Bowers, Roger, *English Church Polyphony* (Aldershot, 1999)

There is however, a chronological difference in terms of individual and overall voice ranges. The earlier carols, such as those in the Trinity Roll favour more conservative individual voice ranges; sometimes as narrow as a 5th, and only once stretching a voice as far as a 10<sup>th</sup>, with the later carols of the Ritson manuscript placing most of its voices in the 10<sup>th</sup>-12<sup>th</sup> range.<sup>46</sup> The conservative range of pitches from the Trinity Roll can be seen in Table 7, and a selection of pitches from Ritson, are observed in Table 8. The overall voices ranges from four of the main manuscripts of the 15<sup>th</sup> century also follow this pattern of chronological expansion of range and can be observed in Table 9.

Carol	Voice 1	Voice 2	Voice 3
Hail, Mary, full of grace	E-d' - 7 <sup>th</sup>	d-d'- 5 <sup>th</sup>	g-e' - 6 <sup>th</sup>
Nowell, nowell: In Bethlem	e-d' - 8ve	b-b' - 8ve	
Alma redemptoris mater	b-a' - 7 <sup>th</sup>	c-c' - 8ve	
Now may we singen	b-g' - 6 <sup>th</sup>	d-d' - 8ve	
Be merry, be merry	b-a' - 7 <sup>th</sup>	d-c' - 7 <sup>th</sup>	
Nowell sing we	b-b' - 8ve	d-d' - 8ve	
Deo gracias, Anglia	a-c'' - 10 <sup>th</sup>	d-d' - 8ve	d-c'- 7th
Now make we mirthe	a-a' - 8ve	c-d' - 9 <sup>th</sup>	
Abide, I hope it be the best	d-c' - 7 <sup>th</sup>	g-f' - 7 <sup>th</sup>	f-d' - 6 <sup>th</sup>
What tidings bringest thou?	a-b' - 9 <sup>th</sup>	c-d' - 9 <sup>th</sup>	
Eya, martyr Stephane	a-b' - 9 <sup>th</sup>	c-d' - 9th	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> The only carol to use a 10<sup>th</sup> in this manuscript is 'Deo Gracias', otherwise known as the 'Agincourt Carol'. This carol is discussed at various points within this thesis.

Pray for us	g-g' - 8ve	c-d' - 9 <sup>th</sup>
There is no rose	g-a' - 9 <sup>th</sup>	c-c' - 8ve

# Table 7: Voice Ranges in the Carols of the Trinity Roll

Carol	Voice 1	Voice 2	Voice 3
Sing to we this merry company	c'-e'' - 10 <sup>th</sup>	f-a' – 10 <sup>th</sup>	f-a' – 10 <sup>th</sup>
Johannes assecretis	$c'-e'' - 10^{th}$	c-g' – 12 <sup>th</sup>	$c-f' - 11^{th}$
Sonet laus	$c'-e''-10^{th}$	$f-a'-10^{th}$	$f-a'-10^{th}$
Nowell, nowell: The boares head	c'-e'' - 10 <sup>th</sup>	g-a' – 9 <sup>th</sup>	d-a' – 17 <sup>th</sup>
Pray for us	c'-c''- 8ve	$d-e'-9^{th}$	$d-e'-9^{th}$
Worship we this holy day	d'-d'' – 8ve	f-g' – 9th	f-f' – 8ve
Letare, Cantuaria	$c' - e'' - 10^{th}$	c-g – 5 <sup>th</sup>	f'f' – 8ve
Tidings true	$c'-e''-10^{th}$	f-g' - 9 <sup>th</sup>	e-g' - 10 <sup>th</sup>
Proface, welcome	c'-e'' – 10th	f-g' - 9 <sup>th</sup>	e-g' - 10th

Table 8: Voice Ranges from a selection of carols from Ritson<sup>47</sup>

Manuscript	10 <sup>th</sup>	11 <sup>th</sup>	12 <sup>th</sup>	13 <sup>th</sup>	14 <sup>th</sup>	15 <sup>th</sup>	16 <sup>th</sup>	17th
Trinity	1	1	3	5	3	0	0	0
Selden	0	0	3	11	9	3	2	0
Egerton	0	1	3	10	15	4	0	0
Ritson	0	1	4	8	13	12	3	3

Table 9: Overall Voice compass of the four main manuscripts of the fifteenth century

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> There is a second table that includes the pitch ranges of other carols from Ritson in Chapter 2, 'The Carol: an isolated genre?' page 70

The carol 'Nowell, nowell: The boares head' has a particularly large range in voice 3: a 17th. This is due to voice 3 splitting into two parts for the final chord. For the majority of the Ritson carols, the range is only from g-a' and therefore a 9<sup>th</sup>. The splitting of voice 3 into two parts appears to be unique to this carol. It would suggest that the carol was being sung by more than one voice to a part (lower part at least), but due to its isolated use, cannot be used as evidence for the doubling of voices in other carol performance.

#### **Melodic Behaviour**

The carol, as with voice numbers and texture, develops in terms of melodic behaviour throughout the century. The earliest carols, those from the Trinity Roll, are relatively homophonic in character, with any extra melodic floridity generally shared between parts, or taken by the top part; the carol 'Lullay Lullow', from the manuscript GB-Lbl Add. 5666, is an excellent example of this homophonic texture and is seen in Example 6.



Example 6: 'Lullay lullow'48

The slightly later Selden manuscript is similar in style to the Trinity Roll. It contains a lot of homophonic texture in its carols, but with a greater amount of polyphonic movement; the top voice taking the most florid melodic line, and lower voices playing a slower moving harmonic role. In terms of melodic movement, the voices are reasonably similar in the use of leaps; all parts follow a similar style of conjunct motion, with a conservative use of leaps seen at points in all parts. Melismatic writing becomes more prevalent chronologically, but not extensively. Although Zamzow notes that 'Fewer than half the carols in the Trinity Roll, two-thirds of those in Selden, nearly all in Egerton and all the carols in the Ritson manuscript

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 1

have melismatic passages', <sup>49</sup> the melismatic material is not tremendously florid in style however, and in a sense still retains the feel of the earlier carols. Interestingly, it is often Latin burdens, or in the case of the Selden manuscript, fully Latin carols that contain the most florid of the melismas, perhaps echoing some forms of liturgical music for worship. What is also interesting is the use of 'Alleluia' in these melismatic burdens, particularly as the melismatic 'alleluia' had a long ancestry in liturgical music; a practice that seems to be echoed in the carols. The alleluia is 'performed in a responsorial manner: the first word 'alleluia' is sung, concluding with an extended melismatic flourish...then a verse...is chanted in a moderately elaborate setting; and finally the alleluia is repeated'.<sup>50</sup> The following four examples of the most florid melismatic burdens from Selden illustrate these points, followed by a fifth example of an Alleluia setting to compare melismatic tendencies and demonstrate the protracted use of the word in liturgical plainchant as it is echoed in the carols.



Example 7: Burden of 'Alleluia: Now well may we mirthes make'<sup>51</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English carols* (PhD from University of Iowa) 2000, page 24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> James W. McKinnon and Christian Thodberg. "Alleluia." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press. Web. 26 Jan. 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/40711>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Taken from: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 14



Example 8: 'Alleluia, pro virgine Maria'<sup>52</sup>



Example 9: Burden of 'Alleluia: A newe work'<sup>53</sup>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Taken from: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 21
<sup>53</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 22



Example 10: Burden of 'Ave Maria'<sup>54</sup>



Example 11: 'Alleluia' with its following verse. 'Veni Sancte Spiritus'<sup>55</sup>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 25
<sup>55</sup> "Ex.2 Alleluia, Veni Sancte Spiritus." *Grove Music Online*. Oxford Music Online. Oxford University Press. Web. 24 Jan. 2014. <a href="http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/img/grove/music/F010622">http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/img/grove/music/F010622</a>>.

One of the most popular melodic treatments amongst voices in the carols is the use of contrary motion. As Zamzow notes:

Contrary outward motion, an expansive movement where the cantus rises and the tenor falls, is the most common type of motion in carol stanzas. Contrary inward motion, where the cantus and tenor collapse, is the second most common type, occurring on burdens, especially in Ritson, more than anywhere else. An important relationship exists between initial sonority and direction: burdens tend to open with a unison and then expand outwardly in contrary motion.<sup>56</sup>

A good example the use of contrary inward motion can be observed in a carol from the Trinity Roll, 'Eya mater Stephane' from the early fifteenth century, and can be seen in Example 12. This carol also demonstrates some outward motion. Zamzow does not mention in this quote the extensive use of phrases in parallel motion also found within the carols. Example 11 demonstrates this technique of writing in parallel motion, and can be seen in bars 10 and 11 and 26 to the end.



Example 12: 'Eya, martyr Stephane'<sup>57</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa) 2000, page 23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 9

This contrary motion device juxtaposed alongside sections of parallel motion is favoured throughout the manuscripts from the early to the late fifteenth century, as Example 13 demonstrates; a carol from the Ritson manuscript, 'Jesu for thy mercy'.

BURDEN 10 less, thy ple ana save .... 0 for thy dë - less, save thy peo-ple su, and le mer - cy en send. BURDEN II .... . peace Ie cs VOICE II TACET 7 6 Ie 54 mer cy 0 Je su for thy - less. peace. mer - cy. end-ë 20 0 save peo - ple peace. thy sare thy ple peace. peo . . • save thy peo-ple and send peace. # VERSE .... for thy 54. shedding fire, save Chris blood : Je su, for thy woun dës. five, save fro shed ding Chris tain blood; 40 45 160 . M strife, all great trouble of lice our neigh-bours ma ti ding and 01 sena good: . cease all great trouble of ma-lice and strife, and of our neigh-bours send us ti - dings good; dal Segno [m.2-12] BURDEN 50 DE -1 Bles Bles sıı, Je - su for thy etc VOICE II TACET-VOICE II TACET-Bles [d D Bles sed Ie su, Bles for thy sed Je su Je - su

Example 13: 'Jesu, for they mercy'<sup>58</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 102

#### Sections/Phrasing

There is generally a correlation between length of sections and melismatic material and chronology. The earlier carols tend to have shorter sections and less melismatic material to draw them out, with the later carols of, say, the Ritson manuscript becoming much longer and more elaborate with greater use of melismatic material. If we compare the music of the Trinity Roll, for example, to that of the Ritson manuscript we find that approximately half of the Trinity Roll employs melismatic passages in comparison to all of the carols in the Ritson manuscript.<sup>59</sup>This would seem to be a general musical trajectory in style as opposed to a difference in complexity related to provenance or the use of the source, as the use of melismatic material seems to gradually increase chronologically. One must be cautious however at implying that the carols start to employ vast swathes of melismatic passages; this is certainly not the case. The carols are generally moderate in their use of this musical device, even by the time we reach the Henry VIII Manuscript.

#### Mensuration

The carols are nearly all written in triple time, with the notable exception of 'Ave, decus seculi' (Example 15) which changes time signature from triple to duple time at very brief points. <sup>60</sup> Alternating mensuration is in itself, not unusual for this period, but Stevens notes that its uniqueness lies in it prescriptiveness:

The very fact of a time-signature is most unusual, so firmly was the triple tradition established. The original time signature C is repeated in all three voices at the beginning of B II [burden 2] but not of the V [verse].<sup>61</sup>

'Marvel not Joseph' (Example 14), also found within Ritson,<sup>62</sup> is presented by Stevens as alternating between two time signatures throughout. While this is a sensible representation of the original carol in modern notational values, it is important to note that the original

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> This is also discussed in: Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa) 2000, page 24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> For a full transcription see: Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 73

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 121

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> For a full transcription see: Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 68

score only uses one time signature, O. The final anomaly is also found in Ritson; 'Worship we this holy day'. <sup>63</sup> This carol also shows mensural complexity, which Stevens choses to interpret as occasional slips into modern 7/8 time. The slightly greater mensural intricacy within these carols could indicate singers with greater capability performing from Ritson, than other manuscripts of a similar period. The carols of the later Fayrfax and Henry VIII manuscripts are entirely different in terms of mensuration, almost entirely moving away from triple mensuration, instead favouring duple time, and therefore reflecting the other songs in the manuscript.



Example 14: 'Marvel not Joseph'<sup>64</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> For a full transcription see: Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 82

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 68



Example 15: 'Ave, decus seculi'65

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 73

#### Use of Pre-Existent Material

Musical borrowing in the middle ages was common place, not only within the carols but in other genres too.<sup>66</sup> Zamzow's research indicated a good number of carols containing what could be musical quotations of pre-existent textual and musical liturgical material, particularly in the later carols of the Ritson manuscript.<sup>67</sup> These are not large quotations, but perhaps would have been enough for a fifteenth century audience, coupled with a familiar text, to recognise in connection with liturgical meaning or function. The motet of the same period was equally at home borrowing both text and music, although Julie Cumming advises caution in the quest to identify pre-existent musical quotations in the motet of the same period; which could equally be applied to the carol.<sup>68</sup> She notes that:

Sometimes...the concentration on pre-existent material causes scholars to assume it is there even if they cannot find it, and lead them to ignore other features of the motet...If a composer wants you to know that he is using chant, he finds a way of letting you know. If a well-educated twentieth-century musicologist cannot tell if there is pre-existent material after consulting the standard references, odds are most of the fifteenth-century audience could not tell either.<sup>69</sup>

Zamzow's study was inclusive of any sequence of four notes or more that could be indicative of the use of pre-existent material, which could fall into Cumming's cautionary category of looking for musical material that simply does not exist, however she does only look for these small sections in conjunction with liturgical texts which would make these small sections more likely to be accurate borrowings from liturgical chant rather than chance melodic similarities.

## Monophonic Carols

In addition to the large corpus of extant polyphonic carols, there are also ten extant monophonic carols, surviving in six manuscripts. These carols can be seen in Table 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> One only has to look at the motet tradition and the use of pre-existent chant to form a cantus firmus juxtaposed with new melodies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa) 2000, page 24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> For further discussion on the carol in comparison to the motet, and other genres, see: Chapter 2, 'The carol; an isolated genre?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 34-35

Carol	Manuscript	Folio/Page		
Lullay, Lullay: As I lay	GB-Lbl- Additional 5943	f. 169		
Lullay, my child	GB-Lbl- Additional 5666	ff. 2-3		
I have loved	GB-Lbl- Additional 5666	f. 3v		
Nowell, nowell: Tidings true	GB-Ob- Eng. Poet.e.1	f. 41v		
Of all the enemies	GB-Ob- Eng. Poet.e.1	f. 50v		
Salva, Sancta parens	GB-Gu, Hunterian 83	f. 21		
Nova, nova	GB-Gu, Hunterian 83	f. 2v		
Though I sing: <i>le bon l. don</i>	GB-Cgc, MS 383/603	p. 210		
Of thy Mercy	GB-Cul Ee.1.12	f. 46v		
Т	Table 10: Extant Monophonic Carols			

The monophonic carols vary in musical style, and text subjects vary from vernacular love lyrics to Latin sacred subjects. The scope of language and text are seen in Table 11.

Carol	Language	Text Subject <sup>70</sup>
Lullay, Lullay: As I lay	English	Lullaby Carol
Lullay, my child	English	Lullaby Carol
I have loved	English	Carol of Love
Nowell, nowell: Tidings true	English/Latin	The Annunciation
Of all the enemies	English	Moralising Carol
Salva, Sancta parens	English/Latin	Carol to the Virgin
Nova, nova	English/Latin	The Annunciation
Though I sing: <i>le bon I. don</i>	English	Uncertain
Of thy Mercy	English/Latin	Carol to the Virgin
Sing we now	English/Latin	Uncertain

Table 11: Text and Language in the Monophonic Carols

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> This table is based on the extant lyrics, which in the majority of cases with monophonic carols, are often sparse. In the case of *Sing we now, Of thy mercy, Though I sing: le bon I. don* and *Of all the enemies,* the extant lyrics consist of no more than one line of text which makes they classification of such carols problematic; *Though I sing: le bon I. don* and *Sing we now* are particularly impossible to classify with any certainty. One must bear in mind that the future discovery of a full text for some of these monophonic examples may alter our view of the text topic.

Although Table 11 gives a good overview of the genre, one must be cautious in the cases of at least seven of these carols: 'Lullay, lullay', 'Lullay, my child', 'I have loved', 'Sing we now', 'Of thy mercy',' Though I sing' and 'Of all the enemies', due to the fact that they only survive as fragments. In fact several of them are only extant with one line of text and music: 'Sing we now', 'Of thy mercy', 'Though I sing' and 'Of all the enemies'. Therefore, the lost text could contain the use of an additional language.<sup>71</sup>

## The Carol and the Carole

The fifteenth-century English carol is most popularly thought to be a direct descendent of the French *carole*, a popular form of dance song. The most prolific supporter of this argument is R. L Greene. <sup>72</sup> Greene's work is specifically focused on the literary, rather than musical aspects of the carol, and convincingly argues the link between carol and *carole*, beginning with the origins of the word itself. He writes:

The word seems first to occur in extant English literature about 1300 in the *Cursor Mundi*, where it has the exact sense of the old French *carole*, that is, a ring-dance in which the dancers themselves sing the governing music.<sup>73</sup>

Greene also claims that a story of German origins; which appears in an English manuscript of the eleventh century and discusses the wickedness of the carole, gives undisputable evidence that the carole was indeed well known in England by this date. He notes:

The importance of this story is twofold. It shows that as early as 1080 in England a Flemish-born monk who had lived in France could present to an English audience, without feeling the need of any explanation, the text of a *carole*...divided into stanza and burden, the burden expressing in its very words the change from rest to motion that comes with the chorale part.'<sup>74</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> The monophonic carols are explored in greater detail, and with more emphasis on their musical content and their possible connection to lost popular melodies in Chapter 4: 'That we with Merth Mowe Savely Sing: The fifteenth-century carol, a music of the people?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), xxiii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), xvii

Greene's argument that the *carole* was sufficiently known in England from such an early date, certainly adds weight to the theory that the carol is of direct descent from the French *carole*. Unfortunately for Greene however, there a missing link in his argument. There appears thus far, to be no convincing extant transitional carol music or texts that show a direct correlation between an earlier *carole* and a fifteenth-century English carol. Greene does however, offer up one piece that he believes could represent this missing link; the single stanza carol, 'Icham of Irlaunde'. He notes that a:

casual jotting of the first half of the 14<sup>th</sup> century in a small collection of written fragments challenges attention by its invitation to the dance. Is it actually a dancesong; is it burden and verse?...It appears to be of somewhat nondescript metre; but, with the form of the primitive dance-song as guide, inspection will show that the little piece divides very easily into a burden and stanza.<sup>75</sup>

There are some regrettable cracks in his argument, particularly the lack of evidence supporting his claim that 'Icham of Irlaunde', was actually intended to be a carol. Margaret Smaill, in her recent dissertation on the performance practises of the medieval carol, writes most disparagingly on Greene's 'missing link' hypothesis. She writes that:

To view *Icham of Irlaunde* as the crucial link in a chain of evidence connecting carol and carole, as Greene and others would seem to do, requires a long stroll down the garden path. First, readers must assume that the poem is in fact a *carole*, and not some other type of dance-song, and second, that Greene's arrangement of the poem into burden and stanza is appropriate. Third, they must overlook the fact that unlike *Icham of Irlaunde*, fifteenth-century carols almost invariably had multiple stanzas.<sup>76</sup>

Smaill's observations are certainly convincing: Greene's argument relies on a number of 'possibilities'. Undoubtedly, Greene would have been aware of the flaws; but in this area of research, there is so little extant surviving evidence, he could certainly be forgiven for clutching at some proverbial straws.

Despite lack of proof, a link between *carole* and carol seems a highly likely conclusion; and this transition between genres may well have been instigated by the Franciscans. This

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), li

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Smaill, Adele Margaret, *Medieval Carols: Origins, Forms, and Performance Contexts* (Michigan, 2003), 15

monastic order was known for its practice of replacing texts of popular secular songs with religious subjects. F.L.Harrison supports this theory writing:

The history of the carol as literature, which has been traced by R.L Greene, involved the adoption by the church of elements from the secular oral tradition of poetry and music. There is evidence that the Franciscans were the main agents in turning the intoxicating secular *carole*, a round dance with leader, to the uses of popular devotion in the carol, as sacred (or secular) song with burden. Sometime between 1317 and 1360 for example, Richard de Ledrede, Franciscan bishop of Kilkenny in Ireland, wrote Latin lyrics, some with refrains, to replace the impious English and French songs which his vicars and clerks had been singing.<sup>77</sup>

Richard de Ledrede wrote a total of sixty Latin texts within the manuscript known as *The Red Book of Ossory*. A Latin inscription is also found within this Franciscan manuscript; the English translation of this reads:

Be advised, reader, that the Bishop of Ossory has made these songs for the vicars of the cathedral church, for the priests, and for the clerks, to be sung on the important holidays and at celebrations in order that their throats and mouths, consecrated to God, may not be polluted by songs which are lewd, secular, and associated with revelry, and, since they are trained singers, let them provide themselves with suitable tunes according to what these sets of words require.<sup>78</sup>

This theory is further 'supported by the fact that three of the ten fully surviving monophonic carols have texts that appear in Franciscan manuscripts.'<sup>79</sup>

John Stevens seconds Greene's theory of connection with the French *carole*. He also concurs that in addition to its direct descent from the *carole*:

The recurrent burden and the dominance of the stanza pattern aaab link the carol with a family of European lyric-forms. The courtly French *virelai* and the Italian

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Harrison, F.L, 'Benedicamus, Conductus, Carol: a newly discovered source', *Acta Musicologica*, xxxvii (1965), 40-41

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Greene, R.L. ed., *The Lyrics of the Red Book of Ossory*, Medium Aevum Monographs, 5 (Oxford, 1974), iii-iv
<sup>79</sup> Stevens, John and Libby, Dennis, "Carol." In *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*,

http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/04974 (accessed August 14, 2010).

*Ballata* are closely related to the carol from the formal point of view, while the Italian *lauda* resembles the carol in form and in spirit.<sup>80</sup>

It is also argued that links between the carol and *carole* can be seen in relation to movement. The French *carole* was designed to accompany dancing, and this element of movement could still be glimpsed in the fifteenth-century carol. Stevens notes that:

A narrow but at the same time highly significant way of describing them is as 'processional' music - the earliest carols, especially, were written as 'popular litanies' for use in ecclesiastical procession, but any processions, civic or courtly, provided a suitable setting. In church and out of it the carol was associated with physical movement; when it was not danced to it was 'processed to'.<sup>81</sup>

It is not even out with the realms of possibility that the Franciscan monks moved or danced to the carol repertory they adopted and developed. As Stevens notes:

Two important facets of the medieval religious carol are its relation to religious dance and popular song, and its connection with the activities of the Franciscan friars. It is not as absurd as it may sound to imagine festive religious songs being danced to. At Sens Cathedral the clergy were permitted by regulation to dance, provided they did not lift their feet off the ground.<sup>82</sup>

The arguments surrounding the origins of the fifteenth-century carol in relation to the French *carole* are plentiful and in many cases, convincing, yet none can quite provide enough evidence to definitively answer the question: is the fifteenth-century carol a direct descendant of the French carole? As Robert Mullaly notes, despite the hypothesis:

One awkward fact remains: no obvious relationship is discernible between the dance and its song on one hand [the carole] and the burden-and-stanza form on the other [the carol], although the term *carol* came to be applied to both.<sup>83</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), xii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), xiv

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Stevens, John and Libby, Dennis, "Carol." In *Grove Music Online*. Oxford Music Online,

http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/04974 (accessed August 14, 2010).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Mullaly, Robert, The Carole, A Study of a Medieval Dance (Padstow, 2011), 118

Perhaps the use of the same term to describe both types of musical form is enough to alert us to their connection in some way in the Middle Ages?

F.L. Harrison advanced a theory in the 1950s that 'the sacred carol of the fifteenth century took over from the conductus the role of Benedicamus substitute on certain festivals'. <sup>84</sup> The Benedicamus Domino was an integral part of medieval devotion. Anne Walters-Robinson writes:

At least eight or nine times during the course of daily worship, the versicle Benedicamus domino ("Let us bless the Lord") sounded from the choir and corridors of a medieval church. This chant, along with its response Deo gratias ("Thanks be to God"), served as the normal concluding sentences for each of the eight office hours (vespers, compline, matins, lauds, prime, terce, sext, none) except matins.<sup>85</sup>

Harrison argues that carols as a Benedicamus subject are more than likely due to large gaps in evidence of Benedicamus substitutes:

after the period of the thirteenth-and fourteenth century ordinals. The disappearance of the conductus in the second half of the fourteenth century and the appearance of the votive antiphons make it clear that this could not have been the main function of the votive antiphon...the words of some polyphonic carols...make it likely that the sacred carol of the fifteenth century took over from the conductus the role of Benedicamus substitute on certain festivals.<sup>86</sup>

Harrison compounds his theory with evidence of the words *Deo Gratias*, the response of the Benedicamus, found within a number of carol texts. He writes:

The texts of some polyphonic carols strongly suggest that this was their function. The famous 'Agincourt' carol *Deo Gratias Anglia* has the refrain- line *Deo gratias*. The Latin carol *Deo gratias persolvamus* in the Selden manuscript ends with *Benedicamus* 

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Harrison, F.L, 'Benedicamus, Conductus, Carol: a newly discovered source', Acta Musicologica, xxxvii (1965),
40-41

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Walters Robertson, Anne, "Benedicamus Domino": The Unwritten Tradition', *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, Vol.41, No.1 (Spring, 1988), 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Harrison, F.L., *Music in Medieval Britain* (London, 1963), 416

*Domino, Deo gratias*...both the burden and the last verse of *Novo profuse* gaudio...end with *Benedicamus Domino...* 

Harrison names seven carol texts in total, which considering approximately five hundred survive, would seem to suggest that his theory, whilst compelling, is by no means proven. In fact, most of the arguments and theories around the origins and uses of the late medieval carol are complex and compelling, but as yet, unproven.

This brief summary of the key elements of the late medieval carol and the theories surrounding its origins and connections to the French carole, reveals it as a fascinating genre with many areas ripe for further study.

## Previous Scholarship: the need for a multidisciplinary approach

Previous publications of research concerning the late medieval carol have tended to deal with the genre in isolation from other musical forms. However, the carols were by no means an isolated form of composition in the fifteenth century, and were frequently found in manuscripts alongside other genres.<sup>87</sup> Further separation within carol scholarship is seen in the tendency of researchers to deal with those surviving with musical notation, and those without extant notation separately. We have a large number of non-notated carols; carols that must be seen in the context of those with extant notation rather than a separate branch of the same tree. To separate the two, is to only see one side of the coin.

Until Greene's landmark literary study in 1935, published carol research had been minimal.<sup>88</sup> Greene's work, which catalogued the carols and placed them into subject categories, brought the carol texts to the fore.<sup>89</sup> His publication however was primarily concerned with carol texts rather than music, and additionally, only included those carols in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> The carol in relation to other genres is addressed in Chapter 2, 'The Carol: an isolated genre?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Some publication of songs and carols was undertaken in the nineteenth century by the prolific publisher and Editor Thomas Wright. He published titles such as: Wright, Thomas, *Songs and Carols: Printed from a Manuscript in the Sloane Collection in the British Museum* (1836), and Wright, Thomas, *Specimens of Old Christmas Carols, Selected from Manuscripts and Printed Books* (1841). These publications contain no musical notation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Greene's carol classifications are addressed in Chapter 5: 'Women in the carols'.

English or English/Latin. He completely excludes the Latin carols, classing them instead as cantilenae, and subsequently creating yet another avenue of isolation.

It was not until John Stevens' comprehensive edition of the polyphonic and monophonic carols in 1952 that the music was brought to the forefront.<sup>90</sup> Stevens chose, quite rightly, to include the Latin carols excluded by Greene, on the grounds that the musical form was identical to those that were English or macaronic. Indeed, if the Latin carols were included alongside the English and macaronic carols in the fifteenth century without any clear separation, there would seem no reason to separate them for research purposes today. Writing in his introductory commentary, he notes that:

It seemed logical...to include the Latin carols often called cantilenae, of the fifteenth century, which are from a musical and social point of view absolutely indistinguishable from their English counterparts.<sup>91</sup>

Stevens's inclusion of the Latin carols in his edition certainly emphasised their musical value, but he did not include, due to the purpose of his study, any of the vast corpus of non-notated carols; although he does allude to them, writing that the carol's 'importance is substantiated by the survival of nearly 500 distinct vernacular lyrics in this form'.<sup>92</sup> Stevens' edition contains 135 carols from twelve manuscripts. Table 12 details the manuscripts included by Stevens.

Manuscript	Number of Carols
GB-Lbl Additional 5666	3
GB-Cul 0.3.58	13
GB-Ob Selden b.26	33
GB-Ob Ashmole 1393	1
GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	33
GB-Lbl Additional 5665	45
GB- Cul Additional 5943	1
GB-Ob Eng.poet.e.1	2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> This volume was originally published in 1952, reviewed in 1954 and subsequently reprinted in 1970.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), xiii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), xiii

GB-Gu Hunterian 83	2
GB-Cul Ee.1.12	2
GB-Cgc 383/603	1
GB-Cul LI.1.11	1

Table 12: Manuscripts transcribed in Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970) This edition of carols did not, however, include the eighteen carols of the Fayrfax manuscript from c.1500, or the thirteen carols of the Henry VIII manuscript due to the difference in style between the carols of this early period and those of the early sixteenth century.<sup>93</sup> Instead, Stevens produced a volume of songs and carols from the Ritson and Fayrfax manuscripts in 1975, and had already published an edition of Henry VIII's Manuscript in 1962; thus creating yet another way of separating the carol into different research categories. This edition however, presents the carols in a wider context, placing them alongside other songs from both manuscripts, thus not treating them in isolation.<sup>94</sup> Since Stevens' editions, scholars have seemed reluctant to publish on the carols, viewing his work as definitive. As a result, editions of manuscripts that contain carols have been published that omit carols.<sup>95</sup> This again projects a false image of the separation of the genre from other musical forms.

*Music in Medieval Britain*, a monograph by F.L. Harrison, sits chronologically after Stevens' work.<sup>96</sup> Harrison is particularly occupied by placing the carol in a liturgical context. This is immediately evident from the title of the chapter in which the discussion of the carol unfolds; 'Other Ritual Forms; The Carol'. He argues that the carol was utilised as a Benedicamus Domino substitute. Harrison cites the inclusion of Benedicamus Domino at the end or within the text of some carols as an indication that they were indeed for this use, however, when we look closer, of the number of carols that survive with notation, only six actually include this phrase, and one carol contains the first two lines of a Benedicamus

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> As discussed earlier in this chapter.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Early Tudor Songs and Carols* (London 1975) and Stevens' John, ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> For example: McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript Egerton 3307* (London, 1963), and Lane, Eleanor and Sandon, Nick, *The Ritson Manuscript, liturgical compositions, Votive Antiphons, Te Deum* (2001, n.p.)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Harrison, F.L., *Music in Medieval Britain* (1958). This is the earliest edition of this publication. There are several later editions of the same publication, although the carol section remains identical.

trope set for Christmas celebration. This is quite a small percentage of the overall extant repertoire, and although it doesn't entirely rule out Harrison's theory, it does make it less likely that this would have been their sole purpose, and one must not forget that the phrases 'Benedicamus domino' and 'Deo gracias' would have been well known in the Middle Ages.

Harrison, as with most other authors, does not really touch on the carols without extant musical notation, but does allude to there being 'a considerable number of 'moral' and convivial carols which could not have been introduced into a service, and were probably sung at banquets in royal and aristocratic households and at evenings of recreation in colleges and collegiate churches'.<sup>97</sup> The discussion of the carol only in terms of either textual or musicological importance is not isolated to Stevens, Greene and Harrison; it continues within other academic publications too, for example, Denis Stevens also only dealt with one dimension of the repertoire. He wrote:

The word of these often polyphonic songs might also be in Latin or English or a mixture of both languages. They too were usually religious and the form was once again ABA pattern like the virelai. There are fine monodic pieces such as *Nowell, this is the salutation* and *Nova, nova ave fit* but also polyphonic works like *Abyde I hope* with a monodic burden for solo voice which is taken up again in polyphony by a three part chorus. Monody, however, soon disappeared and two-and-three-part polyphony became the rule.<sup>98</sup>

Denis Stevens, although noting earlier that the carol was one of the most popular genres of the period, does not mention the non-notated carols which make up approximately three quarters of the repertoire. John Caldwell too, in his 1978 monograph *Medieval Music*, continues this tradition, only discussing the polyphonic carol and including little mention of the monophonic repertoire, and nothing of the non-notated corpus. In the 1990s, however, Caldwell does address this imbalance and writes that 'A large number of lyrics in carol form have survived without the music' and that they 'embrace all areas of subject-matter, sacred and secular'.<sup>99</sup> Caldwell attempts here to give a more rounded view of the carol, although

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Harrison, F.L., *Music in Medieval Britain* (London, 1958), 418

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> Stevens, Denis, *Medieval Song* (1970, n.p.), 41

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Caldwell, J., *The Oxford History of English Music* (Oxford, 1991), 162

he almost dismisses its worth as a genre when he notes that 'we have here a body of homely lyric', although he does note that the 'polyphonic carol is nearly always a high-minded genre', and addresses important sources such as the Henry VIII, Ritson and Fayrfax manuscripts at points within different chapters, showing the perhaps more sophisticated side of the carol repertoire, and its evolution from the early repertoire; although he does not include it within the bulk of his carol discussion. He also points out that 'the musical settings of satirical, amorous, or erotic songs in this form have almost disappeared. These will have been the province of a lower class of musician.'<sup>100</sup> Caldwell does not give any evidence for his suggestions, but does appear to be acknowledging the diversity of the genre. Caldwell's, of all the publications thus far chronologically, has treated the carol in the most balanced manner, if rather briefly.

There are also publications from the mid-twentieth century that deal exclusively with the textual aspects of the carols and omit any discussion of their musical aspects. One example of this is found in Rosemary Woolf's 1968 edition of *The English Religious Lyric in the Middle Ages*. This publication is particularly concerned only with sacred texts, of which the carol provides many examples, and devotes an appendix to the discussion of the carol. The only mention of the music of the carols within this volume is Woolfe's comment that:

The carol is a poem designed for singing-musicologists identify in it a distinctive musical shape-with regular stanzas (most often quatrains), and a burden which recurs after each. They were written by men in religious orders for use on festive or liturgical celebrations.<sup>101</sup>

Peter Dronke is another example of a scholar of this period addressing, if somewhat briefly, the textual issues of the medieval carol; this time in relation to its presumed dance origins in his publication *The Medieval Lyric*<sup>102</sup> from 1968 Although Dronke doesn't particularly address the musical characteristics of the genre, he does allude to its musicality.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Caldwell, J., *The Oxford History of English Music* (Oxford, 1991), 164

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Woolf, Rosemary, *The English Religious Lyric in the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 1968), 384

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Dronke, Peter, *The Medieval Lyric* (Cambridge, 1968).

1930s	1940s	1950s	1960s	1970s	1980s	1990s	2000s
R.L.Greene, The Early English Carols (Oxford, 1935) Text based. Not inclusive of Latin carols		Harrison, F.L., <i>Music in Medieval Britain</i> (1958) Musicological approach only. Liturgical focus	Stevens, Denis, ed., A History of Song (London, 1960) Musicological approach only	Stevens, John, ed., Early Tudor Songs and Carols (London, 1975) Edition of notated songs and carols from the Ritson and Fayrfax manuscripts c. 1470		Caldwell, J., <i>The Oxford History of English</i> <i>Music</i> (Oxford, 1991) Focus on polyphonic carols although short mention of un notated corpus	Duncan, Thomas, <i>Late Medieval</i> <i>English Lyrics and Carols 1400- 1530</i> (Harmondsworth, 2000) Literary approach
		Bukofzer, M., Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music (London, 1951) Musicological approach only	Stevens' John, ed., <i>Music</i> at the Court of Henry VIII (London, 1962) Edition of songs and carols from the Henry VIII manuscript.	Caldwell, John, <i>Medieval</i> <i>Music</i> (London, 1978) Discussion of non- notated carols only		Keyte, Hugh, Parrott, Andrew, eds., <i>The New</i> <i>Oxford Book of Carols</i> (New York, 1992) Edition of carols from and beyond the medieval period. Musicological approach only.	Lefferts, P. 'England', in, Everist, Mark, ed. <i>The Cambridge</i> <i>Companion to Medieval Music</i> (Cambridge 2001), 107-120 Musicological approach only
		Stevens, John , ed., <i>Mediaeval Carols</i> (London, 1952) Edition of music up to Ritson Manuscript c.1470 Revised in 1954 and reprinted in 1970	Davies, R.T., ed., <i>Medieval English</i> <i>Lyrics</i> (London, 1963) Mainly literary interest but acknowledgement of music.	Hoppin, Richard, <i>Medieval Music</i> (Oxford, 1978) Discussion of musically notated carols only		Fallows, David, Songs and Musicians in the Fifteenth Century (Hampshire, 1996) This is an anthology collection that re-prints Fallows essay (amongst others), 'English Song Repertories of the Mid-fifteenth Century', Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association, 103/1 (London, 1976-77), 61-79 Musicological approach. Value of carol manuscripts rather than carols themselves.	Taruskin, Richard, <i>The New</i> <i>Oxford History of Western Music</i> (Oxford, 2005) Musicological approach only
		Moore, Arthur K., The Secular Lyric in Middle English (Kentuky, 1951) Literary approach. No	Woolf, Rosemary, The English Religious Lyric in the Middle Ages (Oxford, 1968)	Gray, Douglas, Themes and Images in the Medieval English Religious Lyric (London/Boston, 1972)			Reichl, Karl 'The Middle English Carol' in Duncan, Thomas G., ed., A Companion to the Middle English Lyric (Cambridge, 2005), 150-170

musical discussion. Concerned only with secular carol lyrics.	Literary approach. No discussion of musical elements. Only concerned with those carols of religious content.	Literary approach. Brief discussion of the carol. Brief mention of music. Only concerned with those carols of religious content.	Literary approach, but well balanced presentation of the carol in musical and textual terms. Deals with issues such as themes, form and music, manuscript transmission and possible relationship to the carole and the processional hymn.
	Dronke, Peter, <i>The</i> <i>Medieval Lyric</i> (Cambridge, 1968) Literary approach. Discusses the carol in relation to its presumed origins in dance.		Hirsh, John C., <i>Medieval Lyric:</i> <i>Middle English Lyrics, Ballads and</i> <i>Carols</i> (Oxford, 2005) Edition of texts no discussion of music.
			Reichl, Karl ed., <i>Medieval Oral</i> <i>Literature</i> (Berlin, 2012) Balanced and forward thinking description of the carol. Some mention of singing but musical aspects not addressed in any detail.
			Duncan, Thomas, Medieval English Lyrics and Carols (Cambridge, 2013)

Table 13: The main monographs from 1935-2011 that contain commentary on carols.

Another publication from the same decade as Caldwell's previously discussed work, *The Oxford History of English Music* (Oxford, 1991), is, Keyte, Hugh, and Parrott, Andrew, eds., *The New Oxford Book of Carols* (New York, 1992); a publication which gives an overview of the carol from the Middle Ages to present day. Within the introduction it includes a brief discussion of the medieval carols, although it is vague and again omits to discuss the secular carols or those without music or on secular subjects; only sixteen carols from the fifteenth century. They describe the carols of the Middle Ages thus:

Despite their calculatedly popular character...these are rarely heard outside specialist circles. They were evidently written for professionals to sing, but their popular idiom must have had a broader appeal than most polyphony of the period. Some were certainly intended for the Christmas banquets in ecclesiastical establishments, others perhaps for use as substitutes for office antiphons, in devotions at the crib, or in the Christmas post-vespers processions. In addition to the polyphonic carols we have included two monophonic examples...which give a rare hint at what Christmas music may have been like outside the church.<sup>103</sup>

This gives a fair summary, and rightly points out the neglect the carols have faced in terms of performance or recording. Unfortunately, although understandably due to the scope of the work as an anthology of music for performance, this publication still excludes any mention of the large non-notated corpus.

One of the most recent publications, *The Cambridge Guide to Medieval Music* edited by Mark Everist incorporates many elements of musicological research into the medieval period, including a chapter on music in England by Peter Lefferts. Lefferts briefly mentions the carols, suggesting that they were not a genre suitable for the noble courts. He writes that:

The polyphonic English devotional carol in English and Latin is an important indigenous product of the same era that did not circulate abroad. Not the music of the noble courts but not the music of the people either, the carol appears to have been a repertory primarily for recreational use at Christmas and Eastertime in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Keyte, Hugh, Parrott, Andrew, eds., *The New Oxford Book of Carols* (New York, 1992), xviii

world of the scholars, fellows and singing-men of schools, colleges and major ecclesiastical choral establishments.<sup>104</sup>

This would seem a rather sweeping statement, and one that again isolates the carol into one restrictive category. With manuscripts such as the Henry VIII Manuscript, which includes royal compositions and arrangements and was most probably connected with the royal court, and the splendour of Egerton and the Fayrfax manuscript, Lefferts would seem to be generalising unfairly, not to mention evidence that exists of carols being sung in royal company. There is 'An account of a royal banquet on Twelfth Night' in 1487 tells us that 'At the Table in the Medell of the Hall sat the Deance and those of the Kings Chapell, which incontynently after the King's first course sange a Carall'.<sup>105</sup> This is clear evidence of carols being deemed appropriate for royal company, and would seem to counter the view that Lefferts presents.

More recently, musicology scholars such as Helen Deeming have tackled the genre anew, with valuable work on individual carols such as the 'Agincourt carol'.<sup>106</sup> David Fallows has also discussed the importance of, not necessarily the carols themselves, but at least their extant manuscripts, to the mapping of song throughout the fifteenth century, writing that:

it is still necessary to begin any such survey on a note of extreme caution and with a declaration that the picture must be built on a series of widely separated steppingstones – or more precisely, on a scattered group of stones peeping up from the river and perhaps never intended to pave a way across...a landing place is now fairly solidly established on the far bank thanks to the recent publication by John Stevens of the Fayrfax Manuscript...dating from around 1500, and of the Ritson Manuscript...some of which must have been copied around 1470. Further, a little way up the river, there is a more or less continuous path across provided by the

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Lefferts, P. 'England', in, Everist, M., *The Cambridge Guide to Medieval Music* (Cambridge, 2011), 113
<sup>105</sup> Harrison, F.L., *Music in Medieval Britain* (London, 1963), 419

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music*, 35/1 (2007), 23-38. As noted within the introduction, there have also been some recent PhD dissertations written upon the subject, but regrettably, with little resulting publication of the research: Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa, 2000), Smaill, Adele Margaret, *Medieval Carols: Origins, Forms, and Performance Contexts* (PhD from Michigan, 2003), and Palti, Kathleen, 'Singe we now alle and sum': Three Fifteenth-Century Collections of Communal Song (PhD from University College London, 2008).

English carol tradition...and surviving in a series of five manuscripts that are miraculously fairly even in their chronological and stylistic spacing over the years from 1430 to 1500. <sup>107</sup>

Richard Taruskin too, in his recent tomes charting the history of western music, also includes a discussion of the carol. His approach is to consider the carols up to the early second half of the fifteenth century, thus dealing with the Ritson and particularly the carols of the Fayrfax manuscript separately. He includes no discussion of the non-notated carols. In treating the carols this way, he not only follows tradition by not including any mention of the non-notated corpus and their significance to the carol genre as a whole, but succeeds in further splitting the genre into two further sections: early fifteenth-century carols and late fifteenth-century carols.

This renewed interest extends to literary scholars too with new publications such as *Medieval Oral Literature* by Karl Reichl which presents a balanced and forward thinking description of the carol which does mention the tradition of singing this genre, but fails to discuss any musical aspects in detail. <sup>108</sup> This is in contrast to his earlier writing on the carol from 2005 in which he actually presents a well balanced presentation of the carol in musical and textual terms, dealing with themes, form and music, manuscript transmission and the carols possible relationship to the *carole* and the processional hymn.

The predisposition to treat the carol as either a musical or textual genre (and sometimes also in terms of carol before 1470, and carols after 1470) serves only to look at the repertoire one dimensionally. All aspects of the repertoire must be seen as equally valuable to understanding the carol and its place in fifteenth-century society. The need for a multidisciplinary approach is imperative. Although many carols have no extant music, we cannot say with any certainty that they had never been set to music; indeed, in such a society oral traditions were strong, and there would have been less of a need for notation. As musicologists therefore, we must ask ourselves whether the possibility of musical settings for these carols is also strong, and if so, why the music not copied alongside these extant texts rather than shying away from the problem altogether and placing them in a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Fallows, David, 'English Song Repertories of the Mid-fifteenth Century', *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association*, 103/1 (London, 1976-77), 61

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Reichl, Karl ed., *Medieval Oral Literature* (Berlin, 2012)

separate category. One only has to look to the large non-notated chansonniers to see the carols are not alone in surviving or being deliberately compiled without notation; this however, does not render them any less important to musicological research, we just need to value them in a different way. As Mary Atchison notes in relation to the non-notated chansonniers:

perhaps in this search for melodies and a musicological frame of reference for the texts the point...is missed. The texts have no melodies. There are no empty staves. Melodies are not 'missing'; they were never designed to be included. This is quite distinct from chansonniers which have staves drawn yet the notation never entered. The former can be seen to be conceptually complete, the latter incomplete.<sup>109</sup>

This concept could be applied to the non-notated carols. Rather than searching for lost melodies to make them of worth to musicological research, we must see them instead as a complete repertoire that can help add to our understanding of the notated carols. <sup>110</sup>

## **Conclusion**

The carol can be seen as a genre that had many levels of use in society and musically and textually evolved throughout the fifteenth century; evolving and growing in line with other musical trends. Despite its inclusion in a number of publications, the genre has never been approached in a research context that fully embraces all of the extant carols as one body of material, or fully addresses it beyond the standard textual transcriptions by Greene, or musical transcriptions by Stevens. Academics seem to have neglected the carol of late, perhaps due to the perception of it as a 'homely' genre with less musical value than the Latin motet or the large cyclic masses, but it is precisely this sort of popular genre that gives a real insight into the social aspect of the Middle Ages, the place of music in society outside of the liturgy, and the overlap between music of the church and so called 'popular' song. A

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Atchinson, Mary, The Chansonnier of Oxford Bodleian MS Douce 308 (Aldershot, 2005),2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> The issue of possible lost melodies is addressed in Chapter 4: "That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth-century carol, a music of the people?'

more comparative approach to the genre is now needed in order to better understand the genre; thus allowing it to be seen in a much wider context.

The remainder of this thesis therefore, will attempt to examine carols with and without musical notation as one genre in an attempt to place the carol within clearer social, political and religious contexts. The separation of the carol from other genres in terms of research gives a distorted impression. To disregard the source material which shows that the carol was collected alongside other musical forms and was therefore clearly not thought of as entirely 'separate' by those copyists or their patrons is to misrepresent the genre; a concept that will be argued in the following chapter.

# Chapter 2

# The Carol: an isolated genre?

With the exception of the Trinity Roll, the notated carol generally sits alongside other musical genres in extant manuscripts of the fifteenth century. However, most carol research discusses the carol as a separate entity to other music of the fifteenth century. In addition, research into this genre has tended not to be multidisciplinary, with notated and non-notated carols often being treated as two different areas of research. In order to better understand the carol in not only a social context, but also in terms of musical content, it is essential to look at it in comparison with other common genres of this period. This chapter aims to examine the carol alongside contemporary genres such as the motet, hymn and cantilena, as well as older musical forms such as the conductus and the three formes fixes: rondeau, ballade and virelai.

Of the extant, notated carol manuscripts of the fifteenth century, only one, the Trinity Roll consists only of carols and no other musical or lyrical forms. This roll contains thirteen carols only. This manuscript is an exception. Generally, the carol is found alongside other lyrical genres. Table 14 gives a general overview of the other musical genres placed alongside the carol in the main extant notated manuscripts. The main musically notated carol manuscripts tend generally to contain large numbers of carols in comparison to the other genres; they are always the dominant content, testament to their popularity at this time.

70

MS	Date	Carols	Motets	Hymns	Mass/Mass sections	Te Deum	Canticle	Processional Hymns	Passion	Latin secular song	English Secular Song	Dutch secular Piece	French Secular Song	English Sacred Song	Textless Music	Total
Trinity	Early 15 <sup>th</sup> century	13	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	13
Selden	1425-1450	32	17	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	1	53
Egerton	1450	32	6	0	4	0	0	7	2	1	0	0	0	0	1	53
Ritson	1475	44	22	1	3	2	1	2	0	0	18	0	1	1	0	95 (+ a duplicate = 96)
MS Add. 5666	15thC 1/2	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	5
Ashmole 1393	1425	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	3
Fayrfax	c. 1500	18	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	12	0	0	37	1	50
Henry VIII	c.1520	13	1 (+1 motet-	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	41	3	12 + 3 French/ English	0	35	109
One can see from this table, the diversity of other musical forms within these im manuscripts, ranging from sacred song to hymns and music for liturgical use. In c further understand the carol, a comparison between it and some of these other imperative.

#### The Carol and the Motet

The carols, as we can see in Table 14, sit most prominently alongside the sacred fifteenth-century motet is an inherently difficult form to define, with many schol able to give vague and basic descriptions.<sup>110</sup> Margaret Bent laments that "A piec in several parts with words' is as precise a definition of the motet as will serve from thirteenth to the late sixteenth-century and beyond'.<sup>111</sup> Julie Cumming, in her groundbreaking study of the motet of the fifteenth century, deliberates the proc motet definition within the fifteenth century itself and among modern scholars c She writes:

Contemporary definitions of the term are extremely vague and there is lines scholarly consensus in the twentieth century on the nature and function of fifteenth-century motet: the boundary with liturgical music is especially performed of the spectrum are the scholars who use "motet" loosely as a term for the many kinds of Latin-texted polyphonic music other than the the other end are the scholars who treat the "motet" as a residual categor containing only pieces without pre-existent liturgical texts...If we try to do motet in terms of function the problems are just as great. The little evide have suggests that the motets were used in numerous contexts, almost n them liturgically prescribed.<sup>112</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> For further reading on the motet see: Pesce, Dolores, *Hearing the Motet* (New York, 1992), Le *The Motet in England in the Fourteenth Century* (Michigan, 1983), Cummings, Julie E., *The Motet Dufay* (Cambridge, 1999), and for a detailed look at the earlier thirteenth century motet see: Eve *French Motets in the Thirteenth Century: music, poetry and genre* (Cambridge, 1994).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Bent, Margaret, 'The late-medieval motet', in, Knighton, Tess and Fallows, David, eds., *Compa Medieval and Renaissance Music* (Berkley, 1997) 114-119,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 1-2

The carol at least, is much easier to define in terms of form, although it shares a strong similarity with the motet in terms of the difficulty in determining definitive function and purpose.<sup>113</sup> Apart from some evidence that attests to the carol's use at Christmas, there is little other evidence on which to base theories of additional function, or indeed to suggest in what context the carol was being used at Christmas. In order to look closer at the motet and the carol in such a comparative context, Julie Cumming's criteria for motet definition in this period will act as the basis of this research.<sup>114</sup> Her detailed study into the fifteenth-century motet is clear and concise in its analysis of the changing nature of the motet in the period 1400-1475 and gives information and definitions of style and function in the fifteenth-century motet, addressing issues such as: number of voices, voice ranges, melodic behaviour, rhythm, reduced scoring , length, sections, mensuration, complexity, use of pre-existent material and issues of text.<sup>115</sup> A number of these definitions have already been discussed in general terms in relation to the carol in Chapter one; these definitions will now be examined comparatively with the motet genre, before looking at some more specific examples.

#### <u>Voices</u>

As demonstrated in the previous chapter, the carol favoured a two-voice texture in the earliest manuscripts of the fifteenth century. The later manuscripts however, have evolved into mainly three-voice carols; with one perhaps experimental four-voice piece. Within these three-voice carols, the texture is enhanced by the alternation of voice texture between burdens and verses.<sup>116</sup> The motet however, seems to be in favour of the three voice texture from the beginning of the century, with a marked increase in four-part writing. Cumming writes:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Although Cumming states that almost no motets were liturgically prescribed, Robert Nosow's work, which considers how motets were used and performed in the fifteenth century, disputes this and considers all motets to have held a ritual function. Nosow, Robert Michael, *Ritual Meanings in the Fifteenth-Century Motet* (Cambridge, 2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 24-40

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> See Chapter 1: 'The Carol: musical features and previous scholarship'

Most fifteenth-century motets are for three or four voices. The three-voice pieces are usually fairly short and song-like, while most four-voice pieces are longer and more ambitious in terms of form and structure...Over the course of the century the amount of three-voice writing decreases, while music for four voices becomes the norm.<sup>117</sup>

This use of three voice texture for shorter and more song-like motets resonates well with the use of two or three-voice textures within carol writing. The carols are, by nature, simple in form (although one must not confuse a simple form with simple musical content). The use of four-voice texture would perhaps have been seen as unnecessarily complex for this genre, particularly one that is written in the vernacular, and seems to place an emphasis on text.

#### Melodic Behaviour

There were, as Cumming notes, a number of general rules in terms of the melodic behaviour of different voices. Indeed, 'The upper discantus voices were melodic, with relatively restrained use of leaps and predominantly stepwise melodies', with the tenor voice having a slightly greater freedom but consisting 'primarily of conjunct motion'. In terms of the voice with the greatest amount of melodic freedom, the contratenor easily fits that category with 'large leaps of dissonant intervals, motion through a twelfth in the space of two or three beats, and so forth. They also had the widest range.' <sup>118</sup>

As noted previously, the carol grows in terms of melodic behaviour throughout the century; demonstrated in the surviving manuscripts. The earliest carols are relatively homophonic in character, with any extra melodic floridity, as with the motets, generally coming from the uppermost part.

The slightly later Selden manuscript is relatively similar in style to the Trinity Roll, containing a lot of homophonic texture in its carols, but with more polyphonic movement; the top voice taking the most florid melodic line, and lower voices playing a slower moving

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 29

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 30

harmonic role. In terms of melodic movement, the voices are reasonably similar in the use of leaps and jumps; all parts follow a similar style of conjunct motion, with a conservative amount of leaps and jumps seen at points in all parts. Melismatic writing becomes more prevalent chronologically, but not extensively. Although Zamzow notes that 'Fewer than half the carols in the Trinity Roll, two-thirds of those in Selden, nearly all in Egerton and all the carols in the Ritson manuscript have melismatic passages', <sup>119</sup> the melismatic material is still not tremendously florid in style, and still retains the feel of the earlier carols.

#### Text Setting

Like the carol, the motet is often written using liturgical text; Cumming's comments on motet texts could just as easily apply to the carol repertory when she writes that:

Motet texts can be divided into sacred and secular, though sometimes the distinction is difficult to make. Sacred texts include those in honour of the Virgin, of Christ, and the saints. Secular texts include admonitory texts about the evils of the world or of the church and laudatory political texts about rulers...sometimes with reference to specific occasions.<sup>120</sup>

The carols also have texts relating to human weakness, sexual exploits and relationships, which perhaps give them a more 'earthy' character, and place them closer to the popular music genre than the more stylised motet of this period, and as we will explore in later chapters, they also tackle political subjects, and celebrate particular saints and occasions. The motet though, as Bent notes 'By the sixteenth century, motets were more often sacred than secular'.<sup>121</sup> The carol too, is more often sacred than secular, but this could be due to the survival of sacred texts notated in the manuscripts of the church educated rather than a true representation of the genre.<sup>122</sup>Where the motet and carol differ somewhat, is in the treatment of text. The fifteenth-century motet is known for its juxtaposition of different

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa, 2000),24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 36

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Bent, Margaret, 'The late-medieval motet', in, Knighton, Tess and Fallows, David, eds., *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music* (Berkley, 1997), 114

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> The issue of surviving texts is discussed within Chapter 4, "That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth- century carol, a music of the people?'

texts simultaneously in one piece. There are however, no examples of this in the carol repertory at all; all voices sing the same text.

The carols are notable for their macaronic text setting, often mixing English and Latin or English and French text within one piece; often alternating language between burden and verse or placing a Latin refrain within an otherwise English text. Often these Latin lines are liturgical; something that is echoed in the motet repertoire. The motet in the first half of the fifteenth century generally used new texts, but by the late fifteenth-century composers 'usually chose pre-existent texts and set them to music'.<sup>123</sup> In terms of text style, the motet embraced both poetry and prose, the carol however is very much a poetic genre, favouring rhyming lines and stanzas.78)

#### Egerton- A Comparative Study

Egerton is one of the largest of the musically notated manuscripts. It not only contains a total of 32 carols, but also includes a number of other liturgical, sacred and secular pieces. The carols in this manuscript are collected in one section, with exception of 'O Potores' (the drinking song) and motet 'Domino sanctus Socie'. The first section consists mainly of music for Holy Week; one Mass, three Mass Proper sections, seven processional hymns, two Passions and five motets.

The Egerton Manuscript is compiled in two very distinct sections; the first being music for Holy Week, the second containing mainly carols, with exception of one polyphonic drinking song, and one motet. <sup>124</sup> The Egerton manuscript, includes the motet 'Cantemus Domino' within the carol section of the manuscript. It is placed beside the carol 'Comidentes Convenite' which addresses 'Sister Feasters'. It has been argued that the motet, due to its pitch range could have been written for female voices, McPeek writes:

The motet immediately after the drinking song is singularly appropriate for women, since not only does it use the feminine forms in the word endings, but as Greene

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 35

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Egerton is discussed in most detail in Chapter 6: 'The Medieval Carol: a vehicle for political commentary and English nationalism.'

points out, both the poem and the tenor melody were traditionally associated with women. In addition, treble voices of soprano range, so rare in the Egerton MS (this piece contains the highest notes in the entire manuscript), suggest performance by women of a piece specifically appropriate to them'.<sup>125</sup>

The feminine ending that McPeek refers to is seen in the word 'socie'. If referring to male companions, the word would read 'Socii', which, according to Greene, 'appears in almost all known texts of the hymn'.<sup>126</sup> The text in its entirety reads:

Cantemus Domino socie, cantemus honorem Dulcis amor Cristi personet ore pio Primus ad yma ruit magna de luce Superbus sic homo cum tumuit primus Ad yma ruit unius ob noxam multi periere Minores salvantur cuncti unius ob Meritum femina sola fuit patuit qua Janua leto per quam vita redit femina Sola fuit. <sup>127</sup>

McPeek also notes that 'as well as an additional reason for the motet's position at the close of the original grouping: not only is it the sole sacred motet, but it is the only one specifically appropriate to women, and, traditionally, to women only'. Does this suggest the motet form was more appropriate in the context of this manuscript for women to sing than the carol, or would perhaps the women also have sung some of the carol material? Either is a possibility, but the evidence would suggest perhaps the motet was the only one that would only have worked with female singers due to the feminine ending. It is not impossible however that these endings could have been changed to masculine to suit male singers.<sup>128</sup> Endings were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript Egerton 3307* (London, 1963)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Greene, R.L., 'Two Medieval Musical Manuscripts: Egerton 3307 and some University of Chicago Fragments', in *The Journal of the American Musical Association* (1954), 1-34

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript Egerton 3307* (London, 1963), 32

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> The changing of gender within the carols is documented in Chapter 5: 'Women in the Carols'.

changed in order to change a lyric from masculine to feminine in the carols, why not also in motets?<sup>129</sup>

In analysing the choice of motet against the carols in this manuscripts section, a number of factors will be taken in to consideration, again drawn from Cumming's model: pitch, voices (number of, ranges and speed), language, subject, movement, melodic behaviour, rhythm and phrasing, construction and counterpoint, mensuration, complexity, use of pre existent material.

The motet 'Cantemus Domine Socie' is based on eight lines of a poem by Sedulius found in Osbern's 'Life of St Dunstan' and includes the antiphon 'Gaudent in celis' in the tenor part. It is written for four voices, but much of the texture alternates between duet and full voice singing; imitating the carol form. Although the motet is written for four voices, none of the carols in this section, or indeed the drinking song 'O Potores' are written for the same number of voices. <sup>130</sup> 'O Potores' is written for two and the carols either for two voices or three. Interestingly, Julie Cumming notes that this motet is one of two English motets where:

The tenor is the lowest voice, the contratenor slightly higher...Cantemus Domino is also the only piece in this group to have a tenor cantus-firmus'.<sup>131</sup>

In comparison to the carol pitch ranges, the motet is relatively similar, although the top part does reach a pitch one step higher than the carols, which led McPeek to speculate that the motet was meant to be sung by women, particularly with its place in the manuscript next to the carol 'Comidentes Convenite' which is a direct address to women present.<sup>132</sup> This however, is not conclusive, the pitch difference does not seem large enough to prove this definitively, and a number of carols also reach the same top note, which would suggest they too would be intended for female singers.<sup>133</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> For discussion surrounding women and carol performance/authorships see Chapter 5: 'Women in the Carols'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Three or four voices is a normal number for the fifteenth century with four voices becoming more and more popular towards the end of the century.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 236

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> For more detailed analysis of this carol, see Chapter5: 'Women in the Carols'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> This argument is explored in detail in Chapter 5: 'Women in the Carols'.

Title	Voice 1	Voice 2	Voice 3	Voice 4
Cantemus Domino Socie (Motet)	d-f' (10)	a-b' (9)	c-f' (11)	c-c' (8)
Princeps Pacis (Carol)	d-d' (8)	f-g' (9)	f-a' (10)	
Parit Virgo Filium (Carol)	c'-c'' (8)	c-f' (11)	d-d' (8)	
Lauda Salvatorem (Carol)	a-c" (8)	c-f' (11)	d-c' (7)	

Table 15: Pitch range of the motet in comparison to three voice carols (two of which sit inclose proximity to the motet in the manuscript)

The use of voice ranges in the carols of table 15, are relatively similar to the motet. Certainly, voice one in the motet displays the highest pitch of the carol section, but only by one tone, and in terms of range, it is matched and exceeded by some of the carol voices.

The length of *Cantemus Domino Socie* is 214 perfections, split into two sections (section one consisting of a total of 91 perfections with an original 'O' (perfect) time signature(91 bars), and section two, with an original 'C' (imperfect) time signature and 123 perfections (123 bars)). <sup>134</sup> In terms of comparison with the carols sittiing alongside this motet in Egerton, the longest carol consists of 82 perfections, and the shortest only 23. The longer ones are usually deemed more complex and in a higher style. It has a borrowed cantus firmus, which is easily identified in the tenor's much slower movement than the other voices. In general the motet, in terms of motet form in the fifteenth century: the top voices tend to move in a melodic but relatively stepwise manner, with limited use of leaps; the contratenor, typically, has the widest pitch range and is not afraid of large jumps and leaps; with the tenor moving largely in conjunct motion.

This treatment of voices is not too dissimilar to the carols in Egerton, although, due to the lack of cantus firmus, the voices tend to be more similar in terms of movement and melodic

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Modern 'bars' in accordance with McPeek, Gwynn, S., *Egerton 3307, The British Museum Manuscript* (London, 1963)

and rhythmic similarity. Indeed, the top voice tends to display slightly more in terms of movement in comparison to the lowest voice, but in no way comparable to the difference between top voice and tenor in the motet. As motets were so often composed with a cantus firmus, the Egerton carol section motet reflects the wider motet genre in terms of voice style and pitch.

It is interesting that this lone motet (alongside the drinking song 'O Potores') is placed within an section entirely made up of carols. It would seem that this motet is deemed a suitable musical genre to sit within a body of carols, and that the scribe or compiler perceived a link between the motet and the carol. Strangely however, for a section that only uses three voices, this one four voice piece does seem unusual; in fact it is the only four voice piece in the entire manuscript. This four voice motet with its tenor in the base, is one of only two non-isorhythmic motets with this voice formation and number (the other being Dunstaple's 'Descendi') extant from this period. It seems, as Cumming points out:

This particular approach to four –voice texture, with the tenor alone at the bottom of the texture, does not seem to have been used on the Continent.<sup>135</sup>

This manuscript, with its favouritism of the carol, a very English and insular genre, and its inclusion of its particularly English subject matter, would seem to favour such a peculiarly English motet.

It would appear then that the motet of the fifteenth century was thought to be an appropriate genre to be placed alongside carols. Although there is one extant source that contains only musically notated carols, the remainder of the corpus, like motet , is always found amongst other genres.

Like the carol, the motet is hard to pin down in terms of functionality. As Cumming notes, the motet is:

A genre that is textually and functionally flexible, with no fixed subject matter and no prescribed liturgical position, that lies in the middle of the genre hierarchy, and thus has a broad range of tone and style height'.<sup>136</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 236

The main difference between the two genres however has to be in the flexibility of form. The carol is very much a fixed form (although the development of the double burden throughout the fifteenth century does attest to its development with time). The motet however has a flexibility of form denied to the carol. What the carol does have is a more defined personality than the motet, it is easier to get a hold on it and its place. The carol too, like the motet has gradients of style, some of the perhaps 'lewder; carols lacking notation could have been used for recreational purposes and set to popular melodies.<sup>137</sup>

The carol has somehow been sidelined in recent musicological studies, however, the importance of the carol seems somewhat undervalued, perhaps due to its pigeon holing as merely a form for festivities at Christmas, or its misunderstanding as only being a genre written by clerics for their own amusement. One look at the Egerton Manuscript or Ritson would dispel this as far too general a viewpoint. The carol, like the motet, has both low and high style versions of the same form; the high style of the carols seen in most of the extant polyphonic genre, and glimpses of a more simplified style evident in some of the monophonic survivors; some of the non-notated carols too, with their 'earthier' subject matter, may fall into the clerical amusement category, but this certainly cannot be said for all of them.

#### The Carol and Earlier Genres

The carol, due to its fixed structure, is very often placed in the same context as the chronologically earlier three *formes fixes*: the ballade, the rondeau and the virelai. Usually in academic writing, this observation comes as only a brief comment or as an after or closing thought without further explanation. In order to understand fully the similarity, and indeed differences, between the carol and the three formes fixes it is important to examine them more detail. All three genres are continental in origin but found in English sources, all three have a fixed structure, and all three have connections to dance. Of these three generalities, the carol can identify in its use of a fixed structure and does have an ambiguous link to the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Cumming, Julie E., *The Motet in the Age of Du Fay* (Cambridge, 1999), 60

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> See Chapter 4: "That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth- century carol, a music of the people?'

French carole which was a fixed form dance genre, but as discussed in previous chapters, no definitive proof of this currently exists. The carol is not a continental genre and does not travel outside of English sources, therefore the main similarity between the carol and these three fixed forms really stems from its fixed structure.

Of these main characteristics: continental genres, connections to dance and fixed musical structure, the carols can at least partially be said to relate to the dance element and the fixed structure. There are of course, other elements of each individual form: ballade, rondeau and virelai that the carol shows some affiliation with, which will now be discussed in further detail, starting with the virelai.

The virelai has the basic structure ABBA, and is most similar to the carol. The refrain 'is normally several lines long and occupies the whole of the first musical section.'<sup>138</sup> It is perhaps unfairly seen as the least popular genre of the *forms fixes*, due only to its lack of survival in written form. Nigel Wilkins notes that the virelai's use of increasing development of complex metrical patterns within the text structure meant that it:

came to be a rather more boisterous form than the ballade or the rondeau. An indication perhaps of its more 'popular' nature is in the fact that of the 33 virelais that Machaut set to music only eight use polyphony; and of these seven are very simple two-part settings for voice and untexted tenor.<sup>139</sup>

It is this idea of the virelai as a 'popular' genre that seems to sit well with the carol repertoire, that and the preference for monophonic settings. Despite a huge number of polyphonic notated carols surviving, there are still a number of monophonic carols, and a vast number of untexted carols which point to lost popular melodies.<sup>140</sup>

The text of the virelai differs greatly from the carol repertoire as it is concentrated mainly on courtly love lyrics, as opposed to the carols' diverse subject matter, a trait also seen in the rondeau and the ballade.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Wilkins, Nigel. "Virelai." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed May 21, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/29490.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Nigel Wilkins. "Virelai." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed May 21, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/29490.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> See Chapter 4: "That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth- century carol, a music of the people?'

The ballade however, by the end of the fourteenth century had developed to incorporate a wide range of texts 'in praise of patrons or in celebration of historical events; in the main, however, the ballade was throughout its history the preferred form for the serious love song.<sup>141</sup> The carol is certainly not known for its praise of patrons, but certainly does have some love lyrics and a number of carols that celebrate important events in English history as well as English Kings and Saints; one only has to look to the famous 'Agincourt carol' as a fitting example of a tribute to both a King and important historical event. <sup>142</sup>The basic form of the ballade is AAB; both musically and textually. A large number of ballades survive without musical notation, indeed 200 by Machaut alone; similar to the carol and its large number of extant un-notated repertoire. Of course, collections of lyrics without their music is certainly not exclusive to the ballade and the carol; many English and continental manuscripts survive with large numbers of lyrics with no musical notation; the fifteenthcentury GB-Lbl Sloane 2593 is a good example of an English manuscript that falls in to this category, and the fourteenth -century Chansonnier Oxford, Bodleian Library Douce 308 is an exceptional continental example of a large collection of lyric forms (500 in total), collected without corresponding musical notation.<sup>143</sup>

The rondeau, like the ballade and virelai, was also concerned in the main with courtly love, rather than the nativity, political and more pragmatic ideas of love portrayed in the carols. Of course, one must remember that the ballade, virelai and rondeau were earlier musical forms, in a time where courtly love was a particulalrly fashionable lyric on the continent, unlike the English carol. Interestingly though, other than the similarity of fixed form, the rondeau does have an affiliation with the carol in terms of use of pre existent material; or rather the use of rondeau material in other musical forms and the carol's use of pre existent text. As Wilkins notes:

A vital...factor is the particular importance acquired by the rondeau refrain, since its performance, though it may be only two lines long, entails the use of the whole melody, not simply part of it. This may well be the reason why rondeau refrains took on a life of their own and were often inserted into other songs, motets, romances

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Wilkins, Nigel, . "Ballade (i)." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed May 21, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/01884.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> The Agincourt carol if published in: Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> Atchison, Mary, *The Chansonnier of Oxford Bodleian Douce* 308 (Aldershot, 2005)

and many miscellaneous literary works. Some 13th-century motets use an entire rondeau as one of the voice parts or as the fundamental tenor, which occasionally makes possible the reconstruction of a piece found elsewhere without music.<sup>144</sup>

In each fixed form there is some similarity to the carol beyond a fixed structure, but the chronological difference between the formes fixes make them difficult to compare with any real comparative meaning. By the time the carol flourished in the fifteenth century, the formes fixes had waned in popularity on the continent, or developed into something new; for example the virelai becomes a literary genre rather than a musical one in the fifteenth century. The dance form connection between the formes fixes and the carol, suggesting that all three derived from dances, is certainly possible, although difficult to prove. The carol has often been argued to be a derivative of the French dance form, the carole, but the lack of extant music for the carole, and any form of definitive evidence that links the two forms is severely lacking.<sup>145</sup> Indeed, even the extant formes fixes and their link to dance has been questioned. Henrick Van der Werf suggests that:

There is a theory that the rondeau, the virelai, and the ballade either are, or derive from dancing songs. This usually goes together with the assumption that their refrains derive from a practice that dance songs were intoned by a soloist, some of whose verses were repeated by the (other) dancers. It is a thankless task to try to disprove a theory that has never been proven... From some narratives we may also conclude that an alternation between a soloist and others occasionally occurred in dancing songs. Forms of the word "rondeau" occasionally appear as labels for a dancing song. The noun "ballade" seems to be related to the verb *ballare,* meaning "to dance." Some late entries in *Le Manuscrit du Roi* which in their form resemble the virelai, have the title *danssa*. Beyond that, there is little or nothing to connect all rondeaux, virelais, and ballades to dancing. Exploring their origin a bit further, I suggest that if the rondeaux, virelais, and ballades of Guillaume de Machaut were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> Wilkins, Nigel, "Rondeau (i)." *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed May 21, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/23782

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> For more discussion of the origins of the carol see Chapter 1: 'The Carol: Musical Features and Previous Scholarship'

descendants of dancing songs, they are at least as far removed from their origin as Beethoven's scherzos are removed from the courtly minuet. <sup>146</sup>

So it seems that the uncertainty, or indeed gulf between the dance form carole, and the fifteenth-century carol might be as far removed as the original dance forms that may have led to the final three formes fixes as they came to be known by the fourteenth century.

The chronological distance between the fifteenth-century English carol and the earlier continental formes fixes makes meaningful comparison difficult, but there are certainly some similarities beyond the use of a fixed structure between them. Indeed, some continuing use of the formes fixes, in particular the ballade and rondeau, was taking in place in England alongside the carol, but the music is not extant on the scale of the carol. As David Fallows succinctly notes:

It is possible...to see...clearly separable stylistic strands among the English song sources from the middle years of the fifteenth century, strands that are made visible only if we add the various songs in continental sources and follow the leads offered by poetic form. Strand one is the rondeau, thoroughly French in style, represented in English only by the Portland leaf and the fragment at Cambridge. Strand two is the ballade, also strongly influenced by continental music, but cultivated by English composers at a time when continental musicians had all but abandoned it...Finally there is what one might call the truly English tradition of free-form songs...they have simple imitation, much homophonic writing and increasingly elaborate closing melismas.<sup>147</sup>

Fallows does not mention the carol within these stylistic strands, perhaps due to the tradition of academics to continually place the carol as separate to every other genre, a practice that needs addressing, and shall be discussed now in further detail.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> Van der Werf, 'The 'Not-So-Precisely Measured' Music of the Middle Ages', *Performance Practice Review*, Vol. 1/1 (1988), 55-56

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> Fallows, David, 'English Song Repertories of the Mid-Fifteenth Century', *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association*, Vol. 13 (1976-77), 77-78

#### Conductus

The earlier conductus has been argued by academics to be the predecessor of the carol, not necessarily in terms of form, but perhaps more for its setting of not only sacred subjects but, as with the carol, the setting of political or satirical text. As Hoppin notes:

This textual variety makes the conductus difficult to define and its function difficult to determine. Some conducti could, and probably did, serve as unofficial additions to the liturgy. A more appropriate use for others might have been the musical and moral instruction of the young or the leisure entertainment of clerics and scholars.<sup>148</sup>

The conductus repertoire is not in strict musical form as the carols are; instead their musical form can change substantially, giving a more flexible approach. Like the carol, conducti were also thought to, in the main, have consisted of 'new' melodic material rather than relying on existing material to provide a cantus firmus. The carol too, is not often found to use cantus firmus material, but does on occasion, as does the conducti, borrow fragments of melody and text.

Due to the almost complete disappearance of the conductus by the fifteenth century, and the subsequent emerging popularity of the carol, it has been argued that the carol is a replacement genre for the conductus. This is impossible to prove certainly, but is nevertheless a possibility. In the poem 'Sir Gawayne and the Green Knight', written towards the end of the fourteenth century however, a quarter of a century before the emergence of our extant carol manuscripts, both genres are mentioned together, perhaps implying they are similar or interchangeable in some way. The poem reads:

> Much glam and gle glent therinne About the fyre upon flet, and on fele wyse At the soper and afer, mony athel songez As condutes of Krystmasse and carols newe With al the mannerly merthe that mon may of telle.<sup>149</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Hoppin, R., *Medieval Music* (New York, 1978), 242

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Transcription taken from: Harrison, F.L., Music in Medieval Britain (London, 1963), 418

This poem places the 'newe' carol in the same category as the much older genre of the conductus, not least because it calls them conducti of Christmas, which could indeed point to a relationship between the two genres. The interpretation of the wod 'newe' is of course ambiguous; it could refer to the carol as a new genre, or be referring to new examples of an already established one. I may be inclined to suppose it is referring to recent examples of an already established genre as one would expect the author to be using familiar terms to engage with his reader, rather than introducing them to a new, lesser known musical device.

Other similarities to the carol according to Stevens and Libby are its 'note-against-note style, its syllabic treatment of the text, its presentation in score, [and] the absence of cantus firmi...'<sup>150</sup> as well as its qualities as a processional hymn.

#### The Ritson Manuscript and the Hymn

We only have to look at the connection between carol and hymn to further see that the carol was not a genre in isolation, and was drawing from and engaging with other sources. Greene lists a total of sixty macaronic carols that contain lines borrowed from hymns that were 'some of the finest and best known which the Middle Ages produced'.<sup>151</sup> Greene's wish to continue to separate the carol as a genre however leads him to surmise that:

More probably the carols' independence of the hymns' subject-matter is due to the recognition by those who produced the carols that the masterpieces of church song were in a more exalted strain than was fitting for pieces modelled on popular song.<sup>152</sup>

This would seem rather a presumption. It could also be argued that the carols' writers, by including some Latin hymn lines, were paying homage to the hymn tradition or subject but deliberately wanting to create something new from it, in particular the addition of

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Stevens, John and Libby, Dennis. "Carol." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed January 4, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/04974.
 <sup>151</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), lxvii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), lxxi. Greene lists carols that contain quotations from hymns on pages lxv-lxvii within this same publication. Despite this table from Greene, it would seem there has been no further detailed research on the inclusion of hymn texts in the carols since his research. This would seem to require future research that is beyond the scope of this thesis.

vernacular text, in order to appeal to a different audience or performance setting. This could perhaps be seen in the context of troping.

The hymn was an important part of the Western Church, with 'a hymn sung in each of the daily offices'.<sup>153</sup> The general description by Hoppin being:

From the time of Ambrose until now, hymn texts have been divided into short stanzas, or strophes, all of which have the same poetic structure. This structure may vary from one hymn to another, but all the stanzas of one hymn will have the same number of lines, the same metrical pattern, and the same rhyme scheme, if rhyme is present. It follows, therefore, that when the melody of the first stanza is repeated for each succeeding stanza, strophic form results. It also follows that all hymns with stanzas of the same poetic structure may be sung to the same melody, and the use of one melody for two or more different hymns was as common in the Middle Ages as it is in present-day hymnals.<sup>154</sup>

The Ritson manuscript is one of only 'Two 15<sup>th</sup>-century English sources [that] contain polyphonic hymns...they use the techniques of cantus firmus treatment...that is not known elsewhere and marks them as English...The paucity of 15<sup>th</sup>-century sources makes a complete understanding of English polyphonic hymn practices very difficult'.<sup>155</sup> The carol too is difficult to pin down in terms of practice, despite the deluge of extant material. One polyphonic hymn in Ritson is 'O lux beata trinitas', written for two voices.<sup>156</sup> It is a 'Hymn at first Vespers of Sundays, when the service is of the Sunday, from the first Sunday after Trinity until Advent'.<sup>157</sup> It reads:

> O lux beata, trinitas Et principalis unitas, Jam sol recedit igneus, Infunde lumen cordibus.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> Hoppin, R., *Medieval Music* (New York, 1978), 110

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> Hoppin, R., *Medieval Music* (New York, 1978), 111-112

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> Warren Anderson, et al. "Hymn." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed January 4, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/13648.
 <sup>157</sup> Lane, Eleanor, Sandon, Nick and Bayliss, C., *The Ritson Manuscript: Liturgical Compositions, Votive Antiphons, Te deum* (Newton Abbot, 2011), xvi

Te mane laudem carmine, Te deprecemur vespere; Te nostra simplex Gloria Per cuncta laudet secula.

Deo patri sit Gloria Ejusque soli filio Cum spiritu paraclito Et nunc et in perpetuum.<sup>158</sup>

Although this hymn is not quoted in any of the carols in the Ritson manuscript itself, it is quoted in two extant carols, in three manuscripts: 'To blis God bring vs all and sum, christe redemptor omnium'<sup>159</sup> from GB-Obc 354, and GB-Ob Eng.poet..e.1, and 'Make we joye nowe in this fest'<sup>160</sup> from GB-Selden b.26, and GB-Eng poet.e.1.<sup>161</sup> These carols use the first line of the hymn 'O lux beata, trinitas' in different ways in the text. The carol 'To blis God bring vs all and sum' uses Latin lines from six hymns for the second line of the burden and the last line of each stanza. The first line of this particular hymn is found at the end of stanza four in the version from GB-Obc 354, and at the end of stanza three in the GB-Ob Eng.poet.e.1 version. The GB-Obc 354 version reads:

#### To blis God bring vs all and sum,

#### Christe redemptor omnium

In Bedlem, in that fayer cyte,

A child was born of Owr Lady,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> For a full transcription and translation of this hymn see: Lane, Eleanor, Sandon, Nick and Bayliss, C., *The Ritson Manuscript: Liturgical Compositions, Votive Antiphons, Te deum* (Newton Abbot, 2011), xxix and for a musical transcription see pages21-23 in the same publication.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> For full text see: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 14-15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> For full text see: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> This hymn, alsthough present in Ritson, only appears with the burden and the first two stanzas, therefore omits the quotation of this hymn.

Lord and Prynce that he shuld be, A solis ortus cardine.

Chyldren were slayn grett plente, Jhesu, for the love of the; Lett vs neur dampned be. Hostes Herodes ympie.

He was born of Owr Lady Withowt wembe of her body, Godes Son that syttyth on hye, Jhesu saluator seculi.

As the son shynyth thorow the glas, So Jhesu in her body was: To serue hym he geve vs grace, O lux beata Trinitas.

Now ys born owr Lord Jhesus, That mad mery all vs; Be all mery in thy howse; Exvltet celum lavdibus.<sup>162</sup>

Unfortunately, there is no surviving musical notation for this carol in order to compare the music of the hymn and the music of the carol. The carol 'Make we joye', however, does survive with musical notation, although there seems to be no obvious relationship between the two melodies. It uses Latin lines from ten hymns as the second line of its burden, and as the first and last lines of each stanza.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 14-15

Make we joye nowe in this fest, In quo Christus natus est. Eya!

A Patre vnigenitus Thorw a maiden is com to vs. Synge we to here and sey, 'Welcome! Veni redemptor gencium.'

Agnoscat omne speculum: A bright sterre thre kynges [made] come For to seke with here presens Verbum supernum prodiens.

A solis ortus cardine, So mighty a lord was none as he, For to oure kynde he hath yeue gryth, Adam parens quod polluit.

Maria ventre concepit; The Holy Gost was aye here with. In Bedleem yborne he ys, Consors paterni luminis.

O lux beata Trinitas! He lay bytwene an oxe and asse,. Thou moder and maiden fre,

#### Gloria tibi, Domine.<sup>163</sup>

The hymn is not placed next to the carols in the manuscript, but between a Marian antiphon and an antiphon. The carols in the Ritson manuscript are placed near the beginning. The initial construction (until the completion of the carols only) consisting of:

1.	Antiphon (Miserere michi domine)	Layer 5	
2.	Benedicamus Domino	Layer 5	
3.	Marian Antiphon, (Stella celi extirpavit)	Layer 5	
4.	31 carols	Layer 1	
5.	Later Carol	Layer 5	
6.	8 carols	Layer 1	
7.	Marian antiphon, (Salve Regina)	Layer 5	
8.	5 carols	Layer 1	
9.	Vernacular song <sup>164</sup>	Layer 1	
10	Textless fragment	Layer 1	
11. Marian Antiphon (Nesciens Mater)		Layer 1	
12	Alleluia (Per te dei genitrix)	Layer 5	
13. Marian Antiphon (Beata dei genitrix)			
14. Marian Antiphon (Nesciens Mater) Layer 1			
15. Marian Antiphon (Nesciens Mater) Layer 1			
16	16. Marian Antiphon (Ave Regina celorum) Layer		

Although we can observe large sections of carols, they are still interspersed with other forms. Ritson is compiled in five layers. The first three layers are of particular interest to this study. Layer one, the earliest, consisting of all 44 carols and six other items such as antiphons and three settings of Nesciens matter; layer two with the polyphonic hymn and eight songs; and finally layer three which contains two masses by Thomas Packe: Rex Summe and Gaudete in Domino. The first layer is commonly believed to be started around 1460, with the final layers completed around 1500. The inclusion of material from layer five around the carols would suggest their continuing popularity and use c. 1500. The polyphonic hymn discussed previously is written for two voices. None of the carols are in two voice

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup> For a complete inventory of the contents of Ritson see: Lane, Eleanor, Sandon, Nick and Bayliss, C., *The Ritson Manuscript: Liturgical Compositions, Votive Antiphons, Te deum* (Newton Abbot, 2011), xvi

format; nearly all are written for three voices with the exception of one; written for five. Table 16 below illustrates the voice texture in all of the music of Ritson.

RITSON	One Voice	Two Voices	Three Voices	Four Voices	5 voices
Vernacular Song (20)	1 (5%)	5 (25%)	14 (70%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Carols (44)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	44 (98%)	1 (2%)	0 (0%)
Other (34)	3 (9%)	8 (24%)	20 (58%)	1 (3%)	2 (6%)
Total (98)	4 (4%)	13 (13%)	78 (79%)	2 (2%)	2(2%)

Table 16: Voice texture in the Ritson manscript

The other music from layer one consists of: a monophonic vernacular song, two three-voice Nesciens Mater, two three-voice Marian antiphons, and a three-voice textless fragment. So essentially the voice number is consistent with the carols within this first layer, and with the exception of the vernacular song 'I have been a foster', the material surrounding the carols is concerned with the Christmas season.

So again we see the carol, not isolated from other musical genres, but surrounded by them. The fifteenth-century scribes/compilers of these manuscripts clearly saw them as worthy enough to sit alongside liturgical music as well as other vernacular song, therefore as researchers, we should do the same.

#### Possible Reasons for the Isolation of the Carol in Current and Past Research

Why then, when we see that the carol is very much integrated with other musical genres of the fifteenth century, is it still not treated in conjunction with other genres by academics and performers (it is rare to hear carols performed, other than the obvious Christmas ones, and usually only by English performers)? One reason may be that the carol is very much an 'English' genre, one that has had little if no influence on continental music of the same period, and is instead seen more as a progression of older continental styles such as the carole, or placed in the same category as the earlier *formes fixes*.

The lack of carols composed by 'famous' composers has not helped in raising the interest of musicologists. With the exception of one carol that is labelled 'J.D.', which musicologists have long clung to the hope that it may be by John Dunstaple, there are no famous composers connected with the extant carol repertoire until we reach GB-Lbl Additional 5465, otherwise known as the Fayrfax manuscript, where we find a number by familiar names such as Cornish, Davy, Browne, Banister, Turges, Sheryngham and William Cornish Junior.<sup>165</sup> This makes the earlier carols less desirable as a genre for serious research, and places them in the cabinet of musical curiosity rather than at the forefront of research. The named composers we do have are, in the main, considered provincial due to their location outside of the Royal court and the continent, and the lack of any of their work appearing in manuscripts other than Ritson.<sup>166</sup> As musicologists researching in an area that is littered with large swathes of missing material, we must desist from concentrating on the 'famous' composers, and re-evaluate these smaller provincial musical survivors and their contribution to the fifteenth-century repertoire.

The abundant use of English in the carols may not only have caused their lack of influence abroad, particularly as the amount of English texted music abroad is so minimal, but also may be another reason that the genre has been so neglected in current research and been another catalyst in the separation of the genre from the rest of the fifteenth-century song repertoire. Certainly, English vernacular song is not prolific in extant continental sources. David Fallows in his catalogue of fifteenth-century song only lists a total of five purely English texts. He does however note that:

English texts of a kind appear in Continental manuscripts for one song in Tr88, one in EscB, and three in Mel. But the 'English' repertory can be considerably expanded by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> The 'J.D.' carol and questions of authorship are discussed in Chapter 3: 'The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> The Ritson mansucript contains the greatest number of named composers, the two most prolific being Richard Smert and John Trouluffe.

taking account of songs ascribed to English composers as well as those in a style related to works established as English.<sup>167</sup>

The misconception that carol texts are only centred upon the nativity does not help the cause of the genre either. The variety of text subjects in the carols are a valuable insight into non liturgical/sacred aspects of medieval thinking and medieval life. Their text setting can open a far greater window into medieval life than yet another Mass setting by a famous composer. Focusing on these large and famous works is only presenting a narrow elitist view of music from this period, neglecting the larger picture and the music surrounding these grand works. The carols' 'popular' nature perhaps also makes them less interesting to scholars as a serious musical genre, but it is precisely this popularity that should be drawing academics to study them further. They were obviously of particular importance in the fifteenth century in a variety of classifications; in substantial notated volumes such as Egerton, sharing manuscript space with liturgical music, to smaller pocket manuscript books owned by preachers or minstrels and cover subjects from the nativity to sexual encounters. This ability to span class divides should make the carol of great value to researchers of this period.

#### **Conclusion**

The carol is so often treated in isolation to other genres, yet it is found placed in manuscripts alongside many other genres that receive far greater serious musicological study and are performed more widely. This suggests that it was not treated as a separate genre in the fifteenth century. We only have to look at the carols interspersed among other music in the main notated manuscripts in order to see this. Apart from the isolated Trinity Roll, all the other manuscripts contain other musical material alongside the carol. Granted, Egerton does have a 'carol section' but within that section is also found a motet and an English song, and a section of music for holy week. Also, its ability to incorporate other genres, such as hymn texts and lines from the liturgy also proves it is not by any means an isolated genre.

In terms of musical value, it has been demonstrated, not only within this chapter, but also in Chapter 1, that the carol is not a simple, stagnant musical form. It has grown and developed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Fallows, David, A Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs, 1415–1480 (Oxford, 1999), 53

in musical style throughout the fifteenth century and beyond; growing in its use of voices like the motet, and developing its form. It, like the motet, uses a variety of language combinations (although the carol only uses one language at any one time in all voices) and it is, also like the motet, able to adapt to a variety of text settings: sacred, secular, liturgical.

Its lack of influence abroad should not be seen as detrimental to the form, but rather a testament to its peculiarly English nature. Links to the continent do not make a genre any more valuable a commodity. Placing the carol in a wider context throughout this thesis; in terms of its placement alongside other genres in manuscripts and in performance, and in terms of its place in society will help us to understand this important form in a more three-dimensional fashion. The possibility of a lack of famous composers linked to the fifteenth-century carols would certainly seem one possibility for the sidelining of the genre, and is one that needs addressing further within the following chapter.

# Chapter 3

# The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?

In the pursuit of understanding and connecting with music of the past our natural starting point remains, more often than not, with the composer. Although often a valid research method, this approach can cloud rather than clarify our understanding. This need to connect with a composer, a method originating in the nineteenth century, is one that is still evident to a certain extent in current thought. A greater value is often placed on those pieces which can claim a named composer or author, thus resulting in the side-lining of a great deal of anonymous music in musicological research. This has resulted in research interests often bypassing anonymous works in favour of those by prominent or even just named composers, creating a false picture of music and its place in history. In the case of early music, very little evidence survives of named authors or composers, and the evidence that does is often sparse or unreliable, which places the music of the middle ages very differently to that of the nineteenth century musical cannon. This chapter aims to discuss the legitimacy of focusing on the composer as the only, or indeed the primary aspect of researching music of the Middle Ages and in particular, the late medieval carols.

## The Author's Voice

Music invites human connection; a need to understand. This connection with the sound is more often than not mediated through our knowledge of the composer and a need to hear and understand the possible biographical narratives he or she may be trying to convey to us through his/her compositions. Echoing this sentiment, Roland Barthes writes: The *explanation* of a work is always sought in the man or woman who produced it, as it were always in the end, through the more or less transparent allegory of the fiction, the voice of a single person, the *author* 'confiding' in us.<sup>168</sup>

This perception of the author's voice was particularly perpetuated in the nineteenth century, and resulted in the creation of an almost divine status surrounding the composers of the European classical tradition. The composer as an artist creating a 'work' was born. No longer was music merely a practical device, but had emerged as art in its own right. Willem Erauw discusses this phenomenon in relation to the work in this field by Lydia Goehr. He notes that:

a classical concert had become a ritual event, production/performance was now clouded in an atmosphere of nebulous secrecy. It was no longer obvious that mortal human beings, composers and performers alike, were still capable of evoking this sacred realm instrumental music now belonged to.<sup>169</sup>

In creating these 'celebrity' or 'divinely touched' composers, we have unintentionally produced a closed canon of classical music that excludes a great wealth of musical material. Sophie Fuller writes:

A complex and varied art form, classical music is in origin a Western genre, that has grown out of the music used for Christian worship and European folk traditions. Over the centuries it has travelled throughout the world, borrowing freely from other musics and cultures, although it remains dominated by a central Germanic canon from Bach through Beethoven to Brahms and Wagner.<sup>170</sup>

This nineteenth-century conception still remains to a certain extent in the thoughts and attitudes of today's listeners and researchers, despite the success of the contemporary and early music movements of the last 30 years. It is however, an outdated concept, which creates too narrow a focus to allow a truly three-dimensional understanding of music. The composer is only one element of the wider picture available to us, not the ultimate one.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> Barthes, Roland, 'The Death of the Author' in, *Image, Music Text* (London, 1977), 143
 <sup>169</sup>Erauw, Willem, 'Canon Formation: Some More Reflections on Lydia Goehr's 'Imaginary Museum of Musical Works', *Acta Musicologica*, Vol. 70, 2 (Jul. - Dec., 1998), 113

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> Fuller, Sophie, 'Dead White Men in Wigs' in, Cooper, s. ed., *Girls! Girls! Girls!* (London, 1995), 22

Even when our knowledge of the composer is plentiful, and manuscript sources are readily available, we can still never be entirely sure that the manuscript that remains even accurately represents the composer's intentions; particularly in early music, where extant sources and authorial information is so much scarcer. When working with nineteenthcentury sources, and prominent composers such as Chopin, Randel notes just such problems:

For a piano piece by Chopin, you may well have the composer's autograph ... ; copies made for sending to publishers; publisher's proofs. In fact there may be three first editions from three different publishers ... And the three published editions are not quite the same ... which of the three versions is right? The last because it represents the composer's most considered intentions? The first because it is closest to his original conception?<sup>171</sup>

There are many pitfalls in trying to understand the music from the point of view of the composer only, but much to be gained in combining knowledge of the creator of the work with other methodologies. Caution however, must be used when trying to build a narrative around a work from any starting point, particularly that of a connection with a distant creator. It is too easy, in attempting to engage with the music, to create false images of the past; and again, even greater caution is needed when dealing with early music, where we have so much less evidence available to us. Leo Treitler also advises caution in this approach. In his work on early chant he notes that:

The vocabulary of these early histories is bathed in a feeling of nostalgia for a golden age undebased by corruption, but an age, we must remember, about whose music little or nothing was known. But that is just the point about a golden age. It has meaning only as a transcendent idea whose main attribute is the unspoilt quality that attracts nostalgia. To concretize it is already to spoil it. The penumbra of a golden age has always tended to surround ... and continues to do so.<sup>172</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Randel, Don Michael, 'The Canons in the Musicological Toolbox', *Disciplining Music: Musicology and its Canons*, eds. Katherine Bergeron and Phillip V. Bohlman (Chicago, 1992), 88-89

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> Treitler, Leo, With Voice and Pen: Coming to Know Medieval Song and How it was Made (Kings Lynn, 2003),
213

One must therefore be cautious in approaching early music as such a golden, unspoilt and romanticised entity created by hazy, God-like figures, but instead ensure its examination, in so far as is possible, in the context of the factual evidence available to us.

As a student, I recall the visit of a local poet. A number of weeks before his arrival, the class were coached in the analysis of his poems; exploring and understanding them at a critical level. The poet himself on hearing the analysis so painstakingly constructed by teacher and class, explained that none of it had any point, what we were discovering was not at all what had been his intention to convey, that we were looking for a sub-narrative and explanation for his work that simply wasn't there, but had been invented by us, the readers. This danger of over-analysis and the creation of false narratives is an ever present danger, as this example illustrates. However, one must consider that although the analysis had little point for him as a 'creator', it is still of use to the 'receiver'. Analysis, it could be argued has some positive value in helping to engage modern audiences with music from the past, particularly early music, and Barthes would certainly argue that the listener of today is of greater importance than the author of yesterday when he writes that:

Classic criticism has never paid any attention to the reader, for it, the writer is the only person in literature ... we know that to give writing its future, it is necessary to overthrow the myth: the birth of the reader must be at the cost of the death of the Author<sup>173</sup>.

I would argue however that our understanding and connection with the music of the past, need not necessarily be at the expense of the 'death of the author' where an author is available to us, but can be enhanced in our understanding of the authorial presence in conjunction with a greater appreciation of the music in a wider, more three-dimensional context. This is never more the case than in our treatment of the medieval period, where very few extant sources detail authors or composers, and those composers that are named very often have little known about their lives in order to help us to relate to them intimately in their music in any way. Don Michael Randel points out one of the problems in implementing this change of approach, encouraging listeners, performers and researchers

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Barthes, Roland, 'The Death of the Author' in, *Image, Music Text* (London, 1977), 142-3

alike to broaden their field of repertoire beyond that of named canonical composers. He writes:

Even when there is no hope of identifying a single composer, as in some medieval repertories, for example, we seem to prefer to study music for which we can imagine more clearly the possibility of an individual creator.<sup>174</sup>

It is important that we remember that music, and in particular early music, cannot be understood as a stand-alone art form, or as a fantasised communication from an authorial voice. It is only when it is placed into a social and historical context that a more detailed picture can be constructed. It is particularly important to understand early music in such a way, not only because, as Randel points out, so often we cannot identify a composer, but also that more often than not, when researching medieval music, we must remember that it was not created to be treated as a work of art, but was instead created for a practical purpose. It was a useful part of ceremonies, court functions; or most often, church services. We only have to look at the medieval carols to see this in practice. John Stevens summarizes the place of music in the middle ages and in particular that of the carols, writing:

'Ceremonial' is a word which may be applied to all the polyphonic carols. Like so much other mediaeval music the carol was an ornament in a ceremony. The most powerful appeal, however, of any ceremony, whether processional in character or not, was certainly visual – in church, silken copes, lighted tapers, jewelled crucifixes would fix attention. Next would come the dramatic quality of the scene – a ceremony is always an action, and a procession is not a meaningless walk. The music we may be sure was subordinate to the 'sight' and to the 'plot', but it is not to be looked down upon on that account. On the contrary we must put resolutely aside our own ideas of the self-sufficiency of art. To the mediaeval way of thinking even music had a function, and its function on these occasions was to adorn the ceremony.<sup>175</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> Randel, Don Michael, 'The Canons in the Musicological Toolbox', *Disciplining Music: Musicology and its Canons*, eds. Katherine Bergeron and Phillip V. Bohlman (Chicago, 1992), 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> Stevens, John, ed. *Mediaeval* Carols(London, 1970), xiv

Medieval music then, needs to be treated as a functional device. We must remember it was not created as an art work, and very often has little or, in many cases, no authorial information connected with it; therefore, connecting with it on alternative levels is imperative. The fifteenth-century carol echoes this same sentiment of practical music; music with a purpose. The carol's purpose is arguably, music to be moved to. As John Stevens notes:

A narrow but at the same time a highly significant way of describing them is as 'processional' music – the earliest carols, especially, were written as 'popular litanies' for use in ecclesiastical procession, but any procession, civic or courtly, provided a suitable setting. In church and out of it the carol was associated with physical movement; when it was not danced to, it was 'processed to'.<sup>176</sup>

Practical music such as the carol therefore, cannot then be treated, or indeed fully understood, as art for art's sake. Even if we could connect with this music in this nineteenth-century manner, the assignation of authorship in music of the middle ages is too vague. Even those attributions to specific composers cannot be presumed accurate. We need to find new ways of appreciating with the music on the page, using new methodologies such as semiotics, gender study and approaching music in an ethnomusicological way; all methodologies that are utilised within this thesis. Too often these methodologies are reserved for contemporary study, but implemented correctly, could open a whole new way of understanding early music. An ethnomusicological approach in particular could help to place the music in a wider context. Too often 'Musicologists and music theorists see ethnomusicology as the study of the music they don't study; ethnomusicologists see it as the study of *all* music, in terms of its social and cultural context, embracing production, reception, and signification.'<sup>177</sup> Reinhard Strohm also echoes this call for new methods of constructing a more comprehensive study of early music when he writes:

In order to make it our own, we may have to reconstruct its history in its full depth, for example by exploiting the meta-poetry of all those extant documents and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Stevens, John, ed. *Mediaeval* Carols(London, 1970), xiv

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Cook, Nicholas, Music: A Very Short Introduction (Oxford, 1998), 99

messages that illustrate or transmit music in its cultural contexts. None of them has 'Middle Ages' or 'Renaissance' written on it.<sup>178</sup>

### Authorship in the Carols

The carol repertoire of the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries is an ideal example of the ambiguity found in attributing authorship in the Middle Ages and the need for academic study to introduce modern methodologies in order to better understand the repertoire. There are approximately 130 extant carols with music; although a large number in terms of extant material from this period, only twenty five have attributed authors, the majority of which survive from the early sixteenth century rather than the fifteenth century. Of these twenty five carols, only a total of fifteen separate names are attributed. Table 17 shows these works with their attributed authors/composers and details of the manuscripts in which they are found.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Strohm, R, 'How to Make Medieval Music Our Own: A Response to Christopher Page and Margaret Bent' *Early Music*, 22 (1994), 719

I Pray You AllSeldenc. 1450J.D.Ecce Quod NaturaSeldenc. 1450James RymanY-Blessed be that LordSeldenc. 1450ChildeNowell, nowell: DieuRitsonc. 1500SmertMan, be joyfulRitsonc. 1500SmertAve, decus seculiRitsonc. 1500SmertSoli Deo sitRitsonc. 1500SmertO clavis DavidRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeHave Mercy of meRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeJesus, fili DeiRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeJesus autem hodieRitsonc. 1500SmertJesus autem hodieRitsonc. 1500SmertJesus, fili DeiRitsonc. 1500SmertJesus, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc. 1500SmertJesu, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc. 1500Brownethis beSaryfaxc. 1500Woefully arrayedFayrfaxc. 1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc. 1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc. 1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc. 1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc. 1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc. 1500Davyeasec. 1500TurgesGoddes knightc	Carol	Manuscript	Date	Composer/ Author
Ecce Quod NaturaSeldenc.1450James RymanY-Blessed be that LordSeldenc. 1450ChildeNowell, nowell: DieuRitsonc.1500SmertMan, be joyfulRitsonc.1500SmertAve, decus seculiRitsonc.1500SmertSoli Deo sitRitsonc.1500SmertO clavis DavidRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500SmertJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500SmertJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500SmertJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500SmertJesu, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc.1500Brownethis beSheryfaxUove yeSheryfaxJesu, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knightc.1500TurgesHoyday, hoyda, JollyFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knight </th <th>l Pray You All</th> <th>Selden</th> <th>c. 1450</th> <th>J.D.</th>	l Pray You All	Selden	c. 1450	J.D.
Y-Blessed be that LordSeldenc. 1450ChildeNowell, nowell: DieuRitsonc. 1500Smertvous gardeMan, be joyfulRitsonc. 1500SmertAve, decus seculiRitsonc. 1500SmertSoli Deo sitRitsonc. 1500SmertHave Mercy of meRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeJesu, fill DeiRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeJesu, fill DeiRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeNascitur ex virgineRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeJesus autem hodieRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeJesus autem hodieRitsonc. 1500Smert & TrouluffeJesus autem hodieRitsonc. 1500SmertIlove, I love, and whomFayrfaxc. 1500SmertVoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc. 1500Brownethis beWoefully arrayedFayrfaxc. 1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc. 1500BrowneMore member thee wellMargaret MeekFayrfaxc. 1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc. 1500BrowneIoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc. 1500DavyeaseFrom stormy windesFayrfaxc. 1500TurgesEnforce yourself asFayrfaxc. 1500TurgesGoddes kn	•	Selden	c.1450	James Ryman
Nowell, nowell: DieuRitsonc.1500SmertVous garde	Y-Blessed be that Lord	Selden	c. 1450	-
vous gardeMan, be joyfulRitsonc.1500SmertAve, decus seculiRitsonc.1500SmertSoli Deo sitRitsonc.1500SmertSoli Deo sitRitsonc.1500SmertO clavis DavidRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeJesus, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500SmertJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500SmertJesus, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc.1500SmertJesu, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc.1500BrowneIove yeWoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500SherynghamWoefully arrayedFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, gentle JesuFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyease </th <th>Nowell, nowell: Dieu</th> <th>Ritson</th> <th></th> <th>Smert</th>	Nowell, nowell: Dieu	Ritson		Smert
Man, be joyfulRitsonc.1500SmertAve, decus seculiRitsonc.1500SmertSoli Deo sitRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeHave Mercy of meRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeNascitur ex virgineRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500Smert & TrouluffeBlessed mote thou beRitsonc.1500SmertI love, 1 love, and whomFayrfaxc.1500SmertJesu, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc.1500Brownethis beWoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500Davyease </th <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th>				
Ave, decus seculiRitsonc.1500SmertSoli Deo sitRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeHave Mercy of meRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeO clavis DavidRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeJesu, fill DeiRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeNascitur ex virgineRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeBlessed mote thou beRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeI love, 1 love, and whomFayrfaxc.1500Phillipslove yeSmertSmertJesu, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc.1500Brownethis beSmertWoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500Davyease </th <th>÷</th> <th>Ritson</th> <th>c.1500</th> <th>Smert</th>	÷	Ritson	c.1500	Smert
Soli Deo sitRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeHave Mercy of meRitsonc.1500SmertO clavis DavidRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeNascitur ex virgineRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeBlessed mote thou beRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeBlessed mote thou beRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeI love, I love, and whomFayrfaxc.1500SmertJesu, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc.1500Brownethis beSmort & SmortWoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyeasec.1500TurgesEnforce yourself asFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knight </th <th></th> <th>Ritson</th> <th>c.1500</th> <th>Smert</th>		Ritson	c.1500	Smert
O clavis DavidRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeJesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeNascitur ex virgineRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeBlessed mote thou beRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeBlessed mote thou beRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeI love, I love, and whomFayrfaxc.1500PhillipsJove ye </th <th>Soli Deo sit</th> <th>Ritson</th> <th>c.1500</th> <th>Smert &amp;Trouluffe</th>	Soli Deo sit	Ritson	c.1500	Smert &Trouluffe
Jesu, fili DeiRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeNascitur ex virgineRitsonc.1500SmertJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeBlessed mote thou beRitsonc.1500SmertI love, I love, and whomFayrfaxc.1500Phillipslove ye	Have Mercy of me	Ritson	c.1500	Smert
Nascitur ex virgineRitsonc.1500SmertJesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeBlessed mote thou beRitsonc.1500SmertI love, I love, and whomFayrfaxc.1500Phillipslove ye	O clavis David	Ritson	c.1500	Smert & Trouluffe
Jesus autem hodieRitsonc.1500Smert &TrouluffeBlessed mote thou beRitsonc.1500SmertI love, I love, and whomFayrfaxc.1500Phillipslove yeJesu, mercy, how mayFayrfaxc.1500Brownethis beWoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorAh, gentle JesuFayrfaxc.1500BrowneWoefully arrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyease </th <th>Jesu, fili Dei</th> <th>Ritson</th> <th>c.1500</th> <th>Smert &amp; Trouluffe</th>	Jesu, fili Dei	Ritson	c.1500	Smert & Trouluffe
Blessed mote thou be I love, I love, and whom FayrfaxRitsonc.1500SmertI love, I love, and whom FayrfaxFayrfaxc.1500Phillipslove ye	Nascitur ex virgine	Ritson	c.1500	Smert
I love, I love, and whom love yeFayrfaxc.1500PhillipsJesu, mercy, how may this beFayrfaxc.1500BrowneWoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorAh, gentle JesuFayrfaxc.1500SherynghamWoefully arrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyease </th <th>Jesus autem hodie</th> <th>Ritson</th> <th>c.1500</th> <th>Smert &amp; Trouluffe</th>	Jesus autem hodie	Ritson	c.1500	Smert & Trouluffe
love yeJesu, mercy, how may this beFayrfaxc.1500BrowneWoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorAh, gentle JesuFayrfaxc.1500SherynghamWoefully arrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyease </th <th>Blessed mote thou be</th> <th>Ritson</th> <th>c.1500</th> <th>Smert</th>	Blessed mote thou be	Ritson	c.1500	Smert
Jesu, mercy, how may this beFayrfaxc.1500BrowneWoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorAh, gentle JesuFayrfaxc.1500SherynghamWoefully arrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellKayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500DavyeaseKayrfaxc.1500DavyProm stormy windesFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorrutterkinKayrfaxc.1500TurgesFrom stormy windesFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knightKayrfaxc.1500TurgesAlone I live aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperGreen groweth theHenry VIIIc.1520CornishhollyKayr Millic.1520CornishYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cornish	I love, I love, and whom	Fayrfax	c.1500	Phillips
this beWoefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorAh, gentle JesuFayrfaxc.1500SherynghamWoefully arrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyease </th <th>love ye</th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th>	love ye			
Woefully ArrayedFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorAh, gentle JesuFayrfaxc.1500SherynghamWoefully arrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellStorneMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500DavyeaseStorneHoyday, hoyda, jollyFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorrutterkinStorneFrom stormy windesFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knightStorneAlone I live aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperGreen groweth theHenry VIIIc.1520CornishhollyStorneStorneYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper	Jesu, mercy, how may	Fayrfax	c.1500	Browne
Ah, gentle JesuFayrfaxc.1500SherynghamWoefully arrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellStormeMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500DavyeaseStormeStormeHoyday, hoyda, jollyFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorrutterkinStormeStormeFrom stormy windesFayrfaxc.1500TurgesEnforce yourself asFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knightStormeStormeAlone I live aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperGreen groweth theHenry VIIIc.1520CornishhollyStormeStormeYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CooperI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper	this be			
Woefully arrayedFayrfaxc.1500BrowneMy fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyease </th <th>Woefully Arrayed</th> <th>Fayrfax</th> <th>c.1500</th> <th>William Cornish, Junior</th>	Woefully Arrayed	Fayrfax	c.1500	William Cornish, Junior
My fearful dreamFayrfaxc.1500BanastirAh, mine heart,Fayrfaxc.1500Davyremember thee wellMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyease </th <th>Ah, gentle Jesu</th> <th>Fayrfax</th> <th>c.1500</th> <th>Sheryngham</th>	Ah, gentle Jesu	Fayrfax	c.1500	Sheryngham
Ah, mine heart, remember thee wellFayrfaxc.1500DavyMargaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill at easeFayrfaxc.1500DavyHoyday, hoyda, jollyFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorrutterkinFrom stormy windesFayrfaxc.1500TurgesFrom stormy windesFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knightIIIIAlone I live aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperGreen groweth theHenry VIIIc.1520CornishhollyIIC.1520CornishYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper	Woefully arrayed	Fayrfax	c.1500	Browne
remember thee wellFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyease	My fearful dream	Fayrfax	c.1500	Banastir
Margaret MeekFayrfaxc.1500BrowneJoan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyease	Ah, mine heart,	Fayrfax	c.1500	Davy
Joan is sick and ill atFayrfaxc.1500Davyease	remember thee well			
easeHoyday, hoyda, jollyFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorrutterkinFayrfaxc.1500TurgesFrom stormy windesFayrfaxc.1500TurgesEnforce yourself asFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knightAlone I live aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperGreen groweth theHenry VIIIc.1520Henry VIIIhollyYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper	Margaret Meek	Fayrfax	c.1500	Browne
Hoyday, hoyda, jolly rutterkinFayrfaxc.1500William Cornish, JuniorFrom stormy windes Enforce yourself as Goddes knightFayrfaxc.1500TurgesAlone I live alone Green groweth the Henry VIIIK.1520CooperGreen groweth the Henry VIIIC.1520Henry VIIIYou and I and Amyas Whiles life or breath Henry VIIIK.1520CornishWhiles life or breath Henry VIIIC.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIC.1520Cooper	Joan is sick and ill at	Fayrfax	c.1500	Davy
rutterkinFrom stormy windesFayrfaxc.1500TurgesEnforce yourself asFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knightAlone I live aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperGreen groweth theHenry VIIIc.1520Henry VIIIhollyYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper				
From stormy windesFayrfaxc.1500TurgesEnforce yourself asFayrfaxc.1500TurgesGoddes knightKanne Llive aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperAlone Llive aloneHenry VIIIc.1520Henry VIIIAlone J and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper		Fayrfax	c.1500	William Cornish, Junior
Enforce yourself as Goddes knightFayrfaxc.1500TurgesAlone I live aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperGreen groweth theHenry VIIIc.1520Henry VIIIhollyVou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper				
Goddes knightC.1520CooperAlone I live aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperGreen groweth theHenry VIIIc.1520Henry VIIIhollyYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper	•	-		
Alone I live aloneHenry VIIIc.1520CooperGreen groweth theHenry VIIIc.1520Henry VIIIhollyThenry VIIIc.1520CornishYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper		Fayrfax	c.1500	Turges
Green groweth the hollyHenry VIIIc.1520Henry VIIIYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper	-			
hollyYou and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper		•		•
You and I and AmyasHenry VIIIc.1520CornishWhiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper	-	Henry VIII	c.1520	Henry VIII
Whiles life or breathHenry VIIIc.1520CornishI have been a fosterHenry VIIIc.1520Cooper	•			
I have been a foster Henry VIII c.1520 Cooper	-	•		
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		•		
		•		•
Though some saith     Henry VIII     c.1520     Henry VIII	I nough some saith	Henry VIII		

Table 17: Named Authors of Carols<sup>179</sup>

James Ryman, a fifteenth-century poet and musician, is heralded as the most prolific of carol writers. His carols, most of which are found in GB-Cu- Ee.1.12, are an ideal example of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> It is most likely that the 'William Cornysh Junior' of the Fayrfax manuscript is the same 'William Cornysh' of the Henry VIII manuscript, despite the lack of 'Junior' used in the latter manuscript.

uncertainty of authorship in this period. This doubt concerning his authorship still exists despite an inscription found half way through the document that reads:

Explicit liber ympnorum et canticorum, quem composuit frater Iacobus Ryman ordinis Minorum ad Iaudem omnipotentis dei et sanctissime matris eius Marie omniumque sanctorum anno domini millesimo ccc.molxxxxijo<sup>180</sup>

[Here ends the ... book of songs, which were composed by James Ryman, the brother of the Order of Friars Minor, to the praise of Almighty God and of his most holy mother Mary and of all the saints, in the year of our Lord 1492]<sup>181</sup>

The inscription does not act as definitive confirmation of what is often presumed; that Ryman did in fact compose the lyrics, or indeed the music to accompany these carols.<sup>182</sup> The Latin word 'composuit' could just as easily mean 'compile' as it could 'compose'. David Jeffrey notes that:

There has been some question as to whether Ryman was the composer or merely the collector of the verse in MS. Cambridge library Ee.1.12, and it is perhaps difficult to decide this matter definitively, even by an appeal to the stylistic similarity of any of the pieces in the later portion of the book with those of the former.<sup>183</sup>

The likelihood that Ryman was indeed the author of the lyrics is certainly high, but by no means certain, particularly as this inscription occurs part way through the manuscript, and not at the end, therefore omitting to apply to thirty nine other pieces. Whether these compositions still apply to the Ryman inscription is open to debate. However, Jeffrey does write that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> Jeffrey, David L., 'James Ryman and the Fifteenth-Century Carol', in *Fifteenth-Century Studies: Recent Essays*, ed. R.F. Yeager (Hamden, CT, 1984), 303

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> Translation by Louise McInnes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> There is some musical notation within this manuscript, but most of it is faded.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> Jeffrey, David L., 'James Ryman and the Fifteenth-Century Carol', in *Fifteenth-Century Studies: Recent Essays*, ed. R.F. Yeager (Hamden, CT, 1984), 303

Zupita believed that the new hand which commenced at song number 112 [within the manuscript] and continued to the end was that of the poet himself, since it was the same hand that made corrections throughout the manuscript.<sup>184</sup>

This scribal similarity could therefore link Ryman to the remainder of the manuscript. Interestingly, however, in other writings about James Ryman and his relationship to the carols, a much clearer picture is painted. Mary Berry writes that:

towards the end of the 15th century Friar James Ryman of Canterbury composed no fewer than 119 carols and some 40 other poems, in a homely, simple style. He often used some well-worn Latin snippet, such as 'O clemens, O pia, O dulcis Maria', as a burden (Greene, 1935). Ryman also made English homespun translations of Latin hymns which were probably sung to their plainchant tunes. Either he or his scribe was familiar with the musical technique of faburden.<sup>185</sup>

Within this quote we find James Ryman confirmed, without any reference to doubt, as the composer of 119 carols. Greene also affirms this view in his description of GB-Lbl- Ee.1.12 when he writes:

Ryman is thus responsible for a quarter of all the extant English carols of a date earlier than 1550. He tried his hand at almost every device of style used in other carols and appears to have invented a few of his own. He used Latin freely, particularly in his burdens, and several times composed a series of carols in the same strain and using the same burden, either in an identical form or with slight variations ... Ryman is to be regarded as a conscientious, rather uninspired Franciscan, engaged in turning religious and profitable matter into vernacular songs in order to appeal to the people. His use of the carol-form is doubtless the result of observation of popularity of the carol at the time he was writing, and there is every reason to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Jeffrey, David L., 'James Ryman and the Fifteenth-Century Carol', in *Fifteenth-Century Studies: Recent Essays*, ed. R.F. Yeager (Hamden, CT, 1984), 304

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> Mary Berry. "Franciscan friars." In *Grove Music Online*. Oxford Music Online,

http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/10113 (accessed December 22, 2010).

believe that he meant his work to be more than a pious literary exercise – that he designed his poems to be sung by his preaching brothers and their audiences.<sup>186</sup>

This quote is interesting, not only for its strong opinion on the author of the GB-Cul- Ee.1.12 carols, but also of Greene's humanizing of Ryman. He paints a picture of an 'uninspired Franciscan', composing carols for his fellow friars and their congregations in a conscientious manner; and drawing on his knowledge of the popularity of the carol at this time. This underlying attempt to make Ryman a three-dimensional, and somewhat dull, figure and to give a narrative to his work is a good example of our need to create and understand the music through the author, no matter how sparse our evidential material may be. John Hirsh too attempts to understand Ryman the man through his lyrics, claiming that Greene's cataloguing of Ryman's carols in his 'Early English Carols' obscures the 'ways in which their themes intersect and re-imagine one another'. <sup>187</sup> Hirsh claims that the carol lyrics, when examined in small groups can help us to 'gain an insight into his orthodox and theologically considered beliefs [and] devout attitudes that are as well received in song as anywhere'.<sup>188</sup> This is true to a certain extent, as certainly Ryman's carols comment upon many aspects of Christian doctrine as well as secular subjects.<sup>189</sup> However, uncertainty still remains over whether Ryman is indeed the author of these carols; and even if we could confirm that Ryman was the author of all 119 currently attributed to him, some uncertainty would still remain as to exactly how much of the material was indeed Ryman's own. Borrowing of music and lyrics in the Middle Ages was commonplace and Ryman may well have worked in collaboration with others. Too much uncertainty exists around the shadowy artistic figures of the medieval period to take small fragments of evidence and attempt to build them into fully focused images of the men, or indeed women, behind the music and lyrics of the fifteenth century.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), clv

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Hirsh, John C., 'Christian Poetics and Orthodix Practice: Meaning and Implication in six carols by James
 Ryman, O.F.M' in Changanti, S. And Szitlya, P.R., eds., *Medieval Poetics and Special Practice* (Fordham, 2012), 56

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> Hirsh, John C., 'Christian Poetics and Orthodox Practice: Meaning and Implication in six carols by James Ryman, O.F.M' in Changanti, S. And Szitlya, P.R., eds., *Medieval Poetics and Special Practice* (Fordham, 2012), 56

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> Ryman's carols are discussed from a gender perspective in Chapter 5: 'Women in the Medieval Carols'.
### Who is the composer? Musical Borrowing Within the Carols

Borrowing within music and lyrics in the Middle Ages was commonplace, and not the issue it is in today's creative arts. Musicians and lyricists borrowed freely from one another to create their own compositions. A good example of this is seen in the suggested borrowing between the composers Browne and Turges; found within the carol, 'From Stormy Windes'. Hugh Benham, in his article *A Carol and a Cantus Firmus*,<sup>190</sup> argues that a large amount of material from Browne's *Stabat juxta Christi crucem*, was borrowed from Turges' carol and subsequently used as a cantus firmus. Benham writes:

John Browne's six-part votive antiphon Stabat juxta Christi crucem (from the Eton Choirbook, GB-WRec MS 178, opening d.1) uses as its cantus firmus the same melody as the lowest voice of Turges' carol.<sup>191</sup>

Example 1 clearly shows the striking similarity between melodies, but it does raise a number of questions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Benham, Hugh, 'Prince Arthur (1486-1502): a Carol and a Cantus Firmus', *Early Music*, XV (1987), 463-8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> Benham, Hugh, 'Prince Arthur (1486-1502): a Carol and a Cantus Firmus', Early Music, XV (1987), 463





Example 1: The antiphon 'Sabat Juxta Christi crucem', and the carol 'From stormy windes'<sup>192</sup>

If it is indeed the case that these two melodies are from the same source, there then arises the question of which source? Turges may well have borrowed the melody himself from another source, tangling the web yet further; or indeed both men could have borrowed the same melody from two separate sources. Benham also discusses this possibility, writing:

But did the melody used by Turges and Browne have an earlier, independent, existence? There is no positive evidence to support this. One possibility, however, is that it began life as a popular or folk melody that gained favour at court, even perhaps having originally had different words from those used by Turges or Browne. Another possibility is that it was extracted from some earlier polyphonic composition

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> Benham, Hugh, 'Prince Arthur (1486-1502): a Carol and a Cantus Firmus', Early Music, XV (1987), 464

... If either of these possibilities is the case, no direct link need have existed between the carol and the antiphon.<sup>193</sup>

What Benham succeeds in encapsulating in this quote, is not only the problems faced in attributing authorship within this instance, but also within the wider carol repertoire; and in music of the Middle Ages as a whole. The lines are so blurred, and the possibilities so endless, that it is almost impossible to pinpoint authorship with any accuracy.

### Authorship in the Ritson Manuscript

A problem of attribution of authorship within the carols is also evident when examining the Ritson Manuscript. As can be seen in table 17, the names 'Smert' and 'Trouluffe' are attributed to a number of carols within this manuscript. The name 'Smert' appears against six carols in isolation and four in conjunction with the name 'Trouluffe'. The extant biographical information on both these figures is sparse. It is believed that both Smert and Trouluffe were connected with Exeter Cathedral. Nicholas Orme, in his study of musicians from this Cathedral explains that:

Smert has a special claim on our attention. He is the earliest Exeter musician to have left identifiable compositions, which are preserved in the chief surviving collection of medieval west-country music: the so-called Ritson Manuscript in the British Library. These range from a Latin hymn to the Virgin, 'Ave decus seculi', to settings of carols in English, as well as other items partly or possibly from his hand.<sup>194</sup>

Although there is evidence to suggest Smert's career path, there is no information on his personal life, or personality; nothing to allow any understanding of him as a man. The same could be said of Trouluffe. The extant documentation containing his name is much sparser even than Smert. Orme notes that Trouluffe:

is the second earliest musician of the west country whose compositions survive, again in the Ritson Manuscript, but the details of his life are more than usually

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> Benham, Hugh, 'Prince Arthur (1486-1502): a Carol and a Cantus Firmus', *Early Music*, XV (1987), 463

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> N. Orme: 'The Early Musicians of Exeter Cathedral', *Music and Letters*, lix (1978), 401

shadowy. As he appears on the scene much later than Pyttes and Smert, he was evidently their junior albeit still a contemporary. Lacy provided him in 1448 with a canonry and prebend in the collegiate church of Probus, Cornwall, and at a subsequent but unknown date he acquired a second Cornish canonry and prebend at Crantock. Neither appointment obliged him to become a priest, and he is not styled as such in any of the documents in which he figures. He probably remained a clerk in minor orders throughout his life. He died in the winter of 1473-4, and he was still in possession of both his benefices at the time of his death.<sup>195</sup>

Trying to base any significant research of these ten carols on any understanding of Smert and Trouluffe as we often strive to do when researching the music of the composers of later repertory we have created would be fool hardy. The information available to us is far too scant and, for that matter, unreliable. A name next to a composition tells us very little. In the case of the joint compositions; how can we know exactly how much was the work of each man? It could be that one was responsible for lyric, the other for melody. Examining the carols by Smert and Trouluffe in this way, would be doing a disservice to the music available to us, and would only succeed in creating a less than full picture of the past.

### The Henry VIII Manuscript and the Fayrfax Manuscript

The Henry VIII and Fayrfax manuscripts, both dating from the early sixteenth century, are chronologically the latest of the musically notated manuscripts. These manuscripts herald a change in the musical style of the carols, as well as a modification of the carol structure in the Henry VIII manuscript.<sup>196</sup> The carol is seen in these manuscripts to be evolving from the strict burden/verse/burden structure of the fifteenth century; and in terms of authorship, these manuscripts include the names of composers far more frequently than the manuscripts containing carols from the previous century, which is perhaps why they are more widely known and studied than the earlier manuscripts. GB-Lbl-Additional 31922 is commonly known as 'The Henry VIII manuscript'; although there is no evidence to suggest

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> N. Orme: 'The Early Musicians of Exeter Cathedral', *Music and Letters*, lix (1978), 402

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> For more discussion of this change of musical style see Chapter 2: 'The Carol: an isolated genre?'

that Henry ever owned the manuscript at all; the inclusion of Henry's own compositions and the connection of the manuscript to the royal court having led it to be given this title. Labelling the manuscript in this way undoubtedly gives it more importance in popular consciousness than had it remained simply GB-Lbl-Additional 31922 but could be creating a false image of it provenance. John Stevens justifies his own use of the title in his musical edition of the manuscript, writing:

The songbook has been entitled for convenience Henry VIII's book. This handy label will not, it is hoped, be used to perpetuate the legend that the songbook belonged to the king himself. It is intended chiefly to acknowledge the fact that it contains many of the king's own compositions.<sup>197</sup>

Although Steven's explanation within the introduction of his edition is clear, I would argue that entitling it as blatantly as 'King Henry VIII's Manuscript' could do nothing but perpetuate such a legend.<sup>198</sup> Labelling the manuscript in such a way is essentially continuing the idea of the great composer or musical genius, giving music added value. Although it has value in helping to place the book within a particular environment in the readers' imagination, this practice still needs approaching with caution.

Of all the named carol composers within the manuscript, William Cornish Junior is the most well-known. Cornish's name is attributed to two carols: 'You and I and Amyas', and 'Whiles life or breath'.<sup>199</sup> He was a leading figure in the entertainments of the royal court, and the name ' Cornysh' or 'Cornish' is found against a large number of works that are thought to be by him; and also against another number that could possibly be attributed to him. These works range from the carols to large-scale sacred pieces. As David Greer and Fiona Kisby note:

A number of impressive sacred works are ascribed in other sources to a composer named Cornysh. In addition, there are works now lost that are attributed to someone of this name: an antiphon *Altissimi potentia* ... a *Magnificat*, a *Stabat mater* and a five-part antiphon *Ad te purissima virgo* (formerly in the Eton

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Stevens, John, ed., Music at the Court of Henry VIII(1962), xvii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> Stevens uses this exact title in: Stevens, John, ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII*(1962), xi

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> Both these carols are discussed in relation to their female content in Chapter 5: 'Women in the Late Medieval Carols'.

Choirbook, *GB-WRec* 178) and some masses listed in a 1529 inventory of King's College, Cambridge...The name 'Cornysh' was entered in small writing at the end of several works, including three masses, in the Lambeth Choirbook (*GB-Llp* 1), but the significance of this is not known.<sup>200</sup>

Both Cornysh's carols only survive with music for the burden which is written for three voices. Stevens suggests the lack of notated verses suggesting they were 'presumably sung to a known tune'.<sup>201</sup> Both pieces, reflecting in style the other carols of the manuscript, make limited use of melismatic material, except for the ends of phrases and a use a typically compact pitch range with little use of leaps within parts. Example 2 shows the surviving burden of 'You and I and Amyas' and demonstrates its limited use of melisma and pitch range.



Example 2: 'You and I and Amyas'.<sup>202</sup>

The fact that such prolific composers of the time, such as Cornysh, are composing carols alongside larger works shows the importance of the carol at this time. It was not only a simple form of music for the amusement of clerics, but could also be seen perhaps as a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>200</sup> Stevens, John. ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (1962), 33

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> Stevens, John. ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (1962), 104. The idea of carols being set to popular melodies is addressed in detail in Chapter 4: 'That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth- century carol, a music of the people?'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> Stevens, John. ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII*(1962), 33

more serious compositional genre, or one that was at least popular and respected enough to be utilised at court and composed by the king himself who can be attributed to at least two: *Green groweth the holly* and *Though some saith*.<sup>203</sup> One could suggest that composers like Cornysh adopted a more deliberately popular idiom specifically for certain musical effects, such as representing 'common people' in a play, but the use of the carol to convey the words of aristocratic voices such as that of Catherine of Aragon in 'Whilles lyue or breth is in my brest'<sup>204</sup> of the 'Lady' in 'You and I and Amyas' would dispute this. Indeed, the existence of carols in manuscripts such as these may even suggest that many other carols within the anonymous fifteenth-century manuscripts were being created for use in grander performance settings than previously thought.

### THE 'J.D.' CAROL

There are no carols directly attributed to the prolific fifteenth-century composer John Dunstaple.<sup>205</sup> However, there is one carol that exists with words and musical notation in the manuscript GB-Ob-Selden b.26 with the initials 'J.D.' placed beside the text; this manuscript folio can be seen in Example 3.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> Pieces ascribed to King Henry VIII within this manuscript (20 songs and 13 instrumental pieces) are labelled (contemporary to the music itself) with the heading 'The Kynge H viij'. Some are believed to be original compositions by the King, but others are arrangements of previously existing melodies.
 <sup>204</sup> Stevens, John. ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII*(1962), 40

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> Also sometimes written as John 'Dunstable'. Margaret Bent asserts that there are far more instances of his name with a 'p' than a 'b'. Bent, Margaret. "Dunstaple, John." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online.* Oxford University Press, accessed March 14, 2013,

http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/08331



Example 3: GB-Ob-Selden b26, folio 5, 'I pray you alle'

The insertion of these initials has led to speculation that John Dunstaple could be the composer of 'I Pray you alle'. The popularity of the carol form would suggest that it would be unlikely that a composer such as Dunstaple did not write some carols, although whether any of his survive within extant manuscripts is unproven. Margaret Bent writes that:

The great bulk of the English carol repertory is anonymous, but it is highly probable, on statistical and stylistic grounds, that Dunstaple wrote some. (Note, for example, the carol-like phrase structure of the Gloria settings, nos.4 and 7.)<sup>206</sup>

There is one other work within this manuscript that is attributed to Dunstaple; the motet 'Beata mater et innupta', which is found on folio 6v, very close to the carol, which could perhaps indicate a collection of his music in one section of the manuscript. There is no certainty that Dunstaple was in fact the composer of this carol despite his use of a carol like structure in his Gloria settings; the carol form was so popular, Dunstaple would surely have been aware of it and be able to have made use of the carol structure in his other compositions without having had to write any himself. As musicologists however, our tendency is, naturally, to want to attach music to the composers we know of in order to better understand both the music and the man behind it.

This carol was evidently a popular one, as concordances are found with words and music in Egerton and with words in Ritson. All three share the same words, but the musical settings differ, which raises issues of authorship too. If Dunstaple wrote both the words and music, was the musical setting without his initials by another composer, or was he responsible for both settings? It would seem more likely that the second musical setting was by a later composer due to the later provenance of Ritson, and particularly as the music of the later manuscript is more evolved in terms of the carol form. It embraces the evolution of the carol genre by setting a double burden and making greater use of melisma at the ends of sections, as well as setting the second burden for three voices; the earlier setting being for two voices throughout.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> Margaret Bent. "Dunstaple, John." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed March 14, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/08331.



Example 4: 'I pray you alle' from the Egerton manuscript.<sup>207</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 53





Example 5: 'I pray you alle' from the Ritson manuscript.<sup>208</sup>

The text is entirely in the vernacular. This carol would be only one of five secular pieces attributed to Dunstaple, and the only vernacular piece in the entire repertoire; it would therefore be unique in his surviving output.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 88-89

### Other Named Carol Composers

The same story is true of most other carol composers of this era. Of them all, the least is known of Childe, whose name is only found above one carol in the Selden manuscript, and no other pieces of music. There has been a suggestion that he 'may have been the William Child who was assistant master at Eton from 1446 to 1449',<sup>209</sup> but there is nothing to confirm this as fact. Even John Browne, the producer of three carols in the Fayrfax manuscript, along with numerous other compositions within the Eton Choirbook, has little extant information remaining to tell us of his life. Perhaps the carol composer we know the most about is William Cornysh. A significant amount of factual information survives as to his career and his attendance at important historical events such as the coronation of Henry VIII. It is documented that he became Master of the Royal Children, and subsequently an important figure in the life of the court. Despite however, having this wealth of factual information, very little of it can tell us of him as a man; so to create sub-narratives within his music from this information would be difficult at the least.

### Conclusion

In conclusion, it would seem that we must not confuse our treatment of early music with that of later musics. Medieval music must be treated as a separate entity to later repertory. With few exceptions, our knowledge and understanding of the composers of medieval music and in particular, the medieval carols, is not a sufficient foundation for research when exploring this music. Authorial questions are by no means irrelevant, but they only allow us to view one part of the story. The fact that of the approximately 130 extant carols with music, only 25 remain with any suggestion of authorship, should lead us away from scrutinizing the music from a composer-centred research perspective. Although a valuable

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> David Greer. "Childe." In *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*,

http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/05584 (accessed January 9, 2011).

aspect of musicological research, it must be seen as an additional facet, not a primary one. Relying on purely empirical research methods dealing only with purely factual evidence, would result in the production of dry results lacking insight. However, putting the carols and their composers into a wider social and historical context by combining more traditional methods of research with modern methodologies such as semiotics and gender study, and approaching them in an ethnomusicological manner, should create a much more complete and accurate image of the music and its place in society; while still avoiding the temptation of creating false narratives and romanticised images of the past. The remainder of this thesis will attempt to view the carol genre in this way.

## Chapter 4

# 'That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenthcentury carol, a music of the people?

Carols provide an insight not only into the medieval celebration of the Christmas period, but into further aspects of medieval life both within and outside ecclesiastical practice. Described in recent scholarship as not being 'music of the people',<sup>210</sup> there is however a great deal of evidence that could attest to the contrary. Through the exploration of carols and their manuscripts this chapter argues that this musical form was indeed music of the people or at the very least, music for the people.<sup>211</sup> Evidence exists of its use within the popular Corpus Christi plays, Christmas festivities and important public pageants, not to mention the appearance of many carols in informal pocket-book style manuscripts suitable for personal rather than professional use; all of which will be further explored within this chapter.

### Lost Melodies and the Oral Tradition

Musicologists should use the phrase, 'music of the people' with caution. This is a broad and all-encompassing phrase that can easily be manipulated and misconstrued. The phrase is generally synonymous with describing the music of the illiterate classes; albeit a rather sweeping generalisation. Greene has described the carol as a form that was 'popular by destination; rather than origin', noting that 'it is applied to material the text of which is derived from written or printed sources, but which is designed to appeal to an audience including people of scant formal education and social refinement'.<sup>212</sup> I would take this a step further, and argue that there was an oral tradition of carol singing by people of 'scant formal

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>210</sup> See: Fenlon, Iain ed., *Cambridge Music Manuscripts 900-1700* (Cambridge, 1982) and more recently,
 Lefferts, P. 'England' in, Everist, Mark, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Music* (Cambridge 2001),
 113.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> A definition of 'the people' will be explained later within this chapter.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), xciii

education and social refinement' that co-existed with the more refined art music form of the remaining manuscript carol evidence available to us today. The fact the over 500 carol texts survive, yet only approximately 130 with music, and that the majority of the musically notated sources contain mainly sacred carols, suggests a hugely popular form, that must also have had an equally large amount of lost or orally transmitted material that was never committed to writing.

We must remember when researching pre-classical music, that a vast amount of music is no longer extant, and often the job of the musicologist is to try to piece together the surviving fragments in order to give an idea of what the lost whole may have looked like:

Some scholars estimate that between 80 and 90 percent of medieval manuscripts are no longer extant... Studying earlier repertories is like trying to do a jigsaw with half of the pieces missing. Hence scholars and performers alike must take an informed yet creative approach: we must imagine what the past was like because we can never know it exactly.<sup>213</sup>

The reason why so much of this music does not survive is argued by Elizabeth Aubrey, who writes in her article discussing the 'High Style' and 'Low Style' in medieval song that:

All of the evidence we have is written down – texts that were deemed worthy of preservation by educated individuals. We have every reason to believe that numerous songs were never written, songs that existed in an idiom for which writing was considered unnecessary. This surely includes dances, simple refrains, working songs, lullabies, and other musical expressions that spiced the daily lives not just of peasants, but of members of every stratum in society. Such songs can be considered 'popular' in that they were 'of the people', but all of the people, not only those in the lower classes.<sup>214</sup>

In relation to the carols, it is tempting to see such a number of extant pieces and assume a fuller picture than is actually projected. We must also remember that these Late Medieval

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> Rose, Stephen, 'Early Music', in Harper-Scott, J.P.E and Samson, Jim, eds., *An Introduction to Music Studies* (Cambridge, 2009),122

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> Aubrey, Elizabeth, 'Reconsidering "High Style" and "Low Style" in Medieval Song, *Journal of Music Theory*,
 52/1 (Spring, 2008), 118

carols are collected from manuscripts that span a time period of approximately 150 years. If this large body of carol material survives, then we must ask ourselves how much more has been lost? This simple question puts a new perspective on the research; the missing repertoire becomes an important figuration in our understanding of the genre. Certainly there is less surviving secular musical material, and indeed secular carols, than there is sacred music, but it must be remembered that much of this sacred material survives only because it was notated by learned monks or clerics. Rose notes that:

Much secular music from before the fifteenth century is lost. One reason for this is that outside the Church, musicians did not necessarily have the education to notate their repertory, and they did not share the Church's enthusiasm for writing as a way to ensure liturgical uniformity. Virtually no instrumental music survives in written form from the Middle Ages, with the exception of a few dance tunes in manuscripts, but there is plenty of evidence in illustrations, sculptures, letters and poems that instrumental music was an important source of entertainment during banquets and festivals, in taverns and on the streets.<sup>215</sup>

There are however, possible clues in the carol repertory that may lead us to discover elements of these lost secular melodies. One of these clues could perhaps be found in the melodies of the monophonic carols.

### Monophonic Carols

Some scholars have speculated that perhaps the extant monophonic carols, surviving in six manuscripts, may provide an insight into a lost popular carol tradition; a tradition that that survived elsewhere through oral transmission.<sup>216</sup> John Stevens writes:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> Rose, Stephen, 'Early Music', in Harper-Scott, J.P.E and Samson, Jim, eds., *An Introduction to Music Studies* (Cambridge, 2009),127

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>216</sup> See: Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music* 35 (2007), 23-38 and Stevens, ed. *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970)

In contrast to these 'professional' sources are the six manuscripts containing monophonic carols... it is likely that these carols are the written residue of a vast body of popular tunes now lost.<sup>217</sup>

These monophonic survivors, seen in Table 18, offer up a number of traits that could offer clues to their origins.

Carol	Manuscript	Folio/Page
Lullay, Lullay: As I lay	GB-Lbl- Additional 5943	f. 169
Lullay, my child	GB-Lbl- Additional 5666	ff. 2-3
I have loved	GB-Lbl- Additional 5666	f. 3v
Nowell, nowell: Tidings true	GB-Ob- Eng. Poet.e.1	f. 41v
Of all the enemies	GB-Ob- Eng. Poet.e.1	f. 50v
Salve, Sancta parens	GB-Gu, Hunterian 83	f. 21
Nova, nova	GB-Gu, Hunterian 83	f. 2v
Though I sing: <i>le bon I. don</i>	GB-Gcg, MS 383/603	p. 210
Of thy Mercy	GB-Cul Ee.1.12	f. 46v
		218

Table 18: Extant Monophonic Carols <sup>218</sup>

Four show a considerable plainchant quality in their melodies, which is not surprising considering the continuing importance of the plainchant tradition throughout the fifteenth century. As Peter Jeffery notes:

In medieval culture... one is dealing not only with the differences between the clergy and the laity, but with several social strata along a continuum from King to noble to peasant, which strata persisted in both the clerical and lay segments of society. In both clerical and lay music there was some sort of continuity perceived between what we would call the 'folk songs' and the 'art' music – but it was in Grocheio's view it was at Gregorian chant that all these categories intersected.'<sup>219</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Stevens, ed. *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970)xiv

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> Compiled from: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970). This table is duplicated in Chapter 1, page 50. It is re-included here due to its importance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> Jeffery, Peter, *Re-Envisioning Past Musical Cultures: Ethnomusicology in the study of Gregorian Chant* (Chicago, 1995), 85. *Grocheio*, a French music theorist, was writing in the 14<sup>th</sup> century. He penned the treatise *Ars Musicae*. He divided music into three distinct categories: Musica simplex (popular music of the layperson), Composita (music of the educated) and Ecclesiastica (music of the Church). Distinguishing between music on a

One of the most interesting carols that display this plainchant movement is 'Salve, sancta parens' which is found in the manuscript GB-Gu-Hunterian 83;<sup>220</sup> a manuscript from the latter part of the fifteenth century which contains a mixture of material such as lists of fifteenth-century monarchs, Brut chronicles, and a translation of Higden's *Polychronicon* as translated by John of Trevisa.<sup>221</sup> The text of this carol reads:

Salve, sancta parens.

All hail, Mary, and well thou be,

Maiden and mother withouten offence

For thy sovereign virginity.

Salve, sancta parens.

O courteous Queen most commendable

O prince peerless in patience,

O virgin victorious unvariable,

Salve, sancta parens

O consolatrix of contribulate,

O sovereign well of sapience,

O maiden and mother immaculate,

class level was not unique to Grocheio; in Scotland for example, the music of the church was better known as 'Music Fyne'. This style of Scottish music is addressed in: Ross, D. James, *Music Fyne: Robert Carver and the Art of Music in Sixteenth- Century Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1993). For more information on Grocheio, see: Constant J. Mews, John N. Crossley and Catherine Jeffreys, eds., *Ars Musice: Johannes De Grocheio* (Michigan, 2011) <sup>220</sup> For more detail see, Robbins, R.H. 'Two New Carols', *Modern Language Notes*, 58/1 (Jan., 1943), 39-42 <sup>221</sup> A chronicle written by Ranulf Higden in the fourteenth century which documents a range of general history split into seven books. John of Trevisa translated the work in 1387, which was subsequently printed in 1482, attesting to its longevity. It is therefore is not unexpected to find it in a manuscript of the period of GB-Gu Hunterian 83.

Salve, sancta parens. O precious pearl imperpeternal, O saviour of sadness set in sentence, O empress both of heaven and hell, Salve, sancta parens.

O well of grace celestial, Bring us, Lady, to your presence, Keep us well that we not fall, Salve, sancta parens.<sup>222</sup>

This carol is unique in its combination of both plainchant and mensural notation. The burden is notated in plainchant style (black void, unmeasured notation), in contrast to the black, full measured notation of the verse, and is clearly seen in Example 1. 'Salve sancta parens' is notated on the second half of the folio and is laid out textually, in an expected format; a format that is seen throughout most of the carol manuscripts.<sup>223</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 111

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>223</sup> In many manuscripts, carols are found with either the first line of the verse placed to the right of the main text, or the burden. In dense textual manuscripts such as GB- Lbl Sloane 2593 it makes the carols easily distinguishable from the other poetic forms.

diffetin Hoet betted to Hort fo cut and stre ffoo sant den tio de to A take att paffe and a H AG z no ad to By tellity a tale at the alo ce felino. att make it well. Chate Byters 60 tos e. A tala Juble than many for they be dode fi co Bo Wac AF Savert Arial And land bir the molde Mores Rang ogle tale gie low pop mon of later po Of & gonati and off notes to roby and in andelege I sant of Bratt Swort as of formed in andelege delete 6 heyle Mary. And west it AR maden & moder of onton 31 fished prese Salar the onfiren Salue ned faucta places nt Sup & fight . a O ourtaffe grobern mote concendable. D paone perele mypetiatt D raffie off on the off at m fantenos tes m' pereles m plaente portoune on bamable 147 D poparioe both off habon and helt Salue fancta provene Salue Canetel poderes folating of conton filte of onpiene in wett Q hoff off 970 mayden & mot mmaculato Brong BAL line onwerd provene TORA FR Hote fatt

Example 1: GB-Gu Hunterian 83, Folio 12r. Showing the carol 'Salve sancta parens' notated on the bottom half of the manuscript.<sup>224</sup>

The use of these contrasting notational styles could point to an indication of performance, perhaps suggesting solo voice for the plainchant and chorus for the verse, or could merely

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 224}$  Available online at http://special.lib.gla.ac.uk/teach/manuscripts/history.html

be to emphasise the integration of liturgical practise as the chant 'Salve, sancta parens' is set in the Sarum use for the vigil of the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin.<sup>225</sup>

Above the carol on folio 12r is the song 'Nowe well and now woo', which Robbins describes as a 'popular tail-rimed poem'.<sup>226</sup> Interestingly the textual layout of the song in the manuscript is very similar to the layout of the carol form as found often in other carol manuscripts of the fifteenth century, suggesting it was perhaps treated as a parallel song style.<sup>227</sup>

The carol 'Nova, nova', one of the most interesting of the monophonic carols from a popular song perspective, is found much earlier in the manuscript, but is written in the same hand as the other two musical offerings. 'Nova, nova' (which translates as 'News, news: AVE came from EVA', a popular theme in the middle ages which celebrates how Mary had atoned for Eve's sins) however, conveys a very different melodic style; a 'folk' or 'dance' style melody. It employs triple mensuration as opposed to the duple mensuration of 'Salve, sancta parens', and a consistent dotted rhythm throughout the melodic line. It also makes no use of plainchant style or notation. Interestingly, the text of this carol can be found in two other manuscripts: GB-Obac 354 and GB-Ob-Eng. Poet.e.1 (described by Robbins as GB-Obac 29734). Robbins writes that this version of the text 'agrees very closely with the Balliol... The slips in the Hunterian text point to its having been written from memory or from oral transmission.'<sup>228</sup> The Hunterian manuscript dates from 1483 at the earliest, with GB-Ob-Eng. Poet.e.1 dating from 1460-1468, so transmission of this song has occurred within a similar time frame in each manuscript. Manuscript GB-Obac 354 however (also known as 'Richard Hill's book'), dates from the first third of the sixteenth century, so slightly later than the other two manuscripts, yet demonstrates the continued popularity of this carol. Example 3 shows a transcription of 'Nova, nova', in which we can see its effective rhythmic and melodic composition, and its artful use of the initial burden material in diminution at the end of the verse. 'Nova, nova' may well demonstrate echoes of a popular song tradition, in

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> Similar perhaps to a thirteenth-century motet that uses liturgical chant as tenor under a vernacular lyric.
 <sup>226</sup> Robbins, R.H. 'Two New Carols', *Modern Language Notes*, 58/1 (Jan., 1943), 39

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> In GB-Lbl Sloane 2593 the carols are easily distinguishable from the other lyric forms as the burden is written out on the first line, followed by the first line of the stanza with a paragraph mark to the left. The lines of the stanza are joined together on the right by a square bracket, with the final line of the stanza placed in the middle to the right, outside of the bracket.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> Robbins, R.H. 'Two New Carols', *Modern Language Notes*, 58/1 (Jan., 1943), 40

that it may be an artful recomposition of a popular original rather than represent a direct copy. It certainly seems the most likely monophonic surviving carol to show such a strong traditional song element.



Example 3: 'Nova, nova'229

The fact that both these monophonic carols, 'Salve, sancta parens' and 'Nova, nova', in their different styles, have been inserted into this eclectic manuscript that contains no other music, illustrates the lack of separation and segregation between musical style and content that is often found in manuscripts of the Middle Ages. Our need as researchers to place music into neat categories of style and social class is neither appropriate, nor possible when approaching pre-classical music, and certainly in the case of this diverse manuscript; it is impossible to say with confidence the reason for their inclusion.

Of course, monophonic carols do not exist only in manuscripts with other monophonic carols, indeed we find the lilting lullaby carol, 'Lullay, lullay: As I lay' interspersed among seventeen polyphonic songs in a monastic manuscript from the early fifteenth century, GB-Lbl Additional 5943, and both 'Lullay, my child' and 'I have loved' are found in the early fifteenth-century manuscript GB-Lbl Additional 5666 which contains in total: three English carols (two of which are our monophonic examples), one Latin polyphonic carol (the lullaby carol 'Lullay: I saw') alongside an English secular piece, 'I saw a swete sely', a selection of notes and drawings, a Latin grammatical treatise and the accounts of a John White. The monophonic carols are not collected together, as we often find in the case of the polyphonic carols; in large gatherings as in manuscripts such as Egerton with its 32 carols together in one section, or the Ritson Manuscript, with its 44 Latin and English carols, or indeed the earliest source of the polyphonic carol genre, the Trinity Roll with its selection of thirteen polyphonic carols (including the famous 'Agincourt carol'). These manuscripts were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> Stevens, J. ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 111

gathering together a 'high class' carol genre, for an educated class of people. However, the monophonic carols, found randomly scattered amongst other music, prose, accounts etc. suggest random, popular carol melodies perhaps heard and transmitted orally, and notated arbitrarily, by those with the ability to do so. Indeed, 'Nowell, nowell: Tidings true', a seven stanza monophonic carol telling the story of the immaculate conception, is found within the mainly non-notated manuscript GB-Ob Eng. Poet.e.1, and followed a few folios later by the two line burden of the carol 'Of all the enemies'. 'Nowell, nowell: Tidings true' can be seen in Example 4.

LITERS PRESERVICES FROM STORES AND STATE STORES AND STORES AND STATES d Falle 2 mat no 2 good als OB

Example 4: GB-Obl Eng. Poet.e.1, f. 41v which depicts the carol 'Nowell, nowell: Tidings true'.<sup>230</sup>

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 230}$  Image taken with permission of the Bodleian Library, Oxford.

John Stevens does suggest caution in placing too much expectation upon these monophonic manuscripts however, suggesting that:

The popular character of these miscellanies should certainly not be exaggerated; of the six manuscripts at least two were in monastic hands, and all of them contained learned matter in Latin. Nevertheless it is likely that these carols are the written residue of a vast body of popular tunes now lost.<sup>231</sup>

Indeed, two manuscripts were in monastic hands, but we must also note that four were not. One must also remember that monks were not born monks; they too were once the laity, and experienced secular song and popular singing traditions. The appearance of a popular melody in a monastic book is therefore not hard to imagine. We only have to look further back into the fourteenth century to see the Franciscans setting sacred texts to popular secular melodies, not unlike the carol form as we have come to know it, in the 'Red Book of Ossory'. Richard de Ledrede, a Franciscan Bishop of Kilkenny in Ireland, wrote a total of sixty Latin texts in this manuscript. A Latin inscription in the manuscript reads:

Be advised, reader, that the Bishop of Ossory has made these songs for the vicars of the cathedral church, for the priests, and for the clerks, to be sung on the important holidays and at celebrations in order that their throats and mouths, consecrated to God, may not be polluted by songs which are lewd, secular, and associated with revelry, and, since they are trained singers, let them provide themselves with suitable tunes according to what these sets of words require.<sup>232</sup>

Many monastic orders were mendicant, including the Franciscans, and encouraged community involvement, and travelling to the people in order to preach.<sup>233</sup> Peter Jeffery writes that:

There are references to music in medieval sermons, at least from the time of the mendicant orders (the thirteenth century and later), whose wandering friars incorporated popular singing and dancing into their preaching. In England some of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>231</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), xiv

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> Greene, R.L. ed., *The Lyrics of the Red Book of Ossory*, Medium Aevum Monographs, 5 (Oxford, 1974), iii-iv
 <sup>233</sup> One must be aware that there was in fact a distinction between mendicant friars and possessioner monks and canons. Possessioners were owners of property; mendicants were not.

these songs seemed to have been related to the repertory of Christmas carols, which often mixed passages in Latin and the vernacular...<sup>234</sup>

Even a number of monastic possessioner houses provided sermons to lay audiences within their walls, and as James Clark notes, the divide between monk and laity had all but disappeared by the fifteenth century. He writes:

The barrier between the cloister and society had become almost entirely permeable. Not only were there plenty of laity residing in houses and coming and going; but equally, the monks were often out, sometimes taking their leisure, but also for quite legitimate administrative purposes, running the monastic economy.<sup>235</sup>

The perception of the monk hidden behind cloistered walls, sheltered from the outside community and therefore untouched by popular songs and traditions was, it would seem, fading considerably by this period.

None of the monophonic carols, in fact, show any particularly demanding traits in terms of vocal range or rhythmic complexity. In comparison to the vast majority of the polyphonic carols, which regularly exceed an octave, the monophonic carols are particularly conservative. This makes them easy to sing (or play), which could suggest they were written by, or indeed for, musicians unfamiliar with notation, who would perhaps have favoured a simpler style of melody in order to aid the memorization and oral transmission of the songs. Table 19 below shows the ranges of all ten.

Manuscript	Carol	No. In MB <sup>236</sup>	Vocal Range	
Gb-Lbl Add. 5943	Lullay, lullay:As I lay	1A	c – bb	(7 <sup>th</sup> )
GB-Lbl Add. 5666	Lullay, my child	2A	d-b	(6 <sup>th</sup> )
GB-Lbl Add 5666	I have loved	3A	c-d'	(9 <sup>th</sup> )
GB-Obl Eng. Poet.e.1	Nowell, nowell: Tidings	4A	d-d'	(8ve)
	true			

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>234</sup> Jeffery, Peter, *Re-envisioning Past Musical Cultures: Ethnomusicology in the Study of Gregorian Chant* (Chicago, 1992), 74

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>235</sup> Clark, James, G., *The Religious Orders in Pre-Reformation England* (Woodbridge, 2002), 186

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970)

GB-Gu Hunterian 83	Nova, nova	5A	g-f'	(7 <sup>th</sup> )
GB-Gu Hunterian 83	Salve, sancta parens	6A	c-c'	(8ve)
GB-Cul Ee.1.12	Sing we now	7A	f-d'	(6 <sup>th</sup> )
GB-Cul Ee.1.12	Of thy mercy	8A	g-d'	(5 <sup>th</sup> )
GB-Cgc 383	Though I sing	9A	g-d'	(5 <sup>th</sup> )
GB-Obl Eng. Poet.e.1	Of all the enemies	10A	a-f'	(6 <sup>th</sup> )

The carol 'Of thy mercy' is one of two monophonic carols with the smallest voice range, encompassing only a fifth. It is found within the manuscript GB-Cul Ee.1.12, with a second monophonic carol, 'Sing we now', which also has a small voice range, that of a sixth. This manuscript contains a total of 121 carols, inclusive of the two monophonic carols listed here.<sup>237</sup> The carols, English songs and hymns of this manuscript, which hail from the latter part of the fifteenth century, are thought to have been written, or at least recorded, by the Franciscan James Ryman. Apart from a small section of musical notation without words, it would seem that these two carols are the only musically notated pieces in the manuscript. The carol 'Of thy mercy' (a six stanza carol) and 'Sing we now'<sup>238</sup>(a four stanza carol) both only survive with musical notation for their burden, which may suggest that the verses were set to popular melodies with a lesser well known burden added, or even perhaps that the burden acted as an aide memoire to help the singer remember which verse tune went with it. Their simple, stepwise melodies survive without mensuration, which could again suggest that this was a popular melody which had merely needed its pitches to be notated in order to be sufficient enough to jog the memory of the reader/singer, particularly as the melodies of both these pieces are so similar, the singer may have needed reminding which piece was which. Example 5 illustrates the simple melody of 'Sing we now', and Example 6 shows 'Of thy mercy'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> The Ryman carols are discussed in more detail in Chapter 3: 'The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> 'Sing we now' has a concordance in three other manuscripts: GB-Obc 354, GB-Ob Eng.poet.e.1 and GB-Ctc
0.3.58. However, only the GB-Cul Ee.1.12 manuscript contains musical notation for this carol.



Example 6: 'Of thy mercy'<sup>240</sup>

Both carols are macaronic, with the second line of each burden in Latin, as well as the refrain line of each stanza, and the remainder of the text in English.

It is not only in the short musical jottings of GB-Cul Ee.1.12 that we see carols recorded with only their burdens notated. This is also particularly evident in the Henry VIII manuscript.<sup>241</sup> It would seem that musically notating only the burden in this manuscript, possibly for use at the royal court could also have been due to the use of well-known melodies; the burden therefore only served as a reminder to the user. This practice then sees a monastic manuscript, GB-Cul Ee.1.12, and the Henry VIII courtly manuscript echo a similar recording technique for carols that perhaps indicates the prolific use of popular melodies in different strata of society, or even perhaps the use of similar melodic formulae.<sup>242</sup>

### The Agincourt Carol

Despite extant manuscript evidence of the medieval carol being composed in monasteries or colleges, there is also evidence of these polyphonic carols being performed to a wider class of audience than these exclusive environments; many extant carols may well have originated there, but they didn't necessarily remain there. One of the earliest extant polyphonic carols 'Deo Gracias Anglia' is testament to that. This carol, found in two manuscript sources from the first half of the fifteenth century (and with only minor

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>239</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 111

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>240</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 111

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> This manuscript and its notated burdens are discussed further in Chapter 3: The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?. The burdens in this manuscript are polyphonic, not monophonic.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup> It could be that as with rather later Italian poetry set to music, that there were 'standard' melodies that suited a particular poetic form, often based on common chordal sequences.

discrepancies between the two manuscripts), is a political carol.<sup>243</sup> It celebrates the victory of Henry V at the battle of Agincourt in 1415, recounting the events of the battle in some detail over five stanzas in three voice parts, with a rousing almost completely monophonic burden.<sup>244</sup> A performance of this striking and unique piece of polyphonic song could well have taken place at the pageant in the city of London in celebration of Henry V's return from France, and his historic victory at the battle of Agincourt, as has been argued by Helen Deeming.<sup>245</sup> If this hypothesis is indeed accurate, those on the streets of the capital that day could not have failed to have been impressed with its patriotic text and the call to sing together 'Deo Gracias Anglia redde pro victoria!' (England, give thanks to God for victory!). Helen Deeming argues that even if this particular carol was not in fact performed at this pageant:

Certain aspects of the accounts are actively consistent with the singing of carols...Two sources mention the singing of "Nowell": while not actually used in Deo Gracias Anglia itself, the word is the mainstay of the carol literature in general.<sup>246</sup>

The almost entirely monophonic burden of this carol is an intriguing addition. The choice of monophony for this could be for a number of reasons. The end of the final stanza declares 'That we with merth mowe savely sing', which could indicate a call to an audience to participate in the singing of the burden, which would have been simpler for an untrained audience to do if a simple monophonic line. Past theories claimed the 'Agincourt carol' was sung on the battle field by the victorious English army, but as Deeming notes, 'The sophistication of both poetry and musical setting are too great to have been the spontaneous invention of the rejoicing troops.'<sup>247</sup> However, the simple monophonic burden could perhaps have been a remnant of a song or cry from the victorious army, which has then been embellished and set polyphonically; this burden in its original layout in the fifteenth- century manuscript GB-Ob Selden b.26 can be seen in Example 7, and a modern

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 243}$  GB-Ctc 0.3.58, no.7 and GB-Ob Arch. Selden b. 26 , folio 17v

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> Henry V was a popular choice for political carol texts. The majority of political carols in the first half of the fifteenth century deal with this subject. For more discussion of these carols see Chapter 6: 'The Medieval Carol: a vehicle for political commentary and English nationalism'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup> Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music* 35 (2007), 23-38

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>246</sup> Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music* 35 (2007), 30

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>247</sup> Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music* 35 (2007), 26

transcription of the burden in Example 8. Deeming puts forward the very tangible possibility of their having been 'an earlier, monophonic version ...performed at the London pageant and subsequently incorporated into a three voice setting'.<sup>248</sup> Although she dismisses the possibility of any battlefield connection, a link of some kind is by no means entirely impossible; musicians were very much a part of Henry V's entourage.

Andrias ATACIAN AADAM O Des grands anglia 10880 wittena

Example 7: The 'Agincourt Carol' in GB-Ob Selden b.26, ff. 17v-18r<sup>249</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music* 35 (2007),30

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>249</sup> This image is available at: http://www.luminarium.org/medlit/medlyric/agincourt.php



Example 8: 'Deo Gracias' otherwise known as the 'Agincourt Carol'<sup>250</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 6

### Drama and the Carol

The drama and narrative found in the Agincourt carol, is something that is often seen in fifteenth- century carols. Many carols are almost plays in themselves with a number of speaking characters and an engaging storyline. If we return to the text of 'Nova, nova' we can see an excellent example of this; this carol seems to be a miniature liturgical drama all of its own. It has three characters: Mary, Narrator and Angel, all of whom speak. It reads:

Nova, Nova: AVE fit ex EVA Gabriel of high degree, He came down from Trinity, From Nazareth to Galilee: Nova, nova

Nova, Nova: AVE fit ex EVA I met a maiden in a place; I kneeled down afore her face And said: Hail, Mary, full of grace; Nova, nova

Nova, Nova: AVE fit ex EVA Then said the angel; dread not thou, For ye be conceived with great virtue Whose name shall be called Jesu; Nova, nova

Nova, Nova: AVE fit ex EVA Then said the maiden: Verily, I am your servant right truly; Ecce, ancilla Domini;<sup>251</sup> Nova, nova<sup>252</sup>

This form of narrative is seen in many carols of the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, with the result that many carols could be argued to have had their roots in drama, and been intended for plays and maskings; particularly in the Corpus Christi play cycles which were performed in 'prosperous urban centres, such as Coventry and York, from the late fourteenth century onwards'.<sup>253</sup> Margaret Smaill argues that:

A few carols and variants have long been associated with plays... but the extent of the connection has been underestimated. This oversight resulted from a combination of factors: playbooks with incomplete or ambiguous music directions; the ubiquity of many of the subjects treated in both plays and carols, which hinders efforts to establish robust connections; and the fact that musicians, especially those hired from cathedrals and churches, may well have supplied their own music.<sup>254</sup>

If Smaill is correct, and the carols were a part of this dramatic event (and I see no reason why such a popular lyrical and musical style would not have been), then the music would have been shared by the performers with hundreds of people in one day; people of all class distinctions. Certainly, we know that two songs in the Coventry cycles were carols: 'Lully, lulla', and 'As I out rode.' These three part carols were added in 1591 to a manuscript that dates from almost 60 years previously. What is most interesting in this sharing of music, is Smaill's hypothesis that musicians may well have inserted their own music into the Corpus Christi proceedings, for example, their polyphonic sacred songs and carols which are extant in some of the manuscripts and available to us today, thus enabling a sharing of musical ideas between different classes of musicians. JoAnna Dukta notes that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>251</sup> This translates as 'Behold, the handmaid of the Lord'. Translation from : Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 141

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>252</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 111

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> Smaill, Adele Margaret, *Medieval Carols: Origins, Forms, and Performance Contexts* (Michigan, 2003), 325

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>254</sup> Smaill, Adele Margaret, *Medieval Carols: Origins, Forms, and Performance Contexts* (Michigan, 2003), 325

The external evidence of account books and other documents recording the expenses incurred by the play producing craft guilds demonstrates clearly... that far more music was used in the plays than the texts actually indicate. This body of information reveals payments for songs, musicians, and instruments not mentioned in the texts. In Chester, four choirboys are hired for songs not given in the manuscripts... the 'whistles' provided for them suggest that simple tunes played by the children would have been still more music in the pageant... boy choristers, conducts, and minstrels are hired...The Precentor of the Cathedral is paid for songs... and the Cathedral organist performs on the regals at least once.'<sup>255</sup>

This use of varying classes of musicians, from the minstrel to the Cathedral organist, to the young boys playing whistles, must surely demonstrate the coming together of not only different musicians, but also a sharing of their musical styles. If indeed, carols were being used for such dramatic function in the fifteenth century as in the sixteenth century, and there is no reason to suppose otherwise, their melodies and themes would have been played and shared amongst all classes of musician and listener. A good example of a high status manuscript, with carols that would seem well designed for dramatic performance, is the Henry VIII manuscript.<sup>256</sup> The purpose of the manuscript is unclear, but there can be no doubt that some of its contents were perfect for dramatic performance. Carols such as 'Hey trolly lolly lo!' and 'Hey nonny nonny' both have a narrative between two speakers throughout that could lend itself to dramatic performance. 'Hey trolly lolly lo?' is a particularly long narrative between a young milk maid who is trying to reject the advances of her suitor. The burden is a perfect illustration of how the various sections of narrative from male to female are well defined, and could perhaps have given an opportunity to change the performance in some way when each gender is speaking.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> Dutka, 'Music and the English Mystery Plays', *Comparative Drama*, 7/2 (1973, Summer), 138

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> King Henry VIII's manuscript is discussed in more detail within Chapter 3:' The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?'



Example 9: The burden of 'Hey trolly lolly lo'<sup>257</sup>

Interestingly, this carol is in triple time, in contrast to the rest of the carols in this manuscript which are in duple time, which harks back to the earlier carol tradition of the fifteenth-century manuscripts. Unlike a number of the carols in this manuscript this carol has full musical notation for both the burden and verses, which perhaps suggests the melody as less well known than that of 'Hey nonny nonny', which only has musical notation for the burden. 'Hey nonny nonny!' has a short and simple burden that could be derived from popular song (hence the scribe's decision not to include the remainder of the music). The presence of popular song within such a manuscript could illustrate that the use of such song was used in various classes of society not necessarily just by lower-class musicians, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>257</sup> Stevens, John, ed., Songs and Carols from the Court of Henry VIII (London, 1962), 95

the mixing of musicians that we have seen previously would suggest that the higher and lower-class musician were far from being exclusive entities, but were possibly mixing together in a variety of circumstances. Certainly, even if the musicians were not playing together, their styles of music were with the higher class of musician at the court of Henry VIII deliberately capturing 'popular' elements to represent certain characters in their dramatizations. The burden of this nine-stanza carol is illustrated in Example 10.

#### Error! Reference source not found.

Example 10: Burden of 'Hey nonny nonny'<sup>258</sup>

Stevens notes that the song by Henry VIII 'Alack alack what shall I do' may be linked with 'Hey nonny nonny' in a dramatic sense, as 'In the MS index... it is [Alack alack what shall I do] numbered 27. This number appears on f.36 over... Hey nony nony.'<sup>259</sup>As Stevens points out, there seems to be no musical connection between the two, but they were both perhaps connected in use within a masque or some other dramatic performance. The text of this song, thought to be by Henry VIII, reads:

Alack, alack, what shall I do? For care is cast into my heart, And true love locked thereto.<sup>260</sup>

Certainly, the narrative of 'Hey nonny nonny' which describes a love affair and the pain felt by the woman who fears she has lost her love to another, would seem to sit well with the text of Henry's 'Alack, alack'. If these two pieces are indeed dramatically linked, it clearly shows the carol enjoying a place in performance beside other musical genres.

The Henry VIII manuscript is also a good example of the inclusion of those carols that do not necessarily fit into the 'sacred' category, carols that would have seemed out of place in monastic environments; convivial carols, carols of women and erotic carols. As John Caldwell writes:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>258</sup>Stevens, John, ed., Songs and Carols from the Court of Henry VIII (London, 1962),), 27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>259</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Songs and Carols from the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), 104. Stevens chooses to spell the title of the carol slightly differently here to his spelling of it elsewhere in this edition.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>260</sup> Stevens, John, ed., Stevens, John, ed., *Songs and Carols from the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), 26
the musical settings of satirical, amorous, or erotic songs in this form have mostly disappeared. These will have been the province of a lower class of musician, for production at a later stage of an evening's entertainment; and the few surviving specimens with music are perhaps examples of the higher clerical wit rather than of a genuinely popular art.<sup>261</sup>

What would have been the purpose of a carol such as 'Of all creatures women be best',<sup>262</sup> obviously written in order to poke fun at women, and most probably in their company due to the hidden meaning within the text, if it was not shared in convivial company alongside women themselves?; or 'I pray youe, maydys that here be' which indicates an address directly to women in the present company and advises them to treasure their virginity?<sup>263</sup> These carols may not have been used behind enclosed cloistered walls, unless in some cases as a way to preach moral values,<sup>264</sup> but as Caldwell argues, may well have been the carol type favoured by the 'lower class of musician', and may have simply had a monophonic melodic line.<sup>265</sup> These types of carols are often found grouped together in non-musically notated pocket-book style manuscripts, and rarely found in the larger monastic notated manuscripts. Some of them also come with notes that instruct the reader to sing them to a particular melody. The melody is never notated, but must have been a popular enough tune to have been readily known. As Stevens noted:

Two carols in a manuscript at Gonville and Caius College, Cambridge, for example, are labelled with the names of tunes – 'Bryd on brere' and 'Le bon l.don'; another carol, *Hey now now now...* is headed 'A song to the tune of and I were a mayd'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>261</sup> Caldwell, John, *The Oxford History of English Music, Vol. 1., From the Beginnings to c.1715* (New York, 1991), 164

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>262</sup> Greene, R. The Early English Carols (Oxford, 1935), 265-266. This carol is given greater consideration in Chapter 5: 'Women in the Late Medieval Carols'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>263</sup> Greene, R. The Early English Carols (Oxford, 1935), 265. This carol is given greater consideration in Chapter
5: 'Women in the Late Medieval Carols'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>264</sup> The argument for seemingly 'unsuitable' carols in monastic manuscripts being used to preach a moral message is addressed in Chapter 5: 'Women in the Late Medieval Carols'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>265</sup> Secular musically notated political carols however are often found alongside sacred musically notated carols in monastic/ecclesiastical manuscripts. GB-LbI Egerton 3307 is a good example of this. See McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript Egerton 3307* (London, 1963)

This evidence surely could argue strongly that many carols were set to popular melodies, and not necessarily all created in polyphonic form by trained musicians.

#### Conclusion

Much of the evidence for the existence of an orally transmitted, popular monophonic carol repertoire is sketchy, but not negligible. I would argue that the number of carol texts that survive, such as 'Nova, nova' or secular carols in the vernacular without musical notation, and their appearance in non-musically notated pocket-book style manuscripts rather than large monastic or royal manuscripts, point to a lost body of monophonic carol melodies that were found in all strata of society. Carols were not exclusively for the educated and monastic classes in society, but shared by all social classes in their various polyphonic and monophonic forms in a much freer way than has previously been thought, just as musicians too were not exclusive to one class, but existing within an wider social framework that, as we will examine in later chapters, involved both men and women; educated and uneducated.

The simple but effective carol form of burden and verse would have made it a form easy to remember and transmit orally. Music and musicians, as demonstrated within this chapter, were not exclusive to one area of society, but existed within an art form that bled throughout the social strata. Arguably, then, on examination of the evidence within this chapter, it would seem there exists even in those carols that were written down and notated, glimpses of more widespread 'popular' traditions of devotional and secular music making.

145

# Chapter 5

## Women in the Late Medieval Carols

Medieval carols, whilst predominantly occupied with the sacred, also open a window into the portrayal of medieval women in society. Issues of gender in the late medieval carols have not been discussed in any great detail, and their value as a social document, particularly in this area, would seem to have been undervalued. The late medieval carols address an abundance of human life, which R.L. Greene categorised under a number of headings: Carols of Advent, Carols of the Nativity Season, Carols of the Nativity, Carols of St John the Evangelist, Carols of the New Year, Carols of the Epiphany, Carols of Holly and Ivy, Lullaby Carols, Carols of the Passion, Carols to the Virgin, Carols of the Annunciation, Carols of Christ's Pleading, Carols of Christ's Love, Carols to Christ, Carols of the Trinity, Carols of Saints, Carols of the Eucharist and 'Corpus Christi', Carols of Religious Counsel, Carols of Moral Counsel, Carols of Doomsday, Carols of Mortality, Satirical Carols, Carols of Women, Carols of Marriage, Convivial Carols, Political Carols and Amorous Carols.<sup>266</sup> Greene's categorisations, whilst undeniably useful, may also be misleading, particularly when addressing issues of gender and the representation of women. Greene places twelve carols under the heading of 'Carols of Women'. However, on closer inspection, this categorisation is clearly far more complex than this as within 35 manuscripts there are actually more than 60 carols that discuss women, are in a female voice, have some female narrative or deal with female saints.<sup>267</sup> I would argue that all of these are in some way 'carols of women'. Tables 20-24 illustrate: carols with a woman's voice, carols of female saints/saint carols addressed to women, carols with some female narrative and carols addressed to women.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>266</sup> Greene, RL. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition (Oxford, 1977)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>267</sup> 'Carols to the Virgin' and 'Holly and Ivy' carols are also not included in this list. 'Holly and Ivy' carols allude to the masculine and feminine in subtle allegorical terms.

Burden	Manuscript	Folio	Date	Music	Language	No. in Greene
A, dere God, qwat I am fayn	GB-Cjc MS.S.54	f.2v	1450-1500	No Music	English	454
Alas, ales, the wyle!	GB-Gcg 383/603	Page 41	c.1450	No Music	English	453
Grudge on who liste, this ys my lott	GB-Lbl Additional 17492	f. 78v	1530	No Music	English	467
Hey, noyney!	US-SM EL 1160	f.11v	c.1500	No Music	English	456.1
Hoow, gossip myne, gossip myn,	GB-Obac 354	f.206v	1 <sup>st</sup> half 16 <sup>th</sup> C.	No Music	English	419
I have forsworne it whil I life	GB-Cul Ff.5.48	f.114v	1450-1500	No Music	English	456
Kyrie, so kyrie	GB-Lbl Sloane 2593	f.34r	1400-1450	No Music	English and Latin	457
Rybbe ne rele ne spynne yc ne may	GB-Gcg 383/603	Page 41	c.1450	No Music	English	452
So well ys me begone	GB-Lbl Sloane 1584	f.45v	15 <sup>th</sup> century	No Music	English	446
Vp son and mery wether	GB-Cul MS Ff.1.6	f.139v	1450-1500	No Music	English	469
Whilles lyue or breth is in my brest	GB-Lbl 31922	f.104v	c.1500-1525	Music for 3 Voices- Burden Only	English	448.1
Wolde God that hyt were so	GB-Lbl Additional 5943	f.178 v	1415-1462	No Music	English	451
Were it Vndo that is ydo	GB-Gcg 383/603	Page 210	c.1450	No Music	English	455
Wep no mre for me, swet hart	GB-Lbl Harley 1317	f. 94v	1450-1550	No Music	English	462

### Table 20: Carols with a Woman's Voice

Carol	Manuscript	Folio	MS Date	Music	Language	No. in Greene
A, a, a, a (St Catherine)	GB-Cjc S.54	f.3r	1400-1450	No Music	English	313
Alle maydenis, for Godes grace (St Nicholas-addressed to women)	GB-Lbl Sloane 2593	f.2v	1400-1450	No Music	English	315
The mother of Mary, that merciful may (St Anne)	GB-Lbl Douce 302	f.31r	1400-1450	No Music	English	311
Wenefrede, thou swete may (St Winifred)	GB-Lbl Douce 302	f.26r	1400-1450	No Music	English	314

Table 21: Carols of Female Saints/Saint Carols Addressed to Women

Carol	Manuscript	Folio	MS Date	Music	Language	No. in Greene
A, a,a,a	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f. 23v	2 <sup>nd</sup> half 15 <sup>th</sup> Century	Music	English	414
Alone, I lyue alone	GB-Lpro Excheq. 22.1.1	f.138v	Late 13 <sup>th</sup> early 14th	No Music	English	450
Hey nonny nonny nonny nonny no	GB-Lbl 31922	f.36r	c.1500-1520	Music for 3 Voices- Burden Only	English	463.1
Hey trolly lolly lo	GB-Lbl 31922		c.1500-1520	Music for 3 voices	English	n/a
Inducas, inducas	GB-Cul Additional 7350 Box 2	f.2r	Late 15 <sup>th</sup> early 16 <sup>th</sup>	No Music	English/Latin	461.1
I pray yow, cum kyss me	GB-CA Letters 2.173	No.173	1500+	No Music	English	443
Podynges at nyght and podynges at none	GB-Cul Additional 7350 Box 2	f.2r	Late 15 <sup>th</sup> early 16 <sup>th</sup> C.	No Music	English	460.1
With Lullay, Lullay , Lyke a Chylde	US- SM Here	f.1v	c.1520	No Music	English	459
Yow and I and Amyas	GB-Lbl 31922	ff.45v, 46r	c.1500-1520	Music for 3 Voices- Burden Only	English	463

Table 22: Carols with some Female Narrative

Carol	Manuscript	Folio	MS Date	Music	Language	No. in Greene
'Alas' sayd the gudman, 'this ys an hevy lyff!'	GB-Obac 354	f.249r	1 <sup>st</sup> half 16 <sup>th</sup> C.	No Music	English	408
Alone, I Lyue alone	GB-Lpro Excheq. 22.1.1		c.1530	No Music	English	450.1
Avyse youe, wemen, wom ye trust	GB-Lbl Douce 302	f.30v	1400-1450	No Music	English	411
Blow, northerne wynd	GB-Lbl Harley 225B	f.72v		No Music	English	440
Blow thi horne, hunter	GB-LbI 31922	f. 39v	c.1500-1520 c.1515-1540	Music for 3 Voices- Burden Only	English	466.1 a b
	GB-Lbl Royal Appendix 58		0.1313 1340	Music for 1 voice		5
Care away, away, away	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f.23r	2 <sup>nd</sup> half 15 <sup>th</sup> Century	No Music	English	406
Care awey, awey, awey	GB-Lbl Printed Book MK.8.k.8	Recto	c.1525	1 Voice Burden Only	English	470.1
Grene growith the holy	GB-Lbl 31922	f. 37v	c.1500-1520	Music for 3 Voices- Burden Only	English	448

Herfor and therfor and	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f.13r	2 <sup>nd</sup> half 15 <sup>th</sup>	No Music	English	402.1
therfor I came		1.131	Century	NO WIUSIC	English	402.1
Hey,howe!	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f.42v	2 <sup>nd</sup> half 15 <sup>th</sup> Century	No Music	English	409
How, hey! It is non les	GB-Lbl Sloane 2593	f.24v	1400-1450	No Music	English	405
I am as light as any roe	GB-Lbl Harley 4294	f.81r		No Music	English	396
In soro and caar he led hys lyfe	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f.29v	2 <sup>nd</sup> half 15 <sup>th</sup> Century	No Music	English	404
In villa, in villa	GB-Obac 354	f.241r	1 <sup>st</sup> half 16 <sup>th</sup> C. 1450-	No Music	English	410 a
	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f.54v- 55r	1500	No Music	English	b
Joan is Sick and III at Ease	BL Additional MS 5465	93v-96r	1505	Music in 3 parts	English	MB xxxvi 60
Joly felowe, joly	GB-Lbl K.1.e.1	f.1v		Music for Bass only	English	447
Man, bewar of thin wowyng	GB-Lbl Sloane 2593	f.9v	1400-1450	No Music	English	403
Margaret Meek	BL Additional MS 5465	89v-93r	1505	Music in 3 parts	English	MB xxxvi 59
My dere an dese that so fayr ys	GB-Olc Lat.100	f.2v		No Music	English	441.1
My lady is a pretty on	GB-Lbl Harley 7578	f. 85r		No Music	English	445
Nova, noua, sawe yow euer such?	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f.42v	2 <sup>nd</sup> half 15 <sup>th</sup> Century	No Music	English	407
Of all creatures women be best	GB-Obac 354	f.250r	1 <sup>st</sup> half 16 <sup>th</sup> C. 1450-	No Music	English	399
	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f.55v-56r	1500	No Music	English	
Of all the things that God	GB-Lbl Additional 5943	Last Flyleaf recto	1415-1462	No Music	English	vii
Pray we to Oure Lady dere	GB-Cjc S.54	f. 7r	1450-1500	No Music	English	394
Wymmen be both goude and truwe	GB-Lbl Harley 7358	f.8r		No Music	English	395
Thei Y synge and murthus make	GB-Gcg 383/603	Page 210	c.1450	No Music	English	441
This day day dawes	GB-Lbl Additional 5465	108v-109r	1505	Music for 3 voices	English	432
For the loue of a maydon fre	GB-Lbl Douce 302	f.30r	1400-1450	No Music	English	397
War yt, war yt, war yt wele	GB-Cjc S.54	9v	1450-1480	No Music	English	400
We ben chapmen light of fote	GB-Lbl Sloane 2593	f.26v	1400-1450	No Music	English	416

Whane thes thynges foloyng	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f.43v	1450-1500	No Music	English	402 a
be done to owr intent						
	GB-Obac 354	(	ast us a sth		- 11 I	
		f.250v	1 <sup>st</sup> half 16 <sup>th</sup> C	No Music	English	
						b
	GB-Lbl Printed Book I		16 <sup>th</sup> Century	No Music	English	
	B. 52242	ff. 005v-				
		006r				С
Who so lyst to loue	GB-Cul MS Ff.1.6	f.136v		No Music	English	442
					21.8.001	
Where ye be my love?	GB-Lbl 31922	f. 111v-112	c.1500-1520	Music for 3	English	n/a
				voices		, -
Wome, women, love of	GB-Obac 354	f.354r	1 <sup>st</sup> half 16 <sup>th</sup> C.	No Music	English	401Aa
women	GB-Ob Eng Poet.e.1	f.56v-57r	1450-1500			
	GB-OD Elig Poet.e.1	f.135r	1430-1300	No Music	English	В
	Lambeth Palace				28	-
	Library. MS.					В
	Lambeth 306					
Women be Good For Love	GB-Cjc S.54	f.13r	1450-1500	No Music	English	Vi
	05 0,0 3.54	1.131	1430-1300	NO MUSIC	English	, i

Table 23: Carols about Women in some form/Love of a Woman<sup>268</sup>

Incipit	Manuscript	Folio	Date	Music	Language	Greene
Be mery, all that be present	GB-Obac 354	f.165	1 <sup>st</sup> half 16 <sup>th</sup> C.	No Music	English	126
Comidentes convenite	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	f. 70v-71	c.1450	Music	Latin	n/a
I ham as I ham, and so will I be	US –Pupl Latin 35	f.[iii]r	15 <sup>th</sup> -16 <sup>th</sup> Century	No Music	English	468.1
I pray youe, maydys that here be	GB-Ob Douce 302	f.30r	1400-1450	No Music	English	398

Table 24: Carols in which women are directly addressed

Within this chapter, these 'carols of women' will be explored: discussing their place within some of the extant manuscripts, their portrayal of medieval woman, and their possible purpose in late medieval society and the possibility of female song writers.

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 268}$  MB indicates the volume and number of the carol in the Musica Britannica series.

#### Female Authorship or Female Voice?

The term 'women's song', can be misleading, as there is a definite distinction between female authorship and female texts and we must be clear as to which we mean.<sup>269</sup> Assigning gender to a writer of anonymous medieval song is a difficult, if not impossible, task. In an age where few male writers are recorded, positively identifying female authorship is like finding the proverbial needle. The carols are no exception; a handful of names are assigned to some within the grander manuscripts such as the Henry VIII manuscript, Egerton or Ritson, but the percentage is minimal in comparison to the extant anonymous carols. Female authorship is not immediately visible in the carols; it would however seem unlikely that there were no female writers of carol lyrics or music, or indeed no women singing carols considering the popularity of the form. Women were involved in music in this period. As Lisa Colton notes:

While there is no doubt that women performed music during the medieval period, the details relating to how they participated in music-making as singers, instrumentalists, composers, lyricists, copyists, owners or patrons- have survived only sketchily. Biographical data for male musicians in England before c.1400 are equally scarce, but many surviving manuscripts contain clear evidence of a link with institutions in which only men lived and worked.<sup>270</sup>

This is indeed true of the medieval carols. Many (but not all), of the extant manuscripts have links to male institutions, or are lacking in any provenance in which a link to female ownership could be demonstrated. Evidence of the material held within the libraries of female institutions is scarce, only provides us with a very small window into women's music making, and reveals nothing tangible in relation to the carols. However, again, the popularity of the form within the male institutions would lead us to presume that they were also a form employed by women in their music making. Anne Bagnall Yardley writes:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>269</sup> Pierre Bec introduces the terms 'féminité génétique' for songs composed by women and 'féminité textuelle' for those in a female voice in order to differentiate. See: Bec, Pierre, *La lyrique français. au moyen age* (XIIe-XIIIe s.), (Paris, 1977)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>270</sup> Colton, Lisa, 'Languishing for Provenance: *Zelo tui langueo* and the search for women's polyphony in England', *Early Music* 39/4 (November, 2011)315

Note that the only two specific skills required of a nun are reading and singing. Without the ability to sing she cannot carry out the "burdens of the choir". Choir service is her principal work. Thus, the most important skills for a nun are the ability to read and sing; in order to maintain the flow of monastic worship new nuns must acquire these arts.<sup>271</sup>

This emphasis and importance of music in the English medieval nunnery may well have extended, as we find in the male institutions, beyond the standard chant and may well have included material such as the carol form. Interestingly, the amount of material that nuns seemed to be reading in this period included a great many theological texts in the vernacular. Anne Bagnall Yardley again writes that:

What these nuns do read increasingly, however, are devotional works in Middle English. Indeed, a study of vernacular sources indicates that the nuns participate in the move towards theological writing in the vernacular to a much greater extent than monks... These versions were clearly written to accommodate the nuns' limited education.<sup>272</sup>

The huge number of carol texts in the vernacular would surely have appealed then to a female institution with a limited understanding of the Latin texts. The bawdier, cruder carols would not necessarily have been appropriate, but certainly the sacred carols, particularly those for the Christmas season or other feasts, would perhaps have been welcomed. The carol to St Nicholas, for example, is a good example of a carol addressed to women. It is found in GB-LbI Sloane 2593, and addresses women directly. The burden reads 'Alle maydenis, for Godes grace, Worchepe ye Seynt Nicolas', and tells the story of St Nicholas coming to the aid of three young women.<sup>273</sup> The direct address to women, particularly young women, in this carol could suggest a female presence at any 'performance' of it.<sup>274</sup> The carol is written by the blind John Audelay, a 'secular chaplain retired to a chantry

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>271</sup> Bagnall Yardley, Anne, *Performing Piety: Musical Culture in Medieval English Nunneries* (New York, 2006),
 75

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>272</sup> Bagnall Yardley, Anne, *Performing Piety: Musical Culture in Medieval English Nunneries* (new York, 2006), 77
 <sup>273</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Douce 302, f.30r and transcribed in: Greene, RL. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup>
 Edition (Oxford, 1977), 193

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>274</sup> The presence of women may have enhanced the text, but would not necessarily have been an essential component.

priesthood at Haughmond Abbey in Shropshire'.<sup>275</sup> As Susanna Fein notes, Audelay's subject interest within this manuscript extends to:

the veneration of female saints and an interest in their vitae in the salutations; the convivial carols, some of which are directed to women and seem meant for singing in a hall.<sup>276</sup>

Indeed, extant evidence of nuns engaging in revelry with friars, and being chastised for dancing and drinking with those outside of their sacred community exists, as it does of nuns engaging in secular music. Yardley quotes a medieval nunnery complaint:

Also the said dame Isabel on Monday last did pass the night with the Austin friars at Northampton and did dance and play the lute with them in the same place until midnight, and on the night following she passed the night with the friar preachers at Northampton, luting and dancing in like manner.<sup>277</sup>

I see no reason to suggest that carols would not have been a part of this extra-curricular singing and dancing. The women in these establishments were not hidden behind the walls of their nunnery, but were engaging with the wider community: by providing hospitality and employment to the layman and 'in several other ways, such as distributing alms, providing intercessory prayers, and burying people in their cemeteries and churches',<sup>278</sup> and it seems, were maintaining contact with male establishments. The sharing of carols therefore would have been a very real possibility, and the writing of carols by the educated nun, also a possibility. Evidence of women reading mensural notation is lacking, indeed the lack of manuscript evidence from female establishments as a whole is unfortunate, but we must remember that oral tradition was strong, and the writing down of texts and music largely irrelevant.<sup>279</sup> Other evidence survives of monks and nuns partaking in musical activity together in images within manuscripts. One example of this can be seen in the English manuscript BL Royal 2 B VII known as the 'Queen Mary Psalter', on folio 177 which depicts a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>275</sup> Fein, Susanna, John the Blind Audelay: Poems and Carols (Kalamazoo, 2009), 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>276</sup> Fein, Susanna, John the Blind Audelay: Poems and Carols (Kalamazoo, 2009), 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>277</sup> For details of where to find this evidence, see footnote 67 in: Bagnall Yardley, Anne, *Performing Piety: Musical Culture in Medieval English Nunneries* (new York, 2006), 272

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>278</sup> Oliva, Marilyn, The Convent and Community in Late Medieval England (Woodbridge, 1998), 140

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>279</sup> Oral transmission in the Middle Ages is addressed in Chapter 4: "That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth century carol, a music of the people'.

monk and a nun playing musical instruments together; the nun playing a psaltery and the monk playing a mandora or gittern.<sup>280</sup> The monk and nun are turned in to one another, suggesting that they are playing together.



Example 1: BL Royal 2 B VII, folio 177<sup>281</sup>

The manuscript GB-Lbl Stowe 17 also shows a monk and a nun together, this time depicting the nun dancing. This manuscript (a book of hours) although not English, but from the Netherlands, portrays a very different image of the medieval monk and nun than that which we are used to seeing. This satirical image portrays the monk playing a pair of bellows and using a distaff as a bow. The use of the bellows and distaff is interesting, as both are domestic tools used by women; the distaff being a medieval spinning tool, and very much a symbol of domesticity. The use of these items then could be seen in two ways. Firstly, the monk could be being portrayed as lacking in masculinity in some way by his use of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>280</sup> There is some dispute over the naming of instruments of this kind, with confusion over the correct identification of mandora/gittern and citole. For more insight into this debate see: Wright, Lawrence, 'The Medieval Gittern and Citole: A Case of Mistaken Identity', *The Galpin Society Journal, Vol. 30* (May, 1977), 8-42 <sup>281</sup> This image is declared as public domain by the British Library. For more information on this manuscript see the British Library online catalogue of illuminated manuscripts.

domestic tools traditionally associated with women, or secondly, and I believe most likely, the tools are representing the female and symbolises the monk 'playing the woman', with excellent results it would seem from the reaction of the nun. The bellows could be seen as a representation of the female body, particularly the womb, with the distaff given male phallic symbolism. Although this is a satirical image, the concept would surely not have worked without the playing of music together by monks and nuns, and indeed inappropriate behaviour between monks and nuns, being well known in the medieval period.



Example 2: GB-Lbl Stowe 17, folio 38<sup>282</sup>

Of course, carols that address women directly within the present company, need not only have been within the sacred community. We find another three carols from three separate manuscripts that also address women directly: 'Comidentes convenite',<sup>283</sup> 'Be mery all that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>282</sup> This image is declared as a public image by the British Library. For more information on this manuscript see the British Library online catalogue of illuminated manuscripts.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>283</sup> British Library, MS. Egerton, 3307, f. 70v-71r

be present',<sup>284</sup> and 'I ham as I ham, and so will I be'.<sup>285</sup> All four of these carols can be seen in Table 24.

'I praye youe, maydys, that here be', reinforces this address directly to the women within the company no less than nine times throughout the carol due to the repetition of its burden. This constant, direct address would simply not work as well in an all-male situation, unless perhaps in the context of a play where men took the part of women.<sup>286</sup> Indeed, there is no extant evidence that exists to suggest the performance of women in plays in England at this time; the likelihood being that the female roles were played by male actors. Rastall writes in the context of the mystery plays that:

Many late medieval plays on the Continent used female actors for the female roles, but this was never the case, as far as we know, in the English plays. The evidence is of course incomplete: no records survive for the East Anglican or Cornish plays, for instance, and it is therefore entirely possible that females played all female roles in those dramas.<sup>287</sup>

The possibility of female involvement in plays and dramas of this period is tantalising, but unfortunately inconclusive. This carol is also written by John Audelay, and is found within the same manuscript as the carol of St Nicholas. There are more than just these two carols within this manuscript that speak of women, but 'I praye youe, maydys, that here be' is the only one with a direct address. There are in fact a total of five carols within this manuscript that are about women in some context.

### Humour in the Female Centred Carol

Not all carols addressed to women are as respectful in tone as 'I praye youe, maydys'. There is a certain sense of poking fun at women that exists within the carol genre, which is perfectly conveyed within the carol 'Of all creatures women be best'. This carol celebrates

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>284</sup> Balliol College, Oxford, MS. 354, f.165

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>285</sup> University of Pennsylvania Library MS. Latin 35, f.[iii]r

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>286</sup> For a detailed discussion on the use of the carols in plays see Chapter 4: "That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth-century carol, a music of the people?"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>287</sup> Rastall, Richard, *Music in Early English Religious Drama: The Heaven Singing* (Cambridge, 1996), 308

women within the verses, exclaiming that women 'be true a tirtyll on tree', 'So jentyll, so curtes' and 'meke and mylde' to name but a few compliments. However, the humour within this carol comes with the addition of the burden which reads, 'Of all creatures women be best, Cuius contrarium verum est'. This burden translates as 'Of all creatures women be best, the opposite is true'. As Greene writes, 'One can imagine the possibilities of mirth raised by its performance before women who did not understand the Latin of the burden'.<sup>288</sup>

Women would have been unlikely to have had an understanding of this Latin burden, and would perhaps rather cruelly have been mocked in its performance, due to their lack of education. Although one would assume that women such as nuns would be educated in the reading and understanding of Latin, it would seem that this was not necessarily the case. As Eileen Power notes:

It was not possible after the fourteenth century...to assume in them that acquaintance with Latin, the learned and ecclesiastical tongue, which was generally assumed in their brothers the monks. Their learning was similar to that of contemporary laymen of their class, rather than of contemporary monks...in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries the Bishops almost invariably send their instructions to the nuns in English. The majority of nuns during these two centuries would seem to have understood neither French nor Latin.<sup>289</sup>

One must be careful not to assume that all nuns were unable to understand Latin, and be equally careful not to equate a lack of understanding of Latin with illiteracy.<sup>290</sup> Regardless of the level of understanding of Latin within female circles, without a female audience, this carol would not necessarily have had the same effect. Yes, men could tell sexist jokes without the presence of women, but the clever use of language in this carol would seem to make a female presence particularly necessary or at least favourable, to ensuring its humorous meaning had full effect. It is possible that this carol would also have worked in the setting of a play with men playing female characters, one would imagine much hilarity

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>288</sup> Greene, RL. *The Early English Carols*, (Oxford, 1935), 431

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>289</sup> Power, Eileen, *Medieval English Nunneries c. 1275-1535* (Cambridge, 1922)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>290</sup> For more discussion on this topic see: Oliva, Marilyn, *The Convent and Community in Late Medieval England* (Woodbridge, 1998), 64-70

ensuing, but the presence of real women would have enhanced the joke considerably. Palti describes the section of GB-Ob Eng poet.e.1 as an 'anti-feminist sequence'<sup>291</sup> which also includes 'In villa, in villa',<sup>292</sup> which bemoans women voicing their opinions, and 'Women, women, love of women' which addresses different kinds of women, mainly focusing upon the negative traits, with the burden scathingly repeating that women 'Maketh bare pursis with sum men.'<sup>293</sup>

Humour is also found in the carols bemoaning the gossiping of women. This seemingly female trait is mentioned too in 'Of all creatures, women be beste'. In stanza four it reads:

For, tell a woman all your cownsayle,

And she can kepe it wonderly well;

She had lever go quyk to hell

Than to her neyghbowr she wold it tell.<sup>294</sup>

The Latin chorus of course contradicts this statement. There are other carols that focus on women as gossips. Stanza six of the carol 'Women, women, love of women' notes that 'Sum may prate withowt hire' for example, but the most interesting carol in this respect is 'Hoow, gossip myne, gossip myn',<sup>295</sup> which is found in both GB-Obc MS. 354 and GB-Lbl Cotton TitusA.xxvi. Greene describes this as a 'convivial' carol rather than a carol of women, but there can be no doubt that this carol is a portrait of the male perception of late medieval women and the threat of them gathering, particularly in 'secret'. As Christine Neufield notes:

In fact, in each version of the carol the secrecy of the gossips' gathering is paramount. The women arrive two by two in order to escape the notice of their husbands. Stanza eight of Version A.a lays out the transgression and risks inherent in the gathering: 'A strype or ii God myght send me y f my husbond myght here seen

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>291</sup> Palti, Kathleen, 'Singe we now alle and sum': Three Fifteenth-Century Collections of Communal Song (PhD from University College London, 2008),80

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>292</sup> Transcriptions of this carol can be found in: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 410-411

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>293</sup> Transcriptions of this carol can be found in: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 267-268

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>294</sup> For a full transcription of this carol see: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 265-266

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>295</sup> Transcriptions of this carol from both manuscripts can be found in: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 280-284

me." She that is aferede, lett her flee,' Quod Alis than; '1 dred no man, Good gossippis myn-a'.<sup>296</sup>

Although the carol, as Greene presents it, is a convivial carol, it also speaks of the darker side of life for women in this period, and highlights that gossiping is frowned upon. There is an underlying distaste of gossiping, and women meeting together in general, in the Middle Ages. As Goldberg writes:

Women's supposedly insatiable desire for 'gossip' was frequently a matter of comment and even friction. The Goodwife advised her daughter not to go in to town from house to house 'for to seke the mase'. Noah's wife in the Chester miracle cycle made herself the object of ridicule by refusing to enter the ark since it meant leaving behind her gossips... Her disobedience was, of course, not merely in respect of her husband, but of divine authority.<sup>297</sup>

So perhaps what reads as having humorous connotations in fact conveys a different, darker, connotation to the medieval reader. Certainly, this distaste of women meeting can be seen in stanza eight, which reads 'A strype or ii God myght send me y f my husbond myght here seen me' and in stanza fourteen, 'For my husbond is so fell He betith me lyke the devil of hell, And the more I crye, The lesse mercy'. The carol does continue its tale in favour of women, and presenting their gossiping as misunderstood.

The carol has a definite dramatic narrative, with 'speaking parts' which may indicate its use in dramatic performance, and the portrayal of woman on the stage. Greene suggests that 'Some such a piece as this was doubtless the model for 'The Good Gossippes songe' in the Chester Play of the Deluge'.<sup>298</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>296</sup> Neufeld, Christine, Marie, *Xanthlppe's Sisters: Orality and Femininity In The Later Middle Ages*, PhD Dissertation, McGill University (Montreal, April 2001), 257-8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>297</sup>Goldberg, P.J.P., 'Women' in, Horrox, R., ed., *Fifteenth Century attitudes: Perceptions of Society in Late Medieval Britain*(Cambridge 1994), 117

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>298</sup> Deimling, H., ed., *The Chester Plays* (London, 1893)

#### 'Comidentes Convinete': A Carol to Women Feasters

One of the most interesting carols, one which survives with musical notation, addressed to women must be 'Comidentes convinite',<sup>299</sup> found in the carefully executed Egerton manuscript.<sup>300</sup> This carol is written entirely in Latin; it is the only carol within the repertoire that in this language and addressed to women, thus suggesting a particularly educated class of female listener or even perhaps a female performer. It is fully notated for three voices. The first burden and the verse are scored for two voices, with the second burden for three; a common scoring for late medieval carols. A translation of the carol and its Latin text reads:

Comidentes, convenite, Sero mane se pectite. Este dulces et condite; Crebro gentes sint petite

Cibis alvos enutrite crescentes sacre, Crescents sacre

Parce vivendo nolite effice macre,]effice macre.<sup>301</sup>

[Sister-feasters, come together, comb yourselves late in the morning; be sweet and adorned; let folk be often begged [to come]

Nourish your bellies with victuals;

A wax taper to the Holy One [fem]

Do not become thin, frugal in living]<sup>302</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>299</sup> This carol is not listed in Greene due to its text being entirely in Latin.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>300</sup> This manuscript is discussed in greater detail in the previous chapter in which its political carols are subject to scrutiny.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>301</sup> Stevens, John, ed. *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970),58

The voice ranges are not unusual for this manuscript, with the top voice in burden one having a range of less than an octave, from c'-b', and voice two spanning a full octave from d-d'. The three voices of burden two span from top voice to bottom voice respectively: c'-c'', c-f', and d-'-d''.

The alternation of voices between verse and burden/burdens is a technique which becomes more and more popular chronologically in the carol manuscripts. In Egerton the use of voice alternation is used in 49% of the carols, as opposed to all the carols in the Ritson manuscript. In this sense, 'Comidentes convenite' is given an increasingly common texture. Its text is entirely in Latin; a language that dominates Egerton, as can be seen in Table 25.

Latin	English	English and Latin	Un-texted
22 (67%)	4 (12%)	6 (18%)	1 (3%)

Table 25: Use of Language in Egerton

'Comidentes convenite' also reflects the other carols in the manuscript in its utilisation of melodic material with voices generally quite equal in terms of movement. The text is treated in a predominantly syllabic manner, with short bursts of melismatic material mainly at the ends of phrases and sections. This can be seen in bars 12-13, 28-30, and 64-66 shown in Example 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>302</sup> Translation by: Stevens, John, ed. *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970),44

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>303</sup> One must be aware of the lack of set pitch in medieval song, and therefore be conscious of the fact that although we can gain a solid picture of voice range and span, we cannot necessarily say with any certainty what pitches these were actually sung at.

E, ff.70v -71 BURDEN tes, H den con te, ni d. tes, 1 7 Co den con ni te, 1 te. Es te dul d i ces 0 ma ne cti Es se te dul-ces di pe et con 1 1 1. 201 te te tes ti sint 10 te. te: cre - bro gen - tes sint ti pe TERSE d. 1 Ci bis tri te sa tes cre, :|: P . . bis al vi e - nu no - li - tri te te cre ef - scen-tes - fi - ci sa ma cre, cre, do Par ce ven -BURDEN II Co entes sa cre. me den tes. P 4 ve cre - scentes sa cre. Co tes, con tes, 7. d. . č. cre-scentes ef - fi-ci me den sa cre.} -con vo ma 50 . 10 10 1 te se Ēs рe cti te. . **P** · Ës - le dul - ces te, se ro ne ma ne te. - cti te, se ro \_ se pe Es-te dul - ces 60 12 o di - te; cre bro tes sint 5... P P • 0 te; cre bro tes sint tı IJ Ŧ o te. con - di te; bro cre gen tes sint . pe Example 3: 'Comidentes convinete'<sup>304</sup>

Egerton, as discussed in earlier chapters, is an important musical manuscript with no definitive provenance. The inclusion of this carol to women, and a highly illuminated entry of the drinking song 'O potores' immediately after it, gives this manuscript an interesting

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>304</sup> From: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 58

slant.<sup>305</sup> There are two distinct halves to the manuscript: the first half is dedicated to music for Holy Week and the second half contains mainly carols – 31 in total plus a motet and drinking song. The second half of the manuscript is of the greatest interest to this study, due to its inclusion of 'Comidentes convenite' and 'O potores'. The insertion of these songs in close proximity to one another within the manuscript is, I believe, no accident. As will be argued in Chapter 6 in relation to the Egerton manuscript, the placement of the carols does not seem to be as random as is the case for the majority of carol manuscripts (and indeed many other late medieval manuscripts). The carols seem more secular than sacred in nature, and would seem to lend themselves to celebrations and feasts. The political carols celebrate England, its victories and its monarchs, whilst the inclusion of the drinking song indicates merriment and feasting, as does 'Comidentes convenite'; especially as it translates as 'Sister feasters'. What kind of women then is this carol addressing? One would assume an educated class of female that would perhaps have understood the Latin text, although as highlighted earlier, one cannot presume an educated female would automatically have had an understanding of Latin at this time. Indeed, would they have been singing it? It is hard to say with certainty, but one way or another, the class of women is indeed a high one. 'O potores' confirms the presence of these women in its illumination, as they are clearly depicted amongst the revellers.<sup>306</sup> McPeek writes:

The presence of a drinking song in such a collection probably would not be as noteworthy were it not for the way in which the piece is preserved. Not only is it accorded a place of prominence in the manuscripts, but the most ornate and carefully executed work of the entire collection graces the initials of its cantus and contratenor parts. The ostentatious manner in which this text is presented inevitably suggests a secular connection for the manuscript. [...] In the present connection two observations are pertinent: first, women are abundantly represented; and second, the dress of the figures, both men and women, is predominantly non-clerical, appropriate to a court or other lay assemblage. The predominantly secular nature of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>305</sup> This is not in carol form.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>306</sup> GB-Lbl Egerton 3307, f. 73r

the costumes, the prominence of women in the scenes depicted, and the ostentation of its presence are all highly suggestive features of this song.<sup>307</sup>

Of course, the depiction of the scene in the initials does not necessarily show the performance of the piece itself; indeed none of the figures are singing or performing in any way. The scene is more a reflection of the text of the piece. This aside, the inclusion of women in this initial could still point to an establishment where women are welcomed, particularly combined with the carol addressed to women. What is equally interesting about this grouping of music in relation to women is also observed by McPeek who notes that:

The motet immediately after the drinking song is singularly appropriate for women, since not only does it use the feminine forms in the word-endings, but as Greene points out, both the poem and the tenor melody were traditionally associated with women. In addition, treble voices of soprano range so rare in *Egerton* (this piece contains the highest notes in the entire manuscript), suggest performance by women of a piece specifically appropriate to them. We see in this piece a further indication of the functional purpose for which the manuscript was compiled, as well as an additional reason for the motet's position at the close of the original grouping: not only is it the sole sacred motet, but it is the only one specifically appropriate to women and, traditionally, to women only. *Comidentes convenite*, however, is a song addressed to women. Their presence is necessary if it is to make any sense.<sup>308</sup>

Of course, we must be wary in assigning definitive pitches to notation of this period, but when we place it in relation to the other pieces from this half of the manuscript, it does seem to sit higher, but not so much higher as to give a clear distinction; in fact the piece only reached one note higher than the other carols in the manuscript. The possibility still remains that women could have sung the uppermost parts of both the carol and the motet. Roger Bowers however, entertains no notion of female voices being used in this motet. He writes:

Its overall compass extends to eighteen notes...The two lowest voices are marked Contratenor...and Tenor...and above them lies a part a fifth higher...Above them lies

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>307</sup> McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript Egerton 3307* (London, 1963),10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>308</sup> McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript Egerton 3307* (London, 1963),10

the topmost voice...this voice divides into a solo gymel...for the two-part passages introductory to each section. Since the lowest three voices clearly represent the historic core ensemble of *superius, contratenor* and *tenor* sung by an alto and two tenors, the upper voice seems certain to have been conceived for performance by boys. Indeed the literary source of the text *Cantemus Domino, socie* presents it as having been sung, in the course of a celestial vision vouchsafed to St Dunstan, by a pair of female precantatrices to a chorus of virgins. It is easy to appreciate, therefore, the reasons why it seemed appropriate to the composer that when setting this motet he should experiment with the engagement of the high voices of boys to sing the upper text.<sup>309</sup>

Bowers does not even mention evidence such as 'the occurrence of the feminine form "socie" in the first line of the motet, instead of the masculine "socii" for "companions" which appears in almost all known texts of the hymn',<sup>310</sup> and that coupled with the higher pitch of the uppermost part, the positioning in the manuscript alongside another piece that addresses women and that the literary source of the text is presented as sung by women could point to female singers. The evidence certainly presents it as a possibility worthy of consideration.

Why this feminine form appears within this motet is of interest, but the fact it is there in this manuscript at all is of greater importance to this study.<sup>311</sup> Much wrangling over the provenance of this manuscript has taken place, as discussed previously, but whatever its provenance is, the fact remains that this manuscript goes some way to show that women were indeed connected with the carol form, and were involved in celebrations where carols were sung, and indeed may well have been singing them themselves at such occasions.<sup>312</sup> Women were certainly involved in performing, and evidence does exist. As Colton notes:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>309</sup> Bowers, Roger, 'To Chorus from Quartet' in Morehen, John, ed., *English Choral Practice*, 1400-1650

<sup>(</sup>Cambridge, 2003), 26-27 <sup>310</sup> Greene, Richard L, 'Two Medieval Manuscripts: Egerton 3307 and Some University of Chicago Fragments', Journal of the American Musicological Society, Vol.7, No. 1(Spring, 1954) 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>311</sup> For more information on the origins of this motet see: Greene, Richard L, 'Two Medieval Manuscripts: Egerton 3307 and Some University of Chicago Fragments', Journal of the American Musicological Society, Vol.7, No. 1(Spring, 1954) 1-34

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>312</sup> For further discussion of the Egerton manuscript see Chapter 6: 'The Medieval Carol: a vehicle for political commentary and English nationalism'

In August 1323, at Wharleton Castle in the Cleveland hills, two women sang songs about Simon de Monfort to King Edward II.<sup>313</sup>

Other accounts of women singing survive, some of which are recounted by Rossell Hope Robbins. He notes that Edward I, 'on his progress through Scotland was entertained on the way between Gask and 'Uggelville' by seven maidens who sang various songs to him' and that the register of William of Wykeham towards the end of the fourteenth century, contains the thundering of a Bishop 'against these secular women [who] often keep up their chattering, carolling [cantalenas] and other light behaviour, until the middle of the night, and disturb the aforesaid nuns, so that they cannot properly perform the regular services.'<sup>314</sup>

Whether singing or not, the carol 'Comidentes convenite', the drinking song, 'O potores' with its rich illuminations of women, and the motet 'Cantemus Domino socie' which suggests the presence of female companions rather than male, all placed within close proximity within this large section suggest beyond doubt that women were involved in the festivities in some capacity, that this half of Egerton was intended for, and were engaged in carolling whether as singers or audience.

### The Henry VIII Manuscript

Another elaborate and equally important manuscript, which also contains notated carols of women, is the Henry VIII manuscript (the notated 'female' carol is a rare thing; only eleven survive). <sup>315</sup> The fact that only eleven carols of women are notated is not of any great surprise, as most of the notated carols that do survive are from elaborate monastic manuscripts where there would have been little call for carols about women to be sung; notated carols with connections to women are therefore more found in non-monastic sources such as the courtly manuscript, the Henry VIII manuscript.<sup>316</sup> This manuscript

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>313</sup> Colton, Lisa, 'Languishing for Provenance: *Zelo tui langueo* and the search for women's polyphony in England', *Early Music* 39/4 (November, 2011)315

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>314</sup> Hope Robbins, Rossell, 'Lyrical Poetry' in Wilson, R.M., *The Lost Literature of Medieval England* (London, 1970), 163-164

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>316</sup>GB-Lbl Additional 31922

contains musical material for use at the royal court of Henry VIII; 109 pieces in total (33 with claims of being by Henry VIII himself). Twelve of these 109 pieces are carols; and of those carols, seven have some relation to women.<sup>317</sup> John Stevens describes this manuscript as:

the chief surviving monument of secular music at the court of Henry VIII...a beautifully, though not sumptuously, produced vellum manuscript measuring twelve inches by eight and a quarter; its original binding was of wooden boards with stamped leather. The one hundred and nine songs and instrumental pieces are well written; one main hand wrote the music, as second scribe assisted with some of the words. The notation is extremely lucid and, since most of the songs are in duple time, presents few difficulties of interpretation.<sup>318</sup>

Since John Stevens' work in this area over four decades ago, the manuscript still remains the 'chief surviving monument of secular music at the court of Henry VIII'.<sup>319</sup> No other manuscript has upstaged it. More recent scholarship has attempted to clarify the purpose of this manuscript. Dietrich Helms has proposed that the manuscript may have been an aid to teaching the royal children. He writes:

The strongest argument in support of the presumed educational purpose of the manuscript is its most obvious characteristic: its repertoire. Henry VIII's book contains specimens of almost all kinds of secular music in circulation at the beginning of the sixteenth century- in England and on the Continent. The manuscript contains various forms of carols, rounds, puzzle canons, and other theoretical compositions, as well as pieces in the florid style of the Fayrfax book (GB-Lbl Add. 5465) and small homophonic courtly songs. Added to these is a selection of what Stevens has called "international song-hits"—some classics of the Burgundian chanson, some samples of the simple predecessors of the Parisian chanson, a motet-chanson, German tenorlieder, an Italian lauda, settings of basse danse tenors, and cantus-firmus-free compositions on short motives, such as Isaacs "La mi."<sup>320</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>317</sup> A more detailed analysis of the musical content of this manuscript is addressed in Chapter 2: 'The Carol: an isolated genre?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>318</sup> Stevens, ed. *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970),xvii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>319</sup> Stevens, ed. *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970),xvii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>320</sup> Helms, Dietrich, 'Henry VIII's book: Teaching Music to Royal Children', *Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 92 (2009),

Helms argues that this varied repertoire would have given the royal reader a good understanding of different styles, both English and Continental, as well as a variety of compositional techniques and that the quality of the manuscript as well as its 'planned, well-ordered structure and its regular, neat form do not fit the characteristics of a musician's miscellany'<sup>321</sup> but instead sets it apart as a manuscript made for someone of high ranking within the court. Helms delivers a convincing argument, and could well be correct in his assumptions, but unfortunately there is still no definitive evidence to make his claims conclusive.

What marks these female carols apart from those found in less sophisticated manuscripts, manuscripts which will be addressed in due course, is their far more refined treatment of the female subject. The first female carol in the manuscript is found on folio 36r, and as with the other female carols (and other carols), contains music for the burden only. This would suggest that the carols were sufficiently well know from oral transmission not to need to be fully notated, but merely the burden represented as a memory aid. As Stevens writes:

One thing at least is clear: dozens of popular songs were known within the court circle and formed a staple of both literary and musical composition. As a result, the connection between words and tune was ever present in people's minds; 'metrical' words were still naturally connected with melody. The wide currency of popular song in courtly circles meant that a natural unsophisticated relationship between words and melody was never lost sight of.<sup>322</sup>

The female carols in this manuscript generally portray the women subjects as noble in some way. The carol 'A Happy Ending' for example, although alluding to the sexual practices found in other carols,<sup>323</sup> speaks of the female subject being as a 'lady gent' which as Greene notes, would translate as 'pleasant, with implications of aristocratic refinement rather than

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>321</sup> Helms, Dietrich, 'Henry VIII's book: Teaching Music to Royal Children', *Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 92 (2009),
 120

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>322</sup> Stevens, J. *Music and Poetry in the Early Tudor Court* (Cambridge, 1979), 54

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>323</sup> In this carol the lady and her love, after holding her in his arms, spend the day alone in the 'wyldernes'. For a full transcription of this carol, see Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 282-283

merely pretty'.<sup>324</sup> In 'You and I and Amyas',<sup>325</sup> by William Cornysh, we again find an aristocratic lady, this time behind the gates of a castle. In this carol, all of the characters are symbolic. The lady is called 'Strangeness' and her suitor, the Knight, 'Desyre'. Strangeness does not admit Desyre into her castle, but instead suggests Desyre draws up a petition and shows his worth. Two other characters appear in stanza seven, 'Kyndnes' and 'Pyte'. The carol reads:

Yow and I and Amyas, Amyas and yow and I, To the grenewode must we go, alas! Yow and I, my lyff, and Amyas.

The knight knokett at the castell gate; The lady meruelyd who was therat.

To call the porter he wold not blyn[wait];

The lady said he shuld not come in.

The portres was a lady bright;

Strangenes that lady hyght.

She asked hym what was his name;

He said, 'Desyre, your man, madame.'

She said, 'Desyre, what do you here?'

He said, 'Madame, as your prisoner.'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>324</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols,* 2<sup>nd</sup>. Ed. (Oxford, 1977), 498

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>325</sup> GB-Lbl Aditional 31922, ff.45v-46r. The name 'Amyas' is believed to be in reference to a family connected with the court. The relevance of using this name is now lost to us, but it is discussed in: Chambers, E.K. *Early English Lyrics* (London, 1947), 337

He was cownselled to breffe a byll[submit a petition] And shew my lady hys oune wyll.

Kyndnes said she wold yt bere, And Pyte said she wold be ther.

Thus how that dyd we cannot say-We left them ther and went ower way.<sup>326</sup>

The story is left unresolved; perhaps to be concluded at a later point in the dramatization, as Stevens rightly suggests that Cornysh would perhaps have written this piece as part of a larger dramatic performance, and perhaps for the nuptials of Catherine and Henry in 1501.<sup>327</sup> Stevens also suggests that the burden of the carol does not seem to relate in any way to the stanzas. I would suggest that if this was indeed a work composed to form part of a larger dramatization, which was highly possible given Cornysh's role as devisor of court pageantry, then perhaps the burden is linking a theme found in other parts of the drama. Drama and entertainment was certainly not lacking at the court of Henry VIII with pageants, disguisings and interludes all frequently performed. Some performances were even open to those from outside the court, as Alison Weir notes:

Under Henry VIII, Eltham Palace seems to have acquired a reputation as a dramatic venue. When the King was in residence, there were frequent performances in the great hall, and Londoners were admitted to watch them.<sup>328</sup>

This carol could certainly have been part of a pageant, disguising or interlude. Drama within these forms fell into three main areas, as Meg Twycross notes:

Ask anyone who has a nodding acquaintance with late medieval theatre, and they will tell you that there are three major genres: mysteries (biblical plays tracing the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>326</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 282

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>327</sup> The use of the carols within drama is addressed Chapter 4: "That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth- century carol, a music of the people?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>328</sup> Weir, Alison, *Henry VIII: King and Court* (London, 2011), 90

history of the Fall and Redemption of Man); moralities (allegorical psychodramas); and interlude (cheerful, largely secular plays of no particular length, which comprise the rest).<sup>329</sup>

The carol 'You and I and Amyas' could arguably have been used in any of these contexts, however, inclusion in an interlude or morality play might seem the most likely, especially with its use of allegorical figures (allegory, as we shall see features often in the carols of the Henry VIII manuscript). The diversity of carols in general, even beyond those of the Henry VIII manuscript, would deem them suitable for select inclusion in interludes, moralities or mystery dramas within the entertainment of the court whether in the setting of pageants, which 'were entertainments involving mock battles-with knights and ladies bombarding each other with flowers, fruit and sweets-allegorical figures, and the ideals of chivalry and courtly love'<sup>330</sup>, or 'disguisings', particularly encouraged by Henry VIII and involving the 'participants dressing up in disguise, with masks, and either performing incognito or taking people unawares'.<sup>331</sup> The possibility for the inclusion of carols in such court entertainments would seem boundless, so their inclusion in a manuscript from the late medieval court may seem entirely logical.

Another carol in a female voice within this manuscript is 'Whiles life or breath'.<sup>332</sup> This carol again tells the tale of an aristocratic woman, talking about her love for her 'Lord': his prowess at knightly tournaments and his warrior nature, yet in contrast; his good countenance, cheerfulness and his goodness. This carol demonstrates the balance of traits believed in the Middle Ages to constitute a good King. They believed, 'To rule well required traits associated with both the masculine and the feminine: kings had to be both unyielding and tender, both economical and bountiful with words and goods, and both courageous and peace loving'.<sup>333</sup> Greene suggests that this may have been the voice of Catherine of Aragon talking about Henry VIII, and may be a, 'reference to a particular occasion'.<sup>334</sup> Whether

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>329</sup> Twycross, Meg, 'Medieval English Theatre: Codes and Genres' in Brown, Peter, ed., *A Companion to Medieval English Literature and Culture* C. 1350 – C. 1500 (Oxford, 2006), 454

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>330</sup> Weir, Alison, *Henry VIII: King and Court* (London, 2011), 91

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>331</sup> Weir, Alison, Henry VIII: King and Court (London, 2011), 91

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>332</sup> Greene lists this carol on folio 104v of the manuscript, but this is in error. It is actually located on folio 54v-55.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>333</sup> Herrup, Cynthia, 'The King's Two Genders', *Journal of British Studies*, 45/3 (July, 2006), 498

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>334</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 487

there is a specific occasion referring to Henry VIII or not, the fact remains that the carol is in reference to courtly, aristocratic figures; those who would have been participants in such knightly tournaments.

The treatment of women in these carols is refined and outwardly respectable and probably reflects the use of this manuscript at court, where female company of an aristocratic nature would be expected; similar in status perhaps to the women of Egerton. Indeed, even when addressing subjects of a sexual nature, the texts treat them in an allegorical manner rather than in crude realism. This is demonstrated in the carol 'Blow thi horne, hunter', <sup>335</sup> again by Cornysh, which alludes to the chase of a woman and the resulting sexual practices, but told through the chase of a deer by a hunter. The carol itself even points out its obvious double meaning in the last stanza with the text, 'Now the construction of the same – what do you mean or think?' (Which translates as – What do you think the double meaning of this song might be?). This carol survives only with its burden notated, which is a common feature of a number of the carols in this manuscript, and with six non-notated stanzas. The burden and stanzas read:

Blow thy horn, hunter, and blow thy horn on high! There is a doe in the yonder wood; in faith she will not die: Now blow thy horn, hunter, now blow thy horn, joly hunter!

Sore this deer stricken is, And yet she bleeds no whit; She lay so fair, I could not miss; Lord, I was glad of it!

As I stood under a bank

The deer shoff on the mead;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>335</sup> For a full transcription of this carol see: Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols,* second edition (Oxford, 1977), 284

I struck her so that down she sank, But yet she was not deas.

There she go'th over the plain? And if ye lust to have a shot, I warrent her barrain. He to go and I to go, But he ran fast afore; I had him shoot and strike the doe, For I might shoot no more.

To the covert both they went, For I found where she lay; An arrow in her haunch she hent; For faint she might not bray.

I was weary of the game, I went to tavern to drink; Now, the construction of the same-What do you mean or think.

Here I leave and make an end Now of this hunter's lore: I think his bow is well unbent, His bolt may flee no more.<sup>336</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>336</sup> This transcription is taken from: Stevens, John, *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), 29

The music of this carol is set for three voices and is mainly syllabic and homophonic in texture with the exception of one short melisma in the final bar of the Tenor, as we can see in Example 4.



Example 4: 'Blow thy horn, hunter'337

There is an obvious element of word painting in bars three to four, where we see the melody rising upwards to c", the highest pitch of the piece, as the text reads 'blow thy horn on high!'. Downward transposition here is limited by the bass G, which would suggest that the uppermost voice must have been sung by boys or even possibly, women. The meaning of the text however, would perhaps render this piece more likely sung by boys in the top rather than women. The pitch ranges are seen in Table 26.

Voice	Lowest Pitch	Highest Pitch
Top Voice	ď	c′′
Middle (tenor) voice	g	e'
Lower Voice	G	g

Table 26: Pitch Ranges of 'Blow thy horn hunter'

The piece conveys a particularly dance like movement, and perhaps we could even say a 'jolly' feel, which perhaps is in reflection of the 'jolliness' of the hunter in question.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>337</sup>This transcription is taken from: Stevens, John, *Music and Poetry in the Early Tudor Court* (London, 1961), 29

#### Sex, Seduction and Shame

Not all carols that relate to women however, are as sophisticated and as subtle in their treatment of the female subject as we find in Egerton and the Henry VIII Manuscript. Many of the carols in female voices or about women are crude, highly descriptive of sexual practices, and often end with the same sorry tale of a woman left 'holding the baby'. GB-Cgc 383/603 contains three carols in a woman's voice, and one about a woman. <sup>338</sup> There are nine carols in total within this manuscript, of which almost half are female-related in some way.<sup>339</sup> This manuscript appears to have been a cleric's book; it contains an eclectic mix of materials of value to a cleric before taking orders.<sup>340</sup> The carols do not particularly stand out within this densely packed manuscript, and the scribe has opted not to lay them out in the format most often found for carols, that of placing either the first line of the verse or burden to the right of the bracketed text. The carols are most definitely crude in their description of the so labelled 'amorous' incidents they describe and would seem very out of place in Egerton or the Henry VIII manuscript. 'Rybbe ne rele ne spynne yc ne may' is a good example of this type of carol. A transcription can be seen below, and an image of page 41 of the manuscript where this carol is written at the top of the page, is illustrated in Example 5. Interestingly, this page also contains another carol in a woman's voice, 'Alas, ales, the wyle!' which is also on the same theme; that of the seduced maiden (again by Jack) and her resulting pregnancy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>338</sup> Greene list this manuscript as GB-Cgc 383, but its correct citation is GB-Cgc 383/603

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>339</sup> Greene only lists 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>340</sup> For more information regarding the contents of this manuscript, see Appendix 1, or Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols*, second edition (Oxford, 1977), 324-325

ne opi 1-00 me negocia in nonst. Pron Bope se off coloris Ohi infinit be GE " Go Babroon for & mofile forthe 494.4 no m Beck Manulane rates les me appu Stallow to you non a al mi dien of the am Son In mosts afre solas hardsma to make the Solkes our Batisan I to motio million this poul Ond mi BITE TAPE put schail. zu ze pe sol antow -801. manapol brange nie onthes i min thei Dup me min Bennett 10 90 For min forti afondaj aco po ale no en or nei agos fal san faites 1580 Coma le Callo Telo mo 5 nache that watthe that in This 1:20\$ 016 YE sho trank of Geor so after · 2 Ge Wolfer leago me on polo 16.12 No Bonio tol . 6 Le Stole Telis Bello . agie 6 mail Bobe begen to 0P a fulletese Faliner de o bene that An Ba thing gilles latter alter pe mile 1 Cal Bart So ma pe map 00.21 peop I OH W i Ont from 2 Bugonf a sosania Bomba Bapones Cof 60 pens 'min min N 10 to tion - pano a Walagon - Con Meno by on So this mo. France let fan Begenu - Ban mer pe bi tionera nulles . HE TT BOS F CReis Chat g-nelalasa Unice d's congest ns burne

Example 5: GB-Cgc 383/603, page 41<sup>341</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>341</sup> Image provided by Cambridge, Gonville and Caius Library.

Rybbe[scrape flax with iron tool] ne rele ne spynne yc ne may For joyghe that is holyday.

All this day ic han sou[ght;] Spyndul ne werene[flywheel of a spindle] ne wond[found]Y nought; To myche blisse ic am brout Ayen this hy halyday.

Yc moste feschun worton[herbs] in; Predele[pride] my kerchief vnder my khyn; Leue Jakke, lend me a pyn To predle me this holiday.

Now yt draweth to the none, And al my cherrus[chores] ben vndone; Y moste a lyte solas[made easy] mye schone To make hem dowge this holiday.

Y moste mylkyn in this payl; Outh me bred al this schayl; Yut is the dow yundur my nayl As ic knad this holyday.

Jakke wol brynge me onward in my wey, Wyth me desire for te play; Of my dame stant me non eyghe[awe] An neuer a god haliday. Jacke wol pay for my scoth

A Sonday ate the ale-schoch;[scot-ale-a forced contribution at a festival]

Jacke wol sowse[soak] wel my wroch[snout]

Euery god halide[y.]

Sone he wolle take me be the hand, And he wolle legge me on the lond,

That al my buttockus ben of son[d,]

Opon this hye holyday.

In he pult, and out he drow, And eur yc lay on hym y-low: 'By Godus deth, thou dest me wow Vpon this hey holyday!'

Sone my wombe began te swelle A[s] greth as a belle; Durst Y nat my dame telle Wat me betydde this holyday.<sup>342</sup>

The fate of the serving maid in 'Rybbe ne rele ne spynne yc ne may', and 'Alas ales, the wyle' is typical of this genre of carol found within many of the similar clerics' manuscripts. We find that the carols do not tend to address issues beyond the resulting pregnancy or attempt to examine the fate of the women in question. They are more interested in the pursuit of the women; the thrill of the chase would no doubt have been of much more amusement to the singers and their audience that the realities that follow. However, it is important to note that the reality is sometimes mentioned, if only fleetingly, which gives a moral edge to the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>342</sup> Greene, R.L. The Early English Carols (Oxford, 1977), 275-6

tales; placing an emphasis at the end of the carols that leaves the listener with the lasting thought that such affairs rarely end well. We must also remember that the woman was very rarely seen as an innocent party in these sorts of situations. Indeed, the medieval understanding of the female reproductive system quite clearly meant that any situation where a woman ended up pregnant must have resulted from her pleasure. Goldberg writes that:

Conception was thought to result from the mixing of the male and female sperm ejaculated through intercourse. It followed that, since sexual pleasure was necessary to stimulate the emission of seed for both women and men, conception could not occur unless the women took pleasure from the act of coitus. The implications of this were mixed. If the church pursued the line that the principal purpose of marriage was the begetting of children, then medicine dictated that pleasure in love-making for both parties was essential to conception. On the other hand; a woman who became pregnant following an alleged rape would not be believed. Similarly it was argued that prostitutes rarely conceived since they engaged in sex for money and not for pleasure.<sup>343</sup>

This perhaps explains the lack of sympathetic tone in the carols towards the pregnant young maid; a resulting pregnancy indicated a woman who had been more than happy with the situation she found herself in.<sup>344</sup> The perception of the woman as responsible for the results of such dalliances is echoed throughout this period. Indeed, Cynthia Herrup explains that even:

The laws about the consequences of wanton sexuality punished women more severely than they did men: laws against bastardy, laws against adultery; and laws against concealing pregnancy. Biology meant that a man might deny what a woman in these circumstances could not, but other statutes distinguished female from male as well: men were barraters, women scolds; men who killed their wives were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>343</sup> Goldberg, P.J.P., 'Women' in, Horrox, R., ed., *Fifteenth-Century Attitudes: Perceptions of Society in Late Medieval Britain*(Cambridge 1994), 128

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>344</sup> It is also possible that these carols were written, or included, as a disincentive to clerics that might be tempted by sexual activity. This possibility is discussed in Chapter 7: "But here the greatest melody arises without any physical instrument, when the angels minister and sing to Christ': The Carol in Sermons and Late Medieval Worship.', 256-267
murderers, women who slaughtered their husbands were petty traitors; and married men were legal adults, married women were legal children. The masculinity that ruled society was...an exceedingly "anxious masculinity".<sup>345</sup>

Women endured the expectation of different standards to those expected of men in this period, expectations that would seem to be reflected in many of the carol texts.

# Ms 54: Saints and Sinners

There is one carol that does address the fate of the pregnant women beyond stating that she was with child, 'A, dere God, qwat I am fayn', from GB-Cjc S.54. This carol tells the tale of the seduced maiden, and her resulting pregnancy, and could certainly have been used as a moral tool. It clearly conveys the anguish of the women; particularly in stanzas three and four which read:

Qwan he and me browt un us the schete,

Of all hys wyll I hym lete;

Now wyll not my gyrdyll met;

A, dere God, quat xal I say?

I xall sey to man and page

That I haue bene of pylgrymage;

Now wyll I not lete for np q[w]age

With me a clerk for to pley. <sup>346</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>345</sup> Herrup, Cynthia, 'The King's Two Genders', *Journal of British Studies*, 45/3 (July, 2006), 500

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>346</sup> For a full transcription see Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols*(Oxford, 1977), 277

The final stanza tells us of the girl's plans to tell 'man and page' that she has been on a pilgrimage. Anne Klinck suggests that the speaker plans to 'represent her unfortunate accident as a consequence of going on pilgrimage, which, she hopes, will excuse it', <sup>347</sup> but I think it more likely that Neil Cartlidge's suggestion that she has rather 'gone away in order to conceal the pregnancy and birth from her own community' more probable.<sup>348</sup> Greene has categorised this carol as 'amorous' but perhaps it should be classified as a moral carol.<sup>349</sup> The placement of this so called carol within GB-Cjc S.54 is also interesting, as it is nestled between a carol to the Virgin and a carol to St Catherine, both in some way related to women and in praise of them, which seems to further highlight the moral tale. This carol, despite being in the female voice, could just as easily be conveying this cautionary tale to a male audience. Although the cleric was in theory a man who has taken vows of celibacy, a breach of which was in England was 'seen as rare and transgressive by the later Middle Ages',<sup>350</sup> there was still an inherent danger of temptation. Composing such lyrics as those in 'A, dere God, qwat I am fayn' for a male audience, with a cleric as the protagonist, would clearly convey the dangers of one of his standing becoming embroiled in such situations, whilst lacing the tale with humour. An image of this carol can be seen on the left folio, preceded by the remainder of the carol to the Virgin, in the image in Example 6. The carol to St Catherine on the right hand folio can clearly be seen with the first line 'A, a,a,a, Salue Caterri[n]a!'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>347</sup> Klinck, Anne, Anthology of Ancient and Medieval Woman's Song (Gordonsville, 2004),139

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>348</sup> Cartlidge, Neil, "'Alas I go with chylde': Representations of extra-marital pregnancy in the middle English Lyric", *English Studies*, 79/5(1998),396

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>349</sup> We also find that Greene's categorisation of 'marriage carols', whilst again helpful, perhaps simplifies the genre. The nine marriage carols, none of which have extant musical notation, more often than not tell of the unjust treatment of a husband by his wife, and are a window into the humour of the time, and common attitudes towards women with less of a moral edge. None are in a woman's voice, but instead are mainly warnings to men by other men.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>350</sup> Cullum, P.H., Lewis, Katherine, J., eds, *Religious Men and Masculine Identity in the Middle Ages* (Woodbridge, 2013), 6

13 4000 3000 S Super Justien 122.420 20 2.10++\*241-WARAY SSAF ON BAY the conservatore is some IAAA Jahurantein 2 may 10 and Tay Ly Byn Lordy any + A Stated 1x mi 2 gan you A gesore marmett cott may 1 5555 11 800 凡代 没 的第三 OF a longly moson with man how Brechen hat a myes 408 Set Des Stur Fuff 983 got albertam tawn 1 day magen no hallar greens may No A MULTER Sound assi to michan 15 py mis St fin to hozers Fo: 60 (5mi 1708 65 cost 9 0 5 3 m 5 24-Walt note nade bott Strate Standburg ta astar that hereby 1 Stan fis and me Protite mus ? SFatting By at 117 ises Base South not they goest

Example 6: GB-Cjc S.54, f. 2v-3r

It would seem that in a manuscript such as this, a cleric's book, that highlighting the sin-free life of Mary and the saintly life of Catherine alongside the carol of the young women pregnant out of wedlock could be a powerful preaching tool.<sup>351</sup> The exact use of this manuscript is unclear, but as Daniel Wakelin comments:

The regular layout [of this manuscript] suggests that the people copying it had seen that such a layout was customary in other manuscripts, and that the scribes did have other manuscripts [...] to copy from. And the sharing of, and interruptions in, copying

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>351</sup> The use of carols in medieval sermons will be addressed in Chapter 7: "But here the greatest melody arises without any physical instrument, when the angels minister and sing to Christ': The Carol in Sermons and Late Medieval Worship.'

would seem to confirm the use of written exemplars. Yet the dominance of the carol in this book suggests that it might have existed in some relation to performance... Whoever made and used this book was not alone: the close collaboration of the people copying, over time, suggests that they were members of some steady community such as a religious house, school, household or lay guild.<sup>352</sup>

The suggestion that GB-Cjc S.54 may have originated from a steady, perhaps religious community is more than likely; the inclusion of the female carols suggesting that women were present at the events at which they would have been sung. GB-Cjc S.54 contains a total of sixteen carols; some are sacred and some secular. The secular carols all seem to have a moral message of some kind, whether it is care of money, being wary of some types of women or the dangers of illicit liaisons which would suggest their use in an establishment where the education of others in both scared and secular matters was of importance, as Wakelin suggests, and somewhere where communal singing would have played a part and where carols could have been sung together by both men and women, and perhaps used in sermons.<sup>353</sup>

# Carols by Women?

With such a number of the carols in a woman's voice (fourteen in total, with a further eight containing some female narrative), it is tempting to believe that carols such as 'A, dere God, qwat I am fayn', and 'Wolde God that hyt were so' which speaks of a woman's unspoken love of a man with such description of her anguish, did indeed have a real woman behind the text. It reads:

#### Wolde God that it were so

#### As I cowed wysshe bytuyxt vu too!

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>352</sup> Wakelin, Daniel, *MS S.54* (Cambridge, St John's College Library),3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>353</sup> The use of carols as a preaching tool within medieval sermons is discussed in Chapter 7: "But here the greatest melody arises without any physical instrument, when the angels minister and sing to Christ': The Carol in Sermons and Late Medieval Worship.'

The man that I loued altherbest [best of all] In al thys contre, est other west, To me he ys a strange gest; What wonder est thow I be woo?

When me were leuest that he schold duelle, He wold noght sey onys farewelle; He wold noght sey ones farewell Wen tyme was come that he most go.

In places ofte when I hym mete, I dar noght speke, but forth I go; With herte and eyes I hym grete; So trywe of loue I know no mo.

As he ys myn hert loue, My dyrward dyre,[dearly beloved] iblessed he be; I swere by God, that ys aboue, Non hath my loue but only he.

I am icomfortyd in eury side; The colures wexeth both fres and newe; When he ys come and wyl abyde, I wott ful wel that he ys trywe.

I loue hym trywely and no mo; Wolde God that he hyt knywe! And euer I hope hyt schal be so;

#### Then schal I change for no new.<sup>354</sup>

However, this carol is actually the perfect example of the ease in which lyrics can be changed from the feminine to the masculine voice and vice versa. We find within this manuscript, that a second scribe has inserted feminine pronouns in order to provide a carol of flexible gender that changes the speaker from a female longing for the love of a male figure, to a male longing for the love of a female figure.<sup>355</sup> This highlights the caution we must use when assigning gender to medieval lyrical forms. Anne Klinck notes that:

The activity of the girl... is limited to meeting her lover in public places, apparently by accident, leaving without speaking to him, commending him to God, and promising to be faithful. When "the man" is replaced by "she" and the pronouns are changed, the speaker metamorphoses into the male abashed lover of many a lyric in the courtly tradition.<sup>356</sup>

Although Greene suggests that 'The changing of the gender of the pronouns throughout a medieval love-lyric is rare, if not unique to this text'.<sup>357</sup> The changing of gender within appropriate carol texts, as well as other lyric forms, may indeed have been common practice, particularly if the carols were being adapted for use in different dramatic entertainments; with the need to write the gender changes into the text perhaps not deemed necessary. This change of pronouns works in the case of this particular carol, and would for a number of other carols.

The possibilities of why this would be done within this particular manuscript are not clear. GB-Lbl Additional 5943 is an eclectic mix of Latin sermons, carols, erotic English songs which have accompanying musical notation and details of the eclipses of the sun and moon to name but a few of its contents.<sup>358</sup> The manuscript bears an inscription that places it in the hands of a Carthusian monk named John, from Somerset, who had been gifted it from

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>354</sup> Greene, RL. *The Early English Carols*, (Oxford, 1935), 306

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>355</sup> British Library, MS. Additional 5943, Folio 178v

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>356</sup> Klink, Anne, L., 'Poetic Markers of Gender in Medieval "Woman's Song": Was Anonymous a Woman?!', Neophilologus, 87, (2003), 352

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>357</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols*(Oxford, 1977), 488

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>358</sup> For a full account of this manuscript see: Rastall, Richard and Hewitt, Leslie, A *Fifteenth Century Song Book, Early Music in Facsimile Vol. 1* (Leeds, 1973)

Thomas Turke, a vicar also from Somerset. We might wonder what a vicar and then a monk should need with a book containing items such as erotic songs and amorous carols. Certainly, personal amusement is a possibility, but they may also relate to the possibility that the carols and other such material were being used by the priest in his sermons in order to provoke humour whilst preaching on moral issues.<sup>359</sup> The change of gender in the carol may be an indication of change depending on need. The female carols within this manuscript are not always as brassy in content as GB-Cgc 383/603, and convey a more tender approach to love and women. 'Of all the things that God' speaks in praise of women it seems (although this carol has been damaged within this manuscript so not all the text survives) and their virtues, and 'Wolde God that hyt were so' talks of a tender love with no mention of carnal acts or pregnancy of MS 383/603.

Of course, there are many 'carols of women' that would not have been able to be altered by a simple change of pronouns. In GB-Cul Ff.5.48 for example, <sup>360</sup> a manuscript from the second half of the fifteenth century, we find the carol 'I have forsworne hit whil I live'.<sup>361</sup> This carol is written in the female voice, and reads as a cautionary tale of a young woman falling under the spell of Sir John, who leaves her pregnant and wanting. This could easily have been authored by a woman as a warning to others, but looking closer at this carol we not only find it signed 'bryan hyf my name iet', which could indicate the poem was perhaps written if not copied by a male scribe or author,<sup>362</sup> but we find the only extant copy of it within a manuscript which is more than likely to have been owned by a male cleric:

A cursory examination of the contents identifies the manuscript as a clerical miscellany. Of the twenty-eight texts, at least eleven can be characterized as catechetical, meditative, or didactic... And the selection from John *Muir's Institutions* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>359</sup> The use of the carol as a possible preaching tool is discussed in chapter seven, 'But here the greatest melody arises without any physical instrument, when the angels minister and sing to Christ': The Carol in Sermons and Late Medieval Worship'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>360</sup> For a critical edition of this manuscript see: Downing, J.Y., *A Critical Edition of Cambridge University MS Ff.5.48* (Cambridge, 1980)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>361</sup> For a full transcription of the lyric see: Greene, RL. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition (Oxford, 1977), 278 <sup>362</sup> Greene, RL. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition (Oxford, 1977), 278

*for the Parish Priest* that opens up the volume strongly suggest a priest owned the book.<sup>363</sup>

It is possible that in this cleric's manuscript, that this female-voiced carol could, as has previously been suggested, have been used in preaching to engage with the audience on a humorous level whilst illustrating a point about the dangers of submitting to carnal desires, or falling for the charms of men such as the Sir John of the carol. As Ohlgren writes:

While these tales may have served the priests' need for private enjoyment and entertainment, they also served more didactic purposes. As Fowler observed, the common denominator of the collection is the desire "to provide materials for the entertainment and instruction of a popular audience"...He cites an anonymous fifteenth-century preacher who tells his congregation "And so may I shewe to you by story, and also by ensampull of kende, and also of gestes" That is, he will enliven his sermon with examples drawn from nature and from stories of deeds or adventures.<sup>364</sup>

Again, we find Greene classifies this carol as 'amorous' but in the context of the manuscript it may be better thought of as a warning against pleasures of the flesh, and the end result of such liaisons for young women.

Although we cannot ascertain whether a female writer was behind some of the texts examined here, Schibanoff makes a valid argument for the existence of female writers and their distinct poetic style, by citing the example of Chaucer and his observations on differences between male and female poetry in *Troilus and Criseyde*.<sup>365</sup> She notes that this work contains three love songs; two in the male voice, and one in the female. She writes:

The third of these intercalated lyrics... is Chaucer's representation of a "woman's song"... Not only are the narrator and speaker of this third lyric female, but... so too

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>363</sup> Ohlgren, Thomas H., Robin Hood: The Early Poems, 1465-1560 – Texts, Contexts, and Ideology with
Appendix – The Dialects and Language of Selected Robin Hood Poems by Lister M. Matheson (Delaware, 2007),
32

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>364</sup> Ohlgren, Thomas H., Robin Hood: The Early Poems, 1465-1560 – Texts, Contexts, and Ideology with
Appendix – The Dialects and Language of Selected Robin Hood Poems by Lister M. Matheson (Delaware, 2007),
42

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>365</sup> This is a poem written by Geoffrey Chaucer c.1380, which tells the love story of Troilus and Criseyde, and the siege of Troy.

is its author – an unnamed woman, the "goodlieste mayde" in all Troy… Most generally, it can illustrate that at least one Medieval author seems to recognize the difference in male and female poetic styles and that his conception of them may not coincide with modern ideas on this subject. It also suggests that one medieval author sees "lament" or "complaint" as a male subject and rhetorical stance, "celebration" as female ones.<sup>366</sup>

One of course, must still be wary of accepting the representation of female style as female voice. This use of male and female style is also seen in used by Machaut in his 'Livre dou Voir Dit' which purports to be an exchange of poems between the lover (Machaut) and his lady (Toute Belle). Machaut's representation of Toute Belle as a writer of music and poetry is interesting. It is essentially based on her lack of feminine, emotional control in contrast to his more stable output. Findley notes that the narrator in this work depicts the female writing process as:

strikingly erotic, involving emotions that spiral out of control and affect her body. In three episodes he describes Toute Belle composing poetry in the grip of passionate feelings. This...state leads her to spout completed pieces without any intermediate process of planning or revision.<sup>367</sup>

The male writer however, is depicted as composing in a far more controlled style, writing 'through disciplined, daily work on a regular schedule, as when he produces one poem for his lady on each day of a nine-day pilgrimage, or when he boasts that he is writing exactly a hundred verses per day in her book'. <sup>368</sup> Interestingly though, Toute Belle herself does not seem to share this 'link between the poems she composes and the emotions she is feeling'. <sup>369</sup> Her voice gives a greater sense of control than the male narrator wishes to portray. The female voice, it would seem, although acknowledged in the Middle Ages, is still difficult to find amongst the conceived male perception of what it should sound like and how it is created.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>366</sup> Schibanoff, S., 'Anonymous Was a Man?', *Tulsa Studies in Women's Literature*, Vol. ½ (Autumn, 1982), 194-196

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>367</sup> Findley, Brooke Heidenreich, *Poet Heroines in Medieval French Narrative* (New York, 2012), 93

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>368</sup> Findley, Brooke Heidenreich, *Poet Heroines in Medieval French Narrative* (New York, 2012), 95

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>369</sup> Findley, Brooke Heidenreich, *Poet Heroines in Medieval French Narrative* (New York, 2012), 98

In the case of medieval carols, the convention for women to write such lyrics is not necessarily as unusual as we might think; the women trouvères and troubadours are a testimony to the work of women in the medieval period, and not forgetting the most famous of all the medieval female composers, Hildegard of Bingen.<sup>370</sup> Indeed, Paula Higgins argues for the existence of the female songwriter in her exploration of the Scottish Princess, Margaret Stuart who married the French King in the early fifteenth century, who was alleged to be writing ballades and rondeaux to the quantity of a dozen in a day. She argues that evidence suggests that the poetry being written by Margaret and her ladies, Jacqueline de Hacqueville in particular, who she argues is the Jacqueline of Busnoys's lyrics, could well be in notated manuscripts. She writes:

Without wishing to exaggerate unduly the role of women in the literary and musical culture of the late Middle Ages, I would nevertheless suggest that the evidence which reveals that at least half a dozen women in a single court of the 1440s were writing poetry that survives in the same manuscripts from which many texts set to music were drawn would seem to dispel the notion that Christine de Pizan was the only woman of the Middle Ages writing poetry. <sup>371</sup>

The tradition of female song writing is there, and there is no reason to suspect that women in the fifteenth century were not continuing this tradition. Having no named female carol composers does not automatically mean they did not exist; we must not assume that anonymous is always male, or if in a woman's voice, female. The assumption of course that female-voiced works are the most likely to be written by women may also be precarious, as there is nothing to suggest a woman would not also have written using the voice of a man.

#### Conclusion

It would seem then, that the late medieval carol has much to say about women, their place in society, and most importantly, their involvement as creators, participant and receivers of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>370</sup> For introductory literature and editions of the work of the female troubadours and trouveres see: Bogin, M., *The Women Troubadours* (New York, 1980) and Doss-Quinby, Tasker Grimbert, Pfeffer and Aubrey, *Songs of the Women Trouveres* (New Haven, 2001)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>371</sup> Higgins, Paula, 'Parisian Nobles, a Scottish Princess, and the Woman's Voice in Late Medieval Song', *Early Music History*, Vol. 10 (1991), 169

medieval carols. The Egerton carol 'Comidentes convenite' conveys the presence of women at important feasts, sitting alongside illustrations of women revellers and a motet that speaks of female company, and the refined nature of the female carols of the Henry VIII manuscript, and their aristocratic female voices demonstrates a high-class genre of 'carols of women'. The many carols that demonstrate the need for women to be present at their performance; whether poking fun at women, addressing them or offering them moral guidance, demonstrates female involvement in carolling at some level. The range of carols that have been identified within this chapter and; speak directly to women, speak in a female voice, are about women or contain an amount of female narrative is testament to the involvement of women in some capacity, whether as subject, audience, performers or composers in the world of the medieval carols. The extent of the involvement and significance of women in the context of the medieval carol should not, in face of this evidence, be underestimated.

# **Chapter Six**

# The Medieval Carol: a vehicle for political commentary and English nationalism.

Throughout the previous chapters, the carol has been examined from a number of different perspectives: its relationship with other fifteenth-century genres; in terms of authorship; lost popular song; and from a gender perspective. Examining the carol in these different ways has allowed a more three-dimensional view of the late medieval carol than has been achieved by previous commentators. One important area that still needs to be addressed however is the carol as a vehicle for political commentary and English nationalism. This chapter aims to address the carol from this aspect and explore how it can convey a political message in a peculiarly English style.

England in the fifteenth century was a land of wars and political turmoil; its focus on war with France in the early part of the century quickly turned into its own inner turmoil, and a bloody civil war between the house of Lancaster and the house of York for control of the English crown ensued. Alessandra Petrina writes that:

The century itself defies definition. There is something deeply contradictory about the English fifteenth century...From the historian's point of view, it is a time fraught with interest: it is during this century that the English nation finds its modern identity and is ultimately released, even through the endless vicissitudes of the Hundred Years' War, from its connection with France and the French crown; meanwhile the deposition of an anointed King, Richard II, introduces a time of almost frenetic changes, concluding with the ascent to the throne of the first Tudor King and the beginning of a very long period of relative political stability.<sup>372</sup>

England is, despite the turmoil, sowing the seeds of a strong national identity in this period. This identity is reflected in the language and literature of the time, and can be traced back to the writings of the poet Geoffrey Chaucer in the late fourteenth century, and his use of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>372</sup> Petrina, Alessandra, *Cultural Politics in Fifteenth-Century England* (Leiden, 2001)

the English language for his poetry rather than the favoured languages of the pen; French and Latin. Although Chaucer is seen as the founder of this movement, Krishan Kumar advises caution at placing too much emphasis on his impact as 'it seems that even the English that emerged as 'standard English' was shaped less by the poets than the clerks of chancery'.<sup>373</sup> Alessandro Petrina explains the distribution of language at this time:

By the beginning of the century , the hitherto little challenged co-existence of three languages in England - Latin in ecclesiastical and academic circles, French at court and in the centres of administration and power, English as the language commonly spoken by the King's subjects - was meeting a number of challenges.<sup>374</sup>

The growth of the English language was further helped by King Henry V, the first King with English as his first language, in the early part of the fifteenth century, and Petrino suggests his decision to make it not only his spoken, but also his written language had its roots in politics and the growing sense of nationhood, noting that:

It is significant that Henry V's switch from French to English in his correspondence occurs in 1417, that is, the year of his second invasion of France; it seems to show that the turning point in the English linguistic policy took place at exactly the same moment in which the French adventure appeared to concretise itself into an acquisition of permanent dominions. Henceforth, Henry would write in English...his use of language as a political weapon had a decisive meaning and showed this king's awareness of the propaganda value of language.<sup>375</sup>

The carols, although written in English, French and Latin, are predominantly English, and thus reflect this growing use of the vernacular in other fields.<sup>376</sup>

By the beginning of the fifteenth century, the carol seems to have evolved into a specifically English structure of musical and lyrical expression; something that has become exclusively English in the fifteenth century, and stays that way, echoing the national development of Englishness. As Stevens writes:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>373</sup> Kumar, Krishan, The Making of English National Identity (Cambridge, 2003)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>374</sup> Petrina, Alessandro, *Cultural Politics in Fifteenth-Century England* (Leiden, 2001), 81

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>375</sup> Petrina, Alessandro, *Cultural Politics in Fifteenth-Century England* (Leiden, 2001), 83

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>376</sup> The use of language in the political carols is addressed later in this thesis.

The recurrent burden and the dominance of the stanza-pattern *aaab* link the carol with a family of European lyric-forms. The courtly French *virelai* and the Italian *balata* are closely related to the carol from the formal point of view, while the Italian *lauda* resembles the carol in form and spirit. It is clear that in the carol we have the English representative of this family, and its importance is substantiated by the survival of nearly 500 distinct vernacular lyrics in this form.<sup>377</sup>

Many of the carols are particularly nationalistic; conveying a pride in England and its achievements on the world stage, keeping tales of English saints alive, or pleading for the deliverance of England from her enemies. In total, there are twenty-six carols with and without musical notation that survive which are political in nature; by political it is meant carols that recount political events, carols associated with royalty, and carols associated with the politically significant saints St George and St Thomas of Canterbury.

The carol by the fifteenth century had become a particularly English form of poetical and musical expression, despite academic theory that places its origins in the early French dance, the *carole*, it developed and grew into a very distinct style of its own; a purely musical device. Judging by the amount of surviving lyrics, it clearly was a popular form of music in fifteenth-century England, one which could convey either a sacred or secular message; both sit comfortably alongside one another within extant manuscripts. It will be argued later in this chapter, that this very English form of musical expression made it the perfect vehicle for conveying the growing sense of English nationhood and identity in the fifteenth century.

# Political Carols in Manuscripts with Musical Notation

There are a total of eighteen carols, from fifteenth-century and early sixteenth-century musically notated manuscripts, that contain strongly political lyrics, or indeed lyrics that convey something about England or the Saints George and Thomas of Canterbury. The political carols with musical notation are listed in Table 27. There are another eight political

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>377</sup> Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London 1970), xiii

carols that survive without notation, which will be addressed at a later juncture within in this study.

Carol	Manuscript	Folio number	Subject
Deo Gracias Anglia	GB-Ctc 0.3.58 Gb-Obl Selden b.26	No. 7 17v	Henry V and victory at Agincourt in 1415
Princeps pacis	GB-Lbl GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	49v-50	Royal law, victory and peace
Anglia, tibi turbidas	GB-Lbl GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	60v-61	Plea for England and friendship with others
Benedicte Deo	GB-Lbl GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	61v	England and France to bless the Lord
Saint Thomas honour we	GB-Lbl GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	62v-3	St Thomas of Canterbury
Enforce we us	GB-Lbl GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	63v	St George and the battle of Agincourt
Exultavit cor	GB-Lbl GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	64v	Henry V
Princeps Serenissime	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	64v	In praise of King Henry VI
Jesu, for they mercy	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	44v-45	Scottish Truce or perhaps the Wars of the Roses
Letare Cantuaria	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	27v-28	St Thomas of Canterbury
Clangat Tuba	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	41v-42	St Thomas of Canterbury
I love, I love and whom love thee	GB-Lbl Additional 5465	40v-46	Celebration of the end of the Wars of the Roses and the birth of Henry VII's child
From stormy windes	GB-Lbl Additional 5465	104v-108	For the protection of Prince Arthur (son of Henry VII)
This day day dawes	GB-Lbl Additional 5465	108v-109r	For Queen Elizabeth, wife of Henry VII

Enforce yourself as Goddes knight	GB-Lbl Additional 5465	115v-118	Henry VII or VIII
Though sum sayeth	Gb-Lbl Additional 31922	71v-72r	By Henry VIII
Whiles life or breath	Gb-Lbl Additional 31922	54v-55	About Henry VIII through eyes of Catherine. Could also be categorised as amorous.
England, be glad	Gb-Lbl Additional 31922	100v-102	Invasion of France in 1513

Table 27: Extant notated carols with political lyrics, or lyrics associated with St Thomas or St George in notated carol manuscripts <sup>378</sup>

Apart from the Trinity Roll, there are a number of political carols found in each manuscript. In order to see the popularity of the political carol in each manuscript, Table 28 illustrates the number and percentage weighting of their inclusion.

Manuscript	Number of Carols	Number of Political Carols	Percentage of Carols
			that are Political
Trinity Roll	13	1	8%
Selden	31	1	3%
Egerton	33	7	21%
Ritson	45	3	7%
Fayrfax	18	4	22%
Henry VIII	13	3	23%

Table 28: The number and percentage weighting of political carols in musically notated manuscripts

<sup>378</sup> The fully Latin texted carols such as 'Exulatavit Cor', 'Letare Cantuaria' and 'Anglia Tibi Turbidas' are not listed in Greene, R.L, *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935). The inclusion of carols to St Thomas of Canterbury and St George are due to their strong nationalistic and political connection.

The carols 'England, be glad' and 'Though some saith' are modified carols, in as much as there is no indication of the repetition of the burden. These carols have been included here as an example of carol development and modification.

# Carols to Saint George and Saint Thomas of Canterbury

Saint George, although a particularly popular figure prior to the fifteenth century and seen as protector of the English, came to particular prominence in the early part of the fifteenth century when Henry V invoked him as the patron Saint of England at the battle of Agincourt in 1415. Many soldiers believed they had seen Saint George fighting in the battle for the English side, and as a result of English success the feast of St George was given principal status by the Archbishop of Canterbury, Archbishop Chichele, in the same year.<sup>379</sup> There is one musically notated carol dedicated in its entirety to Saint George, 'Enforce we us' from the Egerton manuscript, a manuscript that is particularly politically charged, and will be addressed later in this chapter in detail. The carol reads:

#### Enforce we us with all our might

#### To love Saint George our Lady knight.

Worship of virtue is the meed,

And sueth him ay of right;

To worship George then have we need,

Which is our sov'reign lady's knight.

He kept the maid from dragon's dread,

And fraid all France and put to flight

at Agincourt, the chronicle ye read;

The French him see formost in fight.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>379</sup> For more detail on the cult of St George and what he came to represent in political terms, see: Good, Jonathan, *The Cult of Saint George in Medieval England* (Michigan, 2009)

In his virtue he will us lead Againes the fiend, the foul wight, And with his banner overspread, If we him love with all our might.<sup>380</sup>

This carol is written for two voices, one high and one low (although at points within the verse the voices overlap in pitch, which is not unusual in carol repertoire) and is typical in terms of the style of carols in this period. Egerton, as we have seen, employs two- and three-voice carols in almost equal measure.<sup>381</sup> This carol has only one burden, typical of almost half the carols in this manuscript. Example 1 shows this piece in its entirety.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>380</sup> This transcription is taken from Stevens, John, ed., *Medieval Carols* (London, 1970), 49. For a transcription in the full Middle English, see: Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (Oxford, 1988), 190-191
<sup>381</sup> For a table of voice use in the musically notated manuscripts see Chapter 1:'The carol: musical; features and previous scholarship', page 36.



Example 1: 'Enforce we us'<sup>382</sup>

Greene categorises this under the heading 'carols of saints', but due to Saint George's position as protector of the English, and his supposed aid in defeating the French, this carol deserves political status.<sup>383</sup> The importance of Saint George is depicted in the fifteenth-century manuscript GB-Lbl Add.18850, commonly known as the Bedford Hours, and seen in Example 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>382</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 49

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>383</sup> There is an additional carol without musical notation 'Prey we to the Trinyte' from GB-Ob Eng.poet.e.1 which mentions Saint George within its sixth stanza. This carol is not dedicated to the Saint in its entirety and is not overtly political therefore has not been included in this table. This carol is a Litany, and is discussed in further detail in Chapter 7, 'But here the greatest melody arises without any physical instrument, when the angels minister and sing to Christ': The Carol in Sermons and Late Medieval Worship. For a full transcription, see: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 212-213



Example 2: GB-Lbl Add. 18850, f.256v<sup>384</sup>

This image from c. 1424 depicts the Duke of Bedford, brother to King Henry V, kneeling in prayer before St George, dressed in his armour. The cross of Saint George is being visibly held in the background. This page shows the importance of the Saint as a political figure. The Saint was also venerated in other lyrical and poetic forms of the time as the motet 'Christe miles' by John Cooke, most probably used for daily procession in the chapel royal, demonstrates. Robert Nosow writes:

The motetus voice addresses St George as the "Renowned soldier of Christ/…/who art the glory of all warriors." It asks that he "Entreat mercy of the mother/of all grace,/ that she may bring help,/ May protect her country/and guard the King/ from the invasion of enemies." The cogent imagery reflect the charged atmosphere during the wars with France...These lines explicate or gloss the tenor, which reads, "Defend

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>384</sup> This image is freely available online from the British Library: http://www.bl.uk/onlinegallery/sacredtexts/bedford.html

us Christ, from our enemies."...Addressing both St. George and St. Mary in the final two stanzas, it goes on to urgently request peace/in our times."<sup>385</sup>

Both carol and motet portray Saint George as saviour and protector of England, and the placement of the motet within the chapel royal again establishes the prominence of the Saint as a political symbol of the nation.

Saint Thomas of Canterbury is also included as a politically charged saint due to his assassination at the hands of King Henry II's knights in December 1170. Saint Thomas became an enormously popular saint, with more parish churches in England dedicated to him than any other. Example 3 shows the veneration of St Thomas in the early fifteenth century within York Minster; a testament to his enduring legacy during this period.



Example 3: Fifteenth-Century Image of St Thomas of Canterbury<sup>386</sup>

Greene, as with the carols to Saint George, however, chooses not to place the extant carols of Saint Thomas within his political categorisation, but sets them out in a category of their own.<sup>387</sup> The cult of St Thomas was still strong in the fifteenth century however, and one cannot deny the political undertones that go with this saint. As Helen Parish notes:

Within 50 years of his death, there was already evidence of some disquiet about Becket's status as a saint. In a debate with Peter the Cantor in 1220, Roger the Norman had criticised the assumption that Becket had died a holy death for the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>385</sup> Nosow, Robert Michael, *Ritual Meanings in the Fifteenth-Century Motet* (New York, 2012), 14 <sup>386</sup> Image from the aisle of the north choir, York Minster c.1415-20Image freely available online at:

http://vidimus.org/issues/issue-32/panel-of-the-month/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>387</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935)

church, and proposed instead that he deserved to be damned for his traitorous behaviour towards the divinely appointed King, Henry II...In 1429, William Emyan, of Bristol alleged that Thomas Becket was no more of a Saint that William Wycliffe, while one Margery Backster denounced Becket as a liar and a coward whose miracles and prophesies were heresies.<sup>388</sup>

There is no denying the political undertones of cult of Saint Thomas; the eventual attempt by Henry VIII to erase his cult entirely due to his status as a traitor to the crown attests to this, and therefore for the purposes of this study, the carols of St Thomas must be included within the political carol categorisation.

There are three carols that survive to Saint Thomas of Canterbury: 'Letare cantuaria', 'Clangat Tuba' and Saint Thomas honour we'. 'Saint Thomas honour we' is found in the Egerton manuscript, and the remaining two are extant in the Ritson manuscript. The placement of the carol for Saint Thomas in Egerton re-enforces its position as a political carol, as it is found nestled amongst other carols that are unmistakeably political.<sup>389</sup> The Ritson manuscript contains only three political carols out of a total of 44, and two of these carols are in honour of Saint Thomas.<sup>390</sup> Both of the carols are labelled in the manuscript 'sancto Thoma', and no other carols to saints are found within this manuscript, thus perhaps showing a particular affiliation to him over other saints, not unexpected perhaps considering that within Exeter Cathedral, most probably connected to the Ritson manuscript, there hangs a fourteenth-century boss depicting his murder, and in the twelfth-century the saint was supposed to have appeared to the master of the choristers informing him that the Bishop, Bishop Bartholomew, was unwell, and instructed the choir to sing the Psalter in its entirety to aid his recovery.<sup>391</sup> The carols do not sit near one another in the manuscript, but are placed amongst nativity carols and carols for the epiphany. Both carols are typical of the manuscript in terms of form and structure: both have two burdens, with burden one scored

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>388</sup> Parish, Helen, *Monks, Miracles, And Magic: Reformation Representation of the Medieval Church* (London, 2005), 95

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>389</sup> This point will be expanded later in this chapter.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>390</sup> The remaining political carol in this manuscript is either in celebration of the truce with Scotland, or the Wars of the Roses; the true nature of its text is uncertain.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>391</sup> http://www.ofchoristers.net/Chapters/Exeter.htm from: Page, Anne, A History of Cathedral Choir Schools (n.p., n.d.)

for two voices, and burden two for three. There is a difference in the use of language however, 'Letare Cantuaria' is written entirely in Latin and in translation reads:

Rejoice, O Canterbury, In the victory of St. Thomas Let the English nation rejoice in praising the holy martyr,

For the feast day of the blessed Archbishop Thomas now shines upon us,

While he lived, his life blossomed with the exercise of his virtues; He showed justice to all people when they demanded it.

He worshipped God steadfastly, While watching over his flock; And he showed, as was most fitting, That he was a servant of Christ.<sup>392</sup>

The use of the phrase 'English nation' within this carol for Saint Thomas is particularly evocative. Both of these carols are found to be vandalised, most probably due to Henry VIII's reformation, and his eradication of the worship of Saint Thomas. The popularity of St Thomas as a saint would suggest that many more carols dedicated to him may have existed that are now lost to us; indeed many other setting such as motets and masses may also now be lost. The existence of a large body of extant musical works dedicated to the saint and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>392</sup> Translation from: Stevens, John, ed., *The Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 145

collected together by Denis Stevens reveals the possibility of a larger corpus.<sup>393</sup> As Denis Stevens notes however:

Without doubt, many compositions in honour of St. Thomas perished in the Middle Ages in the same way as other motets and Masses perished: they were considered old fashioned and joined the pile of discarded parchment in the bookbinder's workshop. At a somewhat later stage, the Reformation made its own rather more deliberate contribution. But in spite of all this, enough remains to prove the enthusiasm and skill with which poets and composers sought to perpetuate the name of an unforgettable character in the history of the Western world.<sup>394</sup>

The carols too then, have captured the essence of this 'unforgettable character', and make up only a small section of the surviving corpus of English (and continental) music dedicated to the saint.

### The Political Carols of Egerton 3307

The majority of the carols in Table 27 are found in the impressive Egerton manuscript.<sup>395</sup> A large manuscript, from circa 1450, the Egerton manuscript is comprised of two very distinct sections; the first containing processional music for use in Holy Week, and the second containing thirty-one carols plus three other songs with secular texts. The importance of this manuscript in terms of this study, is not only its inclusion of so many political texts, but that it contains the largest amount of political carols, extant with notation and without, that are found within any one manuscript, and that they are grouped together at the heart of the carols.

Egerton, in comparison to some other carol manuscripts from this period, is particularly well executed; this is no random notebook. The choice and grouping of these carols would

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>393</sup> Stevens, Denis, 'Music in Honor of St. Thomas of Canterbury', *The Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 56/3 (July, 1970), 311-348

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>394</sup> Stevens, Denis, 'Music in Honor of St. Thomas of Canterbury', *The Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 56/3 (July, 1970), 344-355

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>395</sup> GB-Lbl Egerton 3307

therefore appear to be deliberate. Its quality of scribal work, illuminations and sense of order would suggest its compilation for use in an establishment of some importance. Debates over its provenance have not yet come to any definitive conclusions; although the two main candidates for place of origin remain Meaux Abbey in Yorkshire, or the more southerly, St George's Chapel in Windsor.<sup>396</sup> Alternately, according to G. McPeek, there may indeed be a connection with the area of Hythe on the south east coast, rather than the previously thought village of Hythe in Yorkshire. McPeek suggests this alternative location due to the inclusion of the (non-political) carol 'Ivy is Good', which sits immediately before the group of political carols at the heart of the carols section, and includes in its final verse the name of 'hye' which could allude to this town. The final verse reads:

Where it taketh hold it keepeth fast And strenketh it that is him by; It keepeth wall from cost and waste, As men may see all day at hye: Ivy: I can tell no cause why

But we must love that gentle tree.<sup>397</sup>

McPeek, noting the appropriateness of Hythe due to this geographical area being particularly well known for its ivy in the Middle Ages, writes:

there is another village which well could be the one meant in the carol, namely, Hythe, located on the coast seventy miles south-east of London. The connection of Hythe with the ruling houses of England has been a matter of record for many

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>396</sup> For more detail on the debate over the provenance of this manuscript see: Schofield, B. 'A Newly Discovered 15<sup>th-</sup> Century Manuscript of the English Chapel Royal', *Musical Quarterly*, 32 (1946), 509-36, and, Greene, R. 'Two Medieval Manuscripts: Egerton 3307 and some University of Chicago Fragments', *Journal of the American Musicological Association*, 7 (1954), 1-34. Although both of these publications are from a number of decades ago, the debate has not moved on from these initial thoughts.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>397</sup> Stevens, John, *Mediaeval* Carols, (London, 1970), 44

centuries. Moreover, the area round Hythe was noted for its sylvan beauty, and particularly for its profuse growth of ivy. Apparently it was something of a pleasure resort and has been visited frequently by the English royal court. In view of the known connection between Hythe and Henry V and VI in affairs of state, it is entirely possible that business as well as pleasure could have made the area well known to the Royal court and all those in any way closely connected with it. <sup>398</sup>

Although alluding to a connection with Hythe, McPeek chooses not to explore this avenue further instead dismissing it as being of relevance only in that those attending St George's Chapel in Windsor would possibly have known about Hythe and would therefore have understood its inclusion within the manuscript. However, could there be a possibility of a more local connection to the manuscript? Perhaps scholars are too eager to connect extant sources to the most prestigious locations and should also be looking at more provincial possibilities. For example, Hythe was certainly a town of importance in the Middle Ages, providing a port and no less than two castles, one of which, if a more local connection was established, may have proved to have been of interest; the castle of Saltwood. The Archbishop of Canterbury's palace for a great majority of its life until the reign of Henry VII, Saltwood was a Bishop's palace of some prominence, and contained within its walls its own chapel dedicated to the Saints Mary and Thomas of Canterbury, and housed its own resident priests:

King John, in his first year, restored the possession of it to the see of Canterbury, to be held of him *in capite*. From which time it became one of the palaces for the archbishops residence, and they appointed a constable for the chief government of it under them. And I find by the patent-rolls, that king Edward II. in his 19th year, was lodged in this castle. Archbishop Courtenay, who came to the see in the 5th year of king Richard II. beautified and enlarged it at a very considerable expence, and inclosed a park round it, making it his usual residence; and archbishop Chicheley

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>398</sup> McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript GB-Lbl Egerton 3307* (London, 1963), 12

resided here anno 4 Henry V. as did at times several of his successors, till archbishop Warham, in the 22d year of king Henry VIII.<sup>399</sup>

Is it therefore possible that this type of establishment could have been connected with a manuscript such as Egerton? It is certainly not impossible. McPeek notes the inclusion of the carol for Thomas of Canterbury as an unusual choice for inclusion at St George's Chapel in Windsor:

One may question the appropriateness of a performance at Windsor of the song about Thomas a Becket.<sup>400</sup>

This carol would however, be entirely appropriate in a chapel dedicated to him, and certainly would not be unexpected in the palace of the Archbishop of Canterbury. The lyrics of this carol read:

#### Saint Thomas honour we,

#### thro whose blood Holy Church is made free.

All Holy Church was but a thrall, thro King and temporal lordes all, he was slain in Christes hall and set all thing in unity, and set all thing in unity; his death hath such auctority.

The King exiled him out of land, the King exiled him out of land, and took his good in his hand, for bidding both free and bond that no prayer for him should be, that no prayer for him should be;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>399</sup> 'Parishes: Saltwood', *The History and Topographical Survey of the County of Kent: Volume 8* (1799), pp. 218-231. URL: http://www.british-history.ac.uk/report.aspx?compid=63477&strquery=saltwood castle Date accessed: 19 July 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>400</sup> McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript GB-Lbl Egerton 3307* (London, 1963), 11

so fierce he shewed his cruelty.

All ben exiled that to him lang, all ben exiled that to him lang, women, children, old men among, young babes that weeped instead of song; Saint Thomas said; welcome ye be; ilk land is now your own country. <sup>401</sup>

The overtly political nature of the carols within the Egerton manuscript would seem appropriate in a setting such as Saltwood, a castle that for much of its life 'seems to have enjoyed an uneasy dual occupation between priests and prelates on the one side, and the noblemen or garrison commanders on the other'.<sup>402</sup> The celebration of Henry the V and VI within the carols may also seem appropriate within this setting, not only due to its dual occupation, but also considering the Archbishop of Canterbury's close connection with Henry V and the battle of Agincourt, where he was present at the King's side. Archbishop Chichele, who was Archbishop until 1443, was also present at the siege of Rouen, negotiating the surrender of the city in 1419 on behalf of Henry V. The inclusion of secular pieces such as the drinking song 'O Potores', would have also been appropriate in such a setting; Christmas celebrations would have taken place with members of the clergy, military figures and members of the castle household. This would certainly have included women, rendering the carol 'Comidentes convenite' which specifically addresses women, to be particularly appropriate.

Much of the argument for St George's Chapel as the place of origin for this manuscript is based around the inclusion of the processional hymn dedicated to St. George, 'Salve festa dies'. McPeek argues that due to its inclusion in the liturgy and its placement with the other liturgical hymns 'indicates the probability either of an establishment dedicated to St. George or a chapel in his honour within a large establishment'.<sup>403</sup> Unfortunately, no reference to any altar or dedication to St George has yet been found in relation to Saltwood; extant

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>401</sup> For a full transcription, including a musical setting see: Stevens, John, *Mediaeval* Carols, (London, 1970), 48
<sup>402</sup>Clark, Alan, *Saltwood Castle* (Leciester, 1975), 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>403</sup> McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript GB-Lbl Egerton 3307* (London, 1963), 11

information is scant on the castle and chapel. If a connection with Saltwood was indeed unattainable on this count, there could still perhaps be a connection with Canterbury itself; indeed Hythe was well known to the Archbishop and his fellow priests, the palace/castle of Saltwood being a favourite residence, and would have had significance to them in Canterbury celebrations. Whether Saltwood could have indeed been a possible location for this manuscript or not, the point here is that it is imperative that scholars look to provincial locations for extant manuscripts as well as royal courts, Abbeys and Cathedrals; less obvious locations might be less of a glamorous option, but may be just as valid.

Although the majority of the carols within the Egerton manuscript are centred upon the Feast of the Nativity, there are no less than seven carols that provide a commentary on English politics, and six of these carols are found grouped very closely together, from folios 60v to 64v. I would argue that in a manuscript as well executed and organised as Egerton that this grouping was no accident. The order of the carols in Egerton can be seen in Table 29. The seven stanza long carol 'Saint Thomas honour we', also sits within this group of political carols, and it could be argued, that its inclusion within the body of such a strong grouping of political texts confirms its presence there on a political level, and would suggest that the decision to give the carols of Saint Thomas political status within this thesis is justified. Certainly, a carol to Saint Thomas of Canterbury is not out of place in a carol section that predominantly celebrates Christmas; St Thomas' feast day lies on the 29<sup>th</sup> of December and would therefore have been celebrated within the same period as the Nativity and New Year carols, but its position within the carols makes it appear to be of greater interest.

Тороѕ	Folio Number	Title
Nativity	folio 49	Tibi laus tibi gloria
Nativity/political	Ff 49v-50	Princeps pacis
Nativity	ff50v-51	David ex progenie
Nativity	f 51v	Novo profusi gaudio
Nativity		Novus sol de virgine
Nativity	ff53v-54	Sol occasum nesciens
Saint Stephen	f. 54	The holy martyr Stephen
Nativity	f.55	Qui natus est de virgine
Nativity	ff. 55v-57	Ave rex angelorum
Nativity	ff.57v-58	Cum virtus magnifica
Nativity	ff.58v-59	Illuminare Jerusalem
lvy	ff.59v-60	Ivy is good

Political	ff.60v-61	Anglia, tibi turbidas
Political	f.61v	Benedicte Deo
Saint John	f.62	Johannes, Jesu care
Saint Thomas (political)	f.62	Saint Thomas honour we
Poitical	f.63v	Enforce we us
Political	f.64	Exultavit cor
Political	f.64v	Princeps serenissime
Nativity	f.65	Ecce, quod natura
Nativity	ff.65v-66	Almighty Jesu
Moral Counsel	f.66v	I pray you all
Nativity	f.67	Ave, plena gracia
Nativity	f.7v	Verbum patris
Nativity	f.68	Illuxit leticia
Refrain Song	f.68v	Omnes una gaudemus
Nativity	f.69	Alleluia: Diva natalicia
Nativity	f.69v-70	Omnis caterva fidelium
Women's address	ff.70v-71	Comedentes convenite
Nativity	f.71v	Gaudeamus pariter
Nativity	f.72	Parit virgo filium
Drinking Song – not a carol	f.72v-75	O potores exquisite
	f.75v-77	Cantemus domino socie
Carol no text	ff.77v-78	
Blank page	f.78v	
Nativity	f.79	Lauda salvatorem
Т	able 29: The order of carols in Eg	erton

What also makes Egerton's large group of political carols of such interest is that it is the largest extant gathering of political carols in any one manuscript of the fifteenth century. In all other carol manuscripts, no more than three political carols exist per manuscript. This inclusion of such a large group at the heart of the carol section therefore suggests a strong political slant to any Christmas festivities within the establishment Egerton was designed for; an establishment where the celebration of English politics and English monarchs would have seemed wholly appropriate alongside carols of the Nativity and the New Year. But how and why would carols such as these have been included in Christmas festivities; or were they not?

# Political Carols in the Ritson Manuscript: the Political Carol in the Celebration

# of Christmas

Ritson, 'the most important indigenous musical source between the Old Hall manuscript and the Eton Choirbook'<sup>404</sup> is one manuscript that goes a little way to helping us understand the inclusion of this genre of carol in the celebration of the Christmas period. It dates from between 1460-1510, and contains a total of 44 carols, which are found in the earliest layer of the manuscript, as well as 43 other polyphonic compositions from a later period. <sup>405</sup> Only three of these 44 carols are either political in nature or shows strong affiliation to an English saint: 'Jesu for thy mercy',' Letare Cantuaria' and 'Clangat Tuba'.

What is of particular interest in the carol section of this manuscript is the labelling, contemporary to the musical notation, of each piece. Each carol is labelled either, 'in die nativitatis', 'de sancto Maria', 'de sancto Johanne', 'de innocentibus','in die circumcisionis', 'Sancta Stephani', 'de nativitate Domini','de sancto Thoma''Epiphanie', 'ad placitum' and 'in fine nativitatis'. Only one carol is given no label at all, *Salve, sancta parens*, a carol for the Virgin. *Jesu for thy mercy*, a political carol, which as Greene notes, 'may refer to the danger to the English truce with Scotland in 1499' or 'Another possibility is that the carol is of earlier date, and that the strife of Lancaster and York is the subject',<sup>406</sup> is given the same instructions as those carols of moral counsel, and is clearly labelled 'ad placitum' translating as 'at pleasure'. This labelling of the political carol within Ritson as 'ad placitum' may allude to the fact that there were no hard and fast rules for the inclusion of secular and indeed political, carols, that they were performed within the Christmas celebrations as the instruction reads 'at pleasure'.

The two carols for the veneration of Saint Thomas are labelled as 'de sancto Thoma'. 'Letare, Cantuaria', which talks of an English nation, with verse one reading 'Gens Anglorum gaudeat in laudem pii martiris' ['Let the English nation rejoice in praising the holy martyr'], is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>404</sup> Lane, Eleanor and Sandon, Nick, *The Ritson Manuscript, liturgical compositions, Votive Antiphons, Te Deum* (np,2001), i

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>405</sup> For more discussion of provenance and dating see: Lane, Eleanor and Sandon, Nick, *The Ritson Manuscript, liturgical compositions, Votive Antiphons, Te Deum* (np,2001), Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), xxii and 125, and, Stevens, John, *Early Tudor Songs and Carols* (London, 1975), xvii-xix

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>406</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carol* (Oxford, 1935), 443

situated between two carols for the Nativity, again suggesting the compiler of the manuscript thought a carol such as this was appropriate within the celebration of the nativity. <sup>407</sup>

The non-musically notated manuscript GB-LbI Additional 31042 (the London Thornton Manuscript), also offers a substantial, and important clue to the inclusion and performance of the political carol within Christmas celebrations.<sup>408</sup> 'The Rose es the fairest flour of alle', a carol in which, 'The allusion is to Henry V and the Agincourt campaign'<sup>409</sup>, is found with a heading that reads 'A Carolle for Crystynmesse', thus indicating very clearly that a political carol such as this was perfectly acceptable within Christmas celebrations, and that it was perhaps the form, one that most probably encouraged group singing with the constant repetition of a burden, that was important for performance in these celebrations and not necessarily the textual content.

The reference to an 'English nation' in the carol 'Letare, Cantuaria' is interesting, as minority of history scholars have claimed that England had developed no real sense of nation or nationalism until the late sixteenth century. Krishan Kumar for example, argues that:

The medieval world was at once too cosmopolitan and too particular, too international and too local, to give rise to a strong sense of nationhood...It is the basis of the rejection...of the idea that anything like a real sense of English nationhood or English nationalism...existed, or could exist in the medieval period, from the seventh or eighth to the fourteenth or fifteenth centuries. However strong and well defined the English *state* became, that is a different matter from arguing that a complementary sense of common *nationhood* developed.<sup>410</sup>

Whether scholars such as Kumar are accurate in their assertion that a full sense of nationality had not truly begun to be formed in the sixteenth century, elements of the growth of such a nationhood seems to be appearing within the political carols of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>407</sup> For a full transcription of this carol see: Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 84, and for a full translation from Latin to English see: Stevens, John, *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970),145

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>408</sup> For more detailed information on this manuscript see: Thompson, John, J., *Robert Thornton and the London Thornton Manuscripts: British Library MS Additional 31042* (Cambridge, 1987)
<sup>409</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 439

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>410</sup> Kumar, Krishan, The making of English National Identity (Cambridge, 2003), 90

fifteenth century; from the use of the phrase 'English nation' in *Letare cantuaria*, or the strong lyrics of the Agincourt carol with its burden repeating the words 'Deo gracias Anglia, redde pro Victoria!' ['England give thanks to God for victory']. The carol 'Anglia, tibi turbidas' has a burden and four stanzas which translates as:

#### England, hope for light after the confusion of darkness

The wickedness of conspirators and the armed might of tyrants are making a confused retreat; with sure confidence, hope for light after darkness.

Let friendship increase and justice take root; Let false-dealing flee into exile; With no sadness of mind, hope...

Let the glowing torch of greed and the stinking dregs of lust be purged; And, sweeping away enticements with the briar of fear, hope...

Let the despoiling of poor persons

and crimes of robbery

seek eternal hiding-places;

And, solaced by the (good) things of old, hope...<sup>411</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>411</sup> Translation taken from: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 143

This carol, although not using the word nation, is still referring to England in some sense of unity, as something recognisable, as well as a unified force against tyranny and conspirators. McPeek describes it as applying:

quite as aptly to the period from 1429 to 1444 as to the Wars of the Roses. During that period, which started with the advent of Joan of Arc and ended with the betrothal in 1444 of Henry VI to Margaret of Anjou...the continental war went very badly for the English...From 1444 to the outbreak of the Wars of the Roses in 1453, England enjoyed comparative peace...Therefore the text applies either before late 1443...or after 1453.<sup>412</sup>

Whether the text refers to the aftermath of the continental war or indeed to the Wars of the Roses, it text is powerful and pleading; making a passionate plea for times of turbulence to now be passed, and for friendship to now be established, wither between supporters of the houses of York and Lancaster, or between England and Scotland.

In the carol 'Benedicte Deo', we also get a sense of England as a collective body in comparison to other nations, and perhaps even a sense of England as an 'empire' if one examines the text of the final stanza. The carol translates from Latin as:

# Bless the Lord God; Praise him in all generations.

Angels and heavens, powers and seas and all works, bless the Lord

Sun, moon and stars, dew, fire and cold, darkness and lightening, bless the Lord

All moving things that live in the world in your appointed stations, bless the Lord

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>412</sup> McPeek, G.S, ed., *The British Museum Manuscript GB-Lbl Egerton 3307* (London, 1963), 15

England and France, and all empires, throughout all climes, bless the Lord.<sup>413</sup>

Through just these few carols, we can see a collective idea of nationality starting to emerge in the use of phrase such as 'English nation' or the perhaps subtle reference to England as an 'empire', or even just in the addressing of England as though it is a definitive, collective body of people as in 'Anglia tibi turbidas' when it calls 'England, hope for light after the confusion of darkness'; a call for peace and unification after the civil war.

# Henry V and Agincourt

The most famous of the political carols is first found, chronologically, within the Trinity Roll, and then in the slightly later Selden manuscript. 'Deo Gracias Anglia' (popularly known as the 'Agincourt Carol'), notated as the seventh carol of thirteen in the Trinity Roll, is the first extant polyphonic political carol in existence and as with the Egerton carols, sits at the heart of the manuscript. It contains a total of five stanzas that provide an account of the battle of Agincourt in 1415, celebrating the success of King Henry V. Agincourt and Henry V's exploits proved to become a popular theme in the writing of the political carol with no less than three dedicated entirely to him, and one recounting the battle; three notated, and one without musical notation. Indeed, 'Deo Gracias Anglia' could be seen as the forerunner to the fifteenth-century political carols that followed. However, Helen Deeming notes that:

If the surviving manuscripts are to be believed, the carol never achieved widespread fame within the carol repertory but perhaps that was inevitable, given its topical text.<sup>414</sup>

This sentiment may echo truly for the entirety of the political carol genre. 'Deo Gracias Anglia' is in fact the only extant political carol with notation to have a concordance in a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>413</sup> Translation taken from: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 143

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>414</sup> Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music* 35 (2007), 34

second manuscript, and as Helen Deeming asserts, the topical content may indeed be to blame. To put this in context somewhat; of the 119 polyphonic carols of the fifteenth century (up to and including Ritson), 42 (35%) have musical concordances, and 28 (23%) have textual concordances. The transmission of carols amongst the fifteenth-century manuscripts therefore, is quite substantial. However, it may also be possible that this first rather extraordinary political carol recounting the important battle at Agincourt, may have been the inspiration for many of the other political carols that emerged in its wake; many of these recount, at some point within their texts, the battle of Agincourt and the merits of Henry V. The second two musically notated carols are both to be found in the same manuscript; Egerton. 'Enforce we us', discussed previously in terms of the political nature of Saint George in the carols, and the Latin carol 'Exultavit Cor' are found beside one another within the manuscript. 'Exultavit Cor' is the only fully Latin carol on this theme; 'Enforce we us' and 'The Rose is the fayreste flour of alle' are both written in the vernacular, and 'Deo Gracias' has a Latin burden juxtaposed alongside English/Latin verses. Like 'Enforce we us', 'Exultavit cor'is also written for two voices, with a single burden.

The only non-notated carol to Henry V 'The Rose is the fairest flour of alle' is allegorical, and never actually names Henry as its subject, referring to Henry V as the 'Rose' and France as the 'Flour-de-Lyse'. In stanza two it clearly states the sentiment of English supremacy over France, stating, 'Therefore me thynke the Flour-de-Lyse Scholde wirshipe the Rose of Ryse'.<sup>415</sup>

Two other carols allude to Henry VI and his short reign, with one of these, A, perles pryns, to the we pray' by John Audelay, celebrating the achievements of his father, Henry V, more than Henry VI himself; perhaps unsurprisingly, considering he was ten years old when he was crowned, and the subsequent disinterest in showed in the affairs of empire and warfare, but perhaps also due to this carol's composition being early in his reign. The second carol, 'Princeps serenissime' is an offering in song to the King.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>415</sup> For a full transcription of this carols see: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 290
#### The Political Carols of The Fayrfax Manuscript

It is not until c. 1500, and the contents of the Fayrfax Manuscript, that the next significant group of political carols is to be found. There are four carols in this manuscript that are political in content; 'I love, I love and whom love thee', 'From stormy windes', 'This day day dawes' and 'Enforce yourself as Goddes knight'. The Fayrfax Manuscript really marks a change in style for the late medieval carol. There is less of the older melismatic style of writing, and more syllabic setting, and voice alternation is used more freely throughout the verses. There is also a return to the simpler single burden setting of the earlier carols.<sup>416</sup> The manuscript itself, although its purpose is unknown, would most likely have been for use in courtly circles. It contains a variety of song types and carols. Three of the political carols are placed closely together in the manuscript, suggesting the grouping of a similar material; 'From stormy windes', 'This day day dawes' and 'Enforce yourself as Goddes knight'. This echoes the grouping together of the political carols in Egerton too, perhaps suggesting they were deliberately placed in close proximity to one another. 'From stormy windes' is a carol calling for the protection of Prince Arthur (Henry VII's son, who died in 1502). This carol really draws attention to the divine right of the English king to rule, not only England, but 'Britayne...Castile and Spain',<sup>417</sup> due of course to his marriage to Catherine of Aragon, and is a perfect example of the belief of the English monarchy of their rights to rule abroad at this time.

The carol 'Enforce yourself as Goddes Knight' is of doubtful subject; the carol could be in homage to Henry VII or Henry VIII. Its close proximity in the manuscript to the carol 'From stormy windes' might however suggest it too is for Henry VII. Prince Arthur may be another possible contender for the subject of this carol, but due to the carol's reference to the 'sovereign' rather than the Prince, it would seem unlikely. The text of this carol reads:

> Enforce yourself as Goddes knight To strengthen your commons in their right Enforce yourself as Goddes knight

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>416</sup> See Chapter 1: 'The Late Medieval Carol: musical features and previous scholarship' for a summary of musical style in the carols.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>417</sup> The full transcription of this carol can be found in : Stevens, John, *Early Tudor Songs and Carols* (London, 1975), 135-137

#### To strengthen your commons in their right

Sov'reign lord in earth most excellent, Whom God hath chose our guide to be, With giftes great and evident Of martial power And also high dignity, Sith it is so, now let your labour be, Enforcing yourself as Goddes knight To strengthen your commons in their right.

God hath giff you of his goodness Wisdom with strength and sov'reignty All misdone thinges to redress, And specially hurtes of thy commonality, Which cry and call unto your majesty. In your person all their hopes is pight To have recover of their unright.<sup>418</sup>

This carol reflects the changing style of the genre by the end of the fifteenth century and beginning of the sixteenth century. It employs only one burden, but this burden is shortened on its final performance after the second verse; a choice of structure echoed in a number of carols in this manuscript. The piece is in duple time, again typical of the change of style in carol form and structure at this time, a change that continues into the carols of the Henry VIII manuscript. As with the carols of Egerton, there is no marked difference in musical form or style between the political carols of the manuscript and any other carol. It is simply the choice of text that separates them.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>418</sup> This transcription is taken from Stevens, John, ed., *Early Tudor Songs and Carols* (London, 1975), 144-145, where a musical transcription is also available. For an alternative transcription of the text only, see: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Oxford, 1977), 266-267.

The final two political carols in this manuscript take the War of the Roses as their subject matter. 'I love, I love and whom love thee' celebrates the end of the war as well as the birth of Henry VII's child, although it does not specify which child, although perhaps the carol for the protection of Prince Arthur could suggest that this too is for his birth. 'This day day dawes' is also in relation to Henry VII, this time celebrating his Queen, Elizabeth of York, describing her as 'The lily white rose'.<sup>419</sup> This carol borrows material from a popular song. Stevens suggests this popular song is used in the burden.<sup>420</sup>

#### Language in the Political Carols

Unlike the macaronic 'Deo Gracias Anglia' with its Latin burden and English stanzas, the majority of political carols are written in the vernacular. None of them use the French language and only two are macaronic; both employing Latin burdens and English stanzas. A break-down of the language of the political carols can be seen in Table 30. The Egerton political carols favour Latin, with five of the seven using the language, and only two in English. In fact, all the extant Latin political carols are only found in Egerton. Whether there was a particular reason for this choice is unknown, but if Stevens is correct in his proclamation that the carols were 'an ornament in a ceremony', <sup>421</sup> perhaps the choice of language in the political carols was in order to adorn that ceremony appropriately, and give these carols a higher status.

Political carols with musical notation	Language	Political carols with no musical notation	Language
Deo Gracias Anglia	Macaronic Latin B English V	Hay, hay, hay, hay!	English

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>419</sup> The full transcription of this carol can be found in: Stevens, John, *Early Tudor Songs and Carols* (London, 1975), 138-139

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>420</sup> See: Stevens, John, *Music and Poetry of the Tudor Court* (Cambridge, 1981), 19-20. A detailed discussion of the use of popular song in carols can be found in Chapter 3: 'The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>421</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Medieval* Carols (London, 1970), xiv

Princeps pacis	Latin	The rose is the fairest	English
		flour of alle	
Anglia, tibi turbidas	Latin	A, Perles Pryns, to thee	English
		we pray	
Benedicte Deo	Latin	A, a,a Edwardeus Dei	Macaronic
		gracia	Latin B
			English V
Saint Thomas honour we	Latin	Nowell, nowell, nowell,	English
		nowell	
Enforce we us	English	Now is the Rose of Rone	English
		grown	
Exultavit cor	English	Though sum sayeth	English
Princeps Serenissime	Latin	Sing 'vp' hart	English
Jesu, for they mercy	English		
Letare Cantuaria	Latin		
Clangat Tuba	Latin		
I love, I love and whom love thee	English		
From stormy windes	English		
This day day dawes	English		
Enforce yourself as Goddes knight	English		
Though sum sayeth	English		
Whiles life or breath	English		
England, be glad	English		

#### Table 30: Language of the political carols

These ceremonies may have encouraged communal singing, particularly in the burdens of the carols. 'Exultavit Cor', a carol giving thanks to God for helping Henry V in battle, seems to encourage this with the burden exclaiming 'My heart has rejoiced in the Lord; now let this assembly sing together'.<sup>422</sup> This carol is only in two parts throughout and is written with a single burden which is common also to the two carols either side of it in the manuscript; 'Enforce we us', dedicated to St George and his preservation of the English in battle at

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>422</sup> English translation from: Stevens, John, ed. *Medieval Carols* (London, 1970), 144

Agincourt, and the serene and beautiful 'Princeps serenissime' which alludes to a dedication to Prince Henry VI. A call to sing is also evident in the burden of the fifteen-stanza carol found in IR-Dtc D.4.18 which gives a full account of the battle of Towton in 1461 from the point of view of a Yorkist supporter.<sup>423</sup> The burden reads:

Now is the Rose of Rone growen to a gret honoure;

Therefor sing we eurerychone, 'I blessed be that floure.'424

This call to sing may give us reason to believe that the ceremonies or festivities these carols were being used in were inclusive of both performer and audience/participants. This could of course refer only to the members of the choir, but the possibility that it is a wider call to those present remains. Indeed, it is not only within the political carol genre that the call to sing together is evident, but across many others. What better way to nurture a sense of a unified culture and nation than to sing of such political events together?

One would perhaps assume that the political carols would favour the vernacular as a reflection of the growing connection between the English language and national identity. However, there is a chronological advancement of this seen in the manuscripts. Once we reach the political carols of the Henry VIII manuscript, the use of Latin has disappeared; perhaps an indication of the strength of the English language at this point of the early sixteenth century, or perhaps as a reflection of use. Ritson, for example, with its connection to Exeter Cathedral and its inclusion of sacred material for use in the liturgy would suggest ecclesiastical environments for performance, therefore the inclusion of Latin would be more appropriate than for the courtly entertainments of the Henry VIII manuscript. The compilers and composers of the music of Ritson too, men of the church, would be of a very different ilk to those compiling music for non-ecclesiastical performance at court; men such as William Cornysh. Cornysh was, 'involved in the production and performance of 'disguisings' and pageants and revels in the reign of Henry VII and on into the reign of Henry VIII when he became Master of the Chapel.'<sup>425</sup> Although men such as Cornysh were composing sacred and secular music in both Latin and English, perhaps the use of English in the political carols

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>423</sup> For more detail see, Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.* (Oxford, 1977), 477-478

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>424</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.* (Oxford, 1977), 260

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>425</sup> Salter, Elisabeth, *Six Renaissance Men and Women: Innovation, Biography and Cultural Creativity* (Aldershot, 2007), 98

of the Henry VIII manuscript would suggest their use outside of religious ceremony or acts of worship.

## The Henry VIII Manuscript and the Political Carol

The Henry VIII manuscript has been explored within other chapters, most notably in chapter six; addressing the female-centred carols within it. There are however, a number of political carols within this manuscript, surviving with musical notations, which need to be addressed.

Deitrich Helms proposed that this manuscript could possibly have been an instructional manuscript for royal children.<sup>426</sup> If this is so, then the choice of text would also have been of importance when selecting pieces to include. The political carols in this manuscript number three out of 12 carols.<sup>427</sup> 'Though sum sayeth', 'Whiles life or breath' and 'England, be glad'. One carol is written by Henry VIII, 'Though sum sayeth', one is about Henry VIII through the eyes of his first wife, 'Whiles life or breath' and the final one, 'England be glad' celebrates the invasion of France by England in 1513. These texts all portray Henry in an excellent light: as lover, warrior, composer and intellectual, thus painting him in a heroic light for any royal children studying the manuscript.

The carol 'Though sum sayeth' has provoked debate as to whether it is a carol or a refrain song. Greene classifies it as a carol, however, Stevens believes that he could be mistaken in this classification due to the confusion of signs given in the music in the original manuscript. Although its form has not been agreed upon by scholars, the possibility remains that it is in carol form, and therefore it will continue to be included in this study.<sup>428</sup> The text of this possible carol, according to Greene, reads:

#### Though sum sayeth that yougth rulyth me,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>426</sup> Helms, Dietrich, 'Henry VIII's book: Teaching Music to Royal Children', *Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 92 (2009),
118-135. Further exploration of this manuscript and Helms's hypothesis can be found in Chapter 6: 'Women in the Carols'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>427</sup> Of these twelve carols, six are classified by John Stevens as 'modified carols'. The modified carols still retain a burden, but evidence for the repetition of this burden is lacking.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>428</sup> Greene includes this carol in his first edition of: *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935). He excludes it from his second, 1977 edition, on the grounds that Stevens has pointed out that it is in fact a modified carol in: Stevens, John, *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), 107

I trust in age for to tarry; God and my right and my dewte, Frome them shall I neuer vary, Though sum sayeth that youg[t]h rulyth me.

Pastymes of youg[t]h sum tyme among None can sey but necessary; I hurt no man; I do no wrong; I loue trew wher I dyd mary.

I pray you all that aged be, How well dyd ye your youg[t]h carry? I think sum wars of ych degre Therin a wager lay dar I!

Then some dyscusse that hens we must; Pray we to God and seynt Mary That all amend, and here an end; Thus sayeth the Kyng, the Eighth Harry.<sup>429</sup>

Although this piece alludes to being written by Henry, one must tread with caution and be wary in accepting evidence of his authorship as definitive.<sup>430</sup> As in the exploration of the female-voiced carols, one can never be certain that voice in the text is the same voice as the writer. The use of 'God as my right' in the burden is a direct reference to England's royal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>429</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 297

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>430</sup> Scholars believe that this piece could well be by Henry due to compositional similarities to other pieces assigned to him (such as phrasing).

motto which reads 'Dieu et mon droit'.<sup>431</sup> The use of this phrase reminds the listener, or reader, of Henry's divine right to rule.

The second carol, one which scholars have not disputed its form, 'Whiles life or breath' by Cornish, is conveyed through the eyes of Henry's first wife, Catherine of Aragon.<sup>432</sup> In this carol, Henry is portrayed as the chivalric lover, warrior and proficient horseman. He is described as a 'chieften of a warriour' and proficient in tournaments, apparently making 'Six course at the ring...Of which four times he did take'. In terms of character, he is generously described as having a 'cheerful countenance' and 'So many virtues of given of grace' and we are to 'Behold his favour and his face. His personage most goodliest!'. He is portrayed as perfect in every way, holding all the best attributes admired in a man. This carol, as with others within the manuscript, only has musical notation for the burden, not for the stanzas. It is fairly typical of the compositional style of the other carols in the manuscript; mainly syllabic text setting with short melismas at the ends of phrases, and particularly at the end. The music begins and ends in all three voices on G, and also concludes most of the phrases, with exception of the first phrase which ends of two D's and an F in the top part. This use of unison or octave finals is common in the music of this manuscript, and works well in this piece, giving a sense of simplicity to a text that portrays a pure love by a woman for her King.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>431</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (oxford, 1935), 444

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>432</sup> For a full transcription of this carol with musical notation, see: Stevens, John, ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), 40



Example 4: 'Whiles life or breath'<sup>433</sup>

The final political carol from this manuscript, 'England, be glad' survives with musical notation for both the burden and the stanzas, which could suggest this was a less familiar musical setting than other carols, or just perhaps that the compiler wanted to demonstrate this composition in its entirety for instructional reasons, if Helms's conjecture that this manuscript was compiled as a tutor book for royal children is correct. <sup>434</sup> The carol refers to the invasion of France in 1513 by Henry and his army. This invasion was a success for Henry, with the French fleeing and spurring their horses away from the battle, <sup>435</sup> which could be the reason for the lines 'With spears and shields on goodly horses light, Bows and arrows to put them all to flight.'<sup>436</sup> Alternatively, due to its use of the present

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>433</sup> Stevens, John, Stevens, John, ed., Music at the Court of Henry VIII (London, 1962), 40

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>434</sup> Greene does not include this carol in his compilation due to its modified form (the verse refrain consists of the second half of the burden).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>435</sup> This battle is commonly known as the 'Battle of the Spurs'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>436</sup> A full transcription can be found in: Stevens, John, ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), 74-75

tense, the carol could have been written before the battle. As Stevens notes, Henry was 'accompanied by the Chapel Royal, travelling as part of the household'<sup>437</sup> therefore, the carol could have been sung on route to France within the entertainments of the household; this would make the text of the burden a motivational device to the travelling Chapel Royal; the burden reads:

England, be glad! pluck up thy lusty heart! Help now thy king, thy king, And take his part, and take his part!<sup>438</sup>

We certainly know that Henry had a number of musicians with him on the 1513 campaign. Theodor Dumitrescu notes that due to Henry's heavy involvement in the campaign (he personally led his troops), it meant:

the inclusion of a significant number of retainers in the journey; along with close to 600 household servants and a chapel of 115 persons, over ten minstrels and eight trumpeters attended on Henry during the war...an additional number of German drummers and fifers were hired, some of whom stayed on afterwards for years at the English court.<sup>439</sup>

It is possible then, that a carol such as 'England, be glad' could have been performed on campaign to entertain the king and his household, and promote a sense of a unified purpose and national pride among the travellers. The text has an uplifting sentiment coupled with a rousing three voice musical setting, making use of imitative phrasing and fast moving melismatic phrase endings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>437</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), xvii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>438</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), 74

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>439</sup> Dumitrescu, Theodor, *The Early Tudor Court and International Musical Relations* (Aldershot, 2007), 36





Example 5: England be glad<sup>440</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>440</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962),74-75

There are no other carols that survive that address this same campaign, although there is another song, in canon form, within the same manuscript which does: 'Pray we to God'. This canon also talks of the campaign in the present tense. It is set for three voices, and reads:

1. Pray we to God that all may guide

That for our king so to provide

2. To send him power to his courage

He may achieve this great voyage;

3. Now let us sing this round all three;

Saint George grant him the victory!<sup>441</sup>



Example 6: Pray we us<sup>442</sup>

This piece and the carol sit side by side in the manuscript, not I would imagine accidentally, and may even have been by the same composer (although both pieces are anonymous); perhaps written by a member of the chapel travelling with Henry or, although less likely, one of the ten minstrels also recorded as travelling with the household.<sup>443</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>441</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962),75

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>442</sup> Stevens, John, ed., Music at the Court of Henry VIII (London, 1962), 75

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>443</sup> There is currently no evidence from this period of minstrels composing written polyphony.

#### Music of the Political Carols

The defining feature of the carol, that which sets it apart from other forms, is undoubtedly the use of a burden sung at the beginning of the piece and repeated after each stanza. The burdens, believed to be a remnant of the carol's previous incarnation as a French dance song, are a matter of debate among scholars, many of whom have dismissed them, 'believing them to add little to otherwise unified poems'.<sup>444</sup> However, as Greene notes, their importance 'is more than a irrelevant exclamatory chorus, such as it often is in folk-song, where its structural importance wholly overshadows its meaning'.<sup>445</sup> Instead the burden is an integral part of the structure and 'so well do they sum up the matter of the stanzas that a classification of the carols by subjects could almost be made from examination of the burdens alone'.<sup>446</sup> They serve to create structure and indeed impact, re-enforcing musical and textual ideas.

Many carols, in particular the early ones, are written with a single burden, however the first notated political carol, 'Deo Gracias Anglia', is only one of two carols within the Trinity Roll, which contains thirteen in total, to have a double burden, a rarity it seems at this point in the development of the carol. Helen Deeming suggests that this use of a double burden may be a reference to:

An earlier monophonic version... incorporated into a three voice setting? This suggestion would explain the presence of the opening unison phrase-serving as a reminder of the original carol and the spectacular circumstances in which it had first been heard.<sup>447</sup>

In the later carols of the Egerton manuscript however, we have seen that double burdens become increasingly more common and the later carols of the Ritson manuscript nearly all

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>444</sup> Garner, Lori Ann, 'Contexts of Interpretation in the Burdens of Middle English Carols', *Neophilologus*, 84 (2000), 467

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>445</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), cxlv

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>446</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), cxlv

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>447</sup> Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music* 35 (2007), 30

contain double burdens, including 'Jesu for thy mercy'. Table 31 illustrates the use of single and double burdens within the political carols of this period. <sup>448</sup>

Political Carols with musical notation	Manuscript	Manuscript date	No. of Burdens	No. of Stanzas
Deo Gracias Anglia	Trinity Roll 1400-1450 Selden b26	1425-1440	2	5
Princeps pacis	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	1430-44	2	4
Anglia tibi turbidas	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	1430-44	2	4
Benedicte Deo	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	1430-44	1	4
Saint Thomas honour we	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	1430	2	7
Enforce we us	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	1430	1	3
Exultavit cor	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	1430	1	5
Princeps serinissime	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	1430	1	3
Jesu for thy mercy	Add.5665	1460-1510	2	1
I loue, I loue, and whom loue ye?	Add. 5465	c.1500	1	6
From stormy wyndis	Add. 5465	c.1500	1	3
Enforce yourself as Goddis Kynght	Add. 5465	c.1500	1	2
This day day dawes	Add. 5465	c.1500	1	2
Though sum sayeth	Add. 31922	c.1520	1	
Whiles life or breath	Add. 31922	c.1520	1	6
England, be glad	Add. 31922	c.1520	1	1

Table 31: Use of single and double burdens in the political carols<sup>449</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>448</sup> A more detailed discussion of the use of single and double burdens is found within Chapter two: 'The carol: an isolated genre?'

Whether with a single or double burden, the political carols, particularly in the quantity that we find them in Egerton, with their rousing texts and music, must have given performers and listeners alike a strong sense of the nationalist pride they were designed to convey; a sense of Englishness in song with the repeating single or double burdens and the continual re-enforcement of their message both textually and musically after each stanza. The rousing 'Deo Gracias Anglia' with its double burden, both of which can be seen in Example 7, declaring 'England, give thanks to God for victory' providing the perfect example of a political carol designed for maximum impact. This declaration, sung first in unison, is immediately followed by the repetition of the text sung to a second melody in three parts, both of which begin and end on D (as opposed to the verse which begins on D but ends on G). This structural device provides a potent musical impact, and would certainly have gained the attention of any listener. This use of a section of unison in the burden is unique to the carols of the fifteenth century; up to and including those of the Ritson manuscript.







<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>449</sup> Although the carols from GB-Lbl Additional. 5465 and GB-Lbl Additional 31922 are listed as having one burden, it is important to note that the burdens when repeated in these carols are often altered slightly in terms of melody or the distribution between parts, unlike the burdens of the chronologically earlier carols that repeat the burden as it was written the first time. Additionally, 'To England be glad' and 'Whiles life or breath' are modified carols; their burdens are not necessarily repeated at all, or material from the burdens are found elsewhere.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>450</sup> Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music* 35 (2007), 27

Each stanza regales the listener with another part of the tale of the battle, ending with a thanks to God, and what could be seen as an invitation to sing with the final line of the last stanza reading, 'Then may we call and safely sing' before concluding with the final repetition of both burdens.<sup>451</sup>

'Anglia tibi turbidas' also employs, like 'Deo Gracias Anglia', a double burden. The first burden is scored for two parts, followed immediately by a second burden using an identical text but scored for three parts; a similar musical scoring to 'Deo Gracias Anglia', and a musical structure that sees continually growing popularity within the carols throughout the fifteenth century. The burdens of 'Anglia tibi turbidas' can be seen in Example 8.



Example 8: Burden one and burden two of 'Anglia tibi turbidas'<sup>452</sup>

In examining the political carols from a purely musical perspective, there is no evidence of any great difference in form or structure from any other carol genre. As we can see in Table 32, they tend to favour finals D, C, F and G, and mensurally the earlier carols are all in triple time, with the later carols of the Fayrfax and Henry VIII manuscripts in duple time, as would be expected. The earlier carols show no particularly outstanding differences in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>451</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Medieval* Carols (London, 1970), 46

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>452</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 45

employment of first and last notes, but the later carols start to display slightly more complexity, in line with other songs in the later manuscripts.

Political Carols with musical notation	Start/end notes burden	Start/end notes stanzas	Mensuration
Deo Gracias Anglia	B1 –D-D B2- D-D	D-G	Triple
Princeps pacis	B1. C-C B2. C-C	G-F	Triple
Anglia tibi turbidas	B1. C-F B2. C-F	C-F	Triple
Benedicte Deo	B. A-D	D-D	Triple
Saint Thomas honour we	B1. D-D B2. D-D	D-D	Triple
Enforce we us	G-D	D-D	Triple
Exultavit cor	F-C	C-F	Triple
Princeps serinissime	C-G	C-G	Triple
Jesu for thy mercy	B1. A-G B2. A-G	G-G	Triple
l loue, l loue, <i>and</i> whom loue ye?	C-G/C	G/B-G/D	Duple
From stormy wyndis	C-FCF	C/F-D	Duple
Enforce yourself as Goddis Kynght	G-F/A/C	C/E-C	Duple
This day day dawes	C-C/E/G	C/E-G/B/D	Duple
Though sum sayeth			
Whiles life or breath	G-G	No Notation	Duple
England, be glad	FFC-CGE	G/D-F/A/C	Duple

Table 32: Musical features of the political carols

It is only their texts, rather than the employment of any particular structural or musical content, that sets them apart from the non-political carols. Indeed, it may be this enduring

similarity of style to other carols types, such as the Nativity and New Year carols, that continue to reinforce the argument for their ready inclusion within Christmas ceremonies and festivities.

#### Political Carols with no Musical Notation

This chapter has predominantly focused upon the extant political carols that survive with musical notation. However, there are a number of other political carols that are extant without: seven in total. These carols are listed in Table 33.

Carol	Manuscript	Subject	
Hay, hay, hay, hay!	GB-Ctc-R.4.20	The death of Archbishop Scrope	
The Rose es the fayreste flour of alle	GB-Lbl-Add. 31042	Henry V and Agincourt	
A, Perles Pryns, to the we pray	GB-Obl Douce 302	King Henry VI	
A,a,a, Edwardeus Dei gracia	GB-Lambeth 306	King Edward IV	
Nowell, nowell, nowell, nowell	GB-Lbl Add. 19046	War of the Roses	
Now is the Rose of Rone growen to a gret honoure	IRL-Dtc D.4.18	Battle of Towton (York)	
Syng 'vp' hart	GB-Lca 1.7	Coronation procession of Edward VI	
Table 33: Political carols extant with no musical notation			

Table 33: Political carols extant with no musical notation

Interestingly, with the exception of the carol 'A, Perles Pryns, to the we pray' in GB-Obl Douce 302 which contains over forty carols and, 'Hay, hay, hay, hay!' in GB-Ctc R.4.20 which contains two carols, the political carols with no musical notation survive in manuscripts where they are the only carol. They are also all concerned with different subjects.

Also of interest, is that more political carols survive with notation than without, which considering that the weighting is usually contrary to this, is unusual. On examination of the sources of these notated political carols however, one can observe that that the vast bulk of these carol survive in three main manuscripts: Egerton 3307 (containing six), the Henry VIII Manuscript (containing three) and the Ritson Manuscript (containing four). <sup>453</sup> This is contrary therefore to the single political carol with no musical notation found dispersed within a selection of manuscripts. These groupings of musically notated political carols were it would seem, as previously discussed, collected together in these manuscripts for use in appropriate establishments.

#### **Conclusion**

The exploration of the political carols, both with and without musical notation, within this chapter has thrown up a number of interesting conclusions. In particular, the realisation that in the late medieval period, it seems the form of the music rather than the textual content may have been what made it appropriate for celebration during the Christmas period; nativity and sacred texts were not, it seems the exclusive repertoire of this season. The grouping of so many political carols together in Egerton, although exceptional and unique within the manuscripts of the fifteenth century, has gone some way to showing the ready inclusion of the political carol within these celebrations, not to mention the evidence seen in the specific labelling of a political carol as a 'carol for Christmas'.

The texts of the late medieval carol have been demonstrated within this chapter to be suggesting a growing sense of nationhood in England at this time, something that is perhaps reflected in the growing number of political carols from the second half of the fifteenth century; with the carols for St George and St Thomas challenging previously accepted definitions of what defines a political carol of this period.

The sheer volume of extant carols both with and without musical notation, demonstrates the importance of the genre in England in the late Middle Ages. Its simple, yet highly effective, repetitive form, makes it an ideal choice for the celebration, transmission and preservation of important political events, and as demonstrated in the carols for Henry VIII's 1513 French invasion, a possible motivational device for those on campaign. What better a way to celebrate and commit to memory important events in English history than such an effective musical form as the carol with its repeating burden and opportunity for communal singing within ceremonies and celebrations?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>453</sup> One also survives in the Trinity Roll and one in Additional 5665

# **Chapter Seven**

# <u>'But here the greatest melody arises without any physical</u> <u>instrument, when the angels minister and sing to Christ</u><sup>'454</sup>: <u>The Carol in Sermons and Late Medieval Worship.</u>

This chapter will explore the possible uses for the carol within sermons and other forms of worship in the late medieval period, and will examine the concept of the carol as a preaching tool. The late medieval carol has long been believed to have had its first sacred incarnation in the hands of the Franciscan friars who took the vernacular musical form and lyrics for use in their worship.<sup>455</sup> In keeping with this practice, there is much evidence to suggest the continuation of the use of the carol in the late middle ages within the church and monastic settings. There are a number of carol manuscripts that originate in the hands of clerics prior to taking orders, vicars or other levels of church employees and friars. These manuscripts also contain sermons, other instructional devices, and theological material. This chapter aims to explore the concept of the carol as a preaching tool, and its other possible uses within medieval worship.

#### Sermon Manuscripts

The evidence for the use of carols within preaching in the late medieval period comes primarily from the carol manuscripts themselves. There are ten manuscripts from the fourteenth to the early sixteenth centuries that contain carols, amongst other materials, that were used by canons and parish priests (such as sermons, instructions and theological material). Sermon manuscripts that contain carols are very different to the large collections of sermons that are often found collated together in large and impressive manuscripts in the late Middle Ages. The carols are not found in these extensive, ordered collections but

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>454</sup> This quotation originates in a fifteenth-century sermon by John Felton for Easter Sunday and is quoted from Wenzel, Siegfried, *Preaching in the Age of Chaucer* (Washington, 2008), 137. Wenzel includes a complete transcription of this sermon within this monologue.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>455</sup> For a more detailed discussion see Chapter 1: 'The Carol: Musical Features and Previous Scholarship'

instead within smaller, random, and what could be classified as more personal, selections. Siegfried Wenzel writes:

The distinction between regular cycle and random collection concerns much more than the order of arrangement – it amounts to being a genuinely generic distinction. Cycles are quite evidently products of the scholarly study, systematic expositions of the lections for Sundays, feast days, or saints' feasts in homiletic form, made to be consulted with ease. In contrast, in so far as one can generalize, random collections tend to gather 'real' sermons, which were actually preached. <sup>456</sup>

It would certainly seem that these smaller, slightly more personalized manuscripts that 'contain a good number of "popular" elements – such as proverbs, allusions to games, snatches of vernacular song... may indeed reflect actual preaching quite closely', <sup>457</sup> and would therefore be of greater value to the understanding of smaller scale preaching than the large collections of model sermons which are more suited as manuscripts for consultation rather than working documents. These 'real' sermon manuscripts (which might be better described as preacher's notebooks) containing carols also are of such a size as to suggest their portability; the elements of wear and tear indicative of their movement around venues and congregations. They are not on the grand scale of books such as the large Breviaries containing the everyday Latin liturgical rites, or the impressive Antiphonaries with their clear purpose, and well thought out contents. The manuscripts in Table 34 which list the those that contain carols and preaching material, are instead compiled of seemingly random selections of material, without impressive illuminations and without any obvious order.<sup>458</sup> Wenzel categorizes the variety of extant manuscripts with a relationship to preaching containing English lyrics into six categories: 'Sermon Collections' (containing series of complete sermons), 'Preaching Tools' (to aid preachers in composing their sermons), 'Preacher's Notebooks' (containing a variety of preaching material in no particular order), 'Miscellanies' (collections of texts and poems not set in the context of a sermon), and 'Poetic Anthologies' (collections of pieces in verse) and 'Non-Preaching books'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>456</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, Latin Sermon Collections from Late Medieval England (Cambridge, 2005), 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>457</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, Latin Sermon Collections from Late Medieval England (Cambridge, 2005), 19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>458</sup> One must remember however, that these seemingly random compilations may have made perfect sense to the original compiler.

(homogenous subject matter).<sup>459</sup> Those containing carols fit most comfortably into the categories of preaching tool, notebook or miscellany.

Ms	DATE	CAROLS <sup>460</sup>	CONTENTS RELATED TO PREACHING
GB-Ed Advocates 18.7.21	1372	149a, 155a, 157d, 271	Theological and preaching material
GB-Ob Bodley 26	c. xiv	12a + possible second carol	Latin sermons and sermon notes. Religious treatise.
GB-Cul Additional 5943	c.xv1/4	151c, 349, 149d, 451	Latin Sermons. Connection with archdeacon and Somerset vicars
GB-Ctc R.14.26	c. xv 1/2	377	Latin Sermons
GB-Cul ff.5.48	c. xv 1/2	456	Instructions for parish priests
GB-Cgc 383/603	c. 1450	114b, 187A, 418, 441, 452, 453, 455, 470, App., No. ii	Cleric's manuscript. Latin treatises on scripture in the liturgy. Miscellaneous material.
GB-Ctc 0.9.38	1450	161b,331a	Monastic affairs
GB-Lbl Harley 5396	c. 1455	36b, 80, 136A	Latin sermons
GB-Lbl Sloane 1584	c. xv 4/4	446	Theological material. Instructions for deacons and sub deacons. Easter sermon
GB-Lbl Lansdowne 379	c. xvi 1/2	43, 94	English sermons
GB-Lbl Cotton Vespasian A.XXV	c. xvi 1/4	95a, 472	Theological material

Table 34: Carol manuscripts containing sermons, theological material or material inrelation to members of the clergy.

The presence of carols in such a number of manuscripts, which span over a century, would suggest their value to those taking the time to preserve them. This coupled with their placement alongside sermons or other similar material, signifying their importance in some aspect of the work of a priest, cleric, canon or friar. The priest's diverse duties in the community which consist of the coordination of up to 40-50 feast days a year, performing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>459</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, *Preachers, Poets, and the Early English Lyric* (Princeton, 1986), 4-7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>460</sup> Numbers correspond to their number in: Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935)

birth, death and marriage duties and preaching on many different religious and moral subjects, as well as general administration of his parish, echoes the diverse contents of the manuscripts; collections of music, poetry, sermons, grammatical treatise, medical recipes, accounts and letters.<sup>461</sup> The cleric's manuscript, such GB-Cgc 383/603, from Oxford circa 1450, would seem to be particularly relevant to one whose job it was to scribe in an ecclesiastical setting for a living with its inclusion of theological material alongside examples of letters and grammatical exercises; the addition of some of the lyrics and music might then be for their own pleasure perhaps rather than for use in worship, sitting alongside sacred pieces most probably encountered in their experiences of worship. The manuscript GB-Ctc 0.9.38, a commonplace book from the Benedictine abbey at Glastonbury circa 1450 is also a good reflection of its origins as a monastic document as it 'brings together work-aday monastic affairs... predictable monastic Latinity (an Epiphany hymn, the Agnus Dei) and sets alongside these an extremely varied collection of English texts: a description of gardening, several moral Chansons d'aventure, works of anti-feminist satire, collection of proverbs, and a poem on the Paris pageant for Henry VI not to mention the two carols: <sup>462</sup> the highly evocative planctus Mariae carol 'Sodenly afraide',<sup>463</sup> a dialogue between narrator and Mary cradling her dead son, and the carol 'Y concell yow, both more and lasse', 464 which advises against swearing by the mass and emphasises its importance in the saving of the soul.

In some cases manuscripts were used by a succession of owners from different occupations: GB-Cu 5943 being a perfect example. This manuscript started life as a student's note book, containing sermons and tracts in Latin until it became the property of Thomas Turke, 'a fellow of Winchester College intermittently between 1395 and 1401 before he became vicar of Bere Regis in Dorset and eventually a Carthusian monk at Hinton Charterhouse in Somerset', <sup>465</sup> who added a number of lyrics and music to the manuscript. The manuscript was eventually owned by a minstrel, which is an interesting example of an overlap in the use of the manuscripts contents by both clergy and laity. The manuscript eventually returned to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>461</sup>For more detail on the role of a late Medieval vicar see: Horrox, Rosemary and Ormrod, W.Mark, *A Social History of England 1200-1500* (Cambridge, 2006)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>462</sup> Wallace, David, The Cambridge History of Medieval English Literature (Cambridge, 2002), 326-7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>463</sup> This carol has echoes of drama, containing a dialogue between Mary and the narrator. It is also found GB-Mr Lat. 395, also from the fifteenth century.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>464</sup> Also found in GB-Obac 354 from the early sixteenth century.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>465</sup> Duncan, Thomas Gibson, ed., *A companion to the Middle English Lyric* (Cambridge, 2005), 15

ecclesiastical use in the hands of John Morton of Devon, who was a rector and vicar in the 1420's and 30's.<sup>466</sup> The use of such a manuscript with its sermons, lyrics and music in the hands of so many, displays the diversity not only of its contents, but of the uses of such contents.

The carols, more often than not, tend to appear un-notated in the manuscripts in Table 34, but this is certainly not to say they were never sung.<sup>467</sup> As Peter Jeffery writes in the context of the mendicant friar:

there are references to music in medieval sermons, at least from the time of the mendicant orders (the thirteenth century and later) whose wandering friars incorporated popular singing and dancing into their preaching. In England some of these songs seem to have been related to the repertory of the Christmas carols, which often mixed passages in Latin and the vernacular.<sup>468</sup>

Wenzel, a leading specialist in medieval sermons, although conceding that music was of importance to preachers and that 'members of religious orders chanted a good deal, during and probably also outside the official liturgy'<sup>469</sup> and that there is 'some evidence that itinerant preachers would attract attention by singing a song', <sup>470</sup> argues that evidence is still lacking to prove one way or another whether the preacher (with or without the audience) sung from the pulpit. However, we do find a number of references to music in sermons of the late Middle Ages. An example taken from a sermon for the enclosure of a nun reads:

It once used to be said in a popular song: 'We shall make a jolly castle On a bank beside a brim; Noe shall e'er come to it Unless he knows how to swim, or else he has a boat of love For to sail therein'<sup>471</sup>

This example is particularly appropriate for this sort of sermon, implying the seclusion of the nun from the outside world, only to be visited by Christ. Essentially:

<sup>467</sup> As discussed in Chapter 4: "That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth-century carol, a music of the people?, it is a very real possibility that non-notated carols would have been sung to lost popular melodies.
 <sup>468</sup> Jeffery, Peter, *Re envisioning past Musical Cultures: Ethnomusicology in the study of Gregorian Chant* (Chicago, 1992), 74

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>466</sup> Duncan, Thomas Gibson, ed., A companion to the Middle English Lyric (Cambridge, 2005), 15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>469</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, *Preachers, Poets, and the Early English Lyric* (Princeton, 1986), 17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>470</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, *Preachers, Poets, and the Early English Lyric* (Princeton, 1986), 17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>471</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, *Preaching in the Age of Chaucer* (Washington, 2008), 296

Nuns were the brides of Christ and had to maintain their virginity intact as a gift for their celestial spouse. Only if they died intact could their sacred marriage be consummated. Enclosure ensured their immaculate bodies would be preserved for ever.<sup>472</sup>

Enclosure was believed to be essential for the 'weaker sex' who it was thought needed more protection from themselves than from others. The use of a vernacular song in this sermon context is nothing unusual. Nuns wrote lyrics, music and drama to be used on occasions throughout the year, indeed 'Communal life, with its festivities and rites of passage, provided a variety of opportunities for creative expression. Key moments, such as the entrance of women into religious life, the clothing of the novices, and the profession of nuns were celebrated with readings of rhymes and theatrical events which took place in the convent'; <sup>473</sup> their lives were not wholly constricted to work and prayer. Secondly, nuns were not always nuns, and would have been familiar with the popular song of the world outside of their enclosure. Vernacular lyrics also appear in many sermons and sermon manuscripts with no connections to nuns; this tradition was well established generally by the late Middle Ages.

'Song' is also mentioned a great deal in sermons. Wenzel notes in his examination of GB-WO-F.126 that:

Among the Latin sermons occur nearly two dozen pieces with English material, even one fully macaronic sermon. They have preserved interesting vernacular sayings, including a reference to the song "Maiden in the Moor Lay" and some of them furnishing intriguing clues to the use of both languages in actual preaching. <sup>474</sup>

Although Greene claims that the song 'Maiden in the Moor Lay' has been wrongly classified as a carol, Stevens disputes this in reference to Wenzel's discovery of the song in a sermon from 1381 that refers to it as a 'carole'. Even more importantly, this 'carole' may go some way to connecting dance and worship, as Stevens notes that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>472</sup> Evangelisti, Silvia, Nuns, a History of Convent Life (Oxford, 2007), 43

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>473</sup> Evangelisti, Silvia, Nuns, a History of Convent Life (Oxford, 2007), 101

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>474</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, Latin Sermon Collections from Later Medieval England (Cambridge, 2005), 150

In 1986 Peter Dronke published an imaginative interpretation of the lyric as a dancesong with mime, based on a Germanic legend of a water-sprite: 'she tends to appear at village dances in the guise of a beautiful human girl, and to fascinate young men there, but she must always return into the moor at a fixed hour, or else she dies'. This...clinches the matter; the Middle English poem must be a dance-song, and indeed a *carole*'.<sup>475</sup>

Sermons were the broadcasting service of the Middle Ages; a way to communicate religious, political and moral messages to all strata of society. The importance of the Church in the community in the Middle Ages was enormous. The lives of all strata of society revolved around the liturgical calendar, with important events such as births, deaths and marriages requiring church services.<sup>476</sup> The carol, with its catchy repetitive lyrics and potential for audience participation would therefore be a welcome addition to a preacher's repertoire. The variety of subjects we find the carols dedicated to attests to this versatility of use; we not only find carols for the feast days of the Saints, but also on subjects of death, marriage, childhood and moral and religious counsel, subjects that relate to the everyday lives of the parishioners. The carol 'Thynk we on our ending, I red, I red, I red' is found within GB- Ctc R.14.26, a manuscript from the early fifteenth century which contains, amongst other things, Latin sermons, treatises (one on music), and St Thomas Aquinas' De Ente et Essentia (a thirteenth-century philosophical work on 'Being and Essence').<sup>477</sup> The inclusion of such a carol within such a collection of sermons and other learned material, would suggest that it was of use to the compiler. The carol, which translates as 'Think on our ending, I advise, I advise, I advise', explores the inevitability of death, advising the listener not to put faith in earthly friends, but only in the mother of God. The carol is in the first person, and would work well within the context of a sermon as it speaks directly to the congregation.<sup>478</sup> The burden is inclusive of the listener, imploring 'Think we on our ending, I red, I red I red' and gives a sense of authority to the speaker in his capacity to advise others. There appears to be erased notation both above and below this carol, something which is not recorded in any sources, but has recently been noted on the 'Digital Imaging Archive of Medieval Music' by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>475</sup> Stevens, John, *Words and Music in the Middle Ages: Song, Narrative, Dance and Drama, 1050-1350*(Cambridge, 1986), 184

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>476</sup> Marriages in this period did not necessarily have to be conducted within a church setting, but often were.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>477</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 345

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>478</sup> For a full transcription of this carol see: Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 252

Ted Dumitrescu.<sup>479</sup> The single line of music is placed above and below the carol and does not appear to exist under the carol text, which would suggest its addition after the carol lyrics were scribed. It cannot be said for certain as to whether the music was the carol melody or not, but it would seem likely. There is no other musical notation within this manuscript, nor any other carols. The carol with this faint musical notation can be seen in on the right hand folio in Example 1.<sup>480</sup>



Example 1: GB-Ctc R.14.26, folios 20v-21r<sup>481</sup>

The preacher's battle for the attention of the audience could explain the presence of carols, particularly 'inappropriate' carols in manuscripts containing preaching material. As Alan Fletcher rightly notes:

The medieval preacher... had an uphill task. To begin with, while he urged familiar matter of eternal consequence, he did so through a necessarily ephemeral medium,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>479</sup> http://www.diamm.ac.uk/jsp/Descriptions?op=SOURCE&sourceKey=321

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>480</sup> The faintness of the notation has made any attempt to reconstruct the music impossible from this image alone. Further examination of the manuscript under UV light will need to be undertaken at a later juncture.
<sup>481</sup> Image provided by Cambridge Trinity College Library.

spoken words, that as soon as uttered, vanish on the air. If interest in familiar matter was to be rekindled, and if he was to turn his congregation's recollection of it into salvific pleasure, the preacher must be memorable both in the moment of utterance and also in a way that outlasted the medium in which he worked.<sup>482</sup>

The use of the carol lyric therefore would seem an entirely effective way to engage an audience and have them remember the key message of a sermon. The use of carol lyrics, with their repeating burden would seem to be particularly effective in this context, and could even have been used as a responsorial device.

#### A Carol Within a Sermon?

The most significant manuscript in terms of extant evidence for the use of carols in sermons or indeed other forms of worship is GB-Ob Bodley 26. This late fourteenth-century manuscript is a compilation of ten manuscripts bound together, and totals over 208 folios. It is a small manuscript, and best suited to the category of 'preacher's notebook' due to its eclectic contents. It contains, amongst other things, Latin sermons and treatises on the Gospels, Latin sermons, sermon notes by a member of the Franciscan community, fragments of an astrological nature and treatises on arithmetic and physiognomy, and most interestingly for the purposes of this chapter: a sermon on unlocking the heart of a sinner.<sup>483</sup>

In all the extant manuscripts, as detailed in Table 34, that contain sermons or other theological material alongside carols, the carols are not found within the body of the sermons, or so closely linked to a sermon as this one. What is interesting about this particular sermon in GB-OB BODLEY 26 however, is what appears to be the placement of the carol, 'Honnd by honnd we schulle ous take' either within a sermon, or between two sermons. The carol reads:

#### Honnd by honnd we schulle ous take,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>482</sup> Fletcher, Alan, John, *Late Medieval Popular Preaching in Britain and Ireland* (Turnhout, 2009), 277. For more information on congregational distraction in the Middle Ages see: Fletcher, Alan, John, *Late Medieval Popular Preaching in Britain and Ireland* (Turnhout, 2009), 277-284

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>483</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 337

And joye and blisse schulle we make,
For the deuel of elle man haght forsake,
And Godes Sone ys maked oure make.
A child is boren amo[n]ges man,
And in that child was no wam;
That child ys God, that child is man,
And in that child oure lif bygan.

Senful man, be blithe and glad: For your marriage thy peys grad Wan Crist was boren; Com to C*ri*st; thy peis ys grad; For the was hys blod ysched, That were forloren.

Senful man, be blithe *and* bold, For eune ys bothe boght *and* sold, Euereche fote. Com to *Cri*st; thy peys ys told, For the he yahf a hondr*e*fo[I]d Hy lif to bote.<sup>484</sup>

Greene writes briefly on this piece and notes:

One of the earliest 'Christmas carols' extant, was probably used by a friar in connection with his preaching. It was written down before 1350 among some Franciscan sermon notes which also contain other rhyming lines in English.<sup>485</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>484</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 11-1

Unfortunately, Greene did not investigate this carol (or the preaching connection) in any detail, which is regrettable due to its clear demonstration of the use of the carol in preaching. The carol appears as though it is placed towards the very end of the sermon, and enclosed by the final concluding words which read 'Thema, 'Trisitcia vestra convertetur in gaudium', Iohannis 16. Verba ista sunt Christi ad discipulos ...', which translates as 'Theme, 'Your sadness will be turned into joy', John 16. These are Christ's words to his disciples ...'.<sup>486</sup> However, Alan Fletcher asserts that in fact these words could be the start of another sermon for Mass on the third Sunday after the Octave of Easter due to this portion of St John's Gospel's place in Sarum Use. Additionally, he claims that the body of the sermon appears to bear no relation to the text of the carol at all. The sermon:

starts with a reflection on the qualities that every preacher needs in order to be effective. After this, the theme 'Audi filia et vide' is repeated, and the sermon proceeds to its central matter. This matter is organized according to a systematically announced set of divisions: the preacher begins by saying that if we reflect on Christ's goodness to mankind in these three respects - a) with how great a love he joined himself with mankind, b) with how great a price he bought mankind, and c) with how great a reward he endowed mankind - it would not be surprising if Christ sought to direct mankind, saying the words of the theme, 'Audi filia et vide'. Each of these three divisions is then treated to further subdivisions, which are amplified and discussed, and from which the bulk of the sermon is generated. The divisions and subdivisions are announced in rhymed English, and the Latin theme, 'Audi filia et vide', also Englished, is repeated with a refrain-like insistence throughout the length of the sermon.<sup>487</sup>

He also writes that:

After the sermon, which ends in the middle of what appears to be fol. 201v ... there follows a set of theological notes on the topic of the five bars or impediments that shut the hearts of sinners (delight in sinning, shame in confessing, hope for a [some

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>485</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), cxxv

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>486</sup> This transcription and translation is provided by Professor Alan Fletcher via personal communication 23/10/2012 and is published with permission. There is no available published translation of this sermon to date, so my thanks go to Alan Fletcher for his summary.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>487</sup> Fletcher, Alan, Personal Communication, 13/10/2012. Published with permission.

word which I can't read] life, fear of penitence, and despair of eternal life). These notes continue until finally there comes the carol, 'Hand by hand we shall us take'. The carol seems unrelated to the sermon 'Audi filia et vide', and also to the theological notes that have immediately preceded it.<sup>488</sup>

He concludes that:

Consequently, I can't readily see how it fits with the carol at all, and I begin to suspect that the carol was simply copied into a spare space on the verso of the folio. When more parchment became available, the scribe started to copy the beginning of a new sermon on the theme 'Tristicia vestra', the remainder of which we now seem to have lost.<sup>489</sup>

It would seem however, despite his observation that the final words below the carol are indeed the start of a new sermon, that Fletcher may be incorrect in his assertion that there is no link between the carol and the sermon 'Audi filia et vide'. He has overlooked the fact that the Latin theme 'Audi filia' refers to Psalm 44 from the Vulgate which is an 'epithalamium' wedding song that was interpreted as prophesying the mystical marriage of: God to Virgin Mary/God and Christ to the Church and to each individual Christian soul. <sup>490</sup> The carol, in stanza two bears the line 'For your marriage thy peis ys grad [peace is proclaimed]', which combined with the last line of the burden 'And Godes Sone ys maked oure make', which also refers to marriage ('make' can translate as 'friend' but in this case it would seem it may more likely refer to the alternative translation of either a married couple/mate/husband or Christ as a bridegroom), and would suggest a common theme between carol and sermon, both therefore showing a connection to the concept of the mystical marriage. This would suggest that there is indeed a link between carol and sermon in this case.

If Fletcher's assertions are correct however, and the carol does not bear any relation to the previous sermon, the possibility still remains that the carol could instead be related to the now lost, sermon that follows it. Of course, the carol need not refer directly to the sermon,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>488</sup> Fletcher, Alan, *Personal Communication*, 13/10/2012

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>489</sup> Fletcher, Alan, *Personal Communication*, 23/10/2012

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>490</sup> A traditional poem, originating from Greece and written to accompany a bride to her marriage chamber.

and although Greene classes this as a Christmas carol, it also refers to Christ's death, and could therefore also be appropriate during Easter and could consequently bear a connection to the Easter sermon that follows it; although this is difficult to establish with any certainty due to the missing folios.<sup>491</sup>

Whether the carol can be definitively connected to the sermon preceding it, or whether the carol is indeed simply placed after it, it would seem indisputable that the carol is set between two sermons, therefore suggesting its use at some point in their preaching. The folio containing the carol can be seen in Example 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>491</sup> The 'Audi filia' and mystical marriage theme are liturgically more connected to Advent and Passiontide, and the Annunciation (25<sup>th</sup> March) and Assumption (15<sup>th</sup> August) than to Christmas and Easter although they could also could be used for services for baptism/consecration of nuns and monks/taking of holy orders/and various saints days for virgin saints.

to yound the B lam. 10 412 and have 15 baren Hunse 2 het manin 1524 82000 Kare for Sarfiel antias be

Example 2: Placement of the carol in GB-Ob Bodley 26, f.202v

The burden of this carol clearly suggests some sort of movement or activity (whether implied or actually undertaken) in its first line when it calls 'Honnde by honnde we schulle ous take'. It would seem possible that this was a literal call to take hands and join together, but equally, it could be a metaphorical suggestion of mankind joining together as one to defeat sin and embrace Christ, or even merely as a reference to the forms of dancing and festivity that takes place outside of the Church. Greene notes that:

Particularly in a piece such as No. 12, one of the earliest written of any of our texts (about 1350), is there a suggestion that religious songs were danced to as well; the burden... being probably a close imitation of a secular dance song'.<sup>492</sup>

If Greene is correct in his assertion here that the burden was indeed an imitation of a popular dance song, it could well be a representation of the Church's attempt to incorporate popular song and dance traditions into the Church in order to exert control over a practice and engage the lay folk in the preachings of the Church.<sup>493</sup> As Greene notes:

The conflict between the Church and these dances and songs was especially marked, but not merely because the performances themselves were accompanied by wanton words and gestures, but also because of the peoples' habit of dancing on the eves of church festivals and in the hallowed precincts of the church-yard or even within the edifice itself. The clergy used hymns, psalms, and sermons in attempts to divert their attention, but the parishioners seem often to have preferred the more exciting pastime.<sup>494</sup>

There would seem no reason to suppose that devices were not used in order to keep the attention of the parishioners in the form of song and dance within preaching. There are indeed accounts of ecclesiastical dancing, and one from the thirteenth century notes that:

'The liturgical commentator Durandus...states that on the eve of St Stephen's Day the deacons, to honour their patron saint, 'joining together in dance sing an antiphon of St Stephen'....And in Limoges on the feast of St Martial there was dancing to psalms in the church; the singers and dancers concluded their psalm with the refrain.<sup>495</sup>

Craig Wright also gives evidence of dancing in French Cathedrals. He specifically notes the ritual dancing in the cathedral of Auxerre in the late medieval period:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>492</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), lvii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>493</sup> Although Robbins prefers the theory that the congregation were taking hands as in a church lullaby enacting taking hands around a crib. See: Robbins, Rossell Hope, 'Middle English Carols as Processional Hymns', *Studies in Philology*, 56 (1959), 576.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>493</sup> Stevens, John, ed. *The Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), xiv

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>494</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), cxii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>495</sup> Stevens, John, *Words and Music in the Middle Ages: Song, Narrative, Dance and Drama, 1050-1350*(Cambridge, 1986), 179

Each year, from at least 1396 until 1538, the canons and chaplains of the cathedral of Auxerre gathered in the early afternoon of Easter Sunday around the maze situated in the nave of their church. Joining hands to form a ring-dance...they chanted antiphonally the sequence Praises to the Easter Victim (Victimae paschali laudes) as they danced on the labyrinth ...The remaining clergy joined hands and , singing and jumping for joy, danced around the maze.<sup>496</sup>

If the canons and chaplains are using such methods themselves, what better way for them to keep the attention of their flock on occasion too than with interludes of song and dance; and even better, religious lyrics set to the popular secular melodies of their everyday lives?<sup>497</sup> As Fletcher notes:

Many Middle English lyrics were, of course, more heard as song than read on the page as literary events, and the prospect of a preacher's sung delivery of at least some non-structural sermon lyrics which are known to have been set to music does not stretch credibility. Given the battle for the congregation's attention that every preacher waged as soon as he stepped into the pulpit, music might have offered another welcome means of holding that attention; we know that the Friars... were widely known for their musical abilities.<sup>498</sup>

GB-Ob Bodley 26 has links to the Franciscan community, an order with well-established links to the carol tradition, and known as an order that engaged with the wider community, rather than hiding itself behind cloistered walls. The inclusion therefore of a carol within a sermon of this provenance being sung may seem entirely plausible, and may give an indication to the use of the carol form by the Franciscans in general.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>496</sup> Wright, Craig, *The Maze and the Warrior* (USA, 2004), 140

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>497</sup> For more detailed examples of the easily distracted medieval parishioner see: Fletcher, Alan, John,
 'Literature and Pulpit' in *Late Medieval Popular Preaching in Britain and Ireland* (Turnhout, 2009). For further discussion of dancing and the church see: Page, Christopher, *Discarding Images* (Oxford, 1993)
 <sup>498</sup> Examples of the section of the sect

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>498</sup> Fletcher, Alan, John, 'Literature and Pulpit' in *Late Medieval Popular Preaching in Britain and Ireland* (Turnhout, 2009), 303

## A Second Carol?

There is some dispute as to whether a second carol is also embedded within this same sermon. Rossell Hope Robbins has argued that this carol within sermon 'Audi filia et vide' has a burden that is found repeated a number of times within the texts, and that a complete stanza with burden can be found on folio 193b.<sup>499</sup> This suggested carol reads:

My doʒter, my darlynnge,

Herkne my lore, y-se my thechyng.

How mankende furst bygan,

In what manschepe now ys man,

What wykednesse man hat y-do,

What ioye and blisse man ys y-bro3<sup>500</sup>

Alan Fletcher disagrees with the inclusion of this carol and believes Robbins,

incorrectly states that the sermon on the *thema Audi, filia, et vide*... has a carol embedded in it; rather, the suspected carol proves to be a rhymed English lines used to mark the sermon's structural parts.<sup>501</sup>

If, as Fletcher suggests, these rhymed lines are indeed structural points of the sermon, and the inclusion of vernacular structural pointers in Latin sermons is indeed an established tradition by this time, there seems no reason as to why these 'rhyming lines' could not also be in carol form; this would not only facilitate the recollection of the structural points of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>499</sup> Hope Robbins, Rossell, 'The Earliest Carols and the Franciscans'', *Modern Language Notes*, Vol. 53, No. 4 (April, 1938), 243 See also, Hope Robbins, Rossell, 'Lyrical Poetry' in Wilson, R.M., *The Lost Literature of Medieval England* (London, 1970), 173

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>500</sup>Transcription of this carol taken from: Hope Robbins, Rossell, 'The Earliest Carols and the Franciscans'', *Modern Language Notes*, Vol. 53, No. 4 (April, 1938), 243

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>501</sup> Fletcher, Alan, John, *Late Medieval Popular Preaching in Britain and Ireland* (Turnhout, 2009), 33
sermon for any preacher and his audience at a later date, but also would reflect the use of the carol placed so clearly towards the end of the sermon.

This possible carol can be seen in Example 3, on the right hand folio page. It is clearly placed within the text and bracketed in such a way as to indicate that it is indeed poetic or lyrical lines. The bracketing of the carol 'Honnd by Honnd' in Example 2 is very similar. That these 'rhyming lines' are also written in the vernacular within a Latin sermon, would also reflect the inclusion of the vernacular 'Honnd by Honnd'.

& when inter the main ATT A in 4 Tro-24 APA33/ Genter To anotene arts 100 m of De Rog alon an All in greating as all

Example 3: GB-Ob Bodley 26, f. 195v-196r. The right hand manuscript page showing the insertion of what could be a second carol within this sermon.

### Vernacular Carols within Latin Sermon Manuscripts

The insertion of an English carol (possibly two) into a Latin sermon does at first seem inconsistent; one would naturally presume some uniformity of language within a sermon. However, evidence exists to suggest that although sermons were written down in Latin, it would not necessarily follow that they were orated in Latin. Wenzel notes that:

Conventional wisdom would have it that, at least in an earlier period, sermons to the lay folk were spoken in the vernacular, and sermons to the clergy in Latin. In the century with which this study is concerned, however, [15<sup>th</sup> century] this distinction clearly broke down, as is patently shown for instance in the licence to preach given in 1417 to the famous canon lawyer William Lyndwood allowing him, indiscriminately, "to preach the word of God to the clergy and the people in Latin or in the vernacular"... Moreover, in whichever language the sermons might have been preached, through the fifteenth century, the majority were written down in Latin.<sup>502</sup>

There exists evidence of sermons that were reportedly delivered in English but still recorded in Latin; the sermon diary of Archbishop Fitzralph in which he reports his own sermons being a particularly good example as 'even the sermons that he reports that he gave in the vernacular are written down in Latin'.<sup>503</sup> It is entirely possible that this sermon was perhaps recorded from a model sermon manuscript and adapted for more practical use by its owner with the inclusion of vernacular lyrics.

It also seems that the language of a sermon is not necessarily an indication of audience. Many sermons have no evidence at all for audience within them, any 'internal references often suggest that the audience was mixed, composed of both clerics and lay folk',<sup>504</sup> which would explain the inclusion of sacred carols with liturgical quotations in these manuscripts sitting alongside carols in the vernacular with more worldly subject matter; an issue discussed later in this chapter.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>502</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, Latin Sermon Collections from Late Medieval England (Cambridge, 2005), 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>503</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, Latin Sermon Collections from Late Medieval England (Cambridge, 2005), 17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>504</sup> Wenzel, Siegfried, Latin Sermon Collections from Late Medieval England (Cambridge, 2005), 9

## The 'Ritson' Manuscript: Understanding Carols in Worship

The manuscripts discussed thus far do not contain any carols with musical notation, except for the 'ghost' of a melody identified by Dumitrescu. However, the musically notated Ritson Manuscript, although it does not contain sermons, theological material or instructions for parish priests that are found in the manuscripts of Table 34, still has a place within this chapter in trying to understand the use of the carol in worship. The Ritson manuscript is of particular importance for a number of reasons: its connection to two named composers, Richard Smert and John Trouluffe;<sup>505</sup> its varied collection of musical settings; and its large collection (44 in total) of carols. Although, as discussed previously in this thesis, the composer centred approach does not necessarily provide a balanced approach to understanding pre-classical music, in the context of this chapter, knowing the position of the composer within society and the church may help clarify who was composing the carol form, and for what purpose.<sup>506</sup>

Ritson, dating from the second half of the fifteenth century, is a large notated manuscript which contains a total of 44 carols as well as settings of the mass, a Kyrie-Gloria pair, a macaronic Te Deum, Office hymn, processional hymns, twenty three motets, sixteen English andone1 French secular piece plus three sacred English pieces. In addition to the named composers Smert and Trouluffe, there are also works by William Cornysh, Pack, Norman, Mowere, Haute, Turges, Petyr and Henry VIII as well as composers identified by their initials only: T.B. and W.P.<sup>507</sup>

Richard Smert (c.1400-1478/9), the eldest of the two composers, was ordained as a priest in 1427 and appointed vicar-choral of Exeter Cathedral from 1427 to circa 1430 and again from 1449 to circa 1478. In addition to the cathedral post, he was also rector of Plymtree in Devon, from 1435 to 1477, an indication of his privileged status.<sup>508</sup> The church seems to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>505</sup> The significance of these named composers is discussed further in Chapter 3, 'The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>506</sup> The validity of the composer-centred approach is discussed in Chapter 3: 'The Named Composer: an obstacle to understanding the late medieval carol?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>507</sup> Boorman, Stanley, et al. "Sources, MS." *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed May 21, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/50158pg13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>508</sup> David Greer and N.I. Orme. "Smert, Richard." In *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online,* http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/25985 (accessed June 23, 2012).

have been prospering at the time of his rectorship, with the expansion of the building (the adding of a porch and south aisle) and records reporting Smert's retirement on an annual pension of £4 collected from the 'fruits of the parish church'.<sup>509</sup> John Trouluffe (?-c 1473) however was not actually employed by Exeter Cathedral alongside Smert, but instead, 'was a protégé of Edmund Lacy, Bishop of Exeter, who made him a canon of Probus, Cornwall, in 1448. He also became a canon of Crantock, Cornwall. Neither post required priestly status. Trouluffe, who died at about Christmas 1473, was probably a musician of Lacy's chapel.'<sup>510</sup> Despite the lack of evidence however, it is still possible that Trouluffe was a priest, and one would expect that he was almost certainly in minor orders.

Both men, Smert in particular in his post as rector of Plymtree, would have been required to contribute to worship, and would have been required to preach. His role as a vicar choral would also have meant his involvement in the day to day worship in the cathedral, standing in for the canons' duties when required, and singing. Although the nature of the polyphonic music in Ritson is far too sophisticated for the idea of spontaneous use in the worship of a small parish church such as that in Plymtree, it would seem entirely suited for use in Exeter Cathedral, performed by trained singers such as the vicars choral.

Ritson contains headings at the top of each of its carols, which give instruction as to which liturgical event each carol is meant for. These headings for the carols composed by Smert and Trouluffe are listed in Table 35. Stevens and Libby write that 'the headings like 'in die nativitatis', or 'de sancto thoma' appearing with certain carols are not necessarily prescriptive rubrics but indicate at least a strong sense of liturgical season.<sup>511</sup> However, these are indeed clearly specific days of the church year and would seem to be entirely prescriptive. The nativity falling on the 25<sup>th</sup> of December, the feast for St Thomas of Canterbury on the 29<sup>th</sup> of December, the feast of Mary on the first of January, feast of the Innocents on the 28<sup>th</sup> of December and the feast of the Epiphany on the 6<sup>th</sup> of January. Other headings are also indicative of feasts connected with the Christmas and New Year season. Although we can't tell exactly how the carols were being utilised on these specific

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>509</sup> http://www.plymtree.org.uk/st-john-the-baptist/a-brief-church-history/rectors-and-priests-of-plymtree, accessed 20/08/2012

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>510</sup> David Greer and N.I. Orme. "Trouluffe, John." In *Grove Music Online*. Oxford Music Online, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/28472 (accessed June 23, 2012)
 <sup>511</sup> John Stevens and Dennis Libby. "Carol." In *Grove Music Online*. Oxford Music Online,

http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/04974 (accessed July 20, 2012).

days, they are being carefully categorised for specific purposes by the compilers of the manuscript.

Carol	Instruction	Composer	No. in MB $^{512}$
Nowell, nowell: Dieu vous garde	in die nativitas	Smert	80
Man be joyful	in die nativitas	Smert	82
Ave, decus seculi <sup>513</sup>	de sancta Maria	Smert	86
Soli, Deo sit	in die nativitas	Smert and Trouluffe	87
Have mercy of me	in die nativitas	Smert	88
O clavis David	in die nativitas	Smert and Trouluffe	91
Jesu, fili virginis <sup>514</sup>	de nativitate	Smert	98
Jesu, fili Dei	de nativitate	Smert and Trouluffe	101
Nascitur ex virgine	de nativitate	Smert	103
Jesus autem hodie	Epiphanie	Smert and Trouluffe	108
Blessed mote thou be	de nativitate	Smert	119

Table 35: Carols in the Ritson Manuscript attributed to Richard Smert and John Trouluffe.

Their prolific writing of carols in this manuscript could suggest Smert and Trouluffe's interest in using them in their work as a canon, rector and vicar choral; Smert wrote a total of eleven carols, of which 4 were written in conjunction with John Trouluffe. The manuscript originally dates from 1460; the carols having been fully included by 1475 (Trouluffe's contributions would have to have been composed by 1473, the year of his death). These carols may reflect the idea that the laity would have been present for their use in their prolific use of English, with any Latin being mainly reserved for the repetitive burden. Although a possibility rather than a certainty, one can imagine however, the message of the preacher

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>512</sup> 'MB' referrers to the numbering in: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>513</sup> This carol is particularly interesting from a musical perspective as it is the only one in a fifteenth-century style to be written in duple time. Stevens suggests this may be Smert experimenting with the new compositional techniques being used in other church music of the time. See: Stevens, John ed. *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>514</sup> Stevens does not list this as a carol by Smert in his Musica Britannica edition, Stevens, John ed. *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), but it is clearly marked with his name in the original manuscript.

being easily remembered by the laity, and indeed the clergy too, in the repetitive carol texts and melodies.

It is entirely possible that the carols found in Ritson are in some way reflective of what may have been being used on a smaller musical scale in Smert's parish of Plymtree. Smert was in his role at Plymtree from 1435-77, and was doubling up as vicar choral at the cathedral in the years 1449-77.<sup>515</sup> This would have meant he was in this dual role at the time of the compilation of Ritson. Some of the carols therefore, may have been the product of smaller monophonic compositions for use in the parish church, and may also reflect some of the popular songs known by the parishioners. Certainly in the role of vicar choral (and indeed rector), Smert would have had the freedom to interact with the laity; a freedom that often earned the vicars choral a reputation for inappropriate behaviour. There is also evidence that connects the carols in Ritson to manuscripts without musical notation, with no less than nine of the carols having correspondences to literary sources. The most interesting of these, GB-Bbcm 123, places the carol 'Alleluia: Now may we mirthes make'in the hands of rather the prebendary of a Parish church in Wales, or its perpetual vicar in 1471, shortly before the completion of the Ritson carols. <sup>516</sup> This nativity carol contains no Latin in the Ritson version, yet the Bridgewater parchment has the burden 'Letabundus exultet fidelys chorus, Alleluia'. This burden is appropriately (for a nativity carol) taken from the opening of the liturgical Laetabundus sequence. The carol is found on the back of a Latin indenture which is dated August 8<sup>th</sup> 1471. It is between Master Maurice, the prebendary of the church of Llangvnllo<sup>517</sup>, and Sir Hugh, the perpetual vicar of the church, and Thomas ap Rees ap Davyd of that Parish conveying to the latter parties the church for five years at a rent of twenty shillings per annum.<sup>518</sup> Andrew Breeze suggests that the owner of the parchment must have been Master Maurice, the prebendary of the church,<sup>519</sup> due to his connection with Exeter Cathedral and his educated status (a degree in canon law from Oxford), suggesting that 'it was more probable that an Oxford-educated canon lawyer like Master

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>515</sup> 1478 was his last year of work, in which he only had the role of vicar choral

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>516</sup> Number 14a in Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>517</sup> Greene names this village as Llangoullo, but he is mistaken as this village does not exist. It is in fact Llangynllo.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>518</sup> Greene, R.L., *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 346

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>519</sup> The role of the prebendary was one of church administration.

Maurice would have a taste for English religious verse than Sir Hugh or Tomas'.<sup>520</sup> Breeze is underestimating the popularity of the carols in the Late Middle Ages amongst all strata of society, and indeed the impact of religion and religious verse among the laity. It is just as likely that the carol was noted down by Sir Hugh or Thomas as Maurice. Indeed, the probability of Maurice hearing the carol sung in the Cathedral may be higher than that of Hugh or Thomas, but the argument that Maurice would have had more interest in religious verse is unconvincing. Sir Hugh, the perpetual vicar, could well have noted the lyrics for use in parish worship at the time of nativity celebrations, whether set to a simpler musical version of that in Ritson, or set to popular melody. Indeed the second carol 'Wele is him, and, wele schal be' a cautionary tale warning the listener of the approach of the day of judgement, could have been used at any time of the liturgical year and complimented a sermon.

Whether or not the carol melodies contained any echoes of popular song is difficult to say, but the repetitive nature of the carols in their use of a burden, and their prolific use of English suggests they would have been effective in conveying the message to the laity. The fact that we know the place of these composers in the church, and can identify that these men were of similar status to those that we would perhaps expect to have had a hand in the non-notated sermon manuscripts of Example 1 (vicars, clerics and canons) might reveal the diverse musical work of men in such roles. Vicars and clerics were evidently active in different forms of carolling; the carols of Ritson being written by active members of the clergy for use in worship on an elaborate scale and less elaborate non notated carols such as those found in the manuscripts of example 1 indicative of their use on a smaller scale.

#### Liturgical quotations in the Carols of the Ritson Manuscript

The use of liturgical texts and musical quotations within the carols of Ritson is particularly striking. In her research on liturgical quotations in the late medieval carols, Beth Anne Zamzow discovered that eighteen of the 44 carols in this manuscript contained liturgical elements in both the music and text. She writes that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>520</sup> Breeze, Andrew, 'Two English carols in a Radnorshire deed of 1471 at Bridgewater, Somerset', *National Library of Wales Journal*, 31/2 (1999)

of those eleven carols in Ritson inscribed with the name of Richard Smert or Smert together with John Troulouffe, five incorporate liturgical music in some form; this represents 45 percent of an admittedly small sampling.<sup>521</sup>

A small sampling it may be, but still an important selection. These small portions of Liturgical musical and textual material repeated in the burdens of these carols would have been easily recalled by members of the congregation as they are continually repeated within the song structure. Bearing in mind the duty of the clergyman was to feed the masses the word of God, and save their souls, a method of repeating a message to the congregations in an engaging and memorable fashion would have been invaluable. The liturgical quotations found within Ritson carols can be seen in Table 36.

No. in MB <sup>522</sup>	First Line of Burden	Textual Quotation	Musical Quotation	Burden	Verses
76	Sing we to this merry company	v	v	English/Latin	English
77	Johannes assecretis divine sophie	v	x	Latin	Latin
78	Sonet laus cula	v	x	Latin	Latin/English
79	Nowell, nowell, nowell, nowell	v	x	English	English
80	Nowell, nowell, nowell, nowell	v	x	English/ French	English/French
81	Marvel not Joseph, on Mary mild	V	x	English	English
82	Man, be joyful, and mirth thou make	V	х	English	English
83	Make us merry this New Year	v	v	English	English
84	Salve, sancta parens	v	v	Latin	Latin
86	Ave, decus seculi	v	x	Latin	Latin
89	Regi canamus glorie	v	x	Latin	Latin
90	O radix Jesse	V	V	Latin	English
91	O clavis David	v	v	Latin	English

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>521</sup> Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa, 2000), 394

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>522</sup> Number in Stevens, John, ed., *Medieval Carols* (London, 1970)

92	Pray for us that we saved be	v	V	English	English/Latin
94	Worship we this holy day	٧	x	English	English
95	Te Deum laudamus	٧	٧	Latin/English	Latin/English
96	Letare, Cantuaria	V	x	Latin	Latin
97	Now make we joy in this fest	V	v	English/ Latin	English/ Latin
98	Jesu, fili virginis	V	v	Latin	English/ Latin
99	Spes mea in Deo est	V	x	Latin	English/ Latin
101	Jesu, fili Dei	V	v	Latin	English/ Latin
102	Tidings true there buth come new	V	x	English	English
103	Nascitur ex virgine	٧	V	Latin	English
104	Do well and dread no man	٧	x	English	English
105	Alleluia	٧	v	Latin	Latin/English
106	Pray for us	٧	x	Latin/English	Latin/English
107	Proface, welcome	٧	x	Latin /English	Latin/English
108	Jesus autem hodie	٧	V	Latin	English/Latin
109	Clangat tuba	٧	x	Latin	English/Latin
110	Man, assay	٧	x	English	English
112	Jesu, for thy mercy endless	٧	x	English	English
113	The best song as it seemeth me	٧	x	English/Latin	English/Latin
115	Pray for us thou prince of peace	V	x	English/Latin	English/Latin
117	The best rede that I can	٧	x	English	English
119	Blessed mote thou be, sweet Jesus	V	٧	English/Latin	English/Latin

Table 36: Liturgical quotations in the carols of the Ritson Manuscript  $^{\rm 523}$ 

There seems no particular distinction between the English or Latin carols in respect of liturgical quotations or musical quotations. Liturgical quotations, both textual and musical,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>523</sup> Summarised from research in: Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa, 2000)

although particularly prominent in Ritson, are also found amongst many of the other carols. Beth Zamzow in her doctoral dissertation writes:

In my estimation, approximately 35 percent of the repertory surviving with music has some type of musical resonance with the liturgy [quotation of chant]. The examples offered in this paper, ranging from the certainties to the questionable, occur in the later carols with more frequency:

2 of the 13 carols in the Trinity Roll, or 15 percent

11 of the 28 in the Selden manuscript, or 39 percent

14 of the 32 in the Egerton manuscript, or 44 percent

18 of the 44 in the Ritson manuscript, or 41 percent

In addition, of those eleven carols in Ritson inscribed with the name of Richard Smert or Smert together with John Troulouffe, five incorporate liturgical music in some form; this represents 45 percent of an admittedly small sampling.<sup>524</sup>

Zamzow describes these musical quotations of chant as appearing as direct quotations, amplified paraphrases or reduced paraphrases, and defines a quotation as 'the presence of four or more chant pitches incorporated into any voice part and at any location of a carol where the text of the chant has been incorporated'.<sup>525</sup> It would seem the most popular placement of textual and musical quotation is in the burdens and refrain lines, although quotations are found in many places within the carol structure. Zamzow identifies the carol 'For all Christen soules' from the Ritson Manuscript as containing a direct quotation of a Sarum chant: the introit 'Requiem aeternam'. Zamzow's reduction of this is shown in Example 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>524</sup> Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa, 2000), 394

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>525</sup> Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa, 2000), 367

5M 860+ Missa pro de hactis Do-Mu 78.18 PS. Te dreet yap ter de. do NG M NA M ot lux par-pea .. lu ce-at e. :5 Ret lu- ce-at e 15

Example 4: Zamzow's reduction of 'For all Christen soules' showing its direct quotation of the introit 'Requiem aeternam' <sup>526</sup>

This inclusion of liturgical quotations in the late medieval carols by composers such as Smert and Troufluffe who, living the liturgy every day of their lives would have had an excellent understanding of it and would have easily drawn on it within their writing, could suggest the use of carols by those learned in the church liturgy on both a musical and textual level in worship, perhaps challenging the commonly perpetuated view that the carols were only used in situations outside of worship, at feasts and other secular occasions. The inclusion of these small sections of chant and textual references to the liturgy and other acts of worship within a predominantly vernacular lyric could act as subliminal prompts to the listening or indeed participating, congregation (both laity and clergy) in a semiotic sense. The prescriptive nature of the liturgy perhaps makes the inclusion of them unlikely in formal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>526</sup> Image taken directly from: Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa, 2000), 257

worship, but it is worth consideration. Parishioners would spend their entire lives immersed in the sights and sounds of liturgical worship. As Duffy notes:

Ecclesiastical law and the vigilance of bishop, arch-deacon, and parson sought to ensure as a minimum regular and sober attendance at matins, Mass, and evensong on Sundays and feasts, and annual confession and communion at Easter. But the laity expected and gave far more in the way of involvement with the action and symbolism of the liturgy than those minimum requirements suggest'.<sup>527</sup>

Adding some of these familiar snippets of chant, and indeed liturgical lyric, would connect them through these carols back to the familiar ritual of liturgical worship for both the clergy and the laity.

#### The Use of Latin and Liturgical Quotation in the Carol/Sermon Manuscripts

Of the manuscripts in Table 34, only three of the ten contain carols with Latin lines; this can be seen in Table 37. Of the total number of carols contained within all ten manuscripts approximately eighteen percent contain Latin.

Ms	Date	Carols <sup>528</sup>	No. With Latin Lines
GB-Ed Advocates 18.7.21	1372	149a, 155a, 157d, 271	0 of 4
GB-Ob Bodley 26	c. xiv	12a + possible second carol	0
GB-Cul Additional 5943	c.xv1/4	151c, 349, 149d, 451	0
GB-Ctc R.14.26	c. xv 1/2	377	0
GB-Cul ff.5.48	c. xv 1/2	456	0
GB-Cgc 383/603	c. 1450	114b, 187A, 418, 441, 452, 453, 455, 470, App., No. ii	2 of 9
GB-Lbl Harley 5396	c. 1455	36b, 80, 136A	2 of 3
GB-Lbl Sloane 1584	c. xv 4/4	446	0
GB-Lbl Lansdowne 379	c. xvi 1/2	43, 94	1 of 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>527</sup> Duffy, Eamon, *The Stripping of the Altars* (Yale, 2005), 11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>528</sup> Numbers correspond to number in: Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935)

#### c. xvi 1/4 95a, 472

#### Table 37: The inclusion of Latin lines

The lives of lay people in the late Middle Ages was dictated around the ebb and flow of the liturgical year, as well as other events of worship in the local church i.e. births, deaths and marriages. The local parishioner's belief in salvation would have been a very real concept. The importance of regularly attending church and participating in the mass in order to reduce their time in purgatory after their death was a very real fear for those living in the medieval period. The inclusion of sacred subjects and lines from the liturgy found in carols would therefore seem perfectly understandable. Even if the parishioner did not necessarily understand the meaning of the Latin text, they would certainly have been able to remember the key repeated phrases they heard on a daily basis and relate them to certain services and liturgical events. We can see the depth of the lay knowledge of the liturgy in documents detailing the provision of masses to be sung after their deaths, and the level of detail that they employ in these instructions. Of course, these observances may have been written with the aid of a clergyman in order to ensure the correct choice of masses and fasts, but nevertheless show the importance that the laity placed on ensuring that particular parts of the liturgy were performed on their behalf after their death.

As with the musically notated carol manuscripts, the majority of Latin is found in the carols from the middle of the fifteenth century onwards. Latin throughout the fifteenth century was beginning to lose its exclusivity as the language of the educated alongside the slowly increasing literacy of the laity and 'as the number of laymen able to read grew in many communities and even in many households, so too did demand for reading matter, and well-to-do households and larger bodies such as gilds acquired collections of material which might include both entertainment and uplift, romances...alongside saints' lives and sermons'.<sup>530</sup> One of the most popular of these books were 'Books of Hours'; so popular they were mass produced in vast numbers with the advent of the printing press.<sup>531</sup> As Duffy notes, 'What is so remarkable ... is that we are dealing here not with an English but with a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>529</sup> Duffy, Eamon, *The Stripping of the Altars* (Yale, 2005)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>530</sup> Duffy, Eamon, *The Stripping of the Altars* (Yale, 2005), 69

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>531</sup> The printing press was invented in 1440. By the end of the fifteenth century printing was widespread across Europe and well established in England.

Latin book'.<sup>532</sup> The lay person was not only familiar with the sound of the Latin he was hearing and repeating in public worship, but an increasing number were now able to access it in written form in their private devotions; how much of the Latin was actually understood is debateable, but their association with it in public worship could have given them at least a basic comprehension of meaning. The circulation of such material would have begun to enhance the literate laity's relationship with the Latin language throughout the fifteenth century, and may therefore have been a contributing factor in its inclusion in the later carols.

Interestingly, the carol 157d in GB-Ed 18.7.21, 'Maiden and Moder, cum and se' appears in a further two manuscripts, and one early printed source.<sup>533</sup> The chronologically latest source, 'Huntington Library, Christmas carolles newely Inprynted' contains the same carol but with a modified burden with Latin lines.<sup>534</sup> The burden reads 'Gaudeamus synge we In hoc sacro tempore; Puer nobis natus est Ex Maria virgine'. This inter-changeability between English and Latin in this carol demonstrates the flexibility of language in the Middle Ages, particularly the flexible use of Latin. It may also be an indication of performance context; the inclusion of Latin giving the carol more gravitas for use in worship than the use of the vernacular. The Latin lines within these carols are as illustrated in Table 38.

Ms	Carol <sup>535</sup>	Latin Lines
BL, Harley 5396	36b (Nativity)	Burden: Puer nobis natus est De
		virgine Maria
		Last line of stanzas:
		S1.Dicam vobis quia
		S2.Sua morte pia
		S3.Sua mente pia
		S4.Teste profecia
		S5.Tua prece pia
BL, Harley 5396	80 (Nativity)	Burden: Christo paremus

<sup>532</sup> Duffy, Eamon, *The Stripping of the Altars* (Yale, 2005), 213

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>533</sup> This carol discussed in the Chapter 4: "That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth-century carol, a music of the people?"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>534</sup> This source is a collection of printed pamphlets, five in total. Pamphlet one is complete and contains four carols. It was printed in London by Richard Kele (d.1552) and dates from c. 1545. The other four incomplete pamphlets contain a further 19 carols between them. For a facsimile of the complete collection see: Bliss Reed, Edward, *Christmas Carols Printed in the Sixteenth Century* (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1932), and for further information on the carols and the pamphlets composition see: Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Oxford, 1977), 340-341

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>535</sup> Numbers correspond to the numbering in: Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Oxford, 1977),
 340-341

		canticam: 'Excelsis Gloria'
BL, Lansdowne 379	94 (Nativity)	Burden: Mirabilem misterium: The
		Son of God ys man becum
CGC, 383/603	114b (St Thomas of Canterbury)	Burden: A,a,a,a Nunc gaudet
		ecclesia
		Stanzas end:
		S1. Cum magna iniuria
		S2. Demonis potencia
		S3. Feruentes insania
		S4. In sua malicia.
		S5. Ferens mortis tedia
		S6. Sine contumilia
		S7. Optans celi gaudia
		S8. Pergens ad celestia
		S9. Contra Regis consilia
CGC, 383/603	187a (Virgin)	Burden: Virgo, rosa virginum,
		Tuum precare Filium
		Each stanza ends:
		S1. Iam concepit Filium
		S2. Ab omni labe criminum
		S3. Surexit die tercia
		S4. Deus super omnia
		S5. Ad celi palacia
		S6. In perhenni Gloria

Table 38: Latin lines within the carols of Table 34.

## A Benedicamus Substitute and Processional Hymn?

One area of worship already suggested as a potential situation for the inclusion of carols is in the role of Benedicamus substitute. F.L. Harrison advanced a theory in the 1950s that the sacred carols superseded the role of the conductus, acting as a substitute for the Benedicamus on a number of festivals.<sup>536</sup> He argued that:

'The disappearance of the conductus in the second half of the fourteenth century and the appearance of the votive antiphons make it clear that this could not have been the main function of the votive antiphon... the words of some polyphonic carols... make it likely that the sacred carol of the fifteenth century took over from the conductus the role of Benedicamus substitute on certain festivals'.<sup>537</sup>

The Benedicamus Domino was an integral part of medieval devotion, concluding each of the hours of the office so 'At least eight or nine times during the course of daily worship, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>536</sup> Harrison, F.L, 'Benedicamus, Conductus, Carol: a newly discovered source', *Acta Musicologica*, xxxvii (1965), 40-41

<sup>537</sup> Harrison, F.L., Music in Medieval Britain (London, 1963), 416

versicle Benedicamus Domino ("Let us bless the Lord") sounded from the choir and corridors of a medieval church... along with its response *Deo gratias* ("Thanks be to God")'.<sup>538</sup> This 'Deo Gratias' response was another confirming element of Harrison's theory. <sup>539</sup> This response is found often within the carol texts (mainly those for the Christmas season). He writes:

The texts of some polyphonic carols strongly suggest that this was their function. The famous 'Agincourt' carol *Deo Gratias Anglia* has the refrain- line *Deo gratias*. The Latin carol *Deo gratias persolvamus* in the Selden manuscript ends with *Benedicamus Domino, Deo gratias...* both the burden and the last verse of *Novo profuse gaudio...* end with *Benedicamus Domino...*<sup>540</sup>

Of these examples, all are extant with musical notation and are preserved in three separate manuscripts: GB-Ctc 0.3.58, GB-Ob Bodley 26 and Lbl Egerton 3307. All three manuscripts contain a number of carols, but only one with the 'Deo Gratias' is found in each. Harrison's discovery of the carols in 9-E-19, a manuscript from the middle of the fourteenth century, advanced his theory. The manuscript contained a cluster of seventeen Benedicamus settings, followed by four carols, leading Harrison to believe that they were included as Benedicamus substitutes in this setting. Where Harrison's theory falls down, is in the labelling of the material within this manuscript. The seventeen Benedicamus settings are labelled as so, but the carols are labelled as carols, and at no point do they refer in their texts to any element of the Benedicamus. Harrison therefore seems to have two conflicting arguments; he argues for the Benedicamus substitution of carols on the basis that textual references are made to this section of the liturgy, yet conflicts this by arguing that despite there being no textual references to the Benedicamus in 9-E-19 the carols would still have been used for this purpose. Unfortunately no other clusters of carols in juxtaposition with Benedicamus settings are extant in order to confirm Harrison's theory. In Ritson we find headings for specific seasonal uses for the carols, and Egerton reveals an underlying organisation demonstrated in its grouping together of political carols, but no clusters of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>538</sup> Anne Walters Robertson, "Benedicamus Domino": The Unwritten Tradition', *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, Vol.41, No.1 (Spring, 1988), 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>539</sup> The hours of the office are: vespers, compline, matins, lauds, prime, terce, sext, none

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>540</sup> Harrison, F.L., *Music in Medieval Britain* (London, 1963), 417

carols with the distinctive 'Deo Gratias' ending. Harrison's argument, whilst compelling, requires more primary evidence.

Rossell Hope Robbins made a strong case for the carol as a processional hymn based on his examination of the polyphonic carol manuscripts. Robins believed that the placement of the carols within these manuscripts may provide evidence of their use, noting that:

With the exception of the Trinity roll, the three other polyphonic manuscripts include Latin antiphons from the Sarum and other processionals. In Egerton MS.3307, the Latin processional hymns are grouped together in one part of the manuscript, but in MS. Arch. Selden they are interspersed among the English carols. The juxtaposition in MS. Arch. Selden is strong presumptive evidence that the compilers made little distinction in use, else the items would certainly been rearranged for more convenient handling in choir practice. In the Ritson MS., the hymns are intermingled with secular songs... almost all of the balance of the manuscript can be explained by its relation to processional rites.<sup>541</sup>

He also cites the carols' quotation of hymn texts in their burdens or refrains as further evidence of their processional use in the manuscripts: Ctc 1230, Ob 26, Lbl 5665, Lbl 2593, Ob.e.1, Obac 354 and Cu Ee.1.12. The carol may well have been used in processions during worship, and the evidence certainly points towards it, but as Stevens notes, 'the earliest carols...were written as 'popular litanies' for use in ecclesiastical procession, but any procession, civic or courtly, provided a suitable setting.'<sup>542</sup>

The use of headings found within Ritson coupled with Harrison's evidence, the liturgical quotations, Robbins' compelling evidence for the use of the carol as a processional hymn and with the text and music identified by Zamzow, seems to suggest a place for the carol within the liturgy, but as Steven's notes, we must be cautious as 'until more evidence becomes available the question must remain open as to whether the medieval carol was admitted into the liturgy or kept peripheral'.<sup>543</sup> The evidence however, certainly seems to

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>541</sup> Robbins, Rossell Hope, 'Middle English Carols as Processional Hymns', *Studies in Philology*, 56 (1959), 562
 <sup>542</sup> Stevens, John, *The Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), xiv

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>543</sup> John Stevens and Dennis Libby. "Carol." In Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online,

http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/04974 (accessed July 20, 2012).

point towards its inclusion in some areas of the liturgy, particularly responsorial sections and processional elements.

## The 'Unsuitable Carol' in Sermon Manuscripts

We must also remember that liturgical quotations are also found in what could be termed as 'unsuitable' carols for liturgical substitution. The words 'Deo Gratias' for example are found in the burden of the Agincourt Carol, which due to its political text would be inappropriate for use as a Benedicamus Domino substitute. The 'Deo Gratias' phrase would have been well known, so its use in carols not intended for use in worship would not seem unusual. Even some of the secular carols use Latin phrases, as in 'Kyrie so Kyrie' from the manuscript GB-BL-Sloane 2593 for example.<sup>544</sup> This carol is narrated in the female voice, and tells the tale of the narrator's dalliance with Jankyn, which inevitably ends with her pregnant. Greene classifies this carol as amorous, but the cautionary element of the tale lends to it a moralistic tone. The carol cleverly follows the order of the Mass, and may have been a cleric's humorous way of remembering the key points. As Duffy notes:

Men and women who could not read, sought to remember the saints' days and other festivals by which the year was mapped out, and resorted to mnemonic devices to imprint the pattern of the year in their minds, The most common of these devices was the "Cisio-Janus", a series of nonsensical rhymes, at first in Latin but later in English, which listed the major feasts of each month.'<sup>545</sup>

This carol could in some way be in homage to this mnemonic tradition. The transcription of the carol reads:

'Kyrie, so kyrie,' Jankyn syngyt merir With 'aleyson.'

As I went on Yol Day in owre prosessyon,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>544</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 309

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>545</sup> Duffy, Eamon, *The Stripping of the Altars* (Yale, 2005), 49

Knew I joly Jankyn be his mery ton. Kyrieleyson

Jankyn began the Offys on the Yol Day, And yyt me thynkyt it dos me good, so Merie gan he say, 'Kyrieleyson.'

Jankyn red the Pystyl ful fayre and ful wel, And yyt me thinkyt it dos me good, as Eure haue I sel [good fortune]. Kyrieleyson.

Jankyn at the Sanctus crakit a merie note, And yyt me thinkyt it dos me good: I payid for his cote. Kyrieleyson.

Jankyn crakit notes, an hunderid on A knot, And ytt he hakkyt hem smallere than Wortes to the pot. Kyrieleyson.

Jankyn at the Agnus beryt the paxbrede; He twynkelid, but sayd nowt, and on myn fot he trede. Kyrieleyson. Benedicamus Domino: Cryst fro schame Me schylde; De gracias therto: alas, I go with chylde! Kyrieleyson.<sup>546</sup>

The carol not only speaks in layers of liturgical function, morality and amusement, but also gives the reader an insight into musical practice. The burden repeatedly tells us that Jankyn sung merrily with 'aleyson'; aleyson most probably being the girl's name 'Alison' and therefore a pun on the Latin 'Eleyson'.<sup>547</sup> In stanza two, we are told that Jankyn is recognisable 'By his merry ton', in stanza four we are told that 'Jankyn at the Sanctus crakit a merie note', and in stanza five Jankyn crakit notes, an hunderid on a knot'. The prowess of Jankyn and his ability not only to trill a merry note, but also to be able to trill a hundred at a time, is conveyed as an impressive skill, and makes him even more of an attractive prospect to the young women.<sup>548</sup> Although this carol has no extant musical notation, its prominent musical theme running throughout may suggest its association with a musical setting.

Five manuscripts containing theological material or sermons are found to contain carols that would perhaps seem unexpected alongside sacred material, and would perhaps seem unsuitable for use in any area of worship, let alone as a 'Benedicamus Domino' substitute. Table 39 shows these manuscripts and their carol contents.

Ms	CAROLS <sup>549</sup>	CONTENTS RELATED TO PREACHING
GB-Lbl 1584	446- Amorous	Theological material. Instructions for Deacons and Sub deacons. Easter sermon. Misc. material.
GB-Lbl A.XXV	95a-Nativity 472- Humorous (later addition to the manuscript)	Theological material

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>546</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 309

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>547</sup> 'Eleyson' translates as 'Mercy'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>548</sup> Kurath, Hans, *Middle English Dictionary:C.6* (Michigan, 1960),706, describes the meaning of 'crakit' as 'To utter (words, speech, etc)...to trill, quaver; trill (a note); also sing'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>549</sup> Numbers correspond to their number in Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935). Carols are also labelled as of Greene's classifications for consistency.

GB-Cul 5943	151c - Lullaby 349-Moral Counsel 149d-Lullaby	Latin Sermons. Connection with archdeacon and Somerset vicars
	451 – Amorous.	
GB-Cul ff.5.48	456- Amorous	Instructions for parish priests
GB-Cgc	114b-Nativity	Misc. contents suggesting a cleric's book prior
83/603	187A-Virgin	to taking orders.
	418-convivial carol	
	441-Amorous	
	452-Amorous	
	453-Amorous	
	455-Amorous	
	470 -Humorous	
	App., No. ii-Nativity	

Table 39: Sermon manuscripts containing secular carols

GB-Cul 5943, a manuscript that was, by 10th December 1418, the property of a Carthusian monk from the Priory of Henton in Somerset, but originally in the possession of the vicar, Thomas Turke. Thomas is noted to be the 'former' perpetual vicar of Biere (also in Somerset). The manuscript contains, alongside the carols and some French, Latin and English songs: a variety of Latin sermons, a Latin poem, Latin religious tracts, Richard Rolle's *Emendatio Vitae* and *Melum Contemplativorum,* eclipses of the sun and moon between the dates 1415 and 1462, Latin theological material, memoranda, accounts that relate to an archdeacon and a number of Somerset vicars and a Latin and English note.<sup>550</sup> The manuscript includes two lullaby carols and a carol on how to conduct oneself with discretion; all three of these can easily be seen as suitable for a manuscript of this kind, sitting comfortably alongside the Latin sermons. The inclusion of the carol 'Would God that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>550</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 341

hyt were so' on the other hand, seems rather out of place; the text being in the female voice, and speaking of unrequited love.<sup>551</sup>

The lullaby carol 'Lullay, lullay: as I lay' found on f. 169, is the only one that is notated within this manuscript. The carol starts to convey a story; story telling is so often found in carols and often overlooked in academic writing.<sup>552</sup> This carol would seem entirely appropriate in worship due to its sacred text. It is in a different hand to the polyphonic music within this manuscript. It is, as would be expected, in triple time; the burden beginning and ending on C, with the verse beginning and ending on D. This carol shows a particular musical connection with the lyrics. In this short and mainly syllabic piece there is a glimpse of sympathetic writing. The only prominent melismatic phrases come on the words 'my longing' and 'child rocking'; the sense of rocking created by the final cadential melismatic figure may be entirely accidental, but the syllabic nature of the rest of the piece would suggest otherwise. The emphasis on the 'longing' felt by the singer is also an effective musical device.<sup>553</sup> Both these phrases can be seen in Example 5.



Example 5: 'Lullay, lullay'554

There are an additional eighteen notated pieces, not in carol form, within this manuscript.<sup>555</sup> Amongst these items are a number of other songs in French, English and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>551</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 306

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>552</sup> See Chapter 4: 'That we with merth mowe savely synge': The fifteenth-century carol, a music of the people?' for further discussion of these ideas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>553</sup> One cannot compare whether the words of subsequent verses took on such significance with the melodic line, as only this verse survives.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>554</sup> Transcription as found in, Stevens, John, ed. *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 110

Latin, and interestingly a number of erotic traditional songs in English. What makes the carol form stand out amongst these however, is its participatory nature, which suggests the communal singing and enjoyment of such pieces. Many carols seem to encourage participatory singing and revelry. The carol by Smert, 'Nowell, nowell: Die vous garde' for example seems to encourage singing. It calls at the end of each of its verses respectively: 'Which causeth you for to sing', 'Wherefore sing we all at-a-braid' and 'And sing with us now joyfully'.<sup>556</sup> It is not only in the notated carols that we find these references to participatory singing, other carols call 'Nowe lete us syng and mery be!'<sup>557</sup>, 'Syng we to the Trinite!'<sup>558</sup>, and 'Alle ye mowen of joye synge'.<sup>559</sup> In Ritson, 'Sing we to this merry company' seems to epitomise a sense of communal enjoyment, and participation through its exclamations at the end of each verse respectively: 'Therefore we sing to thee', 'Right causeth us all to sing to thee' and 'With joy and gladness sing we to thee'.<sup>560</sup> These calls to those that are within this so called 'merry company' suggest a sense of informality despite the complex polyphony and setting of worship.

This eclectic mix of material in GB-Cul 5943 shows a working, ever evolving manuscript where material that needs to be remembered, for whatever reason, is recorded. The supposed connection of this manuscript to Thomas Turke, the vicar of Biere, assumes the importance of this material to him in his life and work, and the inclusion of the erotic songs and amorous carols alongside the Latin sermons suggested a clergy that was well aware of life beyond the church, and the need to connect with the laity on base levels. It could be argued that the erotic and amorous material was there merely for the vicar's personal pleasure, but would it then seem appropriate to hand a manuscript such as this on to a Carthusian monk? The Carthusian order was one of solitude and confinement from the outside world, which could initially make the gift of this particular manuscript with its 'worldly texts' to a Carthusian friar seem an odd choice. However, there is a danger of forgetting that monks were men first and foremost and their sacred duties and choice of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>555</sup> For a facsimile of this manuscript see: Rastall, Richard and Hewitt, Leslie, *A Fifteenth-century Songbook* (Leeds, 1973).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>556</sup> Stevens, John, ed. *Medieval* Carols (London, 1970), 67

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>557</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 35

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>558</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 241

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>559</sup> Greene, R.L, ed. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 139

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>560</sup> Stevens, ed. 'Medieval Carols', in *Musica Britannica*, Vol.iv (London, 1970), 62

lifestyle did not eradicate their personalities and memories of life before taking holy orders. The gift of some erotic and amorous material may therefore have been a welcome gift. The other contents would have been more appropriate however and may have had some value in this monastic setting. <sup>561</sup>

The manuscript GB-Gc 383/603, is particularly interesting in regard to the inclusion of 'unsuitable' preaching material. As discussed previously,<sup>562</sup> it seems to have been 'intended for the use of clerks proceeding to orders since the scriptural and liturgical sources are very numerous.'<sup>563</sup> The manuscript holds a total of eight carols; the sacred carols outnumbered two to six. Why would the compiler favour these secular lyrics? Scholars have often described carols as written by clerics for their own amusement; however, placing them in a manuscript alongside instructional material seems to lend them more significance. Rather than presuming they are only for the amusement of the clerics, perhaps there is a possibility that they have heard these in the context of preaching and committed them to paper or perhaps due to the often cautionary tales of resulting pregnancy after indulging in carnal pleasures, they may have served as subtle warnings to these young men.

The carol 'Alas, als, the wyle!'; seen in Example 6 within the original manuscript, and beginning a third of the way down the page, is one of four carols with similar subject matter within this manuscript.<sup>564</sup> It tells the story of a maiden being seduced by Jack (a commonly used name for such a character), narrated in the female voice, and concludes with her pregnancy. The carol is graphic in its carnal detail and would again raise the question of its suitability for inclusion in a cleric's manuscript alongside Latin sermons and theological material. The carol reads:

Alas, als, the wyle! Thout Y on no gyle, So haue Y god chence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>561</sup> For more information on the Carthusian Order, see: Luxford, Julian, M., *Studies in Carthusian Monasticism in the Late Middle Ages* (2009, np)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>562</sup> See Chapter 5: 'Women in Late Medieval Carols'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>563</sup> Miner, John Nelson, *The Grammar Schools of Medieval England: A.F. Leach in Historiographical Perspective* (Canada, 1990), 139

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>564</sup> A discussion of a second carol of similar subject is found in Chapter 5: 'Women in late Medieval Carols', and can be seen preceding 'Alas, als, the wyle!' on the manuscript page in Example 6.

#### Alas, ales, the wyle

#### That eur Y cowed daunce!

Ladd Y the daunce a yssomur Day;

Y made smale trippus[light steps], soth for to say.

Jak, our haly-watur clerk com be the way,

And he loked me vpon; he thout hit was gay.

Thout yc on ne gyle.

Jack oure haly-watur sclerk, the yong Strippelyng,

For the chesone of [because of] me he com to the ryng [circle of the carole],

And he tripped on my to and made aTwymkelyng;

Euer he can ner; he sparet for no thynge.

Thout Y on no gyle.

Jak, ic wot, preyede in my fayre face;

He thout me ful werly [cautious], so haue Y god Grace;

As we turndun owre dance in a narw place,

Jak bed [offered] me on the mouth; a cussynge ther was.

Thout Y on no gyle.

Jack tho began to rowne [whisper] in my ere: 'Loke that thou be priuey, and graunte That thou the bere; A peyre with glouus ic ha to thyn were.' 'Gramercy, Kacke!' was myn answere. Thoute yc on no gyle. Sone after euensong [sunset] Jak me mette: 'Com hom aftur thy glouus that I the yhette.' Wan ic to his chamber com, doun he me sette; From hym mytte Y nat go wan we were mette. Thout Y on no gyle.

Schetus and chalonus [blankets], ic wot, a were yspredde; Forsothe tho Jak and yc wenten to bedde; He prikede, and he pransede; nolde he neuer lynne [ceased]; Yt was the murgust nyt that eur Y cam ynne. Thout I on no gyle.

Wan Jak had don, tho he rong the bell; Al nyght ther he made me to dwele; Of trewe we haddun yserued the reaggeth [ragged] deuel of helle; Of othur smale burdus kepY nout to telle. Thout Y on no gyle.

The Monday at prime Y com hom, as ic wene; Mwth Y my dame, coppud [peevish] and kene: 'ey, thou stronge strumpeth, ware hastu bene? Thy trippyng and the dauncyng, wel it wel be sen.' Thout Y on no gyle.

Euer bi on and by on y damme reched me clot [clout]; Eur Y ber it priuey wyle tha I mouth, Tyl my gurdul aros, my wombe wax out; Eul therinne es ern eur it wole out.

## Thout Y on no gyle.<sup>565</sup>

Despite its raw narrative, it is essentially a tale of morality rather than the 'amorous' label that it is given by Greene. It displays an awareness of the human condition and a connection to the life of the laity and a sense of connection to the reality of their lives. Whether moralistic tales such as these would have been used merely for the amusement of clerics, or as narratives to warn a listening congregation of the resulting consequences of immoral actions; the fact remains that alongside sacred theological and sermon material sit lyrics such as this carol.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>565</sup> Transcription taken from: Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 307-308



Example 6: GB-Cgc 383/603, page 41.

It is not only in these two manuscripts with connections to monastic houses, priests or containing preaching or theological material that we find 'unsuitable' carols. This is also the case in GB-Lbl 1584, which contains the carol 'So well ys me begone' which is written in the hand of John Gysborn, the canon of Coverham. The carol is written in the female voice and tells of her love for a soldier. Interestingly, the only other piece of prose in this manuscript is

also a song of love in English. The inclusion of two love songs in a manuscript predominantly occupied with theological material and instructions for Deacons and subdeacons and an Easter sermon and written by a canon would initially perhaps seem at odds; one would wonder what use the love songs would have been to a compiler of such academic sacred material, but as demonstrated through the exploration of the manuscripts in this chapter, the juxtaposition of such diverse material is commonplace.

#### <u>Conclusion</u>

There can be no doubt that the late medieval carol was indeed a tool for worship in some context; the carol 'Honnd by Honnd' positioned between two sermons with its possible link in content to the preceding sermon, provides clear evidence that carols were considered appropriate to place alongside sermon material and were perhaps used as a preaching tool. The considerable number of sermon manuscripts that also contain carols within in them in some context would also suggest this. Thanks to Zamzow's research, evidence of liturgical elements in the carols is shown to be abundant. The carols were evidently closely connected with the ritual of worship from a textual perspective, if not in practice. The liturgy seeped into every aspect of the lives of the lay person and the clergy just as it seeps into the body of many of the carols.

The use of the carol in the liturgy is less clear however. Harrison's exploration of the carol as a Benedicamus Domino substitute is viable theory, although more primary evidence is required in order to prove that this was common practice. The liturgical quotations found within the Ritson manuscript, combined with its clear classification of the carols into liturgical seasons, goes some way to connect the carol with the liturgy and use in worship, particularly the Christmas season, rather than the more commonly held notion of carols as merely devices for entertainment at feasts or the personal amusement of clerics, and Robbins' compelling theory of the carol as processional hymn adds yet another possibility for the carol's place within ecclesiastical ceremony. Despite these possible uses, and fragments of evidence however, more evidence is still required in order to understand the role of the carol, if any, in liturgical practice.

It would appear that the time for assuming the late medieval carol was merely an amusement for clerics or simply a Christmas entertainment is now over; this genre needs to be appreciated for its diversity of use in the fifteenth century, and musicologists need to now look beyond the stereotypes at greater possibilities of use for this diverse genre.

## **Conclusion**

The dominant theme throughout this thesis is undoubtedly the need for the late medieval carol to be contextualised within a wider research framework than it has been previously in order to reassess its role and importance in late medieval society and show its diversity as a genre; demonstrating its use in all strata of society, rather than the popular view of the form as a simple amusement for educated clerics. This study has addressed the subject by engaging not only with the carols extant with musical notation, the main musicological approach to the genre in previous published research, but also with those carols that survive without music, thus valuing them as equally important in terms of understanding the genre as a whole. Both those carols extant with and without musical notation have been placed within significant English social, political and religious contexts in order to create a fuller picture of this important insular musical form of the late Middle Ages. In order for this to be successfully achieved, a combination of several research methodologies has been applied to the research: a traditional empirical method in order to define the genre, an ethnomusicological approach in order to understand the form in wider social, religious and political contexts, and a process of approaching text and music from a gender perspective in order to better understand the place of women within the carols. This new, combined methodological approach allows the carol to be viewed from a variety of angles within one study, thus revealing its multifaceted nature.

Combining these methodologies has shown the carol to be a far more diverse genre than has previously been portrayed: often thought of as a form created and nurtured by educated male clerics, this thesis has demonstrated through the exploration of individual carols and manuscripts that the carol was much more than this, having a far more diverse place in late medieval society than has previously been portrayed. The exploration of carols in manuscripts such as Egerton, Fayrfax and Henry VIII for example, has established the carol as a high-minded genre with a place within the royal court and other aristocratic circles, being penned by prolific composers such as Cornysh with his four carols of the Fayrfax and Henry VIII manuscripts: 'Woefully arrayed', 'Hoyday, hoyday, jolly rutterkin', 'You and I and Amyas' and 'Whiles life or breath', and Browne with his two carols of the Fayrfax manuscript

'Margaret Meek' and 'Woefully arrayed'. Equally as important as these carols originating from an aristocratic cultural sphere however, we find through the study of monophonic carols such as 'Nova, nova' with its dance-style melody or secular carols in the vernacular without extant musical notation, that the carol was also a form that used popular melodies and would seem to have existed just as comfortably within an oral framework as a written one. The carols have been shown within this thesis not to have existed exclusively for the educated and monastic classes in society, but shared by all social classes in their various polyphonic and monophonic forms in a much freer way than has previously been thought. 'Nova, nova' also demonstrated the connection between carols and drama with its use of several speaking voices, showing itself to be a mini liturgical drama; indeed, many carols are plays in themselves. The carol genre has been shown in this thesis to have possible uses in liturgical plays, whilst also being equally at home in the dramas and maskings of the royal court of Henry VIII.

A manuscript such as Ritson with its classification of the carols into liturgical seasons has shown tantalising possibilities for connection to the liturgy, and the manuscripts such as GB-Ob Bodley 26 and GB-Cul Additional 5943 that contain both carols and sermons could point to their use within other aspects of worship. Their appearance in non-musically notated pocket-book style manuscripts rather than large monastic or royal manuscripts, seem to point to a lost body of monophonic carol melodies that leaked into all strata of society thus again demonstrating that carols were not exclusively for the monastic and educated classes, but shared by all social classes in their various polyphonic and monophonic forms.

The insular nature of the genre, alongside its lack of named composers, has, perhaps unfairly, discouraged scholars from undertaking substantial detailed, published research. This, coupled with the apparent completeness of both Stevens's and Greene's editions, seems to have almost suspended further detailed research for a number of decades, suggesting a finality in terms of carol research. This study has demonstrated that this is far from the truth. Greene's publication, although an important resource, is very much a product of its time, and a fresh approach to some of his categorisations is timely in order to reassess the classifications of female centred and political carols in particular; both genres that have been demonstrated in this thesis to be more complex than has previously been portrayed. This study has established for example, that Greene's classifications of carols

concerning women were too generalised. The carols of women have instead been demonstrated in this thesis to be far more multifaceted than Greene presents; existing in a number of sub-categories rather than, for example, large groupings of 'amorous carols' or 'carols of women'. The range of carols identified within this chapter that: speak directly to women, speak in a female voice, are about women or contain an amount of female narrative, are testament to the involvement of women in some capacity, whether as subject, audience, performers or composers in the world of the medieval carols. The extent of the involvement and significance of women in the context of the medieval carol should not, in face of this evidence then, be underestimated.

The classification of political carols has also been challenged in this research and is shown to be more complex than previous portrayals; the inclusion of carols addressing the Saints George and Thomas of Canterbury within this grouping, for example, was a very necessary adjustment in order to better understand their inclusion, and indeed placement, within the manuscripts. The importance of the placement of the political carols was particularly apparent in the significant observation of the close grouping of the political carols within the Egerton manuscript which had, nestled at the heart of them, a carol to Saint Thomas. Previous scholarship had not noted the close grouping of political carols in this manuscript, an aspect that might strengthen suggestion of its use in an establishment with strong political carols have also revealed the beginnings of a growing sense of nationhood in England in the fifteenth century with their subject matter and use of terminology such as, 'English nation', 'England be glad' and 'England, raise up thy lusty hearts'; a concept that some scholars have argued was only in its infancy in the sixteenth century.

The carol, although treated in isolation from other genres in previous research, has been shown here to be a musical form that grew and developed in structure and style alongside other music of the period, something clearly seen when it was examined alongside the motet of the fifteenth century. It was also, importantly, demonstrated to be a genre integrated into a broader musical spectrum of forms and styles; one set in manuscripts alongside sacred, secular and liturgical continental and English music, often borrowing lines from hymns, and musical and textual quotations from the liturgy. This confirms that as a

genre, it was clearly assimilated with other musical forms of the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, and as result of this observation, should now be seen, and performed to advantage, in context alongside these other genres today (indeed the carols need to be performed far more than they are currently whether alongside other genres or not, as apart from some of the popular Christmas repertoire, they are rarely heard).

The carol has been revealed to be a far more complex, multifaceted genre than previous scholarship has shown; something that has been successfully redressed in this thesis. It has been revealed as an important, indigenous musical form that has the potential to give a far greater insight into its place in medieval society, and indeed medieval society itself, than has formerly been understood. This thesis has challenged previous academic thought and revealed a number of possibilities for the carol's use: as a tool for worship, a vehicle for English nationalism, a dramatic device and a popular song, as well as a genre that provides us with a window into lost vernacular melodies and the perception of women in fifteenthcentury England. This thesis has advanced the understanding of the place of the English carol in late medieval society and provides a strong foundation for the development of further research in this area. The carols are found in approximately 138 manuscripts, of which this study has addressed 38. A continuing research project that allows a thorough examination of all of these manuscripts using the combined methodologies utilised within this thesis and building on the research from within this study, would undoubtedly produce further valuable evidence that would enable the carol to be placed in even clearer social, political and religious contexts than this constraints of this thesis allows.

# Appendix

**Bibliography of Primary Sources** 

Full Manuscript Reference	Sigla	Abbreviation	Date	Musically notated carols	Contents, Layout and Structure	Carols and the first line of verse one <sup>1</sup>
Bridgwater Corporation Muniments, 123	GB-Bbcm 123		15 <sup>th</sup> century	x	Structure: one length of parchment, measuring 76 x 254mm. Layout and contents: recto contains 'A Latin indenture, dated 8 August 1471, between one Master Maurice, prebendary of the prebendal church of Llangoullo, in the diocese of St. Davids, and Sir Hugh, perpetual vicar of that church, and one Thomas ap Rees ap Davyd of that parishScribbles in the hand of the carols: 'hay hay w'/ 'a and'. <sup>2</sup>	14a: Now well may we myrthys make 362:A domusday we schull ysee
Cambridge, Gonville and Caius College, Manuscript 383/603	GB-Cgc MS 383/603	MS 383/603	14 <sup>th</sup> -15 <sup>th</sup> century	V	<ul> <li>Structure: Paper. 108 folios, measuring 225 x149 mm.</li> <li>Layout and contents: Written in two hands, with all the carols in the same hand.</li> <li>'The MS is a trilingual student's exercise and commonplace book, with forms of letters in French and Latin. There are many memoranda and much penmanship practice. The carols are written in odd spaces in the same fashion as other notes and memoranda. Two of the English carols appear with a French carol between themOther contents include: Latin grammatical notes and verses. A note from Sidonius' De Natura Rerum on the names of animals. Much miscellaneous and some confused material, including Latin grammatical exercises. Latin treatises on passages of Scripture used in the liturgy. The statute 'Qui emptores terrarum'. Accounts ion French. Instructions for keeping accounts, with specimens. An English verse-riddleThe MS. is from Oxfordshire and very probably the work of an Oxford student.'<sup>3</sup></li> </ul>	114b: Lestenytgh, lordynges, both grete and smale 187a: Alle ye mouwen of joye synge 418:Wan ic wente byyonde the see 441: Myne owned ere ladi fair and fre 452: Al this day ic han sought 453:Ladd Y the daunce a Myssomur Day 455: Y louede a child of this cuntre 470: I am sorry for her sake APP., No. ii: Mari mulde hath boren a chylde

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This numbering corresponds to Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.* (Oxford, 1977) unless otherwise stated. The first line of verses have been chosen instead of the first lines of burdens to ensure continuity of reference between Greene, the most comprehensive compilation of the carols in publication, and this table. Those carols referenced in either: Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970) or Stevens, John, ed., *Music at the Court of Henry VIII* (London, 1962), are listed with the first lines of their burden to ensure continuity of reference between these editions and this table.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 330

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 324-325
Cambridge, St John's College, S.54	GB-Cjc S.54		Late 15 <sup>th</sup> century	x	Structure: Paper, 146 x 105mm. i+15 leaves. Layout and contents: Two main scribes (Greene claims there are four, but the most recent work on this manuscript suggests there are only two). <sup>4</sup> 'Containsthe English song 'Qwan crist was borne in Bedlem'The MS. Is certainly from East Anglia, but cannot be placed more exactly.' <sup>5</sup>	83:X for Crites himself was dyth 90: Jhesu restyd in a may 125B a: Now ys the Twelfth Day com 139: Ouer all gatis that I haff gon 142a: A child ys born, ewys 148B:The child was borne this endyr nyth 149b: Als I lay vpon a nith 232a: Mary myld, for loue of the 266:Fadyr, I am thin owyn chyld 274:God, that all this world has wroghth 313:Lystyn, lordyngys, qwatte I xall sey 366: This word is falce, I dare wyll say 391: In eury plas qwere that I wende 394: Sche saw theis women all bedene 400: Stel is gud, I sey no odur 415: Qwyll mene haue her bornys full 454: This enther day I mete a clerke APP., No. iii: The botys hed haue we in broght App. No. iv :d wasche ye App. No.vi: In evyn ther sitte a lady
Cambridge Trinity College, 0.3.58	GB-Ctc O.3.58	Trinity Roll	Early 15 <sup>th</sup> century	V	Structure: Parchment roll, consisting of three sections sewn together, measuring 2207 x 178mm in total. Layout and contents: Musical content on recto in white mensural notation with additional red colouration. Verso contains Latin Offices. Thirteen anonymous carols on front side of roll In one hand, Latin Offices on the reverse in a second hand. The Latin Offices are in a later hand.	<ul> <li>17b: A pryncypal poynth of charyte</li> <li>18a: In Bedlem this berde of lyf</li> <li>19: This babe to vs that now is bore</li> <li>21C: In Bedleem, in that fayr cete</li> <li>22: Now God Almythy doun hath sent</li> <li>98: Of this marter make we mende</li> <li>103Aa: To the now, Cristes dere derlyng</li> <li>117b: A babe is borne of hye natewre</li> <li>173: Ther is no rose of swych vertu</li> <li>234A: As I lay vpon a nyth</li> <li>235b: The Holi Goste is to the sent</li> <li>338b: Abyde, Y hope hit be the beste</li> <li>426b: Owre kynge went forth to</li> <li>Normandy</li> </ul>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 326 claims there are four hands. Daniel Wakelin however, suggests only two in: Wakelin, Daniel, *Cambridge, St John's* College Library, MS S.54 (nd,np) <sup>5</sup> Greene, R.L. The Early English Carols (Oxford, 1977), 325-326

Cambridge Trinity	GB-Ctc 0.9.38	Ctc 0.9.38	15 <sup>th</sup>	х	Structure: Written on paper, 300 x 110mm, v + i (original binding) +	161b: With faoure in hir face ferr passing
College, 0.9.38			century/sec		1-61, 62-87 (amended to 63-88) 90, 88 (amended to 89), i. <sup>6</sup>	my reason
0			ond half			331a: The Masse ys of suwch dygnyte
			(carol layer)		Layout and contents: Written in several hands, but 'Main scribe T	
					(presumably a Glastonbury monk) was responsible for most of its contents' <sup>7</sup>	
					'Apocalypsis Goliae. De Poena Conuigii. De Virtute Clavicum. De	
					Musica et Organis. Contentio inter Aquam et Vinum. Satyricum in	
					Abbates. De Civitatibus Anglicis. The Paris Pageant for Henry VI	
					(1431). English poems on gardening and hawking. English didactic poems: 'Revertere'; 'Who sayth soth he schall be schent': 'Parce	
					mihi Domine' ('The Bird with Four Feathers'); 'And ever more thanke	
					God of all'; 'Hyre and se and say not all'; Lydagate's 'As ryghth as a	
					rams horne': 'Beware the blynd etyth meny a flye'; 'What ever	
					thowe saye avyse the well'. De Symonia et Avaricia. 'De Cantu "Alma	
					Redemptoris Mater"' ('The Boy of Toledo'). Narratio de Duobus	
					Militibus. Latin epitaph on Joseph of Arimathea. Latin poem on the	
					two St. Josephs. Estas et Hiems. Praedication Goliae. De	
					<i>Ingratitudine</i> , 'editus a frater Stephano Duerell monacho Glaston'.	
					<i>Tryvytlam de Laude Universitatis Oxonie</i> . Latin poem on the friars with 'O-and-I' refrain. De Petro de Gauestone (Latin parodies).	
				Satirical Descriptio NorthfolchiaeCopies of letters, one from		
					Nicholas, Abbot of Glastonbury, concerning a council of 1433.	
					Historiae de Santa Cruce, de Pilato, de Juda Iscariota. Many	
					miscellaneous short notes and verses in Latin and English. <sup>4</sup>	
Cambridge Trinity	GB-Ctc R.4.20		15 <sup>th</sup>	Х	Structure: Parchment. 254mm x 184mm. 172 folios.	181: That was Jhesu oure Saueour
College, R.4.20			century/			425: The Bysshop Scrope, that was so
			second half		Layout and contents: Two main hands (but various others present).	wyse
					Carols in second, later hand. Contains 'Mandeville's Travels in	
					English. One complete and several partial copies of an English love letterLydgate's Siege of Thebes. English poems'A gentyll	
					fortune'; 'I have nowe sett myn herte so hye'; Advice in verse from a	

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> http://scriptorium.english.cam.ac.uk/manuscripts/fulldescription.php?ms=0.9.38#tech\_desc (accessed 3 January 2014)
 <sup>7</sup> http://scriptorium.english.cam.ac.uk/manuscripts/fulldescription.php?ms=0.9.38#tech\_desc (accessed 3 January 2014)
 <sup>8</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 327-328

					father to sons and a mother to daughters; 'O tonge so often here byfore'; 'Hayll, mary' (fragment).' <sup>9</sup>	
Cambridge Trinity College, R.14.26	GB-Ctc R.14.26		Early 15 <sup>th</sup> century	x	<ul> <li>Structure: Paper and parchment. 146 x 108mm. 150 folios.</li> <li>Layout and contents: 'Miscellaneous Latin notes and verses. Latin questions on musicLatin sermon on the Ave Maria. Various Latin logical treatises. Latin sermons in the form of logical discourses. Latin treatise on the music. St. Thomas Aquinas' De Ente st Essentia. Various accounts with the date 1617.'<sup>10</sup></li> <li>Faint musical notation exists above and below the carol text on folio 21r.</li> </ul>	377: How schvld I bot I thogth on myn ending day?
Cambridge University Library, Additional 5943	GB- Cu Additional 5943	Additional 5943	15 <sup>th</sup> century/ first quarter	V	Structure: Parchment and paper. 218 x144mm. 182 folios (156-158 lost). Layout and contents: Many hands, but principally in one. 'Latin sermons for various Sundays and feast-days throughout the yearLatin poem, 'Urbanus'. Latin tracts on religious subjects, confession, the Holy Spirit, Articles of the FaithRichard Rolle's <i>Emendatio Vitae</i> and <i>Melum Contemplativorium</i> ,. Reckonings of eclipses of the sun and moon from 1415-1462, with diagramsLatin theological material on fly-leaves (cent. XVI). Various accounts and memoranda. On f. iii v. a quaint Latin and English note: 'Muncy, tumpha, myfmaffemofe'. A Latin note on f. penult. V records that the book is the property of Johnnow (10 December 1418) a Carthusian monk at the Priory of Henton, Somerset, to whom it has been given by Thomas Turk, formerly perpetual vicar of 'Biere' (Beer, Somerset).' <sup>11</sup>	149d: Als I lay vpon a nith 151C: Thys other nyghth 349: If Y halde the lowe asyse 451: The man that I loued altherbest App., No. vii: Wymmen ben fayre for t
Cambridge University	GB-Cu Ee.1.12	Ee.1.12	c. 1492	V	Structure: Paper and parchment. v paper +110 parchment + iv paper	53: This chielde, a heuenly childe 54: Mary so myelde and good of fame 55: Now for to syng I holde it best

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 328 <sup>10</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 328 <sup>11</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 323

Library, Ee.1.12		folios. 200 x 142 mm.	56: The Faders Sone of Heuen Blys
			61:The Faders Sonne of Heven Blis
		Level and a starte Destack shows by Destack a Destack of Destack and	62: The Sonne of God and King of BLis
		Layout and contents: Poetry by Jacobus Ryman, with polyphony:1	63: The Sone of God do full of myght
		hymn (without text), 1 motet (without text), 1 unidentified textless piece <sup>12</sup>	65: Bothe tonge and olde, take hede of
		piece	this
			66: Beholde and see how that nature
			67: The prophesy fulfilled is
			70: Thus it is seide in prophecye
			71: A mayden myelde hath borne a
			chielde
			72: This is the stone kut of the hille
			74: Out of youre slepe arryse and wake
			75: Vpon a nyght an aungell bright
			76: Whenne Criste was borne, an aungell
			bright
			81A: Now in Betheleme, that holy place
			82: To the shepeherdes keeping theire
			folde
			84: Mankyende was shent abd ay forlore
			88: Auctor of helthe, Criste, haue in
			myende
			92: Thou art solace in alle oure foo
			127:Thre kings on the Twelfth Daye
			128: On Twelfthe Day came kings thre
			129: On Twelfthe Day this sterre so clere
			130: Nowe this tyme Rex Pacificus
			154: That meyden mylde here childe did
			kepe
			156: O my dere Sonne, why doest thou
			soo?
			159: When fals Judas her Son had solde
			160: In orophesy thus it is said
			174: To this roose Aumgell Gabriell
			189: Beholde and see, O lady free
			192: O closed gate of Ezechiel
			193: O closed gate of Ezechiell
			194: Haile, perfecte trone of Salamon

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> http://www.diamm.ac.uk/jsp/Descriptions?op=SOURCE&sourceKey=333 (accessed 3 January 2014)

	195: O queen of grace and of conforte
	196: Sith thy Sonne is both God and man
	197: SIth Criste hath take both flesshe and
	blode
	198: Sith of right thou mayst not forsake
	199: O queen of mercy and of grace
	200: O heunly sterre so clere and bright
	201: Haile, full of grace, Criste is with the
	202: Haile, spowse of Criste oure Savioure
	203: As Aaron yerde withoute moistoure
	204: O queen of blisse, thy Son Jhesus
	205: O queen of pitee and of grace
	207: Hayle, oure lod sterre bothe bright
	and clere
	208: O Jesse yerde florigerat
	209: O strong Jufith so full of myght
	210: O fayre Rachel seemly in syght
	211: Adam and Eve, thatte were vnwise
	212: O prynces of eternall peas
	214: Perle prynces of euery place
	215: CHildryn of Eve, bothe grete and
	small
	216: O floure of all uirginite
	217: O Jesse yerde florigerat
	218: Regina celi, letare
	219: Sith thou hast born the Kyng of Grace
	220: O moder mylde, mayde vndefylde
	221:O uirgyn chast both furst and last
	222: O lylly flower of swete odowre
	223: O spopwsesse most dere, most
	bright, most clere
	224: O tryclyn of the Trinite
	225: O spowsesse of Crist and paramour
	226: O meke Hester so mylde of mynde
	227: O blessed mayde, moder and wyffr
	228: Sith thou hast born the Kyng of Grace
	229: O sweete lady, O uirgyn pure
	243a and b: The aungell seyde of high
	degree
	244: The aungell seide of high degree

r		
		yle, full of grace, Criste is with the
		long before prophesy seyde
		e high Fader of blisse aboue
		at archaungell shynyng full bright
	249: Thu	us to her seide an aungell thoo
	250: An	angelle, thatte was fayre and
	bryght	
	251: An	angelle bright came downe with
	light	
	252: O n	nan of molde, mekely behold
		angelle came vnto thatte mayde
	254: An	angelle seide to thatte meyde so
	fre	
	255: An	angelle came with fulle grete light
	257: Thu	us seide Mary of grete honoure
	258: Jos	ephe wolde haue fled fro that
	mayde	
	262:Con	ne, my dere spowse and lady free
	267: Hat	ue myende for the how I was
	borne	
	268: Yf t	hou thy lyfe in synne haue ledde
		ue myende howe I mankyende
	haue tal	(e
	275: O s	weete Jhesu so meke and mylde
	276: O K	King of Grace and Indulgence
	279: O c	prient light shynyng moost bright
	280: O lo	oue a louer that loueth me well
	281: Ada	am and Eve did geve concent
	283: O L	orde, by whome al thing is
	wrought	
	284: O F	ader withoute begynnyng
	285: Thy	rcreatures terrestriall
		God and man sempiternall
		ader of high majeste
		ler and Sonne and Holi Goost
		e High Fader of blisse aboue
		a mayde Criste did not forsake
		ader of Eternall Blys
		endless God of Mageste
		dere of Blisse omnipotent

Cambridge University Library, Ff.5.48	GB-Cu Ff.5.48	15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half	x	Structure: Paper. 135 folios (one lost). 203 x 140 mm. Layout and contents: 'Written in two handsMyrc's Instructions for Parish PriestsThe ABC of Aristotle. The Northern Passion. Signs of Death. Remedies for the Seven Deadly Sins. A tale in verse of an incestuous daughter. A tale of King Edward and the shepherd. Dialogue between a nightingale and a clerk. A verse fabliau of a basin. The Tournament of Tottenham. The tale of the adulterous squire of Falmouth. Two lamentations of the Virgin. A prayer of the five joys of the Virgin. St. Michael and the Annunciation, from the South-English Legendary. Part of The Southern Passion. 'The mourning of a hare'. Weather propheciesVerses on provisions for a feast. Robin Hood and the Monk The colophon to The Northern Passion is in the name of Gilbertus Pylkynton.' <sup>13</sup>	<ul> <li>294: O endless God of Majeste</li> <li>295: The Sonne of God, thatte all hath wrought</li> <li>296: O endless God of Majeste</li> <li>297: O swete Jhesu, we knowledge this</li> <li>298: O Fader of high majeste</li> <li>299: The Sonne of God, oure Lorde Jhesus</li> <li>300: The Faders SOnne of Heuen Blis</li> <li>301: The Sonne of God hath take nature</li> <li>302: To Crist Jhesu, thatte Lorde and Kyng</li> <li>303: Eternall God, Fader of Light</li> <li>304: O endless God, bothe iii and One</li> <li>305: O highe Fader of Heuen Blys</li> <li>318: This brede geveth eternall lyfe</li> <li>352: O man, whiche art the erthe take</li> <li>froo</li> <li>353: I hadde richesse, I had my helthe</li> <li>360: That holy clerke, Seint Augustyne</li> </ul> 456: The last tyme I the wel woke
Edinburgh National Library of Scotland, Advocates 18.7.21	GB-En Advocates 18.7.21	1372	x	Structure: Parchment. 174 x 111mm. i + 166 folios. Layout and contents: Written throughout by the Franciscan Johan	149a: Als I lay vpon a nith 155a: Lullay, lullay, litel child 157D: Mary moder, come and se 271: Thou sikest sore

<sup>13</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 322

					de Grimestone. East Midland dialect. Latin religious poetry. English religious poetry'In Bedlem is a child iborn.' 'Alas I lay upon a nith'. Commonplace book of Latin theological materials arranged alphabetically by subjects, with much verse in Latin and English interspersed. <sup>14</sup> Various names are recorded throughout: Johannis de Grimistone (1372), Sir Thomas Holder Cornell, Sir Walter Haukke and Wililmo Broin.	
Glasgow University Library, Hunterian 83	GB-G, Hunterian 83	Hunterian 83	1475-1500	V	Structure: Paper with parchment flyleaves. 290 x 210 mm. iv+148+ii folios Layout and contents: List of 'alle the kynges in the worlde', fols iiir-iv verso. A carol on the Annunciation with musical score, 'Nova, Nova, Ave fit ex Eva' (refrain), begins, 'Gabriell off hye degre'Prologue and <i>Prima Pars</i> of the <i>Fructus Temporum</i> , copied from the St. Albans edition of the <i>Chronicles of England</i> , fols 1-9r; a table of contents to the <i>Fructus Temporum</i> material is penned on fols 10r-v. This table takes account of the subsequent <i>Brut</i> text, 'Explicit tabula prime pars Et segm <i>entum</i> secunda pars regm Brytaine.' A carol (uniquely preserved in this MS.) with musical score beginning, 'Nowe well & nowe woo/ Now frend and nowe foo'Carol with musical score beginning, 'Salue sancta parens Alle heyle Mary and well you be madynne & moder wt outyn offens', a final verse to this carol has been penned in a different hand <i>Brut</i> Chronicle, fols 15-140v; scribe A continues on from scribe B's text in fols 128-140v, taking material from Caxton's <i>Chronicle of England</i> , and his <i>Liber Ultimus</i> . "Warkworth's" <i>Chronicle</i> , begins imperfectly (lacks first leaf); it is poss. that this manuscript preserves the first composition of the text. <sup>15</sup>	6a: All hail, Mary and well thou be (in: Stevens, John, ed., <i>Mediaeval Carols</i> (London, 1970):
London College of Arms, 1.7	GB-Lca 1.7		16 <sup>th</sup> century (carol layer)	x	Structure: Paper. 349 x 273mm. i+ 92 folios. Layout and contents: 'Written in several hands <i>Forma Coronationis</i> <i>Regum et Reginarium</i> . An account in English of the funeral of Queen	438: Sur, songe in tyme past hath ben 'downe-a-downe'

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 346 (This edition has been used rather than the later one as it provides more detail).
 <sup>15</sup> http://www.qub.ac.uk/imagehis/resources/short/results.php?record=85 (accessed 3 January 2014)

					Elizabeth, wife of Henry VII. An account on the coronation of Henry VIII. A proclamation by Edward VI. A description of the procession through the City to Westminster on the occasion of the coronation of Edward VI, including: A song (not a carol) at the conduit in CheapsideAn account of the funeral of the Earl of Oxford. An account of the funeral of the Bishop of Westminster, A.D. 1500. AN account of the coronation of Queen Mary. An account of the coronation of Charles I as King of Scotland at Holyrood, A.D. 1633. A note on f.1 r. reads: 'A booke of the forme of coronation <i>and</i> burial of diuers estates belonging to thomas hawlay rex Clarenseuex. Gyuen to Clarenceuexby wyll'. <sup>16</sup>	
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Ashmole 1393	GB-Ob Ashmole 1393	Ashmole 1393	15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half	V	Structure: ix paper + 70 paper and parchment + ix paper folios, 146 mm x 100 mm. Composite of five unrelated manuscripts later bound together. <sup>17</sup> Layout and contents: '1. Alchemical, magical, and medicinal formulas. II. Recipes for dyeing and alchemical formulas. III. A religious tract, 'What thynges disposethe a man rightly to life'. IV. Latin devotional verses. A revelation of St. Thomas of Canterbury. V. Medical treatises. Astronomical notes. The song, 'Loue wolle I withoute eny variance', with music. A Latin <i>cantelina</i> , 'Ecce quod natura'.' <sup>18</sup>	170: Thys wynde be reson ys callyd tentacyon
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Bodley 26	GB-Ob Bodley 26	Bodley 26	14 <sup>th</sup> century	x	Structure: Parchment. 149 x 101 mm. ii + 208 folios. Layout and contents: 'Latin sermons and religious treatises on the Gospel of Luke, for Palm Sunday, on St. Thomas of Canterbury, St. Agatha, Habakkuk, etc. Latin treatises on St John the Evangelist, St. Stephen, St. Laurence. Latin sermons and sermon notes by a Franciscan, with bits of English verse interspersed[sermon on the locks on the heart of a sinner, and their keys]Astrological and other fragments. The treatise on arithmetic of Johannes de Sacro	12a: A child is boren amonges man

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 312
 <sup>17</sup> http://www.diamm.ac.uk/jsp/Descriptions?op=SOURCE&sourceKey=486 (accessed 3 January 2014)
 <sup>18</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977), 316

					Bosco, in Latin. A treatise of physiognomy, in Latin. An astrological chart. <sup>19</sup>	
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Douce 302	GB-Ob Douce 302	Douce 302	15 <sup>th</sup> century/ first half	x	Structure: Parchment. 273 x 200 mm. ii+36 folios. Layout and contents: 'Poems by John AudelayOther English poems1. Instruction in Christian living2. Counsels to thoe in religious orders; 3. Of nine virtues (imperfect); 4. 'De effusione sanguinis Christi'; 5. 'Quomodo Jhesus fuit reprobatus a Judeis'; 6. 'De psalterio passionis'; 7. 'De septum verbis Jhesu Christi'; 8. 'De salutacione cororis Jhesu Christi'; 9. 'De meritis misse; quomodo debemus audire missam'; 10. 'Quomodo Dominus Jhesus Christus apparuit Sancto Gregoria in tale effugie'; 11. 'De visitacione infirmorum et consolacione miserorum'; 12. A call to repentance; 13. 'De passion Domini nostril Jhesu Christi de de horis canonicis'; 14. 'Hore canonice passionos Jhesu Christi (il'; 15. 'De epistola Domini nostril Jhesu Christi de die Dominica'; 16. 'Narracio quo Michel duxit Paulum ad infernum'; 17. An appeal of God to men; 18. Audelay's 'Counsel of Conscience'; 19. 'Salutaciones beate Marie virginis'; 20. 'Alia oracio de sancta Maria virgine'; 21. 'Hec salutacio composuit Angelus Gabrielus'; 22. 'Psalmus de Magnificat'; 23. 'Salutacio Sancte Brigitte virginis'; 25. 'Salutacio Sancta Wenefred virginis'; 26. A salutation to St Anne; 27. A salutation on the Vernicle; 53. On the Paternoster; 54. 'De tribus regibus mortuis'; 55. 'Sapiencia huius mundi stulticia est apud Deum'. A religious treatise in prose, on the allegory of a bed as the type of the soul prepared for Christ. The Latin poem <i>Cur Mundus Militat sub Vana Gloria</i> .' <sup>20</sup>	<ul> <li>7A:Welcum be thou, Heuen Kyng</li> <li>97: Saynt Steuen, the first martere</li> <li>102: Synt Jon is Cristis derlyng dere</li> <li>108: Crist crid in cradil, 'Moder, ba, ba!'</li> <li>113: For on a Tewsday Thomes was borne</li> <li>117a: A babe is borne of hye natewre</li> <li>122 A: Ther is a babe born of a may</li> <li>172a: This flour is fayre and fresche of</li> <li>heue</li> <li>177: Blessid mot thou be, thou berd fo</li> <li>bryght</li> <li>230b: Gaude Maria, Cristes moder</li> <li>272: Fore loue is loue and euer schal be</li> <li>310: A hole confessoure thou were hone</li> <li>311: Swete Saynt Anne, we the besche</li> <li>314: As thou were marter and mayd clene</li> <li>324: And loue thi God ouer al thyng</li> <li>325: Foresake thi pride and thyn enuy</li> <li>326: Fede the hungere; the thirste yif</li> <li>drenke</li> <li>327: Mynd, resun, vertu, and grace</li> <li>328: The furst hit is thi heryng</li> <li>347: In wat order or wat degre</li> <li>369: Dred of deth, sorrow of syn</li> <li>397: Blessid mot be oure heuen quene</li> <li>398: In word, in dede, in wyl, in thoght</li> <li>411: Hit is ful heue chastite</li> <li>412: Fore pride in herte he hatis allone</li> <li>428: Fore he is ful yong, tender of age</li> </ul>
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Eng.Poet.e.1	GB-Ob Eng. Poet.e.1	Eng. Poet.e.1	Late 15th or early 16th century	V	Structure: 111 x 152 mm . 65 folios. Two hands. Layout and contents: "Songs not in carol form: Latin sings: 'Angelum misit suum Deus omnipotens'; 'Bonum vinum cum sapore'; 'Et	8 a:The first day of Yole haue we in mynd 21 B: In Bedlem, that fayer cyte 31 b: A Aptre vnigenitus 37: A ferly thing it is to mene

<sup>19</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.(Oxford, 1977), 316 <sup>20</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 337

1	1	virging nature Cliffeta, or sing macula's (Beallimus contactor) English	29. This may I prove withoughth late
		virgine natus, CHriste, es sine macula'; 'Psallimus cantantes'. English	38: This may I preve withoughtn lete
		songs: 'Herfor, and therefor, and therfor I came'; 'Now ys wele and	39: Godes Sonne, for the loue of mane
		all thing aryght'; 'Wold God that men might sene'; 'Tydynges I bring	40: A man was the first gylt
		yow for to tell'; 'Man be war, or thou knyte the fast'; 'Man upon	41: The first day wan Crist was borne
		mold, whatsoever thou be'; 'Holvyr and Heyvy mad a gret	42 a: Welcome be thys blissed feest
		party''The best tre if ye tak entent' (macaronic English and Latin).	44: Goddys Sonne is borne
		Recipe: 'A good medycyn for sor eyen'." <sup>21</sup>	79 A a: Abowt the fyld thei pyped full right
			86 C: Saluator mundi, Domine
		Music on 40v and 41v, text at the bottom of 40v and on 41.	93: Swet Jhesus
			103 A b: To the now, Cristes dere derlyng
			104: O glorious Johan Euangelyste
		40v: "Psallm[us] ca[n]ta[n]tes domino nova ca[n]tica"	115: As storys wright and specyfy
			125 B b: Now is the Twelthe Day icome
		41: "In porta latina in misses ed"	134: At the begynnyng of the mete
			137: Her commys Holly, that is so gent
		41v: "Nowell nowell nowell this is the salutacyon of the ang[ell]	138: The most worthye she is in town
		gabryell" <sup>22</sup>	140: Behold what lyfe that we ryne ine
			145 a: As I v pros in a mornyng
			150 B: That lovely lady sat and song
			151 A: This endrys nyght
			157 B: His body is wappyd all in wo
			175 A: Lyth and lystyn, both old and yyng
			180 A: Of thes iii letters purpose I
			184: Of all thi frendes sche is the flowr
			206: O blyssedfull berd, full of grace
			232 B: Mary, for the loue of the
			237 A: Gabriell, that angell bright
			238 B: Gabryell of hyghe degree
			239 a and d: Tydynges trew ther be cum
			new, sent frome the Trinite
			261: Vnder a tre
			282: An aungell from heuen gan lyth
			309 a: Jhesus, for thi holy name
			332: Man and woman in eury place
			334: WHan nothing was but God alone
			337 b: Holy Wryt seygh, which nothing ys
			sother

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 338
 <sup>22</sup> http://www.diamm.ac.uk/jsp/Descriptions?op=SOURCE&sourceKey=515 (accessed 3 January 2014)

Oxford, Bodleian	GB-Ob Selden b.26	Selden	c.1425-40	V	Structure: Parchment and paper. 260 x 181 mm. 135 folios.	<ul> <li>340: Ittes knowyn in eury schyre</li> <li>342: With pety movyd, I am constreynyd</li> <li>344: Blowyng was mad for gret game</li> <li>356 b: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town</li> <li>358: Game and ernest eur among</li> <li>370 a: As I wnet in a mery mornyng</li> <li>371: As I went me fore to solasse</li> <li>382: Man, bewar, the way is sleder</li> <li>386 a: Vycyce ve wyld and vertues lame</li> <li>388: Eury mane in hys degre</li> <li>389 a: Vnder a forest that was so long</li> <li>399 b: I euery place ye may well see</li> <li>401 A b: Sum be mery, and sum be sade</li> <li>402 a: When nettuls in winter bring forth rosys red</li> <li>404: Yyng men, I red that ye bewar</li> <li>406: All that I may swynk or swet</li> <li>407: Dayly in Englond meruels be fownd</li> <li>409: Thys indrys day befell a stryfe</li> <li>410 b: Many a man blamys his wyffe, perde</li> <li>414: In all this warld is a meryar lyfe</li> <li>419 A b: I shall you tell a full good sport</li> <li>422 A: Bryng vs in no browne bred</li> <li>423: Ale mak many a mane to styk at a brere</li> <li>439: Whylome I present was with my soffreyne</li> <li>5: Go day, Syre Cristemas, our kynge</li> </ul>
Library, Selden b.26	35-00 Selden 9.20	5510611	(carol layer)	v	Layout and contents: 'Composite of five unrelated manuscripts, with the carols in the first part. 'A collection of English and Latin songs and carols, with well-written music in black and red'.' <sup>23</sup>	14 b: Now well may we myrthys make 18 b: In Bedlem this berde if lyf 29: Exortum est in loue and lysse 30: Owt of your slepe aryse and wake 31 a: A Patre vnigenitus 32: This is the songe that ye shul here 33: A songe to syng Y haue good ryght

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 335

Ovford Balliol College	GP-Obac 354			Structure: 202 x 114 mm 256 folios. Paper 'Well written in small	<ul> <li>34: That Lord that lay in asse stalle</li> <li>69: This worle wondreth of al thynge</li> <li>73: A newy werk is come on honde</li> <li>117 c: A babe is borne of hye atewre</li> <li>176: This rose is railed on a rys</li> <li>179: Worshype be the birth of the</li> <li>182: Lo, Moises bush shynynge vnbrent</li> <li>185 B: Holy maide, blessyd thou be</li> <li>190 A: Thow holy doughter of Syon</li> <li>234 B: As Y lay vpon a nyght</li> <li>235 a: The Holi Goste is to the sent</li> <li>337 a: Holy Wryt seyght, which nothing ys</li> <li>sother</li> <li>338 a: Abyde, Y hope hiy be the beste</li> <li>359 A b: Man, haue in mynd how</li> <li>herebeforn</li> <li>426 a: Owre kynge went forth to</li> <li>Normandy</li> <li>The following carols are in: Stevens,</li> <li>John, ed., <i>Mediaeval Carols</i> (London,</li> <li>1970)</li> <li>22: Deo gracias persolvamus</li> <li>28: Alleluia, pro virgine Maria</li> <li>37: Ecce, quod natura</li> <li>41: Lett no man cum into this ball.</li> </ul>
Oxford, Balliol College, 354	GB-Obac 354	16 <sup>th</sup> century/ third	x first	Structure: 292 x 114 mm. 256 folios. Paper. 'Well written in small current hands, the headings and first letters of verse-lines being marked with red chalk. Contemporary foliation in in roman figures, which begins on the fifth leaf, uses lxxxxviik twice, skips clxxvii, and ignores quire xiiithenceforward the leaves have been renumbered in Arabic figures. Old limp vellum wrapper.' <sup>24</sup> Contents and Layout: This is the Commonplace book of Richard Hill,	<ul> <li>11: Lett no man cum into this hall</li> <li>20: This babe to vs now is born</li> <li>21A: In Bedlem, in that fayer cyte</li> <li>27C: In this tyme God hath sent</li> <li>35B: This nyght ther is a child born</li> <li>45: A virgin pure</li> <li>46: Mary, flowr of flowers all</li> <li>47: Glorious God had gret pyte</li> </ul>
				a citizen and grocer from London. A quote from the MS reads: 'A Boke of dyueris tales and balettes and dyueris Reconynges etc'.	<ul><li>48: For his love that bowght vs all dere</li><li>49: The Son of the Fader of Hevyn Blys</li></ul>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> http://image.ox.ac.uk/show?collection=balliol&manuscript=ms354 (accessed 3 January 2014)

	Contains: 'The Seven Sages of Rome. Selected tales from Gower's	50: Into this world this day dide com
	Confessio Amantis.'Jack, His Stepdame, and the Friar'. Sir Thomas	51: Now joy be to the Trynyte
	More's Fortune. The Siege of Rouen by John Page. The Trental of St	52: Cryste kepe vs all, as he well can
	Gregory. Lydgate's Stans Puer ad Mensam. The courtesy-book 'Little	77: As I cam by the way
	John'. The Boke of Curtasie in English and French. Lydgate's The	shepherd vpon a hill he satt
	Myrrour of Mankynd. Dunbar's 'London, thou art the flower of cities	79 A b: Abowt the fyld thei pyped full
	all'. The Nutbrown Mayde. Miscellaneous short religious and secular	right
	poems. Collectanea of useful information, medical prescriptions,	100: Whan Seynt Stevyn was at Jeruzalem
	household recipes, topographical information, puzzles and riddles. <sup>25</sup>	103 A c: To the now, Cristes dere derlyng
		105: Thow dereste disciple of Jhesu Criste
		114 d: Lestenytgh. Lordynges, bothe grete
		and smale
		120: Lyft vp your hartes and be glad
		122 C: Ther ys a child borne of a may
		123 A: Ther ys a blossom sprong of a
		thorn
		126: Owt of the est a sterre shon bright
		131 b: When Jhesus Criste baptyzed was
		132 A: The boris hed in hondes I brynge
		136 B: Holy berith, beris rede ynowgh
		141: Here haue I dwellyd with more and
		lasse
		150 C: A lovely lady sat and sange
		152 A a: A babe is born to blis vs brynge
		153: So blessed a sight it was to see
		158: Thys blessyd babe that thou hast
		born
		162: Bowght and sold full traytorsly
		163 a: Whan that my swete Son was thirty
		winter old
		166: I was borun in a stall
		172 b: This flour is fayre and fresche of
		heue
		175 B: Herkyn to me, both old and yonge
		178: Fayre maydyn, who is this barn
		183: Vpon a lady fayre and bright
		187 B: Qvene of hevyn, blessyd mott thou
		be!

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.(Oxford, 1977), 320

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
		230 a: Gaude Maria, Cristes moder
		232 C: Mary, for the loue of the
		233: Gaude, to whom Gabryell was sent
		234 D: As I me lay on a nyght
		237 B: Gabryell, that abgell bryght
		238 A: Gabriell of high degre
		239 c: Tydynges trew ther be cum new
		240: From hevyn was sent an angell of
		light
		241: I shall you tell a gret mervayll
		273: O worthy Lord and most of myght
		319: Man, that in erth abydyd here
		321: On Cristes day, I vnderstond
		322 A:He bare hym vp, he bare hym down
		331 b: The Masse ys of suwch dygnyte
		345: Be mery and suffer, as I the vise
		346: An old-said sawe, 'Onknowen,
		onkyste'
		350: I was with pope and cardynall
		351: Yf God sent the plentuowsly riches
		355 b: Pryde is out, and pride is inne
		359 A a: Man, haue in mynd how
		herebeforn 361: Att domysday, whan we shall ryse 370 b: As I went in a mery morning 372: Illa iuventus that is so nyse 373: O marcyfull God, maker of all mankynd 374: In twenty yere of age, remember we eurychon 386 b: Vycyce be wyld and vertues lame 389 b: Vnder a forest that was so long 399 a: In eury place ye may well see 401 A a: Sum e mery, and sum be sade 402 b: When nettuls in winter bring forth rosys red 408: A lytyll tale I will you tell 410 a: Many a man blamys his wyffe, prede 413 A: I wold fayn be a clarke

					<ul> <li>419 A a: I shall you tell a full good sport</li> <li>420: Is ther any good man here</li> <li>421: Jentill butler, bell amy</li> <li>424 A: At a place wher he me sett</li> <li>471: I sawe a doge sethyng sowse</li> </ul>
Lambeth Palace, 306	GB-LIp 306	15 <sup>th</sup> century/ second half (carol layer)	x	Structure: Paper. 295 x230 mmWritten in a number of different hands. Layout and contents: "A printed prose Life of St Winifred is bound with the MS. The <i>Brut</i> . Historical notes by Stow. <i>Libeaus Desconus</i> . <i>The Trental of St. Gregory</i> . A life of St Eustace. Hymns to the Virgin. Lydgate's <i>Horse, Goose and Sheep</i> . A poem on 'the letters that shall save England'Other courtly and religious poems. A list of the retinue of Edward III at Calais. <i>The Stations of Rome</i> . Directions for keeping hawks. The 'proper terms' for game. The tale of the knight who married a widow's daughter. A decree of the city of London, concerning St. Peter's, Cornhill. Verses on the purchase of land. <i>The Battle of Brantown</i> . Many medical recipes written <i>passim</i> , some on the same leaves as the two carols."	401 B: Sum be mery, and sum be sade 429: Sith God hathe chose the to be his knyt
London, British Library, Sloane 1584	GB-Lbl 1584	15 <sup>th</sup> century	x	Structure: 135 x 85 (105 x 80 (variable)). Paper and parchment. ff. 96 (+2 unfoliated parchment leaves after f. 82 + 2 unfoliated paper flyleaves at the beginning and at the end). One hand; John Gysborn. <sup>27</sup> Layout and contents: "Theological material, including instructions for deacons and subdeacons, questions to be asked in confession, prayers, &c. Medical recipesA sermon for Easter. Directions for making colours, enamelling, &c. A history of confession. English love-song: 'Greuus ys my sorowe.' On f. 12r. is written: Scriptum per me Johannes Gysborn Canonicus de Couerham. On f.26 v. Is a drawing of Christ's woulds, on ff. 27r28 r. alphabets of initials, on f. 28v. a conventional design, and on f. 83 v. a drawing of a gaily dressed man dancing." <sup>28</sup>	446: Off seruyng men I wyll begyne

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 334
 <sup>27</sup> http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/illuminatedmanuscripts/record.asp?MSID=1123&CollID=9&NStart=1584 (accessed 3 January 2014)
 <sup>28</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 330

London, British Library, Additional 5465	GB-Lbl Additional 5465	Fayrfax	c.1500	V	Structure: Parchment and paper. 297 x 215 mm. Two scribes: Most likely Robert Fayrfax plus one anonymous scribe responsible only for the organ work at the start of the manuscript. Layout and contents: Sacred and secular English songs, some with named composers: Banastre, Browne, Cornyshe, Davy, Fayrfax, Hampshire, Newark, Philips, Sheryngham, Turges, Tuder.	<ul> <li>146 A: This endurs nyght</li> <li>165: To Caluery he bare his cross with doulfull payne (deleted from 2<sup>nd</sup> edition but included in first)</li> <li>263 a: Vpon the cross nailed I was for the</li> <li>264: 'Beholde,' he saide, 'my creature</li> <li>423: Ale mak many a mane to styk at a brere</li> <li>424: At a place wher he me sett</li> <li>436: Souerayne Lorde, in erth most excellent</li> <li>464: Loue is natural to euery wyght</li> <li>The following carols are in: Stevens, John, ed., Mediaeval Carols (London, 1970)</li> <li>49: Alone, alone, alone (modified carol)</li> <li>51: Jesu, mercy, how may this be</li> <li>52: Afraid, alas, and why so suddenly?</li> <li>53: Woefully arrayed</li> <li>55: Woefully arrayed</li> <li>58: Ah, mine heart, remember thee well</li> <li>59: Margaret Meek</li> <li>60: Joan is sick and ill at ease</li> <li>63: Hoyda, hoyda, jolly rutterkin</li> <li>64: From stormy windes</li> <li>66: Small pathes to the greenwood</li> <li>68: Be it known to all</li> </ul>
London, British Library, Additional, 5665	GB-Lbl Additional 5665	Ritson	c. 1460- 1510	V	Structure: Parchment and paper. 258 x 180 mm. Eight scribal hands. The carols all in one hand. Layout and contents: 'The first part of the MS contains CarolsThe remainder of the NS, which contains only music except for a few legal documents, consists of masses, motets and secular songs, the principal composer being a Sir Thomas Pakke of whom nothing is known. Many of the motets belong to the Sarum Processional. There is no reason to doubt the customary attribution of this MS to the West Country, suggested by certain deeds on ff. 61, 69v, 70. Richard Smert, whose name, sometimes coupled with that of John	<ol> <li>O of Jesse thow holy rote</li> <li>O Dauid, thow nobell key</li> <li>Dieve wous garde, byewsser, tydynges</li> <li>A kynges sone and an emperoure</li> <li>C: A vow well may we nyrthys make</li> <li>C: A Patre vnigenitus</li> <li>Tydynges trew told ether ys trewe</li> <li>A childe ys born of a mayde</li> <li>By thi burthe, thou blessed Lord</li> <li>Man, be mery, I the rede</li> <li>Of Mary Criste was bore</li> </ol>

		Trouluffe, appears against several carols, was rector, from 1435 to	91 A and B: Jhesu, of a mayde thou
		1477, of Plymtree, a village near Exeter. <sup>29</sup>	woldest be born
		1477, OF PlyIncree, a Village field Execter.	
			96: O blesse God in Trinite
			99: In this vale off wrecchednesse
			103 A D and E: To the now, Cristes dere
			derlyng
			109: Dic, Erodes impie
			110: When God was born of Mary fre
			111: Herode, that was bothe wylde and
			wode
			116: Oute of the chaffe was pured this
			corne
			118: Gabriell, bryghther then the sonne
			131 a: When Jhesus Criste baptyzed was
			133: The borys hede that we bring here
			186: Benyng lady, blessed mote thow be
			259: I, Josep, wonder how hit may be
			277: Glorious God in Trinite
			306: I haue ysoghfte in many a syde
			307: O God, we pray to the in specyall
			330: When lordechype ys loste
			337 c: Holy Wryt seyght, which nothing ys
			sother
			348: The hyere men clemmeth, the sorere
			ys the falle
			354: Now to do well how shalt thou do?
			359 B: In synne yf thou lyffe haue ledde
			367: This worlde ys but a vanite
			375: While Y was yong and hadde carage
			387: God sende vs pese and vnite
			435: Jhesu, for thy wondes fyff
			446.1: Your light greuans shall not me
			constrayne
			The following carols are in: Stevens,
			John, ed., <i>Mediaeval Carols</i> (London,
			1970)
			1970)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 125

						77: Johannes assecretis 78: Sonet Laus 84: Salve, sancta parens 86: Ave, decus seculi 87: Soli Deo Sit 89: Regi canamus glorie 91: O clavis David 96: Letare, Cantuaria 16A: How shall I please?
London, British Library, Additional 5666	GB-Lbl Additional 5666	Additional 5666	Early 15 <sup>th</sup> century	V	Structure: ' ii paper + i parchment [= former front cover] + 22 paper + i paper folios, 136 x 97. Two systems of new foliation: first (ink), 1- 21, begins with first original paper folio and omits stub between 4/5; second (pencil), 1-22, begins with parchment folio, includes stub, and omits blank folio following f. 8. (References hereafter are to second foliation). Only ff. 2'-3', 4'-5, and 8' contain music; remainder contain miscellaneous notes and accounts of one John White, dated 12 Henry IV (= 1411). New (1960) covers of maroon cloth and leather on boards, with inscription tooled in gold on spine.' <sup>30</sup> Contents and layout: 'A fragment of a lullaby, much fadedSong, 'Now has Mary born'Treatise of Latin grammar, in Latin prose. Expense accounts of John White, dated 12 Henry IV (1411)' <sup>31</sup> The name 'Robertus brouuham' is also found within the ms and a note that sauggesting Friar John Brackley of Norwich was responsible for its compilation, although this claim seems to be false; the script does not match other known to be by Brackley. The volume also contains a few lines of French verse and a hand drawn tree with a pierced heart containing the words 'pur vere amur je su mort' and 'Fuit homo'.	<ul> <li>151 B: This ender nithgt</li> <li>144: I saw a swete semly syght</li> <li>App. No. viii: This ender day wen me was wo</li> <li>The following carols are in: Stevens,</li> <li>John, ed., <i>Mediaeval Carols</i> (London, 1970)</li> <li>2A: Lullay, my child</li> </ul>
London, British Library, Additional 19046	GB-Lbl Additional 19046	Additional 19046	15 <sup>th</sup> century	x	Structure: Paper. 216 x 5149 mm. 132 Folios. A number of scribal hands. Layout and contents: 'The one carol is in the hand which wrote the English glosses in the margins of ff. 65r-73 r., and the scribbles on f. 82 v. The name John Hones of Carmarthen is signed to several of the	430: Tyll home sull Wylekyn, this joly gentyl schepe

<sup>30</sup> http://www.diamm.ac.uk/jsp/Descriptions?op=SOURCE&sourceKey=406 (accessed 3 January 2014)
 <sup>31</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.(Oxford, 1977), 308

					piecesProverbs in Latin distichs. 'Liber parvi doctrinalis de parabilis philosophie.' Latin verses on synonyms (imperfect). Latin and English rules of grammar. 'De regimine vocum.' Latin verses giving the names of familiar objects. Lydgate's <i>Stans Puer ad Mensam</i> . On f.73 v, is the note in a hand of XV: 'Thomas stanlye est postessor huius [?] libri testis est Robertus cavtum.'' <sup>32</sup>	
London, British Library, Additional 31042	GB-Lbl Additional 31042	Additional 31042	Mid-15 <sup>th</sup> century	x	<ul> <li>Structure: Paper and parchment (mainly paper – 4 folios only in parchment: 1, 2, 182 and 183). 183 folios. 270 x 190 mm. In the main, one hand: Robert Thornton from Ryedale, North Yorkshire.</li> <li>Layout and contents: 'A fragment of the <i>Cursor MundiThe Northern Passion</i>. The Destruction of Jerusalem. The Siege of Melayne. The romance Sir Ottuel. Lydgate's Dietary. A song: ;The werlde es tournede up so downe'. The Quatrefoil of Love. Prayer in verse: 'Haile, holy spyritt'. Lydgate's The Virtue of the MassThe story of the Three Kings, in verse.'<sup>33</sup></li> </ul>	427: The Rose it es the fairest flour
London, British Library, Additional 31922	GB-Lbl Additional 31922	Henry VIII	c.1510-20	V	Structure: 'i paper + ii parchment + ii paper + i parchment + 127 parchment + ii parchment + i paper folios, 309 x 211. Modern pencil pagination, 1-250, with errors, crossed out and replaced by modern pencil foliation, 1-130. Original ink numbering of pieces, i-lxxii, generally includes only texted works. Modern covers of maroon leather and cloth on boards. Original index on ff. 2'-3 lists only pieces having original ink numbering (inaccurate after #49). Copied by a single scribe, except for two slightly later additions (f. 90 and ff. 124'-128), each in a different hand.' <sup>34</sup> Layout and contents: English, French and Flemish secular songs (although mainly English). 49 pieces for instruments only. There are a number of named composers: Cornish, Cooper, Daggere,	<ul> <li>437: Pastyme of yought sum tyme among</li> <li>448:As the holy grouth grene</li> <li>448.1: My souerayne lorde for my poure</li> <li>sake</li> <li>463: The knight knokett at the castell gate</li> <li>466: Wherfor shuld I hang vp my bow</li> <li>vpon the grewod bough</li> <li>466.1: Sore this dere stryken ys</li> <li>The following are in concordance with</li> <li>Stevens, John, ed., <i>Music at the Court of</i></li> <li><i>Henry VIII</i> (London, 1962)</li> <li>14: Alone, I live alone</li> </ul>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 332
 <sup>33</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.(Oxford, 1977), 310
 <sup>34</sup> http://www.diamm.ac.uk/jsp/Descriptions?op=SOURCE&sourceKey=1238 (accessed 3 January 2014)

					Dunstaple, Farthyng, Fayrfax, Floyd, King Henry VIII, Kempe and Pygott plus continental arrangers of non-Englsih songs. <sup>35</sup>	<ul> <li>96: England be glad (modified carol)</li> <li>102: Why shall I not? (modified carol)</li> <li>103: What remedy, what remedy?</li> <li>(modified carol)</li> <li>104: Where be ye, my love? (modified carols)</li> <li>105: Quid petis, o fili (modified carol)</li> <li>109: Hey trolly lolly lo (modified carol)</li> </ul>
London, British Library, Cotton Vespasian A.XXV	GB-Lbl Cotton Vespasian A.XXV		16 <sup>th</sup> century/ first quarter	x	Structure: Paper and parchment. 209 x 155 mm. 205 folios. Sections of a number of manuscripts bound together. A number of scribal hands.	472: Aupon the straw
					Layout and contents: 'Carol No. 472 is written on one of two parchment leaveswhich did not originally belong with the other material. It is in a hand of cent. XVI (early), which appears only on these two leaves.' <sup>36</sup> A number of names (and notes) also appear on these two leaves: Wyllum Covsien, Thomas a belton and Rychard cartar.	
					'TheEnglish poems in the MS., including several labelled as carols, were written after 1550Other English songs and verses. Miscellaneous material in English and Latin, principally theological.' <sup>37</sup>	
London, British Library, Egerton 3307	GB-Lbl Egerton 3307	Egerton	c. 1450	V	Structure: Mainly parchment (88) with three paper folios. 292 x 213 mm. Mainly in the hand of one scribe, with two additional contributors.	23 C: Holy Chyrch of hym makyth mynd 39.1: Omnes gentes plaudite 101C: I schal yow tell this ilk nyght 115.1: Al Holy Chyrch was bot a thrall
					Layout and contents: 'The MS is divided into two parts: the first part contains mainly processional music for Holy Week, the second contains Carols. 44-75 (all in the same hand except the last two); the	125.1: Hayl, most mighty in thi werkyng 125.2:Hys signe ys a ster bryth 139.1: luy is both fair and gren 179.1: Hayle be thou, Mary most of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> For further detail see: Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.* (Oxford, 1977), 311, and http://www.diamm.ac.uk/jsp/Descriptions?op=SOURCE&sourceKey=1238 (accessed 3 January 2014) <sup>36</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 325 <sup>37</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 325

					refrain song No 15A; an isorhythmic drinking song, O potores exquisite; and a motet Cantemus Domino.' <sup>38</sup>	honowr 190B: The holy doghter of Syon 279.1: Fader and Son and Holy Gost 311.1: Worschip of vertu ys the mede 337B: Holy Wret seth – nothing ys sother <b>The following carols are in: Stevens,</b> John, ed., <i>Mediaeval Carols</i> (London, 1970) 44: Tibi laus, tibi Gloria 45: Princeps pacis 46: David ex proginie 47: Novo profusi gaudio 49: Sol occasum nesciens 53: Cum virtus magnifica 56: Anglia, tibi turbidas 57: Benedicte Deo 58: Johannes. Jesu care 61: Exultavit cor 62: Princeps serenissime 63: Ecce quod natura 67: Verbum patris 68: Illuxit Leticia 69: Alleluia: Diva natalicia 70: Omnes caterva fidelium 71: Comidentes convenite 72: Gaudeamus partier 73: Parit virgo filium 74: Textless Carol 75: Lauda salvatorem
London, British Library, Harley 5396	GB-Lbl Harley 5396	Harley 5396	c. 1455	V	Structure: Parchment and paper. 311 folios. 216 x127 mm. Several hands (carols and poems in one). Three manuscripts bound together. Layout and contents: 'Latin sermons, collected by J. Felton, Vicar of	36 b: Lystenyt, lordyngus more and lees 80: When Cryst was born of Mary fre 136 A: Holy stond in the hall, fare to behold

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Stevens, John, ed., *Mediaeval Carols* (London, 1970), 125. Within this quotation, Stevens is referring to the numbering of the carols in this edition, not the numbering of the carols in this edition, not the numbering of the carols in Greene.

					Oxford. Holkot's (?) treatise <i>Convertimini</i> . An antidotary, arranged alphabeticallyEnglish poemsA hymn at the elevation of the Host; A hymn to the virgin; A tale against wedlock-breaking; 'Our Lady's Song of the Child that sucked her Breast'; <i>The Ten Commandments</i> ; A Pennyworth of WitGood Rule Is Out of Rememberance; Turn Up Her Halter and Let Her Go; Our Lord's Exhortation; The Bysom Leads the Blind; How The Wise Man Taught His Son; The 'Long Charter of Christ' (A-text); <i>The Tournament of Tottenham; Alas, That Any Kind Man Wants Good; A Tale of King Henry II</i> Accounts, apparently of a Midlands merchant. <sup>39</sup>	
London, British Library, Landsdowne 379	GB-Lbl Lansdowne 379	Lansdowne 379	16 <sup>th</sup> century/first half	x	Structure: Paper. 193 x 133mm. 86 folios .Several scribal hands (carols in one hand). Layout and contents: 'Oration D. Johannis Damasceni, in Greek and Latin verse (cent. XVII). English sermons on the Eucharist, for Easter, and for All Saints. A copy of Bishop William Lyndwode's Constitutiones Provinciales printed by Wynkyn de Wrode, imperfect at beginning and end, the deficiency at the end supplied in MSPrescriptions for the stone, toothaches, &c. Notes on the temperaments of the body and the four elements. Notes on chronology. English prayers (imperfect) by a member of the Charterhouse, London.' <sup>40</sup>	43: Qwhereas Adam cawsed be synne 94: A mervelus thing I hafe musyd in my mynde
London, British Library, Sloane 2593	GB-Lbl Sloane 2593	Sloane 2593	15 <sup>th</sup> century/first half	x	Structure: Paper with one parchment folio. 149 x 111 mm. 37 folios. Part of a larger, now lost, MS. Layout and contents: 'Three Latin songs: 'Procedenti puero'; 'Non pudescit corpore'; 'Meum est propositum in taberna mori.'English songs: 'I syng of a mayden'; 'I have a gentil cook'; 'I haue a newe gardyn'; 'Robin lyth in grene wode bowdyn' (ballad); 'As I wnet throw a gardyn grene'; 'Be the way wandering as I went'; 'Seynt Steuene was a clerk' (ballad); 'Aue maris stella'; 'If I synge ye wyl me	<ul> <li>7 B: Wolcum, Yol, thou mery man</li> <li>8 b: The first day of Yole haue we in mynd</li> <li>16: In this tyme a child was born</li> <li>24: Blyssid be that mayde Mary</li> <li>25: The sunne of grace hym schynit in</li> <li>27 A: In this tyme Cryst haght vs sent</li> <li>28: This tyme is born a child ful good</li> <li>68: Adam our fader was in blis</li> <li>86 A: Saluator mundi, Domine</li> <li>87: Jhesu, as thou art our sauyour</li> </ul>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 328
 <sup>40</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 328 -329

lend <sup>2,44</sup> and smale 128 : Dut of the bloome sprang a thorn 128 : Dut of the bloome sprang a thorn 128 : Duts was born in Bodiem Jude 125 : Nawi is the Twethte Day icome 135 : Laws was born in Bodiem Jude 136 : Due a for andray synthy and synge 148 A: The fader of tleuene his owyn Sone he sent 157 C: Mary moder, cum and se 168 : Man, if theu hast synthy out dynge 188 : It wern fowre letterys of purposy 188 A: Holy maydyn, blysid thou be 188 : Mary is a lady bright 231 : The ferste joye, as i you telle 232 : Cheve, as i you telle 232 : A new song it will begynne 313 : List worn dore drad so 153 : List worn dore drad so 153 : List worn dore drad so 153 : Cheven Jude Song Sert poste 153 : Sert Nicholas was of Sert poste 154 : Thread to Abraham 155 : Throw thou be kyng of tour and 155 : Profe is num, and price thou at wrout 155 : Nicholas was of Sert poste and 155 : Profe is num, and price thou at wrout 155 : Night men there hern so gave			lakke'; 'Enmy Herowde, thou wokkyd kyng'; 'As I me lend to a	114 a: Lestenytgh, lordynges, bothe grete
123 8: Out of the biosme sprang a thorm 124 A: Thesu was born in Bedlem Jude 125 A: Now is the Twelthe Day come 135 b: As U µ prasi in a morning 148 A: The farter of Heuren his owyn Sone he sent 157 C: Mary moder, cum and se 168: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth 169: Jhesu of his moder was born 175: Letteryt, Iordynes, bothe elde and yynge 180 B: It wern forwre letterys of purposy 185 A: Holy mardyn, blysid thou be 188: Mary is a lady brught 123: The ferste joye, as I you telle 124: A lay yopon not an anytht 123: The ferste joye, as I you telle 124: A lay yopon not an anytht 125: Nowel, el, ' bothe eld and yng 126: Naym moder, the not adred 131: The ferste joye, as I you telle 132: A new song I will begynne 135: Seyn Nicholas was of gret poste 136: In Patras, ther born he was 137: Thi Ung is in add yoth un ungitt lere 136: In Patras, ther born he was 137: Thi tong is mand of Heych and biold 139: Thi Ung is in med and 130: Gured is in the vale of Aratham 139: Thi Ung is in add of Heych and biold 139: Thi Ung is in add of Heych and biold 139: Thi Ung is in add of Heych and biold 139: Thycle, is und pride is inne 136: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 137: Thyng, men, mathe ben hem sog ay			lend'.' <sup>41</sup>	and smale
124 A: Ibesu was born in Bedlem Jude         125 A: Now is the Twelthe Day knome         143 I saw a fayr madyn syttyn and snge         143 I saw a fayr madyn syttyn and snge         143 I saw a fayr madyn syttyn and snge         145 A: The Fader of Heusen His owyn         Sone he sent         157 C: Mary moder, cum and se         168: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth         169: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth         121: A new song I will begynne         232: C. As I lay vpom a nyght         233: The faste: by en tot after         234: C. As I lay vpom a nyght         235: Thow thou be syng over lays         236: Now tell         237: The faste: by en tot after         238: Many moder, by not all day nygt         232: Anary moder, by not all day anygt				122 B: A babe is born al of a may
124 A: Ibesu was born in Bedlem Jude         125 A: Now is the Twelthe Day knome         143 I saw a fayr madyn syttyn and snge         143 I saw a fayr madyn syttyn and snge         143 I saw a fayr madyn syttyn and snge         145 A: The Fader of Heusen His owyn         Sone he sent         157 C: Mary moder, cum and se         168: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth         169: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth         121: A new song I will begynne         232: C. As I lay vpom a nyght         233: The faste: by en tot after         234: C. As I lay vpom a nyght         235: Thow thou be syng over lays         236: Now tell         237: The faste: by en tot after         238: Many moder, by not all day nygt         232: Anary moder, by not all day anygt				123 B: Out of the blosme sprang a thorn
125 A. Now is the Twelthe Day icome         143: Isaw a fay madyn sythy and synge         143 b: As U v pros in a morning         144 A. The Fader of Heuene his owyn         Sone he sent         157 C. May moder, cum and se         168: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth         169: Intesu of his moder was born         177: I tastenty, Longhages, bothe elde and         ymge         180: May if thou hast synnyd owth         169: Intesu of his moder was born         175: I tastenty, Longhages, bothe elde and         ymge         180: B: It wern fowre lettenys of purposy         183: May if shady hyght         231: The forste logy, as I you telle         234: C As I Jay ypom a nyght         235: Senty Vico bard eld and ymge         242: Mary moder, be not adred         315: Senty To bothe eld and ymge         234: C As I Jay ypom a nyght         235: C Nowel, el, 'I bothe eld and ymge         242: A Aray moder, be not adred         315: Sent Nicholas was of gret poste         316: In Patas, ther born he was         317: It is berd for heune cam         320: Qwete is bothe seenly and sote         329: Cuved with wo might letter         336: In the vale of Abraham         337: Thitumge is mad of flex/th and blod <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>				
143: 1 saw a fayr mady nytip, and synge145: 1 saw a fayr mady nytip, and synge146: 1 saw a fayr mady nytip, and synge147: 1 saw a fayr mady nytip148: 1 The Fader of Heuene his owynSone he sent157: C: Mary moder, cum and se168: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth169: Nexu of his moder was born175: Lestenyt, Jordynges, bothe elde andyynge180: It wern fowre letterys of purposy183: Ar Holy madyin, blystal thou be188: Mary is a lady brught213: The ferst joye, as I you telle234: Cr As Lipa ypoon a nyght236: Nowel, el,' bothe eld and nyng237: Nic Ferst joye, as I you telle234: Cr As Lipa ypoot and grad235: Seynt Nicholas was of grat post315: Seynt Nicholas was of grat post326: Owerde, el,' bothe eld and nyng327: Lita for for heure cam320: Owerde is bothe seemily and sote329: Euer quark tool320: Owerde is bothe seemily and sote320: Owerde is bothe seemily and sote321: The ferst non ne was321: The ferst non press that growit on320: Owerde is bothe seemily and sote321: The first non gress that growit on335: Seynt Nicholas was of growit on335: Seynt Nicholas was of growit on336: Ying men that bern hene was337: Thi ting men that bern hene was gray338: Ying men that bern hene was gray339: Thit unge in mad of theych and blo336: Thow thou be kyng of tour andtown337: Ying men that bern hene was gray338: Ying me				125 A: Now is the Twelthe Day icome
145 b: As U v pros in a morning 148 A: The Fader of Heuene his owyn Sone he sent 157 C: Mary moder, curn and se 168: Man; Ithou has try snynd owth 169: Jhesu of his moder was born 175: Lesteny, Lordynges, bothe elde and yynge 1800 B: It wern fowre letterys of purposy 185 A: Holy maydyn, blysid thou be 188: Many is a lady bryght 231: The ferste joye, as I you telle 234 C: As I lay yropm a night 232: The ferste joye, as I you telle 234 C: As I lay yropm a night 231: The ferste joye, as I you telle 234 C: As I lay yropm a night 232: An new song I will begynne 315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste 316: In Paras, ther born he was 317: It is bred for heune cam 320: Qwete is bothe seemiy and sote 329: Euery day thou might lere 336: in the vale of Abraham 339: Thi Linage is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on grownd 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 337: Thyk, man, gwerof thou art wrout 357: Thyk, man, gwerof thou art wrout				-
148 A: The Fader of Heuene his owyn         Sone he sent         157 C: Mary moder, cum and se         168: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth         169: hiesu of his moder was born         177. Lestenyt, Lordynges, bothe elde and         ymge         180 B: It wern fowre letterys of purposy         185 A: Holy maydyn, blysid thou be         188: Man, yr is alady brygth         231: The ferste joye, as I you telle         234: An law yoom a myght         236: Nowel, ef. bothe edd and yyng         242: Mary moder, be not adder         232: Xn ewe song i wil begynne         313: Seynt Nicholas was 0 gret poste         316: In theras, ther born he was         317: It is bred for heune cam         320: Qweel is boths eemily and sote         329: Euery day thou might lere         336: In the valie of Abraham         339: Thi Uragie is mad of Heych and blod         341: Ther is no gres that growit on ground         355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne         356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town         357: Trynk, man, gwerof thou art wrout         361: They men that been thow and town         357: Trynk, man, gwerof thou art wrout         368: The proven the mar oggy				
Sone he sent 157 C: Mary moder, cum and se 168: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth 169: Ihesu of his moder was born 175: Isetsnyt, fordynges, bothe elde and yynge 180 B: It wern fowre letterys of purposy 185 A: Holy maydyn, blysid thou be 188: Mary is a lady bryght 231: The ferste joye, as I you telle 234 C: As I lay pom a nyght 236: Nowel, el,' bothe eld and yyng 242: Mary moder, ea i you telle 236: Showel, el,' bothe eld and yng 242: Mary moder, be not adred 312: A new song I wil begynne 315: Seynt Nichols was of gret poste 316: In Patras, ther born he was 317: It is bred fro heune cam 320: Cuwete is bothe seemly and sote 329: Euery day thou might lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou artwrout 367: Thynk, man, qwerof thou artwrout				
157 C: May moder, cum and se168: Man, if thou hast synnyd owth169: Jhesu of his moder was born175 : Lestenyt, lordynges, bothe elde andymge180 B: It wern fowre letterys of purposy185 A: Holy maydyn, blysid thou be188: Mary is a lady brygit231: The ferste joye, as i you telle234: C: As I lay yonn a nygit236: Nowel, el,' bothe eld and dyng242: May moder, be not adred312: A newe song I wil begynne313: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste316: In Patras, ther born he was317: It is bred for heura cam320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote329: Eury day thou might lere336: In the vale of Abraham339: Thi tunge is mad of flexh and blod341: Ther is non gres that growt on ground355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town357: Thysk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 353: Thysk, man, qwerof thou art wrout				
168: Man, if thou hast symyd owth         168: Jhesu of his moder was born         175: Lestenyt, Jordynges, bothe elde and         180: Bit wern fowre letterys of purposy         185 A: Holy maydyn, blyssid thou be         188: Mary is a lady bryght         231: The ferst joye, as 1 you telle         234: C. As I lay yop an nyght         236: Nowe, el, ' bothe eld and yyng         242: Mary moder, be not adred         315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste         316: In Patras, the born he was         317: The is non gres that growit on         320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote         320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote         320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote         329: Thi targe is mad of fleych and blod         341: Ther is non gres that growit on         ground         355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne         355 a: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout         363: Ymp mothat kern hem so gay				
169: Jhesu of his moder was born 175: Lestenyt, lordynges, bothe elde and yynge 180 B: It wern forwel elterys of purposy 185 A: Holy maydyn, blysid thou be 188: Mary is a lady bryght 231: The ferste joye, as I you telle 234 C: As I Jay yoom a ruyght 236: 'Nowel, el,' bothe eld and yyng 242: Mary moder, be not adred 315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste 316: in Patras, ther born he was 316: in Patras, ther born he was 317: It is bort for heune cam 320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote 329: Euery day un ight lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: There is nog res that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 355 a: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 361: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
175 : Lestenyt, lordynges, bothe elde and yynge180 B: It wern fowre letterys of purposy183 A: Holy maydyn, blyssid thou be188 A: Holy maydyn, blyssid thou be189 A: Holy maydyn, blyssid thou be180 A: Moly maydyn, blyssid thou be181 A: Holy maydyn, blyssid thou be182 A: May moder, be not adred234 C: As Hay womer, be not adred231: C anew song I wil begynne235: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste316: In Patras, ther born he was317: It is bred for houen cam320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote329: Euery day thou might lere336: In Patras, ther born he was337: This bred for houen cam339: Thi turge is mad of fleych and blod341: Ther is non gres that growit onground355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour andtown357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout357: Thyng men that bern hem so gay				
yynge 180 B: It wern fowre letterys of purposy 185 A: Holy maydyn, blyssid thou be 188: Mary is a lady bryght 231: The ferste joye, as I you telle 234 C: As I lay yong a nyght 236: 'Nowel, el,' bothe eld and yyng 242: Mary moder, be not adred 312: A newe song I wil begynne 315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste 316: In Patras, ther born he was 317: It is bred fro heune cam 310: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote 329: Euery day thou might lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 335 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
180 B: It wern fowre letterys of purposy185 A: Holy maydyn, blysid thuo be188 A: Holy is alay bryght231: The ferste joye, as I you telle234 C: As I lay yoom a nyght236: 'Nowel, el,' bothe eld and yyng242: Mary moder, be not adred312: A newe song I wil begynne315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste316: In Patras, ther born he was317: It is bred fro heune cam320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote329: Euery day thou might lere336: In the vale of Abraham339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod341: Ther is non gret shat growit onground355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour andtown357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
185 A: Holy maydyn, blyssid thou be 188: Mary is a lady bryght 231: The ferste joye, as I you telle 234 C: As I lay vpom a nyght 236: 'Nowel, el,' tobe eld and dyng 232: A newe song I wil begynne 315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste 316: In Patras, ther born he was 317: It is bred fro heune cam 320: Qwete is both seemly and sote 329: Euery day thou might lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 355 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: 'Yng men that bern hem so gay				
188: Mary is a lady bryght 231: The ferste joye, as 1 you telle 234: C. As I lay yop an anyght 236: 'Nowel, el,' bothe eld and yyng 242: Mary moder, be not dared 312: A newe song I wil begynne 315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste 316: In Patras, ther born he was 317: It is bothe seemly and sote 320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote 320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote 320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote 321: The vale of Abraham 332: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yng men that bern hem so gay				
231: The ferste joye, as I you telle 234 C: As I lay yopon a nght 236: 'Nowel, el,' bothe eld and yyng 242: Mary moder, ben el dared 312: A newe song I wil begynne 315: SeyN Nicholas was of gret poste 316: In Patras, ther born he was 317: It is bred fro heune cam 320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote 329: Euery day thou might lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
234 C: As I lay upom a nyght 236: 'Nowel, el,' bothe eld and yyng 242: Moder, el, or both adred 312: A newe song I wil begynne 315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste 316: In Patras, Ireh born he was 317: It is bred fro heune cam 320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote 329: Euery day thou night lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
236: 'Nowel, el,' bothe eld and yyng 242: Mary moder, be not adred 312: A newe song I wil begynne 315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste 316: In Patras, ther born he was 317: It is bred fro heune cam 320: Quete is bothe seemly and sote 329: Euery day thou might lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
242: Mary moder, be not adred 312: A newe song I wil begynne 315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste 316: In Patras, ther born he was 317: It is bred fro heune cam 320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote 329: Euery day thou might lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 353: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
312: A newe song I wil begynne315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste316: In Patras, ther born he was317: It is bred fro heuer cam320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote329: Euery day thou might lere336: In the vale of Abraham339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod341: Ther is non gres that growit onground355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour andtown357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
315: Seynt Nicholas was of gret poste316: In Patras, ther born he was317: It is bred fro heune cam320: Qwete is bothe seemily and sote320: Qwete is bothe seemily and sote320: Seury day thou might lere336: In the vale of Abraham339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod341: Ther is non gres that growit onground355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour andtown357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
316: In Patras, ther born he was 317: It is bred fro heune cam 320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote 329: Euery day thou might lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi turgle is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
317: It is bred fro heune cam         320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote         329: Euery day thou might lere         336: In the vale of Abraham         339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod         341: Ther is non gres that growit on         ground         355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne         356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and         town         357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout         363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
320: Qwete is bothe seemly and sote329: Euery day thou might lere336: In the vale of Abraham339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod341: Ther is non gres that growit onground355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour andtown357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
329: Euery day thou might lere 336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
336: In the vale of Abraham 339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
339: Thi tunge is mad of fleych and blod 341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
341: Ther is non gres that growit on ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
ground 355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
355 a: Pryde is out, and pride is inne 356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
356 a: Thow thou be kyng of tour and town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
town 357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
357: Thynk, man, qwerof thou art wrout 363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
363: Yyng men that bern hem so gay				
				365: This word, lordingges, I vnderstonde

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Greene, R.L. *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1935), 330

				<ul> <li>368: I am a child and born ful bare</li> <li>381: If thou serue a lord of prys</li> <li>383: Gyle and gold togedere arn met</li> <li>384: Semenaunt is a wonder thing</li> <li>385: A man that xuld of trewthe telle</li> <li>390: Quan I haue in myn purs inow</li> <li>392: Peny is an hardy knyght</li> <li>395 b: Wymmen beth bothe goud and</li> <li>schene</li> <li>403: Loke er thin herte be set</li> <li>405: Yyng men, I warn you euerychon</li> <li>416: We bern abowtyn non cattes skynnys</li> <li>417: Lestenit, lordynges, I you beseke</li> <li>457: As I went on Yol Day in owre</li> <li>prosessyon</li> <li>App., No. v.:Man, loke thou haue this gys</li> </ul>
Dublin, Trinity College, IE TCD MS 432 (Formerly known as: Dublin, Trinity College, D.4.18)	15 <sup>th</sup> century (carol layer)	X	Structure: Vol 1 : fols. 1-58 (vellum; binding measures 204 x 155mm); vol 2: fols 59-121 (paper; binding measures 223 x 159mm) vol. 3: fols. 122-155 (paper; binding measures 222 x 160mm). Measured formerly as 187 x 135mm Layout and contents: 'Carol in volume 2 which also contains: A dialogue between Palamon, Emlyn and Ersyte (verse); Story of Robert of Sicily, of king Palaan, of the seven scoles (told by 'Doctor'), etc (verse); The vii stoles; A story of kyng Palaan; A miracle of our lady done to sir Amery knight; A story of an onhappy boye; A lamentacion of our lady for severing; On the battle of Northampton; On the policy to be observed by the Yorkists; Besechyn benygnely eny creature; Warwyf; On the Yorkist lords; These ben the crysten kynges that reyne under god and the lawes and affter the conqueste , with addenda to 1509; A play with characters Deus, angelus, Abraham, Sara, Isaac; mostly Abraham, Isaac and Sara; coats of arms of 12 French bishops, drawn in ?after, or ?before the play was copied; Hic sunt Maiores et Ballivi de North[ampton] a primo anno regni Regis Ricardi usque in hunc diem, ie 1381 ad 1461 [to Ao xxxviii of Henry VI a few short notes on battles of that year , continued in another hand to 1 Edward IV]; Golden years or some such chart; How men that be in helt shulden visite sike folk how a man schulde be comfortid agens the nachinge in sekenesse ye	431: I warne you euerychone

	secunde co, with pentrials; pencil pentrials; [Richard Rolle], Twelve chapters beg: Tary not for to turne the to God;here enden the xii chapters of Ric heremyte of Hampole. <sup>42</sup>	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> http://marloc.library.tcd.ie/CalmView/Record.aspx?src=CalmView.Catalog&id=IE+TCD+MS+432(accessed 3 January 2014)

## **Bibliography**

Aers, David, Culture and History 1350-1600 (Hemel Hempstead, 1992)

Anderson, Warren, et al. "Hymn." *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed January 4, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/13648.

Archambo, Shelley Batt, 'The Development of the English Carol through the Fifteenth Century', *The Choral Journal*, 27/3 (1986), 28

Atchison, Mary, The Chansonnier of Oxford Bodleian Douce 308 (Aldershot, 2005)

Aubrey, Elizabeth, 'Reconsidering "High Style" and "Low Style" in Medieval Song', *Journal of Music Theory*, 52/1 (Spring, 2008), 75-122

Barthes, Roland, 'The Death of the Author' in, Image, Music, Text (London, 1977)

Beard, David, Gloag, Kenneth, Musicology: The Key Concepts (Oxford, 2005)

Benham, Hugh, 'Prince Arthur (1486-1502): a Carol and a Cantus Firmus', *Early Music*, 15 (1987), 463-8

Bent, Margaret. "Dunstaple, John." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed March 14, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/08331.

Berry, Mary. "Franciscan friars." In *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/10113 (accessed December 22, 2010).

Biddle, Ian D., Gibson, Kirsten, *Masculinity and Western Musical Practice* (Farnham, 2009)

Blackburn, Bonnie J. 'Properchant: English Theory at Home and Abroad with an Excursus on Amerus / Aluredus and his Tradition'. In David Cannata, Gabriella Currie, Rena Mueller and John Nadas eds, *Quomodo cantabimus canticum? Studies in honour of Edward H Roesner*. (Wisconsin, 2008), 81-98

Booth, Wayne C., Colomb, Gregory G., Williams, Joseph M., *The Craft of Research* (Chicago, 1995)

Borgerding, Todd, ed. Gender, Sexuality, and Early Music (New York, 2002)

Boorman, Stanley, et al. "Sources, MS." *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed May 21, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/50158pg13.

Bowers, Jane, Tick, Judith, *Women Making Music: The Western Art Tradition*, 1150-1950 (London, 1986)

Bowers, Roger, 'To Chorus from Quartet' in Morehen, John, ed., *English Choral Practice*, 1400-1650 (Cambridge, 2003), 1-47

Bowers, R., 'The performing ensemble for English church polyphony, *c*.1320–*c*.1390'. In *Studies in the Performance of Late Mediaeval Music*, S. Boorman, ed. (Cambridge, 1983), pp.161–92

Bowers, Roger, English Church Polyphony (Aldershot, 1999)

Bradford, Melvin E., 'Come Slowly All Together: A Reading of the "Corpus Christi Carol", *The South Central Bulletin*, 30/4 (Winter, 1970), 168-171

Brice, D, The Folk Carol of England (London, 1969)

Buchanan, B.C., 1976, The effect of the reformation on the Poetic and Religious Sensibility as Manifest in English lyrics and Carols on the Nativity between 1400 and 1650 (Ulster, 1976)

Bukofzer, M., Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music (London, 1951)

Burrow, John, ed., English Verse 1300-1500 (Essex, 1977)

Caldwell, John, Medieval Music (London, 1978)

Caldwell, J., *The Oxford History of English Music, Vol. 1., From the Beginnings to c.1715* (Oxford, 1991)

Camargo, M., 'Two Middle English Carols from an Exeter Manuscript', *Medium Aevum* 67 (1998), 104-11.

Cartlidge, Neil, "'Alas I go with chylde': Representations of extra-marital pregnancy in the middle English Lyric", *English Studies*, 79/5(1998), 395-414

Catherwood, C.P., English polyphonic carol manuscripts (Oxford, 1996)

Chambers, E.K. *Early English Lyrics* (London, 1947)

Citron, Marcia, Gender and the Musical Canon (Illinois, 200)

Clark, James, G., The Religious Orders in Pre-Reformation England (Woodbridge, 2002)

Clarke, Eric, and Cook, Nicholas, eds., *Empirical Musicology: Aims, Methods, Prospects* (Oxford, 2004)

Cobley, Paul and Jansz, Litza, Introducing Semiotics (1999, Cambridge)

Colton, Lisa, *Music and Sanctity in England: 1260-1400* (PhD from the University of York, 2003)

Colton, Lisa, 'The Articulation of Virginity in the Medieval *Chanson de nonne'*, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 133/2 (2008), 159-188

Cook, Nicholas, *Rethinking Music* (Oxford, 2001)

Cook, Susan, C., *Cecilia Reclaimed: Feminist Perspectives on Gender and Music* (Illinois, 1993)

Cooney, Helen, Nation, Court and Culture (Dublin and Portland, 2000)

Cullum, Pat, 'Introduction: holiness and masculinity in Medieval Europe.' In *Holiness and Masculinity in the Middle Ages*. (Cardiff, 2004), 1-7

Cullum, P.H., Lewis, Katherine, J., eds, *Religious Men and Masculine Identity in the Middle Ages* (Woodbridge, 2013), 6

Cumming, Julie, *The Motet in the Age of Dufay* (Cambridge, 1999)

Cutts, John P. "Wee happy heardsmen here': A Newly Discovered Shepherd'd Carol Possibly Belonging to a Medieval Pageant', *Comparative Drama 18/3* (1984), 265-273

Dalrymple, Roger, *Middle English Literature* (Oxford, 2004)

Daly, Kathleen and O'Day, Rosemary, *France, England and Burgundy in the Fifteenth Century* (Milton Keynes, 2007)

Deimling, H., ed., *The Chester Plays* (London, 1893)

Deeming, Helen, 'The sources and origin of the "Agincourt Carol" ', *Early Music*, 35/1 (2007), 23-38

Deeming, Helen, 'The Song and the Page: Experiments with Form and Layout in Manuscripts of Medieval Latin Song', *Plainsong & Medieval Music*, 15/1 (2006), 1-27

Dobson, E.J., Harrison, F.Ll. Medieval English Songs (London, 1979)

Duffy, Eamon, The Stripping of the Altars (New Haven, 1993)

Dumitrescu, Theodor, *The Early Tudor Court and International Musical Relations* (Aldershot, 2007)

Duncan, Thomas G., 'The Maid in the Moor and the Rawlinson Text', *The Review of English Studies*, 47 (1996), 151-62.

Duncan, Thomas Gibson, A Companion to the Middle English Lyric (Cambridge, 2005)

Dutka, J, 'Music and the English Mystery Plays', *Comparative Drama*, 7/2 (1973, Summer), 135-49

Emery, Anthony, *Greater Medieval Houses of England and Wales 1300-1500:* Southern England (Cambridge, 2006)

Erickson, Carolly, Brief Lives of the English Monarchs (London, 2007)

Everist, Mark, ed., The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Music (Cambridge 2011)

Fallows, David, 'The Fayrfax Manuscript', *The Musical Times*, 117 (February, 1976) 129-130

Fallows, David, 'English Song Repertories of the Mid-Fifteenth Century', *Proceedings* of the Royal Musical Association, 103 (1976-1977), 61-79

Fallows, David, A Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs, 1415–1480 (Oxford, 1999)

Fallows, David, Songs and Musicians in the Fifteenth Century (Hampshire, 1996)

Faulkes, Anthony, 'A New Medieval Carol Text', Notes and Queries, 52 (2005), 445

Fein, Susanna, *Poems and Carols: Oxford, Bodleian Library Ms Douce 302* (Michigan, 2009)

Fenlon, Iain. ed., Cambridge Music Manuscripts 900-1700 (Cambridge, 1982)

Fitzgerald, Christina M. *The Drama of Masculinity and Medieval Guild Culture* (New York, 2007)

Fletcher, Alan, J., 'Unnoticed Sermons from John Mirk's *Festial' Speculum: A Journal of Medieval Studies*, 55/3 (July, 1980), 514-522

Fletcher, Alan J., 'The Lyric in the Sermon', in Duncan, Thomas Gibson ed. A Companion to the Middle English Lyric (Cambridge, 2005) 171-188

Fuller Maitland, J., ed., English Carols of the Fifteenth Century: from an Ms. Roll in the Library of Trinity College, Cambridge (London, 1891)

Fuller, Sophie, 'Dead White Men in Wigs' in, Cooper, s. ed., *Girls! Girls! Girls!* (London, 1995)

Garner, Lori Ann, 'Contexts of interpretation in the Burdens of the Middle English Carols', *Neophilologus*, Vol. 84 (2000), 467-483

Goldberg, P.J.P., 'Women' in, Horrox, R., ed., *Fifteenth -Century Attitudes: Perceptions of Society in Late Medieval Britain*(Cambridge 1994)

Greene, R.L, ed., The Early English Carols (Oxford, 1935)

Greene, R.L., 'The Traditional Survival of Two Medieval Carols' *ELH*, 7/3 (September, 1940), 223-238

Greene, R. 'Two Medieval Manuscripts: Egerton 3307 and some University of Chicago Fragments', *Journal of the American Musicological Association*, 7 (1954), 1-34

Greene, A Selection of Early English Carols (Oxford, 1962)

Greene, R.L., 'Wyatt's'I am as I am' in Carol-Form', The *Review of English Studies*, Vol. 15/58 (May, 1964), 175-180

Greene, R.L. ed., *The Lyrics of the Red Book of Ossory*, Medium Aevum Monographs, 5 (Oxford, 1974),3-4

Greene, R. L., 'A Carol of Anne Boleyn by Wyatt', *The Review of English Studies*, 25/100 (Nov, 1974), 437-439

Greenfeld, Liah, Nationalism: Five Roads to Modernity (Harvard, 1992)

Greer, David, "Childe." In *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/05584 (accessed January 9, 2011).

Hardiment, A., *Liturgical and other influences on the carols of James Ryman, with a transcription of and notes on the part of his verse not easily accessible* (London, 1970-71)

Halmo, Joan, 'A Sarum Antiphoner and other Medieval Office Manuscripts from England and France: some musical relationships', *Plainsong and Medieval Music*, 11/2 (2002), 113-126

Harper-Scott, J.P.E and Samson, Jim, eds., *An Introduction to Music Studies* (Cambridge, 2009)

Harrison, F.Ll., Music in Medieval Britain (London, 1958)

Harrison, F.L, 'Benedicamus, Conductus, Carol: a newly discovered source', *Acta Musicologica*, 37(1965), 35-48

Hasted, Edward, 'Parishes: Saltwood', *The History and Topographical Survey of the County of Kent: Volume 8* (1799), 218-231. URL: http://www.british-history.ac.uk/report.aspx?compid=63477&strquery=saltwood castle Date accessed: 19 July 2011

Helms, Dietrich, 'Henry VIII's book: Teaching Music to Royal Children', *Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 92 (2009), 118-135

Herbert, Trevor, Music in Words (London, 2001)

Herrup, Cynthia, 'The King's Two Genders', *Journal of British Studies*, 45/3 (July, 2006), 493-510

Higgins, Paula. 'Parisian Nobles, a Scottish Princess and the Woman's voice in Late Medieval Song', *Early Music History*, 10 (1991), 145-200

Hirsh, John C., 'Christian Poetics and Orthodox Practice: Meaning and Implication in six carols by James Ryman, O.F.M.' In Changanti, S. And Szitlya, P.R., eds., *Medieval Poetics and Special Practice* (Fordham, 2012)

Hoppin, R., Medieval Music (New York, 1978)

Horrox, R., ed., *Fifteenth Century Attitudes: Perceptions of Society in Late Medieval Britain* (Cambridge 1994)

Hughes, Dom Anslem, 'The Works of Robert Fayrfax', *Music and Letters*, Vol. 30/2 (April 1949), 118-120 James, M.R., and Macaulay, G.C., 'Fifteenth Century Carols and other pieces', *Modern Language Review*, 7 (1913), 68-87

Jeffrey, David L., 'James Ryman and the Fifteenth-Century Carol', in *Fifteenth-Century Studies: Recent Essays*, ed. R.F. Yeager (Hamden, CT, 1984), 303-320

Jeffery, Peter, *Re-Envisioning Past Musical Cultures: Ethnomusicology in the study of Gregorian Chant* (Chicago, 1992)

Keyte, Hugh, Parrott, Andrew, eds., The New Oxford Book of Carols (New York, 1992)

Kirkman, Andrew, The Cultural Life of the Early Polyphonic Mass (New York, 2010)

Klarer, Mario, An Introduction to Literary Studies (London, 1999)

Klinck, Anne, Anthology of Ancient and Medieval Woman's Song (Gordonsville, 2004)

Knapp, Janet, "Conductus." *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed January 4, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/06268

Knighton, Tess, and Fallows, David, *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music* (New York, 1992)

Kumar, Krishan, The Making of English National Identity (Cambridge, 2003)

Lane, Eleanor and Sandon, Nick, *The Ritson Manuscript, liturgical compositions, Votive Antiphons, Te Deum* (Newton Abbot, 2011)

Lavezzo, Kathy, ed., Imagining a Medieval English Nation (Minneapolis, 2003)

Lefferts, P.M. 'The Motet in England in the 14<sup>th</sup> Century' *Current Musicology* 28 (1979), 55-75

Lefferts, Peter, *The Motet in the 14<sup>th</sup> Century* (Michigan, 1983)

Lefferts, P. 'England', in, Everist, Mark, ed. *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Music* (Cambridge 2011), 107-120

Leech-Wilkinson, Daniel, *The Modern Invention of Medieval Music: Scholarship, Ideology, Performance* (Cambridge, 2002)

Lemare, Ria, 'Explaining away the female subject: The case of Medieval Lyric', *Poetics Today*, 7/4 (1986), 729-743

Little, P.L., *The English Carol in the Late Fifteenth and Early Sixteenth Centuries* (Oxford, 1970 – 1971)

Fuller Maitland, J. A., *English Carols of the Fifteenth Century* (London, 1891)

McClary, Susan, Feminine Endings: music, gender and sexuality (Minneapolis, 2002)

McPeek, G.S, ed., The British Museum Manuscript Egerton 3307 (London, 1963)

Miller, C. A Fifteenth Century record of English Choir repertory: BM Add. Ms 5665: a Transcription and Commentary (Yale, 1948)

Miller, Catherine, K., 'The Early English Carol', *Renaissance News*, Vol. 3/4 (1950), 61-64

Milsom, John, 'Carols and 'Contrafacta' in the Early History of the Tudor Anthem', *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association*, 107 (1980-1981), 34-45

Mullally, Robert, The Carole, A Study of a Medieval Dance (Padstow, 2011)

Neufeld, Christine, Marie, *Xanthlppe's Sisters: Orality and Femininity in the Later Middle Ages*, PhD Dissertation, McGill University (Montreal, April 2001)

Nosow, Robert, *Ritual Meanings in the 15<sup>th</sup>-Century Motet* (New York, 2002)

Oliva, Marilyn, *The Convent and Community in Late Medieval England* (Woodbridge, 1998)

Olms, Georg, A Catalogue of the Lansdowne Manuscripts in the British Museum: With Indexes (Germany, 1819)

Page, Christopher, *The Owl and the Nightingale* (London, 1989)

Palti, Kathleen, 'An Unpublished Fifteenth-Century Carol Collection: Oxford, Lincoln College MS Lat. 141', *Medium Ævum*, Ixxvii (2008), 260 - 78.

Palti, Kathleen, 'Singe we now alle and sum': Three Fifteenth-Century Collections of Communal Song (PhD from University College London, 2008)

Parish, Helen, *Monks, Miracles, And Magic: Reformation Representation of the Medieval Church* (London, 2005), 95

Peraino, Judith, 'Re-Placing Medieval Music', *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 54, No. 2 (summer, 2001), 209-264

Petrina, Alessandra, Cultural Politics in Fifteenth-Century England (Leiden, 2004)

Plank, Steven, 'Wrapped up all in Woe: Passion Music in Late Medieval England', in MacDonald, Alasdair, Ridderbos, Bernhard and Schlusemann, R.M., *The Broken Body: Passion Devotion in Late Medieval Culture* (Groningen, 1998), 93-108

Plumley, Yolanda and Margaret Connolly, 'Crossing the Channel: French Lyrics in England in the early Fifteenth Century', in P. Ainsworth and G. Croenen, eds., *Patrons, Authors and Workshops: Books and Book Production in Paris circa* 1400 (Leuven: Peeters, 2006)

Power, Eileen, Medieval English Nunneries c. 1275-1535 (Cambridge, 1922)

Rankin, Susan, 'Some Medieval Songs', Early Music, 31/3 (2003), 327-343

Randel, Don Michael, 'The Canons in the Musicological Toolbox', *Disciplining Music: Musicology and its Canons*, Katherine Bergeron and Phillip V. Bohlman, eds. (Chicago, 1992), 10-22

Rastall, Richard, Two Fifteenth-Century Song Books (Aberystwyth, 1990)

Rastall, Richard, *Music in Early English Religious Drama: Minstrels Playing* (Cambridge, 1996)

Rastall, Richard, *Music in Early English Religious Drama: The Heaven Singing* (Cambridge, 1996)

Reichl, Karl, 'The Middle English Carol', in Duncan, Thomas Gibson ed. A Companion to the Middle English Lyric (Cambridge, 2005), 150-170

Rev, David L., 'James Ryman and the Fifteenth-Century Carol.' In, *Fifteenth-Century Studies: Recent Essays*, ed. R.F. Yeager (Hamden, 1984), 303-20.

Reynolds, Roger, E., 'The Drama of Medieval Liturgical Processions', *Revue de Musicologie*, 86e/1er (2000), 127-142

Robbins, R., 'The Earliest Carols and the Franciscans', *Modern Language Notes*, 3(1939), 239-45

Robbins, Rossell Hope, 'The Burden in Carols', *Modern Language Notes*, 57/1 (January, 1942), 16-22

Robbins, R.H. 'Two New Carols', Modern Language Notes, 58/1 (Jan., 1943), 39-42

Robbins, R.H, 'Middle English Carols as Processional Hymns', *Studies in Philology*, vi (1959), 559-582

Robbins, R.H, 'The Middle English Carol Corpus: some additions', *Modern Language Notes*, 24 (1959), 198-208

Schofield, B. 'A Newly Discovered 15<sup>th-</sup> Century Manuscript of the English Chapel Royal', *Musical Quarterly*, 32 (1946), 509-36

Seay, Albert, Music in the Medieval World (New Jersey, 1965)

Shelemay, Kay Kaufman, 'Toward an Ethnomusicology of the Early Music Movement: Thoughts on Bridging Disciplines and Musical Worlds', *Ethnomusicology*, 45/1 (winter, 2001), 1-29

Shull, Jonathan, 'Locating the Past in the Present: Living Traditions and the Performance of Early Music ', *Ethnomusicology Forum*, 15/1 (2006), 87-111

Smaill, Adele Margaret, *Medieval Carols: Origins, Forms, and Performance Contexts,* (PhD from the University of Michigan, 2003)

Solie, Ruth, Ed. Musicology and Difference (California, 1993)

Speelman, Willem Marie, *The Generation of Meaning in Liturgical Songs* (Kampen, 1995)

Stafford, Pauline, Mulder-Bakker, Anneke B., eds., *Gendering the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 2005)

Stevens, Denis, ed., A History of Song (London, 1960), 15-64

Stevens. Denis, 'Music in Honor of St. Thomas of Canterbury', *The Musical Quarterly*, 6/3 (July, 1970), 311-348

Stevens, Denis, Medieval Song (1970, n.p.)

Stevens, John, 'Carols and Court Songs of the Early Tudor Period', *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association*, 77 (1950-51), 51-62

Stevens, John, *Music and Poetry in the Early Tudor Court* (London, 1961)

Stevens, John, ed., Music at the Court of Henry VIII (London, 1962)

Stevens, John, ed., Mediaeval Carols (London, 1970)

Stevens, John, ed., Early Tudor Songs and Carols (London, 1975)

Stevens, John and Libby, Dennis. 'Carol'.' In *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/04974 (accessed July 20, 2012).

Strohm, R, 'How to Make Medieval Music Our Own: A Response to Christopher Page and Margaret Bent' *Early Music*, 22 (1994), 715-19

Taruskin, R., The Oxford History of Western Music, Vol. 1 (Oxford, 2005)

Treitler, Leo, With Voice and Pen (Oxford, 2003)

Turville-Petre, Thorlac, 'Political Lyrics', in Duncan, Thomas Gibson ed. *A Companion* to the Middle English Lyric (Cambridge, 2005), 171-188

Twycross, Meg, 'Medieval English Theatre: Codes and Genres' in Brown, Peter, ed., *A Companion to Medieval English Literature and Culture* C. 1350 – C. 1500 (Oxford, 2006), 454-472

Van der Werf, 'The 'Not-So-Precisely Measured' Music of the Middle Ages', *Performance Practice Review*, 1/1 (1988), 42-60

Wakelin, Daniel, Cambridge, St John's College Library, MS S.54 (nd,np)

Wakelin, Daniel, 'Lightening at Lynn: The Origins of a Lyric in Sloane 2593', *Notes and* Queries, 48 (2001), 382-385

Wakelin, Daniel, 'The carol in writing: Three Anthologies from Fifteenth-Century Norfolk', *Journal of the Early Book Society*, 9 (2006), 25-49

Walters Robertson, Anne, "Benedicamus Domino": The Unwritten Tradition', Journal of the American Musicological Society, 41/1 (Spring, 1988), 1-62

Ward, Sir A.W, and Waller, A.R, *The Cambridge History of English Literature, 2* (Cambridge, 1963)

Wathey, Andrew, 'The Peace of 1360-1369 and Anglo-French Musical Relations', *Early Music History*, 9 (1990), 129-174

Weir, Alison, Henry VIII: King and Court (London, 2011)

Wenzel, Siegfried, Preachers, Poets and the Early English Lyric (Princeton, 1986)

Wenzel, Siegfried, *Latin Sermon Collections from Late Medieval England* (Cambridge, 2005)

Wenzel, Siegfried, Preaching in the Age of Chaucer (Washington, 2008)

Wilson, R.M, The Lost Literature of Medieval England (London, 1970)

Wilkins, Nigel, . "Ballade (i)." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed May 21, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/01884.

Wilkins, Nigel. "Virelai." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed May 21, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/29490.

Wilkins, Nigel, "Rondeau (i)." *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press, accessed May 21, 2013, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/23782

Wright, Craig, The Maze and the Warrior (Massachusetts, 2004)

Wright, Laurence, 'The Medieval Gittern and Citole: A Case of Mistaken Identity', *The Galpin Society Journal*, 30 (May, 1977), 8-42

Wright, Thomas, Songs and Carols Printed from the Manuscript in the Sloane Collection in the British Museum (Pre 1923)

Yudkin, Jeremy, Music in Medieval Europe (New Jersey, 1980)

Zamzow, Beth Ann, *The Influence of the Liturgy on the Fifteenth-Century English Carols* (PhD from University of Iowa, 2000)

Zieman, Katherine, Singing the New Song (Pennsylvania, 2008)