Graduate Employability in the Curriculum: Student 'expectations v outcomes'. Is it a bridge too far? - a real conundrum!

Original Citation


This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/19471/
Student “Expectations v Outcomes”

Is it a bridge too far? - a real conundrum!

Presented by John English and Chris Ireland, The Business School
Why a conundrum?

1st Year Accountancy module – AIO students

Where are they in terms of employability?

Establish a baseline

Employability Competencies (Rees et al, 2007)
Introduce 6 years ago

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
### “Expectations v Outcomes”
PDP Review & Development – Self Review

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Portfolio Section</th>
<th>Initial Self-Review</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4-11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>Final Self-Review</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Generic Competencies</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Influencing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpersonal Sensitivity</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listening</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning and Organising</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questioning</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teamwork</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Communication</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals*
Why a conundrum?

- Overview of this year’s cohort (149 students)
  - Average for 20 areas was 5.25
  - 12 rated themselves between 7.5 to 9.0
  - 15 rated themselves below 4.0

Hence the conundrum
HE’s employability conundrum? – Two contrasting views

• *It has nothing to do with Higher Education*

• *It has everything to do with Higher Education*

• A pragmatic approach
  – developing both academic and vocational skills under the employability banner
Student visits to Academic Skills

![Bar chart showing student visits to academic skills from 2003/4 to 2006/7 for different subjects: Management & Marketing, Accountancy, Business Studies, Law, Other Schools.]

Bolt-on academic skills

Embedded academic skills

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
New Module: Lecturer’s Nightmare?

- Personal Development Planning
- Academic Skills and Vocational Skills
- Professional Body requirements
- Reflective writing
- Using formative exercises
- Enhancing the personal tutor system
- Shift student focus from numeracy
- Encourage placements
Our light bulb moment: Placements

Placement emphasis - GradCo Ltd

Initial phase
- preparing to apply
- applying

Development phase
- placement contracts
- employability
- fun
- cross boundaries

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Often underprepared for independent learning do not meet our expectations ‘we’ can be too critical

We try to meet them halfway to develop into UK HE students to prepare future employable graduates
Expectation: Do not delay

“We want to get on with studying; that’s what we are here for!”

Outcome: Immediate engagement

Teaching and formative assessment start in Induction Week
Induction Week Day Two

• Short essay about placement
• Many students have avoided writing since GCSEs.
• Collaborative approach (PAL assisted)
• Writing conventions/Attention to detail
Week One, Day One

- Surprise basic maths diagnostic due to mixed ability
- Score <50% = extra maths classes
- Can include A level students – why?
- The Z Z Z rule:-

  “After 3 years in Poland I was so resigned due to outdated teaching and assessments based on the 3 z rule – zakuc, zdac, zapmniec. Thanks to John my happiness of business and economics came back …. also made an impossible thing happen – I even got to like statistics.”
MC-Dip (Skills Diagnostic)

• One of our Baseline Assessments
• First introduced 5 years ago
• Highlights areas for development
• Provides evidence for reflection
Typical MC-Dip Skills Audit

- Numeracy
- Teamwork
- Presentation
- Creativity and Entrepreneurship
- IT
- Marketing
- Managing & Information
- Writing
- International Perspective
- Ethics and Trade

Inspiriting tomorrow's professionals
### Evidence informed approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Using the MC-Dip learning styles on-line</th>
<th>Year 2010/11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt; four weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Style</td>
<td>5.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Numeracy</td>
<td>7.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>7.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presentations</strong></td>
<td><strong>4.77</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>5.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teamwork</td>
<td>6.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average (10 areas)</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.68</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MC-Dip helps us to focus initiatives

- The English and Ireland presentation model:
  - 1st Presentation (formative) only give positive feedback
  - 2nd Presentation (formative) give positive and developmental feedback
  - 3rd Presentation (summative) rehearse with the academic development tutors
Business Challenge (ACCA)

Students act as a consultancy group for a Local Authority and help them make the right decision.

Students present their solution on flip chart paper using the 1\textsuperscript{st} stage of our presentation model.

A place to live? A place to shop?
A place to park?
A place for healthy learning?

You must decide for your local community

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Which employability competencies would you expect to develop in this exercise?

A) Adaptability / flexibility
B) Analysis
C) Decisiveness
D) Initiative
E) Teamwork / working with others
F) Tolerance of stress
**Financial Awareness** – “During the meetings I wasn’t able to provide the group with any figures, it took me a long time to understand where the numbers came from, although I felt behind in my course my group were very supportive and they helped me. I have decided I will prepare figures before a meeting in future as this will help my understanding”

**Interpersonal Sensitivity** – “I am too adamant about my point of view. In this task I respected the views of others as they were better than my own. From the feedback I realise I must respect others’ views ... something I will continue to do throughout my University course”
Strauss Pricing Exercise

Strauss Pricing (Module Leader)

Students help a client by producing a budgets, pricing strategy and a creative marketing slide for a new unique light weight caravan recliner.

The team solution must be presented by PowerPoint using the 2\textsuperscript{nd} stage of our presentation model.

Source: www.lafuma.org.uk

\begin{itemize}
    \item £150 - Premium pricing?
    \item £124.99 - Penetration pricing?
    \item £72 + £36 - Cost plus pricing?
\end{itemize}

You must help the client to decide
Which employability competencies would you expect to develop in this exercise?

A) Attention to detail
B) Planning and organising
C) Leadership
D) Time management
E) Creativity
F) Technical knowledge
Tolerance for Stress - “When I discovered we had to do presentations my heart skipped a few beats and I was hit with nerves. Could I fake illness to get out of doing them? – the formative process … has really helped me overcome the fears of presenting and I am finding ways of managing the stress.”

Worried Y1 Student (2010) now Chancellor’s prize winner who has even presented at our conferences.

Leadership - “Ever since starting school I have never enjoyed taking the lead or responsibility for a task. I felt quite pleased when my team asked me to be a team leader as this gave me the opportunity to get over my fears and take control of a situation”
Did the process have an impact?

Using the MC-Dip learning styles on-line

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Year 2010/11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1st four weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Style</td>
<td>5.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Numeracy</td>
<td>7.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>7.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentations</td>
<td>4.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>5.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teamwork</td>
<td>6.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average (10 areas)</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.68</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The issues faced in 2010/11

• Ever larger numbers on the 1st year
  – Doubled since 2006/7

• Greater numbers of non-UK students

• Presentation Feedback Process
  – Writing, Collating, Delivering and Engaging the Students

• Course needs
  – Referencing, critical thinking and presentation style
A solution for 11/12 presentations

- Working SMARTER
- IT and paperless process
- Student peer assessment and feedback
- Multiple student roles
## The data (feedback in words)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ACCA Game 😊</th>
<th>ACCA Game 😞</th>
<th>Strauss 😊</th>
<th>Strauss 😞</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer</strong></td>
<td>7074</td>
<td>6012</td>
<td>14657</td>
<td>19101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Responses</strong></td>
<td>351</td>
<td>351</td>
<td>431</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average</strong></td>
<td>20.15</td>
<td>17.13</td>
<td>34.01</td>
<td>44.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self</strong></td>
<td>2919</td>
<td>2470</td>
<td>3883</td>
<td>3610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Responses</strong></td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average</strong></td>
<td>33.94</td>
<td>28.72</td>
<td>47.94</td>
<td>44.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tutor</strong></td>
<td>2287</td>
<td>1126</td>
<td>1489</td>
<td>3528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Responses</strong></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average</strong></td>
<td>91.48</td>
<td>45.04</td>
<td>64.74</td>
<td>153.39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Use of the peer feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I used ACCA PEER feedback to prepare for the Strauss Presentation</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I used Strauss PEER feedback to prepare for the final presentation</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The way forward?

- AIO was the start
- Employability is now embedded across the degree
- Dissemination events – across the University

- If we could wave a magic wand we would solve
  - time management, planning and organisation,
  - commercial awareness and professionalism
Does the process still have an impact?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Using the MC-Dip learning styles on-line</th>
<th>Year 2010/11</th>
<th>Year 2012/13</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1st four weeks</td>
<td>End of term two</td>
<td>Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Style</td>
<td>5.42</td>
<td>5.98</td>
<td>0.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Numeracy</td>
<td>7.05</td>
<td>7.31</td>
<td>0.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>7.52</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentations</td>
<td>4.77</td>
<td>5.97</td>
<td>1.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>5.38</td>
<td>5.95</td>
<td>0.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teamwork</td>
<td>6.43</td>
<td>6.91</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average (10 areas)</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.68</strong></td>
<td><strong>6.24</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.56</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“The best thing about this portfolio is … it has really felt like a journey where I ... ‘identified’ my deepest weaknesses to make myself better which is something I never would have done ... the mark I will receive isn’t important as the way it has changed me as a person is far more valuable.”

“I have grown throughout the first year... unlocked motivation I did not even know I had.... I have learnt many skills to do with ... presentations, working in groups and how questioning and confidence has a lot to do with your ability to perform as well....I have also taken into account the peer reviews of our last presentation ..... me and my group will take this on board”
We are making a difference.
This email extract was received from a 2009 graduate - Katie:

It would probably be a good time to say ... how valuable your module, words of wisdom and help was in getting me here – thank you John.

I only wish that I could give back some words of wisdom on how to get your students to buy in to the concept of PDP and soft skills because they are definitely the key to getting onto good graduate schemes and becoming well rounded professionals – just like you said they would."
“As ever it was a pleasure yesterday - Your prize winners were a class act and ... proof of the impact the AIO module is having ... in the way they genuinely appreciate what it has done for them. These are the sorts of things that will prepare your students well for graduation and entering the employment market. What you do with them is fantastic in giving them a focus ... beyond graduation and developing them ... more broadly than the academic curriculum!”
We are making a difference? This is what Fiona and Keeran say:
A bridge too far?
No it’s the start of their fantastic journey


Leeds Metropolitan University (2009). Designing First-Year Assessment and Feedback. Downloaded from https://www.leedsmet.ac.uk/publications/files/Designing_1st_Year_Assessment_and_Feedback.pdf


