Student oral presentations: incorporating peer e-assessment

By
Chris Ireland & John English
Outline

• Why the emphasis on presentations?
• Why peer assessment?
• How has it been received?
• What issues have we identified?
Stereotypical image of an accountant

I understand the stereotype of the visor wearing bean counter for the accountant is wrong and that they practice many skills. What is a visor? Do foreign accountants wear visors at work?

Ceili

The green thing on his head is his visor.

roger

The stereotypical accountant is one that looks at his feet when talking to you. The assertive accountant will look at your feet!

Adapted from: able2know.org/topic/183296-1
The Role of the accountant has changed

Financial Managers
before a transactions manager
now a communicator and strategist
(International Federation of Accountants, 2002)

Management Accountants
before a bookkeeper in the back office
now a consultant in the front office
(Holtzman, 2004)
Communication is key

Albrecht & Sack (2000) survey

Accounting professionals and academics asked which skills were most important.

They agreed on three:

- written communication
- critical thinking
- oral communication

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
The stereotype produces a mismatch

Those wanting to enter accountancy
  tend to be numerate
  tend to be less prepared to communicate
  (Arquero, et al, 2007)

many students choose accountancy under the misconception
that the requirement for communication is low
  (Ameen et al, 2010:33)
Addressing the mismatch

We need to look at
  portrayal of the profession
  selection of students
  course design

(Arquero, et al, 2007)
Accountants in Organisations

Module introduced in September 2006
Incorporated PDP
Imaginary placement year
Students carry out a number of small projects/activities
Includes 3 presentations
Skills Self-Assessment 2013 (based on MC-DiP)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>During the first 4 weeks</th>
<th>out of 10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Writing Style</td>
<td>5.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Numeracy</td>
<td>6.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation</td>
<td>4.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>6.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>5.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teamwork</td>
<td>5.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average (10 areas)</td>
<td>5.67</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Presentations in Year 1 (Before)

Group presentations

November

6 minute presentation
formative feedback from tutor
rest of group observe
Presentations in Year 1 (Before)

Group presentations

February
  10 minute presentation followed by questions
  formative feedback from tutor
  rest of group observe

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Presentations in Year 1 (Before)

Group presentations

April

12 minute presentation followed by questions
summative feedback from tutor
only tutors observe

Inspiring tomorrow's professionals
Our thoughts about the process (2010)

November and February
   Limited value for the audience

April
   Range of interesting topics but only tutors observe

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Involving peers in the assessment of presentations helps develop judgement (Magin and Helmore, 2001) can improve reliability (Magin and Helmore, 2001) provides a clear purpose (MacAlpine, 1999) may foster interest and participation (MacAlpine, 1999) increases attentiveness (Langan et al, 2005)
Involving peers in the assessment of presentations

Greater improvements in presentations occurred when student/tutor assessed as opposed to tutor only
Students welcomed the opportunity to assess
Students welcomed feedback from a range of individuals
The use of e-assessment facilitates rapid provision of written feedback; an attribute valued by students (Browne and Shurville, 2007; NUS, 2010). Extensive feedback requires little administration.
Presentations in Year 1 (Now)

Group presentations

November
   6 minute presentation
   formative feedback from tutor
   rest of group also provide electronic formative feedback

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Presentations in Year 1 (Now)

Group presentations

February

10 minute presentation followed by questions
formative feedback from tutor
different group also provides electronic formative feedback

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Presentations in Year 1 (Now)

Group presentations

April (March 2013)
  12 minute presentation followed by questions
  summative assessment by tutor
  different group conducts same e-assessment

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Assessment of the Presentation

ACCA Business Game 2012

Please complete your assessment of each of the other teams in your group as soon as the group has finished presenting. After the lesson is over, reflect on your own presentation for at least a couple of hours and then complete a self assessment.

*Required

Group *

Team *

The assessment is a ...

Peer assessment

My student ID is ...
Write UJ followed by seven digits e.g. UJ7854321

My surname is ...

My first name is ...

What were the most pleasing aspects of this presentation? *

Write about one way in which this presentation could be improved? *

Complete the assessment using the criteria below

Marking Grid *

Audibility (How easy was it to hear the delivery)

Supporting visuals (flip chart)

Structure

Content

Excellent Very Good Good Satisfactory Development Area

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
## Data from English (2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Using the MC-Dip learning styles on-line</th>
<th>1st four weeks</th>
<th>End of term two</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Writing Style</td>
<td>5.47</td>
<td>5.98</td>
<td>0.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Numeracy</td>
<td>7.05</td>
<td>7.31</td>
<td>0.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>7.52</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presentations</strong></td>
<td>4.77</td>
<td>5.97</td>
<td>1.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>5.38</td>
<td>5.95</td>
<td>0.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teamwork</td>
<td>6.43</td>
<td>6.91</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average (10 areas)</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.68</strong></td>
<td><strong>6.24</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.56</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals*
### Skills Assessment 2012-13 (so far)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1st 4 weeks</th>
<th>End of term 2</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>6.95</td>
<td>7.62</td>
<td>0.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Numeracy</td>
<td>6.90</td>
<td>7.15</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation</td>
<td>4.72</td>
<td>6.23</td>
<td>1.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Style</td>
<td>5.56</td>
<td>6.89</td>
<td>1.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>5.16</td>
<td>6.36</td>
<td>1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teamwork</td>
<td>5.39</td>
<td>5.64</td>
<td>0.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average (10 areas)</td>
<td>5.67</td>
<td>6.57</td>
<td>0.90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Which feedback did you make most use of?

**Bar Chart**

- **2013**
  - Tutor (much more)
  - Tutor (slightly more)
  - About the same
  - Peer (slightly more)
  - Peer (much more)

- **2012**
  - Tutor (much more)
  - Tutor (slightly more)
  - About the same
  - Peer (slightly more)
  - Peer (much more)

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Usefulness of Peer Feedback (2013)

Inspiriting tomorrow’s professionals
Use made of Peer Feedback

Students indicating their use of peer feedback

Feedback on 1\textsuperscript{st} presentation used to inform 2\textsuperscript{nd} = 66% 

Feedback on 2\textsuperscript{nd} presentation used to inform 3\textsuperscript{rd} = 91%

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
101 students left comments about the use of peer assessment in presentations

110 positive comments
32 negative comments
7 other comments
Positive comments

Improvement
It enabled us to improve significantly
gave me the chance to look at where I could improve

New or different perspective
see how your presentation appeared to your peers
different point of view than the feedback from the tutor
wouldn’t have realised if it wasn't included in feedback

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Positive comments

Enjoyment
  I also enjoyed evaluating peers

Speed
  We got the feedback very fast

Extensive
  We had a broad range of comments

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Negative comments

Restrictive rules
peers are not allowed to type anything during the presentations ... cannot react to something straight away
I’d like to be able to add extra comments
I would prefer to have a little more time reviewing

Peer attitude
some people rush
some people put rude comments
you wonder if the people actually put thought into it

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Negative comments

It was the same thing a lot of the time

It was quite a lot to read through

Some groups were so perfect it was hard to say anything
Issue: Summative Assessment

Summative use of peer assessment
How valid is summative peer assessment?
  in the eyes of students
  in the eyes of validation panels

Davis (2004) students assessed peer essays as their own assessment
Harmer et al. (2007) Aropä project
Student comments

has helped me to understand how the marking system works
helps to understand what areas are rated when it comes to grades

I don’t like the fact the points we give are marked against the tutor marks; it shows our thoughts are not valid unless they coincide with what the tutors thought

Inspiring tomorrow’s professionals
Issue: Communication Apprehension

This approach may not be suitable for all

“techniques aimed at the development of communication skills will not resolve communication apprehension”