University of Huddersfield Repository

Deery, Ruth

Engaging with clinical supervision in a community midwifery setting: an action research study

Original Citation


This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/6913/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/
ENGAGING WITH CLINICAL SUPERVISION IN A COMMUNITY MIDWIFERY SETTING

AN ACTION RESEARCH STUDY

RUTH DEERY

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

WOMEN'S INFORMED CHILDBEARING & HEALTH RESEARCH GROUP
SCHOOL OF NURSING AND MIDWIFERY

THE UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD
UK

NOVEMBER 2003
ABSTRACT

The main aim of this research study was to explore midwives’ views and experiences of their support needs in clinical practice and then to identify how they would wish to receive such support. There was much literature to support the existence of stress and burnout in midwifery but no research that addressed ways of alleviating this. Further aims were to redress that imbalance by planning and facilitating a model of clinical supervision devised by the participating midwives.

The study took an action research approach that involved working with a group of eight National Health Service (NHS) community midwives in a collaborative, non-hierarchical and democratic way in order to achieve change. This accorded with a woman-centred approach to working with clients that was being encouraged within midwifery. The midwives were typical of many community-based midwives in the United Kingdom (UK) who were working in increasingly stressful, complex and changing environments.

Wider organisational and cultural issues are considered that affect working relationships. The nature of the way the midwives worked when they were offered and received support, and how they reacted and coped when their work team and work situation was threatened, was also explored.

Each midwife was interviewed twice; before and after the experience of clinical supervision. They also participated in two focus groups before clinical supervision. In-depth individual interviews lasted up to two hours, as did the focus groups. The interviews and the focus groups were taped, transcribed and then analysed using a relational voice-centred methodology.

The main findings were that recent and ongoing change plus the organisational demands placed on the midwives by the NHS and their managers were detrimental to working relationships with their colleagues and clients. This also inhibited the process of change. A discourse of denigration became apparent within the interviews and the midwives behaviour and coping strategies revealed some well developed defence mechanisms, as well as an apparent lack of understanding on their part and that of their midwifery managers in relation to emotion work. Resistance to change was a key defence mechanism used by the midwives.

Strong messages emerge about certain ‘performances’ being available to midwives and the use of defence mechanisms as a way of ‘getting the work done’. There are also messages about the cultural legacy of midwifery and how this can inhibit autonomous behaviour by midwives. Developing and increasing self awareness is still not viewed as being intrinsic to the work of the midwife and midwives are being asked to undertake a level of work that they have not been adequately prepared for. Neither do there appear to be effective role models for midwives. The bureaucratic pressures of working in a large maternity unit are also addressed where the system is seen as more important than the midwives.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many, many people who have unknowingly contributed to the successful completion of this study. I sincerely thank them all, but in particular I would like to take this opportunity to thank the following people.

My gratitude to my husband Patsy and my mother Teresa, who have provided endless support throughout the life of the study, is beyond words. They have been a tower of strength and encouragement for me as have my children, Nick, Laura and Emily who have ‘studied with me’. Nick became a Police Officer during the course of the study, Laura has taken her A levels and is preparing to go to University and Emily has taken her GCSEs…and they were only ‘babies’ when I started my research journey. My father Frank, who was very proud that I was studying for my doctorate died during the course of the research.

Professor Mavis Kirkham, as my research supervisor, has provided infinite support, constantly reinforcing my ability to undertake this research as well as write the thesis. She has inspired me, trusted me, been patient with me and above all, valued me and my contributions to midwifery. Her calming presence has helped me throughout this research journey.

I would like to thank Joss, Dawn, and all the midwives who participated in the study. Without their help and time this study would not have been possible. Joss and Dawn especially have helped me to think differently. I am also grateful to the midwifery managers for providing access to the participating midwives and the maternity unit.

Deborah Hughes has stayed with me every bit of the way on my research journey, reading endless drafts, often at short notice. She has listened patiently and helped to keep me grounded, as well as providing friendship and scholarly guidance for which I will always be grateful.

I also thank Christine Horrocks who joined me at the later stages of my research journey. Her encouragement, friendship and willingness to comment on drafts have been enormously helpful and motivating. She provided a certain ‘structure’ that was necessary for me at this crucial stage of my research journey.

The West Yorkshire Education and Training Consortium (now known as West Yorkshire Workforce Development Confederation) provided funding through a small grant. Without this funding the study might not have proceeded to completion. I am also grateful to the University of Huddersfield who provided funding for my studies at the University of Sheffield.
Table of Contents

Abstract ii
Acknowledgements iii
List of Tables xii
List of Figures xiii

Chapter One: INTRODUCTION 1

The need for the study 2
Aims of the study 3
Setting the scene 4
Key theoretical issues 6
  Feminist theory 6
  Humanistic psychology 7
  Counselling theory 8
  Group Work theory 9
  Psychotherapeutic theory 10
  Sociological theory 11
Transforming the local maternity services 12
Glendale Work Team 14
Dawn’s influence on my study 15
Joss’ influence on my study 16
The organisation of the thesis 16

Chapter Two: VOICES AND ISSUES FROM PAST AND PRESENT MIDWIFERY 19

The move from ‘disordered’ to ‘ordered’ practice 20
  Achieving professional status or a means to control practice? 21
  Dominant doctors and ‘disabled’ midwives 22
Statutory compliance: ‘supervising’ or ‘policing’ midwifery work? 23
Medicalisation of childbirth 24
  Who knows? 24
  The subjugation of midwifery knowledge 28
  Invisible midwifery expertise and invisible women 29
Technological surveillance and intervention 30
Adapting to, and changing ways of working 31
  The effects of changing approaches to care 33
The impact of changing work patterns on the midwifery workforce 34
Part 1: Culture and change in the NHS

The culture of midwifery in the NHS
The context of change in the NHS
Differing approaches to change
Sowing the seeds of change
Culture as a key influence on change
Midwives as obedient technicians
Change managing midwives
Detachment as a monitoring process
‘Militating organisational imperatives’

Key points emerging

Part 2: The midwife-mother relationship

First relationship crucial to subsequent relationships
Providing a holding environment
Providing a secure base
Community-based work as a refuge
The slipperiness of care……
……makes caring complex
The balancing act….becoming emotionally involved
Staying connected despite differences
Reciprocity: mutual aims and aspirations
Mediating between ‘connectedness’ and ‘detachment’
Picking the right balance
Different levels of engagement
Women as ‘natural carers’
The sentimental order of midwifery
Midwives’ ‘composure work’ – a form of task orientated care
Identity work – attending to nurturance, growth and healing
Therapeutic midwifery: being a ‘skilled companion’
Midwives as ‘gravy’
The consequences of partnership…devolving power

Key points emerging

Chapter Four: CLINICAL SUPERVISION – A POTENTIAL SOURCE OF SUPPORT

Strengthening or policing professional practice?
Learning lessons from other professions
Social work – ‘discussing cases’ or ‘anxious caseload management’
The concept of ‘supervisor’ – confusion and ‘definition quagmire’
‘Big sister is watching you’: supervision of midwives
The two hats – contradictions in midwifery supervision
Challenging midwifery supervision
The nature and range of clinical supervision

‘Doing’ clinical supervision

Individual supervision

Group supervision

Peer supervision

Frameworks for clinical supervision

The focus of clinical supervision

Hunt’s three approaches to supervision

Double Matrix Model

Triadic model of supervision

Six Category Intervention Analysis

Cyclical Model of Counsellor Supervision

Growth and Support Model

Guided Reflection or ‘professional narcissism’

Interactive Model

Nicklin’s six-stage supervision cycle

Problem orientated supervision

A hybrid model of clinical supervision

Practical route to successful clinical supervision

Key points emerging

Chapter Five: ACTION RESEARCH: OPENING NEW DIALOGUES FOR ENQUIRY

The beginnings…action research in the making

Valuing process and outcomes

Contextualising ‘real-world practice’

Defining action research

The nature of reality

‘Learning is rooted in experience’

Rejecting the search for truth

Prescription and the imposition of control

What about complex, messy clinical practice situations?

Naturalistic research: Subjectivity and shedding light on complex problems

Whose knowledge…..whose practice counts?

Critical theory research: challenging politically constructed situations

Models…approaches…typologies…traditions?

Cycles and steps as repressive and mechanical

Struggling in the swampy lowlands

Accepting certainty and valuing uncertainty

Feminisms and action research

The living theory approach

Mapping imagined frameworks’ onto clinical practice

Putting values “up-front”

Active versus passive participation
Chapter Six: METHODS

Placing ‘the self’ at the centre of the inquiry 167
Shaping the research with social, political and critical insight 167
A story of myself (6.12.00) 169
Childhood lasts a lifetime 169

Phase One 174
Gaining access 174
Gatekeeping access 174
Old habits die hard 175
Silencing mechanisms at play 176
Recruitment to the study 177
Excluding ‘others’ from the research 178

Phases One, Two and Three 179
Interviews as complex, social interactions 179
The influence of reciprocity 181
Listening to midwives’ voices 182
Listening to the voices of Susan, Sarah and Stella 183
Seeking spontaneous storytelling 184
The interviewer as a therapeutic resource 185
Is it necessary to draw a line in the sand? 186
Choosing the venue – feeling safer on your own patch 187
Coping with distractions and interruptions 188
Articulating ‘unarticulated experience’: helping each other out 189
The co-production of data within interviews 191

Phase Two 192
Hearing Joss’ voice 192
Focus groups as ‘natural social networks’ 193
Interaction as synergism 193
Focus groups equate with ‘time-efficiency’ 195
Silent voices…remaining an outsider 196
Focus groups as a forum for change 197
Facilitating focus groups 197
Observing interactions within focus groups 198

Issues of ethics and rigour 199
The appropriateness of reliability and validity in action research 202
Exercising professional imagination 203
Phase Three

Analysing the midwives’ accounts 206
‘Starting up terror’ – leaping into the unknown 207
The process of making sense 208
Facing myself….again 209

The principles of voice-centred relational methodology 210
First reading: focusing on the plot by losing my own plot 211
Second reading: being with midwives 212
Third reading: achieving a sense of balance in relationships 213
Fourth reading: some voices are louder than others 214
Fifth reading: expressing emotion through metaphors 215
Metaphors as a form of expression 216

Chapter Seven: PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS
THE CHALLENGE OF CHANGE: CONFRONTING CRISIS AND PAIN 220

The roller coaster of constant change: onerous or exciting? 221
The tyranny of team midwifery: an unfair imposition. 223
Idealising past ways of working. 226
Coping with stress: feeling upright, depressed and unable to go to work. 227
Habitual ways of working…collusive interaction and refusal to talk. 232
Bad care days…no time to listen and a fear of complex situations. 234
The rudderless ship…pulling differently and needing direction! 236
Pseudo-cohesion as a mask for unsupportive behaviour. 237
Ladylike saboteurs…’flies in the ointment’ or ‘doing good by stealth’. 238
Self denigration as a learned response and a way to discount needs. 242
‘Shared’ or ‘clash’ of personal philosophies. 244
Generations of dinosaurs…the birth and death of oppressors. 245

Key points emerging 247

Chapter Eight: PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS:
MIDWIVES AS ‘EMOTIONAL LABOURERS’ 249

‘Framing’ the story…midwifery work as ‘performance’ 251
Emotional labour 254
Longer client interactions = feeling ‘psychologically drained’ 256
Burnout syndrome 256
‘Professional closeness’ or detachment 260

Relating to, and developing partnerships with women 262
‘Psyching one’s self up’ – a coping strategy 262
Self presentation; coping and performance 263
Being ‘their friend’; feeling safe and suffering pain 264
Emotional engagement: a source of energy or a stressor 266
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Practical and intellectually challenging performances</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finite energy: running on empty</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Down and worn out</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining relationships: holding on to professional power</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expecting nothing other than what is received</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The organisational demands of the maternity service</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protocolisation inhibiting the spontaneous performance of midwifery</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feeling overwhelmed by their relationships with each other</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unequal workloads despite being ‘all the same’</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increasing workloads</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘The cult of busyness’…self protection or avoiding too much work</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differentiating between clients: rejection and acceptance</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need to be needed</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key points emerging</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter Nine: PHASE TWO - FOCUS GROUPS: CLARIFYING SUPPORT NEEDS AND PLANNING FOR CHANGE**

| Focus group one: A forum to reflect on support needs and change      | 294  |
| Observing group interaction                                         | 295  |
| Silent voices huddling together                                      | 296  |
| Getting started…different forms of anxiety                          | 297  |
| Keeping ‘team spirit’ alive…despite obvious differences             | 300  |
| Pussyfooting and ‘smoothing over’ as alternatives                    | 302  |
| Conversational rituals…trying to restore balance                    | 303  |
| Fear of exposing feelings…letting colleagues ‘see inside’           | 304  |
| Attempting to meet support needs                                    | 306  |
| Taking things further…new style of clinical support!                | 308  |
| Fear of a new hierarchy                                             | 310  |
| Celebrating midwifery versus use of a ‘black book’                  | 311  |
| Key points emerging from focus group one                            | 314  |
| Dawn’s input following the first focus group                        | 315  |

| Focus group two: Working towards a supportive framework             | 317  |
| ‘Them’ and ‘us’ – pseudo-collusion as a defence mechanism           | 318  |
| ‘Punching lights out’: no power, anger and dissatisfaction          | 319  |
| ‘Jumping on board’ or resisting collaboration and responsibility     | 320  |
| Managing change…or not…through the study findings                  | 323  |
| Collaborating or colluding: yet another contradiction!              | 324  |
| Different ways of working really means ‘double visits’             | 325  |
| The way forward for the work team                                   | 328  |
| Even researchers get hurt…‘emotional pebbles and potholes’          | 329  |
| Key points emerging from focus group two                            | 330  |
Chapter Ten: PHASE THREE - FINAL INTERVIEWS

CHALLENGES AHEAD: DEVELOPING AN AWARENESS OF REALITY

An ‘opportunity’ or a ‘different space’
Cohesiveness as a means of keeping problems hidden
‘Pseudo-cohesion’ as a means of masking unsupportive behaviour
A challenge: time for reflection and possible change
Too great a challenge: no time and no support during turbulent change.
The need to feel safe: negotiating a safe environment
‘Contract setting’: working together towards a clinical supervision framework.

Making time for clinical supervision
Buying time: money makes midwives!
Time out to talk: spending valuable time
Time as a finite commodity…it costs money!
Time as a ‘sacrifice’: encroaching on others’ time
Taking time that is needed elsewhere

Group supervision: feeling safer in numbers
Feeling valued through equality and consistency
Imposing boundaries: limiting involvement or avoiding responsibility.
Feeling elitist: better to exclude than include
The dumping ground: a place for unloading distress
Help rejecting complainers: a means of expressing resentment or a reflection of reality
Different ways of acknowledging endings
The empty chair: avoidance behaviour or a call for help
Facing the challenge: presenting clinical material of concern
Towards a new understanding
Avoidance of issues
‘Pit-head time’ – an opportunity to discuss ‘casework moments’

Key points emerging

Chapter Eleven: CONCLUDING THOUGHTS….. AND BEYOND

The rhetorical challenge of midwifery
‘Cultures of conflict’
Insights into the performance of midwifery
Performances as bound by the clock
Insights into working relationships
Clinical supervision as an ‘unshackling process’ 398
Midwives who balance well 400
  Pseudo-cohesion as a defence mechanism 401
Struggles and contradictions within action research 401
The way forward 404
Implications for midwifery education and further research 405

Recommendations for midwifery practice 408
Recommendations for further research 411

REFERENCES 413

APPENDICES 443

  1. Description of the midwives 443
  2. Interview Schedule (preliminary interviews) 450
  3. Interview Schedule (focus group 1) 451
  4. Interview Schedule (focus group 2) 452
  5. Interview Schedule (final interviews) 453
List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Four: Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1: Schools of psychotherapy or counselling as applied to clinical supervision</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2: Models of clinical supervision</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Five: Action research: opening new dialogues for Enquiry</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 3: The position of the researcher</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Eight: Midwives as ‘emotional labourers’</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 4: Summary of the spectrum of ‘performances’ (as described in preliminary interviews)</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5: Midwives’ ways of emotional engagement in a bureaucratic context and their subsequent effects</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter One:</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1:</td>
<td>Flow Chart signposting phases and progress of study</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Four:</th>
<th>Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’</th>
<th>81</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2:</td>
<td>Hawkins &amp; Shohet’s Double Matrix Model of Supervision.</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3:</td>
<td>Hybrid Model of Clinical Supervision.</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4:</td>
<td>The route to successful and effective clinical supervision.</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Five:</th>
<th>Action research: opening new dialogues for enquiry</th>
<th>140</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5:</td>
<td>Different approaches to action research in critical theory paradigm.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>