Engaging with clinical supervision in a community midwifery setting: an action research study

Original Citation


This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/6913/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

• The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
• A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
• The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/
ENGAGING WITH CLINICAL SUPERVISION IN A COMMUNITY MIDWIFERY SETTING

AN ACTION RESEARCH STUDY

RUTH DEERY

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

WOMEN'S INFORMED CHILDBEARING & HEALTH RESEARCH GROUP
SCHOOL OF NURSING AND MIDWIFERY
THE UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD
UK

NOVEMBER 2003
ABSTRACT

The main aim of this research study was to explore midwives’ views and experiences of their support needs in clinical practice and then to identify how they would wish to receive such support. There was much literature to support the existence of stress and burnout in midwifery but no research that addressed ways of alleviating this. Further aims were to redress that imbalance by planning and facilitating a model of clinical supervision devised by the participating midwives.

The study took an action research approach that involved working with a group of eight National Health Service (NHS) community midwives in a collaborative, non-hierarchical and democratic way in order to achieve change. This accorded with a woman-centred approach to working with clients that was being encouraged within midwifery. The midwives were typical of many community-based midwives in the United Kingdom (UK) who were working in increasingly stressful, complex and changing environments.

Wider organisational and cultural issues are considered that affect working relationships. The nature of the way the midwives worked when they were offered and received support, and how they reacted and coped when their work team and work situation was threatened, was also explored.

Each midwife was interviewed twice; before and after the experience of clinical supervision. They also participated in two focus groups before clinical supervision. In-depth individual interviews lasted up to two hours, as did the focus groups. The interviews and the focus groups were taped, transcribed and then analysed using a relational voice-centred methodology.

The main findings were that recent and ongoing change plus the organisational demands placed on the midwives by the NHS and their managers were detrimental to working relationships with their colleagues and clients. This also inhibited the process of change. A discourse of denigration became apparent within the interviews and the midwives behaviour and coping strategies revealed some well developed defence mechanisms, as well as an apparent lack of understanding on their part and that of their midwifery managers in relation to emotion work. Resistance to change was a key defence mechanism used by the midwives.

Strong messages emerge about certain ‘performances’ being available to midwives and the use of defence mechanisms as a way of ‘getting the work done’. There are also messages about the cultural legacy of midwifery and how this can inhibit autonomous behaviour by midwives. Developing and increasing self awareness is still not viewed as being intrinsic to the work of the midwife and midwives are being asked to undertake a level of work that they have not been adequately prepared for. Neither do there appear to be effective role models for midwives. The bureaucratic pressures of working in a large maternity unit are also addressed where the system is seen as more important than the midwives.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many, many people who have unknowingly contributed to the successful completion of this study. I sincerely thank them all, but in particular I would like to take this opportunity to thank the following people.

My gratitude to my husband Patsy and my mother Teresa, who have provided endless support throughout the life of the study, is beyond words. They have been a tower of strength and encouragement for me as have my children, Nick, Laura and Emily who have ‘studied with me’. Nick became a Police Officer during the course of the study, Laura has taken her A levels and is preparing to go to University and Emily has taken her GCSEs…and they were only ‘babies’ when I started my research journey. My father Frank, who was very proud that I was studying for my doctorate died during the course of the research.

Professor Mavis Kirkham, as my research supervisor, has provided infinite support, constantly reinforcing my ability to undertake this research as well as write the thesis. She has inspired me, trusted me, been patient with me and above all, valued me and my contributions to midwifery. Her calming presence has helped me throughout this research journey.

I would like to thank Joss, Dawn, and all the midwives who participated in the study. Without their help and time this study would not have been possible. Joss and Dawn especially have helped me to think differently. I am also grateful to the midwifery managers for providing access to the participating midwives and the maternity unit.

Deborah Hughes has stayed with me every bit of the way on my research journey, reading endless drafts, often at short notice. She has listened patiently and helped to keep me grounded, as well as providing friendship and scholarly guidance for which I will always be grateful.

I also thank Christine Horrocks who joined me at the later stages of my research journey. Her encouragement, friendship and willingness to comment on drafts have been enormously helpful and motivating. She provided a certain ‘structure’ that was necessary for me at this crucial stage of my research journey.

The West Yorkshire Education and Training Consortium (now known as West Yorkshire Workforce Development Confederation) provided funding through a small grant. Without this funding the study might not have proceeded to completion. I am also grateful to the University of Huddersfield who provided funding for my studies at the University of Sheffield.
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Abstract</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Acknowledgements</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>List of Tables</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>List of Figures</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter One: INTRODUCTION**

The need for the study  
Aims of the study  
Setting the scene  
Key theoretical issues  
  Feminist theory  
  Humanistic psychology  
  Counselling theory  
  Group Work theory  
  Psychotherapeutic theory  
  Sociological theory  
Transforming the local maternity services  
Glendale Work Team  
Dawn's influence on my study  
Joss' influence on my study  
The organisation of the thesis

**Chapter Two: VOICES AND ISSUES FROM PAST AND PRESENT MIDWIFERY**

The move from 'disordered' to 'ordered' practice  
  Achieving professional status or a means to control practice?  
Dominant doctors and 'disabled' midwives  
Statutory compliance: 'supervising' or 'policing' midwifery work?  
Medicalisation of childbirth  
  Who knows?  
  The subjugation of midwifery knowledge  
  Invisible midwifery expertise and invisible women  
Technological surveillance and intervention  
Adapting to, and changing ways of working  
  The effects of changing approaches to care  
The impact of changing work patterns on the midwifery workforce
Chapter Three: CHANGE, CULTURE, ‘CARING’ AND RELATIONSHIPS

Part 1: Culture and change in the NHS

The culture of midwifery in the NHS 36
The context of change in the NHS 39
Differing approaches to change 41
Sowing the seeds of change 43
Culture as a key influence on change 44
Midwives as obedient technicians 45
Change managing midwives 47
Detachment as a monitoring process 49
‘Militating organisational imperatives’ 50

Key points emerging 51

Part 2: The midwife-mother relationship

First relationship crucial to subsequent relationships 54
Providing a holding environment 55
Providing a secure base 56
Community-based work as a refuge 57
The slipperiness of care....... 58
.......makes caring complex 59
The balancing act....becoming emotionally involved 60
Staying connected despite differences 61
Reciprocity: mutual aims and aspirations 62
Mediating between ‘connectedness’ and ‘detachment’ 64
Picking the right balance 65
Different levels of engagement 66
Women as ‘natural carers’ 69
The sentimental order of midwifery 70
Midwives’ ‘composure work’ – a form of task orientated care 72
Identity work – attending to nurturance, growth and healing 73
Therapeutic midwifery: being a ‘skilled companion’ 75
Midwives as ‘gravy’ 76
The consequences of partnership...devolving power 77

Key points emerging 79

Chapter Four: CLINICAL SUPERVISION – A POTENTIAL SOURCE OF SUPPORT

Strengthening or policing professional practice? 82
Learning lessons from other professions 83
Social work – ‘discussing cases’ or ‘anxious caseload management’ 85
The concept of ‘supervisor’ – confusion and ‘definition quagmire’ 86
‘Big sister is watching you’: supervision of midwives 88
The two hats – contradictions in midwifery supervision 89
Challenging midwifery supervision 90
The nature and range of clinical supervision

‘Doing’ clinical supervision

Individual supervision

Group supervision

Peer supervision

Frameworks for clinical supervision

The focus of clinical supervision

Hunt’s three approaches to supervision

Double Matrix Model

Triadic model of supervision

Six Category Intervention Analysis

Cyclical Model of Counsellor Supervision

Growth and Support Model

Guided Reflection or ‘professional narcissism’

Interactive Model

Nicklin’s six-stage supervision cycle

Problem orientated supervision

A hybrid model of clinical supervision

Practical route to successful clinical supervision

Key points emerging

Chapter Five: ACTION RESEARCH: OPENING NEW DIALOGUES FOR ENQUIRY

The beginnings…action research in the making

Valuing process and outcomes

Contextualising ‘real-world practice’

Defining action research

The nature of reality

‘Learning is rooted in experience’

Rejecting the search for truth

Prescription and the imposition of control

What about complex, messy clinical practice situations?

Naturalistic research: Subjectivity and shedding light on complex problems

Whose knowledge…..whose practice counts?

Critical theory research: challenging politically constructed situations

Models…approaches…typologies…traditions?

Cycles and steps as repressive and mechanical

Struggling in the swampy lowlands

Accepting certainty and valuing uncertainty

Feminisms and action research

The living theory approach

Mapping imagined frameworks’ onto clinical practice

Putting values “up-front”

Active versus passive participation
Chapter Six: METHODS

Placing ‘the self’ at the centre of the inquiry
- Shaping the research with social, political and critical insight
- A story of myself (6.12.00)
- Childhood lasts a lifetime

Phase One
- Gaining access
- Gatekeeping access
- Old habits die hard
- Silencing mechanisms at play
- Recruitment to the study
- Excluding ‘others’ from the research

Phases One, Two and Three
- Interviews as complex, social interactions
- The influence of reciprocity
- Listening to midwives’ voices
- Listening to the voices of Susan, Sarah and Stella
- Seeking spontaneous storytelling
- The interviewer as a therapeutic resource
- Is it necessary to draw a line in the sand?
- Choosing the venue – feeling safer on your own patch
- Coping with distractions and interruptions
- Articulating ‘unarticulated experience’: helping each other out
- The co-production of data within interviews

Phase Two
- Hearing Joss’ voice
- Focus groups as ‘natural social networks’
- Interaction as synergism
- Focus groups equate with ‘time-efficiency’
- Silent voices….remaining an outsider
- Focus groups as a forum for change
- Facilitating focus groups
- Observing interactions within focus groups

Issues of ethics and rigour
- The appropriateness of reliability and validity in action research
- Exercising professional imagination
Phase Three

Analysing the midwives’ accounts

‘Starting up terror’ – leaping into the unknown
The process of making sense
Facing myself….again

The principles of voice-centred relational methodology

First reading: focusing on the plot by losing my own plot
Second reading: being with midwives
Third reading: achieving a sense of balance in relationships
Fourth reading: some voices are louder than others
Fifth reading: expressing emotion through metaphors
Metaphors as a form of expression

Chapter Seven:     PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS
THE CHALLENGE OF CHANGE: CONFRONTING CRISIS AND PAIN

The roller coaster of constant change: onerous or exciting?
The tyranny of team midwifery: an unfair imposition.
Idealising past ways of working.
Coping with stress: feeling uptight, depressed and unable to go to work.
Habitual ways of working…collusive interaction and refusal to talk.
Bad care days…no time to listen and a fear of complex situations.
The rudderless ship…pulling differently and needing direction!
Pseudo-cohesion as a mask for unsupportive behaviour.
Ladylike saboteurs…‘flies in the ointment’ or ‘doing good by stealth’.
Self denigration as a learned response and a way to discount needs.
‘Shared’ or ‘clash’ of personal philosophies.
Generations of dinosaurs…the birth and death of oppressors.

Key points emerging

Chapter Eight:     PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS:
MIDWIVES AS ‘EMOTIONAL LABOURERS’

‘Framing’ the story…midwifery work as ‘performance’
Emotional labour
Longer client interactions = feeling ‘psychologically drained’
Burnout syndrome
‘Professional closeness’ or detachment

Relating to, and developing partnerships with women
‘Psyching one’s self up’ – a coping strategy
Self presentation; coping and performance
Being ‘their friend’; feeling safe and suffering pain

Emotional engagement: a source of energy or a stressor
Practical and intellectually challenging performances 268
Finite energy: running on empty 269
Down and worn out 271
Defining relationships: holding on to professional power 272
Expecting nothing other than what is received 273
The organisational demands of the maternity service 278
Protocolisation inhibiting the spontaneous performance of midwifery 278

Feeling overwhelmed by their relationships with each other 281
Unequal workloads despite being ‘all the same’ 284
Increasing workloads 285
‘The cult of busyness’…self protection or avoiding too much work 285
Differentiating between clients: rejection and acceptance 288
The need to be needed 289
Key points emerging 293

Chapter Nine: PHASE TWO - FOCUS GROUPS: CLARIFYING SUPPORT NEEDS AND PLANNING FOR CHANGE 294

Focus group one: A forum to reflect on support needs and change 294
Observing group interaction 295
Silent voices huddling together 296
Getting started…different forms of anxiety 297
Keeping ‘team spirit’ alive…despite obvious differences 300
Pussyfooting and ‘smoothing over’ as alternatives 302
Conversational rituals…trying to restore balance 303
Fear of exposing feelings…letting colleagues ‘see inside’ 304
Attempting to meet support needs 306
Taking things further…new style of clinical support! 308
Fear of a new hierarchy 310
Celebrating midwifery versus use of a ‘black book’ 311
Key points emerging from focus group one 314

Dawn’s input following the first focus group 315

Focus group two: Working towards a supportive framework 317
‘Them’ and ‘us’ – pseudo-collusion as a defence mechanism 318
‘Punching lights out’: no power, anger and dissatisfaction 319
‘Jumping on board’ or resisting collaboration and responsibility 320
Managing change…or not…through the study findings 323
Collaborating or colluding: yet another contradiction! 324
Different ways of working really means ‘double visits’ 325
The way forward for the work team 328
Even researchers get hurt…‘emotional pebbles and potholes’ 329
Key points emerging from focus group two 330
Chapter Ten: PHASE THREE - FINAL INTERVIEWS

CHALLENGES AHEAD: DEVELOPING AN AWARENESS OF REALITY

An ‘opportunity’ or a ‘different space’
Cohesiveness as a means of keeping problems hidden
‘Pseudo-coheson as a means of masking unsupportive behaviour
A challenge: time for reflection and possible change
Too great a challenge: no time and no support during turbulent change.
The need to feel safe: negotiating a safe environment
‘Contract setting’: working together towards a clinical supervision framework.

Making time for clinical supervision
Buying time: money makes midwives!
Time out to talk: spending valuable time
Time as a finite commodity…it costs money!
Time as a ‘sacrifice’: encroaching on others’ time
Taking time that is needed elsewhere

Group supervision: feeling safer in numbers
Feeling valued through equality and consistency
Imposing boundaries: limiting involvement or avoiding responsibility.
Feeling elitist: better to exclude than include
The dumping ground: a place for unloading distress
Help rejecting complainers: a means of expressing resentment or a reflection of reality
Different ways of acknowledging endings
The empty chair: avoidance behaviour or a call for help
Facing the challenge: presenting clinical material of concern
Towards a new understanding
Avoidance of issues
‘Pit-head time’ – an opportunity to discuss ‘casework moments’

Key points emerging

Chapter Eleven: CONCLUDING THOUGHTS..... AND BEYOND

The rhetorical challenge of midwifery
‘Cultures of conflict’
Insights into the performance of midwifery
Performances as bound by the clock
Insights into working relationships
Clinical supervision as an ‘unshackling process’ 398
Midwives who balance well 400
   Pseudo-cohesion as a defence mechanism 401
Struggles and contradictions within action research 401
The way forward 404
Implications for midwifery education and further research 405

Recommendations for midwifery practice 408
Recommendations for further research 411

REFERENCES 413

APPENDICES 443

1. Description of the midwives 443
2. Interview Schedule (preliminary interviews) 450
3. Interview Schedule (focus group 1) 451
4. Interview Schedule (focus group 2) 452
5. Interview Schedule (final interviews) 453
List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Four: Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1: Schools of psychotherapy or counselling as applied to clinical supervision</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2: Models of clinical supervision</td>
<td>99-100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Five: Action research: opening new dialogues for Enquiry</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 3: The position of the researcher</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Eight: Midwives as ‘emotional labourers’</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 4: Summary of the spectrum of ‘performances’ (as described in preliminary interviews)</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5: Midwives’ ways of emotional engagement in a bureaucratic context and their subsequent effects</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter One:</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1:</td>
<td>Flow Chart signposting phases and progress of study</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Four:</th>
<th>Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2:</td>
<td>Hawkins &amp; Shohet’s Double Matrix Model of Supervision.</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3:</td>
<td>Hybrid Model of Clinical Supervision.</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4:</td>
<td>The route to successful and effective clinical supervision.</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Five:</th>
<th>Action research: opening new dialogues for enquiry</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5:</td>
<td>Different approaches to action research in critical theory paradigm.</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>