University of Huddersfield Repository

Deery, Ruth

Engaging with clinical supervision in a community midwifery setting: an action research study

Original Citation


This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/6913/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

• The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
• A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
• The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/
ENGAGING WITH CLINICAL SUPERVISION IN A COMMUNITY MIDWIFERY SETTING

AN ACTION RESEARCH STUDY

RUTH DEERY

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

WOMEN'S INFORMED CHILDBEARING & HEALTH RESEARCH GROUP
SCHOOL OF NURSING AND MIDWIFERY

THE UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD
UK

NOVEMBER 2003
ABSTRACT

The main aim of this research study was to explore midwives' views and experiences of their support needs in clinical practice and then to identify how they would wish to receive such support. There was much literature to support the existence of stress and burnout in midwifery but no research that addressed ways of alleviating this. Further aims were to redress that imbalance by planning and facilitating a model of clinical supervision devised by the participating midwives.

The study took an action research approach that involved working with a group of eight National Health Service (NHS) community midwives in a collaborative, non-hierarchical and democratic way in order to achieve change. This accorded with a woman-centred approach to working with clients that was being encouraged within midwifery. The midwives were typical of many community-based midwives in the United Kingdom (UK) who were working in increasingly stressful, complex and changing environments.

Wider organisational and cultural issues are considered that affect working relationships. The nature of the way the midwives worked when they were offered and received support, and how they reacted and coped when their work team and work situation was threatened, was also explored.

Each midwife was interviewed twice; before and after the experience of clinical supervision. They also participated in two focus groups before clinical supervision. In-depth individual interviews lasted up to two hours, as did the focus groups. The interviews and the focus groups were taped, transcribed and then analysed using a relational voice-centred methodology.

The main findings were that recent and ongoing change plus the organisational demands placed on the midwives by the NHS and their managers were detrimental to working relationships with their colleagues and clients. This also inhibited the process of change. A discourse of denigration became apparent within the interviews and the midwives' behaviour and coping strategies revealed some well-developed defence mechanisms, as well as an apparent lack of understanding on their part and that of their midwifery managers in relation to emotion work. Resistance to change was a key defence mechanism used by the midwives.

Strong messages emerge about certain 'performances' being available to midwives and the use of defence mechanisms as a way of 'getting the work done'. There are also messages about the cultural legacy of midwifery and how this can inhibit autonomous behaviour by midwives. Developing and increasing self awareness is still not viewed as being intrinsic to the work of the midwife and midwives are being asked to undertake a level of work that they have not been adequately prepared for. Neither do there appear to be effective role models for midwives. The bureaucratic pressures of working in a large maternity unit are also addressed where the system is seen as more important than the midwives.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many, many people who have unknowingly contributed to the successful completion of this study. I sincerely thank them all, but in particular I would like to take this opportunity to thank the following people.

My gratitude to my husband Patsy and my mother Teresa, who have provided endless support throughout the life of the study, is beyond words. They have been a tower of strength and encouragement for me as have my children, Nick, Laura and Emily who have ‘studied with me’. Nick became a Police Officer during the course of the study, Laura has taken her A levels and is preparing to go to University and Emily has taken her GCSEs…and they were only ‘babies’ when I started my research journey. My father Frank, who was very proud that I was studying for my doctorate died during the course of the research.

Professor Mavis Kirkham, as my research supervisor, has provided infinite support, constantly reinforcing my ability to undertake this research as well as write the thesis. She has inspired me, trusted me, been patient with me and above all, valued me and my contributions to midwifery. Her calming presence has helped me throughout this research journey.

I would like to thank Joss, Dawn, and all the midwives who participated in the study. Without their help and time this study would not have been possible. Joss and Dawn especially have helped me to think differently. I am also grateful to the midwifery managers for providing access to the participating midwives and the maternity unit.

Deborah Hughes has stayed with me every bit of the way on my research journey, reading endless drafts, often at short notice. She has listened patiently and helped to keep me grounded, as well as providing friendship and scholarly guidance for which I will always be grateful.

I also thank Christine Horrocks who joined me at the later stages of my research journey. Her encouragement, friendship and willingness to comment on drafts have been enormously helpful and motivating. She provided a certain ‘structure’ that was necessary for me at this crucial stage of my research journey.

The West Yorkshire Education and Training Consortium (now known as West Yorkshire Workforce Development Confederation) provided funding through a small grant. Without this funding the study might not have proceeded to completion. I am also grateful to the University of Huddersfield who provided funding for my studies at the University of Sheffield.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAGE</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter One: INTRODUCTION

- The need for the study | 2
- Aims of the study | 3
- Setting the scene | 4
- Key theoretical issues | 6
  - Feminist theory | 6
  - Humanistic psychology | 7
  - Counselling theory | 8
  - Group Work theory | 9
  - Psychotherapeutic theory | 10
  - Sociological theory | 11
- Transforming the local maternity services | 12
- Glendale Work Team | 14
- Dawn’s influence on my study | 15
- Joss’ influence on my study | 16
- The organisation of the thesis | 16

## Chapter Two: VOICES AND ISSUES FROM PAST AND PRESENT MIDWIFERY

- The move from ‘disordered’ to ‘ordered’ practice | 20
  - Achieving professional status or a means to control practice? | 21
  - Dominant doctors and ‘disabled’ midwives | 22
  - Statutory compliance: ‘supervising’ or ‘policing’ midwifery work? | 23
- Medicalisation of childbirth | 24
  - Who knows? | 24
  - The subjugation of midwifery knowledge | 28
  - Invisible midwifery expertise and invisible women | 29
- Technological surveillance and intervention | 30
- Adapting to, and changing ways of working | 31
  - The effects of changing approaches to care | 33
- The impact of changing work patterns on the midwifery workforce | 34
### Chapter Three: CHANGE, CULTURE, ‘CARING’ AND RELATIONSHIPS

#### Part 1: Culture and change in the NHS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The culture of midwifery in the NHS</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The context of change in the NHS</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differing approaches to change</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sowing the seeds of change</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture as a key influence on change</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Midwives as obedient technicians</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change managing midwives</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detachment as a monitoring process</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Militating organisational imperatives’</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Key points emerging</strong></td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Part 2: The midwife-mother relationship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First relationship crucial to subsequent relationships</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Providing a holding environment</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Providing a secure base</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community-based work as a refuge</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The slipperiness of care.......</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>……..makes caring complex</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The balancing act….becoming emotionally involved</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staying connected despite differences</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reciprocity: mutual aims and aspirations</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mediating between ‘connectedness’ and ‘detachment’</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picking the right balance</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different levels of engagement</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women as ‘natural carers’</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sentimental order of midwifery</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Midwives’ ‘composure work’ – a form of task orientated care</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity work – attending to nurturance, growth and healing</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Therapeutic midwifery: being a ‘skilled companion’</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Midwives as ‘gravy’</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The consequences of partnership…devolving power</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Key points emerging</strong></td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter Four: CLINICAL SUPERVISION – A POTENTIAL SOURCE OF SUPPORT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strengthening or policing professional practice?</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning lessons from other professions</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social work – ‘discussing cases’ or ‘anxious caseload management’</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The concept of ‘supervisor’ – confusion and ‘definition quagmire’</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Big sister is watching you’: supervision of midwives</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The two hats – contradictions in midwifery supervision</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenging midwifery supervision</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The nature and range of clinical supervision 91
‘Doing’ clinical supervision 93
  Individual supervision 94
  Group supervision 94
  Peer supervision 95

Frameworks for clinical supervision 96
The focus of clinical supervision 96
  Hunt’s three approaches to supervision 102
  Double Matrix Model 103
  Triadic model of supervision 104
  Six Category Intervention Analysis 105
  Cyclical Model of Counsellor Supervision 106
  Growth and Support Model 107
  Guided Reflection or ‘professional narcissism’ 108
  Interactive Model 109
  Nicklin’s six-stage supervision cycle 111
  Problem orientated supervision 112
A hybrid model of clinical supervision 112
Practical route to successful clinical supervision 115

Key points emerging 116

Chapter Five: ACTION RESEARCH: OPENING NEW DIALOGUES FOR ENQUIRY 118

The beginnings…action research in the making 119
Valuing process and outcomes 121
  Contextualising ‘real-world practice’ 122
Defining action research 122
The nature of reality 127
‘Learning is rooted in experience’ 129

Rejecting the search for truth 131
  Prescription and the imposition of control 132
  What about complex, messy clinical practice situations? 133

Naturalistic research: Subjectivity and shedding light on complex problems 134
  Whose knowledge…..whose practice counts? 135

Critical theory research: challenging politically constructed situations 136
Models…approaches…typologies…traditions? 140
  Cycles and steps as repressive and mechanical 142
  Struggling in the swampy lowlands 144
Accepting certainty and valuing uncertainty 145
Feminisms and action research 150
The living theory approach 151
  Mapping imagined frameworks’ onto clinical practice 152
  Putting values “up-front” 153

Active versus passive participation 157
Chapter Six: METHODS

Placing ‘the self’ at the centre of the inquiry
Shaping the research with social, political and critical insight
A story of myself (6.12.00)
Childhood lasts a lifetime

Phase One

Gaining access
Gatekeeping access
Old habits die hard
Silencing mechanisms at play
Recruitment to the study
Excluding ‘others’ from the research

Phases One, Two and Three

Interviews as complex, social interactions
The influence of reciprocity
Listening to midwives' voices
Listening to the voices of Susan, Sarah and Stella
Seeking spontaneous storytelling
The interviewer as a therapeutic resource
Is it necessary to draw a line in the sand?
Choosing the venue – feeling safer on your own patch
Coping with distractions and interruptions
Articulating 'unarticulated experience': helping each other out
The co-production of data within interviews

Phase Two

Hearing Joss’ voice

Focus groups as ‘natural social networks’
Interaction as synergism
Focus groups equate with ‘time-efficiency’
Silent voices…remaining an outsider
Focus groups as a forum for change
Facilitating focus groups
Observing interactions within focus groups

Issues of ethics and rigour
The appropriateness of reliability and validity in action research
Exercising professional imagination
Phase Three

Analysing the midwives’ accounts  206
‘Starting up terror’ – leaping into the unknown  207
The process of making sense  208
Facing myself….again  209

The principles of voice-centred relational methodology  210

First reading: focusing on the plot by losing my own plot  211
Second reading: being with midwives  212
Third reading: achieving a sense of balance in relationships  213
Fourth reading: some voices are louder than others  214
Fifth reading: expressing emotion through metaphors  215
Metaphors as a form of expression  216

Chapter Seven:  PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS
THE CHALLENGE OF CHANGE: CONFRONTING CRISIS AND PAIN  220

The roller coaster of constant change: onerous or exciting?  221
The tyranny of team midwifery: an unfair imposition.  223
Idealising past ways of working.  226
Coping with stress: feeling uptight, depressed and unable to go to work.  227
Habitual ways of working…collusive interaction and refusal to talk.  232
Bad care days…no time to listen and a fear of complex situations.  234
The rudderless ship…pulling differently and needing direction!  236
Pseudo-cohesion as a mask for unsupportive behaviour.  237
Ladylike saboteurs…‘flies in the ointment’ or ‘doing good by stealth’.  238
Self denigration as a learned response and a way to discount needs.  242
‘Shared’ or ‘clash’ of personal philosophies.  244
Generations of dinosaurs…the birth and death of oppressors.  245

Key points emerging  247

Chapter Eight:  PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS:
MIDWIVES AS ‘EMOTIONAL LABOURERS’  249

‘Framing’ the story…midwifery work as ‘performance’  251
Emotional labour  254
Longer client interactions = feeling ‘psychologically drained’  256
Burnout syndrome  256
‘Professional closeness’ or detachment  260

Relating to, and developing partnerships with women  262
‘Psyching one’s self up’ – a coping strategy  262
Self presentation; coping and performance  263
Being ‘their friend’; feeling safe and suffering pain  264
Emotional engagement: a source of energy or a stressor  266
Practical and intellectually challenging performances 268
Finite energy: running on empty 269
Down and worn out 271
Defining relationships: holding on to professional power 272
  Expecting nothing other than what is received 273
The organisational demands of the maternity service 278
  Protocolisation inhibiting the spontaneous performance of midwifery 278
Feeling overwhelmed by their relationships with each other 281
  Unequal workloads despite being ‘all the same’ 284
Increasing workloads 285
  ‘The cult of busyness’…self protection or avoiding too much work 285
  Differentiating between clients: rejection and acceptance 288
The need to be needed 289
Key points emerging 293

Chapter Nine: PHASE TWO - FOCUS GROUPS:
CLARIFYING SUPPORT NEEDS
AND PLANNING FOR CHANGE 294

Focus group one: A forum to reflect on support needs and change 294
  Observing group interaction 295
  Silent voices huddling together 296
Getting started…different forms of anxiety 297
  Keeping ‘team spirit’ alive…despite obvious differences 300
  Pussyfooting and ‘smoothing over’ as alternatives 302
  Conversational rituals…trying to restore balance 303
  Fear of exposing feelings…letting colleagues ‘see inside’ 304
Attempting to meet support needs 306
  Taking things further…new style of clinical support! 308
  Fear of a new hierarchy 310
  Celebrating midwifery versus use of a ‘black book’ 311
Key points emerging from focus group one 314

Dawn’s input following the first focus group 315

Focus group two: Working towards a supportive framework 317
  ‘Them’ and ‘us’ – pseudo-collusion as a defence mechanism 318
  ‘Punching lights out’: no power, anger and dissatisfaction 319
  ‘Jumping on board’ or resisting collaboration and responsibility 320
Managing change…or not…through the study findings 323
  Collaborating or colluding: yet another contradiction! 324
  Different ways of working really means ‘double visits’ 325
The way forward for the work team 328
Even researchers get hurt…‘emotional pebbles and potholes’ 329
Key points emerging from focus group two 330
Chapter Ten: PHASE THREE - FINAL INTERVIEWS

CHALLENGES AHEAD: DEVELOPING AN AWARENESS OF REALITY

An ‘opportunity’ or a ‘different space’
Cohesiveness as a means of keeping problems hidden
‘Pseudo-cohesions’ as a means of masking unsupportive behaviour
A challenge: time for reflection and possible change
Too great a challenge: no time and no support during turbulent change.
The need to feel safe: negotiating a safe environment
‘Contract setting’: working together towards a clinical supervision framework.

Making time for clinical supervision
Buying time: money makes midwives!
Time out to talk: spending valuable time
Time as a finite commodity…it costs money!
Time as a ‘sacrifice’: encroaching on others’ time
Taking time that is needed elsewhere

Group supervision: feeling safer in numbers
Feeling valued through equality and consistency
Imposing boundaries: limiting involvement or avoiding responsibility.
Feeling elitist: better to exclude than include
The dumping ground: a place for unloading distress
Help rejecting complainers: a means of expressing resentment or a reflection of reality
Different ways of acknowledging endings
The empty chair: avoidance behaviour or a call for help
Facing the challenge: presenting clinical material of concern
Towards a new understanding
Avoidance of issues
‘Pit-head time’ – an opportunity to discuss ‘casework moments’

Key points emerging

Chapter Eleven: CONCLUDING THOUGHTS….. AND BEYOND

The rhetorical challenge of midwifery
‘Cultures of conflict’
Insights into the performance of midwifery
Performances as bound by the clock
Insights into working relationships
Clinical supervision as an ‘unshackling process’ 398
Midwives who balance well 400
  Pseudo-cohesion as a defence mechanism 401
Struggles and contradictions within action research 401
The way forward 404
Implications for midwifery education and further research 405

Recommendations for midwifery practice 408
Recommendations for further research 411

REFERENCES 413

APPENDICES 443

1. Description of the midwives 443
2. Interview Schedule (preliminary interviews) 450
3. Interview Schedule (focus group 1) 451
4. Interview Schedule (focus group 2) 452
5. Interview Schedule (final interviews) 453
List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Four: Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1: Schools of psychotherapy or counselling as applied to clinical supervision</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2: Models of clinical supervision</td>
<td>99-100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Five: Action research: opening new dialogues for Enquiry</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 3: The position of the researcher</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Eight: Midwives as ‘emotional labourers’</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 4: Summary of the spectrum of ‘performances’ (as described in preliminary interviews)</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5: Midwives’ ways of emotional engagement in a bureaucratic context and their subsequent effects</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter One: Introduction</th>
<th>Chapter Four: Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’</th>
<th>Chapter Five: Action research: opening new dialogues for enquiry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1: Flow Chart signposting phases and progress of study</td>
<td>Figure 2: Hawkins &amp; Shohet’s Double Matrix Model of Supervision.</td>
<td>Figure 5: Different approaches to action research in critical theory paradigm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>81</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>113</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>116</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>