University of Huddersfield Repository

Deery, Ruth

Engaging with clinical supervision in a community midwifery setting: an action research study

Original Citation


This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/6913/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/
ENGAGING WITH CLINICAL SUPERVISION IN A COMMUNITY MIDWIFERY SETTING

AN ACTION RESEARCH STUDY

RUTH DEERY

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

WOMEN’S INFORMED CHILDBEARING & HEALTH RESEARCH GROUP
SCHOOL OF NURSING AND MIDWIFERY

THE UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD
UK

NOVEMBER 2003
ABSTRACT

The main aim of this research study was to explore midwives’ views and experiences of their support needs in clinical practice and then to identify how they would wish to receive such support. There was much literature to support the existence of stress and burnout in midwifery but no research that addressed ways of alleviating this. Further aims were to redress that imbalance by planning and facilitating a model of clinical supervision devised by the participating midwives.

The study took an action research approach that involved working with a group of eight National Health Service (NHS) community midwives in a collaborative, non-hierarchical and democratic way in order to achieve change. This accorded with a woman-centred approach to working with clients that was being encouraged within midwifery. The midwives were typical of many community-based midwives in the United Kingdom (UK) who were working in increasingly stressful, complex and changing environments.

Wider organisational and cultural issues are considered that affect working relationships. The nature of the way the midwives worked when they were offered and received support, and how they reacted and coped when their work team and work situation was threatened, was also explored.

Each midwife was interviewed twice; before and after the experience of clinical supervision. They also participated in two focus groups before clinical supervision. In-depth individual interviews lasted up to two hours, as did the focus groups. The interviews and the focus groups were taped, transcribed and then analysed using a relational voice-centred methodology.

The main findings were that recent and ongoing change plus the organisational demands placed on the midwives by the NHS and their managers were detrimental to working relationships with their colleagues and clients. This also inhibited the process of change. A discourse of denigration became apparent within the interviews and the midwives behaviour and coping strategies revealed some well developed defence mechanisms, as well as an apparent lack of understanding on their part and that of their midwifery managers in relation to emotion work. Resistance to change was a key defence mechanism used by the midwives.

Strong messages emerge about certain ‘performances’ being available to midwives and the use of defence mechanisms as a way of ‘getting the work done’. There are also messages about the cultural legacy of midwifery and how this can inhibit autonomous behaviour by midwives. Developing and increasing self awareness is still not viewed as being intrinsic to the work of the midwife and midwives are being asked to undertake a level of work that they have not been adequately prepared for. Neither do there appear to be effective role models for midwives. The bureaucratic pressures of working in a large maternity unit are also addressed where the system is seen as more important than the midwives.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many, many people who have unknowingly contributed to the successful completion of this study. I sincerely thank them all, but in particular I would like to take this opportunity to thank the following people.

My gratitude to my husband Patsy and my mother Teresa, who have provided endless support throughout the life of the study, is beyond words. They have been a tower of strength and encouragement for me as have my children, Nick, Laura and Emily who have ‘studied with me’. Nick became a Police Officer during the course of the study, Laura has taken her A levels and is preparing to go to University and Emily has taken her GCSEs…and they were only ‘babies’ when I started my research journey. My father Frank, who was very proud that I was studying for my doctorate died during the course of the research.

Professor Mavis Kirkham, as my research supervisor, has provided infinite support, constantly reinforcing my ability to undertake this research as well as write the thesis. She has inspired me, trusted me, been patient with me and above all, valued me and my contributions to midwifery. Her calming presence has helped me throughout this research journey.

I would like to thank Joss, Dawn, and all the midwives who participated in the study. Without their help and time this study would not have been possible. Joss and Dawn especially have helped me to think differently. I am also grateful to the midwifery managers for providing access to the participating midwives and the maternity unit.

Deborah Hughes has stayed with me every bit of the way on my research journey, reading endless drafts, often at short notice. She has listened patiently and helped to keep me grounded, as well as providing friendship and scholarly guidance for which I will always be grateful.

I also thank Christine Horrocks who joined me at the later stages of my research journey. Her encouragement, friendship and willingness to comment on drafts have been enormously helpful and motivating. She provided a certain ‘structure’ that was necessary for me at this crucial stage of my research journey.

The West Yorkshire Education and Training Consortium (now known as West Yorkshire Workforce Development Confederation) provided funding through a small grant. Without this funding the study might not have proceeded to completion. I am also grateful to the University of Huddersfield who provided funding for my studies at the University of Sheffield.
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter One: INTRODUCTION</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The need for the study</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aims of the study</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting the scene</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key theoretical issues</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feminist theory</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanistic psychology</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counselling theory</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Work theory</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychotherapeutic theory</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociological theory</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transforming the local maternity services</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glendale Work Team</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dawn's influence on my study</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joss' influence on my study</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The organisation of the thesis</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Two: VOICES AND ISSUES FROM PAST AND PRESENT MIDWIFERY</th>
<th>19</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The move from 'disordered' to 'ordered' practice</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achieving professional status or a means to control practice?</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominant doctors and 'disabled' midwives</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statutory compliance: 'supervising' or 'policing' midwifery work?</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medicalisation of childbirth</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who knows?</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The subjugation of midwifery knowledge</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invisible midwifery expertise and invisible women</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technological surveillance and intervention</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adapting to, and changing ways of working</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The effects of changing approaches to care</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The impact of changing work patterns on the midwifery workforce</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter Three: CHANGE, CULTURE, ‘CARING’ AND RELATIONSHIPS

Part 1: Culture and change in the NHS

The culture of midwifery in the NHS
The context of change in the NHS
  - Differing approaches to change
  - Sowing the seeds of change
Culture as a key influence on change
  - Midwives as obedient technicians
Change managing midwives
  - Detachment as a monitoring process
  - ‘Militating organisational imperatives’
Key points emerging

Part 2: The midwife-mother relationship

First relationship crucial to subsequent relationships
  - Providing a holding environment
  - Providing a secure base
  - Community-based work as a refuge
The slipperiness of care
  - …..makes caring complex
The balancing act
  - Staying connected despite differences
  - Reciprocity: mutual aims and aspirations
  - Mediating between ‘connectedness’ and ‘detachment’
  - Picking the right balance
  - Different levels of engagement
Women as ‘natural carers’
  - Midwives’ ‘composure work’ – a form of task orientated care
  - Identity work – attending to nurturance, growth and healing
  - Therapeutic midwifery: being a ‘skilled companion’
  - Midwives as ‘gravy’
  - The consequences of partnership…devolving power
Key points emerging

Chapter Four: CLINICAL SUPERVISION – A POTENTIAL SOURCE OF SUPPORT

Strengthening or policing professional practice?
Learning lessons from other professions
  - Social work – ‘discussing cases’ or ‘anxious caseload management’
  - The concept of ‘supervisor’ – confusion and ‘definition quagmire’
  - ‘Big sister is watching you’: supervision of midwives
  - The two hats – contradictions in midwifery supervision
  - Challenging midwifery supervision
The nature and range of clinical supervision 91
‘Doing’ clinical supervision 93
  Individual supervision 94
  Group supervision 94
  Peer supervision 95

Frameworks for clinical supervision 96
The focus of clinical supervision 96
  Hunt’s three approaches to supervision 102
  Double Matrix Model 103
  Triadic model of supervision 104
  Six Category Intervention Analysis 105
  Cyclical Model of Counsellor Supervision 106
  Growth and Support Model 107
  Guided Reflection or ‘professional narcissism’ 108
  Interactive Model 109
  Nicklin’s six-stage supervision cycle 111
  Problem orientated supervision 112
  A hybrid model of clinical supervision 112
  Practical route to successful clinical supervision 115

Key points emerging 116

Chapter Five: ACTION RESEARCH: OPENING NEW DIALOGUES FOR ENQUIRY 118

The beginnings…action research in the making 119
Valuing process and outcomes 121
  Contextualising ‘real-world practice’ 122
Defining action research 122
The nature of reality 127
‘Learning is rooted in experience’ 129

Rejecting the search for truth 131
  Prescription and the imposition of control 132
  What about complex, messy clinical practice situations? 133

Naturalistic research: Subjectivity and shedding light on complex problems 134
  Whose knowledge…..whose practice counts? 135

Critical theory research: challenging politically constructed situations 136
Models…approaches…typologies…traditions? 140
  Cycles and steps as repressive and mechanical 142
  Struggling in the swampy lowlands 144
Accepting certainty and valuing uncertainty 145
Feminisms and action research 150
The living theory approach 151
  Mapping imagined frameworks’ onto clinical practice 152
  Putting values “up-front” 153

Active versus passive participation 157
Research ‘with’ rather than ‘on’: a conjoint experience 159  
The balance of power… 160  
Becoming a political entrepreneur! 161  
Blurred boundaries – dealing with political behaviour 163  

Key points emerging 165

**Chapter Six: METHODS** 167

Placing ‘the self’ at the centre of the inquiry 167  
Shaping the research with social, political and critical insight 167  
A story of myself (6.12.00) 169  
Childhood lasts a lifetime 169

**Phase One** 174  
Gaining access 174  
Gatekeeping access 174  
Old habits die hard 175  
Silencing mechanisms at play 176  
Recruitment to the study 177  
Excluding ‘others’ from the research 178

**Phases One, Two and Three** 179  
Interviews as complex, social interactions 179  
The influence of reciprocity 181  
Listening to midwives’ voices 182  
Listening to the voices of Susan, Sarah and Stella 183  
Seeking spontaneous storytelling 184  
The interviewer as a therapeutic resource 185  
Is it necessary to draw a line in the sand? 186  
Choosing the venue – feeling safer on your own patch 187  
Coping with distractions and interruptions 188  
Articulating ‘unarticulated experience’: helping each other out 189  
The co-production of data within interviews 191

**Phase Two** 192  
Hearing Joss’ voice 192  
Focus groups as ‘natural social networks’ 193  
Interaction as synergism 193  
Focus groups equate with ‘time-efficiency’ 195  
Silent voices…remaining an outsider 196  
Focus groups as a forum for change 197  
Facilitating focus groups 197  
Observing interactions within focus groups 198

Issues of ethics and rigour 199  
The appropriateness of reliability and validity in action research 202  
Exercising professional imagination 203
Phase Three

Analysing the midwives’ accounts 206

‘Starting up terror’ – leaping into the unknown 207
The process of making sense 208
Facing myself….again 209

The principles of voice-centred relational methodology 210

First reading: focusing on the plot by losing my own plot 211
Second reading: being with midwives 212
Third reading: achieving a sense of balance in relationships 213
Fourth reading: some voices are louder than others 214
Fifth reading: expressing emotion through metaphors 215
Metaphors as a form of expression 216

Chapter Seven:  PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS
THE CHALLENGE OF CHANGE: CONFRONTING CRISIS AND PAIN 220

The roller coaster of constant change: onerous or exciting? 221
The tyranny of team midwifery: an unfair imposition. 223
Idealising past ways of working. 226
Coping with stress: feeling uptight, depressed and unable to go to work. 227
Habitual ways of working…collusive interaction and refusal to talk. 232
Bad care days…no time to listen and a fear of complex situations. 234
The rudderless ship…pulling differently and needing direction! 236
Pseudo-cohesion as a mask for unsupportive behaviour. 237
Ladylike saboteurs…‘flies in the ointment’ or ‘doing good by stealth’. 238
Self denigration as a learned response and a way to discount needs. 242
‘Shared’ or ‘clash’ of personal philosophies. 244
Generations of dinosaurs…the birth and death of oppressors. 245

Key points emerging 247

Chapter Eight:  PHASE ONE - PRELIMINARY INTERVIEWS:
MIDWIVES AS ‘EMOTIONAL LABOURERS’ 249

‘Framing’ the story…midwifery work as ‘performance’ 251
Emotional labour 254
Longer client interactions = feeling ‘psychologically drained’ 256
Burnout syndrome 256
‘Professional closeness’ or detachment 260

Relating to, and developing partnerships with women 262
‘Psyching one’s self up’ – a coping strategy 262
Self presentation; coping and performance 263
Being ‘their friend’; feeling safe and suffering pain 264
Emotional engagement: a source of energy or a stressor 266
Practical and intellectually challenging performances  268
Finite energy: running on empty  269
Down and worn out  271
Defining relationships: holding on to professional power  272
Expecting nothing other than what is received  273
The organisational demands of the maternity service  278
Protocolisation inhibiting the spontaneous performance of midwifery  278
Feeling overwhelmed by their relationships with each other  281
Unequal workloads despite being ‘all the same’  284
Increasing workloads  285
‘The cult of busyness’...self protection or avoiding too much work  285
Differentiating between clients: rejection and acceptance  288
The need to be needed  289
Key points emerging  293

Chapter Nine: PHASE TWO - FOCUS GROUPS: CLARIFYING SUPPORT NEEDS AND PLANNING FOR CHANGE  294

Focus group one: A forum to reflect on support needs and change  294
Observing group interaction  295
Silent voices huddling together  296
Getting started...different forms of anxiety  297
Keeping ‘team spirit’ alive...despite obvious differences  300
Pussyfooting and ‘smoothing over’ as alternatives  302
Conversational rituals...trying to restore balance  303
Fear of exposing feelings...letting colleagues ‘see inside’  304
Attempting to meet support needs  306
Taking things further...new style of clinical support!  308
Fear of a new hierarchy  310
Celebrating midwifery versus use of a ‘black book’  311

Key points emerging from focus group one  314

Dawn’s input following the first focus group  315

Focus group two: Working towards a supportive framework  317
‘Them’ and ‘us’ – pseudo-collusion as a defence mechanism  318
‘Punching lights out’: no power, anger and dissatisfaction  319
‘Jumping on board’ or resisting collaboration and responsibility  320
Managing change...or not...through the study findings  323
Collaborating or colluding: yet another contradiction!  324
Different ways of working really means ‘double visits’  325
The way forward for the work team  328
Even researchers get hurt....‘emotional pebbles and potholes’  329

Key points emerging from focus group two  330
Chapter Ten: PHASE THREE - FINAL INTERVIEWS

CHALLENGES AHEAD: DEVELOPING AN AWARENESS OF REALITY

An ‘opportunity’ or a ‘different space’
Cohesiveness as a means of keeping problems hidden
‘Pseudo-cohesion’ as a means of masking unsupportive behaviour
A challenge: time for reflection and possible change
Too great a challenge: no time and no support during turbulent change.
The need to feel safe: negotiating a safe environment
‘Contract setting’: working together towards a clinical supervision framework.

Making time for clinical supervision
Buying time: money makes midwives!
Time out to talk: spending valuable time
Time as a finite commodity…it costs money!
Time as a ‘sacrifice’: encroaching on others’ time
Taking time that is needed elsewhere

Group supervision: feeling safer in numbers
Feeling valued through equality and consistency
Imposing boundaries: limiting involvement or avoiding responsibility.
Feeling elitist: better to exclude than include
The dumping ground: a place for unloading distress
Help rejecting complainers: a means of expressing resentment or a reflection of reality
Different ways of acknowledging endings
The empty chair: avoidance behaviour or a call for help
Facing the challenge: presenting clinical material of concern
Towards a new understanding
Avoidance of issues
‘Pit-head time’ – an opportunity to discuss ‘casework moments’

Key points emerging

Chapter Eleven: CONCLUDING THOUGHTS..... AND BEYOND

The rhetorical challenge of midwifery
‘Cultures of conflict’
Insights into the performance of midwifery
Performances as bound by the clock
Insights into working relationships
Clinical supervision as an ‘unshackling process’ 398
Midwives who balance well 400
  Pseudo-cohesion as a defence mechanism 401
Struggles and contradictions within action research 401
The way forward 404
Implications for midwifery education and further research 405

Recommendations for midwifery practice 408
Recommendations for further research 411

REFERENCES 413

APPENDICES 443

1. Description of the midwives 443
2. Interview Schedule (preliminary interviews) 450
3. Interview Schedule (focus group 1) 451
4. Interview Schedule (focus group 2) 452
5. Interview Schedule (final interviews) 453
## List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Four:</th>
<th>Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1:</td>
<td>Schools of psychotherapy or counselling as applied to clinical supervision</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2:</td>
<td>Models of clinical supervision</td>
<td>99-100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Chapter Five:          | Action research: opening new dialogues for Enquiry | 118 |
| Table 3:               | The position of the researcher                    | 162 |

| Chapter Eight:         | Midwives as ‘emotional labourers’                  | 249 |
| Table 4:               | Summary of the spectrum of ‘performances’ (as described in preliminary interviews) | 253 |
| Table 5:               | Midwives’ ways of emotional engagement in a bureaucratic context and their subsequent effects | 292 |
# List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter One:</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1:</td>
<td>Flow Chart signposting phases and progress of study</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Four:</th>
<th>Clinical Supervision – an ‘unshackling process’</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2:</td>
<td>Hawkins &amp; Shohet’s Double Matrix Model of Supervision.</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3:</td>
<td>Hybrid Model of Clinical Supervision.</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4:</td>
<td>The route to successful and effective clinical supervision.</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Five:</th>
<th>Action research: opening new dialogues for enquiry</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5:</td>
<td>Different approaches to action research in critical theory paradigm.</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>