University of Huddersfield Repository

Ceriaco, Luis M. P., Gutierrez, Eliecer E., Dubois, Alain and Carr, Martin

Photography-based taxonomy is inadequate, unnecessary, and potentially harmful for biological sciences

Original Citation

Ceriaco, Luis M. P., Gutierrez, Eliecer E., Dubois, Alain and Carr, Martin (2016) Photography-based taxonomy is inadequate, unnecessary, and potentially harmful for biological sciences. Zootaxa, 4196 (3). pp. 435-445. ISSN 1175-5326

This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/31403/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/
Photography-based taxonomy is inadequate, unnecessary, and potentially harmful for biological sciences

LUÍS M. P. CERÍACO1,2*, ELIÉCER E. GUTIÉRREZ3,4, ALAIN DUBOIS5
et al. (see Appendix for the full list of supporting signatories)
1 Department of Biology, Villanova University, Villanova, United States of America.
2 Museu Nacional de História Natural e da Ciência, Lisboa, Portugal.
3 Departamento de Zoologia, Instituto de Ciências Biológicas, Universidade de Brasília, CEP 70910-900, Brasilia, DF, Brazil.
4 National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian Institution, Washington DC, United States of America.
5 ISYEB, Muséum national d’Histoire naturelle, Sorbonne Universités, Paris, France.
*corresponding author: luisceriaco@gmail.com

Note
The question whether taxonomic descriptions naming new animal species without type specimen(s) deposited in collections should be accepted for publication by scientific journals and allowed by the Code has already been discussed in Zootaxa (Dubois & Nemésio 2007; Donegan 2008, 2009; Nemésio 2009a–b; Dubois 2009; Gentile & Snell 2009; Minelli 2009; Cianferoni & Bartolozzi 2016; Amorim et al. 2016). This question was again raised in a letter supported by 35 signatories published in the journal Nature (Pape et al. 2016) on 15 September 2016. On 25 September 2016, the following rebuttal (strictly limited to 300 words as per the editorial rules of Nature) was submitted to Nature, which on 18 October 2016 refused to publish it. As we think this problem is a very important one for zoological taxonomy, this text is published here exactly as submitted to Nature, followed by the list of the 493 taxonomists and collection-based researchers who signed it in the short time span from 20 September to 6 October 2016.

Correspondence
In defense of a species description without preserved specimens, a few colleagues recently provided arguments that could lead to widespread use of photography-based taxonomy (PBT) (Pape et al. 2016). We 493 collection-based researchers refute these arguments.

The main purpose of the Code’s Article 73.1.4—which tolerates the naming of species described based on illustrations—is to allow the nomenclatural availability of species names established without reference specimens before the maturity of taxonomy. However, modern descriptions shouldn’t be done without material evidence through at least one museum ‘type’ specimen, carrying many characters that cannot be seen on photographs and enabling objectivity, replicability and refutability.

Species delimitation is a matter of taxonomy, not of nomenclature, but taxonomic work requires such a specimen to make an objective link between a name and a natural population, without which the allocation of the name remains uncertain.

Alleged species known only from photographs can be referred to by non-scientific names until the collection of a specimen enables acceptable taxonomic descriptions.

Peer-review, which is not required by the Code, may indeed be useful for taxonomic works if carried out by competent referees, but it has repeatedly proved insufficient to prevent flawed descriptions. PBT will promote rapid dissemination of poorly reviewed descriptions based on unverifiable “evidence”.

PBT is detrimental for fields of biology that depend on taxonomy: impeding approval of permits to collect—a strong nuisance for taxonomy; harming the credibility of and obstructing advances in taxonomy, as untrained/unscrupulous persons can easily flood life “catalogues” with dubious taxa; increasing instability and inaccuracy, as scrutiny is hindered by the lack of specimens.

The Code must be reformed to prevent that Articles designed to deal with contributions from the early ages of taxonomy are used to justify outdated practices that can harm science and biodiversity conservation.
References


APPENDIX

Full list of and affiliations of supporting signatories

Cristian Simón Abdala Universidad Nacional de Tucumán, Tucumán, Argentina.
Abdulaziz S. Alqarni King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia.
Kraig Adler Cornell University, Ithaca, USA.
Edson A. Adriano Federal University of São Paulo, Diadema, Brazil.
Erna Aescht Biology Centre of the Upper Austrian Museum, Linz, Austria.
Ishan Agarwal Villanova University, Villanova, USA.
Sabine Agatha Universität Salzburg, Salzburg, Austria.
Donat Agosti Plazi, Bern, Switzerland.
Antonio J. C. Aguiar Universidade de Brasilia, Brasilia, Brazil.
Jonas José Mendes Aguiar Universidade de São Paulo, Ribeirão Preto, Brazil.
Dirk Ahrens Zoologisches Forschungsmuseum A. Koenig, Bonn, Germany.
Alexandre Aleixo Museu Paraense Emílio Goeldi, Belém, Brazil.
Maria Judite Alves Museu Nacional de História Natural e da Ciência, Lisboa, Portugal.
Fabio Raposo do Amaral Universidade Federal de São Paulo, Diadema, Brazil.
Natalia Ananjeva Russian Academy of Sciences, St.Petersburg, Russia.
Marcelo C. Andrade Universidade Federal do Pará, Belém, Brazil.
Marco Brandalise de Andrade Pontificia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, Brazil.
Franco Andreone Museo Regionale di Scienze Naturali, Turin, Italy.
Pedro P. U. Aquino Universidade de Brasilia, Brasilia, Brazil.
Paula Beatriz Araujo Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, Brazil.
Henrard Arnaud Royal Museum for Central Africa, Tervuren, Belgium.
Jairo Arroyave Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Ciudad de México, Mexico.
Wolfgang Arthofer Institute of Ecology, University of Innsbruck, Innsbruck, Austria.
Tom J. Artois Hasselt University, Hasselt, Belgium.
Marcelo Duarte  Museu de Zoologia da Universidade de São Paulo, São Paulo, Brazil.
Marie-Claude Durette-Desset  ISYEB, Muséum national d’Histoire naturelle, Sorbonne Universités, Paris, France.
François Dusoulier  Muséum départemental d’Histoire naturelle du Var, Toulon, France.
Sushil Kumar Dutta  Nature Environment & Wildlife Society, Angul, India.
Michael S. Engel  University of Kansas, Lawrence, USA.
Mark Epstein  Ewing, USA.
Moisés Escalona  Pontificia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, Brazil.
Jacob A. Esselstyn  Museum of Natural Science, Louisiana State University, Baton Rouge, USA.
Koshiro Eto  Kyoto University, Kyoto, Japan.
Rafaela Lopes Falaschi  Museu de Zoologia da Universidade de São Paulo, São Paulo, Brazil.
Zachary H. Falin  University of Kansas, Lawrence, USA.
Eduardo I. Faundez  North Dakota State University, Fargo, USA.
Anderson Feijó  Universidade Federal da Paraíba, João Pessoa, Brazil.
Rodrigo M. Feiota  Universidade Federal do Paraná, Curitiba, Brazil.
Daniel Silva Fernandes  Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil.
Martin Fikáček  Natural History Museum - Národiní Museum, Prague, Czech Republic.
Brian L. Fisher  California Academy of Sciences, San Francisco, USA.
Moira J. FitzPatrick  Natural History Museum of Zimbabwe, Bulawayo, Zimbabwe.
Dimitri Forero  Pontificia Universidad Javeriana, Bogota, Colombia.
Ismael Franz  Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, Brazil.
Hendrik Freitag  Ateneo de Manila University, Quezon City, Philippines.
Thierry Frétey  RACINE, Saint-Maugen, France.
Uwe Fritz  Senckenberg Naturhistorische Sammlungen, Dresden, Germany.
Cyril Gallut  ISYEB, Université Pierre et Marie Curie, Sorbonne Universités Paris, France.
Shan Gao  Ocean University of China, Qingdao, China.
Guilherme S. T. Garbino  Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Brazil.
Luis García-Prieto  Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Ciudad de México, Mexico.
Franger J. García  Universidad de Carabobo, Valencia, Venezuela.
Paulo C. A. Garcia  Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Brazil.
Alfred L. Gardner  United States Geological Survey, Washington DC, USA.
Scott Lyell Gardner  University of Nebraska, Lincoln, USA.
Romain Garrouste  ISYEB, Muséum national d’Histoire naturelle, Sorbonne Universités, Paris, France.
Matthias F. Geiger  Zoologisches Forschungsmuseum A. Koenig, Bonn, Germany.
Thomas C. Giarla  Siena College, Loudonville, USA.
Varad Giri  National Centre for Biological Sciences, Bengaluru, India.
Matthias Glaubrecht  CENAK-Centrum für Naturkunde, Hamburg, Germany.
Robert C. Glotzhober  Ohio History Connection, Columbus, Ohio, USA.
Fabio S. P. Godoi  Universidade Federal do Amazonas, Manaus, Brazil.
Serge Gofas  Universidad de Málaga, Málaga, Spain.
Pablo R. Gonçalves  Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, Macaé, Brazil.
Jun Gong  Chinese Academy of Sciences, Shandong, China.
Víctor H. Gonzalez  University of Kansas, Lawrence, USA.
José Antonio González-Oreja  Benemérita Universidad Autónoma de Puebla, Puebla, México.
Edmundo González-Santillán  Center for Research and Advanced Studies of the National Polytechnic Institute, Irapuato, Mexico.
Enrique González-Soriano  Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Ciudad de México, Mexico.
Steven M. Goodman  Field Museum of Natural History, Chicago USA.
Philippe Grandcolas  ISYEB, Muséum national d’Histoire naturelle, Sorbonne Universités, Paris, France.
Lance Grande  Field Museum of Natural History, Chicago USA.
Eli Greenbaum  University of Texas at El Paso, El Paso USA.
Renato Gregorin  Universidade Federal de Lavras, Lavras, Brazil.