



# University of HUDDERSFIELD

## University of Huddersfield Repository

Etheridge, Stephen

'Slate-Grey Rain and Polished Euphoniums': Southern Pennine Brass Bands, the Working Class and the North, c. 1840-1914

### Original Citation

Etheridge, Stephen (2014) 'Slate-Grey Rain and Polished Euphoniums': Southern Pennine Brass Bands, the Working Class and the North, c. 1840-1914. Doctoral thesis, University of Huddersfield.

This version is available at <http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/24607/>

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: [E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk](mailto:E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk).

<http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/>

# **‘Slate-Grey Rain and Polished Euphoniums’**



Southern Pennine Brass Bands, the Working Class and the  
North c. 1840-1914

**STEPHEN ETHERIDGE**

A thesis submitted to the University of Huddersfield in partial  
fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of  
Philosophy

**University of Huddersfield**

**July 2014**

## **Copyright Statement:**

- i. The author of this thesis (including any appendices and/or schedules to this thesis) owns any copyright in it (the “Copyright”) and s/he has given The University of Huddersfield the right to use such Copyright for any administrative, promotional, educational and/or teaching purposes.
- ii. Copies of this thesis, either in full or in extracts, may be made only in accordance with the regulations of the University Library. Details of these regulations may be obtained from the Librarian. This page must form part of any such copies made.
- iii. The ownership of any patents, designs, trademarks and any and all other intellectual property rights except for the Copyright (the “Intellectual Property Rights”) and any reproductions of copyright works, for example graphs and tables (“Reproductions”), which may be described in this thesis, may not be owned by the author and may be owned by third parties. Such Intellectual Property Rights and Reproductions cannot and must not be made available for use without the prior written permission of the owner(s) of the relevant Intellectual Property Rights and/or Reproductions.

## **Permissions:**

Written permissions have been obtained for all images that are not from the author’s collection.

## Abstract:

Brass Bands have become a clichéd representation of northern working-class culture. Hence, in 1974, Peter Hennessy described a band contest at the Albert Hall:

A roll call of the bands is like an evocation of industrial history. From Wingates Temperance and Black Dyke Mills to more modern conglomerates [...]. Grown men, old bandsmen say, have been known to cry at the beauty of it all [...]. Of all the manifestations of working-class culture, nothing is more certain than a brass band to bring on an attack of the George Orwells. Even the most hardened bourgeois cannot resist romanticizing the proletariat a little when faced with one.<sup>1</sup>

This stereotype, which emerged in the nineteenth century, generated the following research questions: What musical and social elements in the performance of brass band music strengthened working-class cultural identity in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries? How did bands, which thrived in large numbers in the Southern Pennines, emerge as a musical and cultural metonym of the industrial landscape?

This thesis therefore examines internal and external reporting of elements of brass musicianship in brass bands that constructed working class and northern identities. An outline of music-making in the north shows how the region supported bands' development when they began to emerge from the 1830s. Brass musicianship and musical performance strengthened working-class cultural identity. Explorations of musical performances, leisure, rational recreation, social networks, gender and region, all combine to produce a fuller understanding of the northern working class between c.1840 and 1914. Such influences – of class, gender and region – contributed to brass bands producing primary examples of working-class identity. Not only have brass bands been under-explored in the history of leisure, but they also add to the understanding of the origins of stereotypes about working-class culture and northern identity that emerged, and came under scrutiny, in this period.

---

<sup>1</sup> *The Times* (11 October, 1974).

# Contents:

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	Page 4
<b>List of Illustrations</b>	Page 5
<b>List of Tables</b>	Page 6
<b>Introduction</b>	Page 7
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
Music-Making in the North of England: An Overview of the Creation of a Musical Region	Page 40
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
Working-Class Cultural Identity and Musical Performance: The Southern Pennine Brass Band and the Invention of Musical Traditions	Page 65
<b>Chapter 3</b>	
The Professionalisation of the Brass Band Movement, 1880 to 1914: The influence of the Triumvirate of John Gladney (1839-1911), Alexander Owen (1851-1920) and Edwin Swift (1843-1904)	Page 116
<b>Chapter 4</b>	
Brass Bands in the Southern Pennines, 1857-1914: Rational Recreation and Perceptions of Working-Class Respectability	Page 161
<b>Chapter 5</b>	
Music as a Lifelong Pursuit for Bandsmen in the Southern Pennines: Brass Bands and Working-Class Masculinity	Page 226
<b>Chapter 6</b>	
'Where the Brass Band is Beloved': Representations of Brass Band Contests, Bands and Bandsmen in the Press, 1859-1914	Page 257
<b>Chapter 7</b>	
The Brass Band and Perceptions of the North: Musical Constructions of Space, Place and Region	Page 287
<b>Conclusions</b>	Page 317
<b>Tables</b>	Page 331
<b>Bibliography</b>	Page 333
<b>Word Count: 104,905</b>	

## Acknowledgements:

I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr Lisa Colton and Professor Paul Ward, for invaluable support throughout the course of the thesis. They both offered expert guidance and recommendations that helped me bring clarity to my ideas about brass bands as an expression of leisure, class and region. In addition, I would also like to thank Dr Paul Atkinson for his excellent input when Dr Colton was on extended leave.

This research would not have been possible without the financial support of my employer, United Technologies Corporation, who provided a generous Employee Scholarship Programme, throughout my master's degree and PhD, without expectation or demands. It was indeed a philanthropic gesture that has changed my life for the better.

During the course of my research many archival staff went out of their way to find obscure material about brass bands for me. In particular, I would like to thank the staff of Rawtenstall Local Studies Library and Accrington Local Studies Library who helped me track down significant amounts of material. Brass bands are still very active in the Southern Pennines and I would like to thank all the members of Todmorden Community Brass Band for giving me a corner to sit in and examine their precious minute books and financial records on practice nights.

Finally, I would like to thank my partner, Ruth Seddon, for her unflagging support and encouragement throughout the course of this research, and her willingness to drive me to obscure graveyards in the search for just one more bandsman's headstone.

## List of Illustrations:

### Figure 1.

Late eighteenth-century map of Southern Pennine Packhorse Trails: based on Yates's *Map of the County Palatine of Lancaster* (1786) and Jeffery's *Map of the County of Yorkshire* (1775). Source, <<http://www.spptt.org.uk/about-us/ancient-highways-in-the-south-pennines/>> accessed, 1 May, 2011. Permission Received from Sue Hogg, of the Southern Pennine Packhorse Trails' Trust, 1984.

Page 11.

### Figure 2.

The *Cornet Calendar*, 1901. From the author's own collection.

Page 156.

**Figure 3.** Advertisement for uniforms, and other brass band ephemera, *British Bandsman* (4 April, 1903), p. 88. From the author's own collection.

Page 238.

# Tables

- 1) A List of Gladney, Swift and Owen's arrangements, from brass band concert programmes, from the Greenhead Park Concerts in Huddersfield, 1903-1910.



# Introduction

The brass band has become a cliché in the representation of northern working-class culture. Dave Russell considers that, ‘the brass band represents one of the most remarkable working-class cultural achievements in European history.’<sup>1</sup> This was a bold statement, yet it was the boldness of this statement that led to the research questions in this thesis. If the brass band does indeed represent one of the most remarkable working-class cultural achievements in European history, how was that achieved and what did it mean for the communities, such as the Southern Pennines, where brass bands thrived? The central questions this thesis addresses are: what musical and social elements in the performance of brass band music strengthened working-class cultural identity in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries? Within this working-class culture Southern Pennine brass bands emerged as a metonym of the northern industrial landscape, how did this happen? Inside the structure of these larger questions are more nuanced elements relating to working class and northern identity. How did bandsmen take musical performance and create their own identifiable culture? How did brass bands interact, negotiate and compromise with the industrialists and sponsoring communities who gave them finance, so that they could afford instruments to play, and how did this finance affect the cultural identity of brass bands? Finally, the bands relied on extended social networks for support, how did these networks influence the way bandsmen were perceived as working men?

---

<sup>1</sup> Dave Russell, *Popular Music in England 1840-1914: A Social History* (Manchester, 1987, this edition 1991), p. 205.

Examining Southern Pennine brass bands will add to the explanation of the origins of significant stereotypes of working-class culture that emerged between 1840 and 1914.

One thing is certain: the brass band was a popular national leisure pursuit. As Russell highlights, the exact number of bands will never be known and estimates in the period varied widely.<sup>2</sup> In spite of this it is undeniable that the band movement was visible and active in this period. The *British Bandsman and Contest Field's* (hereafter the *British Bandsman*).<sup>3</sup> Easter Contest listing from 1903 is indicative of the high amount of national brass band activity.<sup>4</sup> Yet despite the national nature of the brass band movement and in particular activity in the industrial areas of Cornwall, Scotland and Wales, Ruth Finnigan rightly maintains that researchers viewed any density of brass bands outside the north as a surprise.<sup>5</sup> Within the north there were a significant number of bands concentrated in the Southern Pennines. This was where the brass band movement had its home. In 1914, the *British Bandsman* reflected that, 'it could not be denied that the cradle of the brass band was on the slopes of the Pennine Chain.'<sup>6</sup>

---

2 Russell, *Popular Music in England*, p. 205.

3 The *British Bandsman* was first published in 1887, and had a number of titles. For clarity, throughout this thesis, it is called *British Bandsman*. The titles were: *British Bandsman* (September 1887 to May 1888) *British Bandsman and Orchestral Times* (June 1888 to December 1890), *Orchestral Times and Bandsman* (January 1891 to December 1892), *British Musician* (January to December 1893), *British Musician and Orchestral Times* (January 1894 to December 1898) and *British Bandsman* (January 1899 to the present).

4 *British Bandsman* (18 April, 1903), pp. 124-127. Contests were held, for example, at: Mountain Ash, Carlisle, Abergavenny, Compstall, Stourbridge, Senghenydd, Barnet, Wigan, Rugby, Lewisham, Colne, South Hetton, Elsecar, Ilkley, Lindley, Pwllheheli and Rotherham.

5 Ruth Finnigan, *The Hidden Musicians: Music-making in An English Town* (Cambridge, 1989), p. 47.

6 *British Bandsman* (18 April, 1914), p. 349.

## The Southern Pennines: A Dense Network of Brass Bands

Influential historians have turned to the Southern Pennines to examine working-class lives in the 'classic' period of class formation. In 1968, Eric Hobsbawm argued, when writing about Manchester, that 'whoever says industrial revolution says cotton.'<sup>7</sup> E. P. Thompson's classic, *The Making of the Working Class* (London, 1969) was coloured by archival work from the West Riding of Yorkshire. Patrick Joyce was emphatic that 'the manufacturing districts of Lancashire and the West Riding of Yorkshire were the cradle of factory production, and it [was] to them that posterity [...] looked in seeking to discern the nature of the class structure to which the new system of manufacture gave rise.'<sup>8</sup> Therefore, it is valid to view the density of brass bands in the area as a way of defining aspects of working-class leisure and cultural activity that depended on, interacted with and influenced other activities within the industrial settlements of the Southern Pennines.

Furthermore the years 1870-1914 are of fundamental importance in any study of recreation and leisure. These years saw the fruition of previous trends and the emergence of a fully-formed working-class style of leisure. This period witnessed the evolution of small public houses into fully-fledged music halls, the professionalisation of sports, the emergence of the seaside holiday, and the growth of cinema.<sup>9</sup> In short, this era was the birth of the classic working-class leisure experience that embraced working-class attitudes and experiences.

---

<sup>7</sup> Eric J. Hobsbawm, *Industry and Empire From 1750 to the Present Day* (London, 1968, this edition, updated with Chris Wrigley, 1999), p. 34.

<sup>8</sup> Patrick Joyce, *Work, Society and Politics: The Culture of the Factory in Later Victorian England* (Brighton, 1980, this edition, London, 1982), p. xiii.

<sup>9</sup> Martin Childs, *Labour's Apprentices: Working-Class Lads in Late Victorian and Edwardian England* (Belfast, 1992), p. 143.

Therefore, an understanding of bandsmen, bands and the social networks that supported them adds to the understanding of a period when both men and women were taking part in pastimes that started to define working-class cultural identity after the mid-nineteenth century.<sup>10</sup> Indeed, the brass band becomes a site to explore working-class life from the 1840s onwards.

In 1903, the band commentator 'Shoddythorpe' estimated that there were at least two-hundred and fifty bands in West Yorkshire alone.<sup>11</sup> On the Southern Pennines' Lancashire side the brass band historian Arthur Taylor illustrated the density of brass bands in this period by saying the whole area of Saddleworth 'could almost be designated a national park for brass bands, with Dobcross as the centrepiece.'<sup>12</sup> Moreover, the concentration of bands in the Southern Pennines was outside the main metropolitan areas. They could be found residing on the fringes of cities: Besses o' th' Barn outside Manchester, and Leeds Forge Band, at Kirkstall, on the outskirts of Leeds, for example. There were few dedicated 'city' bands.<sup>13</sup> Brass bands thrived in smaller manufacturing towns in northern valleys. Writing in 1903, the correspondent 'Yorkshireite' highlighted this in the brass band periodical, the *Cornet*:

It seems strange, though nevertheless true, that the best bands are not to be found in the large towns. Look, for instance, at Leeds and Bradford, where they have such a lot of bands and where one would think that the most popular bands would draw the best players from the other bands and thus build up a crack band.<sup>14</sup>

---

10 See Eric Hobsbawm, 'The Making of the Working Class, 1870-1914', in Eric Hobsbawm, *Uncommon People: Resistance, Rebellion and Jazz* (London, 1998, this edition, 1999), pp. 78-99.

11 *British Bandsman*, XVI/64 (23 May, 1903), p. 264.

12 Arthur R. Taylor, *Brass Bands* (St Albans and London, 1979), p. 211.

13 Bradford City Band and Leeds Model Band are the exceptions.

14 *Cornet* (14 March, 1903), p. 4. When 'Yorkshireite' referred to the lots of bands in Leeds and Bradford he was referring to the bands that were close to the city such as Horsforth, Rawdon and Shipley, for example.)



Figure 1. Late eighteenth-century map of Southern Pennine Packhorse Trails: based on Yates's *Map of the County Palatine of Lancaster* (1786) and Jeffery's *Map of the County of Yorkshire* (1775). Source, <<http://www.spptt.org.uk/about-us/ancient-highways-in-the-south-pennines/>> accessed, 1 May, 2011.

As a geographical area the Southern Pennines is small, and the eighteenth-century packhorse trails give an impression of the immediacy of the area and how close a large number of bands were to each other. Bands, in other words, were within walking distance of each other in the industrial centres (see fig. 1). The region extended to Bradford in the east, Wigan in the west and Oldham and Manchester in the south, nevertheless the majority of bands came from the area shown. The area lies between the great conurbations of Lancashire and Greater Manchester and West Yorkshire. The Southern Pennines are a large-scale sweeping landscape of exposed upland moorland and pasture, divided by deep valleys. The area shared many characteristics with other upland areas, such as the Bowland Fells and Dark Peak, but industrialisation and a large population removed the sense of unspoilt wilderness that distinguished other regions. It was the proximity of the population to the surrounding uplands that was a distinctive feature of the area, and it was this closeness to the hills that influenced the nation's perception of the northern working-class bandsman. Throughout the period of industrialisation, from the late eighteenth century onwards, the landscape of the area underwent transformation. Villages, enclosures, commons, packhorse trails and canals were built upon on a still discernible prehistoric past. During the early years of industrialisation, from the early to late eighteenth-century, access to the area was poor, and, as the map shows, there were little more than packhorse trails traversing the moorland tops.<sup>15</sup>

---

15 Natural England, *Natural England-36 Southern Pennines Profile*, <[www.naturalengland.org.uk/publication/nca/southern\\_pennines.aspx](http://www.naturalengland.org.uk/publication/nca/southern_pennines.aspx)>, accessed, 18 January, 2011, pp.105-108.

The land was marginal for crop growing, and agriculture based on sheep and cattle has always been important in the area. With the building of Victorian reservoirs significant farming populations were displaced and agricultural workers were attracted to factory work in the valleys. Cotton weaving in Lancashire and wool weaving in Yorkshire were the dominant industries, but the hills around Bacup and Haslingden had a considerable number of coal and lead mines together with numerous quarrying concerns. In addition employers who specialised in footwear production and brick making had an important presence in the Rossendale Valley.<sup>16</sup> These elements of industrialisation - work, social networks and landscape - conjoined to produce the northern working-class bandsman.

### **The Brass Band as Social History and Musicology**

The approach taken in this thesis bridges a gap between musicology and social history. Whilst some work has been done to fill this gap, a great deal remains. In 1979 William Weber saw that musicologists and social historians had similar interests. Yet he still saw musicologists as scholars who tried to find meaning in musical scores, and social historians as researchers who tried to find historical significance in social groups. The link between music and the development of social networks had not yet been fully formed. Weber wrote:

I see strong similarities between recent interests of musicologists and the search among social historians for a clearer historical vocabulary. Just as musicologists are trying to

---

<sup>16</sup> Arthur Baldwin, Miles Crompton, Ian Hargreaves, John Simpson and Gary Taylor, *The Changing Faces of Rossendale: Production Lines* (Halifax, n.d.), pp. 19-25.

arrive at a more accurate sense of how scores used to be played, so social historians are struggling to define what social groups meant to people in the past. Even if unanimity is in short supply in both fields, we all respect the past and ask that it be heard and seen in its own terms.<sup>17</sup>

Dave Russell made a call to study music to understand social history, together with the need to embrace an interdisciplinary approach, in his 1993 article, 'The "Social History" of Popular Music: A Label Without a Cause?'<sup>18</sup> Major inroads into exploring music as an interdisciplinary study were made by the 'Music and Cultures Research Group' in the Open University's Music Department, consisting of Trevor Herbert, Martin Clayton and Richard Middleton. The group's stated purpose was to 'pursue research in the cultural study of music, with an emphasis on interdisciplinary approaches drawing on musicology, social history, anthropology, ethnomusicology, cultural theory and other relevant areas.'<sup>19</sup> The key text that resulted from this group was a collection of essays covering many aspects of the conjunction between music and culture.<sup>20</sup> Their proposal to the publishers shows the influence of their work on my own research; they wrote:

A tendency to increasing concern with 'culture' has been manifested in music scholarship for some time, and in a variety of ways. It would be too much to say that various trajectories are converging, let alone that all will crystallize into a single field of 'cultural musicology'. Nonetheless, different approaches are interacting, and with increasing intensity, such that it is clear that a new paradigm may well be on the horizon. All the disciplines involved in the study of music will continue to be changed by this process and, for some, reconfiguration seems inevitable.<sup>21</sup>

---

17 William Weber, 'The Muddle of the Middle Classes', *19th-Century Music*, Vol. 3, No. 2 (November, 1979), p. 185.

18 *Popular Music*, 12/2 (May 1993), pp. 139-155.

19 < <http://www.open.ac.uk/Arts/music/musiccult.shtml>> accessed, 6 October, 2011

20 Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert and Richard Middleton (Eds.), *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction* (New York, 2003), < <http://www.open.ac.uk/Arts/music/musiccult.shtml>> accessed, 6 October, 2011.

21 Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert and Richard Middleton (Eds.), *The Cultural Study of Music*, p. 1.



Significant research also emerged from the conferences of *The Royal Musical Association's Biennial Conferences on Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain*, from 1997 onwards. These conferences have been crucial gathering points for scholars from a wide range of disciplines including musicology, cultural social and economic history, politics, sociology and cultural geography.<sup>22</sup> Significantly the work has been enriched by interdisciplinary dialogue.<sup>23</sup> This engagement with leading historians and cultural theorists has overturned the accepted view of nineteenth-century Britain being a musical wasteland.<sup>24</sup> Critically, as Rachel Cowgill maintains, these conferences 'have long since squashed the notion that musicologists are not interested in the broad contextualization of music and its significance as a cultural practice.'<sup>25</sup> This evolution and acceptance of social history within the discipline of musicology was recently expressed in 2012 at the Centre for the Study of Music, Gender and Identity (MuGI), based at the University of Huddersfield, who argue they are 'unique within the research context of music as a discipline in our exploration of the relationship between music, gender and identity in diverse cultural and chronological contexts.'<sup>26</sup>

In spite of these explorations, partnerships, challenges to orthodoxies and interdisciplinary work, bandsmen, the brass band and the brass band movement remain under explored in social history and musicology. This is the space in the research that this thesis will fill.

---

22 <<http://www.cardiff.ac.uk/music/newsandevents/events/conferences/13MNCB/aboutMNCB.html>> accessed, 15 May, 2013.

23 See, for example, Bennett Zon (Ed.), *Nineteenth-Century British Music Studies Volume 1* (Aldershot, 1997); Jeremy Dibble (Ed.), *Nineteenth-Century Music Studies Volume 2* (Aldershot, 2002); Peter Horton and Bennett Zon (Eds.), *Nineteenth-Century Music Studies Volume 3* (Aldershot, 2003); Rachael Cowgill and Julian Ruston (Eds.), *Europe, Empire and Spectacle in Nineteenth-Century British Music* (Aldershot, 2006) and Paul Rodmell (Ed.), *Music and Institutions in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (Farnham, 2012).

24 <<http://www.cardiff.ac.uk/music/newsandevents/events/conferences/13MNCB/aboutMNCB.html>>

25 See the previous website.

26 <<http://www.hud.ac.uk/research/researchcentres/mugi/>> accessed, 2 January, 2014.

## A Neglected Force-The Brass Band

Writing in 1917, Percy Alfred Scholes argued in *Everyman and His Music: Simple Papers on Various Subjects* (1917) that the need for more research on brass bands was self evident. In his chapter, 'A Neglected Force-The Brass Band,' he estimated there were at least twenty-thousand brass instrumentalists in the north of England alone.<sup>27</sup> Scholes recognised that brass bands were 'essentially the factory workers' and colliery workers' musical activity, recalling with pleasure the part played in the life of a little manufacturing community.<sup>28</sup> Yet, despite clear observations that the brass band was an important part of working-class community life, key texts, including Russell and Elliot's *The Brass Band Movement* (1936) and Reginald Nettle's *Music in the Five Towns* (1944), that pointed the way for further research and highlighted the influence of industrialisation and the growth of working-class identities upon music, failed to stimulate much additional research in this area.<sup>29</sup> The Royal Musical Association published their *Proceedings* from 1874-1987, which survives today as the *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*. Reflecting the amateur origins of the journal, Reginald Nettel, an amateur musician in Oxford, contributed an article in 1945-46 that recognised the working-class musicianship of the north of England.<sup>30</sup> Researchers, however, missed the opportunity to explore and interrogate these findings. The 1960s saw social history become a credible

---

27 Percy A. Scholes, 'A Neglected Force-The Brass Band', in, Percy A. Scholes, *Everyman and His Music: Simple Papers on Various Subjects* (New York 1917, this edition, 1969), pp. 23-28.

28 Scholes, 'A Neglected Force-The Brass Band', p. 24.

29 Reginald Nettel, *Music in the Five Towns, 1840-1914: A Study of the Social Influences of Music in an Industrial District* (Oxford, 1944).

30 Reginald Nettel, 'The Influence of the Industrial Revolution on English Music', *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association*, seventy-second session, 1945 -1946.

academic discipline and books began to appear that reflected the interdisciplinary nature of the subject. Key texts included Mackerness's *A Social History of English Music* (1964)<sup>31</sup> and Lloyd's *Folksong in England* (1967).<sup>32</sup> From 1976 to 1990 the four main historical journals which placed a strong emphasis on social history - *History Workshop Journal*, *Social History*, *Journal of Social History* and *Past and Present* - published only ten articles covering subjects that could have fallen under the remit of the social history of music.<sup>33</sup> In addition a review of social history journals from 1990-2007 revealed only four articles, one in *Victorian Literature and Culture*, and three published in *The Journal of Victorian Culture*.<sup>34</sup>

Musicological journals have not treated the social history of music much better. From 1986 to 2006, *The Journal of the Royal Musicological Association*, *The Journal of Musicology*, the *Journal of the American Musicological Society* and *Early Music* published six articles that dealt with the social history of music in Britain. This figure is even more surprising when we consider the international coverage of these journals. The exceptions included Dave Russell, who examined the Bradford subscription concerts that were an attempt to create and justify a bourgeois community which had become associated, in the eyes of the

---

31 Eric David Mackerness, *A Social History of English Music* (London, 1964).

32 A.T. Lloyd, *Folksong in England* (Lancaster, 1964).

33 Dave Russell, 'The "social history" of popular music: A label without a cause?' *Popular Music*, 12/2 (May, 1993), p. 140.

34 Ruth R. Solie, 'No "Land Without Music" After all', *Victorian literature and Culture*, 32/1 (March, 2004), pp. 261-276.

Simon Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar: the Hallé Concerts and the Constitution of High Culture in Manchester, c.1850-1880', *The Journal of Victorian Culture*, 2/2 (Autumn, 1997), pp. 208-225.

Christina Basford, 'Learning to Listen: Audiences for Chamber Music in Early Victorian London', *The Journal of Victorian Culture*, 4/1, (Spring, 1999,) pp. 25-45.

Ruth Forbes, 'A Study in Music, Community and Identity in a late Nineteenth-Century Scottish Town', *The Journal of Victorian Culture*, 11/2 (Autumn, 2006), pp. 256-279.

nation, purely with the accumulation of wealth.<sup>35</sup> Suzanne Aspden explored an attempt to define an 'imagined community' of Britishness, expressed through English Opera.<sup>36</sup> Rachel Cowgill recognised the early growth, and importance of, northern music-making, when examining Georgian Halifax. Importantly Cowgill hinted that music should be a research topic that musicologists and social historians should spend more time on.<sup>37</sup> Hans Lennenberg and James Haar both speculated on how cultural history and sociology affected the study of music: highlighting that the sociology of music is a study that would involve various theories about society.<sup>38</sup> Therefore, they showed how social history and musicology could, or should, be cross-discipline subjects. Finally, Derek Scott tackled sexual politics, using metaphors of masculinity and femininity to explain musical style.<sup>39</sup> Contributors to musicological journals are approaching contested and popular themes within social history. The majority of these articles dealt with middle-class perceptions of music-making in metropolitan areas, and did not examine the influences of the working class and regionalism on music. Most recently, the work of Trevor Herbert has been fruitful in exploring the brass band in relation to working-class cultural identity, yet space still remains for a detailed approach to the working class, regional identity and brass bands.<sup>40</sup>

---

35 Dave Russell, 'Provincial concerts in England, 1865-1914: A Case Study of Bradford', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 114/1 (1989), pp. 43-55.

36 Suzanne Aspden, 'Ballads and Britons: Imagined Community and the Continuity of "English Opera"', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 125/1 (2000), pp. 62-92.

37 Rachel Cowgill, "'The most musical spot for its size in the kingdom": Music in Georgian Halifax', *Early Music*, 28 (2000), pp. 557-575.

38 Hans Lennenberg, 'Speculating about Sociology and Social History', *The Journal of Musicology*, 6/4 (October, 1988), pp. 409-420.

James Haar, 'Music Society and Cultural History', *The Journal of Musicology*, 1/1, (January, 1982), pp. 5-14.

39 Derek B. Scott, 'The Sexual Politics of Victorian Musical Aesthetics', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 19/1 (1994), pp. 91-114.

40 See, for example, 'Victorian Brass Bands: The Establishment of a Working Class Musical Tradition', *Historic Brass Society Journal* No 4 (New York, 1992), pp. 1-11; 'Victorian Brass Bands: Class, Taste and Space' in G. Reynolds et al (Eds.), *The Place of Music: Music, Space and the Production of Place*, (New York and London, 1998), pp. 104-128; 'The Practice and Context of a Victorian Brass Band', in Bennett Zon (Ed.), *Nineteenth-Century British Music Studies*, Vol. 1

My research has been shaped by these approaches. My examination of class identity, which was supported by the social networks of Victorian and Edwardian society, reflects a growing interest in the use of social history to study musical groups. After some neglect musical texts are being used to illustrate aspects of social history and show that musicology benefits from being an interdisciplinary subject. Yet, studies to date lean towards middle-class art music and the brass band movement remains open for re-examination.

The early texts that dealt with brass bands hinted at the richness of the working-class networks but this theme was not expanded upon by earlier historians. After Russell and Elliot's *The Brass Band Movement* (1936), key texts about brass bands follow the same pattern of examining instrumental development, contest history and results, the growth of a brass band repertoire and the influence of the major figures in the movement.<sup>41</sup> There has been little examination of the social and cultural influences of the brass band movement on class and regional identity. Writing in 1981, Bernard Waites, in his review of Arthur Taylor's *Brass Bands*, showed the need for further analysis of music in the creation of working class and northern cultural identities that could apply to all the texts. Waites wrote that, 'even though the book bubbled over with the love of brass bands, it was hampered by so many faults of historic writing [...] the analysis of the social relations of brass banding had been sacrificed to a

---

(Aldershot, 1999), pp. 105-18; Trevor Herbert and Margaret Sarkissian, 'Victorian Bands and their Dissemination in the Colonies', *Popular Music*, Vol. 16, No. 2, 1997, pp.167-81; 'Selling Brass Instruments: The Commercial Imaging of Brass Instruments (1830-1930) and Its Cultural Messages', in *Music in Art: the International Journal for Music Iconography*, 28/1-2 (Spring-Fall 2004), 213-26.; 'Music for the Multitude: Accounts of the Brass Bands Entering Enderby Jackson's Crystal Palace Contests in the 1860s' (with Arnold Myers), *Early Music*, Vol. 38, No. 4 (November 2010), pp. 571-584. 41 T.L. Cooper, *Brass Bands of Yorkshire*, (Clapham, Yorks, 1974); Arthur R. Taylor, *Brass Bands* (St Albans and London, 1979); Violet & Geoffrey Brand, *Brass Bands in the 20th Century* ( Letchworth, 1979); C. Bainbridge, *Brass Triumphant* (London, 1980); Arthur R. Taylor, *Labour and Love, An Oral History of the Brass Band Movement* (London, 1983).

narrative strung out on the “heroic” characters’.<sup>42</sup> He argued that ‘the topic cried out for a far denser treatment than this type of popular cultural history would tolerate.’<sup>43</sup>

Only a handful of doctoral theses have tackled brass bands and their music. In 1970, Jack L. Scott wrote *The Evolution of the Brass Band and its Repertoire in Northern England* (Sheffield University). Scott’s work laid out the themes that subsequent researchers to a greater or lesser extent have followed: the development of brass instruments, brass band repertoire, the influence of rational recreation and sponsorship from industrialists on brass band music, the development of the brass band competition and an analysis of the major figures in the band movement. Within this outline there is often discussion of the social and economic background to bands and bandsmen, but, to date, apart from Dave Russell’s thesis, there were no attempts to explore the social and economic aspects fully, which are often seen just as a backdrop to discussion of the instruments, the music, the competitions and the larger personalities.

In 1979, Dave Russell wrote his thesis, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914: A Study of the Relationship between Music and Society* (University of York). It embraced Scott’s work, as well as the early work carried out by Russell, Elliot and Reginald Nettel. Dave Russell’s main reason for choosing music was that it was under-represented in social history. He argued that, ‘the historian’s disregard of popular musical life stem[med] neither from political motivated scholarship, nor lack of musical sensitivity, but

---

42 Bernard Waites, ‘Brass Bands,’ by Arthur Taylor, *Popular Music*, Volume 1 (1981), p. 210.

43 Waites, ‘Brass Bands’, p. 211.

from the belief, held for so long by historians of all political persuasions, that organised labour represented the pre-eminent area of working-class experience to be studied.<sup>44</sup> This thesis was later published as the book, *Popular Music in England 1840-1914: A Social History* (1987). Even though Russell gave considerable space to brass bands in his thesis, book chapters<sup>45</sup> and books, including his later significant study of the north, *Looking North: Northern England and the National Imagination* (2000), the brass bands of the Southern Pennines still need further analysis if their full importance is to be recognised over other forms of music-making in the area that were covered by Russell.

Since 2000, a key text for brass band historians has been Trevor Herbert's edited volume, *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford 2000). The book contained eight chapters: four of which are directly concerned with the social history of music.<sup>46</sup> The other four essays fall under the headings of repertoire, organology and performance practice.<sup>47</sup> This text opens up the brass band movement in terms of social history yet the key themes that I approach in my thesis - class and region - are not explored at significant length.

The work of Dave Russell and Rachel Cowgill highlight that the Southern Pennines had significant mixed musical communities. There were a large

---

44 David Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914: A Study of the Relationship between Music and Society* (PhD Thesis, University of York, 1979), p. 1.

45 See Dave Russell, "Music in Huddersfield, c.1820-1914", in Hilary A. Haigh (Ed.) *Huddersfield: A Most Handsome Town: Aspects of the History and Culture of a West Yorkshire Town* (Huddersfield: Kirklees Metropolitan Council, Cultural Services 1992), pp. 653-680.

46 Trevor Herbert, 'Nineteenth-Century Bands: Making a Movement', pp. 10-67, Dave Russell, 'What's Wrong with Brass Bands?': Cultural Change and the Band Movement', pp.68-121, Trevor Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels: The Bands of the Salvation Army', pp. 187-216, Duncan Bythell, 'The Brass Band in the Antipodes: The Transplantation of British Popular Culture', pp. 217-244.

47 Vic and Sheila Gammon, 'The Musical Revolution of the Mid-Nineteenth Century: From 'Repeat and Twiddle' to 'Precision and Snap'', pp.122-154, Arnold Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands', pp.155-186, Paul Hindmarsh, 'Building a Repertoire: Original Compositions for the British Brass Band,1913-1998', pp. 245-277, Trevor Hebert and John Wallace, 'Aspects of Performance Practices: The Brass Band and Its Influence on Other Brass-Playing Styles', pp. 278-305.

number of choral societies, singing groups and vocal ensembles that were active in this era. Orchestras also had a large working-class membership. There were also examples of hand-bell ringing groups, accordion bands and other groups that working-class people took part in. Therefore, why should I study brass bands over these other groups, especially choral groups, as the significant agency in the construction of class and region?

In 1892, the music journal, *Magazine of Music* featured an article that placed an emphasis on the importance of northern brass bands' social networks. This piece featured the importance of brass band contests and how they encouraged musical skill; moreover, the rhetoric in the piece highlighted the importance of bands over other musical groups in bringing working-class cultures to the attention of the wider world. Towards the article's end the author wrote:

Contests, however, are by no means the only objects, as everybody knows, for which bands exist. There is scarcely a public function of any kind at which there is not a band to dispense sweet harmonies. As one looks through the record of a month's work, one sees social gatherings of all kinds - teas, suppers, dances, cricket or football matches, presentations, festivals, demonstrations, camp meetings and anniversaries. It would seem as if nothing human were complete without a band, for this week, a band has to play at a marriage and a funeral. At Christmas the bands turn out in great force to go the round of their subscribers; and we hear that in spite of the intense cold last Christmas, some bands played before the houses of over a hundred[...]members, notwithstanding benumbed fingers and frozen valves [...]. There are many wide questions connected with these bands - the influence on their members, on their home life, on the life of the neighbourhood, which we must leave to be answered [...] by those whose knowledge of bands and bandsmen is more extensive than our own.<sup>48</sup>

---

48 *Magazine of Music*, 9/4, (April, 1892), pp. 62-63.



The region, as the *Magazine of Music* pointed out, was where it seemed nothing human was complete without a band. Therefore, in spite of the north containing a wide range of musical activity, it is to the brass bands of the Southern Pennines that I turn to in the following chapters for an exploration of working-class leisure and identity in this period.

My study of class and region, indeed my definition of social history, is influenced by E.P. Thompson's classic *The Making of the English Working Class* (London, 1963). In my view bandsmen afford an excellent opportunity of studying 'history from below,' a term used by Thompson in his article in the *Times Literary Supplement* in 1966.<sup>49</sup> In other words the brass bands gave bandsmen a way of facilitating and articulating their own ideas and institutions; bandsmen created their own highly visible history in an expanding area of working-class leisure. A key passage of Thompson's was:

If we stop history at any given point, then there are no classes but simply a multitude of individuals with a multitude of experiences. But if we watch these men over an adequate period of social change, we observe patterns in their relationships, their ideas and their institutions. Class is defined by men as they live their own history, and in the end, this is its only definition.<sup>50</sup>

Much of the social history produced in the 1960s and 1970s was influenced by Thompson's preface in *The Making of the English Working Class*. History came to be analysed with a soft Marxist approach. What was attractive about Thompson's approach was that it gave the working class agency.<sup>51</sup> Working-class people, Thompson argued, were active in creating their own history. For

---

49 E. P. Thompson, 'History from Below', *Times Literary Supplement* (7 April, 1966), pp. 279-80.

50 E. P. Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class* (London, 1963, this edition, 1991), p. 10. Feminist historians were critical of Thompson's masculine approach to history. This thesis discusses the role of both men and women in the brass band movement and the link with working-class identity.

51 Rohan McWilliam, *Popular Politics in Nineteenth-Century England* (London, 1998), p. 21.

Thompson, 'class-consciousness is the way in which these experiences are handled in cultural terms: embodied in value-systems, ideas, and institutional forms.'<sup>52</sup> This view is attractive when analysing brass bands. It was the complexities of bandsmen's experience in creating an institution, even a movement, which counted towards the construction of class identity rather than reducing class to the boundaries of pre-determined theory.<sup>53</sup>

Non-Marxist historians came to similar conclusions. The Society for the Study of Labour History (founded in 1960) investigated how trade unions and the Labour movement became a representation of influence in British society. Asa Briggs, and other contributors to *Chartist Studies*, changed modern study into the movement arguing that Chartism could only be understood fully through local studies, in an attempt to record the activities of the movement's rank and file members.<sup>54</sup>

This view is reflected in my own work by my use of many local studies source material, not only newspapers, but also local diaries, reflections, minute books and financial records that discuss local bands and their relationships within the community. In addition local and national newspapers, magazines, music journals and the brass band movement's own press, records that have been overlooked in earlier analysis of the social networks of brass bands, have been used. Therefore, my thesis examines the fullest possible range of archival material.

---

<sup>52</sup> Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class*, p. 10.

<sup>53</sup> McWilliam, *Popular Politics*, p. 21.

<sup>54</sup> McWilliam, *Popular Politics*, p. 21.

Nationally, brass bands have provided local historians with a wealth of material to write histories of bands in their region. These studies often concentrate on the reasons for setting up a band, such as the influence of the rational recreation ethos, the foundation of bands, including sources of finance, and, significantly, their efforts to win both local and national contests.<sup>55</sup> These histories provide a starting point to understand the lives of working class people through the brass band movement on a national level. These chronologies show how brass bands elsewhere in the country shared commonalities with bands from the Southern Pennines. Nevertheless, here, it was how Southern Pennine bands became distinctive within this shared commonality that is of interest. What emerges from the archival material was that the *distinctiveness* of the Southern Pennine bands was a construction of the internal and external reporting of bands. In other words, when compared with other areas, the working-class 'northernness' of the Southern Pennine Bandsman was an invented construction of commentators. Indeed, in 1891, a reporter in the *Magazine of Music*, who was writing about the area around Chorley in Lancashire, wrote that, 'the North of England has always been noted for its bands and their contests.'<sup>56</sup>

The view of E.P. Thompson view that the working class created its own agency by creating its own culture is an attractive analysis, and might be applied

---

55 See, for example, Helen Abbott, *Murton Pit and People 1838-1984 : Facts and Reflections of the Murton Prize Band*, (Swansea,1984); W. Albery, 'Horsham Borough Silver Band', *Sussex Country Magazine*, 19/1(1945), pp. 95-97; E.H.G. Allen, *A Brief History of the Southampton Albion Silver Band* (n.p.,1953); S. Andrews, *Illustrated History of Luton and District Brass Bands* (Luton,1907); Anon, 'Bloxham, The Village With Three Brass Bands', *The Countryman Magazine*, 38/1 (Autumn 1948), pp.78-79; Charles Duckworth, 'Brass Bands in and Around Buckley', *The Magazine of The Buckley Society*, 8 (March 1983), pp. 3-9; Eric Johnson, *The Bands Play On! A History of Burton Bands* (Tempus Publishing, 2003); Geraint Jones, *Cyrr y Diafol, The Golden Age of Brass Bands in North Wales between 1830 and 1920* (Gwasg Gwynedd, 2004); David Kennedy, *Tutbury's Variations: A History of Wind and Brass Bands in a Staffordshire Village* (Selbsverl, 2002).

56 *Magazine of Music*, No. 8, Vol. 11 (November 1891), p. 203.

to the working-class band, yet it needs testing. Bandsmen relied upon and negotiated intricate relationships with other bandsmen, friends, families, communities, workplaces and middle-class agencies for support. It is within this light that the effect of brass bands upon working-class identity becomes significant. As Geoffrey Crossick has noted, 'the development of the whole of the working class, as well as class relationships outside the working class, must be analysed if the overall stabilisation of the [Victorian] period is to be understood.'<sup>57</sup> Crossick added, 'the effects of mid-Victorian expansion can only be interpreted within the framework of wider social relationships and ideological forces; these determined the consequences of economic developments, in specific places, at specific points in time.'<sup>58</sup> In Crossick's terms, working-class bandsmen lived and experienced their lives within families, communities and workplaces. In order to understand the bandsmens' influence on working-class identity we must understand how bandsmen lived their lives not as individuals but as actors within larger communities.<sup>59</sup> As such, bandsmen worked within the system rather than against it and, as a result, often obtained the resources to ensure their music-making was a success. This process grew out of existing working-class traditions and the bandsmens' invention of musical traditions, creating a set of values which represented a new degree of assimilation into the existing social and economic system.<sup>60</sup>

Both Marxist and left-leaning non-Marxist historians often painted a portrait of a heroic labour movement. As such historians tried to represent the

---

57 Geoffrey Crossick, *An Artisan Elite in Victorian London: Kentish London 1840-1880* (London, 1978), p. 16.

58 Crossick, *An Artisan Elite in Victorian London*, p. 18.

59 Crossick, *An Artisan Elite in Victorian London*, pp. 18-19.

60 Crossick, *An Artisan Elite in Victorian London*, p. 20.

working class as having a sense of agency that created their own destiny. Journals such as *History Workshop*, for example, became the vehicle for a history from below that attempted to unite the working class with historians. In the 1980s, however, the forward march of labour history was stopped.<sup>61</sup> The 1980s saw a revision of working-class historiography that stressed the notions of class, culture and community. The problem was that this analysis romanticised the working class who labour and Marxist historians believed would fulfil their own destiny. In the 1980s the re-election of successive Conservative governments, the decline of traditional working-class industry and high unemployment transformed the nature of the post-war working class.<sup>62</sup> The intellectual framework that supported socialism and the left was undermined by the fall of the Berlin Wall in 1989, and, with the collapse of Soviet Communism, Marxism lost its influence. The revisionists of the Thatcher years therefore could collectively undermine the premises of the traditional narrative.<sup>63</sup>

The first revision of the forward march of labour as the conventional narrative of the Industrial Revolution was challenged by new economic data. Some economic historians doubted the existence of an Industrial Revolution at all.<sup>64</sup> What replaced the Industrial Revolution of 1780-1830 was the idea of the 'long eighteenth century', demonstrating how the economy of the first half of the nineteenth century had more in common with the economy of the eighteenth century rather than the twentieth.<sup>65</sup>

---

61 McWilliam, *Popular Politics*, p. 25.

62 McWilliam, *Popular Politics*, p. 26.

63 McWilliam, *Popular Politics*, p. 26.

64 See N.F.R. Crafts, *British Economic Growth during the Industrial Revolution* (Oxford, 1985) and Pat Hudson, *The Industrial Revolution* (London, 1992).

65 McWilliam *Popular Politics*, p. 27.

Secondly, the notion of 'the long eighteenth century' led Gareth Steadman- Jones to produce an important attack on the traditional narrative. His article 'Rethinking Chartism' challenged the view that Chartism was a response to the new industrial society.<sup>66</sup> He argued that historical interpretations of the period 1870-1914 concentrated on the 'great waves of trade union expansion, the growth of socialism, the foundation of the Labour party, the conversion of the working class from liberalism, the demands for social reform, and the beginnings of the welfare state.'<sup>67</sup> Alternatively, Steadman-Jones argued that political developments could be read by the importance of social perspective. Where older analysis had relied upon decisive breaks that shaped the course of history, revisionists emphasised the continuity of language, ideas and culture from the eighteenth century onwards in forming the historical narrative.<sup>68</sup>

A third criticism came from feminists who pointed out that the established narrative emphasised male workers in the formation of class identity. Thompson, for example, argued that class identity arose from a 'biography of the English working class from its early adolescence until its early manhood.'<sup>69</sup> Class was a male construct that grew out of the years when a man's masculinity reached maturity. That class identities were masculine was implicit in Thompson's language. Other historians ignored gender in the formation of class identities. Published in 1964, E. J. Hobsbawm's *Industry and Empire* gave little indication that gender was important. Men were seen as workers: agents in the production

---

66 Gareth Steadman-Jones, 'Re-thinking Chartism' in, *Languages of Class: Studies in English Working-Class History, 1832-1982* (Cambridge, 1983), pp. 90-178.

67 Gareth Steadman Jones, 'Working-Class Culture and Working-Class Politics in London, 1870-1900: Notes on the Remaking of the Working Class,' in, Gareth Steadman Jones, *Languages of Class Studies in Working-Class History, 1832-1982* (Cambridge, 1983), p. 181.

68 McWilliam, *Popular Politics*, p. 27.

69 E .P Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class*, p. 10.

of goods. The role of women was only partly recognised in the 1999 edition.<sup>70</sup> With the exception of the work of Sheila Rowbotham and Dorothy Thompson, women's considerable political activity has been ignored until more recently.<sup>71</sup> Anna Clark argued that gender transformed these themes.<sup>72</sup> Community, work, cultural and political boundaries were rewritten in terms of gender. In 1995, Clark asked, 'did plebeians define their communities according to the male worlds of workshop and pub, or, did they include women in the wider circles of neighbourhoods and markets?'<sup>73</sup> Clark did not seek to replace these masculine interpretations of history, but endeavoured to 'infuse gender - the social construction of manhood and womanhood - into the analysis of class.'<sup>74</sup> Significantly the coming of women's history meant a new set of narratives. The separate spheres of public and private were seen as important a division as class. Gender became integral to class formation.<sup>75</sup>

In the early 1990s, Patrick Joyce argued that 'it is no longer credible to study the history of labour *in vacuo*. The study of institutions and leaders has been replaced by the study of the *relationship* between groups and classes, and by accounts of social interaction *between* groups and classes, and by accounts of social interaction, whether at home or in the workplace.'<sup>76</sup> Class based history was in danger of no longer being relevant. In 1991 he wrote that 'until relatively

---

70 E. J. Hobsbawm, *Industry and Empire: From 1750 to the Present Day*, (London, 1963, this edition, 1999), cited in, John Tosh, 'Masculinities in an Industrializing Society: Britain, 1800-1914', *Journal of British Studies*, 44 (April 2005), p. 330.

71 Sheila Rowbotham, *Hidden from History: 300 Years of Women's Oppression and the Fight Against It* (London, 1974) and Dorothy Thompson, 'Women and Nineteenth-Century Radical Politics: A Lost Dimension' in Dorothy Thompson, *Outsiders, Class, Gender and Nation* (London, 1993), pp. 72-102.

72 Anna Clark, *The Struggle for the Breeches, Gender and the Making of the British Working Class* (London, 1995), pp. 1-5.

73 Clark, *The Struggle for the Breeches*, p. 3.

74 Clark, *The Struggle for the Breeches*, p. 2.

75 McWilliam, *Popular Politics*, p. 28.

76 Patrick Joyce, 'Work', in F. M. L. Thompson (Ed.), *The Cambridge Social History of Britain, 1750-1950, Volume 2: People and Their Environment* (Cambridge, 1990), p. 170.

recently 'class' in British history was a settled matter [...]. Despite the large amount of subsequent scholarship, the work of E. P. Thompson and E. J. Hobsbawm remained, and remains, central, fixing the historical sequence of class development.'<sup>77</sup> He was critical of this stasis. Class, Joyce argues, 'will not go away, it has its place, and an important one, though it does sometimes need to be put in it.'<sup>78</sup> Joyce then argued that Thompson's argument that a person's experience created class consciousness was over simplistic, and that aspects of language, and its use, are just as valid in the construction of ideology and identity.<sup>79</sup> Joyce argued that 'because manual workers chose to wear cloth caps and support football teams [and brass bands] it does not follow that they saw the social order in terms of class.'<sup>80</sup> He urged, in 1995, that the identities of the 'people', the 'nation', and of 'humanity' were as at least as important in constructing mentalities as was class.<sup>81</sup>

At the first reading Thompson's model suits the bandsmen and their bands. The institutions and ideas that they created did generate a cultural movement. Indeed, within the band movement can be found the notions of class, culture and community, three themes that are supported by archival evidence used throughout this thesis. The themes of class, culture and community do not just support the onward march of the traditionalist view of labour history; within these themes are interpretations of language and culture, social networks and community relations. The strength of the brass band movement lay in its social

---

77 Patrick Joyce, *Visions of the People: Industrial England and the Question of Class, c. 1848-1914* (Cambridge, 1991, this edition, 1994), p.1.

78 Joyce, *Visions of the People*, p. 1.

79 Joyce, *Visions of the People*, p. 9.

80 Joyce, *Visions of the People*, p. 8.

81 Patrick Joyce, 'The End of Social History?' *Social History*, Vol 20. No.1 (1995), pp. 73-91.



networks that created traditions and customs. This reading encourages a revisionist interpretation that language, in this case musical performance, ideas and culture led to the construction of working-class identity. One thing is undeniable; the brass band movement was a leisure pursuit. For working-class bandsmen and their supporting networks it was the development of leisure time in the nineteenth century that enabled them in supporting their activities. It was inside the arena of leisure, then, that regional and class identities were formed.

Therefore, even though historians influenced by Thompson have come under attack, and the foundations of the traditional narrative have become unstable, the task of historians now is, as Rohan McWilliam argues, 'to produce a narrative that is richer, more complex and restores the things the traditional narrative silenced.'<sup>82</sup> This thesis takes Thompson's influence as a foundation; nevertheless, I also argue that language, social networks, custom and gender add richness to the trio of labour historians' class, culture and community.

Bandsmen came to create their identity through negotiation and compromise with other groups and classes. Tested against Thompson bandsmen were not so much a multitude of individuals with a multitude of experiences but a multitude of working people with a common interest in the social networks that supported the band movement. As such, social interaction came to define how bandsmen lived their lives and it is the language used in these interactions that defined their culture. This thesis is influenced by the traditional narrative of class, culture and community but within each of these themes I suggest a closer reading of the

---

82 McWilliam, *Popular Politics*, p. 29.

meaning of social interaction within and between classes is necessary to understand working-class lives in this period.

## Thesis Outline

The thesis starts at the end of the period when the consequences of the invention of the piston valve, and its application to brass instruments, that began in the 1820s, and made rapid progress throughout the 1830s, had become dominant. It has been argued that this was a major influence behind the beginnings of a large band movement. Herbert suggests that:

While Victorian social and economic changes created good conditions for the development of brass bands, the primary reason for their origin can be traced to a single technical invention. The application of valves to brass instruments - one of the most important single inventions ever applied to music - ensured that, for the first time, every brass instrument from the highest treble to the lowest bass was chromatic across its entire range. Furthermore, because the new valved instruments were played with the three most dexterous fingers of the right hand, they were comparatively easy to learn to play and consequently were popularly used by amateurs. Though refinements to instrument designs continued through the century, the main breakthroughs took place between the early 1820s and mid-1830s. The most rapid development of brass bands took place in the forty years or so following the late 1830s.<sup>83</sup>

Indeed, in 1838, the improvements in the construction of brass instruments was noted by the *Spectator*, when they wrote, 'we have lately seen and heard some brass instruments constructed on a principle which promises to enlarge their powers and extend their usefulness to a much greater degree than any former

---

83 Trevor Herbert, 'The Repertory of a Victorian Provincial Brass Band', *Popular Music*, Vol. 9. No. 1 (1990), p. 117.

attempts have been able to accomplish.<sup>84</sup> Brass instruments were durable and affordable, manufacturing methods used established techniques already used in the manufacture of a number of household and commercial goods.<sup>85</sup> Moreover, brass instruments emerged from a technology that resulted in a market for commodities that not only satisfied basic human needs, but imposed those needs on a more affluent population through mass advertisement. Brass bands emerged at a time when scarcity was in retreat, and, in 1870, incomes rose from a slender twenty-five percent above subsistence, to, by 1914, a comfortable one-hundred and fifty percent above subsistence.<sup>86</sup> Nevertheless, as illustrated by the studies of Joseph Rowntree in the press, poverty and need still existed.<sup>87</sup> Brass bands reflected a growth in disposable income for the working class, but such prosperity was tenuous. Bands therefore negotiated and compromised with the industrialists and populations of the Southern Pennine towns to ensure their survival and stability.

In 1914 Percy Fletcher's *Labour and Love*, commissioned in 1913, was performed at the Crystal Palace Competition.<sup>88</sup> *Labour and Love* was significant as it was composed music of some substance that was available to *all* bands.<sup>89</sup> It was the first test piece that was composed for the standardised brass band line-up and that the sources can account for fully. As Paul Hindmarsh has stated, 'it

---

84 *Spectator* (27 October, 1838), p. 9.

85 Herbert, 'Nineteenth Century Bands, Making a Movement', p. 19.

86 Jose Harris, *Private Lives, Public Spirit: Britain 1870-1914* (Oxford, 1993, this edition, 1994), p. 33.

87 See Robert Fitzgerald, 'Rowntree, Joseph (1836-1925)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Oxford University Press, 2004 <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/35857>>, accessed, 22 January, 2013.

88 Jack L. Scott, *The Evolution of the Brass Band and its Repertoire in Northern England* (unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Sheffield, 1970), p. 267.

89 Paul Hindmarsh, 'Building a Repertoire: Original Compositions for the British Brass Band, 1913-1998', in, Herbert (Ed.), *The British Brass Band*, p. 248.

was not part of a local 'bespoke' repertoire [...].It stands like a solitary beacon in the writing for brass band in the early twentieth century[...].<sup>90</sup>

One of the first arguments for the need to compose original compositions for brass bands can be found in the *Outlook*, in 1900. A commentator thought that 'perhaps some of our younger and more enterprising music-makers, sparing an hour or two from the unremunerative opera and the superfluous cantata, may be in future disposed to try their hand in this direction.'<sup>91</sup> Editors in the brass band periodicals had been arguing persistently that the only way band music could be taken seriously as 'art music' was to have their own original compositions written for them and to move away from the standard repertoire of arrangements largely based around opera and selections of works of great composers.<sup>92</sup> In 1910, the Conservative politician, William George Galloway (1868-1931), reflected that brass bands could be an important tool in developing English music, writing:

The brass band movement offers an excellent opportunity to young native composers, if they will be quick to take advantage of it, they will advance the case of music and incidentally improve their own prospects, for they will find an immediate market for their music.<sup>93</sup>

Therefore, with the use of the first dedicated composition for standardised brass bands, I have an important musical finale to the thesis that not only highlights the emergence of the brass band within art music, but also, the performance of this test piece at the Crystal Palace Competition, the annual national contest, which cemented northern and working-class identities together on the London stage.

---

90 Hindmarsh, 'Building a Repertoire', pp. 248-249.

91 *Outlook*, Vol. 4. No.104 (27 January, 1900), p. 844.

92 See, for example, editorials in the *British Bandsman* throughout 1911-1912.

93 William George Galloway, *Musical England* (New York, 1910), p. 205.

Chapter one will give an overview of music-making in the north of England. This will locate the thesis in the geographical area of the Southern Pennines where musical performance was popular. I will then use six themes to explore the brass band's contribution to the development of working-class and regional identities. The first theme, the development of working-class cultural identity through musical performance, will be discussed over two chapters, divided chronologically. First is the development of working-class cultural identity through musical performance from 1840 to 1880, concentrating on the amateur side of banding. This was the era when many brass band traditions were invented establishing a foundation for the creation of musical identities that, through the brass band, became recognisably working class. The second chapter then explores professionalisation of aspects of the brass band movement from 1880 to 1914. This chapter will concentrate on the careers of a trio of band trainers: John Gladney (1839-1911), Alexander Owen (1851-1920) and Edwin Swift (1843-1904). I will examine how these trainers brought their own training methods to standardise brass band performance, instrumentation and sound production. The chapter will include a discussion of brass band repertoire and its association with middle-class 'art music.' How did middle-class musical tastes influence, encourage and strengthen working-class cultural identity when brass bands performed classical music?

Chapter Four will examine the influence of the rational recreation ethos on the band movement. Music was seen by many social reformers as an improving pastime that could encourage social harmony through both its performance and its appreciation. Yet, as F. M. L. Thompson argued, 'the social controllers may

propose what they wish, and if they command the necessary resources of money, influence, and authority they may set up their institutions, services, or laws; ultimately, however, it is the intended objects of control who dispose, by their responses to what is thrust at them, by accepting, rejecting, absorbing, adapting, distorting, or countering the wares on display.<sup>94</sup>

The top down middle-class rhetoric of rational recreation provided finance, guidance and figures of authority but what did the working-class bandsmen gain from these acts? Were they reciprocal or one-sided relationships? What did industrialists, and sponsoring communities, expect from their bands receiving money to represent their workplace and community, in terms of behaviour, education, morals and ethics? Did bands reject, absorb, distort or contradict the financial support that was given with the caveat of moral, educational and ethical behaviour upon its receipt?

Chapter five will examine the bandsmen as 'working men'. Bandsmen had become secure in their performance practice and routines. Playing a brass instrument could be a leisure pastime that lasted a lifetime. When bandsmen learnt to play they entered what was initially a homosocial environment. Over time this environment became more reliant on extended male and female support networks. As Anna Clark argued, the gender relationships found within bands were an amalgam of social relationships between men and women. Keith McClelland argues, 'discussions of working-class life, in the media, between about 1850 and the 1870s were about the "working man" who was the

---

94 F. M. L. Thompson, 'Social Control in Victorian Britain', *The Economic History Review*, 34/2 (May, 1981), p. 193.

representative artisan.<sup>95</sup> Artisans who in good trade conditions could save a little money, and through a more secure and visible trade unionism, for at least a few workers, with the expansion of friendly and Co-operative societies, and other means of collective security, became people who were secure enough to bring about a new legitimacy for the working class and its institutions in state and civil society.<sup>96</sup>

For the majority of middle-class observers, bandsmen were part of the respectable working class.<sup>97</sup> Nevertheless, bands were present in the respectable and the rough element of the class. Bandsmen, through their use of taverns for rehearsals, playing in competitions that contained rough elements and living and working in working-class communities were not immune to rough behaviour. For masculinity, the question becomes how much rough masculinity was embraced and how much respectable masculinity: courtship, marriage, family, and employment security was accepted by bandsmen as the natural progression for their lives? Were bandsmen, in spite of being practitioners of a respectable leisure pursuit, unable to escape the influence of working-class masculinity in their communities? Were they an amalgam of all aspects of working-class masculinity, made visible in a public arena? It was the social networks of bandsmen that supported their masculinity: but such support networks relied upon a large number of women. A gendered analysis of bandsmen does not just engage with the 'working man' but also with a subtler

---

95 Keith McClelland, 'Masculinity and the Representative Artisan in Britain, 1850-80', in Michael Roper and John Tosh (Eds.), *Manful Assertions Masculinities in Britain since 1800* (London: New York, 1991), p. 74.

96 McClelland, 'Masculinity and the Representative Artisan'.

97 Dave Russell argues that the popular music societies of the West Riding were conservative in nature, embracing self-respect and class collaboration. Russell, 'The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District', p. 5.

range of public and private lives that involved both men and women creating the public view of the brass band movement.

Chapter six will examine external reporting of bandsmen found in the press, music journals and other periodicals that expressed an interest in music. Having explored elements that constructed identity within bands, the analysis moves to how bandsmen and bands were viewed by external commentators. Did the identity constructed within the brass band movement reinforce Victorian and Edwardian notions of the working class at leisure? How did this discourse strengthen, or contradict, the bands' internal construction of working-class identity? Arguably more importantly, by examining the brass band periodicals' articles and correspondence, I can examine what bandsmen thought of this writing. Did external reportage of the band movement reflect their own views of themselves?

The final chapter brings together aspects of working-class identity explored so far as an amalgam of representations of the north viewed from the outside, by national newspapers, magazines and journals and from the inside, band periodicals, local newspapers, diaries and local autobiographies. One important aspect of this analysis will be to consider the way in which the brass band came to be seen as an expression of the industrial north, which expressed ideas of labour, industry, community, hardiness and work ethic. In opposition, bands from the south were viewed as unsuccessful because they did not have the traits found in northern bands. Therefore, this final chapter brings together the strands that have been present throughout the thesis in an analysis of why bands were perceived as an expression of working-class northernness.



In this thesis I argue that the distinctiveness of Southern Pennine brass bands was a result of reporting, both in brass band periodicals, and in external sources, that resulted in the construction and expression of class and regional identity through a popular and national working-class leisure pursuit.

## **Music-Making in the North of England: An Overview of the Creation of a Musical Region**

In its August 1907 editorial the *British Bandsman* argued that the brass band contest had developed elements of education, musical performance and musical democracy that had 'removed from us the stigma of being accredited an unmusical nation, and has stimulated unusual musical activity on every hand.'<sup>1</sup>

To argue that the brass band movement was the overpowering element in creating a musical nation was an audacious statement. Nevertheless, as this thesis argues, this boldness was not without some justification.

The periodical's defensive tone was understandable. European and particularly German reporting of England being *Das Land Ohne Musik* was something that British Victorian and Edwardian music lovers had worried about for decades. The roots of this reputation lay in the reports of the poet and satirist Heinrich Heine (1797-1856) when he travelled through England in 1827. In 1840, he told a French newspaper that, 'these people [the English] have no ear, neither for the beat nor indeed for music in any form, and their unnatural passion for piano-playing and singing is all the more disgusting. There is [...] nothing on earth so terrible as English musical composition, except English painting.'<sup>2</sup> This

---

1 *British Bandsman*, XX / 283 (3 August, 1907), p. 301.

2 *Pariser Berichte* (29 July, 1840), cited in, Richard Taruskin, 'The Symphony Goes (Inter)National', *The Oxford History of Western Music* (Online Edition) <<http://www.oxfordwesternmusic.com.libaccess.hud.ac.uk/view/Volume3/actrade-978019538433-div1-014009.xml>> accessed, 15 May, 2012.

theme was expanded by the German organist and music scholar Carl Engel (1818-1882), a friend of Friedrich Engels. In 1866, Engel published a monograph called *An Introduction to the Study of National Music* (London, 1866), which was a loose survey of folk-song collections from around the world, scattered with his own observations. The English, he asserted, had developed their notable folk-songs by borrowing themes from other countries, the English were more likely to adopt a foreign tune as their own than the Germans. He wrote, 'the rural population of England appear to sing less than those of most other European countries.'<sup>3</sup> He did concede that his information had been gathered from insignificant sources, and that towns a long way from the large urban centres must have preserved songs that had been passed down over the generations, he also noted that these melodies had not been collected by outsiders.<sup>4</sup> The notion that the country was unmusical became engrained in the musical consciousness of the English in 1904 when the German philosopher Oscar Adolf Hermann Schmitz published his treatise on English social problems called *Das Land Ohne Musik* (1904). For Schmitz the unmusicality of the English was a subtext for more perceived basic social deficiencies: their unimaginative personalities; their selfishness and their lack of empathy, which, he argued, made them such good imperialists.<sup>5</sup>

How was it that England had developed this dismal musical reputation?

By the eighteenth century, London had become an international centre for credit,

---

<sup>3</sup> Carl Engel, *An Introduction to the Study of National Music, Comprising Researches into Popular Songs, Traditions and Customs* (London, 1866), p. 176.

<sup>4</sup> Engel, *An Introduction to the Study of National Music*, p. 176.

<sup>5</sup> Oscar A. H. Schmitz, *Das Land Ohne Musik: Englische Gesellschaftsprobleme* (Munich 1904, this edition 1914) p. 30, cited in, Richard Taruskin, 'The Symphony Goes (Inter)National'.

trade and commerce.<sup>6</sup> The capital attracted major composers and performers that Richard Taruskin argues had a crushing impact on domestic, and more pointedly, provincial talent.<sup>7</sup> In the eighteenth century there was Handel, whose *Messiah* became perhaps the defining performance piece of the amateur choral society in the nineteenth century, followed by Johann Christian Bach. In the nineteenth century there were other musical visitors including Weber and Mendelssohn. In this way, London became a centre for international talent and, as a result, it was not surprising that English composers felt their skills were ineffective against such international reputations. By the end of the nineteenth century the main composers influencing the English were Brahms, Dvořák, Liszt and Wagner. It has been argued that Sir Hubert Parry (1848-1918) and Sir Charles Villiers Stanford (1852-1924) could not compete with non-English composers because their amateur status as gentlemen left them musically unadventurous. It was not until the emergence of Edward Elgar (1857-1934) that English music was perceived to halt its terminal decline.<sup>8</sup>

Therefore, when the *British Bandsman* argued that it was the brass band movement that had made the nation musical they were contemplating the mainly amateur musicianship of brass bands. This amateur music-making also existed in strength amongst choirs, wind and military bands and orchestras, together with more esoteric groups such as hand-bell ringers and accordion bands. Some commentators felt that it was provincial amateur musicians that helped construct musical reputations, and that they were the main defence the country had

---

<sup>6</sup> See, for example, Linda Colley, *Britons: Forging the Nation, 1707-1837* (New Haven: London), pp. 56-70.

<sup>7</sup> Taruskin, 'The Symphony Goes (Inter)National'.

<sup>8</sup> Taruskin, 'The Symphony Goes (Inter)National'.

against these barbs of being unmusical. *The Times* argued, in 1885, that the bands and choirs that performed at the International Inventions Exhibition proved that, 'as a nation, we were musically superior, at least in terms of amateur performances, to the French and Germans, in particular, the terrible visitation which the country of Beethoven sends to our shores in the shape of the typical German band.'<sup>9</sup> This chapter, then, explores music making in the north of England not only as an illustration of its regional strength but also its contribution to national music-making.

## The Musical North

The north is an astonishing jumble of ill-defined geographical and imaginary borders. Defining these borders has stimulated academic debate.<sup>10</sup> Within this debate the Southern Pennines became central in the definition of the working-class bandsman and brass band. The bandsmen of this area became highly visible representations of the town that was a culmination of a long northern musical tradition. Martin Stokes draws our attention to how we need, when

---

9 *The Times* (17 February 1885). The 'German Band' was a nineteenth-century term that described a group of buskers, whose ensemble was largely a mixture of brass and woodwind instruments, that played in the streets of most large cities, but were most noticeable in London. The antipathy that *The Times* expressed was part of a larger dislike of street music throughout the capital. In *London Labour and the London Poor* (1861) Henry Mayhew noticed that the German Band was made up of German brass players, but, importantly, he estimated that there were upward of one-thousand street musicians of many nationalities plying their trade in the capital, including English violin-players, French hurdy-gurdy players, Italian street entertainers and many English percussionists and minstrels-singers, as well as musicians from India and the United States. The German Band came to represent, for many commentators, a larger problem with the seemingly constant cacophony of noise that was street music. Writing in 1898, *The Minim: A Musical Magazine for Everybody*, summed up the situation of street music thus, 'unknown to the medical faculty [...] there are at the present time two contagious "diseases" rampant of the most virulent type. I may describe them respectively as *The Bazaar Fever* and the *Barrel Organ* and *German Band Mania*.' [Source *The Minim: A Musical Magazine for Everybody*, 5/52 (January 1898), p. 97.

10 For academic debate about the borders of the north see Helen Jewell, *The North-South Divide. The Origins of Northern Consciousness in England* (Manchester, 1994); Dave Russell, *Looking North: Northern England and The National Imagination* (Manchester, 2000); Stuart Rawnsley, 'Constructing "The North": space and a sense of place,' in, Neville Kirk (Ed.), *Northern Identities, Historical Interpretations of 'The North' and Northernness* (Aldershot, 2000); Graham Turner, *The North Country* (London, 1967) and Katie Wales, *Northern English: A Social and Cultural History* (Cambridge, 2006).

constructing musical identity, 'to be able to question how music is used by social actors in specific local situations, to erect boundaries, to maintain distinctions between us and them'.<sup>11</sup> The north contained all classes and cultures, nevertheless, as industrialisation progressed, working-class musicianship began to gain ascendancy and become noticed as a cultural identity, this identity became fixed in the manufacturing districts of the Southern Pennines.

The east Lancashire town of Bacup, for example, is typical of the number of musical groups that could coexist in a small area.<sup>12</sup> From 1840 onwards the town had a brass band, a choral society, a hand-bell ringing group and an orchestral society.<sup>13</sup> In addition Bacup was the headquarters of the Rossendale Branch of the Lancashire Association of Campanologists.<sup>14</sup> Like Bacup, Slaithwaite, in the Colne Valley, was an example of the musical life replicated throughout the Pennines, and was indicative of music's popularity in that region. In 1819, Slaithwaite Old Band formed and was active until 1822.<sup>15</sup> In the 1850s, surviving members of the Slaithwaite Old Band were playing with the Slaithwaite Union Band.<sup>16</sup> Slaithwaite Victoria Band was a brass and reed band formed in 1840; they were active between 1856 and 1872.<sup>17</sup> Prominent from 1898 was Upper Slaithwaite Brass Band.<sup>18</sup> More tellingly, it is revealed that at a local level some musicians were growing tired of the restricted nature of choral music in the area. The *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* wrote, 'why not form a

---

11 Martin Stokes (Ed.), 'Introduction', in, *Ethnicity and Identity: The Musical Construction of Place* (Oxford, 1994), p. 6.

12 In 1851, Bacup had a population of, 10,315; 1861, 10,935; 1871, 17,199; 1881, 25,034 and 1891, 23,498. (Source: Official Census, cited in, Jeanette Edwards, *Ordinary People: A Study of Factors Affecting Communication in the Provision of Services*. (PhD Thesis, University of Manchester, 1990), p. 22.

13 Kenneth F. Bowden (Ed.), *A Bacup Miscellany* (Bacup, 1972), p. 207.

14 *Campanology* (16 September 1896), p. 5.

15 *Huddersfield Chronicle and West Yorkshire Advertiser* (14 June, 1851).

16 *Huddersfield Chronicle and West Yorkshire Advertiser* (14 June, 1851).

17 *Huddersfield Chronicle and West Yorkshire Advertiser* (6 February, 1856-11 May, 1872).

18 *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (17 April, 1898).

philharmonic orchestra - musicians are tired of *Messiah* - it is like the poor, always with us.'<sup>19</sup> By 1900, however, such calls were ineffective, choral music being the most popular musical activity for the town. Slaithwaite boasted four choral societies, a brass band and an amateur orchestra.<sup>20</sup> In this way, throughout the Southern Pennines, amateur musicians constructed musical identities that were not centred on the professional networks found in London. Towns such as Bacup and Slaithwaite were typical of the communities in the Southern Pennines where brass bands thrived. Edward Elgar, for example, recognised this strength of amateur musicianship outside London, when he wrote a flattering letter to the organiser of Morecambe Music Festival, in 1903, that 'someday the press will awake to the fact, already known abroad, and to some few of us, that the living centre of music in Great Britain is not London, but somewhat farther north.'<sup>21</sup>

### **An Area of Varied Musical Activity: Singing**

Singing was one of the earliest forms of music making, part-singing being common in the north of England since at least the thirteenth century. Writing in the *Musical Herald*, in 1918, Henry Coward highlighted the cathedrals and minsters of the north in establishing early musical traditions. He wrote, 'It is known that for centuries Yorkshire has kept the flame of high and holy song brightly burning by means of her grand sacred fanes - York, Ripon, Selby [and]

---

<sup>19</sup> *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News*, (21 January, 1898).

<sup>20</sup> Dave Russell, *Popular Music in England 1840-1914* (Manchester, 1987, this edition, 1991), p. 208.

<sup>21</sup> Letter to the organiser of the Morecambe Music Festival, Canon Gorton, quoted in *Musical Times*, July 1903, cited in, Russell, *Looking North*, p. 207.

Beverley.<sup>22</sup> For the purposes of this thesis we need only be aware that with the beginnings of industrialisation there developed a musical trait amongst labouring people that was noticed by commentators who took an active interest in reporting on the lives of working people. This early musicianship fixed Southern Pennine brass bands at the end of a long tradition of music-making in the area. Writing in 1850, Charles Dickens noticed this long musical tradition, writing that:

In some of the northern counties, particularly Yorkshire and Lancashire, the inhabitants have from time immemorial been remarkable for skill in vocal harmony, and for their knowledge of the old part-music of the English school. As these districts have gradually become the seats of manufacturers, the same musical habits have been kept up; among the growing population; and so salutary have these habits been found - so conducive to order; temperance and industry - that many great manufacturers have encouraged them by furnishing to their work people the means of musical instruction.<sup>23</sup>

Music was part of an education that was an autodidactic tradition for working people from the beginning of industrialisation. E. P. Thompson argued that, 'every weaving district had its weaver poets, biologists, mathematicians, musicians, geologists and botanists.'<sup>24</sup> J. Marshall Mather noticed this trait in 1844, writing in his *Rosendale Rambles* about his '*Half an Hour With a Factory Botanist*'. He clearly had a pre-conceived impression of the autodidact that developed from the images portrayed by novelists and poets:

Factory life in Lancashire seems in some few cases to have quickened the instincts of the operative for the beautiful. Occasionally in my wanderings I have met with those who, while mostly shut up in their mills, spend most of their spare moments shut up in the cloughs and up on the moors, in search of plants, or fern, and other botanical specimens.

---

<sup>22</sup> Henry Coward, 'Yorkshire and Music: A New Assessment of The Divine Art', *Musical Herald*, (April, 1918), p. 332.

<sup>23</sup> Charles Dickens, 'Music in Humble Life', *Household Words*, 1/7 (11 May, 1850), p. 161.

<sup>24</sup> E.P. Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class* (London, 1963, this edition 1980), pp. 297-298.



Long before my residence in Rossendale, I was familiar with these characters on paper and in books. Mrs. Gaskell and Edwin Waugh had introduced them to me.<sup>25</sup>

Accounts, reminiscences and early articles about music-making in this area lean naturally towards the rose-tinted and sentimental. Nevertheless, as Roger Elbourne maintained, these accounts shed light onto an area where extended accounts of musical life in handloom weaving communities are rare.<sup>26</sup> Moreover, music and weaving begin to link the nostalgia of musical performance with the nostalgia often found with early industrial work. E. P. Thompson saw the problem behind these recollections, writing, 'If we set up the ninepin of a golden age it is not difficult to knock it down: weaving was a national occupation, but the memories of better times remain and are strongest in Lancashire and Yorkshire.'<sup>27</sup> Importantly, for the development of musical performance, it was noticed that amateurs copied each other's musical habits. An early example of this can be found when, writing in 1829, about the education and amusements of the lower classes, the *Mirror of Literature, Amusement and Instruction* listed three elements in workers' lives where amateurs copied each other. Music was part of a wide selection of leisure pursuits for working people, yet, early in the industrial era; it was the manufacturing districts that could claim to be the most musical area. The journal highlighted 'the taste for flowers among the Paisley weavers, for gooseberry-growing at Manchester, and for music among the

---

25 J. Marshall Mather, *Rambles around Rossendale* (Darwen, 1844, this edition, 1850), p. 155.

26 Roger Elbourne, *Music and Tradition in Early Industrial Lancashire* (Woodbridge, 1980), p. 28.

27 Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class*, pp. 297-298.

Lancashire or Yorkshire clothiers, that originally sprang up from imitation of one or two amateurs of each pursuit.<sup>28</sup>

Writing in 1844, Samuel Bamford (1788-1882), a Manchester radical, journalist and author, pointed out that musical performance was emerging as a trait that defined the cultural lives of the area.<sup>29</sup> He wrote that the working people of South Lancashire were:

The greatest of readers, can show the greatest numbers of good writers, the greatest numbers of sensible and considerate public speakers. They can show a great number of botanists; a great number of horticulturalists; a great number who are acquainted with the [...] sciences; the greatest number of poets, and greater number of musicians, whether choral or instrumental.<sup>30</sup>

Before industrialisation it was accepted that the countryside had a folk culture that depended upon oral transmission of culture.<sup>31</sup> Writing in 1831 the *Bolton Chronicle* argued that oral traditions were still strong in rural areas of Lancashire, writing, 'sentiment is now propagated amongst the agricultural population by viva-voce communication from farm-to-farm, from parish-to-parish on their daily or Sunday meetings, in the same manner as better the invention of printing'.<sup>32</sup> Every village had an oral collection of well-known songs, many never printed. Singing was the pastime of the weaver at work, particularly the weaver working from home. Moses Heap (1824-1913) was a textile worker, historian and commentator on life in the Rossendale Valley. He wrote about weavers in the 1820s that 'many of [his family's] friends were so fond of singing and fiddling that

---

28 *Mirror of Literature, Amusement and Instruction*, 13/168 (2 May, 1829), p. 303.

29 See Peter Spence, 'Bamford Samuel (1788-1882)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*(Oxford),2004, online edition, (2009)< [www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/1256](http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/1256), accessed 16 January 2013 >

30 Samuel Bamford, *Walks in South Lancashire, On its Borders with Letters, Descriptions Narratives and Observations, Current and Incidental* (Manchester, 1844), pp.13-14.

31 M. Sanderson, 'Social Change and Elementary Education in Industrial Lancashire, 1780-1840', *Northern History*, 3 (1968), pp. 130-154.

32 *Bolton Chronicle* (26 February, 1861).

their looms would be idle until about Tuesday night, then they would work day and night to get their allotted work finished by Saturday.<sup>33</sup> When weavers took their cloth to market, evidence, however sentimental, suggested that these people practiced singing not only to improve their vocal technique, but also to perfect instrumental skills. Also evident was that workers had an acquaintance with the orchestral repertoire. J. Marshall Mather wrote:

The click of the shuttle from the open windows of chambers where hand-loom stood was accompanied by quaint trolls of song [...]. With bent form the old weaver might be seen creeping towards Bacup with his piece across his shoulders, leaning heavily upon his stout staff, or returning with lighter step and lighter heart, with warps and wage, humming out some tune or overture which in his spare moments he sought to master on his instrument or with his voice.<sup>34</sup>

As industrialisation developed it brought people together in more permanent workplaces leading to group singing. In the Yorkshire woollen districts women workers were said to alternate between gossiping and singing hymns whilst working in the burling sheds.<sup>35</sup> Another place to sing was the home. Reginald Nettel maintained that it was the Pennine weavers' harsh living conditions that brought people together because they needed to save money on candles and fuel for heating. This, he argued, that led to people meeting in each other's houses, taking single song lines and turning them into harmonised pieces.<sup>36</sup> When handloom weaving declined the weavers did struggle but Nettel read too much into the hardship of weaving life.<sup>37</sup> Nettel's view does not sit with the early

---

33 Moses Heap, *An Old Man's Memories* n.d. (typescript Rawtenstall Library, 1970), p. 4.

34 J. Marshall Mather, *Rosendale Rambles*, p. 39.

35 J. Lawson, *Letters to the Young on Progress in Pudsey During the Last Sixty Years* (Stanningley, 1887), pp. 33-34, cited in, Hugh McLeod, *Religion and Society in England, 1850-1914* (Basingstoke, 1996), p. 105.

36 Reginald Nettel, 'The influence of the Industrial Revolution on English Music', *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association*, seventy-second session, 1945 -1946, p. 25.

37 Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class*, pp. 313-323.

prosperity of weaving communities, people would come together just for the pleasure and sociability of making music. Writing in 1838, for example, W. Gardiner saw that, 'he [the weaver] had a week-day suit of clothes and one for Sundays and plenty of leisure.'<sup>38</sup>

The social interaction that Nettel highlighted led to people coming together in more public venues to sing together. Alfred Peel recognised that at Goodshawfold in the Rossendale Valley, long before the Goodshawfold Brass Band was formed, in 1867 that singing in public at an informal social occasion was a common practice. He wrote:

The young men of the village would gather together on the bridge spanning the river Lummey or Limey and on a fine summer evening you could see five or six couples sitting aside the bridge parapets busily engaged in the game of draughts, having cut squares into the top stones using cinders and small clinkers for pegs [...]. They would play until darkness came then they would gather together and sing old fashioned glees and the old hymn tunes and songs which sounded grand on a quiet summer night.<sup>39</sup>

Nationally a formal choral tradition established itself quickly. The formal expression of this was the Three Choirs Festival, based in turn at the cathedrals of Gloucester, Worcester and Hereford. The early origins of the festival are unclear. In 1713, the *Worcester Postman* reported a special service of 'Mr. Purcell's great *Te Deum*, with the Symphonies and instrumental parts, on violins and Hautboys.' By 1719, it was seen, in the same newspaper, that the festival was a 'yearly musical assembly'.<sup>40</sup> This early choral tradition developed in the Southern Pennine town of Halifax, which held a triennial music festival from 1796

---

38 W. Gardiner, *Music and Friends* (London, 1838), p. 43, cited in, Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class*, p. 297.

39 Alfred Peel, *Crawshawbooth and District* (Rawtenstall, 1960), p. 95.

40 Watkins Shaw and John C. Phillips, 'Three Choirs Festival', *Grove Music Online*, *Oxford Music Online* <<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/279013>>, p. 1.

to 1830. The Halifax Choral Society, formed in 1817, is believed to be the oldest choral society in the country, formed fifteen years before the York Choral Society and twenty years before the Huddersfield Choral Society. The Society's debut concert was on the 9 February 1819, when it performed Haydn's *Creation*.<sup>41</sup> Therefore the choral tradition was established in the Southern Pennines in the early nineteenth century.

Choral societies were popular among people from a wide range of backgrounds. As the nineteenth century progressed they clearly attracted a working-class membership. By the later nineteenth century choirs belonged to every conceivable working-class organisation.<sup>42</sup>

It is worth examining the Mossley Vocal Society as a case study of singing groups in the late nineteenth century. The town is useful as a representation of singing in the north because before it became a borough in 1885 it straddled the boundaries of Lancashire, the West Riding of Yorkshire and Cheshire. In 1895, the *Musical Herald* noticed that the population of Mossley reflected the population of other towns in the Southern Pennines in terms of population size and employment.<sup>43</sup> Mossley was typical of industry in the area, since weaving was originally carried out in cottages, and then moved to mills and factories as industry grew. It had transportation links with the Huddersfield Narrow Canal and later the railway.<sup>44</sup> As with many Southern Pennine towns it also had a number of musical groups, including the Mossley Brass Band, which took part in contests

---

41 Rachel Cowgill, "'The Most Musical Spot for its Size in the Kingdom': Music in Georgian Halifax", *Early Music*, 28 (2000) p. 357.

42 Russell, *Popular Music in England 1840-1914*, p. 173.

43 *Musical Herald*, 572 (1 November, 1895), p. 328.

44 *Mossley.net* <[www.mossley.net/history.htm](http://www.mossley.net/history.htm)> accessed, 10 May, 2012.

and civic functions, such as the opening of the Mossley Mechanics Institute in 1859.<sup>45</sup>

The Mossley Vocal Society was formed in 1884, and one of the founders, John Shaw, was also the conductor.<sup>46</sup> In 1891, the society began to train for contests and quickly became successful; by 1894 they had won three first prizes in contests in Leeds and Manchester. In November 1895 they were planning to hold a contest in their home town.<sup>47</sup> There were sixty members, although for contests they were only allowed to enter thirty five. As a general rule they met to practice once a week but in the contest season would meet twice a week. Their practice room was a large space in what was once a weaver's cottage, where they kept a library of around sixty part-songs. The repertoire was indicative of the repertoire of brass bands at this time and contained the standard larger pieces for choral societies. There was, for example, Birch's *Robin Hood*, Balfe's *The Bohemian Girl*, together with the ever-present pieces by Handel: *Elijah*, *Judas Maccabaeus* and *Messiah*. Almost all the members of the society were employed in the town's wool or cotton mills.<sup>48</sup>

Although Mossley Vocal Society was composed entirely of working-class members, from the 1820s onwards, as choirs grew in popularity, they could contain members of both the working class and the middle class. Clearly the larger the town the wider social networks there were to call upon for membership of musical societies. Bradford Musical Friendly Society and the Bradford

---

<sup>45</sup> *Huddersfield Chronicle and West Yorkshire Advertiser* (30 April, 1859).

<sup>46</sup> *Musical Herald*, pp. 328-329. All chronological history about The Mossley Vocal Society comes from this article.

<sup>47</sup> In June the same year Mossley Brass Band hosted a local competition that had entrants from Rawtenstall, Denton and Saddleworth, source: *Huddersfield Chronicle and West Yorkshire Advertiser* (29 June, 1895)

<sup>48</sup> *Musical Herald*, p. 328.

Philharmonic had members whose occupations were the owner of a vitriol works, the manager of a textile factory, an artist, an attorney's clerk, an architect and Bradford's Inspector of Weights and Measures.<sup>49</sup>

In this way, the choral societies became a popular pastime for working people in the north, which culminated in large prominent concerts in the key cities. In the 1840s, for example, Manchester Choral Society gave approximately eight concerts of choral music throughout the season. The membership, numbering seventy people, was just over size of Mossley Vocal Union.<sup>50</sup> Its repertoire was narrow, the singing was enthusiastic and skilled, if only in terms of volume and accuracy, and for some commentators part-singing was attractive because it did not require any expenditure on instruments. In 1896 the *Manchester Guardian* wrote:

If we turn to the working class of Manchester, and the surrounding districts, we find an abundant love of music, and a fairly advanced culture. It is limited in range; it knows not Wagner, and Handel is its supreme object of worship. One is struck, too, with a similar limitation in direction [...]. Handel's "*Messiah*" is the favorite work. To hear a good Lancashire choir go through some of Handel's choruses, or Mozart's masses, the sopranos ringing out, as though they would take the roof off, and the different parts coming in at their 'leads' like the crack of a rifle, is a thing not soon to be forgotten[...]. Only Yorkshire can show such clear trumpet-like sopranos, such deep strong basses, and such full-throated contraltos as Lancashire [...]. There is no kind of music so admirably adapted for the poor man's home as part-singing. Orchestral instruments are expensive: the voice costs nothing, and part-music is cheap.<sup>51</sup>

---

49 William Cudworth, *Music in Bradford* (Bradford, 1885), pp. 7-16.

50 Horace Heartwell, 'Characteristics of Manchester', *The North of England Magazine and Bradshaw's Journal of Politics, Literature, Science and Art*, 2/13 (February, 1843), p. 233.

51 *Manchester Guardian* (1 May, 1896).

## Music as an Accessible Pastime

Singing was the cheapest way to perform music but with the development of production-line techniques instruments became affordable and durable. This led to many of the working-class population of the Southern Pennines having access to instruments. In Huddersfield, in 1896, for example, there were forty-six music retailers and in Halifax there were eighteen.<sup>52</sup> The rise in the popularity of the piano further helped make music popular and as the retail price of the piano decreased it made the instrument accessible to people of all classes.<sup>53</sup>

As early as 1845, for example, the *British Minstrel and Musical and Literary Miscellany* was reporting on the publication of a compendium of sheet music called: *Hamilton's Cabinet of Music for Piano-Forte and Organ*.<sup>54</sup> According to the journal this collection would bring music within reach of the working class, claiming that it would 'be eminently useful in spreading abroad, at a cheap rate, music of a kind that the working classes had no way of procuring.'<sup>55</sup> The volume was in two parts, 'one of which will contain selections from the oratorios, and other sacred compositions, with piano and organ accompaniment.'<sup>56</sup> The second section would contain standard classic songs and duets.<sup>57</sup> It is not known whether the collection sold well. Nevertheless, the editors were confident enough to publish, suggesting that enough working-class

---

52 Adrian Smith, *An Improbable Centenary: The Life and Times of The Slaithwaite Philharmonic Orchestra, 1891-1900* (Huddersfield, 1990), p. 9.

53 Peter C. Patrikis, *Piano Roles: Three Hundred Years of Life With the Piano* (Yale, 1999), p. 151.

54 *British Minstrel and Musical and Literary Miscellany*, 3/81 (January, 1845), p. 153.

55 *British Minstrel and Musical and Literary Miscellany*, p. 153.

56 *British Minstrel and Musical and Literary Miscellany*, p. 154.

57 *British Minstrel and Musical and Literary Miscellany*, p. 154.



people had access to a piano to perform the music and a number of these pianos would be in homes where music was a popular pastime.

By 1865, the piano had a dominant role in middle-class drawing room music.<sup>58</sup> In 1872 the *Monthly Musical Record* reflected that, 'at no time, probably, in the history of music has the piano been so popular as at the present day.'<sup>59</sup> They said, 'modern improvements in the processes of manufacture have enabled the makers to produce really respectable instruments at comparatively very low prices; so that except among the poor, it is almost the exception rather than the rule to find a house without a piano.'<sup>60</sup> This production of pianos coincided with a peak in economic prosperity for the working class. Eric Hobsbawm argued that in the boom of 1872-1873, 'some workers actually earned enough to afford for a brief moment the luxuries which employers regarded as their right, indignation [at this prosperity] was sincere and heartfelt. What business had coal-miners with grand pianos and champagne?'<sup>61</sup>

Three things affected the material conditions of the working class: from 1873-1896, the fall in the cost of living, the rise of the domestic mass market for factory-produced goods, and, after 1875, the expansion and development of rows of terraced housing: a result of the so-called 'by-law housing' (under section 157 of the public health act).<sup>62</sup> As Eric Hobsbawm argued, 'all implied or were

---

58 Derek B. Scott, 'Music and Social Class in Victorian London', *Urban History*, 29/1 (2002), p. 62.

59 *Monthly Musical Record* (1 July, 1872), p. 93.

60 The *Monthly Musical Record* estimated that 23,000 pianos a year were produced in London alone and that the publication of sheet music was incalculable, p. 93.

61 Eric Hobsbawm, *The Age of Capital, 1848-1875* (London, 1977, this edition, 1980), p. 256.

62 Eric Hobsbawm, 'The Making of the Working Class, 1870-1914', in, Eric Hobsbawm, *Uncommon People Resistance, Rebellion and Jazz* (London, 1998, this edition, 1999), p. 85.

based on the modest, patchy but plainly undeniable improvement in the standard of life of British workers.’<sup>63</sup>

In spite of Hobsbawm’s observation that the coal-miners’ prosperity resulted in antipathy from some of the middle classes, the overriding aspect was that the working class benefited from the self-improving nature of music. In 1873, the *Manchester Guardian* reported on the relative prosperity and home life of colliers in Wigan. The piece reflected that the competition for labour in the area had increased the wages for the colliers in south-west Lancashire above the norm, reporting that skilled colliers could earn ten shillings for an eight-hour day.<sup>64</sup> The average wages for skilled workers at the time were five and six shillings a day, a good collier could earn three-pounds a week.<sup>65</sup> There was some discussion that the negligent worker would spend this money on alcohol, resulting in neglect of the home; nevertheless, the paper also recognised that there were a significant number of respectable colliers who took pride in their homes. The paper’s correspondent wrote:

Easy chairs and pianos speak of more than ordinary refinement in several colliers’ homes [...]. Collier lads are the best customers of the local music sellers for concertinas, flutinas, and violins. Even the tip-girls, their uncouth garb removed, and dressed as becomes modest women, buy sheet music.<sup>66</sup>

Moreover, the piano could be paid for in instalments. One Wigan innkeeper was known for buying pianos at trade prices and then accepting monthly payments from colliers. The *Manchester Guardian* summed up by saying, ‘is it not better

---

63 Hobsbawm, ‘The Making of the Working Class, 1870-1914’, p. 85.

64 *Manchester Guardian* (18 April, 1873).

65 *Manchester Guardian* (18 April, 1873).

66 *Manchester Guardian* (18 April, 1873).

that a man should buy a piano than spend his money in drink, or on 'dawgs', or in betting on horse races?'<sup>67</sup>

The spread of the piano in working-class homes and communal spaces outlived the boom of 1872-73. By the late nineteenth century pianos were common in prosperous working-class homes. Writing in 1893 the *Musical Herald* said the West Riding of Yorkshire was where 'the people are notoriously attached to music.'<sup>68</sup> They reported that:

Very few homes are without some kind of instrument. Pianos, harmoniums and American organs are as common as washing machines; the instruments, as a rule, are very costly and of a first-class make. You would be surprised when passing the humble dwellings of the miners, the quarrymen, or the factory hands, to hear the intelligent rendering given to the works of our grand old masters.<sup>69</sup>

In the north of England the music trade press noticed that Blackpool had a demand for pianos, and other musical instruments, on which to perform popular tunes in communal areas. For pianos this demand was driven by the number of boarding houses in the area, suggesting that music was a popular pastime for holiday makers when in lodgings. Writing in 1901, the *Musical Opinion and Trade Review* noticed that:

Blackpool is quiet during the winter months. The piano and organ business is, however, one of the few businesses, which manage to maintain an air of vitality during the winter months[...]. There is a respectable working population, which is interested in music[...]. They buy pianos and organs, mandolins and banjos, and boarding houses have a considerable demand for rental pianos.<sup>70</sup>

---

67 *Manchester Guardian* (18 April, 1873).

68 *Musical Herald* (2 October, 1893), Vol 547, p. 293.

69 *Musical Herald*, p. 293.

70 'Music Trade in Northern England', *Musical Opinion and Trade Review*, 24/282 (March, 1901), p. 429.

Therefore, elements of affordability, access and popularity meant that musical performance on instruments became commonplace and was even found in the outlying farms of the Pennines. Moses Heap's commentary shows us that music was played not just on the piano, but also there was a selection of musical instruments in houses. He wrote:

In my young days, I spent many a pleasant hour at a farmhouse named 'New Laithe', about a mile beyond Loveclough, there lived there the family of Hudson, generations of which had been in the forefront of anything musical in the surrounding districts [...]. The house was a musical depot [...]. He George Hudson was a great lover of music and had various kinds of musical instruments. There I could hear two pianos played at the same time, also one or two violins [...]. I was truly pleased to hear the son, George, playing the piano on one side of the house and Sister Esther playing on the other side<sup>71</sup>

This piece also showed that music-making was not confined to the brass bands and choral groups. Throughout 1883, William Millington wrote pieces in the *Eccles and Patricroft Journal*, called *Sketches of Local Musicians and Musical Societies* later published as a book.<sup>72</sup> Richard Berry, for example, of Walkden, was an apprentice shoemaker and learned to play not only the violin, but also the viola.<sup>73</sup> Players like Berry would have played in chapel bands, which were important groups in educating local instrumentalists before the bands began to decline after mid century.<sup>74</sup> William Millington saw chapel bands as schools of music, not only developing instrumental and vocal technique, but also music theory, he wrote:

The chapel choir, with its excellent small band formed a very good school for the study of both vocal and instrumental music. Many of its members were handloom weavers who

---

71 Moses Heap of Rossendale, *My Life and Times (1824-1913)*, transcribed, in 1961, by Jon Elliot, held in Rawtenstall Community History Library (n.p.).

72 William Millington, *Sketches of Local Musicians and Musical Societies* (Pendlebury, 1884).

73 Millington, in, the *Eccles and Patricroft Journal* (28 September, 1883).

74 A guide to church music in the immediate pre-industrial period is, Christopher Dearnley, *English Church Music, 1650-1750* (Oxford, 1970).

made music a special study. Many of them were very good copyists, and by this means, and constant practice, became good performers, and had a large experience and knowledge of Handel's music[...].Thirty six had some connection with weaving - one treble, four counter-tenor, three alto, six tenor, one baritone and nine bass voices. There were six violinists, four viola players, three cellists, two clarinettists, five bassoonists and one French horn player.<sup>75</sup>

Even though chapel bands declined, the working-class membership of orchestras that developed later in the century should not be underestimated. Brass bands and choirs dominated the area but orchestras had a notable presence in the region. In October 1896, the *Orchestral Times and Bandsmen*, devoted considerable space to the Rothwell Orchestral Society, centred on a pit village in the south-east of Leeds, which included thirteen miners (four violins, viola, cello, double bass, two cornets, two horns, two trombones) and a quarryman (first violin).<sup>76</sup> Elsewhere in the industrial heartlands the formation of orchestras was following the same pattern. The Slaithwaite Philharmonic Orchestral Society, for example, was formed in 1891, initially from a small group of working-class members that had an ambition to form an 'orchestral band.'<sup>77</sup> In 1869, Todmorden Harmonic Society and Todmorden Musical Union amalgamated to form the Todmorden Musical Society, and became Todmorden Orchestra in 1915.<sup>78</sup>

The environment provided by amateur orchestras produced local musicians who were not only accomplished performers, but also composers, arrangers, charity fundraisers and musical directors. Thomas Parkinson of Dixon

---

<sup>75</sup> *Eccles and Patricroft Journal* (19 October, 1883).

<sup>76</sup> Russell, *Popular Music in England*, p. 197.

<sup>77</sup> Smith, *An Improbable Centenary*, pp. 1-2.

<sup>78</sup> *Todmorden Orchestra* < [www.todmordenorchestra.org.uk/History.htm](http://www.todmordenorchestra.org.uk/History.htm) > accessed, 1 October, 2011.

Green was a collier who played the violin. He wrote several pieces of music performed by Farnworth Orchestra.<sup>79</sup> Rodger Farnworth of Worsley was said to be a clever trade warper, well read in history, literature and biography. He also learned to play the violin, viola and cello and became a choirmaster at Montop Chapel.<sup>80</sup> George Minshull, of Pendlebury, a collier, who was a cellist with Pendlebury Philharmonic Society, was described as 'a civil and well-mannered man who was always ready to render assistance at concerts and other musical events in aid of charity.'<sup>81</sup> Amateur orchestras, then, had no lack of support from educated, socially aware and urbane working-class members. At the 1903 Morecambe Musical Festival, the *Musical Times* reported that, 'Nelson and Colne Orchestras held their own against all comers [...] the standard of orchestral playing could be considered high, when one remembered that the performers were mostly working men from Lancashire.'<sup>82</sup> Amateur players, then, could command musical respect.

In spite of these working-class orchestral players' successes local orchestras had to rely on professional players to bolster their ranks when large performances occurred. In the north this would often involve players from the Hallé Orchestra.<sup>83</sup> Despite the rhetoric, locally, without professionals to support them, the quality of orchestral musical performance could be patchy and attracted negative comment from observers.

---

79 Millington, in, *The Eccles and Patricroft Journal* (21 December, 1883).

80 *Eccles and Patricroft Journal* (21 December, 1883).

81 *Eccles and Patricroft Journal* (21 December, 1883).

82 *Musical Times* (1 June, 1903), p. 403.

83 David Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914: A Study of the Relationship between Music and Society* (PhD Thesis, University of York, 1979), p.182.

The final arbiters of musical performance were the listening public: what did the public in the industrial towns think of local music making? The very nature of music is to be performed, and, for many communal groups the final result of practice was to perform a concert in public, often relying upon ticket sales, or contributions, to meet the day-to-day expenses of running a group. Sometimes local people had a different view of these orchestras when professional players did not bolster the ranks. The journal the *Yorkshireman* hinted at the public attitude towards amateur players with this sketch:

Percy Gaiters and Mabel Sixbuttons are just leaving an amateur concert:

She: 'Oh hasn't it been charming Percy? Such a lovely concert!'

He: 'Ye-es; but there has been – er - rather a lot of it you know.

She: 'Oh Fi! Which did you like best the duet, or the violin solo, or the piano?'

He: No-neither

She: What then Percy?

He: The intervals of course.<sup>84</sup>

Orchestras were sometimes organised by local choral societies for their larger performances. When they performed together then there was some criticism, the *Yorkshireman* wrote:

Twang! Bang! Go the fifes and the fiddles, and crash! Go the cymbals and drums, and tenors, and altos, and basses, start up with their screams and their howls. The air is filled with their chantings, their scrapings of catgut and such, their pipings, and whistling and mouthings, which may mean little or much.<sup>85</sup>

Three things may have been responsible for these poor performances. The first is a lack of balance between the sections of orchestras. The abundance of school violin lessons in the early twentieth century meant there were a large

---

<sup>84</sup> *Yorkshireman*, 19/195 (10 April, 1880), p.1.

<sup>85</sup> *Yorkshireman*, 15/352 (14 April, 1883), p.1.

number of violinists: other sections had shortages, there were particular shortages in woodwind sections.<sup>86</sup> The second problem was that a number of private music teachers had questionable skills. The *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* pointed out that:

It is essential that the musical public in West Yorkshire should be warned about the number of bogus musical institutions, examinations, and certificates, which have sprung into being in late years. In many cases, they are conducted by men of little, or no, musical status, and in every case the primary goal is money making.<sup>87</sup>

The third problem was repertoire. Shortages of sheet music restricted what orchestras could play, resulting in a great variety of standards of performance. Many orchestras never graduated beyond polkas, waltzes, and, perhaps, attempting an early Haydn symphony.<sup>88</sup> Finally, finance was an issue: orchestras did not attract the same support as brass bands. Local commentators saw that northern people had a taste for both the consumption and performance of classical music but were reluctant to pay the money to support it.<sup>89</sup> Few amateur orchestras survived the media 'revolution' of 1920s and 1930s when the gramophone, radio and cinema changed how people spent their leisure time.<sup>90</sup> The brass bands and choral societies co-existed with the new media because, being amateur institutions, they had no professional rivals. Orchestras, however talented, could not compete with the professional broadcasts and records produced with the invention of the gramophone and radio.

---

86 Russell, *Popular Music in England*, p. 197.

87 *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (30 September, 1898).

88 Russell, *Popular Music in England*, p. 197.

89 *Yorkshireman*, 9/184 (24 January, 1880), p. 4. The Leeds Music Festivals were examples of a response to this; nevertheless, amateur orchestras could never match the amount of money available to brass bands.

90 Russell, *Popular Music in England*, p. 198.



As Dave Russell maintains, it was the success of bands in the contest arena that was the most potent influence for most of this era. Local victories could mirror sporting victories in their extravagance.<sup>91</sup> Russell argues that, 'as in sport, formulaic press coverage of these often featured imagery, that, undoubtedly, captured cross-class sentiment.'<sup>92</sup> J. Hill argued that that these sporting wins 'suggested a magical resolution of the many internal tensions and conflicts that in fact beset the communities [...] offering an idealised vision of society.'<sup>93</sup> These victories could cancel out any negative behaviour with which bandsmen became involved.

The most powerful image of the musical north was displayed when the choirs and bands came together in competition. The images are of the homogenous working-class striving to represent the community. The north was the area where regional contests thrived. The *Yorkshireman* was gushing about bands when they were in a formal setting. The journal highlighted how good music was for working people and the good of the community:

The time will soon come when Bowling [Park, Bradford] will claim as well part in the musical moments, when big foundry-men will join in the game as well, and study crescendo and cadence and shake: when neath Bolling Hall the people will gad about, and hear the sweet music that Bradford goes mad about, when o'er the hillside in joy they will go, and bound like the deer, the gazelle, or the doe.<sup>94</sup>

This poem, about the Bradford Peel Park Contest, on 6 August 1881 further expresses the importance of the contest in asserting musical prowess:

---

91 Russell, *Looking North*, p. 221.

92 Russell, *Looking North*, p. 221.

93 J Hill, 'Rites of Spring: Cup Finals and Community in the North of England', in, J. Hill and J. Williams (Eds), *Sport and Identity in the North of England* (Keele, 1996), pp 106-08, cited in, Russell, *Looking North*, p. 221.

94 *Yorkshireman*, 6/108 (6 July, 1878), p. 1.

The bandsmen are all gathering on this Augustian Saturday,  
To strain cheeks and eyes, in playing for prize,  
For brass wins brass this latter day.  
Yes, brass, brass, brass, my players for brass with brass contesting,  
An example show in each puff and blow,  
All other thoughts divesting [...].  
This contest that's so playful,  
So brassy and pleasant,  
Cannot fail to attract the crowd, how'er packed,  
So mind you are present.<sup>95</sup>

Northern communities were, therefore, musical communities which recognised and were proud of their own musicianship. They made music in a wide variety of ways – the formal and informal, in choirs and choral societies, in bands and orchestras, in the park and in the home. These communities stressed the beneficial influences of music making: self-improvement, rational recreation, sobriety and communal bonding. The brass bands of the Southern Pennines emerged in a north that was energetic, enthusiastic and successful in building musical communities. Brass bands had a stable musical ancestry to build on when they began to appear from the 1830s onwards.

---

<sup>95</sup> *Yorkshireman*, 112/264 (6 August, 1881), p. 1.

## **Working-Class Cultural Identity and Musical Performance:**

### **The Southern Pennine Brass Band and the Invention of Musical Traditions**

The next two chapters explore the creation of working-class cultural identity through musical performance. Chapter one showed the north of England was an area where labouring people were often skilled musicians. The brass bands of the Southern Pennines built their reputations upon a heritage of northern labouring peoples' performance and consumption of music. This tradition meant that novice bandsmen were entering an amateur musical environment where the development of a musical skill would be encouraged and accepted.

This chapter examines how bandsmen learned to play their instruments and how through that education they entered a self-replicating method that created a musical tradition singular to the brass band movement. I will show how bandsmen created their working-class cultural identity within the practice space of the home and the bandroom. An understanding of the processes and the commonalities in that musical performance leads to an understanding of how bandsmen generated wider working-class networks that supported the band. These wider working-class networks would then reinforce the working-class identity of the brass bands when they travelled outside their practice spaces. The

roots of the clichés and metonyms of the working class and the band movement began when bandsmen came together to play music.

The way musical traditions spread can be likened to the spread of language. Sociolinguists have frequently recognised the importance of social networks in fostering the diffusion of features throughout communities. Within the nineteenth-century brass band tradition norms quickly grew when a network was dense, when people interacted frequently and often.<sup>1</sup> Although music is not language, the commonalities created in its performance became a lingua franca that brass musicians could relate to not only locally but also nationally. The terminology of performance practice brought brass band musicians together creating what Trevor Herbert and John Wallace have described as a tradition that was 'hard to break'.<sup>2</sup> Many brass bands had an individual character, and some, such as Besses o' th' Barn (hereafter Besses) achieved greatness, but, as Herbert and Wallace have written, 'none kicked against a tradition sufficiently strongly to be a maverick or to create a watershed in the brass band movement.'<sup>3</sup> This tradition created musical commonalities that every bandsman could follow: it led to the brass band movement pursuing musical excellence to legitimise day-to-day social practices in which bandsmen took part. Bands created dense musical networks, culminating in large regional and national contests. Music was a medium where bandsmen practiced technique, style and repertoire. This practice led to a belief in the value of diffusing technique via oral, written and mentor-driven teaching. These methods led to shared production

---

1 David Crystal, *The Stories of English* (London, 2004), p. 230.

2 Trevor Herbert and John Wallace, 'Aspects of Performance Practices: The Brass Band and its Influence on Other Brass Playing Styles', in, Herbert (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), p. 292.

3 Herbert and Wallace, 'Aspects of Performance Practices', p. 292.

values, such as articulation (tonguing), intonation, balance and tone quality. As Jonathon Rose has argued about the spread of working-class reading habits, bands became their own audience for the dissemination of musical culture, brass band performance traditions defining their own parameters, means of transmission and spread to the wider working class.<sup>4</sup>

Novice bandsmen were reliant on skills and methods that were passed down by other bandsmen. Music was taught through a semi-oral transmission of technique which disseminated advice from tutors through a selection of brass band periodicals, band trainers and more experienced bandsmen. As Pierre Bourdieu described wider working-class educational experiences, the educational level and social origin of the bandsmen resulted in bandsmen creating their own cultural preferences.<sup>5</sup> As Bourdieu argued, 'this predisposes tastes to function as markers of class. The manner in which culture is acquired lives on in the manner of using it.'<sup>6</sup> Therefore, I argue that the novice brass player entered musical education with no other expectation than to be in a band, to become a bandsman. In other words, the culture of the music was there to produce the working-class bandsman. Writing in 1886 an author in the *Musical World* noticed that:

There are signs, indeed, of a movement, which must someday assume large proportions - a movement for providing good and cheap music for the poorer working classes [...]. Now if there is one thing in the way of music that is dear to the heart of a Lancashire artisan, it is a brass band. It is the height of ambition with a lad to play in a band [...]. From many a small cottage in country villages, or in the back streets of a Lancashire town, may be heard the mournful sounds of a cornet, or other wind instrument, as the

---

4 Jonathan Rose, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes* (New Haven and London, 2001), p. 3.

5 Pierre Bourdieu, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*, translated by Richard Nice (Paris, 1979, this edition, London, 1994), p. 1.

6 Bourdieu, *Distinction*, p. 2.

mechanic struggles to make his evenings a preparation for harmonious concerts later on, when he shall have qualified for admission to the nearest amateur band he can find.<sup>7</sup>

In his attempt to 'join the nearest amateur band he can find', this novice bandsman was attempting to learn a code of competence that would allow him to understand the styles that were characteristic of the brass band movement.<sup>8</sup> The education that the novice received was central to this understanding.

From then on the player could be a member of that band for a lifetime. It has been argued that the invention of the piston-valve system meant that all the instruments in a brass band, apart from the bass trombone, had the same treble-clef notation and system of fingering to produce notes.<sup>9</sup> Excluding the trombone slide system this method of fingering and notation gave players the option of staying within the band even if their musical skills deteriorated. A cornet player, for example, who used to play florid and intricate parts, could have the option of playing an instrument, such as the BB flat bass, that, in this period, had less demanding parts. As the *Observer* recognised in 1937 when an author wrote about the National Brass Band Festival at the Alexandra Palace:

The young man in the factory town instinctively takes to the cornet. It is easily carried; he can take it about to parties, and oblige with a tune or two. Thence he gravitates to the local brass band, and finds that he can play almost any required instrument in it, for they are all the same "family". In old age he may end up with the BB flat bass, the deepest instrument of them all, requiring the lungs of a glassblower to fill it.<sup>10</sup>

---

<sup>7</sup> *Musical World*, 64/46 (3 November, 1886), p. 725.

<sup>8</sup> Bourdieu, *Distinction*, p. 2.

<sup>9</sup> Herbert and Wallace, 'Aspects of Performance Practices', in Herbert (Ed.), *The British Brass Band*, p. 287. All the instruments in a brass band, except the bass trombone, used the treble clef. The bass trombone used the bass clef because it was a remainder from the early brass band arrangements when the lower brass all used the bass clef. The argument for all instruments (except the bass trombone) using the treble clef is not entirely convincingly given that everyone can understand a common note system. See Herbert and Wallace, p. 287.

<sup>10</sup> *Observer* (19 September, 1937).

This common technique reflected the insular nature of the brass band movement's musical style. This meant that the performance of bands constantly referenced their own history reflecting the social conditioning of the musical practices that created it.<sup>11</sup>

### **The Growth of Brass Bands**

Brass bands did not arrive fully formed. They developed through a number of key stages that embraced technological, manufacturing, business and performance developments that led to the standardisation of the all-brass band. After a brief outline of the invention of piston valves I will discuss the importance of the introduction of saxhorns; as they were a critical influence on the musical idiom of brass bands. In addition, the business models used by manufacturers in the 1850s helped spread these instruments throughout the country. In this way bandsmen had access to instruments that eventually became standardised throughout the brass band movement resulting in a musical pastime where bandsmen could develop a recognisable working-class hobby.

In the nineteenth century three things that influenced the spread of brass instruments happened simultaneously. They were the development of new types of brass instruments, a refinement of mechanisation and manufacturing techniques and an increased use of brasswind instruments in bands.<sup>12</sup> From the late eighteenth century there were a number of independent experiments being

---

11 Bourdieu, *Distinction*, p. 3.

12 Arnold Myers, 'Design Technology and Manufacture Since 1800', in Trevor Herbert and John Wallace (Eds.) *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments* (Cambridge, 1997, online edition 2011), p. 115.  
<<http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/CCOL9780521563437>> , accessed 10 October, 2014.

carried out in different parts of Europe which were aimed at providing brass players with a system that would enable them to play the entire chromatic range on instruments of different sizes and pitches.<sup>13</sup> Early methods of playing chromatically on trumpets employed slides similar to the u-shaped trombone slide system, hand stopping and crooks.<sup>14</sup> A more widely used invention was the keyed bugle. In 1810 the most celebrated English keyed system was patented by Joseph Halliday.<sup>15</sup> It was similar to Austrian inventions for the keyed trumpet, but there is no direct link between Halliday and other inventors.<sup>16</sup> The keyed bugle became popular in both military and amateur wind bands and over the following decades J.H. White suggested that some 50 British musical instrument makers produced versions of the instrument.<sup>17</sup>

From the late 1830s the keyed bugle's place was slowly replaced by the cornet-à-pistons. This instrument was introduced into Britain in 1838, when a Dutch instrument, made by Louis Embach of Amsterdam, came into the hands of George McFarlane, a Scottish Infantry bandmaster.<sup>18</sup> The piston valve came to supersede other chromatic systems yet some caution is needed when attributing the growth of the brass band movement to the invention of the piston valve, as before the 1840s valved instruments were no more common in brass bands than keyed instruments.<sup>19</sup> John Clegg, for example, one of the cotton manufacturers from Besses o' th' Barn, had played the keyed bugle in 1818 with his 'Reed Band'. Besses were to become a 'crack' brass band but at this time the band

---

13 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 25.

14 See Arnold Myers, *Brass Instruments: Their History and Development* (London, 1976, this edition, 1980), pp. 178-190.

15 Myers, *Brass Instruments*, p. 194.

16 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 27.

17 J. H. White, *A Short History of Bramley Band* (Bramley, 1906), p. 26.

18 White, *A Short History*, p. 47.

19 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 27.



was composed of two C and F clarinets, piccolo, trumpet (most likely a slide system), two horns, trombone, two bass horns and a bass drum. In 1849 the bugle and the woodwind were replaced by cornets, yet the keyed bugles continued to be made in Germany up to 1866.<sup>20</sup> Hence, the early development of bands was the development of keyed instruments in combination with other types of instruments.<sup>21</sup>

The published music of the period reflected this instrumentation and was aimed at instrumentalists who used the keyed system as much as those who used valves. Thomas Harper published his *Airs* for keyed bugle around 1825, and Tully's *Tutor for Keyed Bugle* was published in 1831 as part of Robert Cocks & Company's Series of Modern Tutors. In 1836, Cocks also published Macfarlane's *Eight Popular Airs for Brass Band*, which is regarded as the first British Publication specifically for brass bands of sorts.<sup>22</sup> Macfarlane wrote for three keyed bugles on the lead treble parts as opposed to cornopeans, an early version of the valved cornet that was available. In 1836, Blackman and Pace published *The Cornopean Companion of Scales*. It is evident that from surviving publications and instrumental records that cornopeans were in use throughout the country, but it is clear that these valved systems did not usurp the popularity of keyed instruments.<sup>23</sup> The 'dogged' survival of the ophecleide, that was still being used in contests in the 1860s, and the persistent faith of Thomas Harper in

---

20 Myers, *Brass Instruments*, pp.196-197.

21 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 27.

22 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 27.

23 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 27.

the future of the slide trumpet rebuts that notion that technological innovation led to improved musical facility.<sup>24</sup>

The valve, invented no later than 1814, by Heinrich Stölzel and Fredrich Blühmel in Prussia was first applied to the horn and trumpet.<sup>25</sup> Stölzel, and others, were making valve instruments of various kinds and although the initial development of these instruments was in Germany and Austria it was largely the French remodelling of these instruments which was imported and copied in Britain.<sup>26</sup> There were a number of variations of valve designs, including the Berlin valve, conceived by Stölzel in 1827, and modified by Wilhelm Wieprecht and Carl Wilhelm Moritz in 1835.<sup>27</sup> The design of valve that was to become universal was that of the Parisian maker Étienne François Périnet in 1839. The cornets made by Courtois and Besson, that were imported from Paris in the mid-1850s, established the model for the standard brass band cornet and had Périnet valves.<sup>28</sup> As Arnold Myers has stated, 'the vast majority of valved brass band instruments made at home or imported from abroad have used them.'<sup>29</sup>

### **The Spread of the Saxhorn**

Saxhorns were a family of valved brass instruments developed by Adolphe Sax at his workshops in Paris in the 1840s and 50s.<sup>30</sup> The name 'saxhorn' became a common description for this family of instruments. Patents for valve brass

---

24 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 28.

25 Arnold Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands', in, Herbert, *Making a Movement*, p. 161.

26 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation', p. 161.

27 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation', p. 166.

28 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation', p. 167.

29 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation', p. 167.

30 Philip Bate, Trevor Herbert and Arnold Myers, 'Saxhorn.' Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online. Oxford University Press. <<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/24667>>, accessed 4 October, 2014.

instruments having names with the 'sax' prefix were registered by him in Paris in 1845, but the validity of some of the patents, at least in so far as they protected a genuine new invention, has been questioned at different times.<sup>31</sup> Ignoring the extreme sizes, which were rarely used, the saxhorn family consisted of: soprano in three-foot F, or three and a quarter-foot E-flat; a contralto in four-foot C, or four and a half foot B-flat; a tenor in six-foot F, or six and a half foot E-flat; a baritone in eight foot C, or a nine-foot B-flat; a bass in eight-foot C or nine-foot B-flat; and contrabasses in twelve-foot F or thirteen foot E-flat (later also in eighteen-foot B-flat).<sup>32</sup>

Saxhorns became well-known in Britain through the performances of the Distin family, soon after the family's appearance in Paris around 1843.<sup>33</sup> The popularity of their brass performances was a factor that made an unquestionable contribution to the popularisation of saxhorns in Britain and their subsequent establishment as important instruments in the composition of British brass bands.

John Distin had a reputation as a fine trumpet player and together with his four sons (George, Henry, William and Theodore) formed a brass quintet that started touring Britain in 1837.<sup>34</sup> In 1844 the Distins had reached Paris and in the Spring of 1844 Berlioz organised a concert at the *Salle Herz* in Paris. The ensemble that performed consisted of a trumpet, a cornet, a clarinet, a bass clarinet, a saxophone, played by Sax, and a saxhorn (improved bugle) played by the celebrated Jean Baptiste Arban. John Distin was astonished by the sound of

---

31 See Evgenia Mitroulia, *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production With a Focus on Saxhorns and Related Instruments* (PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh, 2011).

32 Arnold Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands', in Herbert, (Ed.) *The British Brass Band*, p. 169.

33 Mitroulia, *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production*, p. 237.

34 'Provincial Concerts', *Musical World Volume* 6, number 66 (16 June, 1837, p. 14, cited in, Mitroulia, *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production*, p. 237).

the saxhorn and visited Sax the day after where they borrowed three instruments: a soprano in E-flat, a contralto in B-flat and an alto in E-flat. They also arranged with Sax to be the sole distributors of Saxhorns in Britain.<sup>35</sup> From this point the Distins returned to Britain and went on to tour with a new set of saxhorns.<sup>36</sup> George Distin died in 1848 and the quintet became a quartet and resumed touring a few months after George's death.<sup>37</sup> The Distins toured extensively and by the 1850s had given over 10,000 concerts.<sup>38</sup> The concerts attracted thousands of people and Algernon Rose noted the musicianship of the ensemble made saxhorns popular. Rose wrote:

Had the Distin family played loudly and harshly, they would assuredly not have won the new-fangled saxhorns the recognition they did. When properly handled, and when the loudness is kept down, the saxhorn possesses many beautiful tone qualities. Their soft playing and ability to make delightful crescendos and diminuendos, were, 'tis said, the chief charms of the performance by the Distins.<sup>39</sup>

Henry Distin acted as agent for Sax for five years until Henry Distin decided that he could profitably make instruments himself, and took over the running of Distin and Co in 1850. In mid-century other instrument manufacturers commenced trading, including: William Brown (From 1851); Ruddall, Rose and Carte & Co. (Already making woodwind, they added brass on joining with Key & Co c.1857). F. Besson (from 1857, though a related firm was making from 1837 in Paris); George Butler (from 1858 as a branch of a Dublin firm) and Riviere and Hawkes, later Hawkes and Son (already repairing, they added manufacture in 1875).

---

35 Ray Farr, *The Distin Family Legacy: The Rise of the Brass Band in 19th Century Britain* (Newcastle-Upon-Tyne, 2013), p. 119.

36 Mitroulia, *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production*, pp. 237-239.

37 Mitroulia, *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production*, p. 238.

38 Farr, *The Distin Family Legacy*, p. 42.

39 Algernon S. Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen: A Popular Handbook for Brass Instrumentalists* (London, 1895), p. 227.

Apart from George Butler these makers were based in London and the principal provincial manufacturers were Joseph Higham in Manchester (from 1842) and James Gisbourne in Birmingham (from c.1839).<sup>40</sup> As Evgenia Mitroulia has noted, according to all biographers of Sax, Sax and the Distins ended their collaboration during the London International Exhibition of 1851 because the Distins had started making their own instruments.<sup>41</sup> Between 1851 and 1857 the Distins' design of the saxhorn went through a number of changes and valve types.<sup>42</sup>

The point, however, was that through their popular performances and promotion of the saxhorn the Distins had made the brass ensemble a popular musical choice for entertainment. The Distin family led the way for many bands in Britain that started to use saxhorns almost exclusively. In communities of all sizes bands began to call themselves 'saxhorn bands'. From mid-century there were also a notable number who called themselves 'saxtuba bands'.<sup>43</sup> From 1896-1897 Enderby Jackson published a series of articles in *Musical Opinion & Musical Trade Review* called 'Origin & Promotion of Brass Band Contests'. These articles cast some light on the early years of the brass band movement in Britain and how the Distin Family influenced its instrumentation. In his first article of the series Jackson wrote:

Professional bands up to that period [1844] consisted of keyed Kent bugles (E-flat and B-flat), slide trumpets, French horns, trombones (alto, tenor, and bass), ophicleides and serpents. The perfection arrived at by the Distin Troupe aroused the interest of the leaders and members of amateur bands, of wealthy mill owners, and of the many

---

40 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands' p. 171.

41 Mitroulia, *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production*, p. 246.

42 See Mitroulia, *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production*, p. 253.

43 Mitroulia, *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production*, p. 263.

supporters of local bands. [...] Markets were quickly found where to procure the most recent make of the new instruments, cornet-à-pistons being secured as the leading instruments. A demand arose for suitable alto Saxhorns, also for basses furnished with the best modern application of the Sax valves or rotary actions; and these necessary instruments were quickly produced, although the alto horns and baritones proved distinctly inferior in purity of tone to the cornets and basses [...] In a few years almost every village and group of mills in these districts possessed its own band.<sup>44</sup>

Some bands, such as Mossley Brass Band, for example, ordered a full set of Sax Brasses from Henry Distin.<sup>45</sup> The instrumentation of bands in Lancashire and Yorkshire just before 1847, as given by Jackson was the following:

- 1 bugle in E-flat or D-flat (leading)
- 1 bugle in B-flat (repiano)
- 2 bugles in B-flat
- 1 cornopean in A-flat (solo)
- 1 second cornopean A-flat
- 2 trumpets in D-flat
- 2 French horns in D-flat
- 1 saxhorn in E-flat (solo)
- 2 tenor saxhorns in D-flat
- 1 baritone saxhorn in B-flat
- 1 alto trombone
- 2 trombones in B-flat
- 1 bass trombone
- 1 euphonion in A-flat
- 2 bombardons in E-flat
- 2 or 3 ophicleides<sup>46</sup>

Minor variations occurred due to fluctuating players numbers. According to Jackson's reports of Sax's models the ones appearing most often in bands of the early contesting era were cornets-à-pistons, alto saxhorns and bass saxhorns.<sup>47</sup>

---

44 Enderby Jackson, 'Origin & Promotion of Brass Band Contests', *Musical Opinion and Music Trade Review*, Volume 19, number. 222 (March 1896), p. 392, cited in, Mitroulia, *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production*, p. 263.

45 Jackson, 'Origin and Promotion of Brass Band Contests.' p. 392.

46 Jackson, 'Origin and Promotion of Brass Band Contests' Volume 20, No. 234 (March 1897), p 235.

As the all-brass band developed there were a number of British makers who were capable of producing the instruments needed. The firms of Pace, Percival, Key, Greenhill, Roe, Metzler and Sandbach all provided high-quality instruments. The expanding market also absorbed a flood of imported instruments mostly from France and Germany. Compared with the hand-crafted British models many of these instruments were cheap, though some high-quality instruments were sold by Halary and Sax.<sup>48</sup>

### **Buying Brass Instruments**

From the late 1850s the cost of musical instruments began to fall. This was partly due to the removal of protective tariffs through such measures as the Cobden-Chevalier treaty, and partly to increased trade volume and increased levels of competition amongst domestic manufacturers.<sup>49</sup> Cyril Ehrlich has shown how the price of woodwind and string instruments fell in the second half of the nineteenth-century and a similar picture is reflected for the sale of brass instruments. Dave Russell noted that brass bands were using hire purchase agreements as early as 1855, and that this credit may well have been available earlier.<sup>50</sup> This hire-purchase formed only part of a complex system of cash, cheques, deferred payments and discounted offers. In 1895 Algernon Rose stated that 'the credit system has become the very basis of brass bands. Given a body of steady, industrious young men, the acquirement of a set of first-class

---

47 Jackson, 'Origin and Promotion of Brass Band Contests' Volume 20, No. 230 (November 1896), p.102.

48 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands' pp. 170-171.

49 Herbert, 'Making A Movement', p. 43.

50 David Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914: A Study of the Relationships between Music and Society* (PhD Thesis, University of York, 1979), p. 38.

instruments is by no means difficult.<sup>51</sup> Together with the trade in new instruments there was also the availability of second-hand instruments. It is reasonable to say there must have also been a huge market for second-hand instruments as many bands started up and then folded within a few years, and, given the durability of even the cheaper instruments, it is possible many of them stayed in circulation.<sup>52</sup>

In the second half of the nineteenth century most of the instruments for brass bands were made by the larger manufacturers - those that were capable of mass production, such as Boosey, Hawkes, Besson and Higham. Imports of cheap models still continued but included some good quality models such as the Viennese instruments used by the Cyfarthfa Band, together with the Courtois instruments imported by S.A. Chappell.<sup>53</sup> Makers had a vested interest in promoting their instruments by giving them as contest prizes.<sup>54</sup> In August 1868, for example, Todmorden Old Brass Band, from the West Riding of Yorkshire, hosted a contest including a euphonium solo contest in which six players took part. R. Marsden, of Bacup, won the contest and was presented with a euphonium. There was also a solo tenor horn contest and a solo cornet contest where a tenor horn and cornet were prizes.<sup>55</sup> In 1870 the *Preston Guardian* was listing the players that would enter the cornet and euphonium contest at the Preston Brass Band Contest that was to be held on the 30 July.<sup>56</sup> By the 1890s manufacturers filled the market with ephemera such as band lamps for dark

---

51 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, p. 305.

52 Herbert, 'Making A Movement', p. 43.

53 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands', p. 176.

54 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands', p. 176

55 *Huddersfield and West Yorkshire Advertiser* (8 August, 1868).

56 *Preston Guardian* (30 July, 1870).



nights, oils to lubricate slides and valves, music stands and other goods on a scale that had not been known before.<sup>57</sup> Local music retailers became abundant. In 1894 a relatively small community, such as Sowerby Bridge (pop. 7092 in 1891), possessed two such dealerships while Bradford had no fewer than 46.<sup>58</sup> In addition to technical innovations a combination of promotion techniques, cash and credit methods of payment, affordability and durability of brass instruments all helped standardise the brass band.

Useful evidence survives of the numbers and kinds of instruments being used by the leading bands in the 1860s. Over eighty contest forms are preserved in the Enderby Jackson papers that are currently in the care of Arnold Myers. As Myers argues, 'since only bands reasonably certain of their balance of instruments would enter a contest at the national level, we can assume that the instrumentation of these bands represents the "state of the art" at that time.'<sup>59</sup> The thirty-four surviving Crystal Palace Contest forms show that the average band of eighteen players contained the following:

- 1-2 sopranos, mostly in D-flat, but also in E-flat
- 5 cornets, mostly in A-flat, but also in B-flat
- 0-1 alto saxhorns in A-flat
- 2-3 tenor saxhorns (or alt-horns), mostly in D-flat, but also in E-flat
- 1-2 baritones, mostly in A-flat, but also in B-flat
- 1 tenor trombone, mostly in C, but also in B-flat
- 1 bass trombone, mostly in G
- 1-2 ophicleides, mostly in C, but also in B-flat
- 1 Sax bass or euphonium, mostly in B-flat or A-flat, but also in C
- 1 contrabass saxhorns or bombardons, mostly in E-flat, but also in D-flat<sup>60</sup>

---

57 Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914*, p. 138.

58 Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914*, p. 138.

59 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands' p. 171.

60 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands' p. 172.

After the last of Enderby Jackson's Grand National Crystal Palace Contests, in 1863, the annual contest at Belle Vue, in Manchester became the most influential and prestigious. In 1873 there was an incident where a Black Dyke euphonium player played trombone solos on a valve trombone, and, as a result, the contest rules were tightened to avoid this. Present day band instrumentation can be said to have moved towards standardisation from this date.<sup>61</sup> It did, however, take some time for the rules of other contests to follow, and, as Arnold Myers points out, the instrumentation of non-contesting bands was never standardised and 'we can safely assume that some small village bands carried on using valve trombones, clarinets and [...] ophicleides throughout the century.'<sup>62</sup>

Nevertheless, by the 1870s, bandsmen had benefited from the technical, manufacturing and retail changes that resulted in brass instruments becoming popular, affordable and durable. The move to a standardised instrumentation had begun and this gave brass bands a secure starting point to create a hobby that was being commented on by middle-class observers.

### **A Definable and Observable Hobby**

The rise of brass bands coincided with a period when the middle class were taking an increased interest in emerging working-class cultures. The working-class journalist, Thomas Wright, gave the middle class what were effectively a

---

61 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands' p. 173.

62 Myers, 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands' p. 173.

series of written guides to a working class that was becoming increasingly visible. The market for Wright's *Some Habits and Customs of the Working Classes* (1867) and *The Great Unwashed* (1868) reflected an increasing interest in observing and understanding the working, leisure and cultural lives of the working class.<sup>63</sup> This reporting of working-class culture reflected a growing working class that by the 1880s was able to make a significant contribution to the consumer economy. From around 1873 to 1896 there was a striking improvement in average real wages during a period when living costs fell dramatically, meaning that a number of affordable and increasingly regular working-class pastimes emerged. Novices were becoming bandsmen in a period after mid-century when the development of working-class culture had a definable chronology - the rise of football, the seaside holiday, allotments and gardening, naturalist societies, cycling and carpentry, for example, all grew popular. The bandsmen were developing a cultural identity at a time when a distinct - and measurable - notion of what it meant to partake in working-class entertainment and leisure was becoming fixed within the national consciousness.<sup>64</sup>

For the *British Bandsman* it was essential that the working man had a hobby. Unsurprisingly, for this publication, brass bands were considered the best hobby. Writing in 1914, one author argued that the hobby of music was necessary to survive the repetitive nature of manual labour in the industrial world. The writer argued that brass band music was a diversion for working people that could make industrial labour tolerable. Indeed, not only was the brass band a

---

<sup>63</sup> Hobsbawm, *Industry and Empire*, pp. 140-142.

<sup>64</sup> See Jose Harris, *Private Lives: Public Spirit: Britain 1870-1914* (London, 1993, this edition, London, 1994), pp.93-95, and, Eric Hobsbawm, 'The Making of the Working Class, 1870-1914' in, Eric Hobsbawm, *Uncommon People: Resistance, Rebellion and Jazz* (London, 1998, this edition, London, 1999), pp. 76-99.

significant recreation for bandsmen, it also gave other working people pleasure. For bandsmen and the followers of bands the parameters of working-class musical culture were being defined. In other words the brass band was music for working people. The author wrote:

In these days of minute divisions of labour, when a man makes, perhaps, only the hundredth part of an article, minding a machine all day, or some other such monotonous work, it is essential he has a hobby [...]. In banding we have a splendid means of recreation for ourselves, and, what is far better, we have the power of sending an occasional gleam of sunshine into the hearts of those that are well called the "soldiers of industry".<sup>65</sup>

Music fulfilled many of the criteria that Ross McKibbin argues defined a hobby. Firstly, a hobby was freely chosen.<sup>66</sup> Secondly, a hobby should not be random or disorganised but required intellectual and/or physical discipline.<sup>67</sup> Music was an intellectual pursuit and, as we shall see, to become a bandmaster it took a degree of serious study to be able to lead a band, although the levels of achievement could vary. The playing of brass instruments was also a physical activity. In 1909, for example, S. Cope wrote an article in the *British Bandsman* in his column, 'The Bandsman's Aid Chat and Counsel' that stressed the importance of staying healthy in order to play. He talked about the 'physical culture of the body, which [made] bandsmen better men, and therefore more useful bandsmen.'<sup>68</sup> Equally, he argued that better general fitness meant being better able to cope with the physical demands of playing brass instruments.

---

65 *British Bandsman* (14 March, 1914), p. 228.

66 Ross McKibbin, 'Work and Hobbies in Britain, 1880-1950', in, *The Ideologies of Class: Social Relations in Britain 1880-1950* (Oxford, 1994, this edition, 1999), p. 142.

67 McKibbin, 'Work and Hobbies in Britain', p. 142.

68 *British Bandsman* (19 June, 1909), p. 683.

Thirdly, a hobby demanded knowledge and sustained interest.<sup>69</sup> McKibbin argues that the final definition of a hobby should be accompanied by the discharge of mental and physical tension.<sup>70</sup> As this and the next chapter will show the discipline within the rehearsal space provided both these things.

To be a bandsman characterised similarities with other working-class pastimes such as horticulture, animal husbandry, dog and pigeon breeding, carpentry, and sport, where the individual was not so much the participant as the informed observer.<sup>71</sup> For bandsmen to be informed observers was to be able to engage with musical material that demanded understanding, interpretation and instrumental practice. In other words bandsmen engaged with other bandsmen to discuss the right way to perform; this gave bandsmen a commonality with other working-class hobbies emerging at this time. From the last quarter of the nineteenth century hobbies became categorised by intellectual systemisation, understanding the music, physical organisation, playing the music in groups, and commercial exploitation, buying the arranged music.<sup>72</sup>

### **Novice Bandsmen: Experiences and Commonalities**

The *Musical World* was perhaps being romantic when they described the young person practicing hard to join a brass band. Nevertheless, even the 'crack' brass bands were made up of individuals who were at some point novice musicians. It is worthwhile examining the musical careers of three players in order to explore

---

69 Ross McKibbin, 'Work and Hobbies in Britain', p. 142.

70 McKibbin, 'Work and Hobbies in Britain', p. 142.

71 McKibbin, 'Work and Hobbies in Britain', p. 143.

72 McKibbin, 'Work and Hobbies in Britain', p. 143.

the journey of the bandsman from novice to veteran. William Jones, George Wadsworth and Joe Taylor's musical careers were indicative of the experiences of many band members. When we examine the musical careers of these three players we can see where musical traditions began and how they were developed.

### **William Jones (1818-?)**

William Jones was to become a prominent member of Besses. The band was formed in 1818 by the Clegg brothers (John, Joseph, and James), who were cotton manufacturers. Besses is one of the oldest amateur brass bands in the country, Black Dyke Mills (est.1816) being one of the other earliest 'crack' bands. Besses started out as a brass and reed band, and, although Jones spent his early years in this band, he went on to be an influential figure in brass band education. His early experiences with the band are one of the earliest examples we have of a novice player's experience.

Jones was born in 1818; his parents were handloom weavers at Besses, some eight miles north of Manchester.<sup>73</sup> He attended the National School at Prestwich for one year but at the age of seven he began to wind cotton for his parents. With his vocal imitations of the clarionet he soon attracted the attention of one of the founding members of Besses Reed Band, John Blomley, a clarionet player with the gentleman's concerts in Manchester. Blomley gave Jones a job lighting the fires in the band room and running errands for the band. After a year

---

73 *Middleton Guardian* (28 March, 1891) All biographical references come from this article.

of these menial tasks another founder member, John Eastwood, started to give Jones piccolo lessons. This led to him giving his first solo in public when he was twelve. After this he went on to learn the German flute, the keyed bugle and the trumpet. In 1839 he was given a cornopean. The cornopean, which was an early name for the cornet, was said to have been introduced to the public in 1834 by George Macfarlane the keyed-bugle player, together with the trumpet player Thomas Harper Jr.<sup>74</sup> The author in the *Middleton Guardian* argued that Jones could 'boast of being one of the best cornet players around.'<sup>75</sup> The author was writing in 1891 and at the time it is more likely that Jones was a well-known instrumentalist within a number of fledgling bands in the area. Nevertheless, the author did highlight that bandsmen recognised each other's musicianship and style of playing.

Every Easter Monday the band would visit Knott Mill Fair to hear Wombwell's Band: an early example of bandsmen watching established players and being influenced by their style of playing. An author in the *Middleton Guardian* wrote that 'this was where the cornet always took the solos and where they [the bandsmen] were also overpowered by the sensations they had when they heard the powerful tones of the opheicleide.'<sup>76</sup> In 1838 Jones joined the All Saints Choral Society, and Joseph Clegg, of Besses, bought him a chromatic slide trumpet which he used to play at the Choral Society concerts. Jones soon got a job at Thomas Price's works, where he worked for some time. Reflecting a

---

74 Anthony C. Baines and Arnold Myers, *The Cornet*, *Grove Music Online*, <[www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grovemusic/06509](http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grovemusic/06509)> accessed, 2 December, 2011.

75 *Middleton Guardian* (28 March, 1891).

76 *Middleton Guardian* (28 March, 1891).

tradition where more established players gave lessons to novices, he gave cornet lessons to his co-workers, Mr Price and Mr Hardman. He left Besses in 1853 when they broke up as a wind band. However, for the next forty years he found employment as a music teacher and bandmaster.

Jones was appointed as teacher and bandmaster of the Park Lane Band in February 1851. It had been founded by R. N. Phillips, a local advocate of elementary education, and teacher at Park Lane Elementary School, Whitefield, near Besses. Phillips was adamant that the students should learn instrumental music. The band continued until Christmas 1890 when it was disbanded. During this time the band performed at a large number of civic functions: including leading the Unitarian Sunday School's Whitsuntide procession for 39 years. The school band also played at Prestwich Asylum, which motivated the asylum staff to form a band of their own, which Jones also taught. Many of Jones's students went on to be players in Besses, as well as many other bands in Manchester and the north.

### **George Wadsworth (c.1815-1864)**

Across the Pennines in Yorkshire, George Wadsworth lived at Ribbleden Road, Holmfirth.<sup>77</sup> He was the Sexton of Holme Bridge Church and a well-known stonemason. His decorative work on the Holmfirth Co-op was considered the best in the area. His father, John Elijah, was the Sexton of Holmfirth Parish Church and a monumental mason and John Elijah was a well-regarded principal

---

<sup>77</sup>*Huddersfield Daily Examiner* (1 March, 1919). All biographical details about Wadsworth come from this article.



cornet player with Holmfirth Old Band. Wadsworth joined Holmfirth Old Band where he developed his love of brass band music. Showing a trait of many brass players of the time he became proficient on a number of instruments, beginning on the bass trombone, moving to the cornet and finally the euphonium.

Wadsworth became one of the best-known band adjudicators in the area: it was usual for him to adjudicate 'teens' of bands at one contest in one day. Despite his fame and skill he was a modest and retiring man whose friends admired him for his quiet enthusiasm and generosity.

### **Joe Taylor (c.1861-1903)**

Also in Yorkshire, Joe Taylor was born in Lindley and worked as a teaser at the local wool mills of Joseph Walker and Sons. When the mill business failed he became the publican of the Red Lion in Lindley. He was known for his connection with Lindley Band and, like Jones and Wadsworth, he became proficient on a number of instruments. He started with the band when he was 16 playing the tenor horn, moving to the baritone and finally the soprano cornet.

After some years of autodidactic study he became bandmaster of Lindley Band aged 29. He would rehearse the band in preparation to appear at contests under the professional conductorship of John Gladney and Edwin Swift. However, if Gladney or Swift could not attend he would lead the band himself. Under his leadership, the band won the following prizes: Belle Vue 1882 (1st), Sheepridge 1882 (3rd), Belle Vue 1895 (5th, but winning the conductor's medal), Meltham

1900 (1st), Hillhouse 1901(1st) and Hull 1901 (1st). For two seasons he was the instructor at Huddersfield Fire Brigade Band as well as at Elland, Scapegoat Hill and other places.

Clearly not all players reached the attention of the press and not all players reached the level of trainer or bandmaster or became professional. However, by analysing these players' careers we can see commonalities that would have been, to a greater or lesser extent, the experience of most band members.<sup>78</sup> First of all they began work in manual labour or became apprenticed to a trade. George Bromlow, for example, who was solo tenor horn for Houghton Main Colliery Band, and was arguably the best tenor horn player in the country, started work as a miner. They would then gain the support of a mentor, occasionally their father, who was already established in a band. The importance of family tradition and mentoring was explained in 1909, when 'Hic et Ubique' wrote in the *British Bandsman* about the value of fathers, and preferably both parents, encouraging their children to play, writing:

Bandsmen of forty years ago were to a great extent the fathers of the bands of yesterday, and they in their turn of those of today; any man who has spent his life in teaching the gentle art of "blowing" will agree with me that it is far easier to make an instrumentalist out of a lad whose father, or better still, if both his parents were musicians, therefore heredity tells!<sup>79</sup>

Bornat Goodshaw, for example, who became well known for playing cornet solos in Yorkshire and Lancashire, started playing aged nine in Goodshaw Prize Band,

---

<sup>78</sup> All these experiences can be found regularly in the short biographies of the more prominent players that appeared in the brass band periodicals. See, for example, Fenton Renshaw, who began with Holmfirth Temperance Band (Source, the *Cornet*, 14 March, 1903, p. 4); Harry Bentley, who was the euphonium player with Wyke Temperance Band (Source, the *British Bandsman*, 20 June, 1903, p. 342) and Dick Aspin, who, for example, was tutored by his brother in Goodshaw Prize Band, and tried the tenor horn and Eb Bass before settling on the euphonium. (Source, the *British Bandsman* (7 September, 1907, p. 614.).

<sup>79</sup> *British Bandsman* (3 April, 1909), p. 383.

with his father as a tutor.<sup>80</sup> Finally, the novice had access to a number of instruments before settling on one at which they excelled. In this way the novice bandsman was introduced to the brass band through social networks that already existed in the working-class environment. The networks of work and family were present in the brass band when the novice bandsman joined the band. The band situation thus ran in parallel with the shape of work, social and family situations outside work.

### **Novice Practice: Early Efforts**

It took practice to gain acceptance in a band. This early learning, trying to find an instrument that would suit them, could be a frustrating experience for some. The *Musical Times*'s commented on 'the mournful sounds of a cornet coming from the back streets of a Lancashire town.' Writing in 1890, in *Music and Morals*, H. R. Hawes attention was drawn to cornet players, 'for there is a peculiarity about him, he is never tired of playing, as some people are of hearing, the same tunes over and over again.'<sup>81</sup> In 1896 a humorous article in *Pearson's Weekly*, about novice trombone players, highlighted the problems that beginners faced, and the early noise they made, when choosing an instrument to play:

Of all the various brass instruments which have been designed by musical or malevolent ingenuity, there is none, which in its capacity for inflicting both torture and delight, is comparable to the trombone [...]. If we compare the yell of the midnight cat, the tearing of a carpet, and the blast of a horse team whistle, we shall yet fall short of the awful utterances of a trombone in the hands of a beginner. Flesh and blood cannot stand it.<sup>82</sup>

---

<sup>80</sup> *Brass Band News* (1 December, 1905), p. 4.

<sup>81</sup> H.R. Hawes, *Music and Morals*, (London, 1890, this edition 1917), p. 512.

<sup>82</sup> *Pearson's Weekly*, n.d. cited in, the *Cornet* (15 December, 1896), p. 6.

Even when the brass player became more proficient they could still cause problems for their neighbours. The story about Bramley Brass Band's G trombone (bass trombone) player is most likely exaggerated; nevertheless, it highlighted the problems of finding a suitable place to practice because of the noise brass instruments made, together with the impracticality of the larger instruments:

The G trombone player was a good player and he knew it. He lived in the first house in Lower Town Street [Bramley], but it was so small that he could not make his a flat with the door shut, so his slide came out into the street, keeping him always in trouble[ ...]. He moved to number 7. His new landlord made improvements so that he could practice at will, and that he did, for I have heard he could shake the very pavement.<sup>83</sup>

Despite such problems, players were encouraged to practice at home, the implication being that the novice player must catch up with their peers. The way that players established themselves in a band resembles how Patrick Joyce has argued that new employees and apprentices established themselves in the workplace, hence echoing the influence of a working-class workplace's value systems in the brass band community. Players would often follow a family member into the same band, taking on the same value systems and the same disciplines. After a period of time the novice player's work would meet the required standard set by their peers and they would then become accepted into the larger group.<sup>84</sup> This pressure to practice was often increased because many bands had instruments supplied by either the local community or, in the case of factory bands, the factory owner. If players did not keep up then disapproval

---

<sup>83</sup> Hesling-White, *A Short History of Bramley Band*, p. 6.

<sup>84</sup> Patrick Joyce, *Work, Society and Politics: The Culture of the Factory in Later Victorian England* (London, 1980, this edition, 1982), pp. 50-54.

would soon follow. In *Talks With Bandsmen* Algernon Rose felt that private practice was a moral duty. The language used was strong in that it excluded players who did not try their best; the 'delinquent' was the 'black sheep' of the band, potentially being ostracised by the main group. For the novice player socially acceptable norms were learnt quickly; to be accepted into a group of peers required that the novice show the effort to improve and regular practice, as the strength of the larger group depended on the enthusiasm of the individual.

Rose wrote:

The band being now equipped with instruments, it remains for the members individually to make it a success. It is the moral duty, therefore, of every member of a band to devote as much time as he can to private practice. If practice is neglected one day, it is easy to forgo it the next. In short time what is the consequence? Instead of being a credit at rehearsal the player gives forth a vile tone, and bad intonation, there is sluggishness about the mechanism of his instrument, and a constant crackling of water in the valves. Then the aggravated bandmaster has to give undue attention to the delinquent, to the stoppage of instruction to the band as a whole. Everybody feels disgusted with the black sheep who thus keeps them back [...]. The reward of the player who practices regularly is that, in a short time, he gets a good smooth tone, a well-developed and flexible lip, lissom fingers, a command over the entire compass of his instrument [...]. The man who practices diligently has, therefore, the proud satisfaction of knowing that he, by his progress, is materially helping the band to distinction.<sup>85</sup>

To be accepted as a bandsman was to be joined with wider family and work networks. The bands of the factory towns reflected the towns' neighbourhoods in their composition. As Patrick Joyce argued:

If the family was of central significance in the social changes that led to the acceptance of the social order of the mechanised factory industry, then, because of this symbiosis of work and community, so too was people's own sense of communal identity involved in that identity.<sup>86</sup>

---

<sup>85</sup> Algernon S. Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, pp. 334-335.

<sup>86</sup> Patrick Joyce, *Work, Society and Politics*, p. 56.

Joining a brass band was to undertake a commitment to practice. If successful the bandsman joined a band that represented one aspect of the wider working-class experience of work and community and mentors guided this transition from novice to bandsman.

Mentors were important in the learning process as three novices' experiences of learning show us. William Shaw's ambition to play led initially to him keeping his practice time secret. His father played the cornet in a number of bands and was a founding member of Delph Band, in the Saddleworth area of Lancashire.<sup>87</sup> Shaw started playing when 'he picked up dad's cornet when I were nine year old. I used to play up in the bedroom, with a handkerchief stuffed in the bell, when my father was out. He would have killed me if he'd found out I was playing that bloody cornet.' William Shaw joined Oldham Rifles Band; he sat between two experienced players, and remembered 'owt that I didn't know, or hadn't come across before, I got the help of the men in the middle, Frank Miller and Tom Barlow, the top two cornet players.'<sup>88</sup> Shaw did purchase a tutor book, the *Arban Cornet Method*, which he found 'a hell of a long road' but he found it 'as simple as pie when you had someone to put you right'.<sup>89</sup>

Shaw's experience was shared by other the novice players who were soon brought into the brass band environment. Ernest Farrar Woodhead, for example, often went to listen to the practices of Todmorden Old Brass Band, where his father was a member. Woodhead began by learning the flugel horn

---

<sup>87</sup> Arthur R. Taylor, *Labour and Love: An Oral History of The Brass Band Movement* (London, 1983), p. 22.

<sup>88</sup> Taylor, *Labour and Love*, p. 22.

<sup>89</sup> Taylor, *Labour and Love*, p. 22.

and after having lessons from the bandmaster was soon playing the cornet and later the baritone. By November 1896 he was playing the tenor trombone with Shaw Brass Band, where he became the solo trombone player in the band. He then went on to win many solo contests and was considered one of the best trombonists in the country.<sup>90</sup>

Finally, Jack Wilson was a cornet player who began playing with the Old Wrighton Band, he was taught by Joe Haydock. Wilson's first lesson was when Haydock picked up a scrap of paper, drew a music stave and wrote some notes on it. Wilson said 'that was the only lesson he ever had.'<sup>91</sup> From then on, when the band played for dances on Saturday nights, Wilson sat behind the cornet player, followed the music and watched everything he did. This player used to turn around to him from time to time and say 'dust know where we are lad?'<sup>92</sup> Novice players' early experiences were of a musical environment where the oral transmission of technique was the accepted norm. *Brass Band News* illustrated this ethos best when, in 1915, they asked 'are there any young players who are scarcely equal to their parts in the band? It is easy and safe for an old player to say [...] let's go through the parts together [...]. Let's share music and tutor books.'<sup>93</sup>

Bands did not have any choice but to rely upon internal mentors and methods as music education did not become established fully until after 1870. As shown in chapter one, in 1907 an editorial in the *British Bandsman* was in no doubt that the brass band movement was the reason that working people had a

---

90 *British Bandsman* (27 April, 1912), p. 67.

91 Taylor *Labour and Love*, p. 21

92 Taylor *Labour and Love*, p. 21.

93 *Brass Band News* (1 May, 1915), p. 4.

good musical education.<sup>94</sup> Outside the brass band movement the prevailing feeling was that the inherent worth of music education, especially private instrumental teaching, in terms of being a rational recreation and a moral guide, had little need for state intervention.<sup>95</sup>

Compared with continental neighbours the provision of instrumental teaching in Britain by the state was minimal. On the 27 March, 1878, the members of the Society of Arts discussed the condition of 'state aid to music at home and abroad.'<sup>96</sup> The question raised was 'is not only the musical education of the country but the discovery and development of native genius to be left to voluntary effort, with all its attendant uncertainties, or should it rest on the more stable basis of a state education?'<sup>97</sup> The members noted that the oldest English music school, the Royal Academy, was not fully funded by the state but received a good income from student fees, £540 from subscriptions and £500 per annum from the government.<sup>98</sup> Moreover, the Royal Academy did not possess 'either of the characteristics of the foreign conservatoire, the obligatory curriculum, and the free instruction of proved competent persons.'<sup>99</sup> Brussels was funded by the vote of the council chamber, the town and the province. At Liège the municipality, the province and the government provided funds. In Prussia they noted that the various conservatoires were managed by associations, or *vereins*. At Leipzig the conservatoire was supported by the King through a number of subscriptions and legacies. At Vienna the conservatoire was funded by contributions from the

---

94 *British Bandsman* (3 August, 1907), p. 301.

95 David J. Goldby, *Instrumental Teaching in Nineteenth Century Britain* (Abingdon, 2004), p. 66.

96 'State Aid to Music at Home and Abroad', *Musical Standard* Vol 14 No 714 (6 April, 1878), p. 207.

97 'State Aid to Music at Home and Abroad', p. 207.

98 'State Aid to Music at Home and Abroad', p. 207.

99 'State Aid to Music at Home and Abroad', p. 208.



Emperor's Privy Purse, by an annual contribution from the Common Council of Vienna and by the subscriptions of a society set up by the conservatoire. In Munich they noted that the conservatoire was under the direct control of the Minister of Public Instruction and derived its income from state subvention.<sup>100</sup> In these institutions there were always a number of students that paid fees but there were also a number of conservatoires where tuition was free to all and that were completely funded by the state under the control of the Ministry of the Interior. These conservatoires were at Wurzburg, Milan, Naples, Florence and Paris.<sup>101</sup> Significantly the Society of Arts noted that 'in the primary normal schools of France instruction in music is obligatory, and in secondary schools it is partly so. In Prussia singing is part of the course of instruction in the gymnasia.'<sup>102</sup>

Britain could not compete with this state funding. 1833 saw the first state grant for education, and in spite of the appointment of James Kay as the secretary of the Committee of the Council on Education, together with the appointment of school inspectors in 1839, governmental reforms lacked conviction and the grant of twenty-thousand pounds for music education was in real terms a pittance.<sup>103</sup>

Therefore lack of educational support from the beginnings of the band movement meant that bands had to educate themselves. One reason bands had to look to themselves was that instrumental teaching relied on private enterprise. Instrumental education in the Colne Valley, for example, as late as 1898, was

---

100 State Aid to Music at Home and Abroad', p.207.

101 State Aid to Music at Home and Abroad', p.208.

102 State Aid to Music at Home and Abroad', p.208.

103 Goldby, *Instrumental Teaching*, p. 67

considered poor. An editorial in the *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* criticised music professors who were setting themselves up as teachers with little experience and few qualifications who saw music teaching as a way to earn a significant sum of money.<sup>104</sup>

Change did occur with Forster's Education Act of 1870. The existing 20,000 voluntary schools were given slightly increased grants. Where school places were insufficient new school boards could be established, or where there was a demand from ratepayers, school boards could be rate-aided with powers to compel attendance and build schools. School fees of a few pence a week were charged, but poorer parents could be excused payment. As a result of the Act voluntary schools and the new board schools operated a dual system, each school's management committee dealing with Whitehall.<sup>105</sup> Significantly, in 1872, John Hullah, who passionately believed in the civilising effect of music on the working class, was appointed inspector of music in schools and he stayed in the post until 1881. Any developments he could have implemented were lessened as his appointment was only part time, and he concentrated his efforts on the teacher training colleges rather than the schools themselves.<sup>106</sup>

In 1876 Sandon's Education Act created school attendance committees for areas where there were no school boards and these attendance committees had the power to compel attendance.<sup>107</sup> Various loopholes were removed by the incoming Liberal ministry when the 1880 Education Act obliged local authorities (as designated by the 1876 Elementary Education Act) to make byelaws

---

104 *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* ( 30 September, 1898).

105 Chris Cook, *The Routledge Companion to Britain in the Nineteenth Century, 1815-1914* (Abingdon, 2005), p. 110

106 Goldby, *Instrumental Teaching*, pp. 69-70.

107 Cook, *The Routledge Companion to Britain*, p. 110.

enforcing school attendance for children between five and ten,<sup>108</sup> and provided for penalties in cases where 10-13 year olds were illegally employed. It thus effectively established in practice the universal education which the 1870 Act had declared in principle.<sup>109</sup> The move towards free education came with the 1891 education act; an act to make further provision for assisting Education in Public Elementary Schools in England and Wales. This made available a capitation grant of ten-shillings to all schools, to enable them to stop charging fees.<sup>110</sup>

In spite of these educational reforms by this time band methods were fully established, largely negating the need for state intervention in the musical education of brass players. This was because brass bands had been working on their own methods and education. This autodidactic element of music education became most evident when a competent player was promoted to bandmaster.

### **The Bandmaster as Internal Mentor**

Outside the influence of band mentors such as fathers and experienced players it was the bandmaster who both novices and established players relied on for guidance on how to play band repertoire on a weekly basis. Bands often found bandmasters from within their own ranks. The core of band periodicals was weekly and monthly advice on how a bandmaster should train a band. Moreover, the band periodicals had much to say on how a bandmaster should conduct

---

108 Cook, *The Routledge Companion to Britain*, p. 110.

109 *Education in England* <<http://www.educationengland.org.uk/history/chapter03.html>> accessed, 10 December, 2014. The 1880 Education Act is sometimes referred to as the Mundella Act after Liberal MP Anthony Mundella, Vice-President of the Board of Education from 1880 to 1885.

110 Cook, *The Routledge Companion to Britain*, p. 110.

themselves in front of players and the kind of ‘gentleman’ a bandmaster should aspire to as an individual.

Towards the end of the nineteenth century band publications had become well established with a nationwide range of publishers. Publications fell into two areas; the first was the earlier *journals*, which included published music for non-standardised instrumental groups. As Trevor Herbert and John Wallace have written, ‘the printed journals, the most widely consumed music for brass bands in the Victorian period, were aimed at, and designed for, a market which was diverse rather than standardized.’<sup>111</sup> The journals offered little more than musical parts. The repertoire in these journals was varied in technical demands but offers no telling evidence about playing technique and style.<sup>112</sup> *The Bandmaster*, from July 1872, was typical of its kind and contained undemanding parts that could fit bands of various instrumentations.<sup>113</sup> From the 1880s, brass band periodicals became much more discursive and began to offer a wide range of tips on matters of musical ensemble, individual technique, music theory and ethical behaviour.<sup>114</sup> Two influential examples were Wright and Round’s *Brass Band News*, first published in 1881, and the *British Bandsman*, first published in 1887. In 1895, Algernon Rose had listed thirteen band publications that were in circulation, not including the *British Bandsman*.<sup>115</sup> Rose called all the publications ‘journals’, yet

---

111 Herbert and Wallace, ‘Aspects of Performance Practices’, p. 280.

112 Herbert and Wallace, ‘Aspects of Performance Practices’, p. 281.

113 Herbert and Wallace, ‘Aspects of Performance Practices’, p.281.

114 Herbert and Wallace, ‘Aspects of Performance Practice’ in Herbert (Ed.), *The British Brass Band* p. 295.

115 *Brass Band News* (Liverpool, from 1887), *Cornet* (Boston, from 1893), *Wright and Round’s Brass Band Journal* (Liverpool, from 1879), *Northern Brass Band Journal* (South Shields, from c.1890), *Midland Brass Band Journal* (Wolverhampton, from?), *Metcalfe’s Brass Band Journal* (Wolverhampton, from, 1885), *Manchester Brass Band Journal* (Manchester, from,?), *Haigh’s Brass Band Journal* (Hull, from 1857), *Frost’s Brass Band Journal* (Manchester, from 1879.), *Chappell’s Brass Band Journal* (London, from, 1862), *Champion Brass Band Journal* (Hull, from 1857), *Challenge Brass Band Journal* (London, from, 1862), *Boosey’s Brass Band Journal* (London, from, 1852), source: Algernon S. Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, p. 359.

before the 1880s it is unlikely these publications were discursive as later examples were.

The earliest was the *Champion Brass Band Journal* founded by Richard Smith in Hull in 1857. At around the same time Thomas A. Haigh founded the *Amateur Brass and Military Band Journal*, also in Hull. Around 1879 James Frost founded the *Manchester Brass and Military Band Journal*. Arguably the most significant development was when Thomas Wright and Henry Round founded the *Liverpool Brass (and Military) Band Journal*. Wright and Round became the largest and most influential publisher of brass band music during the last quarter of the nineteenth century.<sup>116</sup>

It was the more discursive band periodicals that reinforced the autodidactic nature of working-class reading and education. Jonathon Rose argues that autodidacts' motives were various but the primary concern was to have intellectual independence, resisting the top-down dissemination of ideology, preferring to discover for themselves the ideas behind philosophy, politics and religion.<sup>117</sup> Rose argues that this intellectual independence was strongest amongst people who had to follow orders and wanted to change that, tracing an autodidactic tradition back to the Lollards.<sup>118</sup> By the nineteenth century working people had gravitated to a library of books that were mostly standard classics of the long eighteenth century: *Pilgrim's Progress*, *Robinson Crusoe*, *The Vicar of Wakefield* and *Tom Jones*, for example.<sup>119</sup> Also popular were bound volumes of

---

116 Roy Newsome, *The Nineteenth Century Brass Band in Northern England, Musical and Social Factors in the Development of A Major Amateur Musical Medium* (PhD Thesis, Salford University), p. 4.

117 Rose, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes*, pp. 12-13.

118 Rose, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes*, p. 13.

119 Rose, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes*, p. 120.

any periodical from the same period, including *Spectator*, *Tatler*, *Guardian* and *Rambler*.<sup>120</sup>

When the *Cornet* recommended that bandsmen share their music books, scores and tutor books they were mirroring the wider working-class literary experience. It was not uncommon for industrial towns of any size to have a second-hand bookstall at the local market.<sup>121</sup> Following the pattern that many retail goods have followed, books were originally desirable as first editions, hence expensive. They would then become unfashionable, and, for a short time, end up on cheap second-hand stalls, then some items would gain an antique cachet, and become desirable again.<sup>122</sup> It was when books were cheap that the working class had an opportunity to obtain them. The band periodicals provided a cheap and readily available supplement. The joint spending power of the band could make them available to members. Band committees would vote to subscribe to a periodical for the band. Cleckheaton Christian Brethren Temperance Brass Band's committee, for example, voted in 1897 'that we have *Richardson's Cornet Journal*.'<sup>123</sup> In 1889 the committee voted 'that we have the *Brass Band News*.'<sup>124</sup> A year later they voted 'that we have the *Wright and Round Journal*.'<sup>125</sup> This trend was replicated over the Pennines in Heap Bridge Brass Band. In 1900 their committee voted that 'we subscribe to *Boosey and Hawkes Journal*.'<sup>126</sup> Therefore sharing the periodicals throughout the band gave

---

120 Rose, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes*, p. 120.

121 Rose, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes*, p. 120.

122 Rose, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes*, pp.120-121.

123 *Minute Book of The Christian Brethren Brass Band, Cleckheaton*, West Yorkshire Archive Service, Huddersfield, Catalogue Reference, K131(9 November, 1897).

124 *Minute Book* (12 August, 1889).

125 *Minute Book* (29 December, 1890).

126 *Heap Bridge Brass Band Minute Book, 1898-1914*, Bury Archive Service, Catalogue Reference, RHB/1/1 (21 January, 1900).

members a template of musical instruction to follow that would be being spread throughout the movement.

The periodicals understood this role. They understood that bandsmen often only had the opportunity to learn - and understand - music in the communal practice space. Writing in 1895 the *Cornet* stressed the general musical education aspect of the bandsmen, they wrote 'our experience has been that generally speaking brass bandsmen have but a rudimentary knowledge of the elements of music. Thousands of bandsmen have no means of procuring instruction other than provided by the bands' practices.'<sup>127</sup> Hence it was not uncommon for the periodicals to feature regular columns explaining the rudiments of music. In 1903, for example, the *British Bandsman* featured a column, by L. H. Keay, called *Easy Lessons in the Elements of Music for Bandsmen*, which showed the very basics of music, what a bar line was, for example, which Keay defined as 'perpendicular lines drawn across the stave to divide the music into measures, to facilitate time-keeping and to show the accentuation.'<sup>128</sup> In the next edition, having learnt what a crotchet was, together with what common time was (four beats in a bar), Keay moved on to the complexities of duple time, or two beats in a bar.<sup>129</sup> This was soon followed by lessons on pitch and the use of sharps, naturals and flats,<sup>130</sup> scales followed next.<sup>131</sup> Clearly this is elementary musical knowledge; nevertheless, we must remember that state music education was limited and that dissemination of

---

127 *Cornet* (15 January, 1895), p. 5.

128 *British Bandsman* (4 April, 1903), p. 83.

129 *British Bandsman* (11 April, 1903), p. 103.

130 *British Bandsman*, (8 August, 1903), p. 115.

131 *British Bandsman*, (15 August, 1903), p. 535.

music theory in the periodicals was the most efficient and cost effective way of transferring music theory to bandsmen.

The bandmaster was often promoted from within the band. Therefore, by definition, the bandmaster should know more than the bandsmen. This placed the bandmaster under significant strain to be the mentor: the *Cornet* argued that the bandsmen should 'hold a weekly class with the bandmaster.'<sup>132</sup> In short, because a player had instrumental skill it did not necessarily make that player a good bandmaster or trainer. The *Cornet* recognised that the bandmaster is 'constantly demanded of him that which is beyond his understanding.'<sup>133</sup> To remedy this, and reflecting the autodidactic reading tradition, they recommended that 'working-class men should build a library of books: operas, song and text books.'<sup>134</sup> To this end *Wright and Round's Amateur Band Teacher's Guide and Bandsman's Adviser* wrote about the status of the amateur bandmaster. They wrote that 'the skill of the amateur band depends on the skill of the amateur bandmaster.'<sup>135</sup> The periodical recognised that the bandmaster would be generally promoted from within the band and reflecting on the difficulty of the working class in obtaining literature, they wrote 'he may be -and generally is - a hard-working man who finds it difficult to keep himself respectable and make ends meet.'<sup>136</sup> They saw that the bandmaster had little money to spend on books, music or to pay for lessons in harmony and even less to visit professional concerts or the opera.<sup>137</sup> In short, the periodical argued that the band should help

---

132 *Cornet* (15 January, 1895).

133 *Cornet* (15 January, 1895).

134 *Cornet* (15 January, 1895).

135 *Wright and Round's Amateur Band Teacher's Guide and Bandsman's Adviser* (Liverpool, 1889), p. 11.

136 *Amateur Band Teacher's Guide*, p.11.

137 *Amateur Band Teacher's Guide*, p.11.



the bandmaster become a professional musician writing ‘the band should find him a teacher, give him the means to educate himself and pay him ten shillings a week.’<sup>138</sup>

What was of importance was that the periodicals stressed that the bandsmen, and more importantly the bandmaster, should be eloquent, educated and literate. The tone that emerged in the periodicals was that the working person should elevate themselves above ignorance and, above all, not be seen as a tyrant or a bully. On one hand they were seen as hard working men who found it hard to make ends meet but on the other hand they were expected to have superior knowledge and act as gentlemen. This list of attributes of superior knowledge and gentlemanly conduct were a refrain that was oft repeated in the band periodicals.

In October 1898, for example, the *Cornet* wrote that ‘a bandmaster always owes his position to having a superior knowledge of music.’<sup>139</sup> *Brass Band News* was of the opinion that band periodicals (in particular theirs) were the agency that brought knowledge and gentlemanly conduct about. The rhetoric reflected that bandmasters may have struggled to express the information they wanted to share with eloquence, resulting in frustration, and the bandmaster losing their temper. In 1901 they wrote:

The bandmaster who loses his temper is lost [...]. Keep a strong check on your feelings, and remember, you occupy the position of a gentleman, and it is your duty to act as such. Treat your pupils as gentlemen, and quietly but firmly insist on their treating you as a gentleman.<sup>140</sup>

---

<sup>138</sup> *Amateur Band Teacher's Guide*, p.11.

<sup>139</sup> *Cornet* (15 October, 1898), additional supplement, p. 2.

<sup>140</sup> *Brass Band News* (1 December, 1901), p. 4.

*Brass Band News* counselled tact, patience and understanding, also advising the bandmaster to try different approaches to get his methods across to the band, writing:

Patience brother, patience [...]. It is very depressing to go to the bandroom time after time to find only half the men to meet[...]to have to listen to shabby excuses[...] as sufficient justification for half-hearted attendance. Make the best of it. Keep your temper. Bide your time. Work on cheerfully, do your best for those that do meet you [...]. Treat them as your younger brothers. Be kind, courteous and considerate, and never forget that no matter what your pupils may be, you are a gentleman. Respect yourself and they will respect you. A tactless teacher can never be successful. One man succeeds simply because he smooths all the men the right way; while another fails because he never troubles to find out whether there is a right or wrong way.<sup>141</sup>

For the bandmaster the periodicals became a guide to refer to when wanting guidance on how to run a band practice. This guidance, and the questions bandmasters asked about, fell into four broad categories: basic instrumental technique, articulation, intonation and balance, repertoire performance, often in terms of preparing a contest piece, and behaviour and discipline in band practices and in public arenas. Writing in 1905 *Brass Band News* gave advice to the bandmaster that showed the need for constant reinforcement of basic technique:

When practice is slack and listless, and bad attendances are the rule, the poor bandmaster has a hard time of it in trying to give value for money by giving such instructions as will both interest and educate his pupils:

- 1) You are not holding your instruments properly.
- 2) Your fingers do not fall on the valve tops correctly.
- 3) Stand more erect; you are stooping and cramping your organs of respiration.
- 4) Use your tongue a little more decidedly.
- 5) That is not sustaining: do not let the note die away.

---

<sup>141</sup> *Brass Band News* (1 December, 1901), p. 4.

6) Your intonation is not good.

7) Do you notice that some of you are making long crotchets and some short ones? They should be the same length.

8) We ought to get a better blend of this chord, the horn is too weak and the cornet too strong.<sup>142</sup>

The bandmaster could write to the periodicals to ask advice on how best to implement these techniques. 'Baton', for example, wrote to *The Cornet* in 1900, asking:

I am anxious that my band play in tune. I have spent a good bit of time tuning them, but cannot get them as I would like. I seem to do very well with the cornets, but the bigger instruments completely baffle me, is there any way to learn tuning, or could you through your columns give me a few hints on the matter?<sup>143</sup>

In the same edition 'New Tupton' had a query about how to interpret tempo marks. The question and the answer illustrated how both bandsmen and bandmasters relied upon their own musical community for education, concentrating on reading books and finding alternate route to knowledge. Finally, both the question, and the answer, reflected the elementary nature of music education, these were relatively simple questions and show that the novice bandmaster was someone who had enthusiasm but lacked knowledge, 'New Tupton' asked:

In your Welsh Selection, *Cambrian Echoes*, the first selection is "Allegro Moderato" (108 crotchets), which changes to "Menno Mosso"- which of these is the faster as there has been a little dispute of it in our band? (2.) Also please let me know which is the best book for a young conductor who wishes to learn the different times of movements.<sup>144</sup>

The *Cornet* responded:

---

142 *Brass Band News* (1 February, 1905), p. 4.

143 *Cornet* (15 February, 1900), p. 4.

144 *Cornet* (15 February, 1904). The dispute over the term's meaning suggests that the bandsmen were lacking a precise definition rather than an internal argument between bandsmen over its meaning.

The “Allegro Moderato” must go smart and brisk in quick march time. “Meno Mosso” means slower time; this must be in quick waltz time, about 76 to 80 beats in the minute.  
2) There is no book published that is devoted entirely to your needs. You might obtain the “Dictionary of Musical Terms”, by John Hiles.<sup>145</sup>

They then went on to explain the basic ways to conduct these time signatures writing, ‘always remember the following: the first beat in the bar is always the down and the last beat in the bar is on an up beat.’<sup>146</sup>

In addition to these techniques the bandmaster could also find advice on how to rehearse the band to perform repertoire. It is worth noting that band periodicals’ correspondents were usually editorial constructions, using made-up names. The *British Bandsman* had other correspondents who had pen-names such as ‘Midlandite’, ‘Shoddythorpe’ and ‘Slow Worm’.<sup>147</sup> These correspondents’ instructions were precise in their musical instructions, moving from bar-to-bar in detail. In 1912, for example, ‘Northern Teacher’ wrote in the *British Bandsman*, on how to prepare for Charles Godfrey’s arrangement of *Martina*, writing:

In bar 3 the arpeggio figure between repiano, solo cornet and soprano must be practiced until no break is perceptible. These remarks apply to bars 5, 6, 7 and 8. The next four bars show off the tonal qualities of the band and require to be given with great vigour but do not stab at the last quaver. The last four bars afford a great contrast and are like calm after a storm.<sup>148</sup>

For those bands without a professional trainer, the periodicals acted as overall mentors. Moreover, periodicals started to cement how bands played before they came together on the contest field. The periodicals became a repository of

---

145 *Cornet* (15 February, 1904).

146 *Cornet* (15 February, 1904).

147 Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914*, p. 148.

148 *British Bandsman* (20 April, 1912), p. 42.

knowledge for the bands to use, creating a commonality of musical language shared by bandsmen.

The bandmaster had a reciprocal relationship with his band. He relied upon the band to support his musical education and the band relied upon the bandmaster to encourage and train them to be a better band. Periodicals were the way that bandmasters could keep informed about current methods and techniques. Eventually a bandmaster would do his best to replicate the advice that was given in the periodicals. All these elements meant that brass bands were self-replicating their musical experiences, from novice to bandmaster: their musical experience was constantly referred back to a well-established pattern of techniques, methods and standards of behaviour.

In spite of the enthusiasm for music and music education the bandmaster promoted from within could only take the band so far. Bands were most likely to engage a professional trainer when they were about to enter a contest. Nationally brass bands drew contest judges from the ranks of military bandmasters, reflecting a reliance of brass bands on military musical orthodoxy and style. From the first edition of the *British Bandsman*, in 1887, the standard of military bands was seen as what brass bands should strive to achieve. Many military bandmasters judged contests and arranged brass band contest pieces, as well as taking payment for training volunteer regiment bands. In *Talks With Bandsmen*, Rose listed thirty-two bandmasters from cavalry regiments, three from artillery regiments and one from the Royal Engineers. From the infantry regiments there are three from the guards' regiments. From the Irish, Welsh, Scottish and English county regiments, including the West India Regiment, there

were two bandmasters each totalling one-hundred and thirty eight.<sup>149</sup>

Significantly military bandmasters had close links with the brass band periodicals, the majority of London publications being edited by them and they also contributed articles to other musical periodicals in the country. London based military bandmasters were in a position to understand styles and repertoire that had recently become fashionable in the capital.<sup>150</sup> Therefore, the emerging professional civilian band trainers that bands engaged had set orthodoxies to copy from military bandmasters.

If brass bands found orthodoxy from military bandmasters, can it be said that demobbed militia, or military musicians, playing as amateur bandsmen, reinforced military orthodoxy when they practiced in the bandroom? Britain in the nineteenth century was, despite its reputation for Liberal retrenchment in military matters, a remarkably militarised society. Joanna Bourke has noticed that at the start of the twentieth century 22 per cent of men between 17 and 40 years of age had some military service.<sup>151</sup> In 1896, the *Magazine of Music* gave an outline of the number of military bands that were active, the correspondent wrote:

In the service there are one hundred and forty-six infantry bands, of which three belong to the Foot Guards, one each to the Artillery and Engineers and the remainder to the infantry of the line. The cavalry, including two household regiments and Royal Horse Artillery, number thirty-two. These figures do not include the Militia, Volunteers and Royal Marines. Taking all the bands together, it is reckoned that there are six-thousand musicians in the military service of the Crown.<sup>152</sup>

---

149 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, pp. 363-367.

150 Trevor Herbert, 'Nineteenth-Century Bands, Making a Movement', in Herbert (Ed.), *The British Brass Band*, p. 63.

151 Joanna Bourke, *Working-Class Cultures in Britain, Gender, Ethnicity and Class* (London, 1994), pp. 176-177.

152 Anon, 'How Our Military Bandsmen are Trained', *Magazine of Music* Vol 13.No. 3 (March, 1896), p. 175.

Moreover, the *Magazine of Music* recognised that because of the short service system, introduced by Edward Cardwell, the then Secretary of State for War, in 1870, military bandsmen would only stay in the military for six years.<sup>153</sup> Thus, it is reasonable to say that there were likely to be a large number of ex-military personnel playing in amateur brass bands. This is reinforced by Dave Russell who suggested the financial burden of buying brass instruments could be eased for amateur brass bands by demobbed musicians taking instruments into the community.<sup>154</sup>

The number of demobbed military bandsmen active in brass bands is difficult to calculate. This is partly because of the rhetoric of the brass band movement, which concentrated solely on the working-class membership of bands did not account for ex-military musicians as amateur bandsmen. Apart from the trainers and conductors that led the bands military background or training is neglected in the sources as soon as demobbed military bandsmen became workers. Given the orthodoxy and influence of military music within the brass band movement it is valid to argue, however, that, although the numbers are unknown, demobbed bandsmen reinforced and supported military orthodoxy within amateur brass bands because of their experiences in military service.

In 1895 Algernon Rose drew attention to how many band trainers had emerged by the late nineteenth century. An appendix in his book listed 129 band trainers available for hire.<sup>155</sup> From this list eighty were from the north of England

---

153 'How Our Military Bandsmen are Trained', p. 174. For a contemporary history of the lengths of military enlistment see John Adye, 'In Defence of Short Service', in, *The Nineteenth Century: A Monthly Review*, Vol 32. No 187 (September, 1892), pp. 358-369.

154 Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District*, p. 38.

155 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, pp. 374 -377.

and forty-three came from the Southern Pennines. Eight came from the industrial towns of Lancashire.<sup>156</sup> There were twenty-three from the Manchester region. In Yorkshire, four were from Bradford,<sup>157</sup> two were from Leeds,<sup>158</sup> and finally, six were from Huddersfield.<sup>159</sup> This reflected what Trevor Herbert has highlighted: that in the Yorkshire and Lancashire textile districts, there were a plentiful number of brass band composers, conductors and arrangers, who mostly came from a working-class background, such as Edward Newton, for example, a textile worker, who wrote over three hundred marches.<sup>160</sup>

If there were plentiful band trainers is it safe to assume that they were all of a high standard? The evidence shows that some early trainers were people whose teaching method depended upon shouting and cursing to get their points across. What became evident was that the same methods that the amateur bandmasters used were repeated by professional trainers. The importance of articulation, tuning, sound quality and time are constantly reinforced. As we have seen the band periodicals did not approve of rough behaviour, constantly calling for improvement in manners and methods of teaching delivery. Early memories of band practices, however, reflected the working-class nature of the environment. If the periodical called for eloquence, and gentlemanly conduct, then it seems they were struggling against the acceptance that bad language and shouting were the norm in the rehearsal environment, and, if not liked by the players, there was stoic acceptance by the bandsmen that the trainer would be

---

156 J. Barker, Rochdale, J. Bedford, Salop, J.E. Birtwell, Sabden, T. Hardacre, Bacup, W.E. Holt, Rochdale, H. Lees, Delph, J Partington, Bolton and J.C. Wright, Farnworth.

157 J. Baily, Queensbury, H. Barker, Bradford, G.F. Birkenshaw, Great Horton and H. Cannar, Bradford.

158 H.C. Docherty and G. Raine.

159 F. Renshaw, Brockholes, R. Stead, Slaithwaite, E. Swift and F. Swift, Milnsbridge and T. Wheelwright, Huddersfield.

160 Herbert, 'Nineteenth-Century Bands: Making a Movement', in Herbert (Ed), *The British Brass Band*, p. 63.



like this. Bandsmen tolerated it because they were ambitious and wanted to win contests. An old retired player remembered the kind of attitude and language used by one trainer:

There has been a great change come over bands and teachers since the *Brass Band News* got established, and one of the best things it has done has been to show teachers that it pays to be a gentleman. When contesting [...] was young; it was thought there was only one way to get a band in form for a contest and that was "bully them into it". I have in my mind's eye a teacher[...]who was much in request in the district. We will call him George Bluster Ripantare. I well remember the first time he came to our band. We all assembled in good time. One of our men went to meet him at the station. When he arrived he went to the middle without a word of greeting. Out came the score. Ready! One! Two! Three! Four! Off we went. After about eight bars he pulled us up.

"What the - are you doing?"

"Where the - did you get these instruments?"

"Who the - taught you how to blow?"

"I never heard such a - row in my life, talk about going to a contest?"

Then after a bit of rough advice to one and another he counted us off again.

"What are you grunting at that with that bass?"

"Tongue it man, tongue it, spit the notes out. I don't want that grunting noise...hold the notes out man, are you broken winded?"

"Now then stand up straight there!"

And so the rehearsal went for another two hours, and not one pleasant solid word, nor any word of encouragement. If we had not been in such deadly earnest, and so extremely anxious to make a name, we could never have stood it. But I noticed that all these Ripantare men gradually got left<sup>161</sup>, and I can call to mind two or three that died sour and discontented men. If I was to tell you all the bullying remarks I have heard you would scarcely credit it. The *Brass Band News* has changed all that, thank goodness.<sup>162</sup>

---

161 As in, got left behind, or were no longer employed as trainers.

162 *Brass Band News* (1 February, 1908), p. 4.

In spite of this bandsman's disapproval, and the eventual disappearance of these 'bullies', this article emphasised that the band was a working-class environment. In 1908, in an interview in the *British Bandsman*, John Gladney made the controversial remark that northern bands were inherently rough in their behaviour. When asked to compare northern bands to midland and Welsh bands, he said 'both are far ahead of Lancashire and Yorkshire [...].Why some of the Yorkshire bands are positively vulgar at times. They do not appear to study manners of gentlemanly behaviour at all.'<sup>163</sup> In the next issue the editorial passionately denied this claim, stressing, like other periodicals, that 'bandsmen have had the advantage for the past twenty years of the refining aspect of this special paper, published in their interests, and containing[...]articles intended to uplift the reader in morals, to engrain ambition in him, to repress the ruder elements, and, in short, to incubate gentlemanly behaviour!'<sup>164</sup> In this editorial the frustration can be heard. Regardless of who had upset Gladney, the comment had been made and the fact was that the periodicals were constantly asking for better manners from bandsmen. The *British Bandsman* commented that bands relied on the public support and that if 'bandsmen of a certain band are rowdy or ill-mannered, its [the public's] interest and sympathy is wearied and its support withheld.'<sup>165</sup> This rhetoric was clearly highlighting the truth that bands were places where working-class vulgarity could exist without being challenged from within the band. The *British Bandsman's* frustration lay in the truth that bandsmen were working class. The periodicals constantly wanted bandsmen to

---

<sup>163</sup> *British Bandsman* (18 April, 1908), p. 532.

<sup>164</sup> *British Bandsman* (2 May, 1908), p. 1.

<sup>165</sup> *British Bandsman* (2 May, 1908), p. 1.

elevate themselves above their working-class environment. The *British Bandsman* wrote, 'again and again we have claimed a higher place in the musical world for our bandsmen, and we still claim that upon their artistic attainments they are entitled to equal recognition with orchestral players.'<sup>166</sup>

For the majority of bandsmen this was not possible. The way players became bandmasters and then trainers only kept working-class behaviour within a closed group. Inevitably working-class patterns of behaviour were kept in place by this internal nature of promotions. The early days of band practices and contests began with the individual player, who soon became initiated into the working-class musical environment of experienced mentors, bandmasters and trainers. Periodicals such as the *British Bandsman* and *Brass Band News* were vocal in their efforts to make bandsmen 'gentlemen'. This rhetoric was repeated because they wanted the band movement to be seen as respectable to middle-class observers who were taking an increased interest in working-class leisure.

Regardless of this editorial rhetoric, bandsmen mirrored their interactions at work in the rehearsal space. Band periodicals were attempting to lessen the rougher bandsmen's working-class traits, yet the rehearsal space was where respectable and the rough could coexist. Bandsmen not only learned music but also how to interact with each other and behave in the band. Before bandsmen came into contact with other players and better bands their only mentor was the bandmaster promoted from within. Professional trainers were employed when a contest was imminent. Yet not all trainers were gentlemen, they could swear, shout and be uncouth in their rehearsal style. The *Brass Band News* did hope

---

<sup>166</sup> *British Bandsman* (2 May, 1908), p, 1.

that these people were on the wane. Nevertheless, what is revealed is that bandsmen were, in the final analysis, working men. The *Brass Band News* recognised this and, significantly, acknowledged that bandsmen expected to be surrounded by people who were of their own class. Elitism or superiority was frowned upon. As John Benson has put it, ‘by the middle of the nineteenth century certain groups of workers and their families were displaying an identifiable “communality of interest”’.<sup>167</sup> These working-class interests were based upon the commonalities found in working-class occupations and although population movement did disrupt these commonalities the activities of bandsmen brought them together again in the bandroom. Bandsmen wanted to learn music but on their own terms. Through musical practices bandsmen had begun to establish the way they spent their leisure time and the degree of respect with which they were regarded. They were working men who were also working bandsmen. By 1889, the *Brass Band News* noticed that around Manchester:

In this district (Manchester), our amateur bands are composed of horny-handed working men exclusively. By working men I mean factory-men, forge-men, colliers and so on. We never expect to have a man as a member who “sets his living with his coat on”, and this class, are, as a rule (there are honourable exceptions), such superior persons that would rather have their room than their company.<sup>168</sup>

Therefore, when the novice player joined the band he not only learned to play music, but also how to behave in the band. This relied upon interacting with and gaining the respect of other players, other players who were also working men. The periodicals reported on the more successful bandsmen who had become proficient soloists, trainers, teachers and adjudicators; they had perhaps

---

<sup>167</sup> John Benson, *The Working Class in Britain, 1850-1939* (London and New York, 1989), p. 125.

<sup>168</sup> *Brass Band News*, n.p. (May, 1899), cited in, *Wright and Rounds Amateur Band Teacher's Guide*, p. 11.

succeeded in becoming the gentleman bandsman. Despite the success these players achieved the commonality was that they all began as novice players and all relied upon other working people for their education. For the novice bandsman the overarching experience was to remain as a working man who enjoyed the brass band as a form of leisure. It was the self-replicating way that bandsmen learnt to play that meant that musical practice formed a foundation that supported larger working-class networks when the bands left the bandrooms and played in public. Chapter three expands this theme of working-class identity and musical performance and examines what happened when the bands came under the scrutiny of established and professional trainers and the watching public.

## **The Professionalisation of the Brass Band Movement, 1880 to 1914:**

### **The influence of the triumvirate of John Gladney (1839-1911), Alexander Owen (1851-1920) and Edwin Swift (1843-1904)**

Chapter two examined how repeated musical practices led to the reinforcement of working-class musical identity that was constructed in the practice space. The self-contained method of musical performance developed and maintained a cultural identity for working-class bandsmen. From within this amateur network professional trainers and conductors emerged who would come to define the brass band movement's instrumentation, sound, repertoire and performance style. Through their influence a professional approach to musicianship began to emerge within the brass band movement, reinforcing and further centralising elements that that became established at an amateur level.

This chapter will examine how three music arrangers, adjudicators and band trainers, John Gladney (1839-1911), Alexander Owen (1851-1920) and Edwin Swift (1843-1904), cemented brass band techniques through the strengthening of methods already in place with the use of repertoire, arrangements and training methods that could be copied easily. These trainers' methods meant that when novice bands played in public they were imitating the successful 'crack' bands that the triumvirate trained. As a result of this top-down

imitation the working-class presence of bandsmen in the public arena gained cohesion and uniformity outside the bandroom. In addition, this uniformity of musical processes enabled a way that commentators could view the wider working-class social networks of bands.

This triumvirate of men was significant because their influence upon the brass band movement in the final decades of the nineteenth century was overpowering, particularly from 1875 to 1895. J. L. Scott points out that there were few major contests in this period when one, two, or all three of them did not conduct one of the winning bands.<sup>1</sup> At the height of their most productive period, the status of these trainers was clear to the band movement. In 1895 an author in the *Cornet* wrote 'bandmasters there are by the thousand, but band teachers, oh! How few! He must be at least an Owen or Gladney in embryo.'<sup>2</sup>

### **John Gladney, 1839-1911**

Of the three, John Gladney was the only one who came from a musical family and was the only one who was a professional musician. He was born in Belfast on 12 August 1839. His father, also John Gladney, was the bandmaster with the 30<sup>th</sup> Regiment and this led to a peripatetic childhood, travelling with his father's postings.<sup>3</sup> His musical life began when he was four, when his father taught him to play the piccolo. In 1861 he joined the Hallé Orchestra where he was to remain for most of his career. His father introduced him to brass bands and his first post

---

1 J. L. Scott, *The Evolution of the Brass Band and its Repertoire in Northern England* (PhD Thesis, University of Sheffield, 1970), p. 248.

2 *Cornet* (15 January, 1895), p. 5.

3 Trevor Herbert, Gladney, John (1838-1911) *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford, 2004) [www.oxfordnb.com/view/article/48776](http://www.oxfordnb.com/view/article/48776)> accessed, 3 February, 2008.

as a brass band conductor was with the Tower Hamlets Band (London) in the late 1850s.<sup>4</sup> He would gain his reputation, however, as a band trainer and conductor with the bands in the north of England from the 1860s onwards.

Gladney reputedly trained and conducted more than one hundred bands. His status as a brass band trainer began with Meltham Mills Band, in the West Riding's Holme Valley. In 1871 Gladney was adjudicating at Belle Vue, when Meltham Mills played; he was not impressed and gave their performance poor marks and a poor review.<sup>5</sup> The band was outraged at these comments and Richard Stead, the euphonium player, argued the band should meet with Gladney and tell him what they thought of him and demand to know how he could improve them. Gladney said at the meeting that 'perhaps he could'.<sup>6</sup> The results speak for themselves. During his first two years with the band they entered thirteen contests, winning several prizes, including six firsts. In 1873 they entered ten contests, winning another six first prizes. Between Gladney's appointment in 1871 and 1883 the band won seventy-two prizes and tied four times for joint first place, together with twenty-three second prizes and a further tie.<sup>7</sup> Meltham Mills Brass Band succeeded Bacup Old Brass Band - Britain's premier band in the 1880s – in contest prize money, winning £3,805 in contest prizes.<sup>8</sup> These and other victories made Gladney the most sought-after band

---

4 Herbert, *Gladney, John*.

5 Ron Massy, *Meltham and Meltham Mills Band 1846 -1996, 150 Years of Music*, Commemorative Booklet (n.p.1996), p. 6.

6 Arthur R. Taylor, *Brass Bands* (London, 1979), p. 71.

7 Roy Newsome, *Brass Roots: A Hundred Years of Brass Bands and Their Music, 1836-1936* (Sutton, 1998), p. 49.

8 Newsome, *Brass Roots*, p. 50.



trainer and conductor of the time.<sup>9</sup> He always maintained that Meltham Mills Band was 'unequaled in perfection'.<sup>10</sup>

One of Gladney's most impressive innovations was to standardise the instrumentation of the brass band.<sup>11</sup> Thirty years later he wrote to *Brass Band News*:

In 1871 when I conducted Burnley, the bands had no fixed instrumentation, the average band numbered fifteen or sixteen. Ophicleides had been in use right up to then. Keyed bugles and clarinets were in use up to the 1860s[...].When I took up Meltham, in 1873,<sup>12</sup> I at once remodelled [...] to a band of twenty-four [...]. The great success of Meltham soon made other bands fall in line.<sup>13</sup>

Gladney's model was as follows:

1 Eb Soprano Cornet  
3 Bb Solo Cornets  
2 Bb Repiano Cornets  
1 Bb Second Cornet  
1 Bb Third Cornet  
2 Bb Flugel Horns (1st and 2nd)  
3 Eb Horns (1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup>)  
2 Bb Baritones (1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup>)  
2 Bb Trombones (1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup>)  
1 G (Bass) Trombone  
2 Bb Euphoniums (solo and 2<sup>nd</sup>)  
2 Eb Bombardons (Basses)  
1 Bb Bass (medium size)  
1 BBb Bass (large)  
Drums (Drums were not allowed at major contests.)<sup>14</sup>

---

9 Gladney surrounded himself with proficient players and this clearly helped him succeed. The core was the Stead brothers: Wright played the soprano cornet, Richard, the euphonium and Edwin the trombone. Wright was known to disappear for weeks after a successful contest, Richard was known as being quite proud and over-confident, while Edwin, after winning a hat trick of soloist medals with Meltham Mills, later joined Black Dyke Band and repeated the feat.

However, it is important to note that the third member of the triumvirate - Alexander Owen - at this time was the solo cornet player. (Source: Taylor, *Brass Bands*), p. 70.

10 Herbert, *Gladney, John*.

11 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 72.

12 This is Gladney's mistake, the accepted date is 1871.

13 *Brass Band News* (November 1904), cited in, Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 72.

14 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 73.

Gladney had created a model for all bands to follow if they wished, as he argued, 'to aspire to greatness'.<sup>15</sup> From 1885 to 1887 he repeated a hat trick win at Belle Vue with Kingston Mills Band.<sup>16</sup> In 1888 he took the post of professional conductor with Black Dyke Mills Band. He was, yet again, surrounded by fine quality players and in 1906 led the band on a tour of Canada and the United States.<sup>17</sup> He retired in 1908 aged 68. Gladney had the most musical upbringing of the three and he held a genuine ambition to raise the standards and tastes of amateur musicians.<sup>18</sup> He died of heart failure at his home 36 Camp Street, Broughton, Manchester, on 12 December 1911 and was buried at Ardwick cemetery three days later, leaving a widow and adult family. He was a regular worshipper at Bury Road Congregational Church and was known to be an ardent Conservative in his politics.<sup>19</sup> Gladney had a sophisticated musical talent and in his lifetime was known as 'the father of the brass band movement': a title that he always modestly refused.<sup>20</sup>

### **Edwin Swift (1843 – 1904)**

Gladney's early musical career seems blessed compared to that of Edwin Swift. Swift was a prime example of the working-class autodidact, reflecting many of the attributes of the northern weaver outlined in chapter one. He was also the 'most northern' of the three, described by T. L. Cooper to be 'as Yorkshire as

---

15 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 73.

16 Herbert, *Gladney, John*.

17 Newsome, *Brass Roots*, p. 52.

18 Herbert, *Gladney, John*.

19 Herbert, *Gladney, John*.

20 Herbert, *Gladney, John*.

they come.<sup>21</sup> Self-education brought him genuine satisfaction. Swift had the most in common with the bandsmen he trained. His musical career mapped the same route as many bandsmen, from player to bandmaster then to trainer.

Swift was born at Spring Street, Upper Clough, Linthwaite, near Huddersfield, on 14 May 1843, the son of Joseph Swift, a handloom weaver, and his wife, Hannah.<sup>22</sup> Swift attended a local elementary school until he was nine when he left to become a shuttler in a local cotton mill.<sup>23</sup> His first musical experiences were with a drum and fife band in Huddersfield, which was led by Joseph Thornton, proprietor of Thornton's Temperance Hotel.<sup>24</sup> He also received music theory lessons from a Mr Quarmby, a local amateur clarinettist, and possibly a relative of his mother's.<sup>25</sup> Swift had a brother named Sam, who played the cornet. Much to Sam's annoyance Swift would practice Sam's cornet at every opportunity.<sup>26</sup> His mother was the first to spot his musical talent when she said to Sam, 'nah Sam, if aw wor thee, aw'd neer play that thing ageaen, becos awr Edwin can beat thi head off'.<sup>27</sup>

Swift's work ethic also began at this time often studying and writing music late into the night after his parents had gone to bed. At ten years old he joined Linthwaite band as a cornet player and by the age of fourteen he was the bandmaster and principal cornet player. Swift was buried at a Wesleyan Methodist Chapel and this is a clue to his fierce work ethic. As a child it is most

---

21 T. L. Cooper, *Brass Bands of Yorkshire* (Clapham, Yorkshire, 1974), p. 138.

22 Trevor Herbert, *Swift, Edwin* (1843-1904), *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford, 2004), <[www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/48776](http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/48776)> accessed, 3 February, 2008.

23 Herbert, *Swift, Edwin*.

24 *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904).

25 Herbert, *Swift, Edwin*.

26 *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904).

27 *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904) Unless otherwise mentioned, Swift's biographical details come from his obituary in this paper.

likely that he went to a Methodist Sunday School. For the non-conformist religions education had a moral value, literacy gave working people the ability to read the bible. The attenders of Sunday Schools were chiefly working-class children, the teachers, at least in the first half of the century, being the epitome of working-class respectability.<sup>28</sup> Methodist Sunday Schools and chapels presented the working class with a standard of personal dignity and self-reliance: working people were encouraged to undertake patient labour, temperance and thrift.<sup>29</sup>

The leader of Swift's first band, Thornton, was himself an accomplished flautist and French horn player in 'Old Moore's Quadrille Band' and Thornton was proficient enough to judge brass band contests at the Belle Vue. Yet Thornton was not just a musician who ran a hotel, he was a literate and radical thinker. He was an admirer of Robert Owen. No one in Huddersfield was said to have a better grasp, not only of Owen's ideas, but also those of the French socialists, Saint-Simon, Fourier and Louis Blanc.<sup>30</sup> When the hotel closed, in 1908, the *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* noted that:

For over half a century it had provided a forum for local radicals, philosophers, scientists and poets to discuss religious and political subjects, or modern theories, frowned on elsewhere such as the Mechanics Institutes. Such was its influence on local intellectual and political activity that it earned itself the reputations the 'Centre of Light and Knowledge'.<sup>31</sup>

Swift's first memorable musical achievement was to exasperate the rival band in the area, - Ryland's Band - based at Linthwaite Church in the Colne Valley.

---

28 D.W. Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s* (Oxon, 1989, this edition, 2002), pp. 123-124.

29 For Sunday Schools in the north, see K .D .M. Snell, 'The Sunday-School Movement in England and Wales: Child Labour, Denominational Control and Working-Class Culture', *Past & Present*, No. 164 (August, 1999), pp. 122-168, 30 *Huddersfield Weekly News* (8 November, 1887).

31 *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 October, 1909).

Ryland's had secured a new march which was considered exceptional and they wanted to keep it to themselves. They practiced in Linthwaite Church for two weeks. However, at the end of the first week Swift went to Linthwaite Church and stood outside listening to the march as it was played repeatedly. That night he transcribed all the band parts and on the Saturday afternoon called Linthwaite band for a rehearsal. Long before Ryland's Band made their appearance Linthwaite Band was playing the march through the village, 'to the consternation and surprise of their rivals'.<sup>32</sup> Soon after, Ryland's Band disbanded.

In adult life Swift was a weaver but he still took every possible opportunity to pursue his studies. His loom was near a window so Swift made a small desk to write on at the side. Starting his loom he would turn to his desk and begin arranging band parts, he quickly ignored the loom and he had to pay many fines for damaged pieces of cloth. He had also been known to write on the loom's breast beam and on one occasion his manager was heard to say, 'Edwin, who art ta' weayving for, thi sen ore me!' Edwin replied, 'I am weayving a piece for me sen just now.'<sup>33</sup>

Swift married Maria Mellor, of Upper Clough, Linthwaite, on 4 November 1864. Her father, Thomas Mellor, was a brass band player. They had five sons and three daughters. Two of their sons, Fred and Lawrence, died before their father, in 1899 and 1900 respectively.<sup>34</sup> The death of his two sons brought on a great deal of suffering. Lawrence, the younger of the two, was an organist and a

---

<sup>32</sup> *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904).

<sup>33</sup> *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904).

<sup>34</sup> Herbert, *Swift, Edwin*.

musician of great promise.<sup>35</sup> Fred was a cornet player and at the time of his death was a choirmaster and bandmaster in Dumfries. In addition he had also been bandmaster of Linthwaite Band. In 1901 Swift conducted Wyke Temperance Band at the Crystal Palace contest, playing J. Ord Hume's arrangement of *Gems from Sullivan's Operas Number 3*. This piece contains the funeral anthem, *Brother thou art gone before us* from *Martyr of Antioch*. Swift was overwhelmed with emotion, and, when he was asked where the emotion had come from, said, 'eh lad, when playing that, I am following my two lads to the grave.'<sup>36</sup>

The death of his sons only aggravated an illness that had started with the brutal work regime that Swift set himself. In 1869 he conducted Linthwaite Band in two contests at Slaithwaite and Huddersfield: they came second and fourth respectively. They also took part in the Belle Vue contest where they came fifth.<sup>37</sup> Swift was still working at the mill and these early successes drove him to work harder. When he got home from the mill he would start writing and continue until five in the morning. Then he would get ready for work and do another day at the mill: he would do this several times a week.<sup>38</sup> This regime resulted in serious illness in the spring of 1870.

On 14 May 1875, on his thirty-second birthday, Swift felt confident enough to resign from his work as a handloom weaver to begin his career as a freelance band conductor, arranger and trainer.<sup>39</sup> This must have been a difficult

---

35 Anon, *Life and Career of the Late Mr. Edwin Swift, a Self-Made Musician, Bandmaster and Adjudicator: Trainer of Many of the Leading Bands in the North of England*, (n.p. 1904), p. 13.

36 Anon, *Life and Career of the Late Mr. Edwin Swift*, p.14.

37 *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904).

38 *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904).

39 Herbert, *Swift, Edwin*.

decision for him, as he said 'he had no direct ambition to become a professional, on his own account, he would be well satisfied if he kept the band up to a high standard, as he did work for the love of music. He was the heart and soul in it, so to speak'.<sup>40</sup> In spite of any doubts he may have had, he became extremely successful, especially at raising small village bands to championship standard.<sup>41</sup> Apart from Linthwaite band, he also became instructor to the following: Denton Original, Oldham Rifles, Stalybridge Old, Mosley, Holme Mills, Golcar, Mirfield Rifles, Lindley, Littleborough, Todmorden, Cornholme, Wyke Temperance, Leeds Forge, Dewsbury Old, Stockton-on-Tees, Gainsborough, Rawtenstall, and many others.<sup>42</sup> Many of the bands, chiefly Cornholme, Leeds Forge and Littleborough had notable victories.<sup>43</sup> Wyke Temperance Band and Linthwaite Band, for example, won over £11,000 in contest prizes.<sup>44</sup>

Swift died of cancer of the kidneys on 9 February 1904 at 59 Manchester Road, Milnsbridge, Huddersfield. He was buried on the 12 February at the Wesleyan Chapel burial ground, Holyhouse, just outside Linthwaite.<sup>45</sup> Herbert argues that, 'he was widely regarded as a working class hero'.<sup>46</sup> Swift spent the majority of his life as a weaver. The sociological dilemmas behind the notion of class are not easily solved. Yet if one accepts that social class is determined largely by occupation, and that the working class may be identified by its dependence upon manual labour, then, in 1851, just before Swift began working in a mill, at the age of nine, the working-class population of Britain was 16.2

---

40 *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (12 February, 1904).

41 Herbert, *Swift, Edwin*.

42 *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (12 February, 1904).

43 *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (12 February, 1904).

44 *Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904).

45 Herbert, *Swift, Edwin*.

46 Herbert, *Swift, Edwin*.

million, out of a population of 20.9 million. When, in his thirties, Swift decided to become a professional bands trainer, the working-class population had increased to 20.3 million, out of a total population of 26.2 million.<sup>47</sup>

Therefore, Swift's much reported working-class presence in the brass band movement occurred at a time when not only were people interested in the cultural lives of the working class, but also, when it was accepted that nearly four-fifths of the population engaged in, or supported, by manual labour.<sup>48</sup>

Herbert calls Swift a working-class hero.<sup>49</sup> I argue that a better epithet would be a musical hero who championed a significant working-class tradition. Swift's working-class heritage was well-known in the brass band world and the local community when working-class leisure was prominent amongst a dense population whose culture and lifestyle were being observed and commented upon regularly by middle-class observers. The traditions that were developed in the bandroom were further refined by Swift, who enjoyed improving bands that were struggling to win contests.

Swift's working-class roots were highlighted in his obituary. The *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* reported regularly on local music-making. They had a keen interest in observing the working class when involved in music and especially when the local choirs and bands were successful.<sup>50</sup> Their tone was often celebratory and lionised local working-class musicians. Hence, when they wrote Swift's obituary, they celebrated the autodidactic and weaving

---

47 Source: Calculated from P. Deane and W. A. Cole, *British Economic Growth 1688-1959: Trends and Structure* (Cambridge), 1969, p. 8, cited in, John Benson, *Working Class in Britain, 1850-1930* (London and New York, 1989), p. 4.

48 Benson, *Working Class in Britain*, p. 4.

49 Herbert, Swift, Edwin

50 See the reporting of the success of choral groups in the *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (1 January, 1897).



tradition of the Southern Pennine communities. For the paper, Swift showed the dignity of labour and the heritage of industry that was the home of a musical region. They wrote, 'he was worshipped amongst bandsmen for his quiet and unassuming manner [...] winning the esteem of all he contacted.'<sup>51</sup> [He was] a lad from the loom who was mostly self-taught, he climbed to the highest rung of fame in the brass band world; he was a great honour not only to the sons of toil, but to every class'.<sup>52</sup>

It was true that the working-class membership of brass bands thought of him as a musical hero; on the day of his funeral, many of the engines in the local factories stopped in respect.<sup>53</sup> His funeral cortege was led by sixty instrumentalists, including members of the Linthwaite and Wyke Bands, together with members from Lindley, Almondbury, Gainsborough Britannia and Gainsborough Rifles. In the procession were the entire committee of the Linthwaite Band, plus many band conductors and trainers.<sup>54</sup> In the final analysis, it was, as Earnest Lockwood argued, 'work, perpetual hard work, which made Edwin Swift one of the finest band trainers in the world.'<sup>55</sup> Swift's background had little in common with the more urbane Gladney. Nevertheless, like Gladney, Swift was a fine arranger. Like Gladney, Swift held a genuine belief he could raise the performance standards of amateur musicians.

---

51 *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (12 February, 1904).

52 *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (12 February, 1904).

53 Herbert, *Swift, Edwin*

54 *The Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904).

55 Ernest Lockwood, *Colne Valley Folk, the Romance and Enterprise of a Textile Stronghold* (Heath Canton, 1936), p. 160.

## Alexander Owen (1851 – 1920)

Alexander Owen was born in Swinton, close to Manchester, in 1851.<sup>56</sup> Owen also had a working-class childhood and in later life Owen took pride in the fact that he spent his early years in an orphanage.<sup>57</sup> Indeed, only working-class orphans lived in orphanages and the pride he had in presenting himself this way most likely reflected the fact that he overcame this disadvantageous beginning and had succeeded in not only being a successful musician but also became active in local Conservative politics. He was, like Swift, a self-made man. He was the orphan made good.<sup>58</sup> There is confusion over his early career. One account says that he initially apprenticed as a cabinet-maker,<sup>59</sup> another to a cavalry-bandmaster.<sup>60</sup> It is more than likely a mix of the two, receiving music lessons from the bandmaster, whilst training as a cabinet-maker.

In 1868, he moved to Stalybridge, establishing a tobacconist's business.<sup>61</sup> He joined Stalybridge Old Band and soon became their conductor. In 1871, there were irreconcilable differences and Owen left to form Stalybridge Borough Band.<sup>62</sup> In 1875 he joined the Meltham Mills Band to play the cornet.<sup>63</sup> He remained in Stalybridge and travelled to Meltham, near Huddersfield, whenever they needed him.<sup>64</sup> He was still under John Gladney, at Meltham, when he began

---

56 Dave Russell, *Owen, Alexander (1851-1920)*, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford, 2004), <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/48781>>, accessed, 3 November, 2008.

57 Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.

58 See Laura Peters, *Orphan Texts: Victorian Orphans, Culture and Empire* (Manchester, 2000), Rene Kollar, 'Those Horrible Iron Cages: The Sisters of the Church and the Care of Orphans in Late Victorian England', *American Benedictine Review*, 53:3 (2002), pp. 264-284 and Jean Olwyn Maynard, 'Mid-Victorian Orphanages, London', *Catholic Ancestor*, Vol. 12, issue 4 (2009), pp. 207-217.

59 Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.  
*Stalybridge Old Band Centenary Booklet*, p. 24, cited in, Newsome, *Brass Roots*, p. 54.

61 Russell, *Owen, Alexander*

62 *Stalybridge Old Band Centenary Booklet*, p. 24.

63 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 71.

64 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 71.

his career as a band trainer.<sup>65</sup> In 1877 he began as conductor and trainer with the Boarhurst Band and at the same time he became the licensee of the Bath Hotel, Stalybridge.<sup>66</sup> In 1896 he moved to Manchester, where he made his living almost solely from band work.<sup>67</sup>

Owen's early business ventures as an hotelier and publican, retailer and later becoming active in local Conservative politics - he served as a Conservative member on Stalybridge council from 1887 to 1897 -<sup>68</sup> reflected a growing working-class popular Toryism that was active nationally this period. Historians of nineteenth-century Conservatism have suggested that the Tories found their most vocal working-class supporters not in impoverished areas but among workers in more prosperous and skilled trades.<sup>69</sup> Jon Lawrence recognised that a significant group of Tory populists were publican-politicians such as Levi Johnson, Joseph Lawrence and John Griffiths, all of whom ran substantial public houses in working-class areas of Wolverhampton.<sup>70</sup>

Owen's working life was based upon being self-employed and was not reliant upon deference to an employer. Owen was, however, reliant upon working people spending their wages in his business. Tory activists had attacked the Liberals for their poor record on factory reform, shorter hours and union recognition, and the 'fair wage' issue reinforced that popular Toryism was humane and paternal.<sup>71</sup> It was this paternalism, caring for working-class bandsmen, mixed with a belief in hard work and orderliness that defined Owen's

---

65 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 75.

66 Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.

67 Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.

68 Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.

69 Jon Lawrence, *Speaking for the People: Party, Language and Popular Politics* (Cambridge, 1998), p. 105.

70 Lawrence, *Speaking for the People*, p. 106.

71 Lawrence, *Speaking for the People*, pp. 106-107.

musicianship. Owen was working class; his popular Toryism meant he understood the social life of brass bands and the right of the working man to enjoy their pleasures in peace.<sup>72</sup> Owen, in other words, became a champion of the traditional working-class way of life.

Owen's arrangements placed great technical and physical demands on his players. The 1880s and 1890s were a fruitful period for Owen's arranging, which, as with Gladney and Swift, helped bring success for him and the bands he led.<sup>73</sup> His two most successful arrangements were a selection of *Rossini's Works* and *The Damnation of Faust* (Berlioz). In his first season at Besses *Rossini's Works* was played 19 times at contests, winning 14 first prizes.<sup>74</sup> *The Damnation of Faust* won 19 prizes out of 20 performances.<sup>75</sup>

To achieve such results Owen was a taskmaster in the rehearsal room, often locking the band in for hours at a time, the key going in his waistcoat pocket.<sup>76</sup> However, he did not always get his way, as a story passed down through the members of the band shows. Owen wanted to refine a musical point in a practice with Besses. They were a 'crack' band, yet it seems that bandsmen often attended practice for the social elements. Even though Owen was a respected trainer he could not deny the working-class sociability of the band movement:

One night he was rehearsing with the band - they were playing *Elijah*, and he was trying to get the bass trombone to play a very important declamatory phrase. It wasn't working out as he wanted and eventually, exasperated, he said to the bass trombone player

---

72 Jon Lawrence, 'Class and Gender in the Making of Urban Toryism, 1880-1914', *English Historical Review*, Number 108 (1993), pp. 641-642.

73 Newsome, *Brass Roots*, p. 54.

74 Newsome, *The 19th Century Brass Band In Northern England*, p. 265

75 Newsome, *The 19th Century Brass Band In Northern England*, p. 265.

76 Taylor, *Labour and Love*, p. 10.

'Look, you're saying, "ist that thou Elijah?" - It's very important. If Elijah were in the room tonight, how would you say it, what would you say?' The trombone player thought for a minute, and then he said, "Sithee, Elijah - it's quarter to nine, time this rehearsal was finished. If tha'll come down to the bar with me, I'll let thee buy me half a pint." Owen didn't say a word. Took the key from his waistcoat pocket and unlocked the door.<sup>77</sup>

Owen worked the members of the band hard and once brought the cornet player Harry Mortimer close to tears.<sup>78</sup> In spite of this he never forgot that they were also workers who had to earn a living. Owen's background meant he was not reliant on industrial labour to earn wages. The bandsmen, however, were playing in the band when dependence and deference were the marks of all factory labour. The cotton spinner is perhaps the central case in point. These workers were midway between the engineer and the cotton weaver in terms of autonomy at work but were also open to the vulnerability of the great mass of factory operatives.<sup>79</sup> Security and dependence of employment was a lifelong experience. As Patrick Joyce has put it, 'the domination of work over people's lives consequently affected the acceptance of the authority that governed the routines of work.'<sup>80</sup> Owen understood this and realised that bandsmen could be insecure in their employment. Owen accepted group deference to employers and often walked miles making an effort to thank personally their employers for giving the band members' time off work to rehearse and attend concerts and contests.<sup>81</sup>

This hard work clearly created results in the contest arena making Besses a model to follow and copy. In particular Besses were known for their quality of

---

77 Taylor, *Labour and Love*, p. 10.

78 Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.

79 Patrick Joyce, *Work, Society and Politics, The Culture of the Factory in Later Victorian England* (London, 1980, this edition, 1982), pp. 96-98.

80 Joyce, *Work, Society and Politics*, p. 98.

81 *Middleton Guardian* (23 July, 1889).

sound production.<sup>82</sup> From contemporary written reports it is easy to see that Owen trained the band rigorously. The fact that the band could play pianissimo, as one unit, elevated themselves, and the band movement, above the pub-going, rough image of bandsmen that existed. Model bands such as Besses were significant agents in raising the public image of the band movement. Some commentators felt that bands represented not only disorderly elements of working-class life, but also poor musicianship. In 1867, one commentator wrote:

Brass bands have become a perfect nuisance of late years; blowing away with all their strength. They are always followed by some immense crowd, composed of an admixture of almost all grades of the lower society - "Tagrag and Bobtail." The greatest objection to these noisy bands will be found in the demoralizing influence upon the members: practices are generally held in the public-house. The exhaustion in blowing a wind instrument for any length of time in the street naturally leads the members of a band to a beer shop, where they too frequently indulge to excess; eventually becoming worthless members of society, instead of finding their music a source of pleasure to them.<sup>83</sup>

Writing in 1901, *Brass Band News* countered this view of the over-blowing and unsubtle bandsman and argued that Besses were the band that should be copied to obtain this sound:

We have many times pointed out that the most beautiful effect that the brass band is capable of producing is a well-blended, evenly-balanced pppp. What a friend of ours calls "a glorious glowing whisper of tone", such as Besses produce in [the hymn tune] *Sandon*<sup>84</sup>.

This training also reflected the methods and emphasis created by early trainers who endeavoured to achieve the required winning standards of a contest: intonation, tone quality, in particular, the attainment of a broad group diapason

---

82 A thorough catalogue of all brass band recordings made in the non-microgroove era (before 1960) is given in Frank Andrews's *Brass Band Cylinder and Non-microgroove Disc Recordings 1903-1960* (Winchester, 1967).

83 *Musical Standard*, Vol 7, No 175 (7 December, 1867), p. 359.

84 *Brass Band News* (1 November, 1901), p. 4.

effect, an adherence to dynamic markings (light and shade), tempo and rhythm together with note length. In 1889 a correspondent wrote:

On Saturday, last I happened to be in the park ...when I became aware of the presence of Besses Band [...] I quickly found I was listening to performers of exceptional taste and ability[...]. Amongst the pieces I was particularly struck by the performance of the slow movement near the end of *The Messiah* "But the Lord hath laid on him." I never heard a more beautiful specimen of legato playing. The band may have been placed in a swell box of a grand organ, and the pedal manipulated by the organist. The diminuendo was so charmingly given, the ending dying away so gradually, that I was compelled to listen carefully in order to hear the movement end [...]. Several other selections followed all characterised by the same finish, and admirable attention to light and shade. Then followed a selection of *Faust* by Berlioz, the solos and cadences were admirably played[...]and the charming accompaniments were simply delicious; the delicacy at times was almost enough to make one doubt the evidence of the senses of sight and hearing, and wonder whether we were really listening to instruments of brass.<sup>85</sup>

And from 1890 there is more evidence of the sound quality of Besses:

I was induced last Sunday morning to meet the Besses, and I certainly didn't regret it. As the band played down [the] street, it was more like some grand organ than is popularly known as a brass band and the playing both in the street, and in the hall was a revelation to many.<sup>86</sup>

Owen had achieved the level of sound production that was recognised as being the standard that bands should aim for. However, as we have seen, Owen also spent considerable time rehearsing the band. Owen drilled the band to follow every inclination and nuance of his conducting style, resulting in a musical unit where the identity of the individual player was hidden in the greater whole. In 1890 a correspondent to the *Middleton Guardian* highlighted how the band followed Owen, writing:

---

<sup>85</sup> *Middleton Guardian* (14 September, 1889).

<sup>86</sup> *Middleton Guardian* (18 October, 1890).

Their great secret lies in Mr.Owen, in the fact that he is an accomplished mesmerist! The members of the band are good mesmeric subjects, and I am informed that he has them entirely under his mesmeric control, and he merely wills them to play. The way that even a twitch of the little finger of the conductor was obeyed was simply wonderful.<sup>87</sup>

Owen's hard work would eventually result in great honours. In 1903, after their win at the National Championships, Besses became ambassadors for the band movement. In 1905 they toured France, a project initiated by the Prime Minister, Arthur Balfour, and the secretary of the Anglo French Trade Society.<sup>88</sup>

Afterwards, armed with a repertory of over a hundred pieces, many of them composed or arranged by Owen, the band took on a schedule of overseas tours including North America, Honolulu, Fiji, New Zealand and Australia that lasted seventeen months from 1906-7.<sup>89</sup>

Despite this astounding feat Owen is virtually unknown outside the band movement. He had a range of musical interests, conducting a Stalybridge choral group and playing in the Manchester Saxophone Quartet.<sup>90</sup> He was married, although nothing is known of his wife, and he had at least one son.<sup>91</sup> He died at Chorlton upon Medlock from a stroke on 29 July 1920.<sup>92</sup> A memorial fund was established which resulted, in 1922, of the awarding of the Alexander Owen Memorial Scholarship to provide expert tuition for two years to a brass player.<sup>93</sup>

Between them Gladney, Swift and Owen standardised the bands' instrumentation, performance style and repertoire. Their leadership of the 'crack' bands ensured that other bands would want to copy these innovations, hence

---

<sup>87</sup> *Middleton Guardian*, (18 October, 1890).

<sup>88</sup> Taylor, *Labour and Love*, p. 10.

<sup>89</sup> Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.

<sup>90</sup> Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.

<sup>91</sup> Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.

<sup>92</sup> Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.

<sup>93</sup> Russell, *Owen, Alexander*.



giving cohesion to the band movement when in public. A work ethic was a commonality shared by all three and showed how they related not only to each other but also how they related to novice bandmasters. This meant that the triumvirates' bands represented the musical excellence that could result from a bandmaster's work ethic. Of the three John Gladney was middle class and his background was influenced by military music that set the orthodoxies of musical performance that the brass bands followed. Edwin Swift's working-class heritage was clearly linked to the weaving history of the Southern Pennines. Arguably Swift's persona was significant in the expression of this heritage on the stage. Like John Gladney, Alexander Owen was an active Conservative. Nevertheless, unlike Gladney, he was a working-class Conservative, and expressed the diligence of the respectable working man and what could result from hard work and effort. In addition, Owen showed elements of paternalism and deference. All these elements combined to create 'crack' bands that represented a hard working group of working-class bandsmen that not only performed music but also represented a moderate, rational and restrained version of the working class at leisure. This image was further reinforced by the music the bands played.

### **The Transference of Middle-Class Repertoire**

All three members of the triumvirate were prolific arrangers. In their most productive period, from 1869 to 1888, they produced forty-two arrangements.<sup>94</sup> It is their influence on brass band repertoire that helped cement their impact upon

---

<sup>94</sup>Roy Newsome, *19th Century Brass Bands, Musical and Social Factors in the Development of a Major Amateur Musical Medium* (PhD Thesis, University of Sheffield, 1999), p. 366.

musical identities. The triumvirate's arrangements were often based on a classical canon that had its roots in middle-class culture and status and to understand this is to understand how the brass band movement perceived middle-class values as markers of status and display and how middle-class standards transferred to the band movement.

By the mid 1840s, when brass bands were starting to become well known for their northern contests, concert life in the European cities of London, Paris and Vienna had grown dramatically. William Weber argued that this was a cultural explosion, where the commercial concert world saw the middle class exert powerful and dominant control.<sup>95</sup> This explosion of concert life encompassed the works of celebrated composers that became the staple of brass band repertoire, Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven being the most obvious, and perhaps the most familiar to bandsmen. By 1877, for example, the *Musical World* wrote a long poem about an upcoming brass band contest featuring the efforts of the fictitious northern Cleaster Brass Band to enter a regional contest. The ease with which bandsmen were perceived by this journal as being familiar with these composers indicated that real bandsmen were more than familiar with celebrated composers. The *Musical World* wrote:

So soon as the factory bell told us to cease,  
And we'd washed ourselves clear from the slubber and grease,  
We'd meet again at the sign of "The Fox and The Geese",  
And sat in a ring around the table.  
When Bumbly-foot Harry gave word from the start, we blew hard at Haydn, Beethoven,  
Mozart,  
Until ev'ry man knew the lot off by heart,

---

<sup>95</sup> William Weber, *Music and the Middle Class: The Social Structure of Concert Life in London, Paris and Vienna* (London, 1975), p. 7.

And to play without music was able.<sup>96</sup>

Inherent in this verse is the working-class nature of the bandsmen and their involvement in skilled or manual labour. The word slubber, for example, comes from the word to describe the preparation of wool or cotton for spinning and included three working-class roles, from the labouring to the skilled, the Slubber Doffer, who removed the empty bobbins from the loom spindles, the Slubbing Frame Fitter, who installed and maintained the frame used in the preparation of the cloth, together with the Drawing Frame Slubber Hand who operated the machine used to prepare the cloth.<sup>97</sup>

As discussed in the first chapter, the northern working class were no strangers to the classical canon and this familiarity was reflected on a national scale. As Jonathan Rose points out, Welsh miners, for example, were not only famous for their choral tradition but also named their children after well-known composers. Walter Haydn Davies (b.1903) explained that, 'In fact, in one family there was a Handel, Haydn, Elgar, Verdi, Joseph Parry, Caradog, Mendy (short for Mendelssohn).'<sup>98</sup> The musicianship found amongst the working-class population is not disputed. Some were extremely skilled and many had more than a passing interest. What is of interest, however, is that the choice of repertoire by brass bands was influenced heavily by middle-class values of education, status and control incorporated within art music.

By the mid-nineteenth-century, Simon Gunn argues, classical music had come to occupy a privileged position in the public life of the provincial middle

---

<sup>96</sup> *Musical World* (7 April, 1877), p. 243.

<sup>97</sup> *Hall Genealogy Website: Old Occupation Names* <[www.rmhh.co.uk/occup/s.html](http://www.rmhh.co.uk/occup/s.html)>, accessed, 1 January, 2014.

<sup>98</sup> Walter Haydn Davies, *Right Place-Right Time* (Swansea, 1972), pp. 65-67, cited in, Jonathon Rose, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes* (New Haven and London, 2001), p. 198.

class.<sup>99</sup> Music festivals and concert series became permanent features of cities such as Birmingham, Bradford, Leeds and Liverpool and would soon spread to smaller towns that had a strong middle-class population, such as Bridlington, which held music festivals regularly from 1894 to 1901.<sup>100</sup> For the north it was Manchester where the classical concert became the officially-sanctioned polite entertainment.<sup>101</sup> The Hallé Orchestra's concerts were central to the development of this polite entertainment. Gunn argues that the development of concerts from 1857 was of national musical significance and their achievements were only matched by Manns at the Crystal Palace for their capacity to attract a substantial audience to hear serious and innovative classical music. Manchester, therefore, rivalled London in the mid-Victorian period in the quality, if not the quantity, of its musical life. Therefore socially the concerts became a ritual for the rich and fashionable, creating a new centre for public culture after 1850.<sup>102</sup> The classical repertoire of the concerts became central in the definition of cultural values and judgements. For concert goers, the distinction between 'high' and 'low' culture had become defined by musical taste. Centred as they were at top of Manchester's cultural life the meaning of the concerts was more than musical. They represented the height of public decorum and educated taste, a demonstration of the association with wealth and virtue, which would later be reflected in values of middle-class civic pride.<sup>103</sup>

---

99 Simon Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar: the Hallé Concerts and the Constitution of "High Culture" in Manchester c.1850-1880', *Journal of Victorian Culture*, Vol 2, Issue 2 (1997) p. 208.

100 See Catherine Dale, 'The Provincial Musical Festival in Nineteenth-Century England: A Case Study of Bridlington', in, Rachel Cowgill and Peter Holman (Eds.), *Music in the British Provinces, 1690-1914* (Aldershot, 2007), p. 331.

101 Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar', p. 208

102 Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar', p. 210.

103 Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar', p. 210.

The early concerts featured 'miscellaneous evenings' in which the emergent classical tradition was mirrored by the brass band movement. The Hallé Orchestra's 1858-59 season included selections from operas by Spontini and Rossini alongside symphonies by Beethoven, Berlioz and Mendelssohn.<sup>104</sup> By 1870 a canon of composers had been established and the second halves of the concerts were given over to the complete performance of Beethoven Symphonies by the 1870-71 season. The music of more recent composers, such as Wagner and Brahms, was met with hostility but by the 1881-82 season they were becoming part of the canon.<sup>105</sup> Within the pages of the press, and weekly periodicals, reviews of the concerts appeared alongside occasional pieces on other forms of music: promenade concerts, music hall, brass bands and so on. Therefore, other music was defined in close relation, and opposition to, the classical music played at the concerts. As Gunn argues the concerts were the arena where the epitome of Manchester's taste and musical quality became the standard against which all forms of northern music could be measured and judged.<sup>106</sup>

Therefore, by 1895, the band periodicals were in no doubt that listening to high quality concerts would improve the musicianship of bandsmen. This belief in the top-down study of the classical canon showed the attitudes to band music, particularly the importance of attempting to copy skilled musicians. Tradition was a keyword that meant that the classical canon was handed down to the bandsmen from middle-class tastes. The relationship between superior music

---

104 T Batley, *Sir Charles Halle's Concerts in England* (Manchester, 1896), cited in Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar', p. 217.

105 Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar', p. 217.

106 Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar', p. 219.

and inferior music was perceived as one of dependence upon middle-class tastes. Howard Newby's evaluation of the notion of deference leads to the legitimisation of the social hierarchy in these choices.<sup>107</sup> In terms of Weber deference was the 'the form of social interaction which occurs in situations involving the exercise of traditional authority.'<sup>108</sup>

Periodical editors encouraged bandsmen to copy great performers, to imitate traditional authority. In 1898, for example, the *Cornet* wrote:

Tradition is a great factor in musical education, and advantage should be taken...of listening to artists of eminence. Particular attention being paid to their phrasing and general methods.<sup>109</sup>

This ethos was carried forwards by the *British Bandsman*, when, in 1909, they recommended that the best kind of musical self-improvement came from listening to good examples of music performed by good orchestras and singers.<sup>110</sup>

This attitude hid more discreet behavioural traits that were passed down from the middle-class attitudes to the classical concert, through social interaction and public behaviour in a social space. The Manchester concerts displayed outward images of wealth and fashion. Audience members wore stick ups, claw-hammer coats and camellias and the concerts became an area of extravagant display. The notion of spectacle was facilitated in the concert hall by the seating arrangements: facing each other in two blocks meant the Concert Hall became an indoor promenade of 'high society'. In short, it was an example how ladies

---

107 Howard Newby, 'The Deferential Dialectic', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Number 2 (April, 1975), p. 17.

108 Newby, 'The Deferential Dialectic', p. 146.

109 *Cornet* (15 April, 1898), p. 4.

110 *British Bandsman* (20 November, 1909), p. 557.

and gentlemen behaved in polite society and in public view.<sup>111</sup> In 1876, *The City Jackdaw: A Humorous and Satirical Journal*, which was published in Manchester, wrote a column called *Hallé's Concerts Socially Considered*. This journal was in no doubt about the role of the concerts in the reinforcement of middle-class display and status. They noted that a high proportion of people were not there for the music but to see and be seen, to display and parade to their peers. The author wrote:

It would be interesting to know how many go to the Free Trade Hall on Thursday nights purely for the enjoyment of classical music. Naturally there are a few who really are enthusiasts, and these may be picked out by their attention to music, and by the regularity with which they bring, especially on oratorio nights, the books of music. But let us look at the rest of the audience. The young gentleman who enters with a self-satisfied air is engaged at present to the girl who hangs on his arm. He is very proud of the fact, and hopes that everybody is looking at him; but then those who know him well know he has got engaged for the concert season. He was engaged to another girl last concert season, and he will have a third in 1877, and all because it is considered the proper thing to have a good-looking girl sitting next to him, and so he goes with the times.<sup>112</sup>

Nevertheless, despite the clear use of the concerts for display, socialisation and courtship, the overriding element of classical music was the emotional effect of music on the human condition. The classical repertoire brought with it behavioural values that band periodicals attempted to instil in bandsmen. Classical music, as embodied in the Manchester concerts, offered transcendence from the vulgar, the material and became a release from mundane tasks of daily life, giving access to feelings of the sublime.<sup>113</sup>

---

111 Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar', pp. 214-215.

112 *The City Jackdaw: A Humorous and Satirical Journal*, Volume 1, number 16 (3 March, 1876), p. 157.

113 Gunn, 'The Sublime and the Vulgar', p. 217.

For bandsmen, the band periodicals became voices of authority in how to interpret the rule of musical self discipline. Inevitably, this authority was motivated by the rational recreation ethos. The appreciation of music involved including, as the *Guardian* argued, 'a love of for the beautiful' and a 'consequent elevation in moral perceptions and feeling'.<sup>114</sup> This ethos would, after all, create better bandsmen; making them less like workmen, including all the roughness that was implied by that word, and more like artists. It was the social side of classical music performance that influenced the band periodicals in encouraging bandsmen to elevate themselves into being gentlemen, to mimic the middle class in standards of deportment, dress and behaviour. The desire of band periodicals, such as the *British Bandsman*, for example, to encourage this middle-class attitude to musical appreciation was always in the background, implied in editorials and comment. Their first edition, in 1887, wrote that, 'our aims are to stimulate, and where it is non-existent, to create and foster a love of good and high-class music.'<sup>115</sup> The next year they reflected on the increase in local and national exposure of brass bands in the national press by commenting that 'the deportment of the band in public is of greatest importance. Be gentlemen, and conduct yourselves as discreetly as when on private business.'<sup>116</sup>

Therefore, what was required of bands in order to perform classical music was moral, ethical and polite, or gentlemanly, discipline. These requirements filtered down from the middle-class appreciation of classical music that, although inherent in the rational recreation ethos, became implicit in the performance of

---

114 *Manchester Guardian* (6 May, 1857), cited in Gunn, p. 218.

115 *British Bandsman*, Volume 1, No.1 (September, 1887), p. 1.

116 *British Bandsman*, (April, 1888), p. 124.



the classical repertoire. The higher the bandsman rose within the brass band hierarchy the more the bandsman was expected to subscribe to this ethos. As Matthew Arnold's polarisation of culture and anarchy indicated, the important role of high culture was to act as an instrument of social order in the nineteenth century. High culture demanded discipline, high culture elevated human behaviour, and low culture was degrading.<sup>117</sup>

### **The Band Repertoire**

Early band repertoire consisted of songs, glees and national airs, J. L. Scott highlighting that this had been the standard repertoire since the 1800s.<sup>118</sup> In 1833, Northallerton Band, for example, was booked to play at a dinner that celebrated the election to parliament of W. Duncombe. It is not known what the instrumentation of the Northallerton band was, nevertheless, they most likely used a mixture of wind, brass and keyed brass that was common in 'bands of musick' from 1804 to the late 1830s. These bands were not standardised. In 1807, for example, Wellwyn Band of Musick had 1 flute, 4, clarinets, 2 bassoons 1 horn, drums and percussion and 7 unidentified instruments which Roy Newsome argues were most likely oboes.<sup>119</sup> In the late 1830s Lewes band consisted of 3 clarinets, 1 trumpet, 2 keyed bugles, 1 horn, 2 trombones, 1 serpent together with drums and percussion.<sup>120</sup>

---

117 Derek B. Scott, 'Music and Social Class in Victorian London', *Urban History*, 29/1 (May 2002), pp. 72-73.

118 Scott, *The Evolution of the Brass Band and its Repertoire in Northern England*, p. 186.

119 Newsome, *The 19th Century Brass Band In Northern England*, p. 27.

120 Newsome, *The 19th Century Brass Band In Northern England*, p. 27.

At the dinner the Northallerton band played ten different pieces: *God Save the King*, *Britons Strike Home*, *Here's Health to All Good Lasses*, *Hurrah for the Bonnets of Blue*, *We Gae the Kildrum*, *Oh the Roast Beef of Old England*, *Sweet Lass of Richmond Hill*, *Duke of York's March*, *Duke of Cumberland's March* and *Should Auld Acquaintances Be Forgot*.<sup>121</sup> Also in York, in 1833, the losing Conservative Party held a dinner where an unknown band played the following pieces, *God Save the King*, *Roast Beef of England*, *Hail, Star of Brunswick*, *Rule Britannia*, *Duke of York's March*, *Hurrah for the Bonnets of Blue*, *Air, Merry Christ Church Bells*, *See the Conquering Hero Comes*, *Auld Land Syne*.<sup>122</sup> The first music published for brass band, in March 1836, was *Macfarlane's Eight Popular Airs for Brass Band*, published by R. Cocks and Co.

This pattern of repertoire continued to the 1840s when there was a rise in trade of solo pieces and smaller ensemble arrangements. From the mid-1840s Boosey began publishing their *Repertory for Cornet and Piano*, mainly consisting of operatic arias, costing three shillings each.<sup>123</sup> In 1847, Distin published a *Selection of the most Favourite Swedish melodies as sung by Md. Jenny Lind* for cornet à pistons, saxhorn or tuba with piano accompaniment. In addition, in 1852, Wessell published their *Brass Band Journal* which cost two shillings per arrangement and was aimed at smaller bands of modest ability and income. By at least 1859 brass band periodicals were mainly devoted to publishing arrangements of Italian opera.<sup>124</sup>

---

121 *York Gazette* (5 January, 1833), cited in, Scott, p. 187.

122 *York Chronicle* (24 January, 1833), cited in, Scott, p. 187.

123 Trevor Herbert, 'Making A Movement', *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000) pp. 54-55.

124 Herbert, 'Making A Movement', p. 55.

It should not be underestimated how much operatic arrangements standardised brass band musicianship. It was these arrangements that were spread by the periodicals that began to regulate the public repertoire of the bands, together with what was expected from the players in terms of technique and sound production. For example, Charles Godfrey arranged every contest piece for twenty years. Godfrey was a bandmaster with the Royal Horse Guards Regiment. His arrangements had a routine formula: tutti orchestral or choral sections from the opera, interspersed with melodic solo or ensemble sections arranged for the principal soloists, the whole ensemble section or solo dotted with operatic cadenzas. Little attention was paid to elements of structure or proportion, and as the style was familiar, some pieces, such as Rossini's *Moses in Egypt* (1897, Belle Vue Contest) and Mehul's *Joseph and His Brothers* (1914, Belle Vue Contest) were decidedly obscure.<sup>125</sup>

This taste for operatic selections choice was determined by the dominance of middle-class taste. It was culturally conservative music, catering to popular middle-class choices. This music was not insurgent but deferential to top-down influence. It did not revolt against the established order but relied upon it to grow. What this meant was that the brass band repertoire showed regard, respect and compliance with middle-class taste. What was lacking from the brass band repertoire in this period were many music hall songs, with the exception of minstrelsy tunes, and domestic songs were rarely heard, even though they were hugely popular and readily available.<sup>126</sup> In 1869, for example, Besses held a

---

<sup>125</sup> Paul Hindmarsh, 'Building a Repertoire: Original Compositions for the British Brass Band, 1913-1998' in, Herbert, (Ed.), *The British Brass Band*, pp. 246-247.

<sup>126</sup> Herbert, 'Making A Movement', pp. 55-56.

contest win celebration concert in Middleton, near Manchester. The concert programme shows us that the repertoire was made up of pieces that would have been found in the metropolitan concert hall. The main difference for brass bands, however, was that they were not the full pieces, just the most melodic or tutti selections, that best suited the sonority of brass instruments, hence working-class musicians were familiar with the most tuneful parts of the middle-class concert repertoire, but also, the arrangements created the language of instrumental technique common to all brass band players.

The programme was Embury's *Festival March*, Handel's chorus, *All We Like Sheep*, a selection from Gounod's *Romeo and Juliet*, a selection from Berlioz's *Faust*, a selection of *Rossini's Works*, a selection from Cellier's *Dorothy*, a selection from Gounod's *Cinq Mars*, and Handel's *Hallelujah Chorus*.<sup>127</sup>

Huddersfield's Greenhead Park's concert programmes show the influence of the triumvirate's arrangements upon the brass band repertoire of this period. An analysis of the park programmes from 1907 to 1910 (in appendix 1) shows that the triumvirate's arrangements from the late nineteenth century were still part of the standard repertoire. Therefore, these arrangements can be described as a 'standard' that could be shared by all bands. The 'crack' bands performed the pieces in a way that other bands would want to emulate. It was in the brass band contest where this idea was refined.

---

<sup>127</sup> *Middleton Guardian* (8 June, 1889).

## The Brass Band Contest

Brass band contests cemented and defined musical conventions. Contests began in the mid nineteenth century. Finding the date of the first contest is almost as difficult as finding the date of the formation of the first brass band.<sup>128</sup> Several contests were taking place from 1818, 1821 and 1834.<sup>129</sup> In March 1837, a correspondent to the *Musical World* suggested that bands could improve their performance by giving annual prizes for contests with adjacent towns.<sup>130</sup> By 1853, the first brass band contests were being held at Belle Vue.<sup>131</sup> In 1853, 1854 and 1855, the bands were allowed to pick their own-choice selections.<sup>132</sup> However, from 1855 onwards, test pieces were being used together with an own-choice selection.<sup>133</sup> This continued up to 1867, when the own-choice option ended.<sup>134</sup> We can safely assume that any own-choice selection would have been one that the bands could play well, and the test pieces largely relied upon arrangements of operatic selections. It is important that bands were performing against each other, trying to play the same as - if not better - than the other bands.<sup>135</sup> It was Gladney, Swift and Owen, who conducted a relatively small number of bands - the 'cracks' - that helped provide an incentive for bands to attempt to play to their full potential, in order to equal, or outbid their rivals. As an early historian of the movement, Harold Hind, wrote:

---

128 Arthur R. Taylor, *Brass Bands*, (London, 1979), p. 32.

129 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 32.

130 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 33.

131 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 33.

132 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 259.

133 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 259.

134 Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 259.

135 The history of the brass band contest is too long and involved for inclusion in this chapter, only the key dates and events are here.

Only by competing against neighbouring bands can the true level of the attainments of a particular combination be attained[...] many bands have found their first contest to be a humiliating experience, their faults only becoming apparent [ to them] by comparison with other contestants.<sup>136</sup>

The bands were well aware of how important it was to have a good trainer in order to succeed. This was illustrated in 1884 when Rawtenstall Brass Band, 'straining every effort to enable them to compete with the best bands in the country, engaged Mr. Edwin Swift of Linthwaite'.<sup>137</sup> If bands could not engage one of the triumvirate then evidence suggests that the top-down influence of the triumvirate's training was spread in other ways. There are stories of bandsmen and conductors who wanted to copy the winning methods of the triumvirate hiding outside the bandrooms where they practiced, as Swift had done at Linthwaite, memorising as much of the style as possible, then returning to their own band to mould their band into the same interpretation.<sup>138</sup>

In May 1886 the *Rosendale Free Press* reported that, 'under the auspices of the Rawtenstall Brass Band, a contest was held on the football fields, behind the cemetery.'<sup>139</sup> This contest showed that even though test pieces were now being used regularly in the larger contests, own-choice selections were still being used in smaller contests. Nevertheless, the essentials of brass musicianship were cemented when under adjudication. In the contest arena the skill of the individual musician became hidden in the endeavour to create a homogenous sound. It was this musical homogeneity that was instilled into the less successful bands at a novice level. Apart from Bury Brass Band, the

---

<sup>136</sup> Harold Hind, *The Brass Band* (London, 1934), p. 89.

<sup>137</sup> *Rosendale Free Press* (22 November, 1884).

<sup>138</sup> Taylor, *Brass Bands*, p. 76.

<sup>139</sup> *Rosendale Free Press* (1 May, 1886).

Rawtenstall contest featured bands that never came within the top five places in the major contests. The winning bands were as follows: first, Bury winning £12, second, £8 for Burnley, third, £5 for Tydsley, fourth, £3 for Ramsbottom, and fifth, £2 for Oats Royd Mill, Halifax.<sup>140</sup>

It is a reflection on the popularity of brass bands, and the musicianship of the readers, that often after a contest the full version of adjudicator's remarks were published in the local press. The adjudicator's remarks at Rawtenstall show us the essential elements that were looked for in a contest performance, if we look at the comments for the first three bands that played and did not win a prize, and compare them with the winners, Bury, we can see elements that are repeated constantly from contest to contest, and that were looked for in novice bands. Therefore when novice bandsmen came together at their first contests they strived for the elements that produced a winning performance. These elements were constructed by following the established ways of producing dynamics, articulation, intonation, note length and rhythm, together with tempo, balance and sound quality. The adjudicator's remarks were as follows:

No1. Radcliffe and Pilkington Band

A fair opening, though a little better intonation would have improved it, the transition from forte to double pianissimo not sufficiently observed, cornet blowing a pretty tone[...].Euphonium solo, maestoso, not vigorous enough[...] spiritoso gaily played[...]a moderate performance, of a splendid glee.

No 2. Heap Bridge Band

Opening too loud, but nicely intoned, on proceeding not difference enough in the piano and forte effects, especially the double pianissimo[...].Dotted notes not rightly phrased,

---

<sup>140</sup> *Rossendale Free Press* (1May, 1886).

the quaver is in the right position of the bar, the minim being double dotted, but it was played as if a full fourth of the bar. Same fault as the previous band, in the piu lento concluding the maestoso[...] spiritoso nicely played, attack of the adagio after the pause in excellent tempo. After the first fault, in playing too loud at the start of the glee, they considerably mended in that respect. Well played the treble... showing a nice quality of tone [...] a moderate rendering.

#### No3. Water Band

'Fair opening; incomplete shake by cornet, attack of moderato in good tempo... but notes not running at their full value for this tempo....Andante euphonium very spasmodic, making minims into crotchets, most of the glee fairly played.

#### No7. Bury Borough (first prize)

'A splendid opening in every respect, the light and shade being most musically observed, and the double pianissimo being played with great effect....Moderato well played throughout. In the allegro and piu presto all the marks of expression being most artistically interpreted... also spiritoso and the rest of the glee played so well it would be superfluous to comment upon it... a great performance.<sup>141</sup>

In 1892 the *Magazine of Music* interviewed the adjudicator, R. C. Stephens.

Stephens began his musical career in brass bands and soon became a professional trombonist with a number of orchestras, including the Hallé Orchestra, and was also the principal trombonist at the Manchester Palace of Varieties. Stephens was also considered an accomplished euphonium player, and, in 1892, he was working on a 'Brass Band Tutor' which he hoped to publish.<sup>142</sup>

What emerged from this interview was that adjudicators looked for uniformity of technique in the bands' performances. As was shown at the

---

<sup>141</sup> *Rossendale Free Press* (1 May, 1886).

<sup>142</sup> *Magazine of Music* 9:7 (July, 1892), p. 127.



Rawtenstall contest the priority was given to articulation (attack), phrasing, dynamics (light and shade) and ensemble tone. Stephens told the *Magazine of Music* the musical expectations he had form a band and how he weighted each of these instrumental skills, saying:

I believe that other systems are sometimes adopted, but I think the ideal way is to give a maximum of a 100, divided on the following scale:

Individual Phrasing	20
Ensemble	20
Proper and effective reading of all marks	20
Correct reading of notes	10
Good attack	10
Correct time	5
Correct time for entire register	10
Equality of tone all through instruments especially with cornet	5

The adjudicator, then, was the person who drew the strands of performance together on the contest field. The adjudicator acted as the central pivot in ensuring the bands all attempted to play the same, if not better, than each other, using the same uniformity of instrumental technique. The adjudicators were well aware that their decisions would come under scrutiny, not only from bandsmen, but also the wider public, as the comments were published in the press. This showed that the bandsmen and their followers were knowledgeable about the performance standards required. Moreover, the adjudicator's remarks created a text and guide for improvement in future performances. When the remarks were published in the brass band periodicals, and elsewhere, the adjudicators were creating a historiography of performance practice that was documented and

analysed by bandsmen when they wanted to improve. In this way the adjudicator further reinforced the performance styles of Gladney, Swift and Owen. On Easter Monday 1892, there was a contest at Kidsgrove, in North Staffordshire, many of the bands that competed were conducted by either Gladney, Owen or Swift.<sup>143</sup> In an interview with the *Magazine of Music* the adjudicator, Herr Franz Groenings, of London, said:

The strain of hearing the same piece played by twenty-two bands in succession is not an easy one, and analysing each performance with reference to a uniform and constant standard, is very great. In addition to this he knows that his remarks on each band are being eagerly awaited and will be criticised honestly by many competent critics and unsparingly by any ardent partisans. They will further be reported at length in the brass band journals, and will supply a text for a considerable time to the instructors of the bands [...]. His award will be published far and near.<sup>144</sup>

In the 1840s regional brass band contests were important parts of northern musical life and by the 1860s national contests were established. Therefore trends established at a local level transferred to the national and were well established by the early twentieth century. At Easter 1903 the *British Bandsman* listed the adjudicator's remarks from contests held in Abergavenny, Lewisham, Ilkley, Stourbridge, Lydney, Colne, Rhyl and Baildon.<sup>145</sup> A sample of the remarks reveals the standards adopted in local contests were those adopted at national level. Therefore, standards that had been developed when Gladney, Swift and Owen were most productive had become the norm. These standards were encouraged by the periodicals and reinforced on the contest field by adjudicators. Therefore, bands had clear musical styles to copy if they wanted to

---

<sup>143</sup> *Magazine of Music* 9:6 (June, 1892), p. 102.

<sup>144</sup> *Magazine of Music* 9:6 (June, 1892), p. 102.

<sup>145</sup> *British Bandsman* (25 April, 1903), pp. 144-261.

develop into a 'crack' band. Musical standards were set nationally and meant that the same language created a working-class musical identity that crossed regional boundaries. At the Abergavenny contest, the Welsh Championship Section Brass Band, Abertillery Silver, for example, performed the test piece Charles Godfrey's arrangement of Auber's *Le Domino Noir*. The judge wrote of the first movement, 'attack [articulation] good; tone somewhat dull; time hardly close[...]band out of balance.'<sup>146</sup> When Tillery Colliery Band performed the same movement, the judge wrote, 'attack capital; tone very good and solid [...]. Good balance throughout.'<sup>147</sup> In the north, in Ilkley, the championship test piece was J. Ord Hume's arrangement of traditional tunes, *Gems of Welsh Melody*. The judge wrote about the introduction to the piece, played by Bramley Band, 'time, tune and tempo splendid; from bar 8 pedal bass very good indeed.'<sup>148</sup> In London, in Lewisham, the test piece was also *Gems of Welsh Melody*: further reinforcing the musical repertoire and language shared nationally. The judge wrote that Northfleet Silver Band's performance of the introduction was, 'attack good; tone a little forced; time very fair [...]. Band did not lift together in bar 15.'<sup>149</sup> Similar remarks can be found for the other entrants in the remaining areas, except Rhyll and Baildon where the remarks were submitted too late for the edition.<sup>150</sup>

Contests, then, from novice bands to the championship standard all relied on the same language, the same musical lingua franca, which was further reinforced by the density of repertoire that was played in public whose

---

<sup>146</sup>*British Bandsman*, p. 144.

<sup>147</sup>*British Bandsman*, p. 144.

<sup>148</sup>*British Bandsman*, p. 149.

<sup>149</sup>*British Bandsman*, p. 146.

<sup>150</sup>*British Bandsman*, p. 261.

arrangements had been produced by arrangers who were from largely working-class backgrounds. Bandsmen tried to emulate other bands and could disagree fiercely and threateningly with adjudicators' decisions over contest results. In June 1886, there was a brass band contest at Keighley where Black Dyke were not placed in the top three bands, and some members of Black Dyke 'behaved in an unruly and threatening manner.'<sup>151</sup> These disagreements showed that bandsmen attempted to work towards what they thought the adjudicators would expect of a performance and disappointment provoked strong feelings. As the *Musical Standard* pointed out 'there is plenty of grumbling after contests regarding adjudicators and their decisions, and remarks are often made that brass bandsmen are never satisfied [...].'<sup>152</sup> Bandsmen had done all they could to emulate other bands and meet the needs of the adjudicator. Bandsmen were vocal in their opinion if disappointed. Adjudicators felt that emulation was the key to an excellent performance. In 1896, the *Magazine of Music* featured an article called 'A Chat With A Judge'. The unnamed judge was 'tall and stalwart, with a clever-looking, stern face [...] and whose decision no one would think it wise to question.'<sup>153</sup> The judge stated that 'there is no thing like emulation to bring all that is best out of a man; and the careful, diligent practice which has to be undergone in the preparation of the selected piece cannot fail to have good results.'<sup>154</sup> The performance of music had become associated with the brass bands and more importantly with the bandsmen, who were influenced by middle-class musical tastes but made the repertoire its own.

---

151 *Manchester Times* (5 June, 1886).

152 *Musical Standard*, Vol 38, No 971 (10 August, 1912), p. 95.

153 'A Chat With A Judge', *Magazine of Music*, Volume 13, No 10 (October, 1896), p. 646.

154 'A Chat With A Judge', p. 646.

The performances of the brass bands in this period are much more than how a bands or individuals played a crotchet. To ignore brass bands' musical performances, in terms of the formation of cultural identity, would be to ignore an important contribution to the overall strengthening of a wider working-class culture that was growing quickly in this period, when older working-class traditions were in retreat. E. P. Thompson argued that traditional celebrations associated with trades and built into the calendar year, such as St. Clement for the blacksmiths and St. Crispin for the shoemakers, had quickly faded and were only celebrated occasionally in the nineteenth century.<sup>155</sup> They had lost their trade endorsement and these celebrations became infrequent events held in clubs or pubs.<sup>156</sup> The triumvirate of Gladney, Swift and Owen consolidated brass band tradition. These band traditions legitimised bandsmens' values and social practices in public view.

The calendar that was supplied with the *Cornet* in 1901 (see figure 2 below), reveals the process of building brass band tradition in detail.

---

155 E. P. Thompson, *Customs in Common*, ( first published, London,1991, this edition, 1993), p. 5



# CALENDAR FOR 1901.



MR. A. OWEN.



MR. JOHN GLADNEY.

## CALENDAR FOR 1901.

Good Friday ..... April 6  
 Easter Monday ..... April 9  
 Whit Sunday ..... May 7  
 Bank Holiday ..... August 6  
 Christmas Day ..... Dec. 25  
 Boxing Day ..... Dec. 26

JANUARY.	FEBRUARY.	MARCH.	APRIL.	MAY.	JUNE.
S M T W T F S	S M T W T F S	S M T W T F S	S M T W T F S	S M T W T F S	S M T W T F S
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30



MR. GEO. HAMES.



MR. W. HOLSWORTH.



LINDLEY BRASS BAND (Belle Vue Champions of 1900.)

### List of Brass Band Contests of 1900.

Date.	Contest.	Date.	Contest.	Date.	Contest.	Date.	Contest.
Jan. 1	Bellevue	Jan. 1	St. George	Feb. 23	St. George	Aug. 1	Huddersfield
Jan. 3	St. George	Jan. 4	St. George	Feb. 24	St. George	Aug. 18	St. George
Jan. 17	St. George	Jan. 8	St. George	Feb. 25	St. George	Aug. 25	St. George
Jan. 25	St. George	Jan. 15	St. George	Feb. 26	St. George	Aug. 26	St. George
Jan. 29	St. George	Jan. 22	St. George	Feb. 27	St. George	Aug. 27	St. George
Jan. 30	St. George	Jan. 29	St. George	Feb. 28	St. George	Aug. 28	St. George
Jan. 31	St. George	Jan. 30	St. George	Feb. 29	St. George	Aug. 29	St. George
Feb. 1	St. George	Jan. 31	St. George	Feb. 30	St. George	Aug. 30	St. George
Feb. 2	St. George	Feb. 1	St. George	Mar. 1	St. George	Aug. 31	St. George
Feb. 3	St. George	Feb. 2	St. George	Mar. 2	St. George		
Feb. 4	St. George	Feb. 3	St. George	Mar. 3	St. George		
Feb. 5	St. George	Feb. 4	St. George	Mar. 4	St. George		
Feb. 6	St. George	Feb. 5	St. George	Mar. 5	St. George		
Feb. 7	St. George	Feb. 6	St. George	Mar. 6	St. George		
Feb. 8	St. George	Feb. 7	St. George	Mar. 7	St. George		
Feb. 9	St. George	Feb. 8	St. George	Mar. 8	St. George		
Feb. 10	St. George	Feb. 9	St. George	Mar. 9	St. George		
Feb. 11	St. George	Feb. 10	St. George	Mar. 10	St. George		
Feb. 12	St. George	Feb. 11	St. George	Mar. 11	St. George		
Feb. 13	St. George	Feb. 12	St. George	Mar. 12	St. George		
Feb. 14	St. George	Feb. 13	St. George	Mar. 13	St. George		
Feb. 15	St. George	Feb. 14	St. George	Mar. 14	St. George		
Feb. 16	St. George	Feb. 15	St. George	Mar. 15	St. George		
Feb. 17	St. George	Feb. 16	St. George	Mar. 16	St. George		
Feb. 18	St. George	Feb. 17	St. George	Mar. 17	St. George		
Feb. 19	St. George	Feb. 18	St. George	Mar. 18	St. George		
Feb. 20	St. George	Feb. 19	St. George	Mar. 19	St. George		
Feb. 21	St. George	Feb. 20	St. George	Mar. 20	St. George		
Feb. 22	St. George	Feb. 21	St. George	Mar. 21	St. George		
Feb. 23	St. George	Feb. 22	St. George	Mar. 22	St. George		
Feb. 24	St. George	Feb. 23	St. George	Mar. 23	St. George		
Feb. 25	St. George	Feb. 24	St. George	Mar. 24	St. George		
Feb. 26	St. George	Feb. 25	St. George	Mar. 25	St. George		
Feb. 27	St. George	Feb. 26	St. George	Mar. 26	St. George		
Feb. 28	St. George	Feb. 27	St. George	Mar. 27	St. George		
Feb. 29	St. George	Feb. 28	St. George	Mar. 28	St. George		
Feb. 30	St. George	Feb. 29	St. George	Mar. 29	St. George		
Mar. 1	St. George	Feb. 30	St. George	Mar. 30	St. George		
Mar. 2	St. George	Mar. 1	St. George	Mar. 31	St. George		
Mar. 3	St. George	Mar. 2	St. George				
Mar. 4	St. George	Mar. 3	St. George				
Mar. 5	St. George	Mar. 4	St. George				
Mar. 6	St. George	Mar. 5	St. George				
Mar. 7	St. George	Mar. 6	St. George				
Mar. 8	St. George	Mar. 7	St. George				
Mar. 9	St. George	Mar. 8	St. George				
Mar. 10	St. George	Mar. 9	St. George				
Mar. 11	St. George	Mar. 10	St. George				
Mar. 12	St. George	Mar. 11	St. George				
Mar. 13	St. George	Mar. 12	St. George				
Mar. 14	St. George	Mar. 13	St. George				
Mar. 15	St. George	Mar. 14	St. George				
Mar. 16	St. George	Mar. 15	St. George				
Mar. 17	St. George	Mar. 16	St. George				
Mar. 18	St. George	Mar. 17	St. George				
Mar. 19	St. George	Mar. 18	St. George				
Mar. 20	St. George	Mar. 19	St. George				
Mar. 21	St. George	Mar. 20	St. George				
Mar. 22	St. George	Mar. 21	St. George				
Mar. 23	St. George	Mar. 22	St. George				
Mar. 24	St. George	Mar. 23	St. George				
Mar. 25	St. George	Mar. 24	St. George				
Mar. 26	St. George	Mar. 25	St. George				
Mar. 27	St. George	Mar. 26	St. George				
Mar. 28	St. George	Mar. 27	St. George				
Mar. 29	St. George	Mar. 28	St. George				
Mar. 30	St. George	Mar. 29	St. George				
Mar. 31	St. George	Mar. 30	St. George				



MR. E. SUTTON (Glasgow).



MR. JOHN PALEY.



MR. J. WALKER (Batley).



MR. W. HEAP.

PUBLISHER: F. RICHARDSON,  
 "CORNET" OFFICE, SIBSEY, BOSTON, LINCS.  
 WITH THE PUBLISHER'S COMPLIMENTS.

Figure 2. The Cornet Calendar, 1901.

At the top of the calendar are images of Alexander Owen and John Gladney, two of the triumvirate who conducted 'crack' bands. Hence, the heroes of the band movement were documented in a printed form shared throughout the band movement. The calendar placed not only Owen and Gladney at the top, but also, for that year at least, the members of Lindley Band who had increased status. The band had become a role model. Other successful players, trainers and conductors are featured as role models that aspiring players and bandmasters could emulate. John Paley, for example, was a solo cornet player with Black Dyke Mills and William Heap was a well-known cornet player and conductor who conducted, amongst others, Oats Royd Mill's Brass Band.<sup>157</sup> However, what is striking is the list of the previous year's contests from 1900. These are dates when brass bands would come together to play music. Nevertheless, within this musical performance, bands were refining and celebrating their working-class musical culture in contest spaces where they were assessed, analysed and commented on by middle-class observers. In this way, and because of this commentary, the brass bands were cementing their use of leisure to create new working-class traditions.

The calendar shows that brass bands created their own series of festive events, and their own cultural identity, which emerged out of traditions they were newly inventing: contests at Belle Vue in Manchester and National Finals at the Crystal Palace in London, the Whit Friday Contests and so on. Through repetition of these contests, as well as repetition of more local rituals, such as Christmas carolling, old-peoples' treats and charity fundraising, for example, the

---

<sup>157</sup>*The Internet Bandsman's Everything Within* <[www.ibew.co.uk](http://www.ibew.co.uk)> accessed, 9 December, 2011.

membership of brass bands were sharing in a transformation of rituals taking place amongst the working class, such as the growth of May Day, for example, which Hobsbawm argued was 'perhaps the most ambitious of labour rituals.'<sup>158</sup> Unlike May Day, brass band contests were not demonstrations of labour power in the political sense, they were, however, similar in that they were a presentation of class that showed cultural populism in dedicated social spaces, it was the assertion of identity in a ritualised and legitimised setting. The symbol of the brass band playing at a contest showed the working class could structure and plan their leisure time for their own purposes.

The work carried out by Gladney, Swift and Owen legitimised social practices and conventions of musical style that were copied by other bands, the men became figures of authority in defining the cultural practices of the band movement. They legitimised the brass band movement in terms of sound production, repertoire and rehearsal standards, they reinforced the all ready cyclical transference of knowledge that could be shared by all bandsmen, hence, strengthening tradition and cultural identity. With this process they enabled the brass band to become a secure representation of the working class at leisure. Chapter two showed how novice bandsmen entered the north's musical environment with a secure heritage of musicianship. This chapter has shown how the imitation of the triumvirate's techniques gave bandsmen continuation and consolidation of musical style.

---

158 Eric Hobsbawm, 'Birth of A Holiday: The First of May', in, Eric Hobsbawm, *Uncommon People: Resistance Rebellion and Jazz* (London, 1998, this edition, London, 1999), p. 152.



This acted as a foundation to how the bands wider social networks and supporters were viewed. Musical performance became a way that custom could be used to express the values of the working-class world. As Joyce maintains, 'practice and values were interwoven in the pattern of a working day, week and year which provided a practical and emotionally satisfying structuring of time.'<sup>159</sup> The structuring of time, through regular contests in the brass band movement that could be practiced for and 'aimed' at, ensured that leisure and working-class culture came together in dedicated social spaces when the contest day arrived. The visible leisure of working-class bandsmen, and their followers, was prepared for in advance and marked off from work time. Joyce argues that ritual and repetition were organising principles of working-class life, most notably in the domestic sphere, household chores and the consumption of food, for instance.<sup>160</sup> The brass bands were a way off transferring working-class ritual to the public space.

The activities of the bands had brought the working class together in spaces that accommodated working-class leisure. As Ruth Finnegan has observed of amateur music-making traditions elsewhere, a band practice, a trip to a contest, a day in the park, or an evening concert became more than just time allocated to music: it was also a social occasion.<sup>161</sup> From the novice bandsmen to the players in the 'crack' bands, it was the commonalities in musical processes that led to brass bands becoming a musical expression of working-class leisure

---

<sup>159</sup> Patrick Joyce, *Visions of the People, Industrial England and the Question of Class* (Cambridge, 1991, this edition, 1994), p. 150.

<sup>160</sup> Joyce, *Visions of the People*, p. 152.

<sup>161</sup> Ruth Finnegan, *The Hidden Musicians, Music Making in an English Town* (Cambridge: New York, 1989), p. 328.

that created extended social networks that further reinforced the working-class nature of musical performance.

## **Brass Bands in the Southern Pennines, 1857-1914:**

### **Rational Recreation and Perceptions of Working-Class Respectability**

Opening on 5 May 1857, Manchester held the largest British fine-arts exhibition to date. The Manchester Art Treasures Exhibition opened to the public and by the end of May visitors had reached significant numbers. *John Bull and Britannia* reported that on the 28 May in the afternoon alone, 9,333 people attended the exhibition.<sup>1</sup> This exhibition caught the public's imagination. In all one and a half million people visited. As happened at the Great Exhibition many employers arranged for their workers to visit. Titus Salt brought 2,500 workers from his Saltaire works and the *Art-Treasures Examiner*, the weekly exhibition's journal, described their arrival:

All dressed in their Sunday best[...] in three special trains[...].The fine brass band belonging to the establishment accompanied the first two trains, and the Saltaire Drum-and Fife-Band the last[...].They were accompanied, by their generous employer, Mr Titus Salt, who paid all expenses connected with the trip.<sup>2</sup>

Salt created a spectacle as he entered the exhibition: striding in front of his brass band, who were leading the mill's employees into the exhibition.<sup>3</sup> Salt used his

---

1 *John Bull and Britannia* (30 May, 1857), p. 352.

2 *Art-Treasures Examiner*, p. 252, cited in, Helen Rees Leahy, "Walking for Pleasure?" Bodies of Display at The Manchester Art Exhibition in 1857', *Art History*, 30/4 (September, 2007), p. 560.

3 *Art-Treasures Examiner*, p. 252.

band, seen by the *Art-Treasures Examiner* as his employees, as a declaration of his status within the nation. The reasons for, and thought processes, behind this theatrical act are the influences behind this chapter, in which I explore the relationships that emerged between employers, communities and the bands as a result of the development of working-class leisure and the growth of the rational recreation ethos.

In 1977, when examining a number of texts that discussed the relationship between leisure, rational recreation and social control, Gareth Steadman-Jones argued that 'it is very important to develop research into non-work time and the different ways in which workers have used it. But it would be a fundamental mistake to develop it into a subject in its own right.'<sup>4</sup> Steadman-Jones argued that the greatest social control in a capitalist economy was the need to earn wages. To earn, the worker must be reliable and fit in order to sell their labour.<sup>5</sup> In short, the need for survival outran any consumerist leisure pursuit that may indicate external identity from the ability to earn wages. He argues that 'to study leisure and popular recreation as a distinct subject - particularly if we try to think of it in terms of a polarity between 'class expression and social control - leads to a real danger of overpoliticizing leisure as an area for struggle.'<sup>6</sup> He noted that some leisure areas - the pub for example - were strongly defended, yet other earlier traditions were given up easily. The struggle of the factory of work and

---

4 Gareth Steadman-Jones, 'Class Expression Versus Social Control? A Critique of Recent Trends in the Social History of 'Leisure', *History Workshop Journal*, 4/1 (1977), p. 169.

5 Steadman-Jones, 'Class Expression Versus Social Control?' p. 169.

6 Steadman-Jones, 'Class Expression Versus Social Control?' p. 170.

wages was not leisure. The primary point of a holiday, he argued, was to have fun. It was not political.<sup>7</sup>

This chapter will show - contrary to Steadman-Jones - that the ground between work and leisure was fluid and negotiable. Southern Pennine brass bands relied heavily on industrialists and communities, together with other agencies, such as the 1859 Volunteer Movement, for financial support. It was this support that made the ground between work and leisure unclear. If Steadman-Jones argues that the primary point of a holiday is to enjoy yourself, 'for tomorrow you must work',<sup>8</sup> I argue that bandsmen often needed work to enable their most visible leisure pursuit. It was the growth of leisure and the spread of the rational recreation ethos that ensured that bands could not just survive but thrive. Within this ethos the middle class had well-defined expectations of how working-class bandsmen should behave. It was how these expectations were negotiated by bandsmen that highlighted the close relationship between work and leisure in the formation of the bandsmen's public identity.

In exploring these ideas I will explore two types of relationships that the brass bands had in the Southern Pennines: the first will be the relationship between the brass bands and industrialists, for example, between the Fosters and Black Dyke Mills Band. The second kind of relationship bands had was with the wider community in the form of the public subscription bands. Haworth Brass Band's relationship, for example, with the local community was remarkably

---

7 Steadman-Jones, 'Class Expression Versus Social Control?' p. 170.

8 Steadman-Jones, 'Class Expression Versus Social Control?' p. 170.

similar to the relationship industrialists had with their bands; subscription bands had to appeal to the wider community for finance, often invoking a wider set of positive moral values to receive the subscriptions. In addition the significance of the 1859 Volunteer Movement, as a rational recreation, will be examined as the movement had an important structural impact on the financing of many brass bands in the region. There will also be a discussion of the role of Salvation Army bands and the use of music as a 'rational recreation'. How did music influence Salvationist brass players' role within the wider working-class world of brass bands?

Rational recreation in its simplest form matches the *Oxford English Dictionary's* definition of the words. Rational: 'sensible, sane, moderate, not foolish, absurd or extreme', together with recreation: 'the process or means of refreshing or entertaining oneself'.<sup>9</sup> To the Victorian mind, the ethos was a way of *refreshing* the worker with moderate, improving and sober pastimes. In the eyes of middle-class reformers workers had a duty to use leisure time responsibly. Recreation was an addition to work that rejuvenated and prepared the worker for the challenges of the workplace. Moreover, the worker had a duty to ensure they were ready to perform at their fullest capacity in the workplace. In 1881 the Reverend Harry Jones argued that recreation was a form of renewal. He said that:

Recreation in its popular sense, as play, must work in the lines of its largest processes, if it is to be really of use. For the purposes of healthy renewal, man's complex nature

---

<sup>9</sup> See R. E. Allen (Ed.), *The Concise Oxford Dictionary* (Oxford, 1964, this edition, 1990).

demands more than he can get by mere meat and sleep [...].It must restore something which is legitimately consumed. It is the right and duty of workers.<sup>10</sup>

Rational recreation consisted of a series of activities that the middle class urged workers to undertake and as a way of engaging with and understanding their new leisure time.<sup>11</sup> Recreational activities were numerous and varied. Behind the rhetoric, which gave consistency to appropriate pastimes, there existed a specific rationale for the encouragement of certain activities and the discouragement of others. Anthony Trollope, for example, graded numerous pastimes according to an assessment of their 'dignity'. Such classifications were common amongst educated Victorians, suggesting a range of values systems that underscored class-specific descriptions of popular recreation.<sup>12</sup> Reverend Jones, for example, supported pastimes that had been common for autodidactic workers in the Southern Pennines.<sup>13</sup> Importantly these pastimes were affordable; they were available for a significant number of the working-class population. He said:

It is well to have some occupation [...] of which we are fond. It may be a cheap and humble one; it may seem trifling. Our knowledge of botany, chemistry, geology and other ologies may be very small, but it is astonishing what an interest may be given to even the commonest walk by the knowledge of some of the mere rudiments of science.<sup>14</sup>

Together with these affordable pastimes Jones felt that recreation should 'make us ready and willing to begin work again, [or] there has been something wrong in its use.'<sup>15</sup>

---

10 Reverend Harry Jones, 'Recreation', *Good Words*, 22 (December 1881), pp. 42-43.

11 Chris Waters, *British Socialists and the Politics of Popular Culture 1884-1914* (Manchester, 1990), p. 23.

12 See Bruce Hayley *The Healthy Body and Victorian Culture* (Cambridge, 1978), pp. 124-125, cited in Waters, *British Socialists*, p. 24.

13 See Chapter One.

14 Jones, 'Recreation', p. 45.

15 Jones, 'Recreation', p. 46.

This re-energising rhetoric placed music, and more importantly brass bands, at the forefront of the desire to give the working class an improving pastime. The middle-class rhetoric of rational recreation may have provided finance, guidance and figures of authority, but what did the working-class bandsmen gain from these acts? Were they reciprocal or one-sided relationships? What did industrialists and sponsoring communities expect from their bands in terms of behaviour, education, morals and ethics? Did bands reject, absorb, distort or contradict the financial support that was given with the caveat of moral, educational and ethical behaviour upon its receipt? As F. M. L. Thompson has argued:

the social controllers may propose what they wish, and if they command the necessary resources of money, influence, and authority they may set up their institutions, services, or laws; ultimately, however, it is the intended objects of control who dispose, by their responses to what is thrust at them, by accepting, rejecting, absorbing, adapting, distorting, or countering the wares on display.<sup>16</sup>

From 1850 to 1914 the British developed the working week into its recognisable contemporary form. Leisure began to develop because of the change in the daily hours of work and the nature of the work carried out. Employers understood that productivity would increase if hours were shorter, wages higher, and the pace of work increased.<sup>17</sup> Technological innovation, together with the introduction of production line techniques, achieved higher production.<sup>18</sup> The Factory Act of 1850 changed textile workers' working day to ten and a half hours and they were also assured a Saturday half-holiday. By 1877 this practice had spread to most

---

16 F. M. L. Thompson, 'Social Control in Victorian Britain', *The Economic History Review*, 34/2, (May, 1981), p. 193.

17 Hugh Cunningham, *Leisure in the Industrial Revolution* (London, 1980), p. 147.

18 Cunningham, *Leisure in the Industrial Revolution*, p. 147.



of industry, partly because in 1867 the Factory Act defined a 'factory' as to encompass most of the industries in England and Wales, ranging from small workshops to large enterprises. By 1874 an act had reduced the hours of work in textile factories to ten hours on a weekday and six and a half on a Saturday. The actions of organised labour helped reduce the hours in the working day even more. In the 1850s building unions began the campaign for a nine-hour day and this met with some success in the north of England. The building boom of the 1870s helped bring success to the campaign, establishing a nine-hour day for most unionised workers. Service, agricultural and retail workers continued to work very long and unsociable hours. Nevertheless, for the industrial working class there was now time to pursue leisure activities.<sup>19</sup>

Increased leisure time attracted the attention of philanthropists and social reformers. In the mid-nineteenth-century the rural and urban elites founded clubs, associations and societies keen to provide civilising pastimes for the masses. They were keen to divert the attention of the working-class away from the ennui of factory work, and, what Ross McKibbin argues 'was the inevitable solution to this tedium: the bottle.'<sup>20</sup> Music was one rational recreation viewed as an ideal pastime to divert workers away from the public house. Evidence of the influence of music as a rational recreation for labouring people can be found as early as 1829, when a correspondent wrote in the *Gardener's Magazine* that:

There is nothing I am more anxious to see, or would more gladly contribute to than a *Society for the Rational Amusements of the Lower Classes* [emphasis in original], the first aim of which should be to instruct itinerant teachers of music, singing, and dancing,

---

<sup>19</sup> Cunningham, *Leisure in the Industrial Revolution*, p. 148.

<sup>20</sup> Ross McKibbin, 'Work and Hobbies in Britain, 1880-1950', from, Ross McKibbin, *The Ideologies of Class, Social Relations in Britain 1880-1950* (Oxford, 1990), p.140.

in improved modes of imparting their arts, and thus set the plan agoing, when it would soon work its own way, and then might be extended to higher objects.<sup>21</sup>

The correspondent's view was that the main result of this musical recreation was that when it was conjoined with other improving activities, such as vegetable and flower growing, it stopped the lower classes drinking to excess. The result of education, and rational recreation, was clearly marriage, the security of family unity and moderation, hence the author wrote:

The lower classes in England, thus improved in morals and manners by a better education and more humanising amusements might be safely left to choose their time of contracting marriage, and would no more make beasts of themselves by drinking fermented liquors, than do the lower classes in the lower classes in the city from which I write (Brussels) where probably more beer (and by no means weak) is drank than in any town in England, every street being crowded with *Cabarets* (public-houses), and these in the evenings are almost always filled [...]. Not with rioters and noisy drunkards, but with parties at separate tables, often consisting of a man, his wife and children, all sipping their pot of beer poured into very small glasses to prolong the pleasure, and the gratification of drinking seemingly less than that of the cheerful chit-chat [...]. Deep-rooted national bad habits can be eradicated only by the spread of knowledge, which will ultimately teach our lower classes [...] that *moderation* is the condition of real enjoyments, and must be the motto of even the sensualist who aims at long-continued indulgence.<sup>22</sup>

This desire to provide rational recreation grew from a number of mainly masculine and plebeian influences. Peter Borsay argues that the lower orders were 'labelled in various ways, for example: as the common people, the mobility, the plebs, the populace, the rabble, the masses, the lower orders, the labouring class, the working class, and the workers; and historians have felt able to identify

---

21 *Gardener's Magazine* (n.d., n.p.), cited in, *Mirror of Literature, Amusement and Instruction*, Volume 13, Number 368 (2 May, 1829), p. 303.

22 *Gardener's Magazine*, p. 303.

a particular type of recreational life for this group'.<sup>23</sup> Working-class leisure after the mid nineteenth-century was fiercely competitive and activities such as fishing, football and brass band contests developed strong communal rivalries. Heavy drinking was associated with the lower orders, and in turn drunkenness and the violence it caused became stigmas associated with this group. Drinking and making noise were natural accompaniments to workers' recreation. This behaviour was not just a reaction to the grinding monotony of work; within this behaviour was hidden the sociability and public nature of labouring peoples' recreation.<sup>24</sup> The pub was an attractive place to be: it offered a range of activities for the working classes. From the 1830s the *Bolton Press* showed the wide range of activities on offer in the public house. These recreations encouraged communal bonding, such as bowling, quoiting, glee clubs and free and easies, amateur and professional dramatics, fruit and vegetable shows, flower shows, sweepstake clubs, and the meetings of friendly societies. For the single man, who lived in lodgings, the pub could be a home, where he would read the newspapers and take his meals. Peter Bailey argued that 'the pub remained a centre of warmth, light and sociability for the urban poor, a haven from the filth and meanness of inadequate and congested housing'.<sup>25</sup>

The conclusion was clear: for every increase in free time given to the worker by the state or employer the worker should be encouraged to fill this time with sober, educational and elevating activities. By the end of the nineteenth century the social and economic role of the pub shrank, drinking hours had been

---

23 Peter Borsay, *A History of Leisure* (Basingstoke, 2006), pp. 85-86.

24 Peter Bailey, *Leisure and Class in Victorian England, Rational Recreation and the Contest for Control, 1830-1885* (London, 1978), p. 9.

25 Bailey, *Leisure and Class in Victorian England*, p.10.

limited and children were excluded from the bar.<sup>26</sup> Cock fighting, bear baiting and ratting had almost vanished and evangelical disapproval had quickened the fall of free and easies. By the 1860s many of the great London fairs were abolished and the tradition of the St Monday holiday had all but vanished in most trades.<sup>27</sup> By 1871 there was an increase in the number of parks, museums, art galleries and mechanics' institutes, all promoting a more innocuous use of free time.<sup>28</sup> In 1867 *The Times* editorial illustrated the mood of the rational recreation ethos:

Who would not be the English working man? He is the spoilt child of the great British Family. Though very well able to take care of himself, and with strong notions of independence, we are striving to take him by the hand, and do him some good or other. We build institutions for him, we present him with books, pictures and models, we read to him, and preach to him, we teach him to make societies; we are bringing the franchise to his door, and laying it on his table, if he will but rise from the chair and take it.<sup>29</sup>

### **Music as a Philanthropic Gesture**

Music as a rational recreation was quickly supported financially by industrialists. The link between employers, working people and musical performance had been noticed early in the Victorian era. In 1835 George Hogarth noted that in the north of England amateur musicians mixed socially with their employers at concerts.<sup>30</sup> By 1844 the link between industrialists' philanthropy, the provision of rational recreation and its influence upon the respectability of labouring people was clear to observers. The *British Minstrel and Musical and Literary Miscellany*, for example, reported on 'a great choral meeting of the Lancashire and Cheshire

---

26 Gareth Steadman Jones, *Languages of Class, studies in English Working Class History 1832 – 1982* (Cambridge, 1983), p. 194.

27 Steadman Jones, *Languages of Class*, p. 194.

28 Steadman Jones, *Languages of Class*, p. 194

29 Cited in, Brad Beaven, *Leisure, Citizenship and Working-Class Men in Britain, 1850-1945* (Manchester, 2004), p. 17.

30 George Hogarth, *Musical History, Biography and Criticism*, (London, 1835), p.129.

working men' that was held in Manchester and consisted of eight-hundred and fifty performers trained in the tonic-sol-fa method.<sup>31</sup> The journal wrote about the editorials of Manchester newspapers that 'they all agree in one opinion, namely, that this meeting was eminently successful, whether it be looked upon as evidence of the utility of music in improving the tastes and social habits of the people, or as an experiment and test of what may be done towards fostering the musical capabilities of the working classes.'<sup>32</sup> The *Manchester Guardian* highlighted that industrialists were taking an interest in providing music as a rational recreation, with the aim, and self-satisfaction, of directing working people away from drinking:

There is no musical exhibition in the course of the year, in this eminently musical town, which is more calculated to interest the philanthropist, than these annual choral meetings of the associated workingman's singing classes. It is here that he finds music more directly used as a moral agent, in providing an ever-delightful source of improving recreation for the leisure hours of the masses; and even if the performances were, in themselves, less effective than they are, *his* [the philanthropist. Emphasis in original] satisfaction would hardly be less, because he would view them in their more important bearing, as furnishing beneficial occupation for that portion of twenty-four hours which...is too often devoted to the most disastrous indulgences by our teeming and hard working population.<sup>33</sup>

The *Manchester Times* echoed this rhetoric, making the philanthropist the central enabler in this improvement in the moral life of at least part of the working class writing that:

Music is no longer confined to the palace of the prince, and to the mansion of the millionaire-it is now an inmate of the cottages of the poor, and it presents to them sources of delight which they vainly sought in the alehouse, and in the unkindly strife of politics. All Hail! then, to those men [philanthropists], who by placing this charming

---

<sup>31</sup> *British Minstrel, and Musical and Literary Miscellany*, Volume 3, Number 81 (January 1845), p. 31.

<sup>32</sup> *British Minstrel, and Musical and Literary Miscellany*, p. 31.

<sup>33</sup> *Manchester Guardian*, (n.d.), cited in, *British Minstrel, and Musical and Literary Miscellany*, p. 31.

accomplishment within the reach of the humblest, provide a sinless and exalting amusement for the poor man.<sup>34</sup>

Therefore, by the 1840s, music was a well-established recreation for working people and some philanthropists saw themselves as the body of people who had supported this pastime.

### **Music: The Great Moral Improver**

Many Victorian social reformers believed that the performance and reception of music could improve the mind, civilise the rough and purify the soul and that these benefits would be useful for the moral improvement of working people. In 1846, for example, George Hogarth wrote in his weekly newspaper, the *Musical Herald*:

The tendency of music is to soften and purify the mind [...] the cultivation of musical taste furnishes for the rich a refined and intellectual pursuit [...] [and for the working classes] a relaxation from toil more attractive than the haunts of intemperance [and in] densely populated manufacturing districts of Yorkshire, Lancashire and Derbyshire, music is cultivated among the working classes to an extent unparalleled in any other part of the kingdom [...]<sup>35</sup>

In 1857, an author in the Dublin Temperance Movement pamphlet, *Recreation for the Working Classes on Temperance Principles*, wrote that, 'one of the most important auxiliaries that can be employed, not to only to entertain and delight,

---

<sup>34</sup> *Manchester Times*, (n.d.) cited in *British Minstrel, and Musical and Literary Miscellany*, p. 31.

<sup>35</sup> *Musical Herald* (4 July, 1846), p. 24. This article contains materials from Hogarth's *Musical History: Biography and Criticism* (London, 1835). Cited in Trevor Herbert, 'Nineteenth-Century Bands: Making a Movement' in Trevor Herbert (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), p. 32.

but actually to humanize, is *music* [emphasis in original] - innocent, sublime and sweet music.<sup>36</sup>

These arguments held currency in the Victorian middle-class home and shows what the middle class thought of music as a rational recreation. Derek B. Scott's analysis of songs and piano pieces that were performed in the home shows that 'music for the nineteenth-century middle-class home aligns itself with one of the fundamental "Victorian values" – that of improvement.'<sup>37</sup> Scott examined a range of issues, from what songs and piano pieces were found suitable (their various types and their moral tone), to their role in teaching lessons that improve both mind and spirit. Scott found that the performance of domestic ballads in the middle-class home was not just mere entertainment but was seen as morally elevating and refining.<sup>38</sup>

Music was seen to encourage the better qualities in the workers' nature. As F. M. L. Thompson has argued, the motives and efforts of the teetotalers in cleaning up the music halls and providing parks, libraries and civilising pastimes for working people did meet with some success and were aligned with the aims of other social reformers in this period.<sup>39</sup>

The Reverend Hugh Reginald Haweis stands out as what Chris Waters felt was the most 'elaborate' example of how many Victorian reformers assumed music could exert a refining influence in society, elevating the soul and paving

---

36 Anon, *Recreation for the Working Classes on Temperance Principles* (Dublin, 1857), p. 6.

37 Derek B. Scott, 'Music, Morality and Rational Amusement at the Victorian Middle-Class Soirée' in, Bennett Zon (Ed.), *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Music and Performance Culture in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Essays in Honour of Nicholas Temperley* (Farnham, 2012), p. 83.

38 Scott, 'Music, Morality and Rational Amusement at the Victorian Middle-Class Soirée', p. 83.

39 F. M. L. Thompson, 'Social Control in Victorian Britain', pp. 200-201.

the way for social harmony.<sup>40</sup> Trevor Herbert suggests that Haweis made ‘bizarre postulations’, most notably in *Music and Morals* (London, 1871), where Herbert, writes, that Haweis ‘cheerfully proclaimed that certain types of melody could induce virtue [...]’<sup>41</sup> Yet *Music and Morals* was reprinted 21 times between 1871 and 1906.<sup>42</sup> In spite of the elaborate claims made in the book Waters argues that it was an ‘important source of inspiration for individuals interested in social reform and was, indeed, widely read in socialist circles.’<sup>43</sup> Montague Blatchford, for example, wrote an article called ‘What is Music?’ for the *Clarion*, and one correspondent suggested that music was both an expression of – and an important influence on – the emotions and that Blatchford could learn about the relationship if he read *Music and Morals*.<sup>44</sup> Even though Haweis was seen as one of the more extreme preachers, his views on music as rational recreation reflected the more moderate, but no less enthusiastic, ethos of reformers in this period.

Haweis was born on the 3 April 1838, in Egham, Surrey.<sup>45</sup> Haweis was the eldest of four children and from an early age he showed a great gift for playing the violin. By the age of sixteen, he was sent to a tutor to prepare for entry to Cambridge. In 1856 he enrolled at Trinity College, Cambridge and he threw himself into college life. He was the principal violinist of the Cambridge Musical Society, formed a quartet society, read German poetry and philosophy, started a

---

40 Waters, *British Socialists and the Politics of Popular Culture, 1884-1914*, p. 98.

41 Herbert, ‘Nineteenth-Century Bands: Making a Movement’, p.32.

42 Herbert, ‘Nineteenth-Century Bands: Making a Movement’, p.32.

43 Waters, *British Socialists and the Politics of Popular Culture*, p. 98.

44 Carpenter Papers, MSS 14; *Clarion* (20 November, 1903), p. 8. Cited in, Waters, *British Socialists and the Politics of Popular Culture*, p. 98.

45 Elizabeth Baignet, ‘Haweis, Hugh Reginald (1838-1901)’, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, (Oxford, 2004), <<http://www.oxford.dnb.com/view/article/33763>>, accessed, 1 January, 2009, p.1 (Unless otherwise stated biographical information is from this source.)



short-lived magazine called *The Lion* and wrote for several newspapers. In 1861 he passed the Cambridge exam in theology and became ordained that year, becoming a priest in 1862.

Haweis was an enigmatic and powerful preacher. He was an outspoken advocate of the compatibility of Christianity and Spiritualism, continually driving home the doctrine of eternal damnation. He wore a black cloak when he preached, which led to accusations of vanity and charlatanry and these accusations hid his honest spiritual talent. His early musical career led to him using music as a means of keeping people away from the public house. He used his church to give 'Sunday evenings for the people', at which orchestral music, oratorio performances and even exhibitions of sacred pictures were used to form parts of ordinary church services. He was not alone in using music as an improving recreation. Local authorities were experimenting with giving Sunday afternoon concerts in churches. In 1886 the *Musical Times* noted of musical life in Manchester:

Some hope was excited that recitals on Sunday afternoons might be established after the examples set by the authorities in Liverpool. So that people not desiring to go to church three times a day might have some provision made for their comfort and rational recreation. It is now not an infrequent custom to throw open our church and chapel doors for what are called 'Services of Song' [...]. It would be difficult for the most bigoted to advance any serious arguments against the gratification of taste that would stop opportunities of listening to the tones of an instrument that must ever be invested with a sacred and solemn character.<sup>46</sup>

Haweis became a campaigner for the provision of rational recreations in the community. He was an early advocate for the Sunday opening of museums and

---

<sup>46</sup> *Musical Times* (1 April, 1886), p. 536.

art galleries; he occupied himself with the provision of open spaces in London and laying out disused churchyards as gardens. His main success was as a lecturer on musical and religious themes, travelling throughout England, Canada and the United States. Haweis lectured that music imitated sounds and sights in the natural world. He argued that music was everywhere in the natural world, writing:

The wailing of the wind at night, the hum of insect life, the nightingale's note, the scream of the eagle, the cries of animals, and, above all, the natural inflections of the human voice - such are the rough elements of music, multitudinous, incoherent and formless. Earth, and sea, are full of these inarticulate voices; sound floats upward from populous cities to the cloudland [...]. Alone by the sea we may listen and hear a distinct and different tone each time the swelling wavelet breaks crisply at our feet; and when the wind, with fitful and angry howl drives inland the foam of the breakers, the shriek of the retiring surge upon the shingles will often run through several descending semitones.<sup>47</sup>

Haweis argued that even though music was not as ancient an art as painting or sculpture it was still valid in expressing human emotions.<sup>48</sup> For Haweis music was pure, linked with nature. It only became tainted with the intervention of external personalities. Music became evil, or impure, when the intentions - or emotions - of the composer were impure:

When music becomes a mixed art - that is to say, when it is wedded to words, and associated with definite ideas - when it is made the accompaniment of scenes, which in themselves are calculated to work powerfully for good, or evil upon the emotions - then it is easy to see how music is a moral or an immoral agent.<sup>49</sup>

---

47 Hugh Reginald Haweis, *Music and Morals*, (London, 1871, this edition, 1917), pp. 4-5.

48 Haweis, *Music and Morals*, pp. 9-10.

49 Haweis, *Music and Morals*, pp. 46-47.

Haweis felt that the production of sound was at the root of human emotions, the timbre, speed, variety and intensity of sound could influence how a person felt.<sup>50</sup>

By 1887 this notion was repeated in regional music journals. In the north the

*Yorkshire Musician* reinforced Haweis's message:

Music can neither be satirical, witty, nor personal, hence she is innocent as a companion. She is therefore, pure, holy and harmless to all her votaries, and convincingly a universal factor of unselfish love [...]. Music can only form an adjunct to debauchery when wedded to words [...]. An instrument, which is really music, cannot express a vicious idea, or inspire a corrupt thought.<sup>51</sup>

### **The Salvation Army Bands: Music and Morality**

As musical performance was seen as an ideal pastime to improve morals which enriched the soul of the working class, then discussion of the role of the Salvation Army and their use of brass bands is appropriate. In order to understand the role of Salvation Army bands then it is important to consider the nature of Salvationism and the influence of the Salvation Army's founder, William Booth, and his wife Catherine Booth. Booth had been a Methodist preacher but turned to a more evangelical ministry that was founded upon a strong belief in the need for people to receive spiritual salvation through the enactment of the message of Christ's gospel. Furthermore, Booth believed that this message could be realised through a religious agency which sought to promote social reform and combat vice. The urgent need for his mission was abundantly clear to Booth from the condition of the urban poor.<sup>52</sup>

---

<sup>50</sup> Haweis, *Music and Morals*, pp. 18-21.

<sup>51</sup> *Yorkshire Musician* (1 January, 1887), p. 81.

<sup>52</sup> Trevor Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels: The Bands of the Salvation Army', in Herbert (Ed.) *The British Brass Band*, p. 189.

The Salvation Army was originally founded in 1865 at the East London Christian Mission and within ten years had established thirty-two mission stations.<sup>53</sup> It expanded rapidly between 1878 and 1883. From 1878 they opened new corps in the north of England, the majority in Tyneside, South Yorkshire and central Lancashire. In addition new corps were established in the coal-mining communities of South Wales.<sup>54</sup> By December 1883 the Army had 519 corps in England and Wales, thirty-seven in Scotland and seventeen in Ireland.<sup>55</sup>

Brass bands were introduced into the Army by Charles Fry, a builder from Salisbury. He led the local Wesleyan Methodist choir and was a cornet player with the 1<sup>st</sup> Wiltshire Rifle Volunteer Band.<sup>56</sup> There are contradictory sources over the first use of a band, but it seems the Fry band - consisting of Charles Fry on the cornet, and his three sons, Fred, Earnest and Bert, playing another cornet, a valve trombone and a euphonium - played at an open air meeting in Salisbury in March 1878.<sup>57</sup> The purpose of the band, it seems, was to deflect the attention of hooligans away from other Salvationists rather than musical reasons.<sup>58</sup> Booth appreciated the value and practicality of brass instruments whilst on tour in the north-east. He noted in his diary:

The last Sabbath we had a little novelty, which apparently worked well. Among the converts are two members of brass band-one plays a cornet, and to utilise him at once Brother Russell put him with his cornet in the front rank of the procession from South

---

53 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 189.

54 Glen K. Horridge, *The Salvation Army: Origins and Early Days, 1865-1900* (Godalming, 1993), p. 38. It is worth noting that musical instruments were used in the Army from the earliest days to accompany singing. See Ian Bradley, 'Blowing for the Lord: the Salvation Army', *History Today* Vol 27. No 3. (1 March, 1977), p. 191.

55 Glenn K. Horridge, *The Salvation Army*, p. 38.

56 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 190.

57 See Roy Newsome, *Brass Roots: A Hundred Years of Brass Bands and Their Music, 1836-1936* (Aldershot, 1998), p. 112 and Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 190.

58 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 190.

Stockton. He certainly improved the singing and brought crowds all along the line of march, wondering curiously what we should do next.<sup>59</sup>

In 1880, Booth issued his first 'Orders for Bands' in the *War Cry*, which placed further emphasis on brass instruments in 'the great utility in attracting crowds to our open air meetings and indoor meetings.' He earnestly asked 'for the formation of bands throughout the country.' It has been argued that the first band was established at the Consett corps in 1879.<sup>60</sup> It was noted, however, that another band was formed in Manchester in 1879. It has been suggested that this was not mentioned in the *War Cry*, perhaps for diplomatic reasons, as it was established by General Booth's second son, Ballington Booth.<sup>61</sup> By 1883 there were 400 bands in Britain. Among these were bands in South Shields, Carlisle, Stockton-on-Tees and Sheffield. Ebbw Vale and Merthyr were two of the first in Wales and Hamilton, in Scotland, and Belfast, in Ireland, soon followed.<sup>62</sup>

Bands were incorporated into the Salvation Army for a number of reasons that were synchronous with the growth of secular bands throughout the country. As Herbert has discussed, 'brass instruments are robust, durable, and easy to play, and are suited for indoor and outdoor use. By the 1870s, they were cheap, and a large stock of them was on the second-hand market.'<sup>63</sup> From 1878, a large number corps became established in the industrial north and Wales where secular bands were already established.<sup>64</sup> Herbert argues that many early

---

59 'William Booth's Journal', *Christian Mission Magazine* (October, 1877), pp. 264-265, cited in, Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 190.

60 Horridge, *The Salvation Army*, p. 46.

61 Horridge, *The Salvation Army*, pp. 46-48.

62 Brindley Boon, *Play the Music, Play! The Story of Salvation Army Bands* (St Albans, 1966), p. 15. (A 1916 audit showed there to be 24,477 senior bandmen and 4,270 junior bandmen. Source: *Salvation Army Yearbook*, 1918, p. 26. Cited in Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 191.

63 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 191.

64 Horridge, *The Salvation Army*, p. 38.

Salvationists had most likely been members of brass or volunteer bands, even though, in 1900, the Salvation Army was claiming bandsmen had acquired their musical skills since conversion.<sup>65</sup> It is reasonable to say that as corps were establishing themselves in areas where brass bands were popular they would draw on that established membership to form their own bands.

Booth had worked as a Methodist Minister in Brighouse, in the West Riding of Yorkshire, one of the established centres of the brass band movement, and it was likely he was aware of the growth of the brass band movement. On one hand Booth appreciated their functional qualities, but, on the other, he also saw the brass bands as a danger.<sup>66</sup> Booth was alert to what he perceived to be the seductive power of music and its ability to promote passions, the temptation to indulge in unproductive virtuosity and the ever-present danger that Salvation Army bands would assume an independent identity within the Army.<sup>67</sup> By the 1870s secular bands were moving towards standardised instrumentation because of the influence of contests. Salvation Army bands did not compete and had no need of standardised instrumentation until the twentieth century.<sup>68</sup> As Herbert has noted, 'in the later nineteenth-century, virtuosity and the type of homogeneity which preoccupied non-Salvation Army brass bands were of little concern to their Salvation Army counterparts.'<sup>69</sup>

Salvationists adapted various musical styles and tunes to their own purposes. Booth favoured the brass band because of its potency as a current

---

65 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', pp. 191-192.

66 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 193.

67 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p.193.

68 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p.199.

69 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p.199.

form of popular music. It was one of the ways he harnessed popular culture to his cause.<sup>70</sup> He was quick to appreciate the value of good, rousing songs at his meetings.<sup>71</sup> In 1876 he published *Revival Music*, a collection of well-loved hymns and choruses for use at the Christian Mission and three years later this was reissued as the first *Salvation Army Songbook*.<sup>72</sup> Nevertheless, Booth was dissatisfied with such tunes as they were too solemn for his ear. As early as 1867 he surprised a fellow Salvationist by singing 'Oh, How I love Jesus' to a minstrel tune.<sup>73</sup> The Army took dozens of music-hall songs and wrote new lyrics for them.<sup>74</sup> These tunes were well known and easy to sing. Pamela Walker has argued that the adaptation of these songs helped the Army criticise the behaviour found within the music halls.<sup>75</sup> Music-hall songs were often rewritten to commemorate a local event or special occasion, and, as a result, these adaptations made the Army's music memorable and associated it with what was current and popular. In addition the Army's perspective on these songs countered what was popular and admired by music-hall patrons.<sup>76</sup> In 1884 a correspondent wrote in the *Tonic Sol-Fa Reporter* that:

Music in the Eye of the Salvation Army, is primarily a bait to catch the common throng and bring them to the Army services [...] The advantages of using these popular melodies are obvious. First, they are ear-catching tunes – their popularity proves that. Then the people know them already; they have been whistling them in the streets, hearing them sung at the music-halls or churned out of barrel-organs. What the Army

---

70 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 193.

71 Bradley, 'Blowing for the Lord', p. 191.

72 Bradley, 'Blowing for the Lord', p. 191.

73 Bradley, 'Blowing for the Lord', p. 191.

74 Pamela J. Walker, *Pulling the Devil's Kingdom Down: The Salvation Army in Victorian Britain* (Berkeley, 2001), p. 192.

75 Walker, *Pulling the Devil's Kingdom Down*, p. 192.

76 Walker, *Pulling the Devil's Kingdom Down*, p. 192.

wants is that the common folk who crowd their barracks and halls shall listen and sing, and the battle is half won.<sup>77</sup>

From the late nineteenth century the Army's repertoire expanded with the influences of institutionalisation and Salvationist composers.<sup>78</sup> These early adaptations of popular music, however, engaged the Army with the popular culture of the day.

The main concerns of the of the Salvation Army brass players were to serve the functional purposes of Army events, and to protect themselves, and their instruments, against the violence to which almost all Salvationists were at times subjected.<sup>79</sup> The Salvation Army provoked physical opposition from 'Skeleton Armies' who tried to drive them out of towns.<sup>80</sup> These 'Skeleton Armies' were known in the north but were more strictly a phenomenon of the Southern and Home Counties.<sup>81</sup> It has been suggested that the extremes of intimidation visited upon the Salvation Army by the 'Skeleton Armies', whose members were principally young labourers, shop assistants or semi-skilled workers, was because the secular brass band tradition was at its weakest in these parts of the country.<sup>82</sup> The Salvationists saw the challenge of the 'Skeleton Armies' as being to save them. 'It was very hard', said Mrs Booth, 'when members of the Army were facing these dangerous classes. They had no other motive but to save them.'<sup>83</sup>

---

77 Anon, 'The Music of the Salvation Army', *Tonic Sol-Fa Reporter* (1 August, 1884), p. 324.

78 See Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', pp. 203-213.

79 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p.199.

80 Victor Bailey 'Salvation Army Riots, The "Skeleton Army" and Legal Authority in the Provincial Town', in, A.P. Donajgrodzki, *Social Control in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (London, 1977), p. 233.

81 Bailey 'Salvation Army Riots', p. 233. See also, p. 255.

82 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p.199.

83 *Daily Telegraph* (23 April, 1883), cited in, Bailey 'Salvation Army Riots', p. 233.



Yet, as Pamela Walker has argued, conversion narratives of the Salvation Army, that included the use of brass bands, 'demonstrated a complicated relationship to urbanised working-class culture, organised politics, both bourgeois and proletarian, and the wider community of evangelicals.'<sup>84</sup> The Army's analysis of the causes and consequences of working-class struggle would not have corresponded with the views of labour activists, publicans or even organised hooligans, but neither was it at odds with such working-class voices. The Salvation Army, including its bands, was, as Walker wrote, 'as authentic, complicated and mediated an expression of working-class belief and desire as any other movement of working-class people.'<sup>85</sup> In part a rational recreation, music gave the Salvation Army brass players a way to express their form of musicianship within the wider working-class world. The Salvation Army mirrored how the brass bands of the Southern Pennines engaged with music to create their own traditions and identity but for different and distinct purposes.

### **The Spread of Rational Recreation in Brass Bands**

The development of brass bands occurred when music was perceived as one of the best moral improvers. It was the band periodicals that became the vehicle through which the rational recreation ethos was spread. In the same year the *Yorkshire Musician* was supporting the ideas of Haweis, the first edition of the *British Bandsman* placed editorial emphasis on music as a rational recreation. They wrote, 'our aims are to stimulate, and [...] to create and foster in bandsmen

---

<sup>84</sup> Walker, *Pulling the Devil's Kingdom Down*, p. 67.

<sup>85</sup> Walker, *Pulling the Devil's Kingdom Down*, p. 67.

a desire for, and a love of, good and high-class music; to provide recreative and instructive literature for master and pupil.<sup>86</sup> In 1895 Algernon S. Rose reinforced the rational recreation ethos when he published *Talks With Bandsmen: A Popular Handbook for Brass Instrumentalists*. Rose wanted a book that would give the bandsman information that ‘neither his shilling “Music-Tutor” explains nor his “trainer” has time to discuss.’<sup>87</sup> The book developed from a series of eight lectures given to workers in a London factory. Reflecting the practical, theoretical and educational content of periodicals he wanted to provide information about the origin, history and development of brass instruments. To the bandsman he said, ‘take your nourishment in at your eyes, shut up your mouth, and chew the cud of understanding!’<sup>88</sup> Rose understood the improving ethos behind the performance of music, writing:

There is nowadays, scarcely a mill, a factory, or colliery throughout the Midlands, North of England, parts of Scotland, and, Wales, and, going further afield, throughout certain parts of New Zealand, Tasmania, Canada and the United States, which does not boast its contingent of instrumentalists. Of all amusements for a mechanic, after his daily toil, supposing him to have the least liking for music, there is nothing so suited as the study of a brass instrument. It is easily learnt, calls for little exertion, and, through the emulation it causes, begets habits of abstemiousness [...]. We have to thank music, no less than the Board School influence, for the suppression, in labouring centers, of many objectionable pastimes. The successful cultivation of art, in any form, by the masses, imperceptibly educates the general taste and makes politeness of manners keep pace with refinement of mind.<sup>89</sup>

---

86 *British Bandsman* (September, 1887), p. 1.

87 Rose, Algernon S. Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen A Popular Handbook for Brass Instrumentalists* (London, 1895), *Bandsmen* p. 1.

88 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, p. 1.

89 Rose, ‘Introduction’, *Talks With Bandsmen*, pp. xii-xiii.

## **The Funding of Brass Bands**

Before examining the relationship with brass bands, the industrialists and their communities, an understanding of the various kinds of funding available to brass bands is needed. The relationship between the 1859 Volunteer Movement and brass bands is examined in terms of finance as this had an important influence on the funding of bands in the region. Herbert as argued that 'the volunteer movement sustained many brass bands and may even saved some from extinction in the second half of the nineteenth century.'<sup>90</sup> Significant funding was also available from employers and communities through altruism and philanthropy and, more often the case, backing through loans and guarantees. These are examined through an analysis of Oats Royd Mill Band and Black Dyke Mill's Band and this is followed by an examination of public subscription bands. In addition, after the bands were established, their own subscriptions and fundraising activities helped sustain their presence within their communities. A clear understanding of these different kinds of funding is important because it related to the outcome of the rational recreation ethos upon brass bands. Finance to support music could be a philanthropic gesture by industrialists, and others, but how philanthropic was it.

## **The 1859 Volunteer Movement and Band Funding**

The 1859 volunteer force began in response to a circular letter sent in May 1859 from the Secretary of State for War to the Lord Lieutenants of all counties in

---

<sup>90</sup> Herbert, *Nineteenth-Century Bands: 'Making a Movement'*, p. 43.

response to a perceived military threat from France.<sup>91</sup> By the 1870s it was estimated that the volunteer movement involved eight-per cent of the male population.<sup>92</sup> The volunteers were joined with the formal military by the War Office, but their regular displays of ill-disciplined and amateurish behaviour were the cause of some concern. The force, however, attracted much popular admiration, mainly because it was viewed as a 'rational recreation'; it was never called into action but its activities were ubiquitous throughout the South Pennines.<sup>93</sup>

The main beneficiaries of the movement were many amateur brass bands, which had already been formed and volunteered *en bloc* motivated by practical and self-interested reasons.<sup>94</sup> Bands were seen as desirable, and, for many, an essential part of the volunteer movement. At annual reviews, and other special events, they afforded a sense of occasion together with a practical use at drills.<sup>95</sup> From the 1860s contest reports confirm the number of bands which carried the name of volunteer corps.<sup>96</sup> Many of the volunteer bands from the West Riding of Yorkshire, for example, began life as amateur brass bands. Thus Bramley Band combined their contesting and concert activities in the 1860s and 1870s by providing music at volunteer functions under the title of the Prince of Wales's Own Yorkshire Hussars Regimental Band.<sup>97</sup> Likewise, in the 1870s, Bowling Green

---

91 Trevor Herbert and Helen Barlow, 'The British Military as a Musical Institution' in Paul Rodmell (Ed.), *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Music and Institutions in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (Abingdon, 2012), p. 252.

92 Dave Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914: A Study of the Relationships Between Music and Society* (PhD Thesis, University of York, 1979), p. 251.

93 Herbert and Barlow, 'The British Military as a Musical Institution', p. 252.

94 Herbert and Barlow, 'The British Military as a Musical Institution', p. 252.

95 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 37.

96 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 36.

97 Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914*, p. 252.

Brass Band became the Third West Yorkshire Artillery Volunteers Band and Eccleshill Band became the Eccleshill Rifles.<sup>98</sup>

Apart from volunteer bands started from scratch, the performance standard of the volunteer band relied upon the instrumental skill of its fore-runner, but whatever the instrumental ability there was opportunity for improvement.<sup>99</sup> This was due to the funding available for these bands, for the purchase and repair of instruments, the purchase of music and uniforms and, in addition, rehearsal spaces were readily available in the form of drill halls. It also became possible to appoint an experienced conductor.<sup>100</sup> The government did not make provision for the funding of bands through the War Office. It was obvious, however, that moneys paid in the 'capitation grant', the official mechanism for government funding, were being appropriated to pay for bands, and the issue of volunteer banding soon became controversial.<sup>101</sup>

In 1862, a Royal Commission which had been established to 'enquire into the condition of the volunteer force in Britain' submitted its report and the cost of bands was one of its chief concerns.<sup>102</sup> In questioning Viscount Enfield, a former, subsequently, honorary, Colonel of a former (unnamed) volunteer battalion, the commissioners highlighted that 'the volunteer principle in organisation is this, that so long as they provide for their own expenditure they are entitled to exercise the

---

98 Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914*, p. 252.

99 Roy Newsome, *The Nineteenth Century Brass Band in Northern England, Musical and Social Factors in the Development of A Major Amateur Musical Medium* (PhD Thesis, Salford University, 1990), p. 124.

100 Newsome, *The Nineteenth Century Brass Band in Northern England*, p. 125.

101 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 37.

102 Herbert and Barlow, 'The British Military as a Musical Institution', p. 252.

most discretion as to [how the money is spent].<sup>103</sup> Enfield, however, while largely accepting that point, evidently spoke from bitter experience that the main drain upon his regimental fund had been the band - or rather, two bands, since despite his best efforts 'to induce them to be content with one band [... they] would say that unless they had the advantage of two bands to accompany them when they marched out the regiment would probably not attend.'<sup>104</sup> When Captain Alexander Ewens, adjutant of the City of London Rifle Brigade, was examined he made known to the commissioners that the band cost £600 a year, a fact 'which has lately come to the knowledge of the public through the newspapers.'<sup>105</sup> The evidence of other officers revealed that the more typical cost of a band ranged between around £100 and £300 a year, with the very modest bands costing about £60 a year. Significantly, the testimonies show that the costs were borne not only at the insistence of the officers but also the men.<sup>106</sup>

Financial scrutiny of bands' expenses continued in 1878, when Lord Bury chaired a Departmental Committee Report on the Volunteer Force of Great Britain.<sup>107</sup> All volunteer corps in the country were supplied with a questionnaire and asked to supply details of their expenditure from 1873 to 1877 under various headings. Of the 278 returned questionnaires only a handful admitted that they supported bands, though there was at this time no formal device to fund bands from volunteer finances.<sup>108</sup> As Herbert has written, 'it was in the interests of the

---

103 *House of Commons Parliamentary Papers*, 'Report of the Commissioners Appointed to Inquire into the Condition of the Volunteer Force in Great Britain', 1862 [3053] paragraphs 761-769, cited in, Herbert and Barlow, 'The British Military as a Musical Institution', p. 253.

104 *House of Commons Parliamentary Papers*, p. 253.

105 *House of Commons Parliamentary Papers*, 1364-1382.

106 Herbert and Barlow, 'The British Military as a Musical Institution', p. 253.

107 *House of Commons Parliamentary Papers, 1878-1879* 'Report of the Bury Departmental Committee' [c.2235] l xv.181, cited in, Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 40.

108 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 40.

respondents to understate their expenditure on bands, and it is certain that estimates under this heading were artificially low.<sup>109</sup> As with the 1862 Royal Commission the Bury Report revealed that the support of the band was a major financial burden. Lieutenant Colonel J. A. Thompson of the 1<sup>st</sup> Fife Light Horse VC was challenged that 'Your band cost you 10s. a man: that is a heavy item to come out of the capitation grant: it was £62 last year for 119 men-that takes up the whole equipment fund [...] it runs away with your capitation money.' To this, Thompson replied: 'Yes it does.'<sup>110</sup> Captain and Adjutant Ball of the 1<sup>st</sup> Middlesex Engineer Volunteer Corps admitted to average annual expenses of £280 on the band. When asked for details of these expenses, Ball replied:

[...] we pay a bandmaster. That expenditure will be lower in the future. We have a new system. We give the bandmaster £12 a year and he provides instruments, clothing and everything for the band. We enrol any men he likes and we give him the capitation grant for those men. If he has 30 men he can draw the capitation allowance.<sup>111</sup>

Major Sloan of the 4<sup>th</sup> Lancashire RVC declared an expenditure of £105, and further pleaded that the band 'should be exempt from firing as the buglers are. Their attendance as bandsmen qualifies them for efficiency as far as drill is concerned.' He recommended no substitute duties: 'We have as good a band as we can get [...] but they look upon firing as a heavy task [...] to keep up a good band is one of our difficulties and a good band is necessary in order to get recruits.'<sup>112</sup>

It was clear that many saw a good band being of value to the corps.

Nevertheless, issues of funding and discipline remained a matter of contention.

---

109 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 40.

110 *House of Commons Parliamentary Papers, 1878-1879*, 1216 ff, cited in, Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 40.

111 *House of Commons Parliamentary Papers, 1878-1879*, 1216 ff, cited in, Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 40.

112 *House of Commons Parliamentary Papers, 1878-1879*, 2550, cited in, Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 40.

Ralph H. Knox, deputy accountant general at the War Office, who was also lieutenant in the 2nd Middlesex RVC, cited bands, together with extra pay to permanent staff, and county associations, as one of the principal causes for excess expenditure on volunteer corps.<sup>113</sup> J.R.A. MacDonnal, the editor of the *Volunteer Services Gazette*, argued that the cost of bands should be borne solely by commanding officers.<sup>114</sup> Lord Bury concluded: 'No allowance for bands is made in the disembodied period for any branch of the auxiliary forces, any expense under this head being defrayed by private subscription. The Committee can not advocate any allowance under this head.'<sup>115</sup> In 1887 the Harris Departmental Committee was sympathetic to the problems of recruiting officers because of the costs incurred by 'balls, bands refreshments and so on', and noting the recent changes in the funding of regular army bands, recommended that 7.5 per cent of the capitation grant be made for the funding of bands.<sup>116</sup>

Russell suggests that some bandsmen would have enjoyed the extra recreational activities offered by the volunteers, such as the opportunity to go on annual camps and, most notably, rifle-shooting.<sup>117</sup> Newsome noted that the number of concerts and engagements increased as a result of being in a volunteer band.<sup>118</sup> This extra exposure and display most likely meant that bands benefited from the respectable and patriotic associations of volunteering.<sup>119</sup>

---

113 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 42.

114 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 42.

115 *House of Commons Parliamentary Papers, 1878-1879*, 'Bury Report', p. xviii, cited in Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 42.

116 *House of Commons Parliamentary Papers, 1887*, 'Report of the Volunteer Capitation Committee' [c.4951] xvi. 271, cited in, Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 42.

117 Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914*, p. 252.

118 Newsome, *The Nineteenth Century Brass Band in Northern England*, p. 124.

119 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 42.



The movement had its most potent influence on the material needs of banding. Many bands that were not formed by the volunteers were saved or revitalised by it. The Bacup Band, after breakdown and amalgamation, were reconstituted in 1859 as the 4<sup>th</sup> Lancashire Rifle Volunteers. The Oldham Band, formed in 1865, became the Oldham Rifles in 1871.<sup>120</sup> It is in this revitalising light that volunteer bands should be viewed. Michael J. Lomas has suggested that volunteer bandsmen were using the bands to create amusement for themselves over any respectable and patriotic associations of playing in a volunteer band.<sup>121</sup> It was noted that volunteer bandsmen had problems adhering to standards of discipline expected in the military. In 1868 'A Commissioned Officer of Volunteers' wrote to the *Volunteer Service Gazette*, claiming the behaviour of volunteer bandsmen brought the force into disrepute. He complained that bandsmen were 'notorious for straggling away from their corps and, feeling themselves under no sort of constraint and acknowledging no authority whatever'.<sup>122</sup> The same correspondent claimed he had seen bandsmen on a train who were too drunk to stand; challenging other passengers to a fight; trying to avoid paying the fare and swearing in the company of women.<sup>123</sup>

In this light it can be argued that volunteer bands had used the movement for their own practical and convenient advantage, a secure way of obtaining funds and stabilising the band, disregarding, mocking and even usurping

---

120 Arthur Taylor, *Brass Bands* (St Albans and London, 1979), p. 50, cited in Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 42.

121 Michael J. Lomas, *Amateur Brass and Wind Bands in Southern England Between the Late Eighteenth Century and circa 1900* (PhD Thesis, The Open University, 1990), p. 73.

122 *Volunteer Service Gazette* (25 July, 1868), cited in, Lomas, *Amateur Brass and Wind Bands in Southern England*, p. 572.

123 *Volunteer Service Gazette* (25 July, 1868).

authority because of their own self-interest.<sup>124</sup> The rational recreation ethos in the 1859 Volunteer Movement created an arena where bands could prosper and working-class bandsmen exploited this situation to advance their own music-making.

### **Fundraising, Subscriptions and Contest Prizes**

Although the cost of instruments, music, uniforms, trainers and conductors, may have been met by the main sources of funding from the 1859 Volunteer Movement, the industrialists or public subscriptions, it is worth noting that this support may not have supported many bands' day-to-day expenditures. In addition the main funding was often in the form of an unsecured loan or guarantee and fully-funded support could not be assured. Indeed, as Herbert has argued, 'a number of bands were the recipients of direct patronage by industrial entrepreneurs, but it is doubtful that this type of practice was extensive.'<sup>125</sup> In 1886, for example, the Cleckheaton Christian Brethren Brass Band Committee voted 'that we accept Mr Spencer's offer to lend the money for the purchase of the instruments required, and that we guarantee to him the instruments as security until the money can be refunded.'<sup>126</sup> In 1888 the band had still not repaid the money and had written to Mr Spencer to 'give best thanks to Mr Spencer for his offer to allow the 6 months for the repayment of his loan.'<sup>127</sup> Thus bands came with a wide range of expenses that needed to be serviced to sustain

---

124 Herbert, 'God's Perfect Minstrels', p. 194.

125 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 46.

126 *Minute Book of The Christian Brethren Brass Band, Cleckheaton* (West Yorkshire Archive Service, Calderdale), Catalogue Ref, K131 (24 February, 1886)

127 *Minute Book of The Christian Brethren Brass Band*, (23 January, 1888)

the band. Helmshore Brass Band's 1907 Ledger Book, for example, is indicative of expenses incurred by bands.<sup>128</sup> From the 28 February to the 30 March 1907 their total expenditure was £11. 30s. ½ d.<sup>129</sup> These expenses included 6s. ½ d spent on bandroom window cleaning. Candles for lighting cost 5s; postage stamps cost 2s. 6d. and 1s. 8d. was spent on instrument polish. A subscription to the *Cornet*, together with memos and receipts (stationary), cost £1.5s. & 7d.<sup>130</sup>

Towards the end of the nineteenth century and into the twentieth, bands had to rely upon a number of entrepreneurial schemes and subscriptions for funding.<sup>131</sup> These included chocolate clubs, bazaars and fairs,<sup>132</sup> knife and fork teas and meat suppers.<sup>133</sup> In 1895, for example, Helmshore Brass Band's Committee voted on the 23 February that they should hold a tea-party and entertainment together with a meat tea, consisting of beef and ham, to raise funds.<sup>134</sup> In addition to public subscriptions, subscriptions came from bandsmen. As early as 1842, W.L Mariner's Band was imposing monthly subscriptions on its members.<sup>135</sup> Concerts were an important method of fundraising and could support and add to bandsmen's subscriptions. From January to July 1907 Helmshore Band raised a total of £18.16s. and only £1. 5s. from subscriptions.<sup>136</sup> Bands also had to raise funds for competition entry fees. On the 7 March, 1907, Helmshore Band's Committee voted 'that band play round the village on March

---

128 See also, for example, the *Minute Book of The Christian Brethren Brass Band, Cleckheaton and Todmorden Old Brass Band Ledger Books, 1900-1910*, owned by Todmorden Community Brass Band, Todmorden, West Yorkshire.

129 *Helmshore Brass Band Ledger Books*, 2830 February to 30 March, 1907 (n.p.), Accrington Local Studies Library.

130 *Helmshore Brass Band Ledger Books*.

131 Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 46.

132 See chapter five for a fuller discussion of these activities.

133 See the, for example, *Minute Book of The Christian Brethren Brass Band, Cleckheaton*, 28 January 1889 and 29 December 1890.

134 *Helmshore Brass Band Minute Book*, 16 January, 1895, (n.p.) Accrington Local Studies Library.

135 *W. L. Mariner's Camiando Band Minute Book* (n.p.) University of Leeds Brotherton Library, cited in , Herbert, 'Making a Movement', p. 46.

136 *Helmshore Brass Band Ledger Books*, 1 January-July 13.

23<sup>rd</sup>, and collect en-route proceeds towards contest expenses.<sup>137</sup> For the 'crack' bands contests could provide a lucrative income. Besses o' th' Barn and Black Dyke measured their winning in hundreds of pounds and more. In their first thirty years of contesting Besses won prizes to the value of £3,359.17s.<sup>138</sup> Prize money varied from contest to contest, dependent on size and status. Contests at Clitheroe, Middleton and Rochdale were worth between £5 and £7; larger ones were worth more.<sup>139</sup> In the 1870s Belle Vue paid about £35 plus benefits to the winners. When Kingston Mills Band won the 1887 Belle Vue Contest they received a cash prize of £30, a euphonium valued at £30 and the individual band members won gold medals to the value of £78.15s.<sup>140</sup> Thus, even though funds were available for larger items, such as instruments and uniforms, bands had to be self-reliant when it came to raising money to repay unsecured loans and guarantees together with assorted day-to-day expenses.

### **The Brass Band and the Industrialist**

The periodicals and brass band tutor books were the means through which the rational recreation ethos spread through the band movement. The ethos was present when bands approached industrialists for finance. Bandsmen used claims that they were enjoying rational recreation to give them the moral authority to justify support for their bands.

---

137 *Helmshore Brass Band Minute Book*, 13 March, 1907.

138 J. N. Hampson, *Besses o' th' Barn Band: Its Origin History and Achievements* (Northampton, c.1893), p. 70, cited in Herbert, 'Making a Movement' p. 47.

139 Herbert, 'Making a Movement' p. 47.

140 J. N. Hampson, *Besses o' th' Barn Band*, p. 117.

The number of bands that were associated with mills and factories is difficult to quantify. The paucity of records about businesses, and especially their relationship with bands, means it is difficult to give an exact figure for the number of bands in the Southern Pennines that relied on a mill or factory for support. Nevertheless, it is possible to see how important the bands were to the industrialist through the activities of the famous bands. From 1856 to 1906 there were 49 British 'Open' Championship Brass Band Contests.<sup>141</sup> The top three bands gave 150 performances. Of these top three bands, 123 performances (88%) were bands from the north. Of these northern bands, 128 performances, (85%), were from bands based in the Southern Pennines. Of the top three, 54 performances, (33%), were mill or factory bands from the region.<sup>142</sup> From the performances that gained first prize, 24 (16%) had support from a mill or factory.<sup>143</sup> This does not take account of the less well-known bands that only competed at a local level.

Despite this difficulty in quantifying the extent of sponsorship from industrialists, one thing is sure, it was encouraged. Rose included a chapter in *Talks With Bandsmen* outlining all the things needed to set up and operate a successful brass band.<sup>144</sup> The rational recreation ethos was implied at the beginning of Rose's chapter on how to do this:

Realising the advantage of musical recreation, it may happen that the reader, together with a few kindred spirits, desires to take part in a brass band. If he does not feel ready to

---

141 1859 – no contest.

142 Violet and Geoffrey Brand, *Brass Bands in the 20th Century* (Letchworth, 1979), pp.224-227.

143 1876 and 1877, saw three mill bands gain the top three places: Meltham Mills, Kingston Mills and Holm Mills, and in 1877: Meltham Mills, Black Dyke and Holm Mills. Of the first prizewinners, Black Dyke won twelve times: 1862, 1863, 1871, 1879, 1880, 1881, 1891, 1894, 1895, 1899, 1902 and 1904. Kingston Mills won six times: 1875, 1885, 1886, 1887, 1893 and 1901. Leeds Railway Foundry won twice: 1854 and 1856 (Brand, *Brass Bands*, pp. 224-227).

144 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, pp. 300 – 355.

become an amateur musician, he at least recognises the desirability of, and many advantages, which will accrue from forming a good band in his town.<sup>145</sup>

Rose recommended that if a number of novice bandsmen work in the same factory they should directly approach the factory owners for support. He supplied a form letter that reinforced to the employer the self-improving use of spare time; therefore working people were encouraged, and given the tools to approach prospects for money to support their bands. Rose wrote:

TO THE PROPRIETORS OF THE UNIVERSAL SOAP WORKS, TRIANCOMALEE

DEAR SIRS, - We, the undersigned, being desirous of employing our leisure time in practising music, request your permission to form a brass band in connection with this factory. We shall feel honoured if Mr. So – and – So (naming one of the partners likely to support the project) will consent to become President of the Band. Unfortunately, we are unable at the beginning to defray the entire cost of the purchase of the instruments. Messers, Red, White, and Blue, musical instrument manufacturers, of London, are, however, prepared to sell us the brass instruments required, provided that the firm, whose name we should take, will act as surety for the deferred payments.

We are, Dear Sirs,

Yours Respectfully,

(Here should follow the signatures of everyone in the mill, or the factory, in favour of the scheme, whether desirous of becoming performers, or merely honorary members.)<sup>146</sup>

Rose recommended that, when they were sufficiently able, they should make the band available to play at any charitable function that the president of the firm supported. In return the band should expect a practice room that had a free supply of heat and light. In addition they should expect some help with subscriptions. Rose recommended that the band should not approach the firm for

---

145 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, p. 301.

146 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, p. 304.

finance until they had proved themselves. In the brass band world this meant, however small, some kind of contest success.<sup>147</sup>

### **John Murgatroyd and Oats Royd Mill Brass Band**

To see how a band worked with their employer, Oats Royd Mill Band, at Luddenden, near Halifax, is an ideal case study because it was not a 'crack' band and largely only competed and played locally. This will show how the relationship between the band and the industrialist worked when bands were just beginning and we can also observe the growth of the band over time. Owned by John Murgatroyd (1810-1880), Oats Royd Mill reached completion in 1847.<sup>148</sup> It was the only mill in Luddenden to have its power supplied by steam, rather than water, and specialised in the production of worsted cloth for uniforms. The late 1800s saw several expansions to the site until it became one of the largest worsted mills in the country. At its height the mill employed two thousand people and only closed in 1982.<sup>149</sup>

John Murgatroyd began the band in 1864 with only eight players. By 1865 the band had increased to twelve members.<sup>150</sup> Murgatroyd supplied the band with the instruments they needed and he required the bandsmen sign a form agreeing to keep the instruments in good repair, suggesting the instruments formed part of an unsecured loan:

---

147 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, p.304.

148 *Halifax and Huddersfield Mercantile Directory, 1863- 64*, (London, 1863), p. 386.

149 *Halifax Evening Courier* (10 December, 2004).

150 Robert Turner, Joseph Sutcliffe, Robert Austin, Thomas Murgatroyd, William Murgatroyd, John Helliwell, John Feather, Will Wilkinson, William Sutcliffe, James Sutcliffe, William Waterworth and James Moses. (Source: West Yorkshire Archive Service, Calderdale, *Documents Relating to Oats Royds Mill Brass Band*, Catalogue Ref, JM857).

Musicians' agreement, 1 November 1865, between the members of Oats Royd Mill Brass Band and John Murgatroyd of Oats Mill

1. We the undersigned hereby agree to keep in good order [...] the musical instruments each of us holds in the Oats Royds Mill Band. Such instruments being the property of John Murgatroyd [...] entrusted to us as members of the said band.
2. We, and each of us, will in the event of ceasing to be members of said band, deliver up immediately, in such good order, and repair to the said John Murgatroyd, or the person or persons, he may appoint to receive them.
3. The instruments that each of us holds is the property of John Murgatroyd, we, and each of us, agree to repair any damage [to the instrument].
4. That we are responsible for the said instruments, and agree to pay to the said John Murgatroyd – his heirs or assigns – the full value of any instrument not returned in good order.<sup>151</sup>

To be a member of the band, and receive funding, brought with it the implication that the member should be a responsible person. Moreover, together with the tools supplied by Rose, working people were able to express that they were using instruments as a way to facilitate the sensible, sane and moderate working-class use of leisure. From 1868 to 1870 Murgatroyd literally stamped his name on the band, ensuring that the bandsmen knew that he was the person that gave them the opportunity to perform music. In this way the space between work and leisure was drawn closer. Bands were one expression of the public aspect of factory life, a way in which work enabled leisure in the communities of the Southern Pennines. As Patrick Joyce has argued it was 'a church here, a school or canteen there, and always the stream of social life that characterised

---

151 JM857



all factories. These gestures shaped people's sense of neighbourhood after mid-century'.<sup>152</sup>

From 1869 to 1870 Murgatroyd had the instruments engraved with 'John Murgatroyd Oats Royd Mills' at Stott Brothers, of Halifax.<sup>153</sup> When Murgatroyd purchased the band uniforms, his ownership of the band was complete. The uniform represented a significant financial outlay. G.R. Davies, of Halifax, supplied the estimate for the uniforms:

1. Band suit re pattern of Buttershaw Band, tunic and trousers – double striped: £2 pounds, 17 shillings each
2. Shoulder belts, with music pouch and waist belt: 16 shillings each
3. Shako, with horse hair plumage, and gait mountings: 14 shillings each

Total: £4 seven shillings

If Required:

1. Band Master's Shako – as per Buttershaw Band: 17 shillings and 6 pence
2. Band Master's Suit –  $\frac{3}{4}$  gold lace: 12 shillings and 6 pence
3. Thick Russian gold lace: 5 shillings and 6 pence<sup>154</sup>

From 1864 to 1874 the band grew from eight to thirty-three players, who also had the instruments to match the quality of the uniforms. A year after Murgatroyd's death, in 1881, they held a stock of Besson's first class instruments worth £1,191.<sup>155</sup> Embossed on the brass buttons for the tunics were the initials 'JM'.<sup>156</sup>

It is significant that they modelled themselves on another local band, Buttershaw Mills, of Bradford. Like Oats Royd Mill they competed locally and

---

<sup>152</sup> Patrick Joyce, *Work Society and Politics: the culture of the factory in later Victorian England* (London, 1980), p. 145.

<sup>153</sup> Engraving receipt 253a, 31 December 1869, receipt, 254a, 31 December 1870, JM857.

<sup>154</sup> Estimate for band clothing, JM857.

<sup>155</sup> Instrument, and band membership lists 1864 -1884, JM857.

<sup>156</sup> Brass tunic buttons, JM857.

were successful in local contests. From 1867-1878 Buttershaw won 10 regional contests, came second 8 times and third 7 times. They came within the top 6, 27 times.<sup>157</sup> When Buttershaw were successful, and established locally, Murgatroyd was just setting up his band. Hence, we see with the imitation of Buttershaw Band's uniforms, that not only did Oats Royd Mill want to copy a successful band musically but also in appearance. A mill owner was emulating another mill owner's band with the ambition to be successful. It is unknown what motivation Murgatroyd had to sponsor the band, however, many factories did have a band and this copying of a rival shows that other factory bands were noticed and appraised, as not only musical competition but also as a factory asset.

By 1869 the band was playing in the local community, for example at the Halifax Horticultural and Dog Show in August.<sup>158</sup> In 1887 they were competing in local and regional contests. In May, they won the Halifax Brass Band Contest in which six bands competed and Edwin Swift was judging.<sup>159</sup> Two months later they were at the Rochdale Seventh Annual Brass Band Contest, where they won fourth prize.<sup>160</sup> The next week they competed at the Sowerby Brass Band Contest where they won first prize, out of ten bands.<sup>161</sup> The end of September found them in Liverpool, at the Liverpool Exhibition Brass Band Contest (no result recorded).<sup>162</sup> They had a successful year, winning two out of the four contests they entered. In May 1888 they started strongly, coming second at the

---

<sup>157</sup> *Brass Band Results* <<http://brassbandresults.co.uk/bands/buttershaw-mills-bradford>> accessed, 1 January, 2012.

<sup>158</sup> *Leeds Mercury* (2 August, 1869).

<sup>159</sup> *Leeds Mercury* (23 May, 1887).

<sup>160</sup> *Leeds Mercury* (4 July, 1887).

<sup>161</sup> *Leeds Mercury* (9 July, 1887).

<sup>162</sup> *Liverpool Mercury* (26 September, 1887).

Copley Brass Band Contest.<sup>163</sup> However, no further results appear until August, when they came third at the Ripponden Brass Band Contest.<sup>164</sup> The band was active for twenty-six years. By 1890, ten years after Murgatroyd's death, they had disbanded and when the mill closed no band had replaced them.<sup>165</sup> Overall they were a local band that rarely travelled outside the Southern Pennines, their one excursion outside the area was to the Glasgow International Contest, on the 27 September 1888, but they did not win a prize.<sup>166</sup>

The *Yorkshire Musician* showed how a successful band could obtain even further support when the band won contest. The Leeds Forge Band was formed by the work's director, Samson Fox, in 1882. They were one of the country's 'crack' bands, nevertheless, they only lasted a short time, dissolving in 1892, when the new management withdrew support. In the 1890s they re-emerged as Armley and Wortley Band, funded by public subscription, but could not recapture their former heights. Under the support of Fox, and other colleagues, the band did well. An author in the *Yorkshire Musician* wrote:

The Leeds Forge Band

Samson Fox, the Managing Director of the Leeds Forge Company, presented the band with a complete set of electroplated instruments at the commencement of the year. This valuable gift was followed by another from two other directors: Colonel John Scott, and Mr. Robert Scott, of Greenock, who ordered a very handsome uniform for the band -this is purely an amateur band made up of employees of the Leeds Forge Company [...].

Since the band commenced contesting in 1886, it has won seventeen first prizes, fifteen second prizes, fourteen third prizes, nine fourth prizes and seven fifth prizes - total prize money £678 pounds, 11 shillings.<sup>167</sup>

---

163 *Leeds Mercury* (21 May, 1888).

164 *Manchester Times* (1 September, 1888).

165 Settled accounts in the winding up of Oats Royd Mill Brass Band, November 11, 1890, JM857.

166 < <http://brassbandresults.co.uk/bands/oats-royd-mills/>> accessed, 11 December, 2012.

167 *The Yorkshire Musician* (September, 1889), p.18.

Employers such as Murgatroyd and Fox supplied workers with the means to pursue music as a rational recreation, enabling both employer and employee to gain benefits through prestige and publicity on the one hand and access to instruments, uniforms and financial support on the other.

### **The Foster Brothers and Black Dyke Mills Brass Band**

An examination of one of the most successful bands in this era will further demonstrate how this philanthropy closed the space between work and leisure. John Foster was one of the directors of John Foster and Sons Ltd, Black Dyke Mills, Queensbury, producer of alpaca, mohair and worsted woollens. He was a French horn player in a brass and reed band, which was formed in 1816 by Peter Wharton, the publican of the Old Dolphin Hotel at Queensbury. Foster was a musician and he loved playing the French horn.<sup>168</sup> John Foster was not only a musician: he and his brothers were philanthropists. The mill supported many local causes. They gave £100 to help extend Bradford's Deaf and Dumb Institute.<sup>169</sup> They gave £250 to help build an extension to Bradford Infirmary.<sup>170</sup> In addition they donated £100 to help reduce the outstanding debt at Bradford Children's Hospice.<sup>171</sup> It was not out of character for them to consider giving financial assistance to a local band.

In 1833 a new band called the Queenshead Band formed in Queensbury, and the Foster Brothers gave it some financial assistance. In 1855 the band was

---

168 John H. Clay, *Black Dyke, An Inside Story* (Stockport, 2005), p. 2.

169 West Yorkshire Archive Service, Bradford, *John Foster and Sons, Directors' Minute Book, 1891-1920*, Catalogue Reference, 61D9521/1 (August 28, 1895), p. 61.

170 *John Foster and Sons, Directors' Minute Book, 1891-1920* (November 26, 1895), p. 65.

171 *John Foster and Sons, Directors' Minute Book, 1891-1920* (November 26, 1895), p. 65.

close to falling apart and at this point the Foster Brothers stepped in and joined the band to the mill. Reflecting the experiences of other bands, they gave the band a practice room, in Wellington Mill, a new set of instruments and a set of uniforms. The tone of Jonas Foster's letter to his brother suggested that the appearance of the band was important to them:

We have got the dress for the band which is universally admired. Green coat, trousers and cap, silver buttons with crest on them, coat with white braid round the collar, and small white braid down the front and down the trousers. German silver epaulettes, and silver lace around the caps and white sword belt, leader with gold round his cap, and three cornet piece players, gold stripes on the arm.<sup>172</sup>

The fame of Black Dyke Mills Brass Band spread quickly. In 1860 they won first prize at the first Crystal Palace Contest, winning a silver cup for the Bandmaster, a champion contra bass in Eb, worth 35 guineas, and £30 in cash.<sup>173</sup> The 1860 band was 18 members strong, all employees of the mill.<sup>174</sup> The band's success grew rapidly; the British 'Open' Championship results from 1856 to 1906 are an evidence of their ability. They were rarely out of the top three and they came first twelve times.<sup>175</sup>

In 1906 the band undertook a five-month tour of Canada and America. The company paid for all passage fares, rail travel and board and lodging.<sup>176</sup> While they were away the company also agreed to pay the band members wages of two pounds a week, with the band members receiving fifteen shillings a

---

172 Letter cited in, Clay, p .3 (August 30, 1856), no source given.

173 *The Times* (11 July, 1860)

174 John H. Clay, *Black Dyke*, p .5.

175 Violet and Geoffrey Brand, *Brass Bands*, pp. 224- 227.

176 Queensbury Historical Society, *Legal Agreement, re the Canadian and American tour of 1906* (1 June, 1906), cited in, Clay, *Black Dyke*, p. 19.

week, with the balance paid to the bandsmens' wives or nominated persons.<sup>177</sup> It was agreed that if the tour made a profit the band members stood to receive a share as a bonus but if the tour made a loss then the band would have to reimburse all travel, and accommodation expenses.<sup>178</sup> The tour did indeed make a loss of £2000. However, the company agreed to defer two thirds of this as long as the band paid the remaining amount back from engagement fees.<sup>179</sup> Four months later the band had still not cleared the debt and the company decided to write off £500 of the outstanding £850.<sup>180</sup>

This financing suggests that band funding was not a totally altruistic or philanthropic gesture as it was funded by an unsecured loan from the company. Yet, in the industrial heartlands, industrialists often wanted to be seen to be supplying support for a worthy cause. The large employer's influence was generated in the factory, its locale and magnified in the arena of the town.<sup>181</sup> Most employers conceived their economic duty solely in terms of supplying employment to alleviate a core of endemic poverty found in the towns and cities. Nevertheless, after mid-century, the large employers' view of themselves as the creators and custodians of urban civilisation became sufficiently grandiose to permit a considerable involvement in the control of urban poverty.<sup>182</sup> It was reflected in the foundation of orphanages, almshouses, homes for the aged and Ragged and Industrial Schools that sprang up in this period.<sup>183</sup> Employer

---

177 Queensbury Historical Society, p. 20

178 Queensbury Historical Society, p.20.

179 *John Foster and Sons, Directors' Minute Book, 1891-1920* (December 12, 1906), p. 188.

180 *John Foster and Sons, Directors' Minute Book, 1891-1920* (March 24, 1909), p. 212.

181 Joyce, *Work Society and Politics*, p. 168.

182 Joyce, *Work Society and Politics*, p. 168.

183 Joyce, *Work Society and Politics*, p. 168.

provision can be interpreted in terms of the gift relationship. As Patrick Joyce has argued:

In the sense of deference as a mode of social interaction, the gift was one of the most valuable means of managing the tensions of identification and differentiation that characterized deference. The gift celebrated and reaffirmed the bond of master and man.<sup>184</sup>

The rhetoric of the reporting of the tour suggested that the band was fully funded by philanthropy. Despite the speculative nature of the tour, and its eventual financial loss, the tour created a lot of excitement in Queensbury and Bradford. It is within this excited rhetoric that we should view the unsecured loan - which was largely written off. The Fosters had paid for the band to be seen as theirs. All reporting gave the impression that the Fosters had fully-funded the band's tour. The Fosters did not have to supply the loan or write off the balance. The band did receive a tour and other benefits but the Fosters also received exposure. 'To Messrs John Foster and Sons Ltd, belongs the distinction of sending such a combination on a novel and successful venture,'<sup>185</sup> opined the *Halifax Daily Guardian*, when the band returned. In spite of the fact that the band had clearly undertaken the tour to make money and promote itself, the overriding inescapable theme was that the band was part of the mill; they were John Foster and Son's band, made up of working-class mechanics, which was to be a common refrain throughout their tour. As such, the Fosters inferred the gift relationship between master and employer. In spite of the nature of their funding

---

184 Joyce, *Work Society and Politics*, pp.169-170.

185 *Halifax Daily Guardian* (24 November, 1906).

the band was one part of the Fosters' contribution to the improvement of the community.

There was a large turnout to see the band set off. The town hall bells were chiming and the band, to some people's disappointment, wore mufti rather than the new uniforms that the company had bought them for the tour. The band had lunch bought at the Great Northern Victoria Hotel and Fredrick Foster warned them about the dangers of America saying:

Be careful of what you eat, and also of what you drink, American cocktails are very nice and seductive, but they are not quite as innocent as you think they are. Americans are almost offended if you refuse to drink with them, but I think I can rely on you to use your own judgement.<sup>186</sup>

Foster emphasised that the company had spared no expense in equipping the band for this tour. He said, 'their instruments could not be better, and they had the best selection of music.'<sup>187</sup> Even before they had left Bradford it was being driven home that this band was the public face of John Foster and Sons. It was expected that their behaviour should reflect this, as they were on a tour promoting the mill's business interests. The *Bradford Daily Telegraph* reported that:

The firm felt certain they were doing the right thing in sending the band out, and they hoped the conduct of the men would be the same as it had always been, and they would remember they were the Black Dyke Band, and connected with the firm of John Foster and Sons[...]. I hope you will not forget that this firm is well known, not only in Canada and the States, but throughout the world.<sup>188</sup>

---

<sup>186</sup> *Bradford Daily Telegraph* (29 June, 1906).

<sup>187</sup> *Bradford Daily Telegraph* (29 June, 1906).

<sup>188</sup> *Bradford Daily Telegraph* (29 June, 1906).



The firm saw themselves as having a global reputation: the band was the public expression of this reputation. The Fosters made it clear that without their support the band would not have been successful.

The American and Canadian press viewed the bandsmen as 'mechanics abroad'. Wherever the band went in America and Canada the press were there and the Fosters collected the newspaper reports of the tour in a scrapbook.<sup>189</sup>

The commonality in all the reports was that they promoted the mill and its products, and, significantly, they stressed that the band membership was working class. The *Metronome* wrote:

A British Amateur band is to visit America. Americans will soon have the opportunity to hear a band, which is peculiarly British. The band owes its existence, and its approaching tour, to the generosity of John Foster and Sons, who are great manufacturers of dress fabrics in Yorkshire, and in whose mills the band are employed. Although the band is an amateur band, let it not be thought that they need any indulgence from even the most refined and cultivated musicians. On the contrary, we predict they will astonish all who hear them.<sup>190</sup>

The *Peterborough Daily Evening Review* said, 'this distinguished organization [...] owes its formation to John Foster and Sons, manufacturers of alpaca, mohair and other wools.'<sup>191</sup> The *Montreal Daily Star* stressed the working-class membership of the band and their interest in schemes that would help the working class:

Black Dyke Band Concert in aid of Poor Children

The famous Black Dyke Band will give a special concert in the arena on Saturday afternoon. For the purpose of helping, enlarge the fresh air fund. The interest taken by the members of this band in the fresh air movement will not be wondered at, when it is

---

*Newspaper Cuttings With Regard to John Foster and Sons, and Local Events in Bradford and Queensbury, West Yorkshire Archive Service, Bradford, Catalogue Reference, 6195/9/1/1.*

<sup>190</sup> *Metronome* (July, 1906) *Newspaper Cuttings*, p. 37.

<sup>191</sup> *Peterborough Daily Evening Review* (n.d., 1906), *Newspaper Cuttings*, p. 39.

considered, that the object of the society is to give generously to the children of the working classes the benefit of a summer outing, and that the members composing the Black Dyke Band are every one of the skilled mechanics.<sup>192</sup>

The band returned to Bradford in November 1906. The return was a quieter affair than the departure; the Fosters were away on business, and the crowd that greeted them at the station consisted of wives, sweethearts, relatives and friends.<sup>193</sup> Even though the tour was well promoted what was significant was that the social network of the band that greeted them consisted of close relations. These networks highlighted the working-class nature of the band movement and the people that supported them. Industrialists such as Murgatroyd, Fox and the Fosters could supply all the equipment and facilities they wished but the bands also relied upon stable social networks for support.<sup>194</sup> Industrialists supported the bands rehearsal space, music, uniforms, instruments and tuition, paid time off work, finance for travel and board and lodgings when the band was away. In return industrialists received advertising for their company and its products. If, like Black Dyke, they were successful, this exposure could be almost constant. The expense of running a band could result in financial loss. Nevertheless, for the industrialist the promotion and support of a band was to be accepted, if not expected, of a philanthropic employer who supported other benevolent projects in the community. For the industrialist these philanthropic practices could exert a force for influence in the region. This meant that there was little demarcation between the towns - mixtures of deliberate and *ad hoc* development - and the

---

<sup>192</sup> *Montreal Daily Star* (13 July, 1906), *Newspaper Cuttings*, p. 40.

<sup>193</sup> *Halifax Daily Guardian* (24 November, 1906).

<sup>194</sup> The importance of these networks becomes apparent in the following chapters.

urban factory.<sup>195</sup> Therefore, through the agency of the brass band, the space between leisure and work was brought closer.

## Employee Benefits

The top-down attitude to rational recreation can give the impression that the working class were on the receiving end of a heavy handed and paternalistic guiding hand, a hand that was guiding them in a direction against their will. Brass band music did not do this. Musical tuition was important to band members. Many firms would allow their band members time off work to rehearse for a contest. This was a benefit to the working person - time away from the ennui of factory work, and other workplaces where the work was repetitive, during working hours - to play music. Other workers did not have this luxury and could only play music in their own time. In 1938 one viola player remembered that:

On the Sabbath day[...] after dinner, I practice on my viola with pianoforte accompaniment [...]. On Monday I get up at seven o'clock and tone up my muscles with the aid of chest expanders[...] . I then breakfast and then go to hell - in other words - to work. I work in that hatred, a wretched department -The Grocery [...]. On Tuesday nights I go to band practice, because I am in the [YMCA] intermediate string orchestra [...]. Saturday nights I go to music lessons, unless I have a date with my violin or viola [...]. My favourite hobbies are music, which I spend all my money on and put my heart and soul to.<sup>196</sup>

---

<sup>195</sup> Patrick Joyce, *Work Society and Politics*, p. 145.

<sup>196</sup> H. Durrant, *The Problem of Leisure* (London, 1938), pp. 84 -5, cited in, Ross McKibbin, *Work and Hobbies in Britain, 1880- 1950*, from, *The Ideologies of Class, Social Relations in Britain, 1880-1950* ( Oxford, 1994, first published, 1991), p. 149.

For many working people hobbies made work bearable and for some, as Ross McKibbin argues, 'absorption in hobbies precluded interest in work altogether'.<sup>197</sup>

The evidence suggests that the Fosters allowed band members significant amounts of time off to attend rehearsals and contests. We can see from Black Dyke Mill's Absence Books the acceptance that bandsmen in the mill would be away from work to attend practices, contests and concerts. All band members were mill employees at this time and it is unknown why they are not all listed in the absence books when playing with the band. Nevertheless, the following example shows that bandsmen were given time off. In August and September 1864, for example, three members had a total of ten days off.<sup>198</sup> From July to September 1865 George Rishworth took twelve days.<sup>199</sup> This pattern of assorted absences continued to 1888 when the absence books end.

As with Murgatroyd's band, Black Dyke was active in the local area, taking part in local and regional contests and giving concerts and playing at charitable events. George Hogarth has highlighted that the workers and the industrialists socialised at musical events. It appears that these events had a relaxed atmosphere. Competition could be fierce between local bands but these were also social events. Hubert Shergold remembered seeing the Foden

Brothers with the band at a contest:

When I was with Gossages, we were at a contest with Fodens at New Brighton. I remember seeing Edwin Foden, joking with the band, holding fistfuls of sweets above his head. They were trying to pull his arms and grab the sweets. I knew what he was doing- he was trying to break the tension, trying to relax the players before they went to play

---

<sup>197</sup> Ross McKibbin, *Work and Hobbies in Britain, 1880-1950*, p. 148.

<sup>198</sup> West Yorkshire Archive Service, Bradford, *Register of Staff Absences, With Time Off, and Cause, to Playing in Black Dyke Band*, ref, 61D95/ 8 box 1/ (4 August, 10 and 28 September).

<sup>199</sup> *Register of Staff Absences* (July 15 to September 5, 1865).

[...].There was never any bother getting time off for the band. [Fodens] They were good players, and there was nothing but good feeling towards the bosses. Ted Foden always travelled about with us wherever we went. Bill Foden was always about to. Such a help they were, so keen. All they wanted was you to do your best. I suppose they must have got something out of it, in the way of advertising, like.<sup>200</sup>

There were financial benefits as well. Often the winnings from contests would be divided amongst the band; they would take a share of whatever was left after expenses had been deducted. This benefit was shared with public subscription bands.

### **Public Subscription Bands**

Algernon Rose also gave advice on how to set up and run a public subscription band. Rose's chapter played on the ethos of rational recreation, enabling people who wanted a band to have the rational recreation rhetoric to help secure the finance. As a first step, he recommended that the band call a public meeting, chaired by a person who had authority within the community to add weight to the meeting. Rose recommended that MPs and the Clergy were not invited to chair the meetings, because if the band was to be a balanced representation of the town, or neighbourhood, then political or denominational bias should be avoided. He suggested instead a local businessperson chair the meetings, not because of their education, but because they had tact.<sup>201</sup> The meeting should address the following points:

1. Why is a band desirable?

---

200 Arthur R. Taylor, *Labour and Love*, p. 26.

201 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, p. 304.

2. Why a *Brass Band*?

3. Why supported by subscriptions of honorary members as well as supporters?<sup>202</sup>

Rose recommended set answers to these questions. Moreover, the answers stressed the value of a rational recreation in performing music. The use of rational recreation rhetoric would reinforce the perception that the band belonged to - and was the public representation - of the town or village. Rose wrote:

Why desirable?

- (a) Because there are a number of young men who wish to become musicians
- (b) Because there are many of our neighbours who would welcome outdoor music in this town
- (c) Because the existence of such a band would be invaluable by affording help at charitable and local entertainments

Why a Brass Band?

- (a) Because 'brass' are the easiest musical instruments to learn
- (b) Because the tone of 'brass' carries better in the open air than any other kind of music
- (c) Because the blowing of such instruments is in itself a healthy recreation

Why supported by subscriptions of honorary members as well as performers?

- (a) Because few Brass Bands are self supporting
- (b) Because honorary members generally feel in a sense that the band they subscribe to belongs, in a sense, to them
- (c) Because such support of honorary members puts the performers continually on their mettle, making them feel they are under a constant *moral* [my italics] obligation to show their friends they are worthy of such assistance<sup>203</sup>

---

202 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, p. 311.

203 Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, pp. 311-312.

Rose concluded that ‘the whole speech should culminate with a stirring peroration, pointing out that the want of a band has been felt long enough, that its absence is a dishonour to the town as much as its prosperity will be an honour to it, and that *now* is the time to establish it’.<sup>204</sup> Rose has stressed the influence of rational recreation: it was a good activity for the youth, it was healthy and moral, and their friends and peers monitored their behaviour. The bands’ activities were the public face of the town. But he did so for instrumental purposes. Such strong rhetoric constantly reinforced the rational recreation ethos and as such rational recreation became the central tool in gaining finance.

### **The Rules of Engagement**

The approval of peers was essential then in gaining financial support for the subscription band. Rules written by the bands’ committees became a way to gain this approval. Peers could be assured that finance was being used to pursue rational recreation when bandsmen subscribed to these rules. All bands had rules and all rules were similar.<sup>205</sup> In 1876 Haworth Public Band’s Committee drew up their set:

Haworth Public Band Agreement 6 December 1876

(a) We the undersigned members of the late ‘Springhead Brass Band’ do hereby agree to hand over to the committee of the ‘Haworth Public Band’ all drums, music, music stands, and any other articles we are now possessed of, required for the formation of a band: the whole to become property of the public.

---

<sup>204</sup> Rose, *Talks With Bandsmen*, p. 312.

<sup>205</sup> See West Yorkshire Archive Service, Bradford, *Idle and Thackley Public Brass Band, Rules and Regulations* (30 July, 1898), ref, 540D/1/5, and the *Shipley Brass Band Trust Deed* (7 March, 1894), ref, 41D/84/49.

(b) We further agree to pay a subscription of ten pounds for the cost of the instruments, and an annual subscription of two pounds, to be paid at Christmas, also a weekly sum of 2d each ... to act as a reserve fund for carrying on this band.

(c) We individually promise to take every possible care of the instruments, and other property, committed to our care, and in all, and every way, to look after, and enhance, the welfare of the band.

(d) The public committee, on their part, agree to the band forming a committee within themselves, subject to their reporting monthly or oftener if required, to them who shall have the power of refusing, or sanctioning, any action they intend to take if considered detrimental to the band, and the public at large.

(e) Any member leaving the neighbourhood shall have his share of the ten pounds subscription refunded to him, but any member voluntary leaving, or being expelled from the band for improper conduct shall forfeit same.

(f) If in any the band should be reduced to have only a few members, it shall be the option of the committee whether the sum of the instruments will be called in.

(g) The following are the rules which have been selected by the committee, and to which subscribers will have to conform:

1. That members admitted to this band, shall feel bound to practice on their instruments, and shine to the utmost of their ability, to become proficient in music.
2. That no persons be allowed to enter the band without the permission of the committee or the band.
3. That each member is requested to keep their instrument clean.
4. That there be two practice nights in each week, viz Tuesday and Friday, and each member be expected to attend, unless unavoidably detained.
5. That the offer of engagements [should not] be accepted without first [being] submitted to, and sanctioned, by the committee, and that all monies arising from same, shall be proportionally distributed amongst the members.
6. That each member shall feel bound to obey the leader, and play such tunes as he selects.
7. [Unreadable][...] [that] this band has an engagement, of whatever kind, each member will be bound to play the engagement out, and will not be allowed to leave, until the engagement is finished (unless in case of sickness), and any member disobeying this rule will be fined one shilling, which said will go into the band fund.
8. That no talking be allowed during the time at practice, and if any disputes arise to be closed at the end of the meeting, each member is earnestly requested not to make any interruptions during the time at practice.



9. That no member be allowed to go and play with other bands, unless he can prove he is going to fill up some unavoidable vacancy in the band with which he is going to play. Same to be left at the discretion of the committee.<sup>206</sup>

Top down control had filtered down to a local level. A committee of peers oversaw the activities of the band, checking that any activity they took part in was not detrimental to the image of the town. Rose argued that performers had a *moral* obligation to their friends to show they were worthy of their support. As groups of working-class people, bands were justifying the use of their leisure time in terms of the rational recreation ethos. The state, or police, did not impose these rules. Durkheim argued that society was sustained by morality based on ties of solidarity:

Law and morality are the totality of ties which bind each of us to society, which make a unitary coherent aggregate of the mass of individuals. Everything which is a source of solidarity is moral, everything which forces men to take account of other men is moral, everything which forces to regulate his conduct through something other than the striving of his ego is moral, and morality is as solid as these ties are numerous and strong.<sup>207</sup>

Towards the end of his life, Durkheim advocated the establishment of occupational groups that took an intermediate position between the state and the family, 'groups which, bound together by a warm sense of community', would discourage deviant behaviour.<sup>208</sup> The bands can be seen as one such occupational group – their rules ensured moral and ethical behaviour.

Socialisation produced social order. These rules were tools which prevented deviant behaviour before it could spiral out of control; they insulated band

---

206 West Yorkshire Archive Service, Bradford, *Haworth Public Band Agreement* (6 December, 1876), ref, 80D/92  
207 Emille Durkheim, *The Division of Labour in Society*, cited in R.N. Bellah (Ed.), *Emille Durkheim on Morality and Society, Selected Writings* (Chicago, 1973),p. 136, cited in, A.P. Donajgrodzki (Ed.), *Social Control in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (London, 1977) p. 11 -12.  
208 A.P. Donajgrodzki, *Social Control*, p. 12.

members against external forces that could influence behaviour.<sup>209</sup> The rules were a way of defending the community's reputation from any band that misbehaved in the public arena.

Subscription bands had achieved a way of gaining approval of their peers. The control of the community became balanced with the internal approval of networks of family and friends. Importantly, these events were social events not just band 'work'. Moreover, as the band movement became more sociable, particularly around holiday times and the calendar of events that marked the band year, we see not deviant behaviour but actions that were self-policed by the band. James Law Cropper (1864-1974), remembered 'going out' as a teenager at Christmas time with Water Prize Band (Rossendale):

We covered the whole neighbourhood. We'd meet at the Commercial on Christmas Eve, at twelve o'clock the Church bells used to ring out. We always blasted off with *Old Glory*, then up the road as far as Culvert, we played about every three houses, and they all came out to listen to us, and treat us, they used to bring beer out to pass round, and cups of tea or coffee. We used to do the front, back and cellar dwellings of Culvert, and it would take us until four o'clock in the morning to get back to Water and go home. We'd turn out again at about nine o'clock on Christmas morning going round Dean and Water. We played Christmas Carols [...]. All the old 'Laycock' tunes, always the old tunes they'd had for generations. As a rule, our music that we played for Christmas was hand written.<sup>210</sup>

He remembered the Maypole dances, and entering local contests:

The Band always had a Maypole [...]. It was a huge Maypole, and we opened up with the band playing and the girls dancing, an afterwards there were sports. The Band entered contests, which at the time were held at agricultural shows; there was always one at Kirk, Crawshawbooth, and at Bacup.<sup>211</sup>

---

209 T. Parsons, *The Social System* (London, 1951), p. 321, cited in, A.P. Donajrodzki, (Ed.), *Social Control*, p. 12.

210 James Law Cropper, *Memories*, typewritten transcription of interviews (n.d.) Rawtenstall Local Studies Library, ref RC942WAT, pp. 29-30.

211 Cropper, *Memories*, pp. 28-29.

He remembered when the band played at local dances and the relationship with the Baptists. The band was not only playing at many community events but they were also dependent upon internal networks for support. Water Band were using their shared and collective leisure time to separate themselves from formal networks of rational recreation, the Baptists, for example, who approved some forms of rational recreation in the community. Within their own network Water Band self-policed their own behaviour at community events:

The band used to hold dancing classes on a Monday night [...]. Tommy Collinge - Weighty - who was the band secretary, used to teach the dancing [...]. The dances were held on Saturday night. It was all very up to date, but the Scottish dancing could be dangerous! The lady members would arrange the dances to raise funds. You could say in Water, and its surroundings, if people were interested in anything at all, they were interested in the Band, *or* [his italics] Lumb Baptists, and if it was Lumb Baptists you could say their interests were with the Liberal Party, and Temperance [...]. Folks from Dean, although they were mainly Baptists, took an interest in the Band, and the right old ones didn't seem to have anything against the Band, and of course, we played their tunes at Christmas... but as it became very strong anti -drink, the Baptists and the Band did not mix. Eden didn't connect so much with the anti-drink, dancing and gambling lot.

212

As a form of control, rules worked on two levels: they protected the interests of the town's reputation, upholding the name of the town in the eyes of neighbouring communities, and they also bound the group identities of the bands, since the similarity of band rules stressed their commonalities and musical similarities. The rules, together with the musical styles of playing, created a community where to be an 'insider' was to accept a class culture that *could* overthrow the individual's original role in the community: brother, husband,

---

212Cropper, *Memories*, pp. 28-29.

father, mill worker or even church goer. These new roles were accepted when the bands brought success to the community. The *Yorkshire Musician* summed up the town's acceptance of the band's role in promoting their reputations:

#### Wyke Temperance Band

The famous Wyke Brass Band was founded in the year 1869[...]. Taking into account the splendid array of prizes won by the energetic Wyke Bandsmen, amounting to upwards of £1,400, we may safely assert that no other amateur brass band, in the North of England, all things considered, has been more successful in the contest field. A remarkable and most pleasing feature connected with the band, is that it is upheld, supported, and entirely kept in working order, through the unflagging, and voluntary, exertions of the inhabitants of the prosperous little village in the vicinity of Wyke. Willingly and readily do these not unjustly proud villagers 'come forward in large numbers', as the band secretary Mr Ephraim Pearson quaintly puts it, and throw in their help, in order to keep the band in good trim, and in the front rank of contest players.<sup>213</sup>

### **Parklife, Garden Parties and Functions**

Summer was when brass bands gained most public exposure. From May to the end of September local bands played in the public parks.<sup>214</sup> They played an eclectic mix of summer events: balls, flower shows, Grammar School and police sports days and charity events. Park concerts were the most regulated.

The Public Park Movement started in the 1830s, developing from a desire to improve the health of the Victorian towns and cities' populations. Parks became symbols of civic pride, providing locals with fresh air and attractive surroundings. Parks were places to encourage rational recreation and attractions included music, sports facilities and horticultural displays. Often the park was

---

<sup>213</sup> *Yorkshire Musician* (October, 1889), p. 32.

<sup>214</sup> See the *Music in Greenhead Park Concert Programmes* (1903 -1920), Huddersfield Local Studies Library.

linked with a museum or art gallery.<sup>215</sup> Parks, together with the town hall, library, museum and art gallery, articulated a particular sense of identity and civic pride. They were important places for the bands to play, resulting in a top down control from the Town Clerk's Office.

Bury, for example, had three 'recreation grounds', and Mr J. Haslam, the Town Clerk, held control over which bands played in them. Two of the most important things to Haslam and his committee were what programme the bands played and where the money made from the performances went. Park Concert programmes had a formal structure; the bands would play two programmes, one from 3 pm to 5 pm, and another from 7 pm until dusk.<sup>216</sup> The programmes usually had the same order. They started with a March then followed with an Overture. The overtures were usually Italian opera, including the ubiquitous *William Tell*, but Beethoven's *Egmont* and Mozart's *Don Giovanni* were also popular. There was then a number of waltz tunes. These were followed by lengthier arrangements of selections of the Master's works, usually arranged for brass band by Edwin Swift, John Gladney or Alexander Owen, again Beethoven, Mozart, Wagner and Weber were popular. After these there would be a cornet or euphonium solo. Cornet polkas and Theme and Variations arrangements for euphonium were common. These pieces were followed by a selection of 'show' music - Gilbert and Sullivan gaining ascendancy from 1903, and ending with

---

215 Harriet Jordan, 'Public Parks, 1885-1914', *Garden History*, 22/1 (Summer, 1994), p. 1.  
216 *Music in Greenhead Park Concert Programmes (1903 -1922)*.

another March.<sup>217</sup> Standardisation was important to the Town Clerk's office but it also gave the bands commonality of performance in a public arena.

In April 1899, J. Hulton, the Secretary of Bury and District Bands Organisation, wrote to the Town Clerk about Sunday concerts writing, 'on behalf of the Bury and District Band Organisation, I have been instructed to apply to you in respect to giving Sunday Concerts at the Recreation Grounds Bury, in aid of the Infirmary.'<sup>218</sup> The bands in this organisation were linking themselves with charitable work and hence respectability together with ensuring that health care in the area was supported. The joint fund-raising power of the bands meant that groups of working-class bandsmen came together to form their own philanthropic gesture. Through these bands' financial contributions, larger community concerns could be supported by working-class people as well as wealthier philanthropists.

Moreover, this was used as a lever to gain exposure in the parks. Haslam replied that, 'your letter was considered [...]. Resolved that the matter should stand over for one month, enquiries: how many bands, in what grounds, on what dates, and what amounts are to be handed over to the infirmary authorities? Please supply details'.<sup>219</sup> Hulton replied, 'there will be four bands a fortnight between each concert. A turn in each piece of the recreation grounds, say Heap Bridge at Rochdale Road and so on. After the advertising in the *Bury Times*, and paying carriage for bands, the surplus goes to the infirmary funds.'<sup>220</sup>

---

217 *Music in Greenhead Park Concert Programmes*, also see, Bury Archive Service, *Correspondence re Bury Recreation Grounds*, ref. ABU2/3/7/1 (1895 -1905).

218 Bury Archive Service, *Correspondence re Bury Recreation Grounds* (24 April, 1899), ref 23/7/1.

219 Bury Archive Service (2 June, 1899).

220 Bury Archive Service (7 June, 1899).

Haslam replied on 7 July 1899, and granted the request, but only provisionally; the committee had not yet approved the musical programme and the performance times.<sup>221</sup> It had taken over two months to get this far and the process was still not completed. Every band supplied their performance times and programme, and how the proceeds of the concert were to be distributed, all were subject to approval by the committee before the band played. In the park the bands had to adhere to the times they were booked to play; if they did not a reprimand was swift. In a letter to the secretary of Walshaw Brass Band, Haslam wrote:

There is complaint that your band leaves the recreation ground at 8'o'clock. As you will be aware your band tendered to play from six till dusk, I must ask you in future to observe these conditions and not leave the recreation grounds until dusk.<sup>222</sup>

The secretary of Walshaw Brass Band agreed to make sure the band stayed until dusk in the future. Warth Brass Band were not so fortunate, they wrote to the Town Clerk explaining that they left the grounds early on Saturday because they had another appointment.<sup>223</sup> Haslam responded vigorously writing, 'they had chosen the date they wanted, and they did not attend.'<sup>224</sup> Haslam cancelled all Warth Band's future engagements. Warth Band replied offering to play for two evenings free of charge, and said 'it was a first offence, and we hope you will overlook it.'<sup>225</sup> The committee did overlook it but fined them one guinea.<sup>226</sup>

---

221 Bury Archive Service (7 July,1899).

222 Bury Archive Service, *Correspondence re Bury Recreation Grounds* (17 July , 1895), ref ,ABU 2/3/7/1.

223 Bury Archive Service (25 July, 1895).

224 Bury Archive Service (27 July, 1895).

225 Bury Archive Service (31 July, 1895).

226 Bury Archive Service (31 July, 1895).

Bury Town Council expected high standards from the bands that performed in the recreation grounds. The visiting bands were considered temporary employees of the Council. During their time in the grounds they were not only an expression of their own communities but they were also the public face of Bury Council. Thousands of people could attend these concerts; it was usual to see crowds of five thousand and more there to watch and listen to the band.<sup>227</sup> In the public gaze, the parks were where bands matured the notion that music was an improving use of working-class leisure time.

The Sunday promenade concerts were a prop in sustaining the respectable image of a working-class day out. The bands were reminded repeatedly that a Sunday park performance should contain two things: a contribution to a charity, and that they wear their uniforms, something that the superintendent of Farnworth Park in Bolton received regular reports about, telling him exactly how many bandsmen were in uniform, how many people attended and the approximate amount of money had been raised for charity.<sup>228</sup> These were staples in the support of working-class respectability. For the promenader, Sunday did not last forever and the temporary respectability of the park was no protection against the lure of the pub. For some of the working class the Sunday suit could be surrendered to the pawnbroker on Monday morning without shame.<sup>229</sup> As Robert Roberts suggested, 'the possession of Sunday best clearly became an important ongoing test of status and identity'.<sup>230</sup>

---

227 Bolton Archive Service, *Superintendents Reports on Bands*, (31 July, 1913), ref, AF/6/125/2.

228 Bolton Archive Service, *Superintendents Reports on Bands* (30 May, 1912-31 July, 1913).

229 Gareth Steadman Jones, 'Working-Class Culture and Working-Class Politics in London, 1879-1900: Notes on the Remaking of the Working Class', *Journal of Social History*, 7 (1974), p. 47.

230 Robert Roberts, *The Classic Slum: Salford Life in the First Quarter of the Century* (Harmondsworth, 1973), pp. 22-24.



The brass bands did not go to the pawnbroker on Monday morning. Their uniforms were their 'Sunday best', bought and paid for, and were in constant use. Warth Brass Band's letterhead proclaimed that they were available for 'concerts, fetes, garden parties, athletic sports, flower shows, demonstrations, friendly societies etc, they have a divine selection of classical, dance and other music, twenty-four performers, uniform dark blue navy, with silver facings.'<sup>231</sup> The bands could transfer the respectability of the park concert to any day of the week. Bands, made up of working-class members, were a highly visible agency in showing the respectability that could be achieved through music as a rational recreation.

### **The Manchester Fine Arts Exhibition Conclusion**

In 1857, when Titus Salt strode into Manchester Fine Arts Exhibition, onlookers saw a successful industrialist leading a band raised on the ethos of rational recreation into an exhibition that was an ethical, moral, improving and justifiable use of working-class leisure time. Industrialists and others had supported music as a respectable working-class pastime. To the industrialists, in spite of any loans or repayments of money, these role enactments of respectability were their own doing. That the working-class bandsmen now conformed to their own patterns of behaviour and were consolidating these patterns, was something that the middle-class outsider could not have easily known.<sup>232</sup> The working-class respectability of the brass band, with their shiny buttons, gold and silver braid,

---

<sup>231</sup> Bury Archive Service, *Correspondence re Bury Recreation Grounds* (26 June, 1895).

<sup>232</sup> Peter Bailey, *Popular Culture and Performance in the Victorian City*, p. 44.

horsehair shakos, Italian opera, Wagnerian selections, and gleaming instruments, were a prop to boost their own self-esteem.<sup>233</sup> Wherever the bands - public subscription or factory - travelled their main role was to boost the image of the community or factory they came from, and so boosting the egos of the individuals who led those communities and factories.

In exchange, the working-class membership of the bands accepted their role, and acted it out enthusiastically. They were heading in a different direction. They accepted the benefits of band membership: status within the community, income supplements, time off work, travel, an excellent social life. The communities and the industrialists had a mutually beneficial relationship with the bands; they received as much as the bands gave. Any top down control, even though still active, had been diluted, and customised, to suit the bands own activities, and every rehearsal, contest, park concert, or charity event strengthened their group identity.

Music was considered one of the best rational recreations that improved the mind and soul. The middle class saw music as a way to 'civilise' working people. This moral attempt to civilise the working class gave bandsmen an ethical justification to find finance, time and space to bring together all the musical processes they had developed to date. The bandsmen, significantly, were consolidating a leisure pursuit that was now beginning to rely upon support of the bands' extended social networks. In the next chapter it will emerge that bandsmen were practicing a moral and ethical rational recreation, but they were still capable of rough behaviour. In other words, rational recreation had given

---

<sup>233</sup> Bailey *Popular Culture and Performance in the Victorian City*, p. 44.

bandsmen the ability to develop social environments that not so much improved them but heightened their working-class nature.

## **Music as a Lifelong Pursuit for Bandsmen in the Southern Pennines: Brass Bands and Working-Class Masculinity.**

Chapter two highlighted that bandsmen had the opportunity to perform music for a lifetime. This theme provides an arena to reflect on brass bands and their influence on the construction of working-class masculinity. In relation to the early decades of the twentieth century, Andrew Davies argues that 'leisure was central to the formation of masculine identities in working-class neighbourhoods.'<sup>1</sup> As a popular leisure pursuit brass bands offer an approach to the analysis of Victorian and Edwardian working-class masculinity that has not previously been taken up by historians of gender.

Davies maintains that the three cornerstones of masculine working-class culture were drinking, gambling and sport. Men were identified by their hobbies and the pubs they drank in.<sup>2</sup> Moreover, Davies argues that these pubs were where men carved out territories that were 'exclusively male.'<sup>3</sup> Brass bands were a highly visible working-class hobby which embraced aspects of these cornerstones and bandsmen created an amalgam of these masculinities within brass bands. This chapter explores how bandsmen created a combination of working-class masculinity between their homosocial environments - the pub and

---

1 Andrew Davies, *Leisure, Gender and Poverty: Working-Class Culture in Salford and Manchester, 1900-1939* (Buckingham, 1992), p. 30.

2 Davies, *Leisure, Gender and Poverty*, p. 30.

3 Davies, *Leisure, Gender and Poverty*, p. 30.

the bandroom - where drinking and rough behaviour could exist, and the more respectable sociability of the extended bands' networks. Bandsmen's masculinity was firmly rooted in homosocial environments; nevertheless, band activities challenged the strength of this homosociality, as they became more reliant upon their extended networks for support. This chapter examines this negotiation of social space and how that influenced the masculinity of bandsmen.

### **The Bandsman Between the Rough and the Respectable**

The editorial tone of the band periodicals emphasised that all bandsmen should be respectable. This need for respectability was driven by the ethos of rational recreation. As Derek B. Scott has pointed out, the attitude of the middle class to musical performance aligned itself with one of the fundamental 'Victorian values' – that of improvement.<sup>4</sup> This improvement was also a widely held belief amongst social reformers and philanthropists who felt they could 'civilise' the working class.<sup>5</sup> In their actions, as participants between the rough and the respectable, bandsmen were placed in a position of trust by their communities. Bandsmen represented not only their towns but more importantly, in the eyes of the periodicals' editors, the reputation of the band movement. This trust allowed the bandsmen not only to earn extra money from their musicianship but also develop their own culture both in the homosocial spaces of the bandrooms and on the competition circuit.

---

<sup>4</sup> Derek B. Scott, 'Music, Morality and Rational Amusement at the Victorian Middle-Class Soirée' in, Bennett Zon (Ed.), *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Music and Performance Culture in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Essays in Honour of Nicholas Temperley* (Farnham, 2012), p. 83.

<sup>5</sup> See chapter four.

Editors wanted bandsmen to have a fair social standing and have the necessary qualities that supported that standing. The ability to obtain this standing placed a high value on respectability not only in the practice space but also in the public performances that followed rehearsals. The bands had to negotiate with a wide variety of people for funds. To be successful, bandsmen had to refrain from rough behaviour and try to be a gentleman at all times, distancing themselves from elements of drunkenness and bad language. The fact that periodicals, and others, commented on, and admonished, what they considered to be bad behaviour amongst bandsmen not only shows the desire to protect the reputation of the brass band movement but also that behaviour associated with masculinity highlighted by Davies – such as drinking and roughness – were common. Moreover, as will emerge throughout this chapter, the periodicals carried regular comic sketches about, for example, bandsmen who wanted to go to contests rather than staying at home with their wives, drinking to excess and the way in which bandsmen took credit for the efforts of women within the movement. Such themes inferred particular forms of masculinity so that, although masculinity itself was not addressed directly by commentators, its signifiers were noted regularly and became a significant part of the working-class identity of brass bands.

To be a rough working-class man was to be coarse, loud, unrestrained and indelicate. Fighting, heavy drinking, making noise, blood sports and excess defined rough working-class masculinity. When Shani D' Cruz examined working-class respectability in Middleton, just outside Manchester, she found that excess was synonymous with fairs, processions and public holidays. Later, with

the growth of regular and longer holidays, the railway transferred some of this behaviour away from the town; nevertheless, it was a constant presence at local communal events.<sup>6</sup>

In addition, local neighbourhoods could contain the respectable and the rough in close proximity. 'Echoes of the Valley' was a commentator writing in the *Slaithwaite and Colne Valley News* who regularly commented on regional music-making and often praised local brass bands when they represented the Colne Valley. In 1896 the author's attention focused on the rougher working-class masculinity that existed in Slaithwaite when the Upper Slaithwaite Brass Band was most active, and which, by representing the community, was also being respectable.<sup>7</sup> In the author's opinion, rough working men would spend their wages on drinking, gambling and other low pursuits. 'Echoes of the Valley' wrote:

I am told that in and about Slaithwaite there are a large number of drinking 'cots', where working men resort to and spend their hard earned wages. Cottages are taken by bands of men who form "clubs" which are nothing more nor less than drinking salons. At the weekends the "members" of these "clubs" assemble together and hold high revelry until Monday morning and then turn out to their work [...]. In the majority of cases [they] are veritable gambling dens and low drinking resorts, and simply cater for the coarser person of these men.<sup>8</sup>

Brass bands were present in the respectable and the rough. Bandsmen, through their use of taverns for rehearsals, playing in contests that contained rough elements, and living and working in working-class communities were not immune to rough behaviour. For the masculinity of bandsmen, the question becomes how much rough masculinity - heavy drinking, gambling, fighting and noise - was

---

6 Shani D'Cruz, 'Sex, Violence and Local Courts: Working-Class Respectability in a Mid-Victorian Lancashire Town', *British Journal of Criminology* 39/1 (Special Edition, 1999), pp. 47-49.

7 See Chapter one.

8 *Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (11 December, 1896).

embraced and how much respectable masculinity - gentlemanly behaviour, courtship, marriage, domesticity and employment security - was accepted by bandsmen as the way in which a bandsman should behave? Were bandsmen, in spite of being practitioners of a respectable leisure pursuit, unable to escape the influence of rougher working-class masculinity in their communities? Music as a lifelong pursuit for bandsmen enabled a form of working-class masculinity that could be traced from novice bandsman to the skilled player in the 'crack' band. These questions can be answered by a close reading of this process and by analysing the social networks of the band movement that emerged as a result of this process.

Martin Francis has argued that feminists have rightly asserted there is no shortage of histories of men, which are principally about war, diplomacy and statecraft. Francis maintains that, 'the study of men as gendered beings has been a relatively recent departure in historiography.'<sup>9</sup> Karen Harvey and Alexander Arnold observed that that 'the bulk of research into the history of masculinity has inevitably concentrated on culturally and commercially dominant groups of men not least because records relating to them are most prolific.'<sup>10</sup> Michael Roper and John Tosh argue that making men visible as gendered subjects has major implications for all historians' established themes: for family, labour and business, class and national identities, religion, education, and institutional politics too.<sup>11</sup> Thus, an analysis of bandsmen's social networks, in a

---

9 Martin Francis, "The Domestication of the Male? Recent Research on Nineteenth - and Twentieth-Century British Masculinity", *The Historical Journal*, 45/3 (2002), p. 637.

10 Karen Harvey and Alexander Shepard, "What Have Historians Done with Masculinity? Reflections on Five Centuries of British History, circa 1500-1950", *Journal of British Studies*, 44 (2005), p. 277.

11 Michael Roper and John Tosh (Eds.), *Manful Assertions, Masculinities in Britain since 1800*, (London, 1991), p. 1.



period when working-class leisure was highly visible, answers a call to examine masculinity in this period outside the more dominant models of middle-class education, power and politics.<sup>12</sup>

### **Bandsmen, Money and Masculine Independence**

A distinctly masculine interpretation of what it meant to be 'independent' came to have dominance in the working class from the 1870s onwards. Men were often dependent on women when cyclical and seasonal employment meant they lost their jobs. Gareth Steadman-Jones noted that London bricklayers, joiners and plasterers depended on their wives' earnings as ironers in a collar factory when out of work in the winter.<sup>13</sup> A man's employment was central in defining his masculinity. No man would, as Keith McClelland has written, 'expect, or be expected, to leave work on marriage or at the birth of a child, seek employment because his wife's earnings were too low, or look for work that was reconcilable with his domestic duties.'<sup>14</sup> Men found it difficult to ask for help when they were short of money. By playing for contests, and in other areas, bandsmen could find funds to not only support their hobby, but also to support the socialisation that accompanied this hobby. For the amateur bandsman playing became a way to supplement his 'spends' outside his wages. This income gave bandsmen an element of security when a man's independence depended on how much spending money he had for himself. As Richard Hoggart commented about

---

12 See, for example, J. A. Mangan and James Walvin (Eds.), *Manliness and Morality, Middle-Class Masculinity In Britain and America, 1800-1940* (Manchester, 1987).

13 Gareth Steadman-Jones, *Outcast London* (Oxford, 1971), p. 84, cited in, Keith McClelland, 'Some Thoughts on Masculinity and the "Representative Artisan" in Britain 1850-80', *Gender & History* 1:2 (1989), p. 78.

14 McClelland, 'Some Thoughts on Masculinity', p. 78.

working-class men in Hunslet, near Leeds, in the mid-twentieth century, being independent meant a right having spare money to spend freely on beer, cigarettes and gambling.<sup>15</sup>

The economy of the working-class household was rooted in the collective earnings of father, mother and children. Jose Harris has highlighted the importance of the financial contribution of the wives and children to the household, as social surveys of the period recognised that how much the man contributed from his wages could vary wildly. Indeed, the management of the household fell to the wife, and in what were considered the more respectable households the man would hand his wages over and the wife would often give the husband his 'spends' after the essential items, food, bills and so on had been budgeted for. In spite of observers disagreeing about the significance of the amounts husbands gave, one thing that all agreed on was that it was the wife's skill, or ineptitude, in making ends meet that determined the comfort or neglect of working-class homes.<sup>16</sup>

Therefore, outside their employment, it was bandsmens' use of their musical skill that enabled them to obtain extra spending money. One way proficient bandsmen could earn money was to play for bands that wanted to win contests. Contest rules stated that all members of a band must have been a member of the competing band for at least three months prior to the day of the contest, and that they should live not more than four miles from the town where

---

15 Richard Hoggart, *The Uses of Literacy: Aspects of Working-Class Life With Special Reference to Publications and Entertainments* (Harmondsworth, 1958), p. 56, cited in, Davies, *Leisure, Gender and Poverty*, p. 55.

16 Jose Harris, *Private Lives, Public Spirit: Britain 1870-1914* (Oxford, 1993, this edition, London, 1994), pp. 72-73.

the band resided.<sup>17</sup> This rule was often broken and it gave players the opportunity to earn money outside the workplace.

The minute books of Helmshore Brass Band showed that money was available for proficient players to perform at local contests. In June 1903, they voted to enter the Rishton contest as long as they could get the same players that they had at the Ramsbottom contest.<sup>18</sup> In August 1903, they voted to have Hibert and Hoyle for the Goodshaw contest, and on August 31, they voted to ask J.P. Broadwood and John Heskey to play at Crawshawbooth contest.<sup>19</sup> The back pages of the minute books from 1889-1920 contain 33 names of players who could deputise for them, including the amount of money they charged for rehearsals and contests.<sup>20</sup>

Outside contests there were a number of avenues where bandsmen could play to supplement their income. In 1907, for example, the *British Bandsman* noted that members from the Bradford City Band played with the Carl Rosa Opera Company in Bradford.<sup>21</sup> In 1910 an editorial in the *British Bandsman* criticised bandsmen who were playing at the Bradford Roller Skating Rink.<sup>22</sup> The editor's concern was that this stopped bandsmen attending rehearsals and working towards the greater good of contest success and the good of the

---

17 For example, see rules four and five of the Crystal Palace Contest (September 1902), in, Trevor Herbert (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), p. 317.

18 *Helmshore Brass Band Minute Book* (June 18, 1903) Thanks to John Simpson, of Accrington Local Studies Library, for letting me access this source in his private collection.

19 *Helmshore Brass Band Minute Book* (August 13 and 31, 1903).

20 *Helmshore Brass Band Minute Book*, 1889-1920. See especially: Albert Lonsdale, Soprano Cornet, 3 Albion Street, Wingates, who charged 12 shillings and sixpence for all expenses and the contest, as well as five shillings and five pence per rehearsal; E.J. Woodhead, trombone, 23 Lyon Street, Shaw, who charged fifteen shillings and fares for contests and Louis Wilson, cornet, who, reflecting his status as a soloist, charged one pound a contest plus train fares, and seven shillings and six a rehearsal.

21 *British Bandsman* (12 January, 1907), n.p. Cited in, David Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914: A Study of the Relationships between Music and Society* ( PhD Thesis, University of York, 1979), p. 165.

22 *British Bandsman* (7 January, 1910), n.p., cited in Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District*, p. 165.

movement. In spite of these criticisms, players were free to command a small measure of economic independence. From the 1880s onwards there were a growing number of players, trainers and conductors linked with the 'crack' bands that were professional in all but name. When Black Dyke Mills toured America, in 1906, it was written into the contract that the majority of their salary, which was two pounds a week, was given to their wives and partners, leaving the bandsmen with fifteen shillings a week pocket money. The majority of the bandsmen's wages went to supporting the domestic economy, yet the bandsmen had their 'spends'. Indeed, in November 1907, a correspondent in the *British Bandsman* wrote that some of Black Dyke's players had complained that fifteen shillings a week spending money was 'inadequate remuneration' for the tour.<sup>23</sup> Their complaint was that too much money was being sent home. Even though Black Dyke was a 'crack' band and the line between amateur and professional musician was blurred it was clear that these 'crack' players still saw the notion of having 'spends' as important in supporting their independence, especially when away from home.

Professionalisation should not be confused with the fact that the majority of bands were composed of working-class men who undertook banding as a hobby. Even though many bandsmen were not in 'crack' bands, the same principle applied; it was the earning of spending money that was a significant factor in supporting bandsmen's independence.

An examination of the financial records of Todmorden Old Band, in West Yorkshire's Calder Valley, reveals that the band's committee were able to assist

---

<sup>23</sup> *British Bandsman* (9 November, 1907), p. 807.

when bandsmen were in financial distress and lost their monetary independence. In 1908, the committee paid ten shillings to a 'distressed bandsman', so that he could continue to attend band practice.<sup>24</sup> In the official record the bandsman remained anonymous, which protected his reputation as a working man. Moreover, though, the bandsman obtained the relief because the band wanted him as a player. In other words, the bandsman had enabled his musical skill to obtain relief outside the state or his employer. The amounts that bandsmen earned were seasonal and one-off payments, and, on occasion, altruistic. The money divided from contest wins, money from playing in contests, as a deputy or support player, and income from playing in shows mainly depended on the summer cycle of the band contest season and, for the amateur bandsman, could not be relied upon. Nevertheless, they gave bandsmen an element of security when a man's independence, and status in homosocial environments, depended on how much spending money he had for himself.

### **The Band Uniform: Uniformity, Respectability and Martial Masculinity**

As representatives of a national band movement bandsmen were expected to look smart. Raising money for the purchase of uniforms was one significant reason that the bands' support networks were so active. Uniforms not only implied a martial masculinity for bandsmen but were also a central factor in bringing the bands' social networks together in a common fundraising cause. Uniforms were central to how bandsmen were perceived in public. Uniforms

---

<sup>24</sup> *Todmorden Old Brass Band Ledger Books* (9 June, 1908).

created symmetry and an aura of respectability within the band movement. In 1892, for example, when the *Magazine of Music* reviewed a contest at Clough Hall, Kidsgrove, in Staffordshire, they wrote:

'The Potteries' have a reputation for ugliness, but this spot has been fitly named 'The Paradise of the Potteries.' Some 30,000 people flocked through the gates to witness the most important brass band competition in North Staffordshire [...]. It was well known that though the famous Black Dyke would be absent, Kingston Mills, and our old friends Besses o' th' Barn, would be there. The railway companies had made special arrangements, and all the chief amateur bands, within a reasonable distance of Clough Hall, made an appearance, accompanied by their more ardent admirers. One after another, twenty-two different uniforms, many of them striking in their smartness and many of wonderful workmanship, lent brightness to the scene.<sup>25</sup>

In the early days of the band movement bands bought military uniforms because they were cheap, purchased second hand from the army. When Stephen Lord wrote about Whitworth Vale and Healy bands, in the Rossendale Valley, he noticed that 'some bands in the valley had basic uniforms and some had very elaborate uniforms depending on the regiment.'<sup>26</sup> The regular army did not approve of this. Speaking in 1932, Tom Beckwith, of Rothwell Temperance Band, remembered:

When we got the band together, we picked up a set of second-hand Lancer uniforms - black tunics and white fronts, with white stripes down the trousers. We looked smart I assure you, but one day an army officer saw us and it was all up with our uniform.<sup>27</sup>

It was not just Rothwell Band that were criticised. Objections to bands using old military uniforms meant that parliament passed the *Uniforms Act* in 1894. It tried to prevent civilians wearing military uniforms. The act stated:

---

<sup>25</sup> *Magazine of Music*, 9/6 (June, 1892), p. 102.

<sup>26</sup> Stephen Lord, *The History and Some Personal Recollections of the Whitworth Vale and Healy Band* (n.p., 2005), The Rossendale Collection, Rawtenstall Local Studies Collection, Catalogue Ref: RC785WHI, p. 11.

<sup>27</sup> Robert Carrington (Ed.), *The Centenary Chronicle of Rothwell Temperance Band, 1881-1981, A Tribute to Those Who Have Gone Before* (n.p., 1981), p. 2.

It shall not be lawful for any person not serving in Her Majesty's Military Forces to wear [...] the uniform of any of those forces, or any dress having the appearance or bearing any of the regimental or any other distinctive marks of any such uniform.<sup>28</sup>

Nevertheless, as long as brass bands did not copy military uniforms *exactly*, they could continue to have the military style.<sup>29</sup> The *Musical News* commented:

It is stated that the Uniform Bill will prohibit the purchase of old military uniforms by civilian brass bands. Such bands must chose uniforms unlike those of the army [...]. On the other hand, the custom of wearing showy military uniforms by civilian bands is universally prevalent in the United States, and such uniforms are constantly advertised in the American musical papers, some of them being very smart, not to say gorgeous. There may be more under the proposed regulation.<sup>30</sup>

Uniforms, then, became central to the identity of bandsmen in the public space. One commentator wrote about bands in the north, 'after wandering for many months through their haunts...it seemed to me a labyrinth of trombones in uniform, euphoniums in gold facings, and cornets with tassels galore'.<sup>31</sup> The *British Bandsman*, as well as other periodicals, carried regular advertisements for firms that supplied band uniforms. It was a business with a huge demand. For example, Gisbourne's (see Fig. 3), sold the latest military style belts and pouches (Bandoleers).<sup>32</sup> Hodgeson's of Huddersfield (see Fig. 3) put great emphasis on the fact that they supplied uniforms to the military, 'our army and colonial troops', the Yorkshire Yeomanry Volunteers, the police force and the fire brigade, as well

---

28 *Uniforms Act 1894*, Office of Public Sector Information, <[http://www.opsi.gov.uk/acts/acts1894/pdf/ukpga18940045\\_en.pdf](http://www.opsi.gov.uk/acts/acts1894/pdf/ukpga18940045_en.pdf)> accessed, 3 January 2010, p. 1.

29 *Uniforms Act 1894*, p. 1.

30 *Musical News*, 7/184 (8 September, 1894), p. 189.

31 *Magazine of Music*, 9/4 (April, 1892), p. 62.

32 *British Bandsman* (4 April, 1903), p. 88.

as every competing band in the Huddersfield area.<sup>33</sup> In spite of the 1894 Uniform Act brass bands relied heavily on military imagery in their choice of uniform.

THE BRITISH BANDSMAN. April 4, 1903.



**BANDSMEN:** Are you in want of any of these SPECIALITIES?

\* If you are, Try **GISBORNE'S.**

Anything can be had on Approval for Six Weeks, so that they can be compared with those that cost double the price from other firms.

TROMBONES.—Gisborne's price is £4 10s., not £7 7s., and the Cleburne Trombone is now used by all the leading men, including Mr. Lawson, of Boston; Mr. Jufferies, of Black Duke; Mr. Sam. Holt, of Kingston; Mr. Stand, of the Grenadiers; Mr. Wilson, of the Scots; &c., &c., and as I say, the price is £4 10s., not £7 7s. LEATHER CASES for all Instruments; the Gisborne Perfection Case is all the rage. CORNET CASES from 7/6. BAND POUCHES & BELTS, complete, from 2/6. BAND STANDS, 2/6 and 4/6 each—Best, Strongest, and Cheapest in the trade. Send for Lists of these Goods. All made on good value for money. MOUTHPIECES: have you one to that's the reason we can give such good value for money. Double Rim. Price of all Specially Silver-Plated, 3/6, not 7/6. Gisborne's RIFLE-BORE SHANK, 2/6. Anything you are in need of. Send for them on approval from

**GISBORNE'S, APOLLO WORKS, BIRMINGHAM.**  
Vere St., Bristol St.,

---

**SOMETHING NEW FOR 1903.**

**Don't be Misled by a lot of Bounce in Advertising**

of pieces that are not yet built. Come and see for yourself. The Finest, Cleanest, Largest, and up-to-date Uniform Factory in Huddersfield. All run by Electric Power, and Illuminated throughout. We are the actual makers of all our goods, in every branch of the Uniform trade, and we have supplied our Vests, Trousers, Yorkshire Dragoon, Borough Police Force, Fireworks, and Fire Brigades, several times, and nearly every Band in and around Huddersfield, including our Military Band, Linthwaite Rifle Band, winners of the "Daily Telegraph" Challenge Cup and Lindley Prize Band this last summer. (They know who are the actual makers.) We are also Direct Contractors to His Majesty's Government for our Army and Colonial Troops.

**THE ONLY FIRM IN HUDDERSFIELD.**

Our Show of Uniforms at the Crystal Palace, Contest has more than Doubled our Trade in and around LONDON and the South, including the following Names: Edmonton Town, Edmonton Riflement, Acton Town, Acton Green, Lavender Hill, Buttrick Park, Nine Elm Military, Grassendale Town, Millers Price, Queens Park Estate, Upper Edmonton Prize, Chiswick Town, Dapford, Chelsea Borough Council, Hastings and St. Leonards Borough Council, Reading Excelsior, Reading Temperance, Reading Borough and Thousands of others in the British Isles and Colonies.

We have Hundreds of Photos in our Show Rooms of Bands from all over the World sent us entirely through Satisfaction given

Send for our New Coloured Plate of Registered Designs and Price List (whether for Cash or Instalments).

£5 REWARD given to any person giving information of any person or firm infringing on our Copyright Designs.

**HODGSON & CO.,**  
HIGH-CLASS UNIFORM MANUFACTURERS.  
Factories: VICTORIA LANE, & RAMSDEN STREET,  
**HUDDERSFIELD.**  
Telegrams: "UNIFORMS, HUDDERSFIELD." Letters: 70, West Parade, HUDDERSFIELD.

Figure 3. Advertisements for uniforms, and other brass band ephemera, *British Bandsman* (4 April, 1903), p. 88.

Trevor Herbert maintains that the advertising of brass instruments and band uniforms used military imagery to conjoin anything militaristic with anything that

33 *British Bandsman*, p. 88.



was of sound moral value.<sup>34</sup> Up to the 1920s most instrument manufacturers used the military to endorse their products. S.A. Chappell was a typical brass music publisher and instrument manufacturer who used military references to endorse their products. They described themselves as, 'Manufacturer and Importer of Every Description of Military Musical Instrument to Her Majesty's Army and Navy.'<sup>35</sup> The foundation of the 'Military Music Class', at Kneller Hall, near Twickenham, in the London suburbs, in 1857,<sup>36</sup> had the aim of producing British bandmasters that would undermine foreign competition, whose bandmasters often had close and mutually beneficial relationships with manufacturers and publishers.<sup>37</sup>

Military imagery implied a close relationship with ideologies that were prevalent in this period. In short, masculinity was a cultural construct which placed importance on martial masculinity. This martial imagery was self-evident to commentators on brass bands when they noticed their uniforms. In 1892, for example, the *Magazine of Music* felt that uniforms helped bandsmen create an *esprit de corps*.<sup>38</sup> As David Gilmore has argued, 'in Victorian and Edwardian England, a culture not given over to showy excess, manhood was an artificial product coaxed by austere training and testing'.<sup>39</sup> An imperial masculinity, inherently reliant on militarism, became significant in empire building.

---

34 Trevor Herbert, 'Selling Brass Instruments: The Commercial Imaging of Brass Instruments (1830-1930) and its Cultural Messages', *Music in Art: the International Journal for Music Iconography*, 28/1-2 (Spring-Fall 2004), p. 222.

35 Herbert, 'Selling Brass Instruments', p. 223.

36 Trevor Herbert and Helen Barlow, 'The British Military as a Musical Institution c. 1780-c.1860', in Paul Rodmell (Ed.) *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Music and Institutions in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (Abingdon, 2012), p. 247. This institution acquired the name of 'Royal Military School of Music' in 1887. (Source, Herbert and Barlow, p. 247.)

37 Herbert, *The British Brass Band*, pp. 62-64.

38 *Magazine of Music*, 9/4 (April 1892), p. 62.

39 David. D Gilmore, *Manhood in the Making: Cultural Concepts of Masculinity* (Yale, 1990), p. 223.

From the 1840s to the 1930s the proper definition of manliness as a code of conduct for men was a matter of keen interest to educators and social critics. Emphasis was variously placed on moral courage, sexual purity, athleticism and stoicism, by commentators that ranged from Thomas Arnold, through Thomas Carlyle, Charles Kingsley and Thomas Hughes, to Robert Baden-Powell. Special attention has also been given to the manly precepts that were upheld in all-male schools, the Boys' Brigade and the Boy Scouts.<sup>40</sup>

J. A. Mangan and James Walvin argue that perhaps one of the most arresting features of Victorian manliness was that it was a philosophy which, through the printed word and via prestigious and proliferating educational institutions, developed a swift and ubiquitous influence through 'Anglo-Saxon' territories. Well before the Great War, on both sides of the Atlantic, proponents of the ideal had securely ensconced themselves in dominant positions in society: with the result that between around 1850 and 1940 the cult of manliness became a widely pervasive and inescapable feature of middle-class existence in Britain and America: in literature, education and politics the vocabulary of masculinity was spread forcefully. This ethos was not restricted to the privileged: through school textbooks, children's literature, philanthropic agencies and the churches both the image and associated symbolic activities of both Christian and Darwinian 'manliness' filtered down to the proletariat through an unrelenting and self-assured process of social osmosis. For the working class, the Boys' Brigade Movement - formed in 1883, in Glasgow - became a key movement in the spread

---

40 Michael Roper and John Tosh (Eds.), *Manful Assertions, Masculinities in Britain since 1800*, (London, 1991), p. 1.

of these ideals.<sup>41</sup> Middle-class martial manliness, the officer as gentleman, hero, and finally, a man who would sacrifice his life for empire was central to this imagery. As Calum McKenzie and J. A. Mangan put it, militarism was central to the identity of nation, the identity of social networks and shared conformity and values within groups, writing:

With some justification, it may be claimed, that the New Imperial Britain of the late Victorian and Edwardian eras attempted to socialize a young elite into attitudes fundamental to the ambitions of the respective political regimes. This conditioning involved values based on four interlocking spheres of sociopolitical consciousness: the need to establish an ideal of selfless service to the state; the need to establish a sense of racial superiority as a cornerstone of this selflessness; the need to establish and maintain an imperial chauvinism; and the need to engender uncritical conformity to the values of the group. A major purpose of this interlinked set of values, was to create a “martial middle-class” ready to serve the nation in the plethora of its imperial struggles in both societies.<sup>42</sup>

Bandsmen, then, when wearing militaristic uniforms, were not just conforming to the smartness required of them by the editorial rhetoric found in band periodicals, but also reflected masculine values that were spread to the wider working class through youth groups, literature and sport. Bandsmen, in other words, were conforming to the wider militaristic values that were inherent in Victorian and Edwardian empire-building society.

---

41 J. A. Mangan and James Walvin (Eds.), *Manliness and Morality, Middle-Class Masculinity In Britain and America, 1800-1940* (Manchester, 1987), pp. 1-4.

42 Callum McKenzie and J.A. Mangan, 'Duty unto Death'— the Sacrificial Warrior: English Middle Class Masculinity and Militarism in the Age of the New Imperialism', *The International Journal of the History of Sport* 25/9 (2008) p. 1101.

## The Novice Bandsman: Reflecting Early Industrial Experiences

Victorian and Edwardian bandsmens' masculinity emerged from earlier industrial traditions. When bandsmen came together to practice they transferred working-class identities found elsewhere to their practice space. Indeed, these spaces became a place to continue and develop traditions labouring people established in the early industrial period, when working environments of small workshops developed rhythms of labour that lasted for decades and the influence of these rhythms resonated through the working class. The workplace was where a boy in a trade established essential skills and identities associated with that trade. Before more efficient manufacturing methods emerged an apprentice was often expected to run errands, not only for essential items for the manufacturing of goods but also for items, such as beer, for the other men in the workplace. This willingness to run errands was an essential element in gaining acceptance in the peer group. In addition, apprentices bonded and reinforced acceptance with other labouring men by engaging in chat and horseplay.<sup>43</sup>

This provided spaces where two forms of masculinity were expressed. The first was homosocial contact, the need for men to associate with other men outside the home. Clubs and alehouses and indeed bandrooms were areas where gender and masculine status was both recognised and assessed. Aspirations to masculine independence were not new in this period. McClelland, however, argued that the *dominance* and *visibility* of independent masculinity was new like middle-class institutions, the working class sustained masculine

---

<sup>43</sup> See, for example, *Birmingham Journal* (26 September 1855), cited in, Douglas A. Reid, "The Decline of Saint Monday 1766-1866", *Past and Present*, No 71 (May, 1976), p. 78.

independence because of the 'building of the institutions of collective social defence'.<sup>44</sup> Working-class institutions such as the co-operatives, friendly societies and trade unions, and brass bands, were places where the practice of masculinity was respectable in surroundings outside domesticity.

In the bandroom echoes of these traditions from the workplace can also be found, where, before a band became established, the 'work' of making music was often ignored over the social interaction.<sup>45</sup> Bandsmen were developing their own version of working-class homosociality based on norms of Victorian gender. J. Eaton, Bandmaster of Batley Old Band, reminisced in 1913 about the early practices of the late 1870s where bandsmen came together to chat, tease and banter, as a precursor to practice and, as emerged, more horseplay:

We used to have some pleasant hours in the old bandroom. There were plenty of cracks and holes about the place, and I remember that when it was frosty the gas meter used to be frozen. All used to sit around chaffing and telling tales until the fire burnt up; the meter [...] would be placed on the fire to thaw.<sup>46</sup>

Eaton does not say whether they concentrated on music afterwards, evidence suggests, that by 1900, however, Batley Band were using the Bandroom as a place for chatting, smoking and drinking rather than performing music. One observer at a rehearsal wrote to the band periodical the *Cornet*:

Tobacco smoke so thick one could cut cakes of smoke [...]. There was much larking around [...]. The music started late, then they only played for twenty minutes before stopping [...]. All hands gathered around the stove [...] and the snare drummer was sent for a pail of beer, and with the beer, more stories, and beer again, until it was too late to

---

44 McClelland, *Some Thoughts on Masculinity*, p. 84.

45 The term 'bandroom', used as a dedicated rehearsal space, could embrace the room in a public house, the room above a restaurant, the room in a hotel and even a bedroom. In the late nineteenth century independent bandrooms, such as Batley Old Band's bandroom, were often nothing more than wooden sheds. More dedicated spaces, designed by architects, with extensive facilities, including catering spaces, did not emerge until the first decade of the twentieth century.

46 *British Bandsman* (15 March, 1913) p. 238.

do any work, so all went home with the idea that they had done their duty as band boys ought to.<sup>47</sup>

By 1909, more dedicated bandrooms had been built suggesting professionalisation of practice, but nevertheless, in 1914, the *British Bandsman* featured a cartoon called *Scenes in a Band Club* that saw bandmen playing billiards, smoking, drinking, and playing cards and darts. The practice space was empty, the instruments lying unused.<sup>48</sup> The horseplay and homosociality found in bandrooms linked bandmen with patterns of behaviour found in the workshops of the early industrial era. Workplaces became places to eat and drink, often becoming taprooms, where the apprentices were pot boys, and workers spent long periods of time playing games.<sup>49</sup> These spaces were where working men not only earned wages but also created homosocial environments: work was a social space. When bandmen came together in the bandrooms they created spaces that reflected the masculinity that had its roots in the early industrial workplace. They could have done this in the pub without the hard work, or expense, of playing instruments; however, it was the instruments that made them bandmen and the bandrooms that brought them together as a 'masculine' band. The support of industrialists and communities enabled working-class men to become working-class bandmen in their own dedicated spaces. Musical performance not so much improved these men but acted as a catalyst that drew their masculinity together in one place.

---

47 *Cornet* (15 February, 1900) p. 3.

48 *British Bandsman* (31 January 1914), p. 83.

49 *Birmingham Journal* (26 September, 1855).

Even though McClelland rightly argues that working-class masculinity sustained itself by building collective spaces of social defence, the areas where masculinity were practiced outside domesticity can also be traced to early industrialisation and the celebration of Saint Monday. Saint Monday was the act of taking the first day of the working week off, which sometimes extended into Tuesday and Wednesday. Evidence suggests that this practice lingered longest in the North.<sup>50</sup> Skilled workers could command high wages but they would sometimes elect to take moderate wages in exchange for flexible leisure. Such flexible working followed not from weekend drinking but from the workers deeply held traditional expectation of the surplus of wages. Saint Monday became associated with the lowest forms of labouring people's entertainment: cock fighting and pugilism were common on Monday afternoons up to the 1830s.<sup>51</sup>

From the 1840s to the 1860s the tradition of Saint Monday was maintained against the emerging ethos of rational recreation. It was against this background that the Journeyman Engineer, Thomas Wright, viewed the brass band movement, not, as many Victorians viewed music, as one of the finest rational recreations, that improved the morals and soul, but as a reflection of earlier, rougher labouring traditions. Indeed, in Wright's opinion, the brass band became a vehicle that led respectable men away from the family unit of home, wife and child, into drinking and the resultant poverty that created.

---

50 George Davis, *Saint Monday; or Scenes from a Low Life* (Birmingham, 1790), pp. 7-8, cited in, Reid, "The Decline of Saint Monday 1766-1866", p. 78. (The situation was never clear cut, as it is probable that some putting out work was done on Mondays as "reckoning time" was late on Saturday and this too would encourage a day out of work.)

51 Reid, "The Decline of Saint Monday", p. 79.

In 1870 Wright wrote a sketch called *Willie Tyson's Turkey*.<sup>52</sup> It was the story of a worker who had, 'good-looks, good-humour and a nice-manner.' Willie was a good singer and in general a good musician. With these skills 'he was voted good company and much sought after.' Before Willie got married, he belonged to a choral society where, even though other members were in better positions than he was, they considered him good company and a valuable asset. The choir members hosted many social events, and this is where Willie met and courted his future wife, but also where he liked to socialise with a drink. Willie's fiancée thought that every young man needed to enjoy himself, and that after they were married he would not drink so much. However, after getting married, they did not attend so many parties, and Willie craved a drink, so he began going to the pub. 'He was already beginning to be spoken of as what among working men is styled a "lushington".' Some ten months later, the factory where Willie worked started a brass band, which he joined. 'Now, a workman's band was a very good thing in a general way; but to a man inclined to drink, it often afforded both excuse and opportunity for drinking,' Wright explained. The band proved a snare to Willie, as they often celebrated Saint Monday, together with other outings, and the drinking that accompanied them, Willie started to have days off work. Willie lost his job, spent all his wife's money, and they had to pawn all their belongings. His reputation as a drunkard meant he could not find a job, 'until the once bright little home became shabby and bare and comfortless.'<sup>53</sup>

---

52 Thomas Wright, *The Journeyman Engineer*, "Willie Tyson's Turkey", *Leisure Hour*, 991 (24 December, 1870), pp. 824-829. All further points about Willie Tyson come from this article.

53 Wright, "Willie Tyson's Turkey", p. 829.



## **Extending Social Networks and Social Roles**

Wright's tale was cautionary. Wright was reinforcing a view of alcohol held by other advocates of rational recreation and social improvement, most notably the temperance movement. As explored in chapter four, the pub was a social centre that hosted many communal activities. The pub and the bandroom were social spaces that encouraged, developed and created nuanced relationships between bandsmen, their friends, their wives and sweethearts and the wider community. Brass bands affirmed the inn's place in their traditions by using them for their annual suppers, which were opportunities to bring together families and other supporters to celebrate the year's achievements. The annual bonding of the supper was where the bands reaffirmed their traditions, rules, rituals, and customs. Reported in the press such events assured their identity within the milieu of community life. Through these events the masculinity of bandsmen was moving from the exclusively masculine and homosocial environment, where bandsmen assessed each other, to communal spaces that emphasised the social networks the bandsmen relied on for fundraising. As such these spaces became more respectable and moved towards masculinity found in courtship and domesticity. Wright's negative view of the band, as encouraging drunkenness, was not therefore sufficiently nuanced.

An example of these rituals can be seen when Bacup Band held their annual supper at the New Inn, Bacup, in the Rossendale Valley in 1870. The bandmaster and the trainer were honoured, their skills as mentor and trainer supported by the prizes that the band had won under their leadership.

Photographs of other band members showed that the band's success was a group effort and, finally, they paid tribute to deceased bandsmen. The respect shown to the dead bandsmen highlighted the continuation of musical traditions.

The *Bacup Times* reported that:

The occasion being graced with the presence of all members of the band; with their wives, sweethearts and several friends. The room was very tastefully decorated for the occasion. In the centre of the table, at the higher end of the room, stood the beautiful gilt marble time piece, presented to John Lord, Bandmaster [...]. The table was adorned with a variety of prize instruments [...]. Above the table, and suspended against the wall, was the splendid drum won ... at Belle Vue, in 1869, it was adorned with banners etc. In front of the drum was suspended an excellent life-size photograph of the old and respected tutor of the band, George Ellis [...]. Amongst other decorations were mottoes, banners ..., photographs of members of the band, intermixed with evergreens. In one corner of the room a mourning card was suspended, bearing the following inscription: 'In memory of our deceased friends', over which hung the instruments which belonged to those friends, whose services were so highly prized; and who were so feelingly remembered after death.<sup>54</sup>

Bandsmen were heavily reliant upon a network of women who were as enthusiastic about running the band as they were. It is to these women I turn to highlight more subtle gendered relationships in the life of the bandsman. Women had been organising themselves into significant groups for political change in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Jon Lawrence highlights the prominent role of The Women's Labour League and the Cooperative Women's Guild had in the support of the 1913 'bottom dog' London dock strikes, by organising food aid and rudimentary health care.<sup>55</sup> On the right, the Primrose League believed it had a special mission to defend the family, and in particular

---

<sup>54</sup> *Bacup Times* (5 September, 1870).

<sup>55</sup> Jon Lawrence, *Speaking for the People Party, Language and Popular Politics in England, 1867-1914* (Cambridge, 1998), p. 157.

working-class families, from the unwarranted intrusions of an increasingly interventionist state. They formed in 1883 as the Conservative Party's attempts to democratise the party by broadening its base of support and reforming its organisation.<sup>56</sup> Significantly they encouraged the involvement of women. It is now accepted that, together with its counterpart, the Women's Liberal Federation, they led the way for women to become involved in party politics when direct routes were closed.

The Primrose League believed that the working-class man was the head of his household that his home was his castle and he had the right to a comfortable and secure home. Such language was engaging with gender discourses of the time. The emphasis, however, changed from defending the homosocial environments of the pub and club to protecting the domestic idyll and the security, and respectability, of family life.

Therefore, the strong role of women in these political organisations gave women the ability to form organisational groups in a masculine environment. Within these groups, notable roles were organisation and fundraising. Not only did bands' ladies' committees organise and fundraise but also they changed the nature of masculinity by engaging with the stronghold of brass band masculinity: the contest. The arenas where bandsmen gathered were no longer wholly homosocial but became spaces where, through women's influence, the domestic, and thereby respectable, notion of the working-class man began to encroach on the rougher masculine space. Anna Clark has argued that it was the gendered construction of manhood and womanhood in the social arena that

---

<sup>56</sup> Chris Cook, *The Routledge Companion to Britain in the Nineteenth Century, 1815-1914* (Abingdon, 2005), p. 301.

constructed an analysis of class.<sup>57</sup> Therefore, as women entered the homosocial sphere of bandsmen their masculinity contributed to an overall class identity.

Accounts of ladies' committees are sparse, yet such records are significant. One of the first accounts of women organising themselves into a group dedicated to helping the band was in the industrial north, when the Ladies' Committee of Upper Slaithwaite Brass Band arranged a cricket match between themselves and the Ladies' Committee of Slaithwaite Cricket Club, where, during and after the match, the band supplied music, there was a tea, and dancing carried on late into the night.<sup>58</sup> Brass bands came with a wide range of expenses and raising money was always one of the main activities for bands. The *Brass Band News* recognised women as being efficient at selling tickets to raise funds. In a prescriptive role defined by custom and acceptance, they constructed a space for an ancillary role that became a powerful way that women could contribute to the success of a band. The periodical wrote:

Ask the ladies to organise a tea, and they will give what they can, and beg borrow or steal (figuratively speaking) all the rest. Moreover, they can sell tickets when a man would have no chance. A grocer in a Lancashire village once told us that in one of these ladies teas he gave a ham towards the feed, and then the lady he gave it to asked him to take half-a-dozen tickets, although she knew he could not go. Get the ladies interested in the band, and in what it wants and half the battle is over. Mr H. Clegg of Birstall Old Band [in the West Riding of Yorkshire] mentions their own band in point, he says, "the ladies gave a tea [...] and the funds benefited by about £5."<sup>59</sup>

In September, 1901, Bacup Change Band, in Lancashire's Rossendale Valley, held a 'British Empire Bazaar'. The *Rossendale Free Press* reported that 'the

---

57 Anna Clark, *The Struggle for the Breeches, Gender and the Making of the British Working Class* (London, 1995), p. 2.

58 *Huddersfield Daily Chronicle* (30 August, 1899).

59 *Brass Band News* (1 December, 1901), p. 4.

object of [the bazaar was] to raise about £200 with which to pay for uniforms, and to form a nucleus for tuition and instruments.<sup>60</sup> The bazaar stalls, of which there were at least eleven, according to the *Rossendale Free Press*, 'were laden with a variety of useful and fancy goods, tastefully arranged.'<sup>61</sup> These fundraising committees demonstrated the extent of the support shown by the wives, partners and female relatives of the band members. These committees were a formal structure that represented the band outside musical performance. Ladies' committees became essential in negotiating, arranging and supporting ways of raising finance for bands.

In 1914, for example, the Ladies' Committee of Goodshaw Brass Band started a chocolate club, which had 2,000 members. One commentator noted that the fortunes of Goodshaw Band were getting better, he wrote, 'he thought it was high time they did, and he understood the opposite sex were the cause of the upheaval.'<sup>62</sup> Women, as *The Cornet* and the *British Bandsman* illustrated, could bring the band to the attention of the public in places to which bandsmen could not, or, as the *Cornet* pointed out, would not want to have access.<sup>63</sup>

It was clear women were an important element in the social networks of brass bands, so much so they had become the subject of columns in the *British Bandsman*, highlighting the difference in gender roles in bands at this point in history. In 1914, the *British Bandsman* featured a column called 'A Little Gossip: written by a bandsman's wife.' It was a fictional column written in a humorous style but it shows the importance of bands' support networks. Reflecting the

---

60 *Rossendale Free Press* (28 September, 1901).

61 *Rossendale Free Press* (28 September, 1901).

62 *British Bandsman* (14 February, 1914), p. 131.

63 *Cornet* (14 January, 1899), p. 4.

needs of Bacup Change Brass Band, and others, the importance for these women was to raise funds for instruments. The character, Mrs Quickstep, said:

The band got a new set of instruments, and like everything else they could not pay for them [...]. The members suggested they get up a bazaar [...]. Twenty women promised to do all they could to make the bazaar a success. The things we made would have stocked the Co-operative store: mats, carpets shirts, blouses, fancy cushions, tea cosies [...] I couldn't tell you one quarter of the work we did.<sup>64</sup>

Moreover, what emerged was that some women were not content with their roles as fundraisers but wanted more recognition as organisers. In 1914, in *A Little Gossip*, Mr Jones read aloud to his wife from a newspaper report that featured him being such a fine band secretary, saying he was, 'a born leader, a remarkable organiser, and was one who was untiring in his efforts on behalf of the band.'<sup>65</sup> Mrs Jones said to her husband that, 'it's a good job for you that I'm not [in the band], or I'd let them in for a peep behind the scenes.' When he asked what she meant Mrs Jones said:

I mean those who think you do all the work. How long would you keep the position if I didn't help you? You'd often be in arrears in your work, if you had to do it yourself. Who sold the most tickets for your concert? Who made the most articles for the bazaar? Who does all the work when you show your hospitality to the "roamers" who come here? Who mends the uniforms damaged by careless bandsmen? [Raising her voice] Who takes care of the instruments when bandsmen leave the band? Who canvassed the women-folk when you wanted their help? Who did the cooking for the band supper? Not the Secretary? Oh no. He gets all the honour but where would he be without his wife?

The essential function of the brass band movement was to perform music and it was the band contest that was prominent in the region. Naturally, contests attracted elements of the respectable and the rough. In other words all of

---

<sup>64</sup> *British Bandsman* (17 January, 1914), p. 14.

<sup>65</sup> *British Bandsman* (23 May, 1914), p. 460. All material regarding Mr and Mrs Jones comes from this page.

community life was concentrated in one relatively small space. This was illustrated by one trombone player's experience with Shipley band after a contest in 1882, when his trombone was stolen. Indeed, these were places not just for musical competition but where the bands' larger social networks began. The band wrote to the journal, the *Yorkshireman*, saying:

One of our band chaps got fresh on Saturday night, and while he wor doing a bit of sly courting, he put his trombone on a wall, and a chap wor peeping, and when he wor telling woman how hard he loved her, this other chap ran off with his play. Please warn all pop shops not to pop it.<sup>66</sup>

This mixed-sex environment meant that the bandsman moved away from purely homosocial networks and, as we have seen, became reliant on partners for support. It was inevitable that these social networks would weaken the homosocial dominance of the bands' setting. We can accept that on practice nights the bandroom remained a homosocial space. It was, however, the contest as a bastion of masculinity that was changing. By 1914 the contest space was being encroached upon by women who were expecting to be there.

In 1914 the fictitious Mrs Quickstep and Mrs Newman felt the need to speak out about the male-dominated contests. What is shown was that the contest was not only a homosocial space but also a space that was defended by men. In a time when gender roles were changing, the brass band movement saw working men cling to traditional spaces where masculinity thrived. Mrs Quickstep said:

Women are not wanted at brass band contests; at least, that's how I felt about it. There were only about a dozen women in the hall, and every one of them looked

---

66 *Yorkshireman*, 113/268 (7 January, 1882), p. 1.

uncomfortable. When I went in several men stared at me as though I was in the wrong place, and although I felt as a fish out of water, I intended to hear the contest through.<sup>67</sup>

Mrs Newman replied:

It seems strange they don't encourage women to go. It's about the only musical organisation that squeezes us out[...]. All other forms of art and amusement give us a welcome, but bandsmen seem so self-centred, they have no time to give a thought to women folk[...]. Some men seem to think the only possible way to be a good bandsman is to neglect home and everything else. If they would visit the free libraries more often and give the pubs a miss, now and then, it would do them the power of good.<sup>68</sup>

One bandsman wrote to the *British Bandsman* saying: "Missus" had been spouting again, now she wants to go to band contests - the very idea! Why the bandroom and the contest field were the only places on earth where a bandsman is comparatively safe from feminine interference.'<sup>69</sup> The reply from the Bandsman's Parliament in the *British Bandsman* sympathised. The reply revealed that bands had become not only reliant on networks of women but this reliance could improve the band movement's status in the eyes of the world.<sup>70</sup> What was important was that the bandsmen were seen to be moving away from being rough working-class men. Hence, the editorial comment of the *British Bandsman*, and the beliefs of bandsmen's peers, also strengthened the notion of the working-class man as at their best when under the influence of the wider social networks, which meant moderation, respectability and a level of sobriety.

They wrote:

The member for Queensbury thought the honourable member was taking an extreme view on the matter. There was one thing he would always give the ladies credit for. He

---

<sup>67</sup> *British Bandsman* (28 February, 1914), p. 178.

<sup>68</sup> *British Bandsman* (28 February, 1914), p. 178.

<sup>69</sup> *British Bandsman* (7 March, 1914), p. 206.

<sup>70</sup> The Bandsman's Parliament was an occasional column that ran in the *British Bandsman* from 1912 onwards. It was a space where bandsmen could write in to a group of experts asking questions about all aspects of brass band life.



thought they were able to go to a contest and keep right in their heads, and that's what a lot of band chaps couldn't do. He thought they would keep sober, and their husbands too, probably [...]. He thought their influence would refine us, and some of us could do with it, and be the means of elevating our social status in the eyes of the world.<sup>71</sup>

## **From Novice to Responsible Bandsman**

Bandsmen became reliant upon the networks of their wives and sweethearts to organise events that not only supported the bands financially but also strengthened the bands' social networks. Fairs, bazaars, lunches and suppers were not additions to the life of the bands but an essential part of it.

Consequently, domesticity, and the social networks that grew from the domestic sphere, was equal to the homosocial networks developed in the inns and bandrooms. Men could still have independence, most often acted out in the bandroom, however, joint ventures, carried out in public, now implied respectability and domesticity. Willie Jeffrey, for example, was a flugel horn player with Black Dyke Mills Band. In spite of the excitement and glamour of the American tour Jeffrey only wanted to get home; he wrote in his diary:

At last, the great American tour is over, and in looking back, I can say we have seen and learnt some wonderful things. It has been a tour full of interest, a tour of education and experience which could never possibly been got in any other way, still I for one am glad that it is now over, and that we have all been spared to return to those at home we hold so dear.<sup>72</sup>

When a bandsman entered the brass band he entered a social network that supported musical performance. The bandsman reflected the experience of the

---

<sup>71</sup> *British Bandsman* (7 March, 1914), p. 206.

<sup>72</sup> Queensbury Historical Society, *1906 Diary of Willie Jeffrey*, cited in John H. Clay, *Black Dyke: An Inside Story* (Stockport), p. 49.

majority of working-class men. Firstly, the bandsmen had the ability to support his independence through a number of musical money-making avenues. The income was unreliable, yet, gave the ability to have 'spends', seen as essential in working-class masculine independence. Secondly, uniforms linked bandsmen with a masculinity that was influenced by middle-class values of sacrifice and duty. These values, passed to the working class by groups such as the Scouts and the Boys Brigade, conjoined bandsmen with national expectations of how a respectable man should behave. Thirdly, bandsmen used bandrooms as homosocial environments where they assessed each others' performance. Significantly, these practices continued older masculine working-class traditions found in the workplace. Finally, bandsmen came to rely upon women and social networks for the financial support of their band. In these ways the bandsmen were popular and visible expressions of working-class masculinity on the public stage. In the final analysis the bandsman was a respectable working-class man, who could be rough, but, on the whole, was a decent man. Something the *British Bandsman* wanted all bandsmen to be, when, in 1915, they wrote:

It is good to be a working man, whatever the sphere of work-manual or menial; but it is not good to be only a working man. Why not be a working man and a gentleman? That is the noblest combination on earth.<sup>73</sup>

---

<sup>73</sup> *British Bandsman* (1 January, 1915), p. 6.

## **‘Where the Brass Band is Beloved’:<sup>1</sup>**

### **Representations of Brass Band Contests, Brass Bands and Bandsmen in the Press, 1859-1914**

In 1898 a correspondent from Manchester wrote an article in the *Pall Mall Gazette* about brass bands in the north of England. The piece was called ‘Where the Brass Band is Beloved’. The prominent element in the article was the emphasis on the working-class membership of the bands and their followers. This was a theme reflected in music journals and periodicals that, like the *Pall Mall Gazette*, were largely published in London and supplied the music lover and general reader with a view of the musical working class.<sup>2</sup>

Importantly, for this reporter, the brass bands were fixed within the *culture* of their wider working-class audience. The author’s tone showed the difference between middle-class culture and working-class leisure. Middle-class Manchester had, for example, a culture of art galleries, literature and philosophical societies, together with musical pastimes such as the Hallé Orchestra’s Concerts, which were areas of display and status.<sup>3</sup> In parallel, for the northern working class, the brass band was where working people practiced music as an escape from the ennui of manual labour. Although playing in a brass band had close links with the workplace, as a pastime it was a release from

---

1 *Pall Mall Gazette* (2 September, 1898)

2 *The Retrospective Index to Music Periodicals (1766-1962)* < [www.ripm.org/titles\\_indexed.php5#ENGLISHUK](http://www.ripm.org/titles_indexed.php5#ENGLISHUK) > accessed 18 March, 2013, listed twenty music journals published in London from 1809 to 1913.

3 See H. M. Wach, ‘Culture and the Middle Classes: Popular Knowledge in Industrial Manchester’, *Journal of British Studies*, Vol. 27, No. 4 (October, 1988), pp. 375-404.

work, where bandsmen could gain cultural satisfaction from an identifiable working-class pursuit. Significantly, the writer noted that brass bands appealed to working people alone. The correspondent wrote:

The brass band is not the object of every man's adoration, nor its music of the kind which soothes every savage breast. But with the north-country man the love of the brass band is a passion [...]. These bands are composed of workmen, without exception, and workmen are their chief admirers. The workmen in these regions must have a hobby, if it is only dog-racing or rat-worrying; but when he makes music his hobby there is no limit to his ambition. Weber is not too exacting for him, nor Wagner too abstruse. Coal-grimed pitmen leave the mines and hurry away in their dirt to practice a selection from Mozart; and mill-workers leave the discordant roar of spinning and weaving sheds to study Gounod.<sup>4</sup>

To this point my research has examined brass bands' internal construction of identity. Reporting in band periodicals concentrated on the positive and moral effects of music on the working person. Any delinquent behaviour was criticised and admonished. The overwhelming concern of periodical editors was that the perceived roughness of working-class bandsmen would not taint the image of the brass band movement as a force for cultural and moral improvement in the lives of the working people. Yet, as I will show, even though the periodicals' official line was to admonish rough behaviour, they also accepted that bandsmen could be coarse and parodied this behaviour in fictional tales and sketches.

External reporting of bands in local and national newspapers, together with other periodicals that were either fully or partly dedicated to music, reinforced this view. External reporting, however, had a predisposition to concentrate on the rougher element of bandsmen's behaviour when it came to

---

<sup>4</sup> *Pall Mall Gazette* (2 September, 1898).

explain why brass bands were a working-class phenomenon. Hence, by comparing and contrasting the internal and external reportage on working-class bandsmen, I will show that bandsmen became a vehicle for commentators to understand the working class at leisure. In such reporting rougher working-class traits were brought to the fore in the examination of the bandsmen at leisure. This chapter examines these traits and how the press reported the working-class bandsman through how they socialised, reacted to competition results and interacted with other bands and supporters in the area.

To understand how newspapers and the musical press represented the working-class bandsmen to their readers, we need to understand the nature of the media. Were these representations accurate portrayals of the working class at leisure or was the reporting an amalgam of what the press expected working-class bandsmen should be like? People loved to read and write about music. This was reflected in journals - around two-hundred titles - that gave substantial column space to music.<sup>5</sup> As Leanne Langley has pointed out, 'they were organs of musical opinion; educational, promotional, or music trade mouthpieces; or simply commercial publishing ventures aimed at a more-or-less musical audience'.<sup>6</sup> From local newspapers to scholarly journals there were huge differences in quality of writing, regional bias and depth of knowledge. Journals were known to copy articles from each other without acknowledgement.<sup>7</sup> The press, for example, published articles verbatim from the band periodical the

---

5 Leanne Langley, 'The Musical Press In Nineteenth-Century England', *Notes*, 2nd Series, 46/3 (March, 1990), p. 583.

Also see Imogen Fellinger's list for Great Britain under 'Periodicals', in, *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, volume 14 (London, 1954), pp. 484-487.

6 Langley, 'The Musical Press In Nineteenth-Century England', p. 585.

7 Langley, 'The Musical Press In Nineteenth-Century England', p. 584.

*British Bandsman* during the first twenty years of its publication, from 1887 onwards.<sup>8</sup> Yet, the press remains an important site for exploring the representation of the membership of brass bands and their followers, which added to the construction of the idea of the working class in the media in this era.

Within both external media and the band movement's own publications the appeal lay in the detailed accounts of contests, contest homecomings and concerts, and other social events. As an archival resource, the press helps us shed light on aspects of working-class life largely overlooked by brass band historians. Langley recognised this that medium gives us, 'the possible revelation of a fact or opinion not recorded elsewhere.'<sup>9</sup> Therefore a chronological analysis of the material allows us to see the development of the reporting on one aspect of working-class leisure and cultural identity over time, often using material new to the historical record. What emerged from musical writing in this period were observations of the brass band movement from a middle-class position; the writing was quasi-anthropological in nature, resulting in studies of working-class music-making that engaged with, and complemented, observations of the changing nature of working-class leisure in this period.

For the press it was the brass band contest that became the central event in the representation of the emergence of working-class cultural identity. As I have shown, both locally and nationally, the contest was the most visible expression of brass band culture. Moreover, outside the immediate circle of family and friends, examined in chapter five, the contest brought the bands'

---

8 Alf Hailstone, *The British Bandsman Centenary Book, A Social History of Brass Bands* (Baldock, 1987), p. 95.

9 Langley, 'The Musical Press In Nineteenth-Century England', p. 583.

larger network of supporters together in an arena for scrutiny. Writing in 1907, the *British Bandsman* recognised that the musical competition was neither a new musical idea nor even a contemporary one, and cited the Welsh Eisteddfod as being ‘held from time immemorial, when in olden times, competitors entered just for the love of music, and the chance of winning the laurel leaf.’<sup>10</sup> The periodical remarked that by 1907 the musical competition had become a ‘musical revolution,’ since over 70,000 brass band, choral and other musical people would take part in musical competitions that year.<sup>11</sup> In 1911 *The Times* reported on that year’s Crystal Palace Contest, highlighting that competition was a key factor in musical development, writing, ‘the first brass bands in this country were established by some of the large employers of labour in Lancashire, who provided instruments and tuition. The innovation proved popular in the extreme [...]Public contests became common as a result of local rivalries.’<sup>12</sup> Russell and Elliot’s *The Brass Band Movement* (1936) examined the importance of the contest in centering attention on brass bands. The text showed the two sides of the band movement, not only the improving nature of music, but also the underlying roughness that was present at contests:

The contest is the thing that has brought the brass band into the greatest prominence and has been its greatest glory. That the spirit of competition is not without disadvantages almost goes without saying: it can be an enlivening and ennobling influence, but it can also degenerate into a mere pot-hunting scramble. Bands and their partisans have fought because they have considered the judges’ opinions of less value than their own appreciation of merit. On the whole, however, the disadvantages of a system that allows a minority of disgruntled egotists to cast discredit are outweighed by

---

10 *British Bandsman* (3 August, 1907), p. 501.

11 *British Bandsman* (3 August, 1907), p. 501.

12 *The Times* (30 September, 1911).

the benefits accrued from patient hard work and arduous practice in a genuine spirit of emulation by most bands.<sup>13</sup>

In external and internal reporting the brass band contest was frequently compared with sporting events, especially football's major competitions, likening the enthusiasm and large attendance to a championship match. In 1898, the *Pall Mall Gazette* showed how easy it was for the reporter to link brass bands and sport, writing that:

There is a band contest season, just as there is a football season; there is a band public just as there is a football public, as enthusiastic, opinionated, and observant. That season is now at its height, and is about to culminate in the great contest by which the champion amateur brass band of the year is chosen. This is more than an incident in north-country life: it is an event of vast moment. It excites as much excitement as an English Cup Tie, and if any matter takes as deep hold of the public mind of Lancashire as a football match it is indeed important.<sup>14</sup>

In 1899, the editors of *Wright and Round's Amateur Band Teacher's Guide and Bandsman's Adviser* expanded this theme explaining that competition was a national trait acquired at birth, found in empire building, industry, music and sport. They wrote:

Competition is born in an Englishman, whether it is building up the greatest empire, sinking the deepest mine, or singing the best song. Of course, he does not always succeed, but he never gives it up. Thus it happened, that when the village bands pleased the villagers the villagers praised them, and boasted they were better than any other. In this way band contests originated [...]. On average some 200 band contests take place annually in the United Kingdom, and they are the very best means of developing and retaining a standard of good playing, just as cricket matches keep up the standard of good cricket. Not only do they who take part in either benefit by the rivalry, but all who listen and watch are having a grand object lesson.<sup>15</sup>

---

13 John F. Russell and J.F. Elliot, *The Brass Band Movement* (London, 1936), p. 77.

14 *Pall Mall Gazette* (2 September, 1898).

15 *Wright and Round's Amateur Band Teacher's Guide and Bandsman's Adviser* (Liverpool, 1899), p. 2.



Writing in 1901, *Good Words* reported that ‘brass band contests evoked white-heat enthusiasm in local people; they were important factors in the social life of the people, thousands of people took the keenest interest in them.’<sup>16</sup>

Significantly, the author, T. W. Wilkinson, noticed that the audience ‘follow the playing with intelligent approval or censure according to its quality; and as a successful body of musicians, on returning home, receives an ovation similar to that accorded to the winners of a football cup.’<sup>17</sup> In 1907 the *British Bandsman* also pointed out that this simile reflected a national trait for competition, writing, ‘we are a sporting people, and whether in art or athletics the contesting spirit is an enormous incentive to effort.’<sup>18</sup> The growth of football, together with other sports, was synchronous with the band competition so it was natural for reporters to compare sporting crowds with brass band crowds. In other words, as an emerging phenomenon, reporters who observed band contests searched and found symmetry in, and validation of their reporting, from other popular working-class leisure pursuits.

By the 1870s, a time when brass band contests had become established both regionally and nationally, newspaper reading had become firmly established in the provinces, creating huge interest in local journalism.<sup>19</sup> As Lucy Brown noticed, ‘the reading of newspapers became central to the daily routine, becoming part of the ‘normal furniture of life for all classes.’<sup>20</sup> This print culture that was constructed from the brass band movement’s own periodicals, local and

---

16 T.W. Wilkinson, “Brass Band Contests”, *Good Words*, 42 (December, 1901), p. 593.

17 Wilkinson, “Brass Band Contests”, p. 593.

18 *British Bandsman* (3 August, 1907), p. 501.

19 Richard D. Altick, *The English Common Reader* (Chicago, 1957), p. 356.

20 Lucy Brown, *Victorian News and Newspapers* (Oxford, 1985), p. 273.

national newspapers and the wider musical press became vital to the building of musical communities where the brass band flourished.

The local press was complicit in creating local heroes. The press would often lionise a local sporting team or sports person who had been successful. Hence, when a local brass band was successful in a contest, the writing mirrored this lionisation of sporting success. The choice of stories, the position taken and the language used, created legends about people and places. When the text is approached from this perspective an array of ideas about space, place and region emerge. As Jeff Hill has argued, 'the press is not just a passive reflector of local life and thought, but an active source in creating local feeling.'<sup>21</sup>

As with sport, supporting a band was, 'an expression of a town identity, an association with others from the town that asserted a collective geographical allegiance.'<sup>22</sup> The band contest gave a sense of class consistency that was expressed through the culture of the band contest. The history of the brass band contest is well documented elsewhere.<sup>23</sup> Local band contests were popular from the 1840s onwards, often attracting crowds in their thousands.

Comparison with sport not only helped the press understand and interpret the brass band contests in contemporary populist terms but it also helped commentators understand its attraction to the working people that followed them. Regional identity tended to be working-class specific, emerging from people who spoke the dialect and engaged in local custom.<sup>24</sup> We can see that, even though

---

21 Jeff Hill, 'Rite of Spring': Cup Finals and Community in the North of England', in Jeff Hill and Jack Williams (Eds.) *Sport and Identity in the North of England* (Keele, 1996), p. 86.

22 Jack Williams, 'One Could Literally Have Walked On The Heads of The People Congregated There:' Sport, the Town and Identity, from, Keith Laybourn (Ed.), *Social Conditions Status and Community, 1860-c.1920*. p.123.

23 See Arthur R. Taylor, *Brass Bands* (London, 1977).

24 Paul Ward, *Britishness Since 1870* (London, 2004), p. 68.

brass bands had developed their own traditions and customs, they became linked in the press with the wider working class because bandsmen and band supporters embodied many traits of working-class life. Through this reporting they became a distinct part of working-class life.

Large numbers of people travelled from their towns and villages by train to support their bands. By 1850 Wales, Scotland, the north, the midlands, and the east of England, Devon and Cornwall, together with the south coast of England were all linked by rail with London.<sup>25</sup> A fully-formed railway network helped the brass band movement grow and become popular. The railways brought large numbers of working-class people together, magnifying the rituals, habits and customs of the working class. Rail travel gave thousands of band supporters' mobility within the north and beyond. A clear example of this mobility was when a large proportion of east Lancashire's Rossendale Valley travelled to the 1857 Belle Vue Contest to support Bacup Band. The trains stopped at each station along the Rossendale Valley and took on significant numbers of passengers.

Isaac Leach wrote:

The excitement of the neighbourhood was intense, and for days before the contest the fate of the band at Belle Vue was almost the sole topic of conversation. The practice of the band in the mill yard at Broudclough, on the Sunday previous to the fateful day, was attended by thousands of persons. On the morning of the contest, the Belle Vue excursions from Bacup were packed with people, and most of the mills were obliged to stop. Two special trains were run, the local bookings being as follows: Bacup 1093, Stacksteads 200, Newchurch 519, and Rawtenstall 323.<sup>26</sup>

Hugh Cunningham argues that 'brass band contests [...] were possible only because of cheap rail fares; by 1888 there were 50 excursion trains for the Belle

---

<sup>25</sup> Charles Moore, *The Industrial Age: Economy and Society in Britain, 1750-1995* (London, 1997), p. 419.

<sup>26</sup> Duncan Bythell, *Water, A Village Band 1866-1991* (Water Band, Rossendale, Lancashire, 1991), pp. 6-7.

Vue contest in Manchester.’<sup>27</sup> It is perhaps the journal, the *Yorkshireman* that has the last word to say on the mobility that brass bands gained from the railway. As with many working-class excursions developing in the railway age a ‘day trip’ was a festive event, a holiday that should be enjoyed, the train journey itself being part of the day’s festivities. An observer commented on a contest train passing by in 1878, they wrote:

I was at a railway station the other day as a festive train passed through. A brass band occupied one of the carriages, and the trombonist, not having room for his motions inside performed the sliding operations of his instrument out of the window. I never saw an instrumentalist so “played out” before.<sup>28</sup>

In this way the brass band contest came to the attention of commentators who had an interest in the lives of the working class. One example appeared in November 1859, in the journal *All Year Round*, called, ‘Musical Prize Fight’, which was written by John Hollingshead, a theatre impresario working with Gilbert and Sullivan. He was also a London journalist under the tutelage of Charles Dickens,<sup>29</sup> and as such, the piece is attributed to Dickens.<sup>30</sup> The writing resonated with the cultural identity of working-class residents who lived around Redcar, a place, Hollingshead thought, that few London frequenters of spas and watering places would know. The north, he argued, was populated by a ‘race’ apart. He described the inhabitants of part of the north as clannish and self-reliant. They lived and married amongst themselves, and presented the high cheekbones, and hard features, which generally marked the Yorkshire race.

---

27 Hugh Cunningham, *Leisure in the Industrial Revolution*, (London, 1980), p.159.

28 *Yorkshireman*, Volume 16, No. 126 (14 December, 1878), p. 371.

29 Bob Nicholson, ‘Musical Prize Fight’, < <http://www.digitalvictorianist.com/2014/02/musical-prize-fight/>> accessed 7 April, 2014.

30 John Hollingshead, Charles Dickens, (attributed), ‘Musical Prize Fight,’ *All the Year Round*, (12 November, 1859), pp. 65-68. (All quotes about the Redcar Competition are from this article.)

Hollingshead's attention fixed on a 'Grand Village Band Contest,' being held in Lofthouse, halfway between Redcar and Whitby. While the area is not in the Southern Pennines, the analysis of this piece is justifiable because Hollingshead's writing was a model of the type of reporting that became widespread. The habits and customs of the working class were being commented on and observed in a quasi-anthropological way.

Hollingshead first encountered a brass band in the taproom of The Golden Lion Public House, 'very busily engaging in the Lofthouse rum and ale: hanging up by the hooks from the ceiling, amongst many bundles of dried winter herbs, were several cornopeans to be used in the harmonious fight.' He noticed the habit of every band to play a march when approaching the Golden Lion, forming a circle, and finishing off with a defiant tune to say that we are here, 'beat that if you can.' They would retire to one of the drinking rooms, 'where the landlord gazed upon them with a silent but fatherly interest, having more regard to what they drank, than to what they played.' Hollingshead noticed the attention that the spectators gave the bands. 'The whole village [...] was quite willing to stand still, with its hands in its pockets, and give itself up to gazing at everything and everybody.' He noticed that music was a rational recreation and civilising influence, not only for musicians but also on the bands' supporters:

It was a hopeful sight for those who travel through the moorland district in the constant fear that some ruffian will 'fettle their mouths with a brick.' I do not pretend to say, that because Ah, ehe la morte! is blown upon a Yorkshire trumpet, fighting is altogether a stranger to Yorkshire fists, but I think that the man who conducts the melodies of Bellini, although in a crimson waistcoat and corduroys, is not likely to bite off his neighbour's ear,

or to gouge out his neighbour's eye, and is very likely to have a humanising influence on some of his less cultivated brethren, besides<sup>31</sup>.

Nevertheless, contest results, he observed, still roused 'cheers and groans [that] were sufficiently loud and antagonistic to warrant the presence of police officers, who had come from every village within twenty miles.' Finally, he saw the carnivalesque nature of the brass band contest:

The final musical assault of the day was the triumphal return of the five bands, in their adjudged excellence, to the devoted, and expectant, Golden Lion, where all the dirty glasses and mugs of the morning had been washed by the afternoon, and where fresh barrels of ale were set under groaning machines to satisfy alike the demands of the victor and the vanquished. The noise that these enraged and delighted musicians made, as they marched into the village, all playing at once, and all playing different tunes, amidst the barking of dogs, the cheering of friends, and the groaning of enemies, can only be compared to Bartholomew Fair in its palmist days, when every showman was beating his gong, and declaring that he alone was the possessor of the original spotted boy.<sup>32</sup>

Such events were duplicated throughout the manufacturing districts in an environment where labouring people were in the majority, both in the bands and in the audience. Reporting on a Yorkshire band contest, at Easter 1901, for example, the *Musical Standard* reinforced the points that Hollingshead had highlighted. The *Musical Standard* regularly featured reports on brass bands, and enjoyed a long publishing life in London from 1862 to 1933. Unlike many nineteenth-century music journals, the journal was not published by a music publisher or musical organisation, the editors having a negative view of such ventures. The journal was edited by its founder A. W. Hammond and Joseph Westbrook with the assistance of John Crowdy. The journal's rationale was to

---

31 Hollingshead, 'Musical Prize Fight', p. 67.'

32 Hollingshead 'Musical Prize Fight', p. 68.

offer a well-rounded picture of professional and amateur musical performance in Britain, the continent and North America. It offered musician articles for the church with advice on liturgy, organ music, the building and renovation of organs and church buildings, choral festivals and campanology. For the amateur there was a wide variety of subjects: reviews of operas, concerts and published music of various genres, as well as reviews of musical life in the provinces. The journal also gave a great deal of attention to choral festivals, the most important being the Three Choirs, the Norfolk and Norwich Triennial and the Birmingham Musical Festival, together with reviews from the continent and North America.<sup>33</sup> The northern brass band, then, fitted well within this style of reporting.

The *Musical Standard* decided that, 'the brass band is to country musicians what Paderdewski is to the ordinary run of piano players and to belong to one, and share in its glories is a great thing.'<sup>34</sup> It noticed the locality of regional contests, together with the habits of the working people who followed them: 'most of the bands came from colliery villages, and it was therefore not unnatural that the admirers should in many instances be accompanied by dogs.'<sup>35</sup> It also recognised the public house as a meeting place for discussion of the contest: 'there was naturally much consumption of ale over all these matters...it was something more than ludicrous to hear two colliers dressed in their Sunday best, and washed very cleanly, discussing Chopin as against Handel, over their

---

33 Diana Snigurowicz, *The Musical Standard* (London, 1862-1871, first series),

<[www.ripn.org/journal\\_info.php5ABB=MST](http://www.ripn.org/journal_info.php5ABB=MST)> accessed 18 March 2013.

34 'Makkin Mewsic,' *Musical Standard*, p.247. For similar reports also see 'Music in Lancashire (IV),' *Musical World*, 64/66 (13 November, 1886), p. 725; 'Music for the People- Brass Bands,' *Musical Standard*, 21/888 (6 August, 1881), p. 87; 'Brass Bands,' *Magazine of Music*, 9/7 (July, 1892), p. 127; 'Democratic Brass Bands', *Musical Standard*, 14/343 (28 July, 1900); 'Corni,' *Musical Standard*, (August 10, 1912), p. 95.

35 'Makkin Mewsic,' *Musical Standard*, p. 247.

pots.<sup>36</sup> The *Musical Standard* also noticed the carnival atmosphere of the event: 'the audience, however, appeared to be full of the spirit of Oliver Twist.'<sup>37</sup> The *Musical Standard*, therefore echoed the themes used by Hollingshead.

One of the first accounts of bandsmen drinking to excess comes from the *Accrington Times* in 1875. The paper featured a poem about the behaviour of bandsmen from Church Brass Band, near Accrington, after losing a contest at Rishton. Its tale of the whole band falling in the Leeds and Liverpool Canal because of drunkenness is probably an exaggeration but what the poem shows is that local contests were places where excess and working-class 'roughness' existed. Moreover, locally, these habits were a source of gentle humour and not condemnation, the poet wrote:

Church Band, nowt, Oh! What a fall! For men at top o'th' tree, un when they roll'd daon on to th' floor, my word there were a spree, they hardly knew, mon, wheer they were. Aw, yeard a fellow tell [...] as they were going home that neet, they tumbled in t'canal.<sup>38</sup>

It is unknown if the contest at Rishton had alcohol on sale at the contest site, but by 1886 the sale of alcohol was allowed on the contest field. On 14 April that year Rawtenstall Police Court granted J. W. Brown, of the Rams Head Hotel, a temporary license to sell alcohol at the football field where the Rawtenstall Brass Band Contest was being held on the 24 April.<sup>39</sup> As Peter Bailey has argued by the late nineteenth century, 'apart from certain gross exceptions, drink was becoming more of an incidental social lubricant and less of a total experience.'<sup>40</sup>

For the working-class bandsman the contest represented a space where they

---

36 'Makkin Mewsic' *Musical Standard*, p. 247.

37 'Makkin Mewsic,' *Musical Standard*, p. 248.

38 *Accrington Times* (5 June, 1875)

39 *Rossendale Free Press*, (17 April, 1886)

40 Peter Bailey, *Leisure and Class in Victorian England, Rational Recreation and the Contest for Control, 1830-1855* (Toronto, 1978), p. 174.



could not only carry out their hobby, but also take part in perceived rougher working-class behaviour if they wished. Indeed, as became clear in the press in the early years of the twentieth century, for bandsmen this was behaviour that they did not consider rough, but behaviour that was an accepted commonality amongst the majority of bandsmen on a day out. The sociability of drinking became a marker that defined the working-class nature of the contest day.

The noise and homosocial environment of the contest had the potential for encouraging low behaviour. In spite of the best efforts of the band periodicals bandsmen were working men and could still act roughly. This behaviour fell into three broad areas: drinking and drunkenness, disputing contest results, which could lead to threats of violence to supporters of other bands and the adjudicators, and swearing. These areas often all came together at one pivotal moment such as when the contest results were announced. The editorial tone of the brass band periodicals tried to distance bandsman from rougher elements of working-class life. Inevitably, however, because of the nature of its social networks, the brass band movement became highly visible extension of larger working-class leisure habits that could not remove itself from its own class, rough or not.

In February 1900, for example, the *Cornet* wrote about the importance of the contest in promoting the positive aspects of the brass band movement. Editorial comment such as this further established the way in which bands led to the incorporation of the working class into bourgeois norms, this time in response to external representations of the working-class bandsmen in the press. It was each bandsman's responsibility to see that they did not behave in a way that

could upset a wide range of middle-class benefactors. In other words each bandsman had an individual responsibility to represent not only the town but also the movement.

For the editor, the contest was the key area for promoting the brass band movement to middle-class observers. Moreover, it was the financial benefits that came from the sponsorship of people with significant disposable incomes that was important. Therefore, inevitably, the alcohol induced social side of the contest was viewed as a negative activity, they wrote:

This being a subject of importance to the whole "live" brass band fraternity, there is no need to apologise for laying a growl before the numerous readers of the "Cornet." There is urgent need for improvement in the manner most contests are carried out [...]. It is a fact that brass bands are placed at a low estimate by a majority of people occupying the best social positions, whose influence would be enough to guarantee the success of any band, and would undoubtedly be glad to subscribe to the funds. They are deterred, however, by the line of conduct adopted by many bandsmen in public, and especially on the contest field. It is no uncommon occurrence at band contests to find, after the decision, men who have drunk well, if not wisely, making all kind of insinuations against committees and adjudicators, and using language of the vilest description, because their favourite band has not been placed in the prize list. None will deny this, yet there are some that say, "Take no heed; they have had too much John Barleycorn, and are to be excused. No one not accept their opinions." Perhaps not, but this kind of thing drives away many people, and also tends to keep them; and their friends away from the next contest; besides, they are likely to withdraw their influence and support from the village or town band. As the means of improvement it is in the hands of the bandsmen themselves, it is to be hoped the season of 1900 will show that much of this tendency to lower the standard of brass bands has disappeared.<sup>41</sup>

Yet, on the same page, the band commentator 'Shoddythorpe' celebrated the many toasts and congenial company of the Batley Old Band's Annual Supper, writing, 'of all the happy evenings in my life this was the best. Batley Band can

---

41 *Cornet* (15 February, 1900), p. 4.

play, and they also know how to hold an annual supper'.<sup>42</sup> This dual reporting is both the strength and the irony of the band periodicals. The editorials clearly condemned what they perceived as low behaviour: yet, these social traits became celebrated in humorous and anecdotal sketches that reinforced the notion that bandsmen were working-class people who enjoyed drink as a social lubricant and on occasion to excess. Yet, making the writing humorous also meant that such behaviour was without threat. In the same month the *Cornet* featured the tale of 'Mungoe's' Christmas Adventures', in which Mungoe was visited by his friend, 'Billy Blowtop', who:

'ewst to play t'cornopean in t'band in t'owd days, when Aah used to play t'buzzoon [...]. We gav him a warm welcome, en after we'd hed a gooid meeal en tooisted wer knees[...] en tawked abaat awd times oover a glass ov toddy, we tewk a walk into t'taan. We called at two or three hasses, en Billy met a few owd friends, that he hedn't seen for many a year. Ov course we'd to hev a glass with 'em all, en ther wor soa much to talk abaat wol it wor turnin aght time afore we fairly knew wheer we wor.<sup>43</sup>

Two months later, the editorial voice of the *Cornet* was in a moralising tone again. The editorial condemned bandsmen when they drank, argued and made a great deal of comment over contest results, the rationale being that it would deter the people from subscribing to band funds. More importantly, such drunken behaviour would negate the positive work that the movement had achieved in bringing working-class musical performance to the fore. They wrote:

Bandsmen should learn to control their feelings, a great deal more than they are accustomed to do. There is not a bandsman I know (and I know a good many), who would like to be called "low" or "vulgar" and yet, to exhibit, so openly the uppermost feelings in one's mind, is nothing short of the essence of vulgarity. The natural consequence of these exhibitions of feelings, is that the gentry and upper class people

---

42 *Cornet* (15 February, 1900), p.4.

43 *Cornet* (15 February, 1900), p.3.

will have nothing to do with contests - not because they object to where bandsmen are - but because they are never safe to being a witness to one of these questionable scenes, which almost invariably take place at contests. No, if bandsmen only knew, it does not pay; and they are performing the peculiar feat of raising themselves with one hand, and knocking themselves down with the other.<sup>44</sup>

The brass band contest was an extension of older labouring-class traditions: as such the competition reflected communal holiday revelry. The middle-class dislike of bad behaviour at contests, and the suggestion of revulsion at this behaviour, indicated a clash of cultures. Hence, the band contest became an arena for working-class display. It was this traditional revelry that the editors of the brass band periodicals were fighting against. When the bands played in public it was a festive event, and, as such, bandsmen could not avoid mixing with the wider working class, who some commentators saw as rough and detrimental to the band movement. In *Wright and Round's Amateur Band Teacher's Guide and Bandsman's Adviser*, for example, the editor featured a letter from F. C. B., who wrote:

I have much to say in favour of our amateur bandsmen as musicians, and hope I may live to laud them as gentlemen. And why should they not be gentlemen? Of what value is the "divine art" to them if it does not refine their tastes, and subdue evil passions, and enkindle good passions? Next to hearing a band play well, I like to see a band behave well, and not indulge in rough horse-play and vulgar talk at every opportunity. Again nothing can be more fatal to a band's interest than for the members to make to familiar with the clowns that always crowd around them when fulfilling and engagement.<sup>45</sup>

Often held in wakes weeks, contests drew upon traditions that were common in northern manufacturing districts. Particularly tenacious in Lancashire the wakes

---

<sup>44</sup> *Cornet* (19 April 1900), p. 6.

<sup>45</sup> F. C. B., 'Appearance and Behaviour of Bandsmen', *Brass Band News* (N.D.), cited in, *Wright and Round's Amateur Band Teacher's Guide and Bandsman's Adviser* (Liverpool, 1889), p. 75.

week was the culmination of a full calendar of traditional celebrations. The wakes was originally a religious festival, held on the saint's day of the local church, which centred on the rush bearing festival.<sup>46</sup> This festival was part of the cycle of historical time. Individual and collective memory became essential in marking historical meaning and continuity.<sup>47</sup> The appreciation of brass band music, and its importance to local memory, depended upon a complex process of memory, recalling past events and experiences. Audiences did not enter an event that featured a brass band with an open mind but brought with them extensive musical and social experience. Much of the meaning of the event relied upon what happened in the past, the brass band taking on elements of older rituals.

The contests were days of carnival and holiday, mill owners often giving the towns the whole day off.<sup>48</sup> On the 16 August 1868, for example, the Bacup competition, in east Lancashire's Rossendale Valley, saw sixteen boys, doffers from Shepard's Mill, who were keen to outshine their rivals from Smith and Sons take part in the competition. As Chris Aspin has shown, they were 'dressed in fantastic colours, drawing a rush cart adorned with musical instruments and kitchen utensils.'<sup>49</sup> Boys pulled the rival cart 'wearing white stockings with knickerbocker trousers, secured at the knee by coloured ribbons, and they wore crowns of coloured paper.'<sup>50</sup> In this way Wakes walks were a visible continuation of rural festivals such as rush bearing. The cycle of brass band contests acted as arenas that embraced a history of events that celebrated the lives of working

---

46 Robert Poole, 'Lancashire Wakes Week', *History Today*, 34/8 (August 1984), pp. 22-23.

47 Peter Borsay, *A History of Leisure, The British Experience Since 1500* (Basingstoke, 2006), p. 208.

48 Chris Aspin, *The First Industrial Society, Lancashire, 1750-1850* (Preston, 1995), p. 229.

49 Aspin, *The First Industrial Society*, p. 229.

50 Aspin, *The First Industrial Society*, p. 229.

people.<sup>51</sup> The fair, the festival and the holiday became one under the auspices of the contest.

On 5 April, 1867, for example, Accrington hosted a contest that reinforced the carnival atmosphere, the contest becoming central to the day's events:

Yesterday the whole of the mills were stopped, and a general holiday observed by the work people, who being gaily dressed [...] gave an enlivening appearance for the town. The streets were crowded not only from this, but also from distant towns, the facilities offered by the railway companies, being an inducement for many to enjoy the musical treat. The array of stalls laden with confections, and the roundabouts showed that the pleasures of young England were attended to[...]. Abbey Street presented a very attractive and business like appearance, one side of the street being lined with stalls, the articles on which found ready purchasers in persons that thronged the street.<sup>52</sup>

In 1868, the day became even more carnivalesque. What was revealed was that nine years after Hollingshead's *Musical Prize Fight* the atmosphere of the that contest was exaggerated in subsequent contests. Hollingshead's reporting highlighted the transference of working-class culture from place to place in the Southern Pennines:

This year's exhibition had brought into the town visitors so numerous as to surpass the most sanguine anticipations, tradesmen made great preparations. The lovers of the marvellous too had ample opportunities of gratifying their tastes, for in Church Street, there were exhibitions of the most curious and rare freaks, that nature ever produced. At the top of Union Street, there was a boxing booth, featuring the thorough bulldog type of facial beauty [...]. Photographic galleries were present and were no mean attraction for the fair [...]. Blackburn Road was crowded with people from nine o'clock in the morning until noon, witnessing the arrival of the various bands, intending to take part in the days contest [...]. There were over twenty-thousand people on the contest field, and £478 was taken at the entrance.<sup>53</sup>

---

51 Borsay, *A History of Leisure*, p. 202.

52 *Accrington Times* (6 April, 1867).

53 *Accrington Times* (11 April, 1868).

As Hollingshead had pointed out, the police were present at band contests to control dissent and possible violence towards judges.<sup>54</sup> Adjudicators were well aware that they were under scrutiny by not only the bands but also the supporters in the audience, they were also well aware that the crowd could turn argumentative and even hostile when hearing an unpopular verdict. In 1896, the *Magazine of Music* found that the contest judge was as sanguine, sober and sophisticated as they imagined, in this 'chat with a judge' the *Magazine of Music* revealed the authority of adjudicators, but also, they also found that the audience could have the potential to argue. The reporter began with the judge's clear authority:

He sat in his tent, with a table well filled with papers and a closely marked score before him, while outside, preparations were busily going forward for the great contest....He was just the man I had pictured - tall, stalwart, with a clever-looking stern face; a man capable of weighing to a nicety the merits and capabilities of the various competitors, and whose decision no one would think it wise to question [...]. I enquired as to the success of brass bands in other parts of the country, and was informed they were invariably popular. "English people love a brass band," explained the judge...they are not always reliable critics, though, and it is no very uncommon experience for a judge in a competition like this to be told pretty plainly that his verdict is not the popular verdict.<sup>55</sup>

Disagreements over adjudicators' comments were common.<sup>56</sup> Sometimes they spilled over into threats of violence. A brass band contest, for example, was held on Keighley Cricket and Football Club's field, on the 30 May 1886. Around 10,000 people attended. The judge was Mr. E. Holland, bandmaster of the 1<sup>st</sup> Northampton Regiment. He gave first prize to Leeds Forge Band, second prize to Irwell Bank, third prize to Wyke Old, fourth prize to Wyke Temperance and fifth

---

54 John Hollingshead, attributed to Charles Dickens, *Musical Prize Fight*, p. 68.

55 'Brass Band Contests: A Chat With A Judge', *Magazine of Music* (October, 1896), p. 646.

56 *Rosendale Free Press* (1 May, 1886).

prize to Kingston Mills. He stated that there was only five marks difference between the first three prizes. Black Dyke Mills and Honley did not receive a prize:<sup>57</sup>

The judge's decision gave a good deal of dissatisfaction, and a most unseemly disturbance followed. Dike Band behaved in an unruly and even threatening manner. One man suggested that they should play the "*Dead March*", and this was no sooner said than several of the players struck up a dirge in front of the judge's tent. It was found necessary for three police constables to escort the judge to a cab in waiting, and then police-constable Newhill proceeded with him to the railway station. When the cab drove off there was mingled hooting and cheering, and one enthusiast threw a stone after the departing vehicle, but no damage was done. Arrived at the station, Mr. Holland had to wait several minutes for a train to Preston[...] and in the meantime some of the members of Black Dike and Honley bands had come on to the platform and these began to taunt and hoot again. Mr. Holland was afraid that bodily harm would be done to him [...] he was accompanied by a police constable as far as Skipton.<sup>58</sup>

The brass band contest day was a period of time when the working class attempted to challenge decisions made by people in authority, even though they had no impact on judges' decisions. As central features of the local holiday day the bands represented a temporary suspension of deference to authority; nevertheless, this was only brief, as figures of authority quickly re-established order. The editors of the band periodicals may well have been constant in their pleas for gentlemanly conduct, but when brass bands gathered together the joint force of the bandsmen and their supporters gave dissent a currency - however briefly - that was associated with groups of working-class people. We can see in the audience the notion of moral economy, whereby, as E. P. Thomson argued, that in the eighteenth century:

---

<sup>57</sup> *Manchester Times* (5 June, 1886).

<sup>58</sup> *Manchester Times* (5 June, 1886).



The men and women in the crowd were informed by the belief that they were defending traditional rights and customs; and, in general, they were supported by the wider consensus of the community. On occasion this popular consensus was endorsed by some measure of license afforded by the authorities. More commonly the consensus was so strong that it overrode motives of fear or deference.<sup>59</sup>

These events meant working people, through their support of the bands, had cultural autonomy. The bands' supporters, and the bandsmen's, displeasure at these results legitimized the culture of brass bands within the landscape of working-class leisure. Brass band contests were not the food riots of the eighteenth century that Thompson wrote about, nevertheless, grievances brought about by the actions of the crowd on the contest field highlighted what was expected of a judge within the social norms of the contest. The contest being the event of the day, any outrage against the moral assumptions of the crowd, which band should win, for example, was the occasion for direct action, from silence at the announcement of a result, to threats of violence.<sup>60</sup> Brass bands were central to festive events that had their roots in rural traditions; these traditions were part of the collective memory of the community. With the maturing of industrialisation, bands became a central point in continuing and celebrating these events.

### **The Bandsmen as Viewed by Other Working-Class People**

The work of John Hollingshead, the *Pall Mall Gazette* and other musical journals centred the bandsmen in a working-class environment visible from without. The

---

59 E. P. Thompson, 'The Moral Economy of the Crowd in the Eighteenth Century', *Past and Present*, Number 50 (February, 1971), p. 78.

60 Thompson, 'The Moral Economy of the Crowd', p. 79.

band and their supporters represented the working class in a broader civic environment. How did other local people view the bands? Were bandsmen seen as local heroes? The evidence suggests that local people did not usually see band members as different from normal working people. Jean Mills remembered seeing Bacup Band march through the town; she said that, they were all working lads from the factory.<sup>61</sup> The bands also used this same colloquial language when describing themselves. In September 1911, Helmshore Band's committee decided that they should advertise in the Post Office window for, 'lads', who wanted to play the cornet.<sup>62</sup> This language defined the class the bandsmen came from, and the class to which they wanted to appeal for their members.

One exception to this picture was the way that children perceived bandsmen. Some children saw band members as heroic figures, adding colour to the lives of the working class. As a child, the author, Ben Brierley remembered watching Hollinwood Band. He wrote, 'the uniform adopted by these musical gentlemen was a blue swallow-tail coat, with brass buttons, white trousers, and a black beaver with a yellow band. They were in our eyes princes who had condescended to come amongst poor people.'<sup>63</sup> He and his friends ran home afterwards and tried to form a band using whistles and cows' horns.<sup>64</sup> For some children, at least, brass bands were often role models, who were considered *outside* their class, they were perceived as gentlemen.

The brass band perpetuated its working-class association with activities outside music. Fundraising was something that every band did. In 1869, for

---

61 Arthur R. Taylor, *Labour and Love an Oral History of the Brass Band Movement* (Ashgate, 1983), p. 9.

62 Accrington Local Studies Library, *Helmshore Brass Band Minute Book* (13 September, 1911).

63 Ben Brierley, *Home Memories and Recollections* (Manchester, 1862), p. 17.

64 Brierley, *Home Memories*, pp. 17-19.

example, Westhoughton Old Band held a prize draw to raise money for uniforms. The prizes were a harmonium, a fat pig, a sack of flour, a cheese, an iron bedstead and a fat duck.<sup>65</sup> The prizes showed that value was placed on goods that could make working-class life easier, in short, food, leisure and rest. Protein-rich food was seen as essential in the working person's diet that sustained a person who arrived home at night after a day's manual labour. In this way these prizes enhanced the relationship between brass bands and the day-to-day working-class experience.

In 1910 Helmshore Brass Band, from east Lancashire's Rossendale Valley, held a prize draw for the July holidays. The first prize was a ten-day ticket to Blackpool with two-pound spending money. The second prize was a five-day ticket to Blackpool and one-pound spending money. The third prize was a day ticket and five-shilling spending money. There were also five other one day tickets.<sup>66</sup> These prizes associate the brass band with the northern working-class experience.<sup>67</sup> As a band from Lancashire the members of Helmshore Brass Band knew what would appeal to the local working people as prizes.

By offering these prizes the bands were confirming their social place in the community amongst other organisations from other social classes that offered prizes for fundraising. The bands did not consider any prizes that would appeal to the middle class; or rather just people with money, they knew the audience to which the band appealed, and the scope of that appeal. Despite wide gaps in the

---

65 *Westhoughton Old Band*, < [www.boltonrevisited.org.uk/a-whband.html](http://www.boltonrevisited.org.uk/a-whband.html)>, accessed, 26 February, 2010.

66 Accrington Local Studies Library, *Helmshore Brass Band Minute Book* (31 May, 1910).

67 For a full account of the working-class Blackpool experience see John K. Walton, *The Blackpool Landlady: A Social History* (Manchester, 1978) and, John K. Walton, *The British Seaside: Holidays and Resorts in the Twentieth Century* (Manchester, 2000).

internal class membership of bands, the activities of the bands showed that they understood that the audience to whom they appealed, and from which they came, was working class.

### **How Others See Us**

How did brass bands respond to external reporting that singled them out as being working class? The bands' own periodicals provide the best place to explore this question. In 1901, the *Cornet* was asking the question, 'How Others See Us?'<sup>68</sup> Regrettably in this column they do not cite the newspapers or periodicals who reported on the bands. The significance was that bands were collecting reporting from outside the brass band movement to show the band movement what other people thought of them. What was apparent was that 42 years after Hollingshead described the local brass band contest at Redcar the same themes were evident and were being transferred to the London brass band contest to describe bandsmen from the north. Firstly, there was the notion that the bands were all working people from the mills and factories, and on the whole they were. Hence, a reporter on the 1901 Crystal Palace Contest wrote:

The brass band contest is a function that on no account should be missed by the Londoner in search of excitement and novelty. Apart from the delight which it gives the sympathetic student of humanity to see thousands of hard working northerners, men of the pit and men of the mill steeped to the soul of melody, there is the spectacle of hundreds of huge instruments being borne bravely, hither and thither amongst the seething crowd all day long.<sup>69</sup>

---

68 *Cornet* (15 October, 1901), p.6.

69 *Cornet* (15 October, 1901), p.6.

Secondly, commentators were more than happy to point out that the supporters were not only educated in the style of music, but at the core of their identity were elements of a rougher type of working-class leisure and manual labour. The essence of this leisure was rooted in the whole working-class experience. One commentator, writing to the *Musical Standard*, in 1867, felt that choirs would be much better, and agreeable, than brass bands, mainly because brass players were, in their opinion, authors of their own fate. In a barely concealed attack on rough working-class behaviour the author felt that choral music would be a gentler form of competition. Being working class inevitably led them to the beer shop after playing. The author wrote:

“Brass Band Contests.” Would it not be far more agreeable, more social and far cheaper to organize choirs in our large business establishments. Musical instruments are expensive; they are also very noisy – indeed, they are unbearable unless in a large building or in the open air. Brass bands have become a perfect nuisance of late years; blowing away with all their strength; they are always followed by some immense crowd, composed of an admixture of almost all grades of the lower society -“Tagrag and Bobtail.” The greatest objection to these noisy bands will be found in the demoralizing influence upon the members: practices are generally held in the public-house. The exhaustion in blowing a wind instrument for any length of time in the street naturally leads the members of a band to a beer shop, where they too frequently indulge to excess; eventually becoming worthless members of society, instead of finding their music a source of pleasure to them.<sup>70</sup>

Yet, what commentators expected from working people - to be rough and possibly violent - was in contrast to what they witnessed. The main comment was that working people were prepared to travel long distances to spend free time following a band. Essentially the social networks involved meant this was a day

---

<sup>70</sup> *Musical Standard*, Vol 7 No 175, (7 December, 1867), p. 359.

out when working-class identities were transferred to the southern stage, not only for the bands but for the audience as well:

When the bands are playing the "testpiece" the great audience, mostly from Yorkshire and Lancashire, or Wales, sits score in hand, following every note. Men of whom you would hesitate to ask your way, in a dark lane, sit listening for a fault of execution, in a selection from *The Martyr of Antioch*. They have come up, most of these musicians from the bowels of the earth, and lost a day's pay, and two days rest, simply for the sake of art. When I listened to a gigantic miner, roaring as gently as a sucking dove upon the bombourdon, I felt my cheeks tingle with shame at the remembrance that I once tried to play *Pop Goes the Weasel* on the mouth organ and failed.<sup>71</sup>

When the press referred to the communal group as 'they' or 'them', the bandsmen were the representation of the other, the anthropological, the not fully understood social phenomenon. As with Thomas Wright, the journeyman engineer, commentators defaulted to the rational recreation ethos when faced with the uncomfortable elements of working-class life that acted as the definition between respectable working-class leisure and the rougher elements that, by 1901, were fully formed in the working-class daytrip. One commentator wrote:

In these amateur bands composed of working men of the north, you have not only technical skill, you have the tenderness which is the soul of music. When you look at them, when you hear them talk, when you know amid what surroundings they pass their lives and earn their bread, you come to one conclusion. That conclusion is that of all the arts music must be the one that comes most naturally to the great mass. It would, I take it, be impossible to get a similar assemblage to show such technical skill and perfection of execution in painting or in sculpture, or even in poetry, which is the music of words.<sup>72</sup>

I need not overstate the rational recreation ethos here, as it was explored in chapter four. Nevertheless, much as commentators defaulted to sporting imagery to understand the populist appeal of the brass band movement, it lay as the

---

71 *Cornet* (15 October, 1901), p.6.

72 *Cornet* (15 October, 1901), p.6.

default setting for the reporting of brass bands when commentators felt uncomfortable, or even overwhelmed, with the rougher aspects of working-class life. Brass band journals celebrated the otherness of the working class. As we have seen the *Brass Band News*, the *British Bandsman* and the *Cornet* pointed out continually that bandsmen were working men.

It was the bands themselves that further reinforced their membership and the people they wished to appeal to for support. Fund-raising prizes, day trips and social events were all directed at the working-class community. Middle-class support was accepted from philanthropists, communities and industrialists. Nevertheless, this was part of a complex cross-class relationship.

As a result of these magazines and journals, which were largely published in London, bandsmen were seen as the epitome of the working-class autodidact. Underlying this image of respectable musicianship lay the potential for rough behaviour, often viewed by the press as prevalent amongst the bands' supporters. As the *Manchester Guardian* highlighted, at the Belle Vue Contest in 1893, 'each particular band had its party of friends, and the applause when a difficult passage was achieved was deafening.'<sup>73</sup> Yet, if others disturbed the concentration of the audience who followed the band, the *Pall Mall Gazette* was keen to point out a 'torrent of rude Lancashire [would be brought down] upon your head.'<sup>74</sup> These 'men who you would hesitate to ask the way in a dark lane', then, for the press, were undeniably people who were respectable, but had the potential for disorderly conduct. The London press held the belief that followers

---

<sup>73</sup> *Manchester Guardian* (5 September, 1893).

<sup>74</sup> *Pall Mall Gazette* (2 September, 1898).

of brass bands were working class and, as such, these people naturally followed other male working-class leisure pastimes, such as horseracing, dogs, gambling and drinking. Yet the brass band was the ideal pastime to confirm and embrace the idea that the working class could be educated and literate, but bands provided a highly visible field for working-class roughness and, on occasion, delinquency. In the final analysis, for the external reporters, in the London press, bandsmen were always the working class with all the prejudices and views of them being rough intact. Within these reports were the origins of the clichés of the brass band representing *northern* working-class culture. It is to this northern identity I turn in the next chapter.



## **The Brass Band and Perceptions of the North:**

### **Musical Constructions of Space, Place and Region**

In 1907, the popularity of the national brass band contest at London's Crystal Palace led the *Musical Herald* to reflect on two of the bands that were taking part in the contest. They were Wingates Temperance Brass Band, formed in 1873, near the north-west town of Westhoughton, in Lancashire, and Goodshaw Brass Band, formed in 1867, at Goodshawfold, in east Lancashire's Rossendale Valley, an author in the *Musical Herald* wrote:

Where is Wingates? Where is Goodshaw? You don't know. The same answer might be given regarding scores of villages whence bands came on Sept. 28<sup>th</sup> to the Crystal Palace [...]. We have had bands for a generation past coming out of the unknown and making their villages famous.<sup>1</sup>

Such questions, clearly aimed at a musical audience outside of the region, showed that the industrial north contained communities where brass bands flourished. This chapter explores how the bandsmen, and the brass bands of the Southern Pennines, influenced the construction of an idea of the north: the bandsmen, through their culture of brass bands, contributed to a clichéd perception of the north that flourished well before 1914. This chapter explores

---

<sup>1</sup> *Musical Herald* (1 November, 1907), p. 342.

how external reporting of musicianship and the social networks of bands came together to embody one larger musical north.

There were a significant number of 'crack' bands that came from the Southern Pennines and these bands were emulated by others. Yet this does not account fully for their distinctiveness, as other areas of the country had equally strong brass band traditions. It is undeniable that the Southern Pennines had a strong tradition of music-making and musical appreciation, but there was a great deal of activity in other areas of the country. By the late nineteenth century virtually every town and village in the country had at least one kind of amateur musical ensemble, and Dave Russell has argued that 'the brass band was perhaps the most pervasive of all.'<sup>2</sup> Alun Howkins, for example, discovered 148 bands in rural Oxfordshire alone that were active between 1840 and 1914.<sup>3</sup> Brass band periodicals reported on the activities of bands from almost every corner of the country. In August, 1907, for example, the *British Bandsman* had fourteen pages of 'notes' and 'news' columns of similar sizes from Yorkshire, the Western Borders, West Leeds, Doncaster, Wakefield, the Spenn Valley, Dinnington, East Anglia, Somerset, Lancashire, the Midland Counties and Wales.<sup>4</sup> These columns concentrated on how bands were preparing for contests, how they were fundraising for instruments and uniforms, the appointments of trainers and conductors and an assortment of reports on park concerts, fundraising concerts and charity concerts. As such, bands throughout the country

---

<sup>2</sup> David Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914: A Study of the Relationships between Music and Society* (PhD Thesis, University of York, 1979), p. 316. (In the south and west of England Russell points out that they are more accurately described as 'brass and reed' or 'military' bands.)

<sup>3</sup> Alun Howkins, 'Whitsuntide in Nineteenth-Century Oxfordshire' *History Workshop Pamphlet*, No 8 (1973), cited in Russell, *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District*, p. 316.

<sup>4</sup> *British Bandsman* (3 August, 1907), pp. 503-517.

had commonalities with bands from the Southern Pennines. What made Southern Pennine bands distinctive was not how they were different from other bands but how the press reported on them as representation of 'northernness'. Amongst the commonalities of national brass band activity it is how the 'crack' bands, and the bandsmen, of the Southern Pennines came to be a cultural representation of the industrial north that is of interest.

National studies of identity have been nuanced by regional studies. A number of studies explore sub-identities, including the north-south divide and the idea of the northern regionalism.<sup>5</sup> Stuart Rawnsley maintains that northern identities, in particular, northern working-class identities, carry a greater sense of collective identity than any other 'region' in the country.<sup>6</sup> The north expressed a sense of 'otherness' that became an object both of desire and ridicule.<sup>7</sup> The north, Rawnsley argues, 'is a reified landscape which encapsulates various rhetorical interpretations of the past and present, of classes and cultures.'<sup>8</sup> Edward Said's analysis of orientalism, based on an East-West divide, is relevant for a study of northern working-class cultural identity.<sup>9</sup> Orientalism, for Said, was about creating the other: constructing fictions and myths, expressing notions of

---

5 For example, Helen M. Jewell, *The North-South Divide: The Origins of Northern Consciousness in England* (Manchester, 1994); Stuart Rawnsley, 'Constructing 'The North': Space and a Sense of Place,' in, Neville Kirk (Ed.), *Northern Identities, Historical Interpretations of 'The North' and Northernness* (Aldershot, 2000), pp. 3-22; Dave Russell, *Looking North: Northern England and the National Imagination* (Manchester, 2004); Dave Russell, 'Culture and the formation of Northern English Identities from c.1850' in B. Lancaster, D. Newton, N. Vall (Eds.), *An Agenda for Regional History* (Newcastle-Upon-Tyne, 2007), pp. 271-288; C. Dellheim, 'Imagining England: Victorian Views of the North', *Northern History*, XXII (1986), pp. 216-230; J. Langton, 'The Industrial Revolution and the Regional Geography of England', *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 9 (1984), pp. 145-167.

6 Stuart Rawnsley, 'Constructing 'The North': Space and a Sense of Place,' in Neville Kirk (Ed.), *Northern Identities, Historical Interpretations of 'The North' and Northernness* (Aldershot, 2000), p. 3.

7 H. Bhaba, 'The Other Question: The Stereotype and Colonial Discourse,' *Screen*, 24/6/1983, cited in Katie Wales, *North and South: A Linguistic Divide? Inaugural Lecture*, June 10, 1999, University of Leeds, <[www.leeds.ac.uk/reporter/439/kwales.htm](http://www.leeds.ac.uk/reporter/439/kwales.htm)>, accessed, 8 February, 2010, p. 2.

8 Stuart Rawnsley, 'Constructing 'The North': Space and a Sense of Place,' p. 3.

9 Katie Wales, *North and South: A Linguistic Divide*, p. 2.

power and superiority.<sup>10</sup> Katie Wales argues that the otherness of the north is a potent ingredient in the construction of its regional identity, writing, ‘as a constructed discourse the north cannot exist without the “other” polarity [...] and it breeds its own imaginative geography’.<sup>11</sup> For brass bands I argue that the northern brass bands’ identity was augmented by its difference from southern bands: persistent mythologies and stereotypes that were enduring and constantly repeated are a result of this dichotomy. For musical commentators the image of the brass band not only stood for the whole of the musical north, but also concealed, and occasionally obscured, the subtle cultural languages between counties within the north.

As Patrick Joyce has explained, mythologies and stereotypes are active forces in the construction of a collective memory of place. Regional identity grew from a number of influences. Working people had a selection of identities at their disposal, not necessarily just class, but affiliations to neighbourhood, workplace, town, region, religion and nation. This involved shared perspectives with people from other social groups.<sup>12</sup> Therefore, even though layers of invented tradition covered the history of individual cultural identities - music, sport, clog dancing, rush-bearing festivals and so on - the individual layers need identification and analysis to understand layers of northern identity. As Helen Jewell maintains, ‘the north of England is as much a state of mind as a place’, and further, ‘being a

---

10 Edward Said, *Orientalism*, (London, 1978), cited in Katie Wales, *North and South: A Linguistic Divide*, p. 2.

11 Wales, *North and South: A Linguistic Divide*, p. 2.

12 Patrick Joyce, *Visions of the People Industrial England and the Question of Class, 1848-1914* (Cambridge, 1991)

northerner is a creation of the imagination, a product of cultural traditions, assumptions and memories.’<sup>13</sup>

William Marshall has illustrated how this northern regionalism can be further sub-divided with his study of the creation of Yorkshireness.<sup>14</sup> Marshall’s thesis responds to Dave Russell’s call for detailed research projects on provincial press, books, pamphlets and magazines in the exploration of northernness.<sup>15</sup> Marshall argues that he ‘adds a Yorkshire element to the “genealogy of northern stereotyping”, as Dave Russell has described it.’<sup>16</sup> Sub-divisions of regional identity are thus emerging as important areas of research, and this chapter builds upon research that begins with national identity, that divides into region and subsequently into county identities within that region. John Langton points out that English geographers had often enjoyed vigorous theoretical debates about the regional concept yet relatively little regional geography has been written about England. This, Langton says, ‘was because England ceased to be a patchwork of regionally distinctive environments, economies and societies due to the nationally pervasive effects of industrialization.’<sup>17</sup> Langton cites historians such as E. P. Thompson as important chroniclers of events that created identity in northern regions, in particular the West Riding of Yorkshire, with the importance of trade, social protest, political aims, organisation and the emergence of working-class identity all being part of the creation of an

---

13 Helen Jewell, *The North-South Divide*, p. 6.

14 William Marshall, *The Creation of Yorkshireness, Cultural Identities in Yorkshire c. 1850-1915* (PhD thesis, University of Huddersfield, 2011).

15 Dave Russell, *Looking North*, p. 33.

16 Russell, ‘Culture and the Formation of Northern English Identities’, p. 280. (Cited in Marshall, *The Creation of Yorkshireness*, p. 6.)

17 John Langton, ‘The Industrial Revolution and the Regional Geography of England’, *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 9/2 (1984), p. 145.

industrialised northern region.<sup>18</sup> Langton argues that it was during the early period of industrialisation that 'regional cultures, or *mentalities*, were in process of formation amongst the distinctive economic structures, social associations, conflicts and appropriately shaped reactions to national parliamentary policies in the different regions of early industrial England.'<sup>19</sup>

In this chapter I use Southern Pennine brass bands to add a contribution to the 'ongoing investigation of both images and realities of northern life' that Asa Briggs called for in the first edition of the journal *Northern History*.<sup>20</sup> Significantly, this chapter includes elements of both Yorkshire and Lancashire identity. In contrast to Marshall's thesis, which explored the creation of 'Yorkshireness' through literature, I argue that the brass band did not so much create separate identities for Yorkshire or Lancashire but brought them together as a recognisable 'north' that southern readers could identify as a specific industrialised north, often without clear boundaries. Moreover, this north was a place that represented industrial and urban manual labour over commerce and agriculture. The press and brass band periodicals between 1840 and 1914 provided an anthropological view of 'northernness' that focussed upon the manufacturing districts of the Southern Pennines. As a result of this reporting, to the northern and the southern Victorian and Edwardian observer, brass bands represented an example of the clash of values between northern and southern identity.

---

18 Langton, 'The Industrial Revolution and the Regional Geography of England' p. 150-155. Langton examined the North Staffordshire Potteries and East Lancashire as well.

19 Langton, 'The Industrial Revolution and the Regional Geography of England' p. 159.

20 Asa Briggs, 'Themes in Northern History', *Northern History*, I (1966), pp. 1-6.

This chapter explores three themes. Firstly, I examine the growth of the Southern Pennine brass band as a model band to be emulated in the south. Thus, the musical skill and kudos that northern bands possessed began to gain cultural significance, as musical success was associated with place. Secondly, I explore perceived musical differences between the northern and southern bandsmen, differences often explained by purely physical attributes that bring in notions that the population of the north was a distinct 'race'. Finally, and following on from these perceived physical attributes, there is the self-identification of northern attributes as opposed to southern, brass bands used to magnify the difference between the 'hard' north - the world of manual labour, and the 'soft' south - the world of commerce, finance and fertile land, where agriculture is perceived to be easy work. Finally, I explore the solidification of representations of the larger north and a sense of northern unity arguing that the brass band was a vehicle bringing the industrialised areas of Lancashire and Yorkshire together to be viewed as the industrial north.

### **Reporting on the Model Band: Status and the Creation of Place**

Early reports of London's Crystal Palace Contest concentrated on the artisanal, working-class element of the bands: the 'working-class' geography included areas that were on the southern boundaries of the north, as well as the industrial areas of South Wales and occasionally Scotland. Nevertheless, as time passed - together with the success of bands from the Southern Pennines - so did the consolidation of Lancashire and Yorkshire as home, both geographically and

spiritually, to the brass band. When, in 1862, the *Musical World* reported on the brass band contest at the Crystal Palace they affirmed that the country was musical, reflecting the ongoing argument that Britain was not 'The Land Without Music':

The Crystal Palace [...] was in itself proof that, if not essentially a musical people, we are at any rate a people loving music. By far the larger proportions of the members of these bands belong to the artisan class; and we can not describe their performance more appropriately than in the words of a French gentleman, who was well qualified to judge: "For professional artists good - for workmen wonderful." There were volunteer bands in green or grey; there were other band in costumes of their own [...] and there were still others that played in their working clothes. Perhaps it was the latter that attention was chiefly fixed [...]. Each sturdy leader - whether from Lancashire, Yorkshire or Nottingham - put his whole soul but his whole sinews into the task of the day.<sup>21</sup>

In 1865, the *Musical World* reported on the contest again. What showed was that the north was emerging as the most successful area for bands. With this settlement, this grounding of region, there was another element, the high number of supporters that followed the bands, making them 'legion.' 'Rambler' reported in the *Musical World*, that:

This annual brass band contest of amateurs, principally from the counties of York, Lancashire and Derby, is assuming the appearance of a settled institution, and is looked forward to with the liveliest of interest by the lovers of music-"and their name is legion"- in those counties as the event of the season. Wet or dry, it makes little or no difference; each of the bands is accompanied by the hundreds of admirers from the surrounding country for miles around [...]. There was an immense influx of excursionists early trains, bringing them from Oldham, Hull, Sheffield, Leeds, Ramsbottom, Liverpool, Bradford, Colne, Garston and Bacup [...]. The gardens were, therefore, much crowded and I estimate (unless I saw double) that there were not fewer than 60,000 persons assembled.<sup>22</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup> *Musical World* (13 September, 1862), p. 590.

<sup>22</sup> *Musical World* (16 September, 1865), p. 577.



Reporting of the brass band assumed that they and their supporters came from only a limited area of the north, which was then associated with quite a narrowly defined cultural space.

In 1904, the *British Bandsman* cemented the geographical area of the Southern Pennines as the home of the brass band, when they wrote an obituary of the Hull music publisher, Thomas Albert Haigh (1843-1903). The *British Bandsman* pointed out that:

Thomas Albert Haigh [...] was born in the midst of that district celebrated at once for music in general, and for brass bands in particular, at the Village of Upper Mill, in the West Riding of Yorkshire, five miles from Oldham and Rochdale, and half-way between Huddersfield and Manchester, Upper Mill being twelve miles distant from each of those places.<sup>23</sup>

Questions emerged as to why these bands were more successful than southern bands. It is important to remember that bands in London and the Home Counties were very active. There were numerous park concerts, for example. In 1891, Battersea Park had a number of bands playing: the London, Brighton and South Coast Railway Signalmen's Band, the London and South Railway Band and the Westminster Band.<sup>24</sup> At Streatham Common, there was the Streatham Town Band, and the Volunteer Band of the East Surrey Regiment.<sup>25</sup> From this activity emerged the formation of the London and Home Counties Amateur Band association in 1898. In 1904 it had fifty bands as members and the association was holding local contests for bands from the South of England.<sup>26</sup> Therefore, there was no lack of activity for brass bands in the south, but what concerned

---

<sup>23</sup> *British Bandsman*, XVI/84 (10 October, 1904), p. 734.

<sup>24</sup> *Musical News*, 1/24 (14 August, 1891), p. 487.

<sup>25</sup> *Musical News*, 1/24 (14 August, 1891), p. 487.

<sup>26</sup> *Musical Standard*, Vol 21 No 528 (13 February, 1904), p. 106.

commentators was *why* southern brass bands could not obtain the same success as northern ones.

The view that underpinned assorted notions of 'northernness' that were linked with the bands from the Southern Pennines was that the bands of the region provided a model to be copied, not only for their musicianship, but also in their organisational methods. In 1893, for example, Frank J. Smith, from Buckden, in Huntingdonshire, wrote to *Musical Opinion and Trade Review*:

It must seem strange to all the brass instrumentalists of this country that the great city [London] containing the most eminent manufacturers of brass instruments in all the world is a very long way behind many a small village in the north of England in the manner of brass band music. You remark that musical critics are asking, "why is it?" In my humble opinion that question marks the beginning of the end, for it will lead to a better query, "how can it be remedied?" And that process will lead to a revelation many people are unprepared for. To the critics who ask, "why is it?" I say "*want of opportunity*."<sup>27</sup> [Their italics]

Smith recommended that 'any firm employing a sufficient number of people have it announced that they wish to form a band, that they will provide good instruments, uniform, instruction and a practice room.'<sup>28</sup> When an employer was lacking he recommended that the community should raise a subscription band, with a committee and honorary members.<sup>29</sup> Smith argued that these things were important because even though, in London and the Home Counties, there was initial enthusiasm for brass bands, but which was not supported to maturity.

Smith was right to highlight the irony that the key brass instrument manufacturers in the south, who employed working people, were not as successful as northern

---

<sup>27</sup> *Musical Opinion and Trade Review*, 17/193 (October, 1893), p. 14.

<sup>28</sup> *Musical Opinion and Trade Review*, 17/193 (October, 1893), p. 14.

<sup>29</sup> Smith was highlighting issues that would be published two years later by Algernon S. Rose in *Talks With Bandsmen: A Popular Handbook for Brass Instrumentalists* (London, 1895). Thus, we can see that these ideas surrounding band success are known to, and being discussed by, the reading public before one of the first books dedicated to brass bands.

bands. The contest, and the rivalry that grew from it, together with the encouragement of local supporters, were seen as important elements in developing the musical skills for success. In addition, this musical skill would be developed if southern bands could supply a financial incentive for players with cash contest prizes. For southern commentators these financial incentives were one reason the north had better brass musicians. Moreover, though, it was the attitude to commitment in southern bands that needed to change to rival the north, Smith wrote:

If we kindle a fire we do not expect it to burn long without the addition of more fuel. If we want a real band of music we must see that its enthusiasm is encouraged and kept alive. Herein lies most of the secret of the success of northern bands. They are always hard at work with the object of making themselves superior to those around them; they are encouraged to do so by the offer of very valuable prizes on the contest field, and by the sure and certain applause they will gain from all on their return as victors from a well fought fight. Many bands do not spare expense if they can induce good players to reside among them, work and money being offered to competent men. If brass bands in London or anywhere are to become *bands of music* [italics in original], there must be something more to assist their vitality than beanfeast excursions, occasional dances and half hearted and badly attended practices[...]. The day seems to be coming... when the bands of such firms as Broadwood, Brimstead, Besson, Boosey and Hawkes, and others, together with bands from Camden Town, Brixton, Northwood, Clapham and a host of suburbs, will meet together in friendly competition before an audience of thousands of their respective admirers. The carpers and critics, who seem to take their idea of brass bands from the traveling German examples, may then begin to see what a brass band may become, neither brazen nor vulgar, but a thoroughly musical body of men. That day will be the turning point for the south of England: and, in conclusion, I will express the hope, "may I see you there."<sup>30</sup>

In 1898, strength of feeling about making southern brass bands equal to, if not better than northern ones, resulted in the formation of the London and Home

---

30 *Musical Opinion and Trade Review*, pp. 14-15.

Counties Amateur Band Association. Many of the aims of the association echoed Smith's recommendations. Indeed, a month before formation, in August, Alexander Owen, one of the triumvirate of band trainers, judged the Stratford Music Festival Band Contest, his comments on the competing bands reinforced the need for improvement. The *Daily Mail* reporting that 'he could not flatter them on their performance, for they had played everything on the score incorrectly [...]'. It would be some considerable time before bands from the South could compete successfully with their friends in the North.<sup>31</sup> In response, the association argued that competition was the contributing factor to improvement. The bands of the north were better because they had more practice at competing, a point which was argued by a contributor, calling themselves 'one who was there', who responded to Alexander Owen's comments, saying, 'northern bands have at least a dozen contests and southern bands only two.'<sup>32</sup> It was also implied that the people of the north were inherently more musical than the south. The remedy, the association felt, lay in organisation. The *Musical Standard* reported that:

An effort is being made to raise the standard of the brass bands of London and the Home Counties to something approaching the excellence of the bands of the North of England. The movement had its origin in a severe criticism passed by a professional adjudicator hailing from the North upon the performances of London bands, which competed at the recent Stratford Festival contests. To make such criticism impossible in the future the London and Home Counties Amateur Band association, of which Mr. S. Cope is president, Mr. Warwick Williams, vice-president, and such well-known musicians as Mr. Charles Godfrey, Mr. C. Kiefert and Mr W. Short are on the council, has been formed; and last Saturday a practical outcome of the movement took the form of a first annual championship contest [...]. The Association will seek to attain its ends by encouraging

---

31 *Daily Mail* (15 August, 1898).

32 *Daily Mail* (16 August, 1898).

friendly rivalry among local bands, by instituting solo, quartet and other contests during the winter, by arranging with a professional band teacher to visit such bands as require his services for a final rehearsal for a contest, by providing a lecture or address in each district during winter time, by keeping a register of bands wanting players, and generally encouraging and helping its members in every possible way. I have often wondered why the bands of the North are so very much better than those of the South, but I have never yet heard a very good reason for the superiority which undoubtedly exists. Some people point to certain counties and say that they are more musical than others, but as hitherto no organisation existed which made contests possible it cannot be held that Southern counties have yet shown what they can do. The contests in the North are the main cause of the keen interest taken in their work by members of different bands, and doubtless under the fostering care of this new association the bands of London and the Home Counties will gradually improve.<sup>33</sup>

The music publishers Wright and Round published their band tutor the *Amateur Band Teacher's Guide and Bandsman's Advisor* in 1899, and the phrase that indicated it was a key text for brass bands to follow was that 'it was a synthesis of the systems on which the celebrated prize bands of Lancashire and Yorkshire are taught.'<sup>34</sup> The editor's introduction pointed out that the tutor's strength lay in the fact that it was made up of advice from northern band trainers. In addition, the editors stressed that even though the brass band was a hobby for many bandsmen, they should view 'banding' as a professional pursuit and treat it with enthusiasm and seriousness. In this way, the notion that the manufacturing districts of the north produced the best bands gained resonance. The editors wrote:

Some of the articles contained herein have been written by men, whose names are familiar as household words with Amateur Bandsmen. They embody the ideas of teaching, which have made the Amateur Bands of Lancashire and Yorkshire the best bands in the world. Therefore, we think that many old teachers, who have been debarred

---

<sup>33</sup> *Musical Standard*, 10/246 (17 September, 1898), p. 177. This piece defined the Home Counties as Middlesex, Surrey, Essex, Kent, Sussex, Hampshire, Berkshire, Oxfordshire, Hertfordshire, Bedfordshire and Buckinghamshire.

<sup>34</sup> *Wright and Round's Amateur Band Teacher's Guide and Bandsman's Advisor* (Liverpool, 1899), front cover.

by circumstances from ever having any training under a first-class professional, will find many chapters in this little book worthy of reading to their bands to reinforce their own teaching. And we think bandmasters would save themselves no little trouble if they persuaded each of their pupils to get a copy. It would help the pupils understand the teachings of the bandmaster, it would keep alive the grand sentiment, without no art work can be done, viz. – enthusiasm; it would let them see that playing in a band should not be a mere hobby for passing time, and it would show them that an amateur band may become an artistic body, worthy of the sincere praise of the most fastidious musical critic<sup>35</sup>

By 1900, the notion that Yorkshire and Lancashire contained the best northern bands was complete. According to the *Musical Standard*, this resulted from the combination of financial support from industrialists and sponsoring communities together with regular professional tuition and practice and the influence of the contest, and the financial prizes that could be won, in encouraging rivalry and therefore musicianship.<sup>36</sup> In 1901, the view that the northern bands' superiority was based on instrumental skill that was developed by 'northern' trainers, thus reinforcing the northern brass band tradition, was being cited in the *Cornet* as a key indicator of difference between northern and southern brass players. As David Harvey has stated of the importance of tradition in the creation of place identity elsewhere, 'the assertion of any place-bound identity has to rest at some point on the motivational power of tradition.'<sup>37</sup> In other words, paraphrasing Lewis Mumford, the contests put brass bands in a position to make a statement of grandeur and authority making bands be regarded in admiration by the watching public.<sup>38</sup> This audience, who, came largely from London and the Home

---

35 *Amateur Band Teacher's Guide*, p. 1.

36 *Musical Standard*, 14/343 (28 July, 1900), p. 61.

37 David Harvey, *The Condition of Postmodernity* (Oxford, 1989), p. 303, cited in, Doreen Massey, 'Places and Their Pasts', *History Workshop Journal*, 39 (1995), p. 184.

38 Lewis Mumford, *The City in History* (New York, 1961), pp. 386-391.

Counties, viewed northern bandsmen as driven and determined musicians. The brass bands of the Southern Pennines, then, through tradition, teaching and contest success imposed their authority on the south. What emerged from the correspondents' letters to the *Cornet*, reported in its 'Notes and Notions' column, was that the northern brass bands, inclusive of tradition, authority and reputation, *belonged* to the north. They wrote:

I have seen some of the bandsmen that were at the "Daily Mail" concert, and their opinion is that all along the line the Southern bandsmen were practically paralysed with the playing of our brass bands. They did not think it was possible to produce anything like it; it was an object lesson such as they had never heard before. Yes, my Southern friends, you will have to have our Northern teachers, as those who are at present teaching you, with one or two exceptions are really wrong in their methods.<sup>39</sup>

The letter writer went on, imagining what the southern bandsmen were thinking about the performances, continuing:

Only imagine exclamations of this kind: - "Well if I had not seen or heard it I would not believe it possible for such fine organ - like music to be brought out of brass instruments. We feel that we in the South have not really got over the scale of C yet, comparing our efforts with the playing of our Northern brethren."<sup>40</sup>

Finally, the writer reinforced the point that having a superior trainer was the key to success, writing, 'it is all a matter of method, which, of course, means teaching.'<sup>41</sup>

In 1903 the *British Bandsman* featured a lengthy article that reinforced what the editor felt was the northern ethos behind success. The secret, the editor thought, was not just down to the individual efforts of bandsmen, such as

---

39 *Cornet* (15 February, 1901), p. 4.

40 *Cornet* (15 February, 1901), p. 4.

41 *Cornet* (15 February, 1901), p. 4.

attending practice regularly, but lay in being enthusiastic. The key was that they had a strong support network of a committee, secretary, treasurer and librarian, who, importantly, were members of the community who did not play an instrument, hence, the editor reasoned, these people encouraged interest in the band from outside the networks of the people who played. By having enthusiastic and hard working people in the supporting roles the editor argued that success was inevitable:

Look at the best bands. Nearly all of them hail from small villages, the inhabitants of which, to a man, would deprive themselves of a meal to help their band along. They consider it their duty for they share the honour their bands bring home. See them on a big contest day. How proud they feel, and they are not backward in letting you know they come "fra' Whitefield tha' knows", where Besses hail from. Equally proud are the people of Hyde, for don't they belong to Kingston Mills, while the men of Queensbury look with utter contempt at all and sundry, for they have come to cheer their band, Black Dike. Every band has its partisans; they believe there is no band like their own, and that is the feeling every struggling aspirant after honours should impart to their fellows.<sup>42</sup>

In 1903, for example, southern bands were embracing the advice given in the periodicals. When 'Ferret' wrote, in the *Southern Bands* column, in the *British Bandsman*, that 'Gravesend won the [Wembley] contest "hands down" and that Mr. Manley has begun to show the South that he means business,<sup>43</sup> then it seemed southern bands could challenge the 'crack' bands of the north. In 1908, an editorial in the *British Bandsman* admitted that, in spite of the efforts of the London and Home Counties Brass Band Association, southern bands still lacked organisation and financial support, which meant that players were not motivated to keep up with earlier achievements, writing:

---

<sup>42</sup> *British Bandsman*, XVI/69 (27 June, 1903), p. 386.

<sup>43</sup> *British Bandsman*, XVI/70 (4 July, 1903), p. 404.



It must be admitted that the bandsmen of the South do not compare, as a whole, with the men from the amateur bands from the North of England. Against these mighty bandsmen of the North we have few organisations that can hold their own. We do not wish to say that in the home and Southern counties men are lacking in musical enthusiasm [...]. They are not in the foreground because the same attention has not been given to the art, and because there are not the same inducements for them to devote their hours of leisure to serious practice. Much could be done to remedy this if the London County Council would lend a hand [by providing music lessons].<sup>44</sup>

This situation continued. In 1910, Giles Gosling, a correspondent for the *British Bandsman*, felt that southern bands were still not motivated to work hard enough to be successful. Gosling did mention Crossfields Brass Band, near Reading, but, overall, the emphasis lay with the hard, and persistent, work that Southern Pennine bandsmen did to become excellent players. Gosling wrote:

There should be no reason why every band should not be a Black Dike or a Crossfields [...]. The atmosphere in Lancashire and Yorkshire contains no more music than at Clapham Common, and if our Southern bands would only work like bands in the north do, our bands would be just as good. I am told that these energetic northerners manage to squeeze a few minutes practice into the interval, which is allowed them for breakfast and dinner, and this practice is not confined to the solo players alone, but indulged in by all the members.<sup>45</sup>

## **Musical Geographies: The Physical Brass Band**

Writing in 1969, Lawrence Durrell argued that human beings were expressions of their landscape and that their cultural productions always bore the unmistakable signature of place.<sup>46</sup> This statement influences this chapter. The bands of the Southern Pennines carried the cultural identity of the bandsmen to the southern

---

<sup>44</sup> *British Bandsman*, 318/21 (4 April, 1908), p. 1.

<sup>45</sup> *British Bandsman* (11 June, 1910), p. 574.

<sup>46</sup> Lawrence Durrell, *The Spirit of Place* (New York, 1969), p. 157.

stage. What came to prominence in this period was a belief that northern people were more musical because of physical fitness that developed through the effort of walking around a hilly district, together with the effort involved in manual labour. These elements combined to produce the northern bandsman: a person who could easily cope with the physical demands of playing a brass instrument. However fanciful this may be, the opinion echoed reality because many bandsmen did indeed walk large distances to and from rehearsals. In 1901, for example, *Brass Band News* celebrated the career of J.J. Hargreaves, bandmaster of Haslingden Temperance Brass Band, in east Lancashire's Rossendale Valley. The writing comments on the enthusiasm of Hargreaves for attending band practices. The reported distances he walked to band practices were extraordinary. *Brass Band News* wrote, 'some idea of his enthusiasm and energy may be gathered from the fact that ... altogether, since starting with the band, he has walked over 13,000 miles to practices.'<sup>47</sup>

The band commentator, 'Shoddythorpe', was in no doubt that this walking around hills produced better musicians, in addition, he argued that areas with few hills had fewer brass bands and vocalists, which, as I explore later, had implications for how commentators viewed the south. In 1901, he wrote in the *Cornet*:

Hills are great factors in sound producing. Where there are hills there is music [...]. On the level portions of England, we find very few brass bands or vocalists. To my mind, it is as though hills enchant people to sing and play.<sup>48</sup>

---

47 *Brass Band News* (1 July, 1901), p. 4.

48 *Cornet* (15 June, 1901), p. 4.

By 1914 this notion of physical geography featured in the discussions about brass sound production. The brass band was seen as a cultural production of the physical environment; the bandsman became a fixture in the construction of northern identity through physical fitness that produced an exclusively northern sound. Specifically, this was how the northern brass band became superior in technique to the southern bands. This 'northernness', expressed as physical musicianship, became the topic of discussion in the band periodicals. In

February 1914, Frank Shaw asked *The Bandsman's Parliament*:

Why, in the South of England, bands lacked the sonority of tone on the euphonium, and other instruments, he supposed, that northern players exhibit so wonderfully in their playing.<sup>49</sup>

The answer, under the heading of *Yorkshire Toan* [sic], was given, appropriately enough, by the member for Holmfirth, in the West Riding of Yorkshire, who wrote that they:

Thought that the answer to the riddle could be found under the heading of physique. Speaking generally, the people who lived amongst the hills were a finer and bigger built race than the flat country people. The district they had to traverse was uneven, very much in some parts, and brought the breathing apparatus into greater prominence ..., and nature stepped in to remedy the matter by supplying the native with a greater chest expansion, which enables him to cope with the difficulties of the district.<sup>50</sup>

This writing highlighted that geography influenced fitness, producing better musicians and resulting in high quality sound production. By 1914 the *British Bandsman* was in no doubt the consolidation of these elements had made the Southern Pennines the home of the brass band: the area was the area where

---

49 *British Bandsman* (14 February, 1914), p. 131.

50 *British Bandsman* (14 February, 1914), p. 131.

'musicians are found'. A combination of physical fitness and musical aptitude resulted in musical excellence. The periodical considered that:

It can not be denied that the cradle of the brass band is on the slopes of the Pennine chain. This is also where the best English singers are to be found. It is strange, but nonetheless true, that mountains as districts produce the best vocalists. Their life of climbing seems to endow them with more than ordinary lung power [...]. But voices alone would be useless unless the musical temperament were also present.<sup>51</sup>

Such writing clearly celebrated the Southern Pennines as a musical centre but such pride created deeper antipathies between the north and south. These elements of physicality and musicianship came to represent larger differences that embraced the contrast of values and traits between north and south. As we have seen in the previous chapter, John Hollingshead thought that the people who lived around Redcar, a place, he thought that few London frequenters of spas and watering places would know were a 'race' apart.<sup>52</sup> He described the inhabitants of the north as clannish and self-reliant. They lived and married amongst themselves, and presented the high cheekbones, and hard features, which generally marked the Yorkshire race.<sup>53</sup> This notion of race was part of a pseudo-anthropology that had emerged from the late eighteenth century onwards and underwent various divergences and controversies during the nineteenth. By the 1890s, there was widespread popular awareness of anthropology and ethnology. What Hollingshead was reflecting upon was that written appraisals of northern character were considered empirical and based upon objective

---

<sup>51</sup> *British Bandsman* (18 April, 1914), p. 349.

<sup>52</sup> John Hollingshead, Charles Dickens, (attributed), 'Musical Prize Fight,' *All the Year Round*, (12 November, 1859), p. 65.

<sup>53</sup> Hollingshead, 'Musical Prize Fight,' p. 66.

observations.<sup>54</sup> In the depiction of northern people as a separate race, the key figure was Dr John Beddoe (1826-1911), by 1870, president of the Anthropological Society of London. His research into ethnicity concentrated on the British Isles and, according to David Miles, he was largely responsible for the 'classical myth [of the] small, dark Welshman.'<sup>55</sup> As Marshall has highlighted, Beddoe worked on the notion of the independent Yorkshireman, who was considered bluff of character and interested in dog and horseracing.<sup>56</sup> Marshall argues that ideas about Yorkshireness entered the national consciousness, and were reflected in non-scientific writings in the period; by the late-nineteenth century ideas about Yorkshire identity were self-perpetuating.<sup>57</sup> Despite this Yorkshireness, in reporting and scientific discussion, the idea of the 'northern' worker, affected by industrialisation, was still prevalent in the wider north. Beddoe, himself, writing in 1872, examined the Lancashire worker. He argued that:

The modern history of the southern part of the county [Lancashire] has been very diverse from the northern. The immense development of the cotton trade has affected the physical and moral character of the population in various ways. The ethnological character has been very much obscured by the immigration which has taken place from all parts of Ireland, England, Scotland and Wales, and even from foreign countries. This has been accompanied, however, by a rather rapid multiplication of the native breed, which still retains the preponderance in many parts of South Lancashire, as may be shown by the examination of family names; but which, under the influence of altered conditions of life, has deteriorated in stature, bulk and constitutional vigour [...]. The type originally prevalent in South Lancashire, however, is still sufficiently numerous, even in the streets of Manchester and other large towns, to be pretty easily recognised. The men belonging to it are usually of middle stature and strong build, with a tendency to

---

54 Marshall, *The Creation of Yorkshireness*, p. 16.

55 David Miles, *The Tribes of Britain* (London, 2005), p. 23. Cited in Marshall, *The Invention of Yorkshireness*, p. 17.

56 Marshall, *The Invention of Yorkshireness*, p. 18.

57 Marshall, *The Invention of Yorkshireness*, p. 19.

squareness in the face and the head, the complexion and hair rather light, but the eyes almost as often brown or neutral as blue or light grey.<sup>58</sup>

The focus on industrial labour in the north was blended Lancashire and Yorkshire workers as northern. By 1901, the *Musical Standard* reflected upon a brass band story that illustrated a homogenous northern identity that had arisen from notions of status, independence and artisanal skill, the idea of the skilled and proud Dickensian bandsman, who loved to make music, with a liking for horseracing, dogs and gambling. It was clear that the article was about Besses o' th' Barn Brass Band, based just outside Manchester, and clearly a Lancashire band, yet the qualities are almost identical with those attributed to Yorkshire character. Distinctions and lines became blurred, they wrote:

There is a story current in Yorkshire which sets forth that upon one occasion, a Yorkshireman, staying at a fashionable hotel in London, and being required to sign the register, saw on the page before him, the signature of some proud person, who appended to his autograph the letters, "J.P." "M.P." The Yorkshireman thereupon puts himself down as - let us say - Samuel Stubbs, and added to his scrawl, the mystic suffix, "B.B.B.B.B.B.B.", much to the astonishment of the manager and his clerks, Asked to explain this strange title, or degree, Mr. Stubbs, said with great pride that it signified "Best Bloomin' Bugler in the Besses o' th' Barn Brass Band," and walked away as if conscious of a great and overwhelming dignity

But it is only Yorkshiremen, and perhaps a few Lancastrians, who can fully appreciate the importance of this story. There are two or three things about which your genuine Yorkshireman is profoundly interested. Horseracing is one; anything "doggy" is another; a third is "makkin mewsic." The folk of the thickly-populated districts are keen on anything musical, and I have heard discussion as to certain parts of Chopin and Grieg carried on very learnedly by black-faced colliers, when, they had said all they considered necessary, turned to rabbit-coursing with equal zeal.<sup>59</sup>

---

58 John Beddoe, 'On the Anthropology of Lancashire', *The Journal of the Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland*, Volume 1 (1872), pp. xvii-xviii.

59 'Makkin Mewsic,' *Musical Standard*, 15/381 (20 April, 1901), p. 247.

This language described the manufacturing districts of the north and disregarded the large areas of the north that contained the agricultural, the historical - in terms of abbeys and monasteries - and coastal areas.

Whether from Yorkshire or Lancashire the bandsmen of the Southern Pennines consolidated elements that observers easily recognised as being 'northern'. As Katie Wales has argued, northern stereotypes acted as metonyms for cultural images: dogs, racing, ale, horny-handed sons of toil, factory chimneys, brass bands, 'poor,' 'hard,' 'friendly,' and so on.<sup>60</sup> These images juxtaposed southern images of 'bowler hat, thatched cottages, luncheon, village green, intelligent, ambitious, well off, and so on.'<sup>61</sup> Northern identities - constructed as the other to normative southern Englishness - were enhanced in a world of labour that reinforced sense of neighbourhood and community, in which the qualities of independence, dignity of labour and solidarity, both at work and in the community, were key components.<sup>62</sup> The Southern Pennines were considered to represent a northern ethos where diligent work produced musical excellence. Moreover, this excellence was a direct result of the core nature of the northern bandsman, which was that they were from an industrial region, where bandsmen – the 'sons of toil' and the 'soldiers of industry' - were used to prolonged and intensive labour. This manufacturing drudgery created, shaped and produced bandsmen who embraced hard musical work.

---

60 Wales, *North and South: A Linguistic Divide*, p. 2

61 Wales, *North and South: A Linguistic Divide*, p. 2.

62 Rawnsley, 'Constructing 'The North': Space and a Sense of Place,' p. 8.

## **Brass Bands in the Southern Pennines and the Division between North and South**

Up to this point, we have seen how the bandsmen and brass bands of the north were considered a positive role model for bands in the south, particularly those in London and the Home Counties. Superior northern musicianship was thought to result from a wide range of factors reinforced by popular belief and discussion. This idea of musical geography cemented the bands of the Southern Pennines as ambassadors of region. Yet, within this debate and reporting there were elements of division and antipathy. The Southern Pennine brass band became a vehicle through which deeper divides between north and south were examined.

The *British Bandsman* highlighted differences between northern and southern bands and northern and southern people. Published in London, it examined the nature of the north-south divide from a metropolitan perspective. It considered that the north was the example to follow. The editorial was reflective as to the reason why the south did not have as many band contests. The piece blamed poor organisation and motivation, but the central reason they perceived as a self-confessed laziness, writing:

The northern counties are "all alive" with brass band contests. We really can not see why the Southern counties should not follow suit, but we Southerners are imbued with an excess of indolence.<sup>63</sup>

For the *British Bandsman* this self-confessed 'indolence' was in stark contrast to what Donald Horne has called the *Northern Metaphor*. As Russell maintains the period from around 1880 to 1920 was significant in that southern imagery won

---

63 *British Bandsman* (August 1888), p. 198.



out over the northern. Horne was not attempting to define north and south, or to capture the separate images of the regions, but rather to identify self-images of nation that could broadly be attributed to distinct areas.<sup>64</sup> Horne wrote:

In the *Northern Metaphor* Britain is pragmatic, empirical, calculating, Puritan, bourgeois, enterprising, adventurous, scientific, serious and believes in struggle. Its sinful excess is a ruthless avarice, rationalized in the belief that the prime impulse in all human beings is a rational, calculating, economic self-interest. In the *Southern Metaphor* Britain is romantic, illogical, muddled, divinely lucky, Anglican, aristocratic, traditional, frivolous, and believes in order and tradition. Its sinful excess is a ruthless pride, rationalized in the belief that men are born to serve.<sup>65</sup>

As Russell points out, the *Southern Metaphor* stood for an English 'homeland' that centred on the Home Counties, with a sanctification and celebration of a certain type of rural idyll, together with the certainty that tradition further reinforced the Anglican and aristocratic certainties of nation and home. While the *Southern Metaphor* was unstable, it had certainly gone far enough in this period to devalue the regions and qualities that had produced the industrial revolution. The north started the twentieth century with its greatest triumphs of industrialisation tainted, and its future under threat.<sup>66</sup> Therefore, even though the victory of the south's celebration of the certainty of 'Englishness' was neither complete nor as assured as it sometimes asserted. Commentators in the *British Bandsman* had surrendered to northern dominance in brass band music easily, furthermore, openly asserting that southern bandsmen were too lethargic to maintain a sustained southern band movement.

---

<sup>64</sup> Russell, *Looking North*, p. 26.

<sup>65</sup> Donald Horne, *God is an Englishman* (Sydney, 1969), p. 22-23, cited in, Russell, *Looking North*, p. 26.

<sup>66</sup> Russell, *Looking North*, pp. 26-27.

The most telling commentary on the difference between northern and southern bandsmen came in 1909, when the correspondent for the *Southern Notes* column of the *British Bandsman*, who wrote under the *nom de plume* of 'Hic et Ubique'<sup>67</sup>, and was a regular contributor to the periodical, wrote an article called *The Evolution of the Southern Bandsman*. Firstly, 'Hic et Ubique' stated that 'I am a believer in the musical aptitude of the South and can imagine no reason why the bands of the South can not hold their own against the bands of the North.'<sup>68</sup> Nevertheless, he explored the nature of the southern bandsman. In languages redolent of Horne's Southern *Metaphor* it was the geographical environment that 'Hic et Ubique' blamed for any perceived indolence, based on pseudo-scientific anthropological evidence. Land in the south was fertile and easily farmed, the sun was always warm, and although the southern bandsman had the ability to appreciate art, they lacked the tenacity to study and succeed in academic pursuits. This was, as Horne argued, the romantic, muddled and frivolous nature of the south:

Anthropologists tell us that [...] the nature of the [southern] inhabitants is regulated by climatic, and other natural causes; under sunny skies where the earth is easily tilled and prodigal in its gifts to those who merely scratch its back. The dwellers in this region are of an easy-going indolent nature, they have the love of art given out to them, and the gift of its perception, naturally, but the dogged determination, and the will power necessary, for close application and study [...] is entirely lacking in their composition.<sup>69</sup>

This view contrasted sharply with the view of the north. The work the geography of the north produced for the population created a race of people who, because of industrial labour, naturally had more tenacity to succeed in artistic pursuits.

---

67 Latin: Here and Everywhere.

68 *British Bandsman* (3 April, 1909), p. 383.

69 *British Bandsman* (3 April, 1909), p. 383.

The result was that this created tradition that was passed down through the generations. Thus, as Durrell recognised, the cultural production of a place was a direct result of the geography. The northern bandsmen through this generational tradition had the undeniable signature of place in the bandsmen's north. Edward Relph has written that 'physical appearance, activities and meanings are the raw materials of the identity of places and the dialectical links between them are the elementary structural relationships in that identity.'<sup>70</sup> Therefore, the dichotomy of north and south, between 'hard' and 'soft,' was viewed as their continued interaction with each other. The southern bandsmen not only placed the band in a position of authority, but also the distinctiveness of manual labour gave this musicianship authority. This gave rise to an identity based primarily on tradition. This produced a north that reflected the physical (in the production of tone and articulation) the social (in the wide networks of bands) the aesthetic (in the large number of instruments and ephemera, such as uniforms) whose elements all became adapted to each other in the production of the completely northern band. 'Hic et Ubique' wrote:

On the other hand inhabitants of a less congenial climate, with a Mother Earth so hard and cruel that the necessities of life have to be taken by brute force, from her very vitals. These conditions breed a race whose attributes are conducive to closer application, and the surmounting of difficulties, which must be conquered before any excellence in art can be obtained. Bandsmen of forty years ago were to a great extent the fathers of the bands of yesterday, and they in turn of those of today; any man who has spent his life in teaching the gentle art of "blowing" will agree with me that it is far easier to make an instrumentalist out of a lad whose father, or better still, if both his parents were musicians, therefore hereditary tells! There you have the superiority of the Northern bandsmen.<sup>71</sup>

---

70 Edward Relph, *Place and Placelessness* (London, 1976), p. 48.

71 *British Bandsman* (3 April, 1909).

The Southerner, 'Hic et Ubique' argued, came from an environment where the bandsman 'descends from generally lethargic populations, who have no experience of hard work.' Within this environment, for bands at least, there was no strength of musical tradition. Brass bands were a representation of the north: industrial, hard, with prolonged and intensive labour, yet with a tenderness of expression. The south was otherwise, a place of agriculture, home and gentility. Clearly, labouring people in the south worked as hard as those in the north, nevertheless, the view remained that southern bands could not succeed because they did not have the industrial nature, the tenacity to overcome industrial-centered drudgery, that made northern bands successful. The Archbishop of Canterbury reinforced this view of north and south, when writing in the *Spectator* in 1910:

It was what is called the Industrial revolution, which turned the North and the Northern Midlands into a humming machine-room, and made them disinclined ever again - if indeed they had not otherwise learnt their lesson - to turn away from business to sentiment. It caused the coalless South to seem by contrast a land of Arcadian lassitude. Arkwright, Hargreaves, Watt, Boulton, Stephenson and the rest all belonged to the North. From their time the reputation of the North changed. Romance retired ashamed to the border and fells, and even there became a legend. The South, if it did not borrow the fallen reputation of the North, at all events appeared henceforward ... by contrast to be more dreamy, less hard-headed, less ingenious. The change is already an old one, and its features will probably remain.<sup>72</sup>

In this period, brass bands not only represented the north-south divide but also represented the main manufacturing district within it. Within the movement, the brass band periodicals produced pages and pages of reports that showed the

---

<sup>72</sup> *Spectator* (5 November, 1910), p. 9.

commonalities of brass band life throughout the country. Internally commentators tried to find solutions for underachieving bands so they could become as good as northern bands, which did include some regional analysis of bandsmen's personality. Internally the periodical commentators wanted to know *why* bands underachieved. For external commentators, however, it was Southern Pennine bands that became a cultural invention of 'northernness', metonyms of industry, toil and region were represented by the artistry of the region's bandsmen.

The 'crack' bands of the Southern Pennines acted as a marker of excellence that all other bands should aim for. This was the aim of bands within the north, but the difference in musical skill between northern and southern bands acted as a marker for the difference of northern and southern traits. Northern bands were industrial; they were working class, truculent and rough. They were also industrious, committed and talented; hence, this industrial identity acted as a musical example to follow. Southern bands wanted to be as successful as northern bands, yet they thought themselves victims of geographical constrictions.

Mythologies of region came to constrict the reality that there was no true reason why the bands from the south could not be successful. The northern bandsmen were the 'soldiers of industry' and the 'sons of toil'. The bandsmen's working environment made them used to hard work. In addition, northern bandsmen were perceived as fitter and stronger because of the geographical environment of the Southern Pennines. The notion that gained currency was that a plentiful supply of exercise gave northern bandsmen the physical strength to cope with the substantial demands of playing a brass instrument.

Southern bands did need better organisation and training, and this was noted and commented on. One remedy was to form local brass band associations who would arrange contests in an attempt to mimic the success of band contests in the north. The main reason was that observers saw band contests as the driving force behind better musicianship and keeping up enthusiasm. In spite of these opportunities, southern bands could not reach the standard of northern bands. In the eyes of southern bandsmen, the northern bandsmen was blessed with better opportunities: better organisation, time to practice, a work ethic, a musical environment that encouraged practice and, however fanciful, the advantages of fitness, that was a result of manual labour and regional geography.

In the final analysis, and in spite of brass bands being a national movement, the metaphors of the north and south were inescapable, and the brass bands of the Southern Pennines happily played upon these metaphors to maintain their musical construction of place, together with their dominance in that place. Bands from the Southern Pennines were expressions of their landscape, and their cultural productions always bore the unmistakable signature of place.

## Conclusions:

### Slate-Grey Rain and Polished Euphoniums

Writing in the *Daily Herald* in 1963, Dennis Potter wrote a review of a play by Ron Watson called *Man of Brass*. The play starred Jimmy Edwards, who played Ernie Briggs, a B-flat bass player, who preferred playing in brass bands to staying at home with his wife. Potter captured the tone of the play by writing, ‘this “northern saga” grimly celebrating slate-grey rain and polished euphoniums was firmly in the eh-bah-goom heritage of North Country humour.’<sup>1</sup> As Dave Russell maintains, this image of the northern working-class brass band ‘has become so taken for granted in the national comic grammar that it is easy to smile (or wince) and move on.’<sup>2</sup> The aim of this thesis was not to move on, but to pause and ask questions about these assumptions.

This thesis grew from Dave Russell’s bold statement that, ‘the brass band represents one of the most remarkable working-class cultural achievements in European history.’<sup>3</sup> His assertion led me to interrogate why brass bands should be associated so strongly with the working class and the north. Indeed, modern commentators on the brass band movement, from politics, to journalism and film, are quick to evoke metonyms of class and region when writing about brass bands. There are no shortages of ways that the brass band acts as a representation of the working-class north. In 1972, for example, David Clark, the

---

1 Quoted in the *British Bandsman* (7 December, 1963), cited in, Dave Russell, *Looking North: Northern England and the National Imagination* (Manchester, 2004), p. 2.

2 Russell, *Looking North*, p. 2.

3 Dave Russell, *Popular Music in England 1840-1914: A Social History* (Manchester, 1987, this edition, 1991), p. 205.

Labour MP for the Colne Valley, asked why the Arts Council should give a grant to the National Youth Orchestra and not the National Youth Brass Band. He accused the Arts Council of being 'against working-class culture'.<sup>4</sup>

The rhetoric that the brass band was a significant agency in expressing northern working-class life reached its peak with the 1996 film *Brassed Off*.<sup>5</sup> The film followed the fortunes of Grimley Brass Band (Grimley being a thinly disguised version of Grimethorpe in South Yorkshire), and its efforts to win the National Championship. The film was well received in mining communities, who felt that it reflected the hardships and suffering they had experienced during the decline of the mining industry, under the governments of Margaret Thatcher and John Major.<sup>6</sup>

The brass band community, however, was hostile to what they saw as another misrepresentation of a great movement.<sup>7</sup> Musical aspects of the film were wildly inaccurate. Brass band musicians who criticised musical mistakes were, as Trevor Herbert has argued, missing the point of the film. It was not a musical documentary, but a snapshot of a place and time. The place was a community in which a brass band had thrived because of the employment that was provided by industrialisation. Herbert argued that, 'symbolically, this was a time when history and tradition confronted modernity.'<sup>8</sup> In other words, the local brass band not only represented an industrial working-class community, but also

---

4 *The Times* (24 November, 1972).

5 Mark Herman, *Brassed Off*, Channel Four, Miramax Films (1996).

6 Trevor Herbert (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), p.1.

7 Herbert, *The British Brass Band*, p. 1.

8 Herbert, *The British Brass Band*, p. 1.



the decline of a working-class way of life that was associated with that industrialisation.

The brass band movement, then, in spite of being a national movement, is accepted - almost without question - as working class and northern.

Commentators on brass bands rely on these representations as an easy cliché of region and class without interrogation or explanation. It was this effortless acceptance that the brass band was a northern metonym that led to the research questions underpinning this thesis, which have their foundation in the belief that the brass bands of the Southern Pennines remained an under-researched arena in the study of a highly visible aspect of Victorian and Edwardian working-class leisure, which was an important element in the examination of class, culture and region. Significantly, this thesis shows how brass bands became important in constructing both internal and external notions of the working-class at leisure, in an era when the working-class way of life and emerging cultural identities were under scrutiny from middle-class observers.

My study of bands in this region adds to the emerging scholarship that bridges a gap between musicology and social history. Significant inroads have been made in bringing together interdisciplinary scholarship to broaden the study of music as a social phenomenon within musicology and social history. This space in the scholarship led me to examine a wide range of archival material that not only looked at class and region but also contributing themes to the larger questions about musical performance, leisure and rational recreation, gender and masculinity, together with the effect of the bands' wider social networks in reinforcing musical identities. Brass bands existed to perform music. From this

musical performance emerged large social networks that started with family and friends and grew to include supporters from the street, town and region. These social networks and their contribution to the construction of class and region, together with the social aspects of musical performance and its effect on class and region, offer exciting threads of research for brass band scholars.

This archival material was generated because the brass bands of the Southern Pennines were constantly active in a small geographical area. Varied and regular activities placed the brass bands in a dominant position in a highly musical region. As the *Magazine of Music* said, 'it would seem as if nothing were complete without a band.'<sup>9</sup> Bands were the significant musical force, over choirs, orchestras and other musical groups in the region, when it came to exploring the links between working-class cultural identity and northernness.

As Russell argues, the reason the area was renowned for its musical prowess was 'an inter-relationship of several factors operating in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries [which] generated a climate propitious to musical endeavour.'<sup>10</sup> Firstly, Methodism was a powerful influence in the area and on its music. But Methodists did not dominate local musical activity and Anglicans were also influential in the area's early choral groups. Roman Catholic influence should also be acknowledged, with St Patrick's church being a well-known musical centre in Huddersfield by mid-century.<sup>11</sup> Secondly, often under the ethos of rational recreation, the local elite supported local working-class musical groups. Finally, as Russell argues, the development of musical life in the

---

<sup>9</sup> *Magazine of Music*, 9/4 (April 1892), p. 63.

<sup>10</sup> Dave Russell, "Music in Huddersfield, c.1820–1914", in Hilary A. Haigh (Ed), *Huddersfield: A Most Handsome Town: Aspects of the History and Culture of a West Yorkshire Town* (Huddersfield, 1992), p. 655.

<sup>11</sup> Russell, "Music in Huddersfield", p. 655.

Pennines was helped by the flexible working patterns of people in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.<sup>12</sup>

E. P. Thompson acknowledged that in the *early* period of industrialisation Southern Pennine weavers had free time to develop autodidactic leisure activities. The putting out system required much fetching, carrying and waiting for materials, such as weavers waiting for finished pieces to dry in tenter fields. Hence we get the characteristic irregularity of labour patterns before the coming of large-scale machine-powered industry. Within the general demands of the week's or fortnight's tasks the working day might be lengthened or shortened.<sup>13</sup> Thompson wrote: 'the son of a weaver from the Heptonstall district, who was a child in the 1820s, recalled that weavers "had their good times." The atmosphere was not fouled by [...] the smoke of the factory.'<sup>14</sup> A Keighley factory child, who left the mill for a hand-loom at the age of eighteen, informed the 1832 Sadler's Committee that he preferred the loom to the mill 'a great deal: I have more relaxation; I can look about me, and go out and refresh myself a little.'<sup>15</sup> The passing of flexible working patterns was lamented by the weaver poets, shown by a verse written by one weaver who worked at a hand-loom from 1820 to 1850 and then obtained work in a power-loom factory. The weaver wrote:

I then worked in a small chamber overlooking Luddenden Churchyard. I used to go into the fields and woods [...] at mealtimes and listen to the songs of the summer birds, or watch the trembling waters of the Ludden [...]. Sometimes I have been roused from those reveries by some forsaken maiden [...] who has poured forth her heartwailing to the

---

12 Russell, "Music in Huddersfield", p. 656.

13 E. P. Thompson, 'Time, Work-Discipline, and Industrial Capitalism', *Past & Present*, 38 (1967), p. 71.

14 E. P. Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class* (London, 1963, this edition, 1991) (no source given), p. 321.

15 Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class*, (no source given) p. 321.

thankless wind. I have then gone home and written [...].But it's all over I must continue to work amongst the clatter of machinery.<sup>16</sup>

In later industrialisation strikes and lockouts could have forced the weavers to make music in each other's homes to save money, which was suggested by Reginald Nettel in 1945.<sup>17</sup> Yet, the writing of the early weavers has what Thompson called a 'patina of cliché'.<sup>18</sup> This cliché of flexible working influencing musicianship has persisted in accounts of music-making in the region.<sup>19</sup>

The final elements in the growth of the popularity of music were the rivalries and competition that grew between musical groups, often expressed through contests, in an effort to match the excellence of 'rival' towns.<sup>20</sup> From the 1830s instrumental groups that would become brass bands emerged into a region that was already well-known for its working-class musicianship. It was this musical heritage that secured a foundation where brass bands could flourish.

The way the brass band musicians played music linked competition to musical performance. The technique of playing brass instruments meant there were commonalities of technique that every bandsman could understand, from novice players in fledgling bands to proficient players in 'crack' bands. They could reference their own technique back to a lingua franca of musical performance. From these methods a large working-class musical network was formed.

---

16 Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class*, (no source given) p. 324.

17 Reginald Nettel, 'The Influence of the Industrial Revolution on English Music', *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association, seventy-second session*, (1945-46), p. 25.

18 Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class*, p. 324.

19 See chapter one, especially, Roger Elbourne, *Music and Tradition in Early Industrial Lancashire* (Woodbridge, 1980).

20 Russell, "Music in Huddersfield", p. 656.

When the novice bandsmen learned to play they relied upon an internal network of mentors and a semi-oral transmission of technique. This style of learning led to a self-replicating tradition that created large social networks on the same musical foundation. The band movement not only created a singular musical style but also this style cemented such musicianship as 'working class' in the eyes of many commentators.

This performance style was further reinforced by the band trainers and arrangers Gladney, Swift and Owen, and other professional trainers who copied their methods. The amalgam of their training and use of their arrangements created the model 'crack' bands that other bands could copy if they wanted to succeed in the contest circuit. The contest circuit brought these elements together to create an arena where the brass bands of the Southern Pennines dominated. The outcome of this was that commentators could examine the behaviour of the working class in one place, the contest venue.

For many Victorians and Edwardians, music represented the ideal rational recreation. Music, it was felt, could improve morals, ethics, behaviour and the soul. Bands had to negotiate with a number of middle-class benefactors to obtain financial support resulting in a subtle mixture of cross-class relationships. As such, when constructing their proposals for finance, band committees stressed the improving benefits of music for the working class. Algernon Rose, in his *Talks With Bandsmen*, supplied bands with detailed instructions on how to answer questions with statements that stressed the rational recreation ethos. Band committees knew that significant sums of money were available to bands - whether factory or subscription - and the key element in obtaining these funds

was to meet the rational recreation criteria. From this finance the bands had the security to strengthen an emerging working-class tradition.

As such, bands often emerged where industrialists already had a reputation for paternalism. The most famous example of a factory-sponsored band was Black Dyke Mills Band, supported by John Foster's of Queensbury. By 1891, Foster's employed about half of the village's 6,500 inhabitants, and inevitably the fate of most of the others depended on the mill's continued success.<sup>21</sup> The existence of brass bands in these areas suggests that they were viewed by industrialists as a considerable public statement, and perhaps are one of the most practical expressions of a wider practice through which industrialists maintained influence on the local community through paternalism.

Bandsmen and industrialists viewed the bands as an agency for advertising the factories' products. Consequently, the line between work and leisure became blurred. Bands regularly played at holiday events, charity events and in parks at weekends, as well as at contests. In this way the bandsmen who played for factory bands were linked with work outside normal working hours. They became an expression of the influence of the factory in community life. Work and leisure were interdependent and relied upon each other for success.

Clearly, the role of the bands was to represent their employers and towns in public, yet a subtler process was occurring that would not have been obvious to the people that supplied finance to bands. The bands had the ability to create their own calendar of festive events, contributing to working-class associational life. Brass bands, then, through the rational recreation ethos, and the high status

---

21 E. Sigsworth, *Black Dyke Mills* (Liverpool, 1958), pp. ix-xii.

music had in that ethos, were able to negotiate financial security to maintain working-class identity on their own terms, when older traditions were in retreat.

One editorial theme that recurred throughout the band journals was that the working-class bandsman should behave like a gentleman. This notion was driven by the fear that the rougher elements of working-class masculinity - drinking, gambling, swearing and fighting - would bring the band movement into disrepute. This fear came about because brass bands were such a public statement of deferential and respectful working-class culture. Bandsmen were working men who lived and worked in industrial communities that could contain both respectable and rough elements. When a bandsman acted roughly at a park concert, for example, then the band movement came under scrutiny. This dichotomy between the need for good behaviour and the journals' acceptance that bandsmen were indeed working men, who were more than capable of behaving roughly, is an under-explored area in the examination of working-class masculinity in this period. The self-replicating nature of brass band musicianship brought bandsmen together in spaces where they could express their working-class masculinity in a musical environment.

Musicianship gave bandsmen independence, a significant element in the construction of working-class masculinity in this period. The skilled player had access to a number of ways to earn extra money in addition to their wages, often as a deputy player with a band that wanted to do well in a contest. In addition, bandsmen could play with 'bands' that performed in places of entertainment, rolling and ice-skating rinks and for pit orchestras in theatres.

Such payments could not be relied upon and were seasonal but as Richard Hoggart noted in the mid-twentieth century, men defined their independence by the amount of free money that they had to spend on beer, cigarettes and gambling.<sup>22</sup> Men were defined by the pubs they drank in and by their hobbies. As such, extra money earned by bandsmen gave them the 'spends' to ensure their ability to sustain a social life, and as such their masculinity in the wider working-class world. The bandsman's hobby not only secured independence but also created extra homosocial environments outside the pub. The bandroom was not just a place to practice but brought like-minded men together in a space outside the pub to meet in a homosocial place. When sponsoring communities and industrialists provided the finance for a practice space they gave bandsmen an alternate area to the pub where they could act as working-class men. Moreover, these spaces were where brass band music became definably working class. The bandsmen did not expect or necessarily welcome members from other classes. To be a bandsman was to gain acceptance in a homosocial and working-class environment, where music acted to highlight traits of working-class masculinity found elsewhere in this period.

Brass bands came with a range of operating expenses, such as heating and lighting in bandrooms, together with the need for instruments, uniforms and music. As a result, subscription bands relied upon extended networks of families, friends and sweethearts for fundraising. Women made a significant contribution to the success of bands in the region through fundraising. In addition, ladies'

---

<sup>22</sup> Richard Hoggart, *The Uses of Literacy: Aspects of Working-Class Life With Special Reference to Publications and Entertainments* (Harmondsworth, 1958), p. 56, cited in, Davies, *Leisure, Gender and Poverty*, p. 55.



committees had the ability to advertise the bands' activities in a wide network of groups that men did not have access to. In this way women became an essential power in the organisation of fundraising for bands. Indeed, the brass band journals recognised that ladies' committees were important elements in raising the respectable image of the working-class brass band, and women were indeed making inroads into the bastion of brass band masculinity, the contest arena. In spite of these advances the brass band remained a homosocial environment, particularly in the bandrooms.

External reporting of brass bands in the press was driven by a quasi-anthropological study of the working-class at leisure. When bands came together on the contest circuit they not only played music but exposed themselves to a watching middle-class public interested in the cultural lives of the working class. Brass band contests emerged at the same time as football tournaments. It was natural for reporters to seek a sporting simile for the number of working-class people that supported bands, and the championship football matches of the period gave commentators that rhetorical expression of class. As a result, reporting of bands in the media noticed the traits and habits of the wider social networks around bands. The musical performance was a catalyst for expressions of working-class culture. Moreover, this reporting highlighted some of the rougher elements of working-class life and how the brass band contest acted as a place where working-class people could not only appreciate music but also enjoy the contest with elements of drinking, swearing and the ability to voice their anger, however briefly and unsuccessfully, at the figure of authority, the band adjudicator.

What drove reporting about northern working-class brass bands was the observation of musical and physical qualities that the northern bandsmen possessed and how these qualities created the dichotomy with bands from the south. Bands in the south of England were also composed of working-class men and, in addition, had a following of wives and sweethearts together with a lively contest circuit. In 1898, for example, the *Daily Mail* reported on a band contest at Muswell-Hill, where fourteen southern bands took part, writing:

The majority [of bands] were sons of industry, the engineer's shop or the guard's van [...]. A phalanx of young ladies in all the witchery of white pique and green silk had come prepared to pull for Highgate Band or die in the effort.<sup>23</sup>

Reporting that celebrated the success of southern bands was rare. What dominated press reporting was the quality of musicianship found within the northern bands, and how this musicianship was achieved. The bands of the Southern Pennines were the 'model' bands to copy, not only for their musical style, but also the aspiration to mimic their organisational methods and obtain access to top-class tutors. Northern bands were seen as successful because of an amalgam of the beneficial influences of a northern work ethic, time to practice, the advantageous effects of more contests, and physical fitness that was the result of industrial labour and geographical environment. These were the notions that created the dichotomy between the 'hard' north and the 'soft' south. The superiority of northern bands was a clear product of industrial labour that created bandsmen who were used to hard work and as a result worked hard at music. The north was seen as an area that encouraged musical activity, not only

---

<sup>23</sup> *Daily Mail* (10 October, 1898).

because of tradition, but also because the geographical environment was perceived to create fitter people who could produce a better tone, because of better lung capacity.

However fanciful these notions were, it is undeniable that in the late nineteenth century they had academic and popular currency and influenced the view of the northern bandsman. The bands of the Southern Pennines came to represent the industrial, the hard and on occasion the truculent. In addition they represented the artistic, the dignified and the noble. Southern bands were often seen as lacking organisation, motivation and musicianship because they were not northern.

This was because the south was not viewed as industrial. Southern bands represented the soft, the easy and, on occasion, the indolent. This dichotomy was driven by the positive and negative attributes of region. In the north, the ground had to be mined, quarried and worked. The wages of the working class had to be torn from the earth. In the south the land just had to be scratched to produce results. The brass bands of the Southern Pennines became more than the example of high-quality working-class music, they became a representation of space and place. Cornish and Welsh miners also had to make their living by tearing their wages from the earth; nevertheless, the bandsmen of the north represented all aspects of industry, not just miners. In the final analysis, the region was where commentators looked to understand the musicianship of the brass band movement. It was this commentary, and attempts to understand this musical phenomenon, that created an invention of space and place.

Such imagery makes the brass band an important element in the construction of class and region. The north was a musical environment. The study of musicology and social history provides a method to explore musicianship in the north of England. Historical studies of choirs and orchestras, for example, would benefit from the approach taken in this thesis. The industrial north and its musical heritage provide mountains of archival material that highlight aspects of class and region in Victorian and Edwardian society.

# Tables:

## Table 1

A List of Gladney, Swift and Owen's arrangements, from brass band concert programmes from the Greenhead Park Concerts in Huddersfield, 1903-1910. The prominence of Swift's arrangements reflects that Lindley Band and Linthwaite Band were close to Huddersfield and most likely booked to play often.

<b>John Gladney</b>		
25 May 1903	Batley Old	<i>Selection of Meyerbeer's Les Huguenots</i>
3 June 1903	Batley Old	<i>Selection of Mendelssohn's Works</i>
19 August 1903	Black Dyke Mills	<i>Selection of Sohr's Works</i>
30 May 1906	Black Dyke Mills	<i>Selection of Mendelssohn's Works</i>
5 May 1907	Black Dyke Mills	<i>Selection of Sohr's Works</i>
24 July 1907	Black Dyke Mills	<i>Selection of Beethoven's Works</i>
4 Sept 1907	Black Dyke Mills	<i>Selection of Sohr's Works</i>
August 1908	Lindley	<i>Selection of Weber's Works</i>
2 June 1909	Lindley	<i>Overture from Mozart's Magic Flute</i>
<b>Alexander Owen</b>		
29 July 1903	Shipley	<i>Selection of Berlioz's Works</i>
16 May 1906	Besses	<i>Selection of Beethoven's Works</i>
8 Aug 1906	Batley	<i>Selection of Rossini's Works</i>
13 May 1908	Besses	<i>Selection of Beethoven's Works</i>
13 May 1908	Besses	<i>Round the World March, Composer, Alexander Owen</i>
1 Sept 1909	Besses	<i>Selection of Rossini's Works</i>
1 June 1910	Shaw (Oldham)	<i>Selection of Rossini's Works</i>
<b>Edwin Swift</b>		
10 June 1903	Wyke	<i>Selection from Donizetti's, San Sebastani</i>
17 June 1903	Linthwaite	<i>Selection from Donizetti's, San Sebastani</i>
17 June 1903	Linthwaite	<i>Overture from Beethoven's, Fidelio</i>
8 July 1907	Lindley	<i>Selection from Donizetti's, San Sebastani</i>
26 August 1903	Linthwaite	<i>Selection from Tchaikovsky's Works</i>
7 June 1905	Hebden Bridge	<i>Selection from Donizetti's, Poliuto</i>
5 July 1905	Linthwaite	<i>Selection from Rossini's, La Cenerentola</i>
23 August 1905	Wyke	<i>Selection of Wagner's, Bayreuth</i>
16 May 1906	Besses	<i>Souvenir De Meyerbeer (selection of Meyerbeer's work)</i>
23 May 1906	Batley	<i>Souvenir De Meyerbeer</i>
30 May 1906	Black Dyke	<i>Selection of Meyerbeer's, L'Etoile Du Nord</i>
11 July 1906	Lindley	<i>Souvenir De Meyerbeer</i>
25 July 1906	Linthwaite	<i>Selection of Beethoven's, Die Rue In Von Allen</i>
1 August 1906	Wingates	<i>Selection of Sohr's Works</i>
15 May 1907	Black Dyke	<i>Selection from Monckton's, The Spring Chicken</i>
15 May 1907	Black Dyke	<i>Selection of Wagner's, Bayreuth</i>
22 May 1907	Wingates	<i>Gems of Chopin</i>
18 Sept 1907	Wyke	<i>Selection of Wagner's, Bayreuth</i>
23 Sept 1907	Lindley	<i>Souvenir De Meyerbeer</i>

24 Sept 1907	Linthwaite	<i>Souvenir De Meyerbeer</i>
24 Sept 1907	Linthwaite	<i>Selection from Donizetti's, Poliuto</i>
24 Sept 1907	Linthwaite	<i>Gems of Chopin</i>
24 June 1908	Wyke	<i>Selection of Beethoven's Works</i>
24 June 1908	Wyke	<i>Selection of Wagner's, Bayreuth</i>
24 June 1908	Wyke	<i>Selection of Rossini's, William Tell</i>
1 July 1908	Linthwaite	<i>Selection from Donizetti's, San Sebastani</i>
1 July 1908	Linthwaite	<i>Selection of Sohr's Works</i>
19 August 1908	Halifax	<i>Selection of Beethoven's Works</i>
26 August 1908	Huddersfield Fire	<i>Souvenir De Meyerbeer</i>
19 Sept 1908	Black Dyke	<i>Selection of Wagner's, Bayreuth</i>
19 Sept 1908	Black Dyke	<i>Selection of Meyerbeer's, L'Etoile Du Nord</i>
22 May 1909	Lindley	<i>Selection of Beethoven's Works</i>
28 July 1909	Huddersfield Fire	<i>Gems of Tchaikovsky</i>
10 August 1910	Linthwaite	<i>Souvenir De Meyerbeer</i>

# Bibliography

Where primary sources and books cannot be found in the British Library collections I have listed the locations using the following key:

Accrington Local Studies Library (ALS)

Bacup Local Studies Library (BLS)

Bolton Archive Service (BOAS)

Bradford Local Studies Library (BRLS)

Burnley Local Studies Library (BULS)

Bury Archive Service (BAS)

Halifax Local Studies Library (HXLS)

Haworth Brass Band (HB)

Huddersfield Local Studies Library (HLS)

Lancashire Record Office, Preston (LRO)

Leeds Local Studies Library (LLS)

National Brass Band Archive, Wigan (BBA)

Rawtenstall Local Studies Library (RLS)

Salford Local Studies Library (SLS)

Todmorden Community Brass Band (TCBB)

West Yorkshire Archive Service, Bradford (WYASBR)

West Yorkshire Archive Service, Calderdale (WYASCD)

## Primary Sources:

### Newspapers:

**(The date ranges of newspapers, magazines, periodicals and journals include dates of those consulted)**

*Accrington Free Press* (June 1875 to April 1878)

*Accrington Gazette* (June 1875 to April 1878)

*Accrington Times* (June, 1875 to April 1878)

*Bacup and Rossendale News* (April to May 1876)

*Bacup Times* (September, 1870 and April to May 1876)

*Bolton Chronicle* (February-March, 1861)

*Bradford Daily Argus* (June, 1906)

*Bradford Daily Telegraph* (June-July, 1906)

*Bradford Observer* (June-July, 1906)

*Bury Times* (June-July, 1899)

*Daily Mail* (15 August, 1898, 16 August, 1898, 10 October, 1898)

*Daily Telegraph* (18 July, 2007)

*Derbyshire Evening Telegraph* (24 September, 2007)

*Eccles and Patricroft Journal* (September-December 1883)

*Halifax Daily Guardian* (Canada) (WYASBR) (24 November, 1906)

*Halifax Evening Courier* (10 December, 2004)

*Haslingden Chronicle and Ramsbottom Times* (July-August, 1901)

*Haslingden Gazette* (July-August, 1901)

*Haslingden Guardian* (July-August, 1901)

*Hebden Bridge Evening News* (January-February, 1909)



*Huddersfield Chronicle and West Yorkshire Advertiser* (14 June, 1851 and February 1856 to May 1872)

*Huddersfield Daily Chronicle* (February 1856-May 1872)

*Huddersfield Daily Examiner* (January-February, 1904)

*Huddersfield Weekly Examiner* (13 February, 1904, 13 October, 1909)

*Huddersfield Weekly News* (8 November, 1887)

*Leeds Mercury* (8 November, 1887)

*Liverpool Mercury* (26 September, 1887)

*Manchester Guardian* (5 September, 1893)

*Manchester Times* (5 June, 1886)

*Middleton Guardian* (8 June, 1889, 23 July, 1889, 14 September, 1889, 18 October, 1890)

*Rossendale Free Press* (22 November, 1884, 1 May, 1886, 27 November, 1901)

*Observer* (19 September, 1937)

*Slaithwaite Guardian and Colne Valley News* (12 January, 1897-17 April, 1898, 30 September, 1898, 12 February, 1904)

*The Times* (11 July, 1860, 17 February, 1885, 30 September, 1911, 24 November, 1972, 11 October, 1974)

*Todmorden and District News* (January-February, 1909)

### **Brass Band Journals:**

*Brass Band News* (1 July, 1901, 1 November, 1901, 1 December, 1901, 1 February, 1905, 1 December, 1905, 1 February, 1908)

*British Bandsman* (September, 1887, April, 1888, August, 1888, 15 March, 1903, 4 April, 1903, 11 April, 1903, 18 April, 1903, 25 April, 1903, 23 May, 1903, 20 June, 1903, 4 July, 1903, 27 June, 1903, 4 July, 1903, 8 August, 1903, 15 August, 1903, 10 October, 1904, 2 January, 1907, 3 August, 1907, 3 August, 1907, 7 September, 1907, 9 November, 1907, 18 April, 1908, 2 May, 1908, 3 April, 1909, 19 June, 1909, 20 November, 1909, 7 January, 1910, 11 June, 1910, 20 April, 1912, 27 April, 1912, 17 January, 1914, 31 January, 1914, 14 February,

1914, 28 February, 1914, 7 March, 1914, 14 March, 1914, 18 April, 1914, 1 January, 1915)

*Cornet* (15 January, 1895, 15 December, 1896, 15 April, 1898, 15 October, 1898, 14 January, 1899, 15 February, 1900, 19 April, 1900, 15 February, 1901, 15 October, 1901, 14 March, 1903, 15 February, 1904)

### **Music Journals:**

*British Minstrel and Musical and Literary Miscellany* (January, 1845)

*Campanology* (16 September, 1896)

*Magazine of Music* (April, 1892, June, 1892, July, 1892, March, 1896, October, 1896)

*Minim: A Musical Magazine for Everybody* (January, 1898)

*Monthly Musical Record* (1 July, 1872)

*Musical Herald* (2 October, 1893, 1 November, 1895, 1 November, 1907, April, 1918)

*Musical Opinion and Trade Review* (March, 1901)

*Musical Standard* (6 August, 1881, 28 July, 1900)

*Musical World* (13 November, 1886)

*Tonic Sol-Fa Reporter* (1 August, 1884)

*Yorkshire Musician* (1 January, 1887, October, 1889)

### **Journals and Magazines:**

*All Year Round* (12 November, 1859)

*City Jackdaw: A Humorous and Satirical Journal* (3 March, 1876)

*Gardener's Magazine* (May, 1829)

*Good Words* (November, 1900)

*Household Words* (11 May, 1850)

*John Bull and Britannia* (30 May, 1857)

*Leisure Hour* (24 December, 1870)

*Mirror of Literature, Amusement and Instruction* (May, 1829)

*North of England Magazine and Bradshaw's Journal of Politics, Literature, Science and Art* (February, 1843)

*Outlook* (27 January, 1900)

*Pearson's Weekly* (December, 1896)

*Spectator* (27 October, 1838 and 5 November, 1910)

*The Nineteenth Century: A Monthly Review* (September, 1892)

*Yorkshireman* (January 1880, April 1880, April 1883)

## **Archival Records:**

### **Brass Band History Booklets:**

Anon, *Irwell Springs (Bacup) Band* (Bacup, 1914) (RLS)

Anon, *Life and Career of the Late Mr. Edwin Swift, a Self-Made Musician, Bandmaster and Adjudicator: Trainer of Many of the Leading Bands in the North of England*, (n.p. 1904) (HLS)

Anon, *Milnrow Public Band, 1869-1969* (Milnrow, 1969) (BBA)

Anon, *Slaithwaite Band: Golden Jubilee Year Souvenir* (Huddersfield, 1975) (HLS)

Anon, *Stalybridge Old Band, 1814-1914* (Stalybridge, n.d.) (BBA)

Bythell, D. *Banding in the Dales: A Centenary History of Muker Silver Band* (Muker, 1997)

Bythel, D. *Water, A Village Band, 1866-1991* (Water Band, Rossendale, Lancashire, 1991) (RLS)

Carrington, R. (Ed.), *The Centenary Chronicle of Rothwell Temperance Band, 1881-1981, A Tribute to Those Who Have Gone Before* (Leeds, 1981) (BBA)

Hampson, J. N. *The Origin, History and Achievements of Besses o' th' Barn Band* (Northampton, 1893) (ALS)

Hartley, E. A. *Brindle Band: A Social and Cultural History of a Lancashire Brass Band, 1868-2000* (Preston, 2000) (LRO)

Hesling White, J. E. *Our Village Band* (Bramley, 1905) (LLS)

Hesling-White, J. E. *A Short History of Bramley Band From Its Inception to The Present Time. With Glimpses of Old Time Doings in Bramley* (Bramley, 1906) (LLS)

Hume, J. O., *Souvenir of St Hilda's Band* (n.p.1929) (BBA)

Leech, I. *Reminisces of The Bacup Old Band, Which Appeared in the Columns of the Bacup Times in 1893* (Bacup, 1893) (RLS)

Lord, S. *The History and Some Personal Recollections of the Whitworth Vale and Healy Band* (Rochdale, 2005) (RLS)

Massy, R. *Meltham and Meltham Mills Band 1846 -1996, 150 Years of Music, Commemorative Booklet* (n.p.1996) (BBA)

Rogerson, B. 'A Touch of Brass', *Eccles & District Historical Society Lectures* (1977-1978) (SLS)

Walker, M. *The History of Farnworth and Walkden Brass Band: A Brief History of Brass Bands in the Bolton District* (n.p., 2007) (RLS)

#### **Local History Pamphlets:**

Baldwin, A. Crompton, M. Hargreaves, I. Simpson, J. Taylor, G. *The Changing Faces of Rossendale: Production Lines* (Halifax, n.d.) (RLS)

#### **Architectural Plans:**

*Clifton Subscription Brass Band-Plan of Proposed Band Room, Clifton* (11 May, 1898) (WYASCD), catalogue ref CMT6/MU: 24/42

#### **Brass Band Minute Books:**

*Haworth Brass Band Minute Books, 1900-1904* (HB)

*Minute Book of The Christian Brethren Brass Band, Cleckheaton, 1886-1899* (WYASCD), catalogue ref, K131

*Heap Bridge Brass Band Minute Books, 1898-1914* (BAS), catalogue ref, RHB/1/1

*Helmshore Brass Band Minute Books, 1889-1922* (ALS)

### **Brass Band Tutor Books and Instrumental Methods:**

Arban, J. B. *Grande Méthode Complète de Cornet à Pistons et de Saxhorn* (Paris, 1864) (BBA)

Curwen, J. *The Brass Band Book for Tonic Sol-Fa Pupils, Containing Instructions for the Cornet, Bugle, Tenor, Baritone, Euphonium, Bombardon, Trumpet, Trombone, Ohecleide and French horn* (London, 1864) (BBA)

*Wright and Round's Amateur Band Teacher's Guide and Bandsman's Adviser* (Liverpool, 1889) (BBA)

### **Concert Programmes:**

*G.U.S. (Footwear) Band 1867-1967, Centenary Year Concert Programme* (12 November, 1967), catalogue reference, RC785G00 (RLS)

*Music in Greenhead Park Concert Programmes* (1901-1922) (HLS)

### **Contest Entry Forms:**

*Contest Entry Forms for the Belle Vue Contest, Manchester, from 1901-1904* (BBA)

### **Contest Results:**

*Database of Contest Results from 1900-Present* (BBA)

### **Correspondence and Reports:**

*Correspondence re Bury Recreation Grounds, 1895-1905* (BAS), catalogue ref, ABU2/3/7/1

*Park Superintendents Reports on Bands, 1812-1913* (BOAS), catalogue ref, AF/6/125/2

### **Ephemera:**

*Documents Relating to Oats Royds Mill Brass Band, 1864-1897* (WYASCD), catalogue ref, JM857: Band Uniform Brass Tunic Buttons

*Newspaper Cuttings With Regard to John Foster and Sons, and Local Events in Bradford and Queensbury* (WYASBR) catalogue ref, 6195/9/1/1

Peacock M. R. *Haworth Public Prize Band Poem* (September, 1912) (HB)

### **Financial Records, Personnel Records and Receipts:**

*Bradford Brass Band Account Book, 1854-1858* (WYASBR), catalogue ref, DB16/C31

*Bradford Borough Council, Town Clerk, Papers Regarding Peel Park, Including Financial Agreements, Correspondence, Minutes, Plans, Reports and Subscriptions, 1851-1864* (WYASBR) catalogue ref, 1D82

*John Foster and Sons, Director's Minute Book, 1891-1920* (WYASBR) catalogue ref, 61D9521/1

*Documents Relating to Oats Royds Mill Brass Band, 1864-1897* (WYASCD) catalogue ref, JM857:

Engraving receipt 253a, 31 December, 1869, receipt, 254a, 31 December 1870

Estimate for band clothing

Instrument and band membership lists, 1864-1884

Settled Accounts in the Winding up of Oats Royd Mill Brass Band (11 November, 1890)

*Helmshore Brass Band Leger Books, 1901-1914* (ALS)

*Heap Bridge Brass Band Trust Deed for Instruments and Other Property, 21 December, 1885* (BAS), catalogue ref, RHB 2/1

*Register of Staff Absences, With Time Off, and Cause, to Playing in Black Dyke Band, 1864-1880* (WYASBR), ref 61D95/ 8 box 1/ 4

*Watson and Son and Smith, Solicitors, Bradford, Records (Idle and Thackley Brass Band Papers, 1898-1943* (WYASBR), catalogue ref, GB202

*Todmorden Old Brass Band Ledger Books, 1900-1910* (TCBB)

### **Pamphlets:**

Anon, *Recreation for the Working Classes on Temperance Principles* (Dublin, 1857)

### **Parliamentary Acts:**

*Uniforms Act 1894*, Office of Public Sector Information,  
<[http://www.opsi.gov.uk/acts/acts1894/pdf/ukpga18940045\\_en.pdf](http://www.opsi.gov.uk/acts/acts1894/pdf/ukpga18940045_en.pdf)>

### **Trade Directories:**

*Halifax and Huddersfield Mercantile Directory, 1863-64*, (London, 1863) (HXL5)

*Kelly's Directory of the West Riding of Yorkshire, 1897* (London, 1897) (HXL5)

### **Trust Deeds, Rules and Regulations:**

*Clifton Brass Band, Declaration of Trust, 1882* (WYASCD), catalogue ref, KMA: 1850

*Cliviger Prize Band Rules and By-Laws, 1908* (BULS), catalogue ref, LT641

*Haworth Public Band Agreement* (6 December, 1876) (WYASBR) catalogue ref, 80D/92

*Idle and Thackley Public Brass Band, Rules and Regulations* (30 July, 1898) (WYASBR) catalogue ref, 540D/1/5

*The Shipley Brass Band Trust Deed* (7 March, 1894) (WYASBR), catalogue ref, 41D/84/49

### **Unpublished Manuscripts, Diaries and Reflections:**

James Law Cropper, *Memories*, typewritten transcription of interviews (n.d.) (RLS)

Moses Heap, *An Old Man's Memories* n.d. (typescript, 1970) (RLS)

*Moses Heap of Rossendale, My Life and Times (1824-1913)* (transcribed by John Elliot, 1961) (RLS)

*Diary of Willie Jeffrey, 1906* (Queensbury Historical Society) photocopy, held in (BRLS)

## Secondary Sources:

Anderson, B, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London, 1991)

Aspin, C. *The First Industrial Society, Lancashire, 1750-1850* (Preston, 1995)

Baignet, E. 'Haweis, Hugh Reginald (1838-1901)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, (Oxford, 2004), <<http://www.oxford.dnb.com/view/article/33763>>

Bainbridge, C. *Brass Triumphant* (London, 1980)

Baines, A. *Brass Instruments* (London, 1976, this edition, London, 1980)

Bamford, S. *Walks in South Lancashire, On its Borders with Letters, Descriptions Narratives and Observations, Current and Incidental* (Manchester, 1844) (RLS)

Bailey, P. *Leisure and Class in Victorian England, Rational Recreation and the Contest for Control, 1830-1885* (London, 1978)

Bailey, P. *Popular Culture and Performance in the Victorian City* (Cambridge, 1998)

Bailey, P. 'Ally Sloper's Half-Holiday: Comic Art in the 1880s', *History Workshop*, 16 (1993), pp. 4-31

Bailey, P. "'Will the Real Bill Banks Please Stand Up?'" Towards a Role Analysis of Mid-Victorian Working-Class Respectability', *Journal of Social History*, Vol. No. 3 (1979), pp. 336-353

Baines, A. C. and Myers, A. *The Cornet*, *Grove Music Online* (Oxford University Press) <[www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grovemusic/06509](http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grovemusic/06509) >

Bashford, C. and Langley L. (Eds.), *Music and British Culture, 1785-1914: Essays in Honour of Cyrill Ehrlich* (Oxford and New York, 2000)

Bate, P, Herbert, T and Myers A, 'Saxhorn.' *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online* (Oxford University Press)  
<<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/24667>>

Beaven, B. *Leisure, Citizenship and Working-Class Men in Britain, 1850-1945* (Manchester, 2004)



- Bebbington, B. W. *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s* (Oxon, 1989, this edition, 2002)
- Benas, B. B. 'Merseyside Orchestras: An Introduction to the History of Local Instrumental Music', *Transactions of the Historic Society of Lancashire and Cheshire*, 95 (1945), pp. 95-117 (BBA)
- Benson, J. *The Working Class in Britain, 1850-1939* (London and New York, 1989)
- Bennett, Z. (Ed.), *Nineteenth-Century British Music Studies, Vol. 1* (Aldershot, 1999)
- Bevan, C. 'Brass Band Contests: Art or Sport?' in, Herbert, T. (Ed.), *Bands: The Brass Band Movement in the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> Centuries* (Oxford, 1991), pp. 102-119
- Boon, B. *Play the Music, Play! The Story of Salvation Army Bands* (St Albans, 1966)
- Bourdieu, P. translated by Nice R., *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste* (Paris, 1979, this edition, London, 1994)
- Bourke, J. *Working-Class Cultures in Britain, Gender, Ethnicity and Class* (London, 1994)
- Borsay, P. *A History of Leisure: The British Experience Since 1500* (Basingstoke, 2006)
- Bradley, I. 'Blowing for the Lord: the Salvation Army', *History Today*, Vol 27. No 3 (1977) pp. 190-195
- Brierley, B. *Home Memories and Recollections* (Manchester, 1862) (RLS)
- Briggs, A. 'Issues in Northern History', *Northern History*, 1 (1966), pp. 1-6
- Brown, L. *Victorian News and Newspapers* (Oxford, 1985)
- Bowden, K. F. (Ed.), *A Bacup Miscellany* (Bacup, 1972) (RLS)
- Brand, V. and Brand, G. *Brass Bands in the 20th Century* (Letchworth, 1979)
- Burke, P. *History and Social Theory* (Cambridge University Press, 1992)
- Bythell, D. 'The Brass Band in the Antipodes: The Transplantation of British Popular Culture', in, Herbert, T. (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), pp. 217-244
- Carter, T. 'The Sound of Silence: Models for an Urban Musicology', *Urban History*, 29/1 (2002), pp. 8-18

- Childs, M. J. *Labour's Apprentices: Working-Class Lads in Late Victorian and Edwardian England* (Belfast, 1992)
- Clark, A. *The Struggle for the Breeches, Gender and the Making of the British Working Class* (London, 1995)
- Clark, D. B. 'The Concept of Community: A Re- Examination', *Sociological Review*, Volume 21 (1973), pp. 397-416
- Clay, J. H. *Black Dyke, An Inside Story* (Stockport, 2005) (BLS)
- Clayton, M. Herbert, T. and Middleton, R. (Eds.), *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction* (New York, 2003)
- Colley, L. *Britons: Forging the Nation, 1707-1837* (New Haven: London, 2005)
- Cook, C. *The Routledge Companion to Britain in the Nineteenth Century, 1815-1914* (Abingdon, 2005)
- Cooper, T. L. *Brass Bands of Yorkshire*, (Clapham, Yorks, 1974)
- Corbridge, S. L. *It's An Old Lancashire Custom* (Preston, 1952, this edition, 1964)
- Cornes M. *The Industrial Triangle: Work and Society in the Towns of Heywood, Middleton and Rochdale, 1840-1870* (PhD thesis, University of Huddersfield, 2000)
- Cowgill, R. and Holman, P. (Eds.), *Music in the British Provinces, 1690-1914* (Aldershot, 2007)
- Cowgill, R. 'Disputing Choruses in 1760s Halifax: Jonah Bates, William Herschell and the "Messiah" Club', in, Cowgill, R. and Holman, P. (Eds.), *Music in the British Provinces, 1690-1914* (Aldershot, 2007), pp. 87-114
- Cowgill, R. 'The Business of Music in late Georgian and Victorian Halifax, c. 1760-1901', *Transactions of the Halifax Antiquarian Society*, 10 (2002), pp. 77-95 (HXLS)
- Cowgill, R. "'The Most Musical Spot for its Size in the Kingdom": Music in Georgian Halifax', *Early Music*, 28 (2000), pp. 557-575
- Crow, G. and Graham, A. *Community Life An Introduction to Local Social Relations* (Hemel Hempstead, 1994)
- Crystal, D. *The Stories of English* (London, 2004)
- Cudworth, W. *Music in Bradford* (Bradford, 1885) (BRLS)
- Cunningham, H. *Leisure in the Industrial Revolution* (London, 1980)

- Cunningham, H. 'The Metropolitan Fairs: A Case Study in the Social Control of Leisure', in, Donajrodzki, A. P. (Ed.), *Social Control in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (London, 1977), pp. 163-184
- Dale, C. 'The Provincial Music Festival in Nineteenth-Century England: A Case Study of Bridlington', in, Cowgill, R. and Holman, P. (Eds.), *Music in the British Provinces, 1690-1914* (Aldershot, 2007), pp. 325-348
- Davies, A. *Leisure, Gender and Poverty: Working-Class Culture in Salford and Manchester, 1900-1939* (Buckingham, 1992)
- D'Cruz, S. 'Sex, Violence and Local Courts: Working-Class Respectability in a Mid-Victorian Lancashire Town', *British Journal of Criminology* 39/1 (Special Edition, 1999), pp. 47-49
- Dearnley, C. *English Church Music, 1650-1750: In Royal Chapel, Cathedral and Parish Church* (London, 1970)
- Dellheim, C. 'Imagining England: Victorian Views of the North', *Northern History*, XXII (1986), pp. 126-130
- Dentith, S. *Society and Cultural Forms in Nineteenth-Century England* (Basingstoke, 1998)
- Donajrodzki, A. P. (Ed.), *Social Control in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (London, 1977)
- Drage, S. 'The Larks of Dean: Amateur Musicians in the North of England', in, Cowgill, R. and Holman, P. (Eds.), *Music in the British Provinces, 1690-1914* (Aldershot, 2007), pp. 195-222
- Durrell, L. *The Spirit of Place* (New York, 1969)
- Edwards J. *Ordinary People: A Study of Factors Affecting Communication in the Provision of Services*. (PhD Thesis, University of Manchester, 1990)
- Ehrlich, C. *The Music Profession in Britain Since the Eighteenth Century: A Social History* (Oxford, 1985)
- Ehrlich, C. *The Piano: A Social History* (London and Dent, 1976)
- Ehrlich, C. and Russell, D. 'Victorian Music: A Perspective', *Journal of Victorian Culture*, Vol. 13 (1998), pp. 111-122
- Elbourne, R. P. *Music and Tradition in Early Industrial Lancashire* (Woodbridge, 1980)
- Elbourne, R. P. "Singing Away to the Click of the Shuttle": Musical Life in the Handloom Weaving Communities of Lancashire', *Local Historian*, 12 (1976), pp. 13-17

Engel, C. *An Introduction to the Study of National Music, Comprising Researches into Popular Songs, Traditions and Customs* (London, 1866)

Farr, R. *The Distin Family Legacy: The Rise of the Brass Band in 19<sup>th</sup> Century Britain* (Newcastle-Upon-Tyne, 2013)

Finnegan, R. *The Hidden Musicians: Music-Making in An English Town* (Cambridge, 1989)

Fitzgerald, R. 'Rowntree, Joseph (1836–1925)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Oxford University Press, 2004  
<<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/35857>>, accessed, 22 January, 2013

Flanders, J. *Consuming Passions: Leisure and Pleasure in Victorian Britain* (London, 2006)

Forbes, R. 'A Study in Music, Community and Identity in a Late Nineteenth-Century Victorian Town', *Journal of Victorian Culture* Volume 11. Number 2 (2006), pp. 256-280

Francis, M. "The Domestication of the Male? Recent Research on Nineteenth - and Twentieth-Century British Masculinity", *The Historical Journal*, 45/3 (2002), pp. 637-652

Galloway, W. M. *Musical England* (New York, 1910)

Gammon, V. and Gammon, S. 'The Musical Revolution of the Mid-Nineteenth Century: From 'Repeat and Twiddle' to 'Precision and Snap'', in, Herbert, T. (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), pp.122-154

Gilbert, D. 'Imagined Communities and Mining Communities', *Labour History Review*, vol.60, no.2 (1995), pp. 47-55

Gilmore, D. D. *Manhood in the Making: Cultural Concepts of Masculinity* (Yale, 1990)

Golby, J. M. and Purdue A. W. *The Civilisation of the Crowd, Popular Culture in England, 1750-1900* (Sutton, 1999)

Goldby, D. J. *Instrumental Teaching in Nineteenth Century Britain* (Abingdon, 2004)

Granovetter, M. 'The Strength of Weak Ties', *American Journal of Sociology*, 78/6, pp. 1360-1380.

Gunn, S. 'The Sublime and the Vulgar: the Halle Concerts and the Constitution of High Culture in Manchester, c.1850-1880', *The Journal of Victorian Culture*, 2/2 (Autumn, 1997), pp. 208-228

- Haigh, H. A. (Ed.), *Huddersfield: A Most Handsome Town: Aspects of the History and Culture of a West Yorkshire Town* (Huddersfield, 1992)
- Hailstone, A. *The British Bandsman Centenary Book, A Social History of Brass Bands* (Baldock, 1987)
- Harding, V. 'Introduction: Music and Urban Identity', *Urban History*, Vol. 29. No. 1 (2002), pp. 5-7
- Harris, J. *Private Lives, Public Spirit: Britain 1870-1914* (Oxford, 1993, this edition, London, 1994)
- Harvey, K. and Shepard, A. 'What Have Historians Done with Masculinity? Reflections on Five Centuries of British History, circa 1500-1950', *Journal of British Studies*, Vol 44. No. 2 (2005), pp. 274-280
- Haweis, H. R. *Music and Morals*, (London, 1890, this edition 1917)
- Helme, C. *What Brass Bands Did For Me* (Stroud, 2009)
- Herbert, T. (Ed.), *Bands: The Brass Band Movement in the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> Centuries* (Buckingham, 1991)
- Herbert, T. (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000)
- Herbert, T. 'God's Perfect Minstrels: The Bands of the Salvation Army', in, Herbert, T. (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), pp. 187-216
- Herbert, T. 'Nineteenth-Century Bands: Making a Movement', in, Herbert, T. (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), pp.10-67
- Herbert, T. and Barlow, H. 'The British Military as a Musical Institution' in Paul Rodmell (Ed.), *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Music and Institutions in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (Abingdon, 2012), pp. 247-265.
- Herbert, T. and Wallace, J. 'Aspects of Performance Practices: The Brass Band and Its Influence on Other Brass-Playing Styles', in, Trevor Herbert (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), pp. 278-305.
- Herbert, T. 'The Practice and Context of a Victorian Brass Band', in Bennett, Z. (Ed.), *Nineteenth-Century British Music Studies, Vol. 1* (Aldershot, 1999), pp. 105-18
- Herbert, T. 'Victorian Brass Bands: Class, Taste and Space' in Reynolds G. et al (Eds.), *The Place of Music: Music, Space and the Production of Place*, (New York and London, 1998), pp. 104-128

Herbert, T. Gladney, John (1838-1911) *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford, 2004), <[www.oxfordnb.com/view/article/48776](http://www.oxfordnb.com/view/article/48776)>

Herbert, T. *Swift, Edwin* (1843-1904), *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford, 2004), <[www.oxfordnb.com/view/article/48776](http://www.oxfordnb.com/view/article/48776)>

Herbert, T. 'The Repertory of a Victorian Provincial Brass Band', *Popular Music*, Vol. 9, No. 1(1990), pp. 117-132

Herbert, T. 'Selling Brass Instruments: The Commercial Imaging of Brass Instruments (1830-1930) and its Cultural Messages', in *Music in Art: the International Journal for Music Iconography*, 28/1-2 (Spring-Fall 2004), pp. 213-26

Herbert, T. 'Victorian Brass Bands: The Establishment of a Working Class Musical Tradition', *Historic Brass Society Journal* No 4 (New York, 1992), pp. 1-11

Herbert, T. and Sarkissian M 'Victorian Bands and their Dissemination in the Colonies', *Popular Music*, Vol. 16, No. 2 (1997), pp. 167-181

Herbert, T. with Myers, A. 'Music for the Multitude: Accounts of the Brass Bands Entering Enderby Jackson's Crystal Palace Contests in the 1860s', *Early Music*, Vol. 38, No. 4, (November 2010), pp. 571-584

Hill, J. and Williams, J. (Eds.), *Sport and Identity in the North of England* (Keele, 1996)

Hillery, G. A. 'Definitions of Community: Areas of Agreement', *Rural Sociology*, 20 (1955), p. 111-123.

Hind, H. *The Brass Band* (London, 1934)

Hindmarsh, P. 'Building a Repertoire: Original Compositions for the British Brass Band, 1913-1998', in Herbert, T. (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), pp. 245-277

Hobsbawm, E. J. *Industry and Empire From 1750 to the Present Day* (London, 1968, this edition, updated with Chris Wrigley, London, 1999)

Hobsbawm, E. J. *The Age of Capital, 1848-1875* (London, 1977, this edition, 1980)

Hobsbawm, E. J. *Uncommon People: Resistance, Rebellion and Jazz* (London, 1998, this edition, London, 1999)

Hogarth, G. *Musical History, Biography and Criticism* (London, 1835)

- Hoggart, R. *The Uses of Literacy: Aspects of Working-Class Life With Special Reference to Publications and Entertainments* (Harmondsworth, 1958)
- Hudson, R. 'Regions and Place: Music, Identity and Place', *Progress in Human Geography* Vol. 30 No. 5 (2006) pp. 626–634
- Jewell, H. M. *The North-South Divide. The Origins of Northern Consciousness in England* (Manchester, 1994)
- Jordan, A. 'Public Parks, 1885-1914', *Garden History* Vol. 22 No.1 (Summer, 1994), pp. 85-113
- Joyce, P. *Visions of the People: Industrial England and the Question of Class, 1848-1914* (Cambridge, 1991, this edition, 1994)
- Joyce, P. 'Work', in F. M. L. Thompson (Ed.), *The Cambridge Social History of Britain, 1750-1950, Volume 2: People and Their Environment* (Cambridge, 1990), pp. 131-194
- Joyce, P. *Work, Society and Politics: The Culture of the Factory in Later Victorian England* (Brighton, 1980, this edition, London, 1982)
- Joyce, P. 'The End of Social History?' *Social History*, 1995, Vol. 20, No.1 (1995), pp. 73-91
- Kamper, D. S. 'Popular Sunday Newspapers, Respectability and Working-Class Culture in Late Victorian Britain' in, Huggins, M. and Mangan, J.A. (Eds.), *Disreputable Pleasures: Less Virtuous Victorians at Play* (London, 2004), pp. 83-102
- Kirk, N. (Ed.), *Northern Identities, Historical Interpretations of 'The North' and 'Northernness'* (Aldershot, 2000)
- Lancaster, B. Newton, D. and Vall, N. (Eds.), *An Agenda for Regional History* (Newcastle-Upon-Tyne, 2007)
- Langley, L. 'The Musical Press in Nineteenth-Century England', *Notes*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Series, 46/3 (March, 1990), pp. 583-592
- Langton, J. 'The Industrial Revolution and the Regional Geography of England', *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 9/2 (1984), pp. 145-167
- Laybourn, K. (Ed.), *Social Conditions Status and Community, 1860-c.1920* (Stroud, 1997)
- Lawrence, J. *Speaking for the People: Party, Language and Popular Politics, 1867-1914* (Cambridge, 1998)
- Lawrence, J. 'Class and Gender in the Making of Urban Toryism, 1880-1914', *English Historical Review*, 108/428 (1993), pp. 695-692

- Lennenberg, H. 'Speculating about Sociology and Social History', *The Journal of Musicology*, 6/4 (October, 1988,) pp. 409-423
- Lloyd, A. T. *Folksong in England* (Lancaster, 1964)
- Lockwood, E. *Colne Valley Folk, the Romance and Enterprise of a Textile Stronghold* (Heath Canton, 1936) (HLS)
- Lomas, M. J. *Amateur Brass and Wind Bands in Southern England Between the Late Eighteenth Century and Circa 1900* (PhD Thesis, The Open University, 1990)
- Macfarlane, A. 'History, Anthropology and the Study of Communities', *Social History* (May, 1977), pp. 17-23
- Macgill, L. 'The Emergence of Public Parks in Keighley, West Yorkshire, 1887-93: Leisure, Pleasure or Reform?' *Garden History*, Vol 35. No 2 (Winter, 2007), pp. 146-159
- Mackerness E. D. *A Social History of English Music* (London, 1964)
- MacRaild, D. M. and David M. E., *Labour in British Society, 1830 -1914* (London and New York, 2000)
- Mangan, J. A. and Walvin L. (Eds.), *Manliness and Morality, Middle-Class Masculinity in Britain and America, 1800-1940* (Manchester, 1987)
- Millington, W. *Sketches of Local Musicians and Musical Societies* (Pendlebury, 1884) (SLS)
- McKenzie, C. and Mangan, J. A. 'Duty unto Death'– the Sacrificial Warrior: English Middle Class Masculinity and Militarism in the Age of the New Imperialism', *The International Journal of the History of Sport* Vol 25. No 9 (2008), pp. 1080-1105
- McKibbin, R. 'Work and Hobbies in Britain, 1880-1950', in, *The Ideologies of Class: Social Relations in Britain 1880-1950* (Oxford, 1994, this edition, Oxford, 1999), pp.139-136
- McLeod, H. *Religion and Society in England, 1850-1914* (Basingstoke, 1996)
- McClelland, K. 'Some Thoughts on Masculinity and the "Representative Artisan" in Britain 1850-80', *Gender & History* Vol.1.No. 2 (1989), pp. 164-177
- McWilliam, R. *Popular Politics in Nineteenth-Century England* (London, 1998)
- Marshall, J. M. *Rambles around Rossendale* (Darwen, 1844, this edition, Darwen, 1850) (RLS)
- Marshall W. *The Creation of Yorkshireness, Cultural Identities in Yorkshire c.1850-1915* (PhD thesis, University of Huddersfield, 2011)



Martin, J. 'Pigeon Racing and Working-Class Culture in Britain, 1870-1950', *Cultural History: The Journal of the Social History Society* Vol 4.No.3. (2007), pp. 361-383

Massey, D. 'Places and Their Pasts', *History Workshop Journal*, 39 (1995), pp. 182-192

Mitroulia, E. *Adolphe Sax's Brasswind Production With a Focus on Saxhorns and Related Instruments* (PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh, 2011)

Moore, C. *The Industrial Age: Economy and Society in Britain, 1750-1995* (London, 1997)

Mumford, L. *The City in History* (New York, 1961)

Musgrove, F. 'The Rise of a Northern Musical Élite', *Northern History*, Vol. 35. No.1 (January, 1999), pp. 50-76

Myers, A. *Brass Instruments: Their History and Development* (London, 1976, this edition, 1980)

Myers, A. 'Design Technology and Manufacture Since 1800', in Trevor Herbert and John Wallace (Eds.) *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments* (Cambridge, 1997, online edition 20011),  
<<http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/CCOL9780521563437>>

Myers, A. 'Instruments and Instrumentation of British Brass Bands', in, Herbert, T. (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), pp.155-186

Nettel, R. *Music in the Five Towns, 1840-1914: A Study of the Social Influences of Music in an Industrial District* (Oxford, 1944)

Nettel, R. 'The influence of the Industrial Revolution on English Music', *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association*, seventy-second session (1945-1946), pp. 23-40

Newby, H. 'The Deferential Dialectic', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Number 2 (April, 1975), pp. 139-164

Newsome, R. *Brass Roots: A Hundred Years of Brass Bands and Their Music, 1836-1936* (Sutton, 1998)

Newsome, R. *150 Golden Years: The History of Black Dyke Band* (London, 2005)

Newsome R. *The Nineteenth Century Brass Band in Northern England, Musical and Social Factors in the Development of A Major Amateur Musical Medium* (PhD Thesis, Salford University, 1990)

O'Neill, J. 'Village Band', *Oral History Journal*, Vol. 15, No. 1 (Spring, 1987), pp. 50-53

Patrikis, P.C. *Piano Roles: Three Hundred Years of Life With the Piano* (Yale, 1999)

Peel, A. *Crawshawbooth and District* (Rawtenstall, 1960) (RLS)

Pieper, A. 'Music and Middle-Class Culture in Early Nineteenth-Century Leipzig and Birmingham', *Cultural and Social History: The Journal of the Social History Society*, Vol 5. No.1 (2008), pp. 53-78

Poole, R. 'Lancashire Wakes Week', *History Today*, 34/8 (August 1984), pp. 22-23.

Rawnsley, S. 'Constructing the "North": Space and a Sense of Place, in, Kirk, N. (Ed.), *Northern Identities, Historical Interpretations of 'The North' and 'Northernness'* (Aldershot, 2000), pp. 3-22

Rees-Lehay, H. "'Walking for Pleasure?'" Bodies of Display at The Manchester Art Exhibition in 1857', *Art History*, 30/4, (September 2007), pp. 545-565

Reid, D.A. "The Decline of Saint Monday 1766-1866", *Past and Present*, No. 71 (May, 1976), pp. 76-101

Relph, E. *Place and Placelessness* (London, 1976)

Roberts, R. *The Classic Slum: Salford Life in the First Quarter of the Century* (Harmondsworth, 1973)

Rodmell, P. (Ed.), *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Music and Institutions in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (Abingdon, 2012)

Roper, M. and Tosh, J. (Eds.), *Manful Assertions, Masculinities in Britain since 1800*, (London, 1991)

Rose, A.S. *Talks With Bandsmen: A Popular Handbook for Brass Instrumentalists* (London, 1895)

Rose, J. *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes* (New Haven and London, 2001)

Russell, A. 'Local Elites and the Working-Class Response in the North-West, 1870–1895: Paternalism and Deference Reconsidered', *Northern History*, Vol. 23. No.1 (January, 1987), pp. 153-173

Russell, D. *Looking North: Northern England and the National Imagination* (Manchester, 2000)

Russell, D. *Popular Music in England 1840-1914: A Social History* (Manchester, 1987, this edition 1991)

Russell, D. 'Culture and the Formation of Northern Identities from c.1850', in, Lancaster, B. Newton, D. and Vall, N. (Eds.), *An Agenda for Regional History* (Newcastle-Upon-Tyne, 2007), pp. 271-288

Russell, D. "Music in Huddersfield, c.1820–1914", in Haigh, H. A. (Ed.), *Huddersfield: A Most Handsome Town: Aspects of the History and Culture of a West Yorkshire Town* (Huddersfield, 1992)

Russell, D. 'Music and Northern Identity, 1890-1965', in, Kirk, N. (Ed.), *Northern Identities, Historical Interpretations of 'The North' and 'Northernness'* (Aldershot, 2000), pp. 23-46

Russell, D. 'Musicians in the English Provincial City, Manchester c. 1860-1914', in, Bashford C. and Langley L. (Eds.), *Music and British Culture, 1785-1914: Essays in Honour of Cyrill Ehrlich* (Oxford and New York, 2000), pp. 235-534

Russell, D. 'Popular Entertainments', in Donohue, J. *The Cambridge History of British Theatre*, Volume 2, 1660-1895 (Cambridge, 2004), pp. 369-187

Russell, D. 'What's Wrong with Brass Bands?' Cultural Change and the Band Movement', in, Herbert, T. (Ed.), *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford, 2000), pp. 68-121

Russell, D. Owen, Alexander (1851-1920), *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, (Oxford, 2004), < <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/48781>>

Russell, D. 'The Leeds Rational Recreation Society, 1852-9: "Music for the People" in a Mid-Victorian City', *The Thoresby Miscellany*, 17 (Leeds, 1981), pp.137-158

Russell, D. 'Provincial concerts in England, 1865-1914: A Case Study of Bradford', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 114/1 (1989), pp. 43-55.

Russell, D. 'The 'Social History' of Popular Music: A Label Without a Cause?' *Popular Music*, Vol.12. No. 2 (May 1993), pp.139-154

Russell, D. 'Sport and Identity: 'The Case of Yorkshire County Cricket Club, 1830-1939', *20<sup>th</sup> Century British History*, 7 (1996), pp. 206-230

Russell, D. *The Popular Music Societies of the Yorkshire Textile District, 1850-1914: A Study of the Relationships between Music and Society* (PhD Thesis, University of York, 1979)

Russell, J. F. and Elliot, J. H. *The Brass Band Movement* (London, 1936)

- Sanderson, M. 'Social Change and Elementary Education in Industrial Lancashire, 1780-1840', *Northern History*, 3 (1968), pp. 130-154.
- Scholes, P. A. *Everyman and His Music: Simple Papers on Various Subjects* (New York 1917, this edition, 1969)
- Scott, D. B. 'Music and Social Class in Victorian London', *Urban History*, 29/1 (2002), pp. 60-73
- Scott, D. B. 'Music, Morality and Rational Amusement at the Victorian Middle-Class Soirée' in, Bennett Zon (Ed.), *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Music and Performance Culture in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Essays in Honour of Nicholas Temperley* (Farnham, 2012), pp. 83-101.
- Scott, J. L. *The Evolution of the Brass Band and its Repertoire in Northern England* (PhD Thesis, University of Sheffield, 1970)
- Simpson, J. *A History of Edenfield and District* (Edenfield, 2003)
- Sigsworth, E. *Black Dyke Mills* (Liverpool, 1958)
- Smith, A. *An Improbable Centenary: The Life and Times of The Slaithwaite Philharmonic Orchestra, 1891-1900* (Huddersfield, 1990) (HLS)
- Smith, J. S. *A Musical Pilgrimage in Yorkshire* (Leeds, 1928) (LLS)
- Snell, K. D. M. 'The Sunday-School Movement in England and Wales: Child Labour, Denominational Control and Working-Class Culture', *Past & Present*, No. 164 (August, 1999), pp. 122-168
- Solie, R. R. 'No 'Land Without Music' After all', *Victorian Literature and Culture*, 32/1 (March, 2004), pp. 261-276.
- Spence, P. 'Bamford Samuel (1788-1882)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford), 2004, online edition (2009), <[www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/1256](http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/1256)>
- Springhall, J. 'Building Character in the British Boy: The Attempt to Extend Christian Manliness to Working-Class Adolescents, 1880-1914' in, Mangan, J. A. and Walvin, J. (Eds.), *Manliness and Morality, Middle-Class Masculinity in Britain and America, 1800-1940* (Manchester, 1987), pp. 52-74
- Steadman-Jones, G. *Languages of Class: Studies in English Working-Class History, 1832-1982* (Cambridge, 1983)
- Steadman-Jones, G. 'Class Expression Versus Social Control? A Critique of Recent Trends in the Social History of 'Leisure'', *History Workshop Journal*, 4/1 (1977), pp. 162-170

- Stebbins, R. A. 'Music Among Friends: The Social Networks of Amateur Musicians', *International Review of Sociology* (Series II, April-August, 1976), pp. 52-73
- Stokes, M. (Ed.) *Ethnicity and Identity: The Musical Construction of Place* (Oxford, 1994)
- Storch, R. D. 'The Problem of Working-Class Leisure. Some Roots of Middle-Class Moral Reform in the Industrial North', in, Donajgradzki, A. P. (Ed.), *Social Control in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (London, 1977), pp. 138-165
- Sykes, D. F. E. *The History of the Colne Valley* (Slaithwaite, 1906) (HLS)
- Sykes, R.A. 'Some Aspects of Working-Class Consciousness in Oldham, 1830-1842', *The Historical Journal*, Vol 23. No1. (March, 1980), pp. 167-179.
- Taruskin, R. 'The Symphony Goes (Inter)National', *The Oxford History of Western Music* (Online Edition)  
<<http://www.oxfordwesternmusic.com.libaccess.hud.ac.uk/view/Volume3/actrade-978019538433-div1-014009.xml>>
- Taylor, A. R. *Brass Bands* (St Albans and London, 1979)
- Taylor, A. R. *Labour and Love, An Oral History of the Brass Band Movement* (London, 1983)
- Thompson, D. T. *Nonconformity in the Nineteenth Century* (London, 1972)
- Thompson, E. P. *Customs in Common*, (first published, London, 1991, this edition, 1993)
- Thompson, E. P. *The Making of the English Working Class* (London, 1963, this edition, 1991)
- Thompson, E. P. 'History from Below', *Times Literary Supplement* (7 April, 1966), pp. 279-80.
- Thompson, E. P. 'The Moral Economy of the Crowd in the Eighteenth Century', *Past and Present*, 50 (February, 1971), pp. 76-136
- Thompson, E. P. 'Time, Work-Discipline, and Industrial Capitalism', *Past & Present*, 38 (1967), pp. 56-197
- Thompson, F. M. L. *The Rise of Respectable Society: A Social History of Victorian Britain, 1830-1900* (Harvard, 1988)
- Thompson, F. M. L. 'Social Control in Victorian Britain', *The Economic History Review*, 34/2 (May, 1981), pp. 189-208

- Tosh, J. *A Man's Place: Masculinity and the Middle-Class Home in Victorian England* (London and Yale, 1999)
- Tosh, J. 'The Old Adam and the New Man: Emerging Themes in the History of English Masculinities, 1750-1850' in, Hitchcock T. and Cohen M. (Eds.), *English Masculinities, 1660-1800* (London, 1999), pp. 217-238
- Tosh, J. 'Gentlemanly Politeness and Manly Simplicity in Victorian England', *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 6<sup>th</sup> Series, 12 (2002), pp. 455-472
- Tosh, J. 'Masculinities in an Industrializing Society: Britain, 1800-1914', *Journal of British Studies*, 44 (April 2005), pp. 330-342
- Turner, G. *The North Country* (London, 1967)
- Vernon, J. *Politics and the People, A Study in English Political Culture, c.1815-1867* (Cambridge, 1993)
- Vickers, P. *Let's All Have a Real Good Time: Popular Entertainment in Longridge, 1840-1920* (Preston, 2001) (LRO)
- Waites, B. 'Brass Bands,' by Arthur Taylor, *Popular Music*, 1 (1981), pp. 210-211
- Wales, K. *Northern English: A Social and Cultural History* (Cambridge, 2006)
- Walker, P. J. *Pulling the Devil's Kingdom Down: The Salvation Army in Victorian Britain* (Berkeley, 2001)
- Walsh, S. 'Beatrice Webb and Bacup', *Manchester Region History Review*, Vol.3. No. 2 (Autumn/Winter, 1989-90), pp. 9-14
- Walton, J and Walvin, B. *Leisure in Britain, 1780-1939* (Manchester, 1983)
- Ward, P. *Britishness Since 1870* (London, 2004)
- Waters, C. *British Socialists and the Politics of Popular Culture 1884-1914* (Manchester, 1990)
- Waters, F. and Berryman, J. *A History of the Virtuosi Brass Band of Great Britain* (Huddersfield, 2004)
- Watkins, S. and Phillips, J. C. 'Three Choirs Festival', *Grove Music Online*, *Oxford Music Online*  
<<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/279013>>
- Weber, W. *Music and the Middle Class: The Social Structure of Concert Life in London, Paris and Vienna* (London, 1975)
- Williams. R. *Keywords* (London, 1976)
- Wrigley, F. *Brass Bands, Stalybridge and Me* (Manchester, 2000)

**Blogs:**

*The Digital Victorianist* :< <http://www.digitalvictorianist.com>>

**Websites:**

*Brass Band Results* :< <http://brassbandresults.co.uk>>

*Bolton Revisited* :< [www.boltonrevisited.org.uk](http://www.boltonrevisited.org.uk)>

*Cardiff University: News, Events and Conferences:*

<<http://www.cardiff.ac.uk/music/newsandevents/events/conferences/13MNCB/aboutMNCB.html>>

*Hall Genealogy Website: Old Occupations* :< [www.rmhh.co.uk/occup/s.html](http://www.rmhh.co.uk/occup/s.html)>

*Huddersfield University: Centre for the Study of Music, Gender and Identity*

(MuGi) <<http://www.hud.ac.uk/research/researchcentres/mugi/>>

*The Internet Bandsman's Everything Within*<[www.ibew.co.uk](http://www.ibew.co.uk)>

*History of Mossley*<[www.mossley.net/history.htm](http://www.mossley.net/history.htm)>

*History of Todmorden Orchestra*:< [www.todmordenorchestra.org.uk/History.htm](http://www.todmordenorchestra.org.uk/History.htm)>

*Music and Cultures Research Group at the Open*

*University*:<<http://www.open.ac.uk/Arts/music/musiccult.shtml>>

*Natural England-36 Southern Pennines*

*Profile*<[www.naturalengland.org.uk/publication/nca/southern\\_pennines.aspx](http://www.naturalengland.org.uk/publication/nca/southern_pennines.aspx)>

*The Retrospective Index to Music Periodicals (1766-1962)*

<[www.ripn.org/titles\\_indexed.php5#ENGLISHUK](http://www.ripn.org/titles_indexed.php5#ENGLISHUK)>

*The Southern Pennines Packhorse Trails Trust, 1984*

<<http://www.spptt.org.uk/about-us/ancient-highways-in-the-south-pennines/>>