Shame and using mental health services: Connection and validation or alienation and objectification?

Original Citation


This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/18593/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/
Shame and using mental health services: 
*Connection and validation or alienation and objectification?*

Dawn Leeming¹ & Mary Boyle²

¹. University of Huddersfield; ². University of East London
Aim:

- To explore how mental health services risk exacerbating the emotional problems they are charged to address
  - focus on the issue of shame
Providing help to deal with feelings of shame

I feel worthless

I'm a pathetic piece of *** - I feel better when I've hurt myself

I binge / drink to stop myself feeling so bad about myself, and then I feel ashamed of my behaviour

I just wanted to hurt him - he made me feel so stupid

I couldn't cope, I still can't cope - I'm a disgrace. I should be able to cope.

I feel stupid & clumsy & inadequate in front of others

There's something wrong with me - I'm going mad
Shame in the eyes of the other

- Shame has sometimes been viewed by clinical theorists as negative self-evaluation (e.g. Tangney; Lewis)

However, often shame is a social phenomenon

- A painful awareness of one’s devaluation in the eyes of the potential or actual other (e.g. Goffman; Erikson; Satre; Scheff; Gilbert)
- Useful concept for thinking about how external positioning by others (or possibility of this) gets inside
- Importance of social context for repairing shame
Conditions for repairing shame

Theory & recent empirical findings tell us:

Connection

Articulating & acknowledging shame

Empowerment

Acceptance, validation, compassion

Normalisation & contextualisation of experiences

(Brown, 2006; Gilbert & Proctor, 2006; Leeming & Boyle, 2012; van Vliet, 2008)

Art work credit: Hero-in-shame, Deviantart.com
Can mental health services provide these conditions?

- Numerous critiques of mental health services for disempowering, degrading, blaming service users (e.g. Chamberlin, 1988; Johnstone, 2000; Newnes, Holmes & Dunn, 1999, 2001; Boyle, 2002; Coles, Keenan & Diamond, 2013)

- Becoming a user of mental health services can invoke highly stigmatising identity
Our data

From project on managing potential for shame in accessing mental health services:

- Interviews with 22 service-users 15-89 yrs
- One of themes: Being diminished by staff
  - subthemes: negative judgements; alienation & rejection; restriction of autonomy; involuntary exposure & scrutiny
“it was humiliating...cos it was like I was like on trial, every week when I went to a ward round....they’re all sitting there with their clipboards like saying ‘Oh yes, you’re still not eating enough’.... And you just sit there and... I hated it...they were constantly criticising me.”

“I got lower in my state of mind. I didn’t feel like a person, I felt like a number somewhere... stuck away somewhere, like a number”

“some of the staff I got on with and some I didn’t, because I found some were very arrogant and they couldn’t care less. You were there as a patient and that’s how you stopped and their word was law”

I’ve had other psychiatrists and it’s just like er I’m just a face on medication, and whether I’m stable or not, you know like safe, but that doesn’t help cos you get 15 minutes
However…

Some found the validation & acceptance of staff crucial:

..professional people understanding me well and treating me like a person - not like an inferiority complex or whatever…that’s important…They accept me for what I am or as I am (.) and they haven’t thrown me out or chucked me on the scrap heap

She made me feel welcome. Cos I did think that she’d like look at me like ‘Ah’ I dunno, cos I didn’t, I never been to one of these sort of places before. I thought she’d look at me like, … like dirt or somink, but she didn’t.
Why do things go wrong?

- One key factor may be the medicalisation of extremes of distress and problematic behaviour
  - produces conditions at odds with those necessary for the repair of shame
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Repair of shame</th>
<th>Diagnostic practices</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Articulating &amp; acknowledging shame</td>
<td>• Focus on form rather than content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Connection</td>
<td>• Distance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Normalising experiences</td>
<td>• Identifying abnormality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Contextualising experiences</td>
<td>• De-contextualising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Self-understanding &amp; acceptance</td>
<td>• Prioritising professional understandings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Empowerment</td>
<td>• Professional control</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Summary & conclusions

- When accessing mental health services, people are often struggling with feelings of shame.
- The way in which diagnostic practices structure helping relationships can be problematic for repairing shame.
- The recent position statement by the DCP on diagnosis is to be welcomed.
  - provides support for alternatives to medical understandings of distress.