



University of HUDDERSFIELD

University of Huddersfield Repository

Simmons, Robin

A review of Lee, A. and Danby, S. (2012) Reshaping Doctoral Education: international approaches and pedagogies

Original Citation

Simmons, Robin (2012) A review of Lee, A. and Danby, S. (2012) Reshaping Doctoral Education: international approaches and pedagogies. *British Journal of educational studies*, 60 (3). pp. 281-282. ISSN 0007-1005

This version is available at <http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/14774/>

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

<http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/>

Book Review

Reshaping Doctoral Education: International Approaches and Pedagogies. By A. Lee and S. Danby (Eds). Pp. 221. Routledge. 2012 ISBN 9780415618137

The impact of globalisation alongside the spread of economic and political neo-liberalism has led to a commercialisation of virtually all forms of education, but perhaps doctoral education especially. This presents a range of challenges and opportunities and the fifteen chapters in this edited collection focus on implications for the way doctoral education is structured, designed and delivered. In the UK and other European countries the number of students enrolled on doctoral programmes has almost doubled over the last ten years, and the USA now produces over 40,000 doctoral graduates each year (p. 3). Increasingly, students from China, India and other 'non-Western' nations are undertaking doctorates, either with universities in Europe, North America or Australasia, or through the rapidly expanding number of doctoral programmes offered elsewhere. Meanwhile, advances in information technology make remote study a possibility - at least in theory, and sometimes in practice. Whilst policy initiatives such as the Bologna Process have attempted to provide a degree of consistency in the nature of higher education across national boundaries, doctoral education is characterised by increasing difference. As Park (2007) highlights, the spread of professional doctorates as an alternative to the more traditional PhD has meant more formally taught content and a shift towards a cohort rather than an individual experience for many undertaking doctoral programmes.

This book attempts to theorise different pedagogical practices found within a range of doctorates in a variety of contexts. It is split into three sections and is written by over thirty contributors from 8 nations; notably, some chapters are based upon a dialogue between research supervisors and current or past doctoral students. The first section of the book focuses on 'old' and 'new' forms of doctoral pedagogy. Traditionally, aspiring academics, supervised on an individual basis, studied discrete disciplines and submitted a tome-like thesis at the end of an extended period of research. However, whilst the experiences of some contemporary doctoral students is not dissimilar to those of previous generations, there is also little doubt that doctoral education has undergone significant change in recent years. The chapters by Manathunga on team supervision, Zuckas and Lundgaard Anderson on doctoral summer schools, and Abrandt Dahlgren and Bjuremark on doctoral seminars offer thought-provoking analyses of a range of pedagogies and provide valuable insight into some of the structured forms of tuition which now form part of many doctoral programmes. Gabrys and Beltechi's *Cognitive apprenticeship*, describes a structured programme of generic skills training run by the Mathematical, Physical and Life Sciences Division at the University of Oxford, and the different forms of pedagogy used in this programme. Using the work of Collins *et al* (1991) as a reference point, this chapter poses important questions about the role of transferable skills in doctoral education, their place alongside specialist knowledge, and their role in equipping doctoral students for the workplace – whether in academia or elsewhere.

The second section deals with a range of doctoral programmes in different fields of study, and the challenges of working across traditional boundaries. Adkins *et al's* chapter *Pedagogies of industry partnership* uses Bernstein's (2000) work on pedagogic practice as a conceptual framework to explore the different pedagogic discourses and identities associated with particular formations of knowledge, and some of the tensions between the demands of academic research and its

application to industrial settings. Such debates are particularly pertinent as much remodelling of doctoral education is driven, at least to some degree, by dominant discourses of globalisation and the 'knowledge economy'. Willetts *et al* focus on the current fashion for transdisciplinary research – a trend which they relate to the 'increasingly complex challenges that defy disciplinary boundaries and demand new and varied ways of engaging with research contexts...' (p. 129). Rooted in a postmodern analysis, their chapter deals with the tensions associated with 'borderless' inquiry, both for students and supervisors.

The book's third section is concerned with intercultural dimensions associated with the increasing internationalisation of doctoral education. Abrandt *et al*'s chapter *The graduate school in the sky* provides a critical overview of 'Doctoralnet', an international network for doctoral students and senior researchers which uses a range of face-to-face and on-line pedagogies. Their discussion of the 'distributed' and 'horizontal' offers an insight into some of the possibilities peer relationships can offer in doctoral education. Singh and Chan focus on the experience of Chinese doctoral students in Australia, and the way non-Western knowledge and resources can be marginalised, particularly in Anglophone settings, where academics are often limited in their desire to access non-Western theories and reluctant to have students engage with ideas outside mainstream Western intellectual tradition. McKinley and Grant's account of the experiences of Indigenous doctoral students in New Zealand is illuminating. Drawing on interviews with Maori students and the supervisors of Maori students, they discuss the academic and emotional 'double transformation' with which many Indigenous students are faced, and argue the case for 'difference pedagogies' in engaging with Maori and other minority students. The Indigenous concept of ako learning, a process which requires presence and spontaneity, poses questions for advocates of some of the more distributed and remote forms of pedagogy discussed elsewhere in this book.

Despite a growing literature, doctoral education is notably under-researched and under-theorised, and issues of pedagogy are often overlooked. In this book Alison Lee and Susan Danby bring together a range of authors who analyse and theorise the changing nature of the doctorate and issues of pedagogy in particular. As such, it makes a significant contribution to the field and deserves to be read, not only by academics and research students, but also by administrators, policymakers and others concerned with doctoral education.

By Robin Simmons

University of Huddersfield

References

Bernstein, B. (2000) *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique*, London: Rowman and Littlefield

Collins, A., Brown, JS. And Holum, A. (1991) Cognitive apprenticeship: Making thinking visible, *American Educator*, 15 (6-11), pp. 36-48

Park, C. (2007) *Redefining the Doctorate*, London: Higher Education Academy,
<http://www.heacademy.ac.uk>.