University of Huddersfield Repository

Dashwood, Richard

Composing With Anthropology: The Manifestation of Influence in Interactions between Western and Non-Western Music

Original Citation


This version is available at http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/12899/

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/
COMPOSING WITH ANTHROPOLOGY: THE MANIFESTATION OF INFLUENCE
IN INTERACTIONS BETWEEN WESTERN AND NON-WESTERN MUSIC

RICHARD DASHWOOD

A thesis submitted to the University of Huddersfield
In partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Art by Research

The University of Huddersfield

August 2011
Abstract

The two aims of this thesis are the theoretical understanding, and the practical exploration, of the issues faced by Western art music composers when they engage with musical sources from Non-Western cultures. The first volume is a dissertation dedicated to the first aim of theoretical understanding. In it I have sought to chart the historical development of cross-cultural engagement by examining the writings and works of certain Western composers. By doing this I have endeavoured to understand how Non-Western influences manifest themselves in a composers work, and, with reference to writings in contemporary ethnomusicology, to create a model for the categorising of approaches to cross-cultural composition.

I have also explained why I believe such engagement with Non-Western influences to be both fascinating and important for contemporary Western composers and indeed Western society as a whole, although I have also discussed the problems, ethical, aesthetic and practical, encountered in the process. These problems have prompted a range of creative solutions and to illustrate certain devices I have presented a variety of score examples.

The second volume consists of materials related to my composition ‘Prelude and Meditation,’ which was written for the Okeanos ensemble whose workshops I attended and participated in. The project provided me with an opportunity to conduct my own engagement with Non-Western music, which I have discussed at length in the dissertation. The second volume includes the original score, a recording of the piece by the Okeanos ensemble and a partially amended score, which was produced after the performance as a revision of material that I felt could be improved upon.

It is my hope that the two volumes combined will represent a useful and interesting contribution to the study and appreciation of the growing relationship between Western and Non-Western musical cultures.
Copyright.

i. The author of this thesis (including any appendices and/or schedules to this thesis) owns any copyright in it (the “Copyright”) and s/he has given The University of Huddersfield the right to use such Copyright for any administrative, promotional, educational and/or teaching purposes.

ii. Copies of this thesis, either in full or in extracts, may be made only in accordance with the regulations of the University Library. Details of these regulations may be obtained from the Librarian. This page must form part of any such copies made.

iii. The ownership of any patents, designs, trade marks and any and all other intellectual property rights except for the Copyright (the “Intellectual Property Rights”) and any reproductions of copyright works, for example graphs and tables (“Reproductions”), which may be described in this thesis, may not be owned by the author and may be owned by third parties. Such Intellectual Property Rights and Reproductions cannot and must not be made available for use without the prior written permission of the owner(s) of the relevant Intellectual Property Rights and/or Reproductions.
Contents

Volume I of II

A dissertation, giving a written account of the findings of my research and bearing the same title as the overall thesis, Composing with Anthropology: The Manifestation of Influence in Interactions between Western and Non-Western Music. This volume begins at page 7.

Introduction page 7

Ethics, Aesthetics and Representation page 8

The Reich Doctrine: Its Strengths and Weaknesses page 15

On the Marriage of Black and White: The Work of Geoffrey Poole page 30

No Aesthetics without Theology: David Fanshawe and Holy Africa page 41

Comments on Cross-Culturalism in my own work page 74

Conclusion: Present day Assessments and Future Predictions page 82

Volume II of II

This volume consists of materials relating to my composition ‘Prelude and Meditation.’ The materials are the original pre-performance score and the amended score. In addition, there is a supplementary C.D containing three tracks. Track 1 is the Geoffrey Poole composition ‘Two-Way Talking.’ Track 2 is the Geoffrey Poole composition ‘Swans Reflecting Elephants.’ Track 3 is the recording of ‘Prelude and Meditation’ by the Okeanos ensemble. The two Poole pieces are included because unlike other works examined in the thesis, there are no recordings available on public release.

I wish to thank Geoffrey Poole for kindly producing and making available to me, recordings of both these pieces. I would also like to acknowledge with gratitude his willingness to devote some of his time to talking with me about his work and the issues raised in this thesis. His contribution was more than useful and is sincerely appreciated.

The final word count for this thesis is 24,310.
List of Figures

N.B
Neither the introduction to the dissertation, nor the first chapter, contain any figures and therefore although the first figure is contained in the second chapter it is listed as 1.1.

From Chapter Two. The original source for these figures is:

Figure 1.1 ‘The Principal rhythm’ page 26. Taken from Schick S. ‘The Percussionist’s Art: Same Bed, Different Dreams’ (see bibliography)
Figure 1.2 ‘Constructing the Principal rhythm’ page 26. Taken from Reich S. ‘Writings on Music 1965-2000’ (see bibliography.)
Figure 1.3 ‘Deconstructing the Principal rhythm’ page 27. Taken from Reich S. ‘Writings on Music 1965-2000’ (see bibliography.)
Figure 1.4 ‘Resultant Patterns’ page 28. Taken from Schick S. ‘The Percussionist’s Art: Same Bed, Different Dreams’ (see bibliography.)

From Chapter Three

Figure 2.1 ‘Imerina’ page 33. Taken from Poole G. ‘Black-White-Rainbow’ (see bibliography.)

From Chapter Four. All figures taken from Fanshawe D. ‘African Sanctus’ Miniature Score (see bibliography)

Figure 3.1 ‘African Sanctus opening page’ Page 43
Figure 3.2 ‘An anecdote about the call to prayer’ Page 44
Figure 3.3 ‘Kyrie: Call to Prayer’ Page 46
Figure 3.4 ‘Islamic prayer school’ Page 48
Figure 3.5 ‘4 men in a trance chanting by moonlight’ Page 49
Figure 3.6 ‘Latin to sound a bit African’ Page 51
Figure 3.7 ‘A note about Good King Wenceslas’ Page 51
Figure 3.8 ‘Bells and Desert Sounds’ Page 52
Figure 3.9 ‘Songs and Frogs’ Page 53
Figure 3.10 ‘Mbira pattern’ Page 54
Figure 3.11 ‘Menacing’ Page 56
Figure 3.12 ‘Bash It!’ Page 57
Figure 3.13 ‘Bwala Dance’ Page 58
Figure 3.14 ‘Lamentation’ Page 61
Figure 3.15 ‘The Lord’s Prayer’ Page 62
Figure 3.16 ‘Chants and Songs’ Page 64
Figure 3.17 ‘The Spirit of Bwala’ Page 67
Figure 3.18 ‘Triumphant expression’ Page 68
Figure 3.19 ‘Finale and Cartoons’ Page 69
List of Figures: Continued.

From Chapter Five. All figures taken from ‘Prelude and Meditation’ (see Volume II)

Figure 4.1 ‘Opening system with Shakuhachi phrase’ Page 78
Figure 4.2 ‘Extended Shakuhachi phrase’ Page 78
Figure 4.3 ‘Shamisen fragment’ Page 79
Figure 4.4 ‘Koto quavers in Meditation’ Page 80
Figure 4.5 ‘Climactic passage’ Page 81
Figure 4.6 ‘Clarinet plays the theme’ Page 81

From the Conclusion. Except where stated, all figures from Poole G. ‘Two-Way Talking’
and ‘Swans Reflecting Elephants’ by the same author (see bibliography.)

Figure 5.1 ‘Layout for Two-Way Talking’ Page 83
Figure 5.2 ‘Master Drummers semi-improvised part’ Part 84
Figure 5.3 ‘Crazy Dance’ Page 85
Figure 5.4 ‘Titles of movements’ Page 85. Taken from Poole G. ‘Black-White-Rainbow’
(see bibliography.)
Figure 5.5 ‘Layout of Swans Reflecting Elephants’ Page 86
Figure 5.6 ‘Gamelan parts in Western notation’ Page 87
Figure 5.7 ‘Notes on Swans Reflecting Elephants’ Page 88
Introduction.

Music is thought to be common to every human culture and society and has evolved over many thousands of years. It is used to celebrate and cement communal bonds, communicate knowledge and express our deepest emotional and religious ideas. Composers seek to find original and innovative ways of creating such meaningful experiences and in the twentieth century a plethora of different ways to do this were developed. Owing to the rise of phenomena such as communications technology, international travel, economic and political globalisation and humanistic internationalist post-war worldviews, musicians, indeed all artists have been given unprecedented access not just to their own native cultural traditions but those of all the other nations of the world. This is, depending on ones view, a great opportunity, an intellectual dilemma or indeed an irrelevance. Several composers of the twentieth century have tended towards the first or second view seeing a wealth of melodic and rhythmic devices and material for musical processes that can be drawn on. Some of them have also seen an extra-musical virtue to openly celebrate cultural interaction between peoples of the world.

There are however some difficulties for the contemporary Western art music composer in approaching Non-Western musical sources. The main one is the issue of cultural appropriation. Stated bluntly, the charge is that Westerners have no business ‘taking over’ a tradition foreign to them. Reasons for this include the danger perceived in exoticism of a culture and its music rather than a genuine and serious immersion in it, as well as a measure of scepticism of the extent to which a serious immersion can be a success. Some writers have suggested, as we will see, that it could be taken as a form of neo-colonialist or at least ethno-centric thinking. Even if the composer honestly refutes that charge, they need to be sensitive to the issue and to the criticism their work will provoke. Not all of this criticism will come from overseas. Some critics contend that it represents an inadequate understanding of world music and an unnecessary infidelity to the Western European musical tradition.

There are therefore some central issues to address. The first and most important is the question of how it is possible for composers to legitimately draw influence from a musical culture foreign to them? To address this point successfully we must examine how different composers have sought to use the influence of a Non-Western musical source and which if any approach or approaches can be considered the most appropriate (from a musicological as well as ethical viewpoint.) I also intend to discuss what contribution this practice makes to contemporary art music, arguing that this issue is more than just an exercise in multiculturalism but is in fact of wider relevance to a discussion of the nature and future of the art
music tradition. I shall be examining possible ways in which looking beyond one’s own shores might provide composers with the impetus to adopt new practices into their work as well as providing a rich canon of music to revive a flagging imagination.

**Ethics, Aesthetics and Representation**

A good starting point for determining the ethical and aesthetic legitimacy of interactions with Non-Western musics, is the composer and the interested musicologist considering exactly why they desire to do so. In *The Music of the Other: New Challenges for Ethnomusicology in a Global Age,* the French ethnomusicologist Laurent Aubert discusses at length the reasons for the growth of interest in ‘world music’ not only among artists and scholars but also among the general public. He focuses on the issue of the perception of music observing that a distinction can be made by ‘dividing listeners into two categories concerning their attitude towards music: distant listeners, whose appreciation proceeds from an analytic and, in principle, objective approach to what they hear; and participating listeners, whose listening is of a more synthetic nature, fed by aspirations of a subjective and emotional order. The first type is especially susceptible to the forms and structures of music; the second, to its content and reality.’ (Aubert. 2007: 41)

This distinction is of crucial importance to the composer, (in a way that it will not be to the general listener or even the musicologist,) because of the simple fact that their aesthetic tastes and musical values are bound to have an impact on how and what they compose. Furthermore, clarification of the psychological and philosophical motivations behind an interest in listening to Non-Western music will be an important clue to understanding compositions of a cross-cultural nature and the way they will be received and appreciated. Aubert continues to further examine listener profiles using a model suggested by Theodor Adorno in his ‘Sociology of Music,’ beginning by placing ‘world music’ enthusiasts in the context of a model created before ‘world music’ truly existed on a significant scale. Some of the profiles produced by this approach are of more relevance from a compositional perspective than others (Aubert, it must be noted includes the general listener in his discussion.) An interesting profile is that of the ‘culture consumer’, for whom a ‘Music is of interest if it confirms the idea he or she has of it so far.’ (Aubert. 2007: 44) As we shall see later this idea of confirmation is a significant one in the writings of Steve Reich and
is closely related to the above mentioned notion of the distant listener.

Profiling Approaches to Non-Western Music

Aware though of the limitations of Adorno’s method, Aubert branches out to consider categories of his own and in doing so he provides a potentially helpful basis for assessing differing approaches to the handling of Non-Western music by Western composers.

‘The first is the ‘curious for diversity’ type, fascinated by cultural difference in itself, who loves to be surprised by hitherto unknown creativity and whose incentives are of both aesthetic and socio-political order. The other two are what we could call the ‘contemplative listener’ or by turning to Nietzschean categories, the Apollonian, and the ‘enthusiastic listener’, or Dionysian, respectively. The predilection of the former includes the predominantly modal Oriental genres, whereas the latter will be keener, for example, on African and Afro-American expressions characterised by the extensive use of percussion instruments.’ (Aubert. 2007: 45)

Perhaps the most fascinating thing about such profiles is that composers relevant to this topic frequently match more than one description. The first profile sounds similar to his initial description of the participating listener and the second two are both reminiscent of the distant listener model. I would argue that there are four reasons that can be suggested for this imperfect fit. Firstly, the chronological development of composer’s thoughts and experiences throughout their career may well involve a gradual and not necessarily deliberate warming towards ideas previously rejected. Secondly, a historical development of ideas is not confined to individuals but is a process affecting every aspect of the continuing art music tradition. Which means that different composers from various decades or generations will express even very similar ideas in different ways. As we shall see, the approaches taken by a composer towards Non-Western influence are at least partly influenced by contemporary musical trends and general worldviews. The third reason is that the nature and scope of a specific composition may well furnish an opportunity for experimenting with different cultural and musicological ingredients. Finally as Aubert himself observes, these profiles are essentially psychological sketches that are useful but by no means exhaustive. Actual manifestation of them requires what Aubert calls
appropriate cognitive methods.’ (Aubert. 2007: 46) He goes on to admit that,

‘I am conscious of the aleatory character of such a typology, which only distinguishes tendencies... It can mostly contribute by focusing on some unconscious foundations of taste in Western society.’ (Aubert. 2007: 46)

These same foundations can apply just as well to the interest listeners may take in Non-Western music as to the established Western musical forms and traditions.

A Model for Composers using Non-Western Music

It is important though to clarify the motivations of that specific group of listeners called composers, since their concerns are likely to be both more detailed and more pressing than those of a general listener. One of the key motivations, fully consistent with the profiles we have already seen, is the discovery that a certain musical form or aspects of the culture to which a form belongs, truly appeal to the individuals aesthetic taste and that the influence represents a confirmation of beliefs already held by the individual about what they want their music to represent. This first approach I will call ‘intellectual/aesthetic influence.’ This means that the composer is not so much interested in representing compositionally the diversity of the musical sources encountered or their cultural background (even if they take a profound interest in the anthropological details of a particular musical culture.) Instead he or she is interested purely in the musical material itself and the implicit creative suggestions contained in it with regards to form, structure and process and other musicological elements. This approach can include elements both of the aforementioned ‘apollonian’ and ‘dionysian’ models suggested by Aubert and indeed the reconciliation of the two in the work of a single composer can be the source of some deeply inspirational, special pieces of music.

The second reason is a desire to undertake what might be called a synthesis or bridge between cultures and to represent this idea in musical form. This approach I am going to call the ‘cultural/aesthetic influence’ and it refers to composers who feel motivated to actually include imitations or representations of Non-Western musical material in their compositions. Such an approach is often born of first-hand experience of another culture and the warm humanistic feeling that the composer bears towards it. It quite obviously can also include elements of Aubert’s depiction of the ‘curious for diversity’ type, the only amendment needing to be made is the observation that as a trained, creative musician the composer
will be sensitive to the details of the culture he or she takes interest in and will presumably work hard to ensure that any reference within their works is an authentic expression of their musical voice. This path nevertheless is fraught with the aforementioned ethical issues and will be all the more so if a composition in any sense can be described with the somewhat ugly terms ‘hybrid’ or ‘fusion.’ A defence against the charge of valueless hybridity can be found by making reference to the political and socio-cultural climate in which the music is produced. Consider the following statement;

‘A foreseeable social phenomenon, (Marshall) McLuhan’s ‘global village’, is rising under our noses and, whatever we think of the script, we are all actors in the social drama it equates. Globalisation of culture is not, as we believed for a long time, an exclusive synonym for the Westernisation of the rest of the planet, because the sonic invasion has been reciprocal, even if we assume responsibility for it’s initial impulse…. Considered for a long time as the ‘bete noire’ of all anthropologies, hybridity is claimed today as the banner of a whole generation with aching roots. Musicians understand it well... they turn today with a sincere openness to the delights of a global ‘sound-world’ rich in unexploited resources.’(Aubert. 2007:53)

The case of the white South Africans

A near perfect historical example of this is the emergence in the late 1980’s/ early 1990’s of a new generation of South African composers both black and white who found it impossible to ignore in their compositional work the extraordinary implications for their culture of the collapse of the Apartheid regime and the transition to a genuine multi-racial democracy. In this climate white South Africans, whose cultural heritage and education is essentially European in character, and black South Africans from a host of social and even tribal backgrounds discovered that their shared musical culture was an intrinsically mixed bag of Western and Non-Western influences. In the light of their experience notions of the ethnic or national ownership of a musical culture became irrelevant and perhaps by implication, not a world away from the enforced separation of apartheid ideology. In a paper for the 1999 anthology ‘Composing the Music of Africa: Composition, Interpretation and Realisation,’ entitled ‘Keeping our Ears to the Ground: Cross-Culturalism and the Composer in South Africa Old and New’, the South African composer Hans Roosenschoon discussed the issues surrounding the works coming out of South Africa during and before the collapse of apartheid (1990-94) and tries to clarify the musicological and cultural difficulties the composers in South
Africa faced. He is particularly keen to emphasise that the ethical virtue found in sincere protest against a repulsive political regime goes some way to vindicating the question of artistic worth, a sentiment expressed immediately by his prefaced quotation from Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau;

‘The art constituting the essence of a nation is born of the needs of that nation, and is of the very substance of all who experience the collective crisis. (Fischer-Dieskau quoted in Roosenschoon, ed Floyd 1999: 265)

Roosenschoon makes clear that the central problem from a purely musical point of view was the extreme plurality of musical material that either actually existed or was as he puts it ‘ideologically imagined.’ What follows is a version of our already familiar model of the different options available to the interested composer. Of more than significant interest are the differences in terminology used to express ideas essentially similar to ones we have already discussed. An argument of this paper is that such varieties of expression are born of the historicity of the source. Roosenschoon refers to a 1984 symposium where Peter Klatzow, an eminent composer gave a speech that distinguished between ‘nationalism and exoticism.’ (Roosenschoon ed Floyd. 1999: 266) By nationalism, Klatzow means a compositional process that uses musical sources chiefly or wholly on their basis of the material and it’s usefulness as the basis for pieces. Roosenschoon describes this as absorbing traditional music and using it ‘self-containedly.’ (Roosenschoon ed Floyd. 1999: 266) It is quite easy to see a comparison between this and our established idea of intellectual/aesthetic influence. The music is selected because of it’s inherent qualities and not for the sake of it being an excitingly unfamiliar sound. Later on we shall see that this is a core belief of Steve Reich in his approach to non-western music. Klatzow then explains that an exotic composer,

‘reaches outside his or her particular area for new materials and methods. This, to a certain extent, also indicates a restlessness amongst creative people and the need to stretch their imaginations towards entirely new challenges.’ (Klatzow quoted in Roosenschoon ed Floyd. 1999:266)

This is intended to describe the opposite approach and as such can be identified with our model of cultural/aesthetic influence. It is however something of an imperfect fit. Klatzow’s description of the search for new methods and materials could just as easily apply to Reich as to Aubert’s ‘participating listener.’ So how do we solve the discrepancy? The answer is to consider the historical and
cultural location of Klatzow’s reflections. In 1984 black composers were at best ignored and at worst discouraged from composing and the (white) European tradition officially venerated. A successful South African composer was therefore almost inevitably white. That fact carried with it a whole host of difficulties that went beyond routine scholarly considerations. The possibility of a moral obligation to react against the rabid intolerance of all things traditionally African, a lack of familiarity with ‘Black’ musical forms and traditions and a perfectly reasonably desire to write music that will still be accepted for performance would all be issues in the minds of composers like Klatzow. This, it seems plausible to argue, explains why Klatzow’s definition of exoticism is an indifferent one. It is tempting to see in the second part of the quotation an implicit vindication not only of a general attempt to explore unfamiliar musical cultures but also of the desire to make them both more familiar and more acceptable, in South Africa at least. Bearing this in mind the compatibility of Klatzow’s model of influence manifestation with Aubert’s becomes closer, especially if we remember that Klatzow had a no more persuasive model at his disposal in 1984 (Steve Reich’s work as we shall see fits Aubert ‘distant listener’ profile quite well.)

Roosenschoon writing a number of years later with the hindsight of the collapse of Apartheid handles the issue more explicitly. While acknowledging that the ‘nationalist’ composers will endeavour to create something genuinely original and interesting he raises the concern that a simple dualist model will not help us to avoid exoticism, which he sees as no real problem for the composer:

‘In the indigenous music of our country... the musical component is not independent of the socio-political context within which it occurs... the gap between it and Western art-music is particularly wide, and in my opinion therefore, it is impossible for a composer of Western art music, when taking material from African sources to be anything else except an ‘exoticist.’ (Roosenschoon ed Floyd. 1999:267)

Roosenschoon strongly vindicates the cultural/aesthetic approach but in doing so appears to present a vindication of exoticism different from the one that might well cause the likes of Reich and even Klatzow to baulk. We shall return to this theme of exoticism later but for now it remains enough to define it a less than authentic representation of a cultural source of inspiration and one that for an artist serves the needs of the ‘home audience’ and negates the importance of the ‘exotic people’. Nothing in Roosenschoon’s
writing incriminates him on this point. Indeed he seems scrupulous
in his desire to handle African music with good sense and affection,
to the point that he actually suggests a third option in our model.
After defining once again our standard choices - the structural,
intellectual and essentially Western aesthetic which he associates
with Klatzow, and the option of an overtly audible influence which
he describes as 'going with ethnomusicology', (Roosenschoon ed
Floyd. 1999: 268) he proposes the path of 'Cross-culturalism.'
(Roosenschoon ed Floyd. 1999: 268) The principal difficulty with
this attempt at breaking the two-way deadlock is that he fails to
explain precisely what he means and indeed admits that the
possibility of an attempt to do justice to two cultures
simultaneously remains 'rather a moot point.' (Roosenschoon ed
Floyd. 1999: 268) His best attempt at vindication comes from what
appears to be an almost neo-romantic anti-intellectualism;

'Musical purism is for scholars, not for composers, who must be
free to paraphrase, to juxtapose different styles and instrumental
forces, or to do whatever their creative consciences dictate.'
(Roosenschoon ed Floyd. 1999: 267)

This statement, impasioned as it is does not impress as an
explanation but what is far more persuasive is Roosenschoons'
thoughtful response to the key issue of whether or not a Non-
Western influence should be recognisable to the listener. He
observes that the issue is two-fold. First of all we should ask just
how audible the Non-Western influence is. Are we comfortably
aware of it but still able to appreciate the originality of the
composers' work? Or is it pronounced and fundamental to the piece.
Even then we should not hastily dismiss it because the second point
is to consider the aesthetic and cultural perspective of the listener
as well as the composer (which chimes agreeably with Aubert's
writings.) Does one listen with, as Roosenschoon puts it, 'Western
ears or African ears.' (Roosenschoon ed Floyd. 1999: 267)

What Roosenschoon gives us in the full vigour of the Rainbow
Nation's birth celebrations is a belief, expressed almost lyrically,
that an awareness by black and white South African composers of
their shared musical heritage will serve a source of compositional
inspiration rich enough to transcend any difficulties concerning the
manifestation of influences. Clearly, informed and vigorous
scholarship has to push past such sweeping declarations and still
ask the difficult questions and yet we must not dismiss
Roosenschoon's third way (which in my opinion is merely an
elaborate version of the cultural/aesthetic model,) so easily. It is
clearly an idea of its time and the perspectives in South Africa and
elsewhere may have changed since it was articulated but two points in it’s favour stand out. Firstly it has an irrefutable moral force to it that reminds us that there is beauty in truth and that all creative art has an opportunity if not a duty to do or be something good in the world. Secondly it forces us to address the perspectives of all composers and listeners and consider if they are different to our own. The white South Africans are fundamentally more immersed in African music then many in Europe are, so notions of what does or does not constitute appropriation are not so clear cut as they may be in much of the Western world. Indeed, even in Europe or North America, the increasing cultural diversity of society clouds the issue further.

**The ‘Reich Doctrine:’ It’s Strengths and Weaknesses.**

Roosenschoon deserves credit for articulating the aforementioned issues but it would be helpful to examine the perspectives of individual composers of relevance and see how their ideas about Non-western music were developed and how it has affected their work. In view of that let us now consider the work of arguably the most important and almost certainly the most famous composer to have used Non-Western influences, Steve Reich. Reich was in the late 1960’s, a key player in the emerging second generation of minimalist composers and like his predecessors Terry Riley and La Monte Young worked in a manner that was, for the time, unorthodox, even eccentric. Among the radical and experimental ideas that these composers explored were the return of tonal harmony, the pioneering use of technology and the engagement with Non-Western music. It is important to understand that this engagement with Non-Western music was not fundamentally more important than any of the other ideas. It served as an interesting but ultimately non-essential feature of minimalist composition. The following quote (which I am interpreting as a staunch and polemical defence of the intellectual/aesthetic approach) is from a 1971 essay by Reich, written at the height of minimalist engagement with Non-Western music, concerning how the composer should use world music influences:

‘The least interesting form of influence, to my mind, is that of imitating the sound of some non-western music in one’s own music (sitars in the rock band) or by using one’s own instruments to sound like non-western ones (singing Indian style melodies over electronic drones). Imitating the sound of non-western music leads to exotic music: what used to be called Chinoiserie.'
Alternatively one can create a music with one’s own sound that is constructed in the light of one’s knowledge of non-western structures... This brings about the interesting situation of the non-western influence being there in the thinking, but not in the sound... Instead of imitation, the influence of non-western musical structures on the thinking of a western composer is likely to produce something genuinely new.' (Reich quoted in Schwarz 1996: 72-73)

Examining the Reich Doctrine

So for Reich the involvement of another culture is strictly an abstract process and the soundworld should not obviously reveal the influence. This doctrine appears straightforward enough in light of previous discussion but there is a lot to consider here and it is worth conducting an exegesis of the statement to uncover the detail.

‘The least interesting form of influence, to my mind is that of imitating the sound of some non-western music.’ (Reich quoted in Schwarz 1996: 73)

In K. Robert Schwarz’s book ‘Minimalists’ we are told about Reich’s discoveries when he travelled to West Africa to study percussion,

‘What Reich discovered was that the structure of West African music was not that different from his own. His music too, was polyrhythmic, for the phasing process results in the layering of rhythmic patterns with different downbeats. His music, too focused on rhythm rather than harmony or melody... and his music too, was a ritualistic activity that subjugated personal expression to communal process.’ (Schwarz 1996: 74)

Now if Reich’s personal aesthetic taste and structural approaches were already closely allied with the aesthetics of African percussion (and he has frequently emphasised that what he found in African percussion was confirmation and not any new sense of inspiration,) then it is questionable that a similar soundworld would constitute a form of plagiarism, as Reich appears to be worried about. Could it not be considered a legitimate musical reference analogous to the quoting of other author’s works that the present author will do to confirm and strengthen the arguments presented in this paper? It is of course also possible that ‘least interesting’ in this case could mean most likely to provoke a charge of cultural appropriation and least
likely to ensure stylistic authenticity. Reich is repeatedly sensitive in his writings to the need to avoid any sense of exoticism and though his thoughts on music have evolved considerably over the course of his career, he has remained clear that for him an influence should be structural and not audible. In a piece of writing from 1970 'Some Optimistic Predictions About the Future of Music,' Reich stated

‘Non-Western music in general and African, Indonesian and Indian music in particular will serve as new structural models for western musicians. Not as new models of sound (that’s the old exoticism trip.) Those of us who love the sounds will hopefully just go and learn how to play these musics.’ (Reich. 1970: 51)

The prediction certainly does seem optimistic and such frank declarations are less common in his more recent writings. What is interesting though about that statement is his suggestion that composers who have a sincere love of a non-Western musical form (Gamelan for instance) can remedy a less than ideal (as he would see it,) desire to imitate a soundworld simply by undertaking study of that music in its traditional and most authentic form. This suggestion of the composer as ethnomusicologist is an interesting one. Given the growing abundance of world music programmes in universities and ensembles such as ethnic drum circles springing up in major towns and cities we might say that, in this regard, his prediction has been validated.

To return to our exegesis,

‘This can be done by using non-western instruments in one’s own music (sitar in the rock band) or by using one’s own instruments to sound like non-western ones (singing Indian style melodies over electronic drones).’ (Reich quoted in Schwarz 1996: 73)

The first difficulty with this passage, since it is critical in its perspective, is the limit of influence it would place on Western instrumental writing. A great number of Western musicians both past and present would stand condemned on this point ranging from romantics such as Liszt and Grieg for using folk material in their nationalist works to contemporary musicians who perform on instruments not native to their own country. A good example of this would be the use by many classical and, to a lesser extent, popular guitarists of the ‘Spanish’ guitar. These musicians may not be Spanish but they are using an instrument that is in my view heavily connected to Spanish culture, not least because it is
an important instrument in many traditional forms of Spanish music, Flamenco being an example. I am tempted to argue that even if guitarists and composers of guitar music succeed in creating authentic and interesting music without an intellectual engagement with Spanish culture, they may well be hard pressed to avoid there being at least some sense of a Hispanic nature to it, however vaguely defined, given the distinctive timbre of the instrument. I realise that this claim is a bold one and I offer it as an illustration of a point, rather than any dogmatic position.¹

Examples and Illustrations

Reich also fails to consider the possibility of composing for cross-cultural collaborating ensembles, which is the grouping of Western and Non-Western musicians, playing together but maintaining control of their own instruments (and perhaps their ‘cultural purity’ too). A classic example of this is found in David Fanshawe’s much loved work ‘African Sanctus’ which is scored for ‘Soprano, SATB Choir, Piano, African tapes’ and multiple percussionists including ‘multi-racial drummers, ethnic drums and ad-lib performers. (Fanshawe 1979: 7)) This eclectic mix enables Fanshawe not just to imitate African music but to welcome African musicians playing their own instruments into the fold alongside reasonably conventional western performers playing conventionally scored western liturgical music. In doing so Fanshawe pays African music the compliment of not interfering in a way that could be taken as patronising, instead treating African music as the equal of his own. And the end result is not the subjugation of personal expression to communal process but a religious and humanitarian synthesis of the two. Fanshawe’s work will be considered in greater detail later.

Another example, perhaps one that Reich might find more compelling is Iannis Xenakis’ percussion compositions ‘Okho’ and ‘Rebonds’ (1989.) The former is scored for three Djembes, the latter for bongos, congas, tom-toms, bass drums and wood blocks. Almost all of these instruments are either of African origin or closely related to African variants yet Xenakis did not travel to Africa, nor did he undertake any major ethnomusicological study before beginning work on these pieces. Essentially, he regarded the instruments as sources of abstract percussive sound that he felt would make an interesting sonic basis for these pieces. In considering what seems here to be a

¹ I have advanced this analogy with the classical guitar carefully as it has a proven capacity to polarise opinion. The point is the importance of considering how significant the cultural identity of a musical instrument is.
reasonable stance, the question to consider, particularly if we follow Reich’s line of argument is, ‘What about Africa?’ Is it possible to write for an instrument so thoroughly connected to a particular culture as, for instance, the Djembe and assess it independently of its West African origins? There is a strong temptation to say that just like the earlier example of the Spanish guitar it is not.

However the temptation was resisted by Jacques Lonchampt who wrote that ‘Rebons’ did not suffer from what he called ‘contamination folklorique.’ (Longchamp quoted in Schick 2006: 204) Granted, this is not the stated opinion of the composer but that staunch phrase has become strongly associated with the piece. One response that immediately springs to mind is to object to the notion of contamination. We can no doubt be certain that the remark refers to the belief that the compositions appear to be free of anything save the creativity of Xenakis and yet it is not hard to argue a case that if music played on an African percussion instrument were to sound at all like traditional African music then listeners would be experiencing something as natural and unremarkable as Anglophone conversation in England. From this perspective Longchampt’s reason for praising the piece appears to be unfounded, (though there are plenty of worthy reasons for liking it.)

Having criticised Longchampt for finding a virtue in the absence of Africanisms in Xenakis’s work, I now criticise him for having believed in such absence at all. In his book ‘The Percussionists Art: Same Bed Different Dreams,’ the distinguished percussionist Steven Schick gently mocks Longchampt’s observation with the question ‘Who is he kidding?’ going on to write:

‘These pieces, ‘Rebons’ and ‘Okho’, are thoroughly ‘contaminated’ by traditional African music, judged solely on the basis of their material... the choice of sonic material itself plays a considerable role in determining how it will be used. A composer who listens to the Djembe... to the visceral power of the instrument will necessarily compose something that reflects it’s African heritage.’ (Schick. 2006: 204)

Schick’s observation actually confounds the neatness of a division between purely aesthetic and purely structural influence (as does Roosenschoon, with his vision of cross-culturalism being a link between a natural duality.) This leads us to consider if it is the case that the composer is not truly in control of how an influence manifests itself in their music. What we are beginning to see is the idea that ‘cross-culturalism’ could mean
the marriage of a Western musical structure with a Non-Western soundworld. But to return to our statement from Steve Reich we see that his original formula appears to rule out such a distinction.

‘Imitating the sound of non-western music leads to exotic music; what used to be called Chinoiserie’ (Reich quoted in Schwarz 1996: 73)

This was probably a credible point when first written but if we consider that since then the rise of the internet has made it possible for people to listen to music from almost anywhere in the world without leaving the comfort of their own room, the notion that anything is really exotic anymore is questionable. A passable modern definition of the word (to expand our earlier one) could be that it pertains to aspects of human culture and environment that are either not familiar to an individual at all or not deeply understood by them if there is a familiarity. How then might we avoid this ‘new exoticism trip’?

Firstly, we should not ignore the idea that pieces could be built on the principle of presenting world musics together but without intermingling of parts or instruments, a suggestion similar to, perhaps even neater than the earlier one that Western structures and Non-Western soundworlds might work coherently together. This idea could lead to the creation of a new genre of Programme music or even festival music that would serve as cultural introduction rather than cultural fusion. In a post-colonial, globalised and (in Western nations) increasingly multicultural society such music need have no fear of not finding an audience, as was observed by Roosenschoon in his discussion on new South African composers. We need to be concerned though with what the audience’s relationship to any Non-Western influenced Western music would be. There is a danger of the music serving an entirely socio-political purpose that subverts questions of artistic worth. Much of Roosenschoon’s article is taken up with discourse concerning public funding for the arts and the political implications of what financial backing for certain composers and publishers and not others might have had on the nuances of music making in South Africa. Put simply, if certain forms of music are ‘acceptable’ purely on grounds of their being socially useful, rather than on their actual compositional merit then the health of the musical culture will surely suffer. Roosenschoon eventually and rather cynically suggests that the relevant distinction in the case of South Africa was less about exoticism versus nationalism and more to do with
the private liberty of the creative artist versus the nationalisation of culture.

Fortunately the position of the arts in the majority of Western societies is not one that involves such extremes of political manipulation (even well-intentioned varieties.) We would be naïve though if we thought that there are no other forms of manipulation of music for dubious reasons; economic and corporate ones being good examples. Record companies have found that mass-produced ‘world music’ or ‘fusion’ albums do sell well and manage to bridge the gap between ‘serious’ and ‘popular music.’ So far so good, but what about the quality of such music, and indeed of its audience? We should recall that among the themes repeatedly discussed by ethnomusicologists are the ways in which traditional cultures express musically notions of spirituality, ritual and educational understanding of life events, relationships to characters real or symbolic as well as ideas of a more earthy social value (working roles and seasonal changes for example.) The association of extra-musical meaning to music greatly affects its function and value in a society, a point emphasised by several of the authors whose work is considered in this thesis. Often in the process (as Roosenschoon realised,) such practices confound, innocently and quite legitimately of course, the established Western notions of the nature of musical creativity and the role of individuals, not least with regards relationships between music makers and music receivers.

On the Nature of a Musical Experience

It is therefore worth considering if the influence of a Non-Western music could be centred on a philosophy of the nature of a musical experience. If Western ideas of musical practice such as the concert and even the recording industry do not seem to do justice to Non-Western musics then maybe our contemporary culture could support the notion of revising the form and scope of such practices? The inherently communal, even religious nature of many Non-Western forms (Gamelan being an example) do not sit so easily with ticket sales, programme notes and polite applause. An authentic performance practice then would need to be developed so that musical forms Western or Non-Western were not cheapened by an unnatural representation. This would furthermore require that an audience would have to exhibit great care in how they listened to such music. Aubert, whose prime motivation for writing ‘The Music of the Other’ appears to be to vindicate the need for this requirement quotes the Irish musician Ross Daly as saying,
‘It would be naïve to think that anybody sitting in the comfort of their European or U.S homes ... could possibly appreciate the rest of the world’s music properly, let alone understand it ... in the context of its specific forms of expression... I have met world music freaks kitted out with all the latest hi-fi gadgetry who listen to West African griots one minute, Japanese koto the next and then Bengali music... they don’t understand the first thing about the music’s cultural and human background. If we are going to be able to appreciate the wide variety of music which exists in the world, we should forget about all these recordings and drastically increase the amount of live music we listen to... it is still far too early to talk about world music.’ (Daly quoted in Aubert. 2007: 55)

So the serious composer must reject anything connected to the commercial ‘world music’ recording phenomenon and instead ensure that the creation and representation of musical compositions influenced by Non-Western music will tend less towards any kind of exoticism and more towards a sincere form of recognition. Reviving the idea of programme music is one possible way to introduce such attitudes to the Western art music tradition. It is not impossible to see how music of this nature could be a popular form of artistic expression and a worthy way of allowing the well-intentioned interest many Westerners in the culture and peoples of the rest of the world to be developed in a respectful and useful fashion.

Reich was interested in a similar goal but he experimented with a different solution, which was to avoid anything that might suggest ‘foreignness’ in his work. In his writings he rejected out of hand the notion of working with distinctly ‘ethnic instruments’ favouring instead the development of new ideas within his own minimalist, Western idiom.) This approach would make its adherents suspicious of even the most nuanced approach to a ‘world music’ based composition, reasoning that if a piece is obviously intended to be a celebratory multicultural work (such as African Sanctus arguably is) then it is a work that carries the heavy burden of a concept. The concept may be a noble and beautiful one such as Fanshawe’s ‘Dona Nobis Pacem’ but it is one that is arguably in the way of the musical material being interesting in itself, such abstraction being at the core of twentieth century Western art music. It is plausible that the idea of African Sanctus- Christian liturgy fused with Islamic chanting proclaiming a message of love and peace performed by choir and instrumentalists complete with African musical episodes, endeared itself to a number of people before they had actually
heard it. Perhaps the audience liked it despite the unorthodox form when they might have rejected another piece of equal or even superior quality if it lacked a similarly emotive message. To reiterate an earlier point, if music is judged on overwhelmingly non-musical terms then the judgement is in danger of lacking aesthetic and intellectual integrity. A popular theme in Western art music since Beethoven’s day is of the composer being the servant of humanity. Reich’s early approach argues that if humanity wants good service from music then it should place value on music that conveys clarity, nuance and integrity in and of itself. One cannot really say that there is anything fundamentally wrong with this assertion; it is merely the case that it is a historical solution that made sense at the time. The newer solution outlined above helps us to avoid exoticism in a way that is more coherent in the light of contemporary Western culture.

‘Alternately, one can create a music with one’s own sound that is constructed in light of one’s knowledge of non-western structures.’ (Reich quoted in Schwarz 1996: 73)

This is a succinct and admirable claim and is of course one of the key features of the minimalist compositions of Reich and others). It also reminds of his insistence that a Non-Western music is not necessarily interesting just because it is not Western, (a repudiation of Aubert’s ‘curious for diversity’ typology.) Instead interest is derived from the form and structure of the music and the effects these elements have on the resulting sound. This still vindicates the legitimacy of a Non-Western influence as it highlights the creative opportunities it provides the interested composer.

It is though worth observing that in the case of his early masterpiece ‘Drumming’ (1971,) Reich has claimed that his experience as a percussionist playing music using standard western techniques was possibly as influential as what he discovered on his much-noted trip to Ghana in 1971. Many enthusiasts for Reich’s work have made a mistake in thinking of him as even remotely resembling what we might call a world music composer. There is probably no more lauded a composer than Reich to have used a Non-Western influence and none that have used one to produce anything so distinctly a part of the evolving Western tradition.
'This brings about the interesting situation of the non-western influence being there in the thinking, but not in the sound. Instead of imitation, the influence of non-western musical structures on the thinking of a western composer is likely to produce something genuinely new.' (Reich quoted in Schwarz 1996: 73)

Producing something genuinely new is a laudable ambition for a composer. This division between thinking and sound, or rather between the verb to compose and the noun composition, is an interesting one related to our ongoing discussion of the models of influence manifestation. Reich may well have been a little naïve in thinking that the influence will not impact upon the aesthetic soundworld created. It is after all a well-established concept that different musicians have different playing tastes and this will impact upon the sound of the music they write. Students are often introduced to key works in the hope that some will be inspirational to an individual and it is no surprise if their work begins to adopt some of the stylistic hallmarks of an admired composer, an idea expressed by Leonard Bernstein thus. ‘Any composer’s writing is the sum of himself, of all his roots and influences.’ (Bernstein quoted in Thompson and Wade-Matthews. 2002: 486) This does not have to happen audibly, indeed as a case in point; Reich’s profound respect for ‘The Rite of Spring’ doesn’t make his work sound remotely like Stravinsky. Nevertheless that it does not have to happen overtly does not seem to bar it sometimes happening anyway.

‘Drumming’

This point is once again illustrated in ‘Drumming.’ The piece does actually sound somewhat reminiscent of African percussion if only because of its instrumentation. Schwarz bluntly states that ‘no work of Reich’s may seem as overtly influenced by non-western music as ‘Drumming’, and none has quite as much of the flavour of communal ritual.’ (Schwarz 1996: 76) In particular it should be noted that his choices of tuned bongos and marimbas are hardly the best ones for a composer allegedly seeking to avoid audibly African timbre.

But as we have discussed previously, Reich has always argued that it was confirmation of his existing aesthetic tastes and practices that he found in his lessons with the Ghanaian master drummer. He has also indicated that he specifically found and enjoyed similarities between the polyrhythmic layering of parts so characteristic of West African ensemble percussion music and
his own approach to part layering in his early phasing pieces. This only shows that he found 'same-but-different' musical ideas in Africa rather than brand new material to exploit.

In bearing this in mind, what assessment can be made of the cross-cultural element in 'Drumming?' Perhaps the most interesting and, for my purposes, the most useful, commentary on the piece is provided by Steven Schick in 'The Percussionists Art.' He begins with this observation,

‘He (Reich) created an utterly ingenious dual model for musical coexistence within a discontinuous cultural environment. One part of the Reich model of coexistence regulates the relationship among a complex of musical cultures that influence this music, and the second part creates a unique rapport among no fewer than twelve musicians themselves as they rehearse and perform the piece.’ (Schick 2006: 234)

The reference to regulation is in accord with what we have so far seen of Reich’s attitude to Non-Western influence, namely a rigorous and methodical assessment of what he can use and what he should not try to use. The second reference to the good working relationship of the players can serve as a reminder that both Reich’s composition and much of the West African percussion and vocal music that Reich studied are centred on principles of communal musical participation.

‘Drumming’ has four movements, each with a different ensemble, except for the fourth which features all the instruments heard throughout the piece. The first is for tuned bongos, the second for marimbas and voices and the third for glockenspiels and piccolo. As I stated previously, the instruments chosen by Reich are reminiscent of African music if only in terms of the provenance of many of them. It would seem that Reich has translated some of what he learnt in Africa on to instruments more familiar to the Western concert audience, thus showing a subtle approach to cross-cultural practice. Schick describes what he considers the four devices of the piece, beginning firstly with acknowledgement that the whole piece is built around one principal rhythm.

‘Drumming lasts more than an hour, and without exception, the entirety of the piece is based on a single rhythm in 3/2 meter...(see figure 1.1) (Schick 2006: 234)
He goes on to explain the four devices. I shall quote from them in order to illustrate the extent of any African influence.

‘Building up and down. The principal rhythm builds up or builds down at least once in Parts I, III, and IV... (See figures 1.2 and 1.3) The building up starts with a single note. Gradually the performers add one at a time, each time repeating the pattern several times in its partially constructed state, until the entire rhythm is present. Building down reverses the process by subtracting one note at a time until a single note is left. (Schick 2006: 234)
Building up and down does certainly occur in West African music, where there will often be a call from a master drummer that prompts the introduction of a new support pattern from other players. The difference between this and Reich’s approach is that the evolution of a texture in a West African piece will often occur at the level of an entire phrase with a certain degree of ambiguity in the time signature. In contrast Reich composed a strictly controlled rhythmic development where the expansion of the texture was occurring within single bars.

‘Phasing. Rhythmic complexity is achieved when a performer phases forward or backwards against a sounding rhythm. (Schick 2006: 234)

Reich’s phasing technique is one of the better-known hallmarks of his music. It was also an early technique born of his experimenting with tape recordings. Having very little to do with any Non-Western music, it shows how Reich incorporated all his experiences and not just Non-Western ones into his composition.

‘Resultant patterns. Brief sections of resultant patterns underscore the new rhythmic combinations that result from phasing... (See figure 1.4) this underscores the communal nature of the piece. The evolving rhythmic structures in the piece are
composites and cannot be played by a single performer. (Schick 2006: 235)

Figure 1.4. ‘Resultant Patterns’

Such unconscious synchronicity between performers can occur in African percussion music, for instance in many pieces from Gambia, where the break patterns between supports from Djembe players will align with downbeats from Dun-Dun players and thus enable sudden tempo changes to occur naturally. It should not be forgotten that West African percussion music is often an accompaniment to singing or dancing and thus the layers of communal virtuosity are ever more intricately developed. Reich has no such additional material to work around. His voice parts are integral to the overall piece rather than being something added on. In his essay on ‘Drumming,’ Reich describes how he found himself singing out loud as he composed the percussion material. This led him to realise that,
‘I could make some of the resulting patterns sound very much as if my voice were another set of drums, gradually bringing out one pattern after another... Thus the basic assumption about the voices in Drumming was that they would not sing words but would precisely imitate the sound of the instruments. (Reich 1971 edited 2002: 64)

Although this is a working process of his own creation, I feel it is worth noting the similarity between Reich’s experiments and the African tradition of ‘Talking Drums,’ about which there will be more discussion later. Reich’s own ethnomusicological writings make clear that he was aware of, and impressed with this tradition, but chose to follow his own approach to writing for voices.

The fourth device is,

‘New material. On occasion a player simply starts a new rhythmic or melodic version of the principal rhythm without building up or phasing into it. New material starts directly at full volume, rather than fading in. The abruptness and relative rarity of these moments makes them especially memorable and therefore useful demarcations of form.’ (Schick 2006: 235)

This is perhaps, consciously or not, a version of the sudden call of the master drummer in an African ensemble performance. Reich, one might argue merely takes the partially improvised nature of the African original and actually builds it into the structure of his piece.

There is though, a danger with reading too many African inspirations into ‘Drumming.’ Reich is clearly his own man and some of the features of the piece that seem to be African influenced aren’t necessarily so. Steven Schick lends credence to this idea, observing that while the use of drums in cyclical patterns is a feature of African music it is also a practice of western jazz and rock drummers. Schick writes,

‘Drumming does not appropriate ideas from other cultures; it confirms and resonates with them...Any percussionist who worries that by borrowing ideas or a sound across cultural boundaries he or she may cross the line between healthy cross-fertilisation and the hegemony of appropriation would do well to rephrase Steve Reich’s observations as a question. To what extent does the idea or sound in question reinforce strands of connection among cultures and tap a mutually sustaining pool of musical wisdom.’ (Schick. 2006:240)
In short, it is not his fault if the authentic ‘Steve Reich soundworld’ sounds reminiscent of someone or somewhere else’s and it is in fact profoundly inspirational to consider that in musical cultures around the world people have created expressive and interesting materials that can in sensible hands be shown to cohere together with both success and originality.

Reich’s means of achieving such coherence was still very much within the limits of ‘intellectual/aesthetic’ influence, further proof of which can be found in the fact that in the original passage from Steve Reich that I quoted from, he refers specifically to Non-Western musical structures rather than Non-Western melodies, harmonies and forces. In focusing on these elements Reich revealed a crucial aspect of prototype minimalist thought—namely the primacy of process. As a genuinely creative man Reich would naturally wish to ensure that his processes, being the most important pat of his work, were truly his own. This makes it less problematic that in the timbral and instrumental realms an occasionally more direct homage can be heard, to Africa in ‘Drumming’ and possibly to Bali in ‘Music for Mallet Instruments, Voices and Organ.’ So whilst he is not imitating Non-Western music at the level of a crude pastiche, he has revealed its inspiration in his actual soundworld.

As his career progressed Reich became less interested from a compositional viewpoint in Non-Western musics and more towards developing his harmonic language in his large ensemble works. Even the phasing technique so prevalent in his earlier works has its swansong in ‘Drumming.’ The lingering global (since it is not specifically Non-Western,) influence on his work has been his re-discovery of his Jewish spirituality and his desire to permit a tradition rich in musical practice to inform his work.

**On the Marriage of Black and White: The work of Geoffrey Poole**

In continuing then to explore the development of ideas concerning cross-culturalism, let us now turn to a composer still active in this field, the British composer Geoffrey Poole. Poole has, throughout his career, shown an impressive versatility in his writing taking influences from a whole host of Non-Western sources including African percussion, Javanese Gamelan and traditional forms of Japanese music. He has also written at length about his interactions with ‘world musics’ and the significant amounts of time he has spent abroad. This last aspect is of particular significance. Throughout this paper so far, we have
repeatedly encountered the theme not always directly expressed but relevant nonetheless that a genuine and credit-worthy attempt at musical cross-culturalism requires the instigator to have a convincing understanding and knowledge not only of the musical material itself but something of its social background or cultural meaning. We have also seen in Steve Reich, Hans Roosenschoon and non-composing musicians like Daly and Schick a sincere affection for the Non-Western music and a desire that justice be done by it.

This theme is found again in the writings of Geoffrey Poole and by way of examining his work we can study his essay ‘Black-White- Rainbow: a personal view on what African music means to the Contemporary Western Composer.’ His introduction asks exactly what happens to musical material at the point of interaction with another source. Answering this question will help us to further assess the merits of the different approaches we have encountered in the models so far. Poole’s first sketch of an answer is this.

‘When two cultures intermarry, their issue is not merely the sum of their attributes, it is a multiplication, a vast spectrum of possibilities. Yet looked at another way, one might say the defining factor is the subtraction of attributes, the calling into question of that which has been assumed within each culture.

(Poole ed. Floyd. 1999: 295)

So here we have the idea that in any sort of cross-cultural composition we have a whole work in and of itself and not merely the result of an equation ‘West plus Non-West equals.’ In venturing into such a borderland we must leave behind something of the baggage we have brought with us though we find this difficult. Poole emphasises this notion by making reference to the writing of the Black Madagascan poet Jean-Joseph Rabearivelo whose writings formed the basis of Poole’s choral composition ‘Imerina.’

‘There in the North, stand two stones, and they are somewhat alike:
One is black and one is white.
If I pick up the white one, the black one shame me.
If I pick up the black one, the white one shame me.
If I pick them both up, one is love, the other is consolation
(Rabearivelo translated and quoted in Poole and Floyd. 1999:307)
The poet’s anguish we are told, is due to his sense of being torn between his native culture and his knowledge and expertise in the school of French Symbolism. We are being cautioned here that the difficulties in attempting cross-culturalism are considerable and require that the Western composer be prepared to recognise what can and cannot be translated. We have already at this point begun to contravene the almost entirely Westernised approach of Steve Reich who as previously mentioned, preferred to consider the Non-Western influence purely as interesting musicological data at least within his compositions. However, as we shall see Poole does not quite so easily sit on the other side of the fence with the likes of Roosenschoon calling for a cheerfully multicultural approach (indeed to his credit he admits how his greenish-centre-left politics led to him having a naïve view African musical culture before he went live in Kenya.) Instead we are presented with food for thought on the difficulties of any interaction between the West and African music. Poole articulates a vision that again chimes with what we have already heard, that we should consider the musical cultures of interest firstly in relation to the people that create them and need them and secondly in relation to our own musical practices so that we can begin to see areas of possible interaction. Poole’s setting of the poem is one of his earliest attempts in the cross-cultural field. (See figure 2.1) He writes,

‘The three years following my arrival in Kenya (two there, one back in the UK) marked the death of certain attitudes and skills that had taken 15 years to build up, and saw only one new work. It was written with maximum simplicity and directness for that most African of mediums, unaccompanied collective voices.
(Poole ed Floyd 1999: 306)

This is, in my view, a very worthwhile exercise not just because it lead to a greater sensitivity to the musical culture being ‘visited’ but also that Poole shows us how cross-cultural practice might genuinely contribute to a reappraisal of the state of our own musical culture. In this vein Poole is almost cynical about the nuances of Western art music which he considers in the light of the technologically unsophisticated and yet richly joyous communal music making that one can find in so many parts of the African continent.
Figure 2.1. ‘Imerina’

Composing the Music of Africa
The spirit of the cry

‘Music may bubble up at any time, perhaps beginning as singing to oneself but also immediately solidifying into a social tie... Every new song is an affirmation: I’m here, this is me... It reaffirms our suspicion that ‘our music may have paid too dear a price for its sophistication. There is a capacity for music within us that has been cramped by even the most primary processes of notation and it has to be said- forever disadvantaged by the over-structures, the safely engineered ‘objective worth criteria’ of the submitted score...Only the singer composer, for whom the barrier of notation is obliterated, can hope to access the spirit of the cry directly. Which is probably why the byways of rock and folk have generally got closer to Africa than we have in the concert tradition. (Poole ed Floyd. 1999:296)

Having previously stated that such considerations were worthwhile, I feel some pause is needed here to assess what Poole is and isn’t saying. He was clearly struck during his time in Africa by the seemingly more ‘organic’ nature of African culture and it’s ability to express humanity through community. Visitors to Africa, including the present author often feel an emotive lament that our own ‘Post-modern’ and cynically capitalist society might be lacking something in the way of such spiritual wealth. Nevertheless it would be wise to look beyond liberal sentiments, however accurate they may be. Poole’s observation about popular music traditions reaching the heart of the matter more readily than the art music tradition is, I would argue, faultlessly correct and indeed we should not forget that Jazz, Blues and by extension Rock musics are living vindications of the creative possibilities of cross-culturalism in music, though of course they are born of the evolving practice of generations of black music makers in a white-dominant society rather than the success of a single composer. Poole perhaps is arguing that being in the right place and understanding how different forms of music affect and appeal to different peoples is a great help in learning to interact with a music.

Notes on Notation

Some clarity is needed though concerning his near resentment of notation. In my view this is a concern more about the direction of twentieth century art music than the European tradition as a whole. Although they seldom did it with the scruple of the anthropologist, many western composers utilised the folk music of their native cultures or drew upon their religious traditions for
devices and inspiration: The Norwegian Grieg claimed that he was sure that his music had ‘a taste of codfish about it’ (Grieg quoted in Thompson and Wade-Matthews 2002: 388), and both Chopin in his Polonaises and Liszt in his Hungarian Rhapsodies used folk material to transform the piano as an instrument of expressive power and technical virtuosity. Again in the earlier parts of the twentieth century composers such as Bartok and Vaughan-Williams undertook what could be thought of as prototype ethnomusicological research to put together idioms of striking beauty and cleverness. Crucially, all these composers wrote their notes! And their scores are left behind for future generations of performers to interpret. Approaching these old symbols with fresh eyes is one of the joys of being a musician in the West.

What Poole is referring to is the arguably excessive cerebralism that characterised much of modernist thought in music and which succeeded in alienating large numbers of the general public in the Western world. It is my opinion that cross-culturalism by Western composers, irrespective of their motivations and their approaches is basically part of a much wider recovery in the art music tradition from some of the extremes of the avant-garde. It is a controversial claim no doubt but I feel that there is an artistic kinship between the composer who looks south of Gibraltar and east of Istanbul for inspiration and the composer who permits himself or herself to write in C major or repeat the pattern for its meditative effect. The point being that notation itself is not wholly to blame if we in the West do not make our music quite as intrinsic to our daily living as many Non-Western peoples do. Nor should we forget that in Non-Western cultures, the lack of written notation does not mean that the music is easy or that it does not require skill or training. Focusing, as Poole does in the paper on African music, we still encounter material that is taught and practiced with great devotion often by performers who could fairly be called virtuosi.

In all fairness to Poole, we may suppose him able to understand this and I suspect the passage needs to be read as praise for the ‘earthiness’ of African music rather than as an excess of post modernism. Nevertheless it seems important to insist that any practice of cross-culturalism that is founded on or includes any sort of infidelity to the riches of the Western musical tradition is unlikely to succeed (and I would argue deserves its failure.) How may one respect and love a borrowed culture if one is needlessly contemptuous of one’s own?
The issue of integration

Having been critical of Poole I should now like to give him all due credit for the wisdom of the following statements.

‘What we may realistically strive to do within the contemporary classical field is not to present reliable copies of what already exists in another place (even assuming one had no scruples about the blatant theft of artistic property) but to assimilate the spirit, or rather to allow African music to stimulate the dormant quarters of our own musicality, and use that as the basis to create something genuinely new.... so long as the African input is perceived as ‘other’, then one is relying on exoticism... only when the elements have been absorbed and wholly integrated into a composers sensibilities is the process complete to my way of thinking.’ (Poole ed Floyd. 1999: 296-314)

I think we can identify three important points from this: First of all Poole gives us a stout rejection of the appropriation of cultural material. To merely copy music is intellectually sloppy, ethically dubious and likely to lead to profoundly uninteresting music. Yet as we heard earlier from Aubert and Ross Daly cheap imitation or fusion is a process that some Western musicians have found themselves following. It insults the borrowed culture and hardly enhances the musical experience of the Western listener. The second point of interest is that Poole seems almost to restate much of Steve Reich’s earlier ‘manifesto’ statement. Both explicitly reject exoticism and express a desire to create something new. It is interesting though to see how differently the two men think this is to be done. Reich seemed almost to make a virtue of avoiding ‘Africanness’ in his works whereas Poole does, as I shall show in detail later, make a more explicit acknowledgement in his work of the influence of Africa in his work.

The third point is born of what I believe to be a link between the word spirit and the reference to dormant quarters. Poole seems to regard the experience of African music and African culture as equally important, that is to say that they fuel his creative imagination in all aspects. Therefore the principal influence is perhaps not so much on the details of his soundworld, but on how he actually motivates himself to create a soundworld at all. For the reliability of this idea I look to his statement,

‘Nothing I have written in the 1990’s has failed to be touched by my experience of African music, and I see no reason to write for
noseflute and mbira to prove it. The point is really that, by observing a foreign culture in which tradition is all-important but under threat, I came to appreciate the strengths and indeed the fragility, of our own ways and our need to preserve the lifeblood of our own culture.’ (Poole ed Floyd. 1999: 314)

This is a rather more lyrical way of vindicating a synthesis than Reich’s and in fact Poole is critical of the approach of Reich or rather, some of his admirers writing that,

‘One of the more depressing aspects of African influence on the West is seen in the mechanical repetitiveness practised by many of today’s aspiring composers under the name of ‘minimalism’. In my view the early Steve Reich expunges quite enough of the terror, error and sonorous subtlety of West African drumming to make it acceptable to the comfortable first world.’ (Poole ed Floyd. 1999: 326)

The lesson here then is maybe to consider that there are two sides to the coin when we are talking about appropriation. So far we have understood appropriation as a form of crude imitation or pastiche. But Poole’s remark cautions us that it could equally mean the Westernising of Non-Western material to be acceptable to Western ears. The argument furthermore means that ‘exoticism’ can be interpreted as producing a ‘user-friendly’ version of another culture that spares us the time-consuming and perhaps unsettling experience of examining exactly what the ‘other’ people express in their music. In his paper Poole is keen to assert his belief, one that I share, that music is something that should mean something to people. He talks about how music should be a part and parcel of our appreciation of ‘life’s big issues- love, existence, demise, and grief.’ Poole argues that this is what Western music used to do and perhaps does not do so well any more.

‘I refer to the suspicion that contemporary music has mortgaged itself increasingly on the plane of professionalism and egotism... In this case African culture had the very specific role of reassuring me as to the fundamental value of music as a healing presence and an intermediary to eternity.’ (Poole ed Floyd. 1999:327)

What should we make of this almost mystical language? It reveals that Poole, who spent almost two years divorced from the working experience of Western based professional composers, found the lack of abstraction in African music refreshing, a point
previously mentioned. But more importantly there is a sense, which was confirmed to me in conversation with him, that his experiences of African music provoked a personal exegesis on the subject of just what it is that he loves about music. He talks about how different sounds inspired him to consider previously unthought-of ideas, for example in writing for voices he considers the timbral possibilities of a voice and creates a vocality with a distinct character, an idea I will return to. He made the statement that despite his global wanderings he considers himself absolutely to be a contemporary classical composer. I take this remark to mean that he is not interested in the model of composer-as-explorer, represented by David Fanshawe but is instead interested in the resonance (acoustic and metaphorical) that can be found between different musical cultures. To put in the form of an aphorism ‘Similarities are more interesting than differences’ which is not a world away from Reich’s feeling that African music confirmed rather than confounded his pre-existing musical ideas.

Furthermore we come close to the ethnomusicological goal of understanding universal principles in music. It will never work on a simplistic level, there is too much of a gulf between Gamelan and Mozart to pretend they are the same. But we can begin to discover eternal verities of musical expression that can hold true wherever you are in the world. Interestingly there have been studies recently in neuroscience and psychology that look at the idea of music as an adaptation of evolution, considering whether music making has sociobiological benefits to human beings and has therefore become a hallmark of the species. The neuroscientist Daniel Levitin in his book ‘The World in Six Songs: How the Musical Brain Created Human Nature’ discussed the idea at length, the six songs being a metaphor for the six purposes he feels music-making has for humanity that could have caused its evolution and its prevalence among the species.

Rather than head off onto a tangent I will sum up the point thus: our symbol-forming minds should use this medium of music, acquired in the evolution of our human nature, for the enrichment of our experience of this life in all its glories and, importantly, its agonies, and that we should do this in common with those around us. Poole is absolutely right to praise African music for the part it plays in doing this just as I feel all the world’s

musical cultures, including our own western traditions do, at their best, fulfil this role.

Creating a synthesis

The problem of course is what is retained and lost in an attempt either at synthesis or personal engagement. Poole fears that the Minimalist aesthetic guts African music of the very things that make it so fascinating in the first place. Whilst I am tempted to see his point I also feel compelled to recall our earlier discussion about the historical perspectives of different composers. Poole is writing in a world where multi-culturalism has become more established than it was when Reich wrote his essay so it is now easier to conceive a work that attempts a genuine fusion. So really we come back to the now familiar model of influence manifestation. I have shown how Aubert, Reich, Klatzow and Roosenschoon all feel the need to define terms and establish positions in the field of cross-cultural endeavour. And now we can see how Poole’s model relates to theirs.

‘The marriage of Black and White is not easy. The success of the graft depends on which features are of value to the host culture ... to borrow a concept form Carl Jung, I would now say that the abstractions of Boulez (and Bach, Beethoven and Webern) for example are indicative of the intuitive Psyche, whereas the sense-data impact of the primal cry belongs to the opposite end of the ‘irrational spectrum’; no less powerful or sophisticated, but fundamentally at odds.’ (Poole ed Floyd. 1999: 331)

So Poole essentially is reinforcing the original distinction I drew between intellectual/aesthetic and cultural/aesthetic forms of influence but he does it in a different way. The inference I would make is that he feels that an attitude to music that places intellectual concepts as paramount is something inherently Western and that an attempt at cross-culturalism along these lines will lead to pieces that suit received Western models of musical activity- the concert performance and the study score. Following this idea would mean locating minimalism in this category since Reich arguably gives us a polished version of Africanisms in ‘Drumming.’ Poole’s obvious distaste for this approach is given by him as being part of the reason that some of his earlier larger scale concert works that tried to use an African influence failed, ‘ the African character had to be transmuted to meet the demands of an abstract work.’ (Poole ed Floyd. 1999:332)
Instead Poole favours a version of the cultural/aesthetic model where forces within a work, whether Western, Non-Western or a mix are given parts specially designed to give them a recognisable almost anthropomorphic character. This is intended so as to place music closer to that primal cry- an ineffable, intuitive, emotive force that fires human creativity. Poole contends that Western music comes closest to this in forms such as opera and song where the canon of art music comes tantalisingly close to traditions of Folk music.

I confess that as taken as I am with many of Poole’s ideas I remain hesitant about his criticisms of Western musical practices, although in fairness it is not so much that he berates Western music for it’s values as for what he considers it’s lack of values. In conversation with him, I found that this rebellious stance had mellowed somewhat and that he was happy to confront some of the imperfection in the idea. His approach to composition requires openness to intellectual enquiry and a commitment to the discovery of the meaning and significance of different ideas and materials. Although it would be blatant bigotry to suggest that musicians from other cultures do not have such cognitive skill and imagination manifest in their creativity, the framework in which Poole composes is a European formula; Enlightenment principle plus romantic passions plus modernist originality. The very act of looking around for new ideas is an inherent part of Western culture, one that has had effects both glorious and tragic. What does this mean for the interested composer?

‘If my theory amounts to anything it is to say the cultural assimilation issue is not merely one of techniques, but is governed by the individual needs of each psyche... a final conclusion would be out of place in what must remain an open ended- quest.... African music has its treasures to offer materially... but these are seldom directly transferable... there are probably as many solutions as seekers.’ (Poole ed Floyd. 1999: 332)

Poole’s ideas are somewhat polemical but I believe that they are worthy of interest as the account of a man with an admirable body of original works behind him, works which are for me among the best and most coherent examples of cross-cultural composition.
No Aesthetics without Theology: David Fanshawe and ‘Holy Africa’

Earlier I made reference to David Fanshawe’s famous work ‘African Sanctus’ and this is the first piece I would like to examine.

There is no better introduction to the piece than that supplied by the composer himself in the programme notes to the score.

‘In 1969 I went to Africa for the first time with the idea of writing a major work which would combine my love of travel, adventure and recording with my composition...overlooking the Nile one evening, I suddenly heard in my head the unlikely combination of a Western choir accompanying the Islamic call to prayer. My objective at the time was to travel up the Nile, record traditional music and one day, compose selected recordings into my own music, creating a work of praise to One God. The journey became a symbolic one which I like to call the Sanctus Journey.’

(Fanshawe 1979: 1)

Central to Fanshawe’s thinking were two issues. Firstly his deep and obvious love for Africa and his desire to understand African musical culture as rigorously as a romantic sense of enchantment would permit. Secondly his sincere Christian Faith was by no means hostile to other religious traditions and in particular he was drawn to the fact that Jews, Christians and Muslims all believe not just in One God, but crucially in the same One God. By no means is he the first thinker to realise the humanitarian possibilities inherent in a widespread appreciation of this fact but it required something of a pioneer spirit to celebrate this so openly and forcefully through artistic creation. In terms of my suggested model of influence manifestation, African Sanctus appears to belong to the category of cultural/aesthetic influence. Like Roosenschoon and unlike Reich, Fanshawe absolutely intends to wallow in the actual sounds of African musicians and takes, as I shall show, almost no interest in Reich’s rationalised distilling of cultural material.

The form of the piece

The piece consists of thirteen relatively short movements that loosely follow the liturgical structure of the Roman Catholic Mass and form a musical setting of the Mass. Some of the liturgy is drawn from the Anglican rite also. In addition are recordings of the Islamic Muezzin and numerous excerpts from Fanshawe’s impressive, indeed irreplaceable ethnomusicological archive. Since the recordings are required to fit in and around Fanshawe’s
actual composed material in a live performance, a certain degree of technological ingenuity is needed to mount a performance. It would be nice to locate the work in the context of twentieth century developments in electro-acoustic composition, this is however quite difficult. Fanshawe’s writings and ‘African Sanctus’ itself have little in common with the approaches to tape recordings that Reich and others pioneered. The uses of recordings, while very important in the Sanctus, have a specific aesthetic function for Fanshawe. The sense of theatre is of great importance to the composer, as some of his detailed performance notes make clear. For example:

‘African Sanctus will most likely be performed as a straight concert work. The part which refers to drummers and ad-lib performers does not necessarily imply that the work has to be staged... any dancing or choreography can only become effective under special circumstances with proper direction, lighting etc... where the performance area is limited and the presentation simpler, the more effective it becomes. In Africa when gatherings occur, it is common to see one or two individuals letting themselves go, adding their own enthusiastic body movements, shouts and ululations.’ (Fanshawe 1979:2)

His desire to see African music celebrated at its most organic is a constant theme but as with Roosenschoon there are questions to be raised about the sophistication of his approach. There is I believe, a strong conclusion to be made in this area but only after considering the music itself can it be fully appreciated. The first movement begins with the main Sanctus theme, which is heard several times throughout the piece, lasting each time approximately thirty seconds. It begins with four bars of dramatic percussion beats, two in each bar played slowly with the instruction to sound ‘tribalistic.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 11 see figure 3.1) This is the first of numerous vague instructions in the score that require something to sound ‘African’ or ‘ethnic.’ To the experienced musician, Western or otherwise, these can seem to jar with their naivety, suggesting something of Reich’s ‘Afrikanische musik.’ On the surface it seems that Fanshawe, for all his anthropological achievements is indulging a well meaning but naïve attempt at being multi-cultural. There is however in my view an explanation. The piece contains a dedication to ‘Musicians who neither read nor write music,’ which I interpret as a sentiment similar to Geoffrey Poole’s remark about western music paying a heavy price for it’s sophistication. Because most Non-Western music functions happily without written notation there is a need perhaps to lament the pragmatic necessity to write
things down and contain what should be limitless creative freedom. The cynical response might be to observe that the whole work would cease to be performable if there were not clear instructions. Fanshawe’s solution appears to be a deliberately anarchic score. Tradition and convention is basically observed but, tongue firmly in cheek we have cartoon drawings, anecdotes and little jokes all included in the score. (See figure 3.2)

Figure 3.1. ‘African Sanctus opening page’
Figure 3.2. ‘An anecdote about the call to prayer’

To the Ambrosian Singers.

2. KYRIE: CALL TO PRAYER

The principal Sanctus theme continues consisting of a loud tutti section exclaiming the Latin liturgy. Although it is mostly quaver figures the strong percussion sounds on the two crotchet beats
keep it firmly anchored. Throughout the piece, the instrumentation adds to the sense of anarchy. The instrumental section reads rather more like a lead sheet for a rock band than the score for an orchestral ensemble with the lead guitar having chord symbols provided and the drummers permitted to ad-lib. Of course the performance actually has to be very tightly controlled but Fanshawe seems determined to preserve a sense of improvised tribal festival (even though many such tribal rituals in Africa are themselves tightly bound by rules to ensure religious authenticity.)

At performance mark A the first tape recording begins, playing the Ugandan ‘Bwala’ dance recorded in 1969. It consists of voice and percussion, is played quite quickly and has a similar percussive feel to Fanshawe’s material. With very few exceptions Fanshawe ensures that his own material and that of his recordings play well together with the transition sometimes sounding completely seamless but even when it is obvious it still sounds natural. Fanshawe deserves credit for his highly original way of creating music that does not sound crudely imitative of African music but nonetheless manages to fit well with the real sounds of the continent. Since his goal is to look for unity and universality between cultures he obviously listened intensely to his recordings to find ways of composing around them in a suitable way. The first movement is just short of four minutes in length and follows a verse-chorus structure, with the Sanctus theme as chorus and the ‘Bwala’ dance as verse. It would certainly be in keeping with Fanshawe’s orthodoxy of the unorthodox to have a pop-song structure in a setting of the Mass.

The Call to Prayer

The second movement is the ‘Kyrie/Call to Prayer.’ Something must be said of Fanshawe’s handling of the liturgy at this point. The Kyrie is a Christian prayer and about the last remaining part of the Catholic liturgy in the Greek language. It follows a three-part pattern, ‘Kyrie Eleison, Christe Eleison, Kyrie Eleison.’ (Lord have mercy, Christ have mercy, Lord have mercy.) This is introduced by Fanshawe after we hear the opening of a recording of the Islamic Muezzin, which begins with the exclamation ‘Allahu Akbar’, or ‘God is Great.’ This prayer is often sung to call Muslims to worship and the text in English is often rendered ‘God is great, there is no God but God and Muhammad is the Prophet of God.’ The combination of these two prayers is handled by Fanshawe with a skill that gives the lie to his seemingly impish simplicity. (See figure 3.3) The musical material is very serene and meditative. Aware of the atmosphere it creates
Fanshawe, in a note at the bottom of the page, offers the conductor the chance to begin with this piece, especially if it is to be a small-scale performance.  

Figure 3.3. ‘Kyrie: Call to Prayer’.
The third movement is the ‘Gloria: Bride of the Nile’ The Gloria is one of the great prayers of the Church and based on the angelic proclamation of Christ’s birth in the Gospels. The choir is asked accordingly to ‘Hammer it out’ creating a percussive effect whilst fitting it around a charming Egyptian wedding song. The Gloria’s principle feature of interest is the call and response between the male and female voices, a device hardly unheard of in Western music but also familiar to many of the African tribal rituals with which the composer is familiar. The piano also plays at its most percussive in this section sounding dissonant at points. The contrast between all this activity and the tranquility of the song is very effective. The chanting repetition of the song makes the female voices in Fanshawe’s choir sound almost ethereal by comparison. Eventually on p48 of the score (no bar numbers are given in the composer’s hand written manuscript,) the Egyptian song dies away to be replaced with a recording of Islamic prayers. Fanshawe writes on the stave,

‘Boys learn the Koran in a special prayer school. The Gloria now juxtaposes Latin with Arabic chanting stressing again the musical relationship between Christ and Muhammad.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 48 see figure 3.4)

This point is at the heart of my understanding of the piece and I shall return to it later. The change of recording prompts the choir to now adopt a gentler pace and tone. The instruction ‘espresse dolce’ seems to confirm that the Gloria should now sound rather more like traditional sacred choral music, an impression increased by the introduction of the soprano solo at the top of page 49. This tranquillity is abruptly halted by page 52 as the Gloria swells to a climactic passage before it and the tapes fade away over a prolonged period.

The fourth movement is the ‘Credo: Sudanese Dances and Recitations. The credo or creed is the central affirmation of faith for Christians and here it is heard among other things with courtship dances, a women’s bravery dance and the most evocative title of them all ‘Four men in a trance chanting by moonlight.’ (See figure 3.5) During the very lively dances at the start of the movement Fanshawe permits improvisation from his percussionists by telling the conductor to ‘encourage it with verve.’ The ‘four men chanting’ recording is both beautiful and important. Fanshawe, in the middle of a page of musical manuscript, takes up the story thus:
‘I discovered the four men on the prayer mat by accident in the Marra Mountains of Western Sudan in 1969. I heard them from afar on top of the mountains whilst riding my camel on a somewhat dangerous journey. Riding on alone under a full moon I reached them, recorded them and vanished. They never saw me as they had been in a trance. Afterwards, very elated in the wilderness, I confronted God, the Creator, and became very moved and was inspired.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 62)

Figure 3.4. ‘Islamic prayer school’.
This passage contains a mix of the mystical and the poetic such as that to be found in the King James Bible, a point to which I
shall return. It is again worth stating the apparent oddness of writing this in the middle of the score. Fanshawe’s choral setting of the credo, which has a liturgically appropriate exultant feel to it, eventually follows the recordings. Fanshawe indicates a ‘steady and intoxicating tempo’ on page 64 and performance mark E on page 67 instructs the choir to sing in a manner that is ‘tribalistic and not without humour.’ Humour is provided by Fanshawe just one bar earlier with the frankly ludicrous instruction, ‘Latin to sound a bit African so emphasise the yumms.’ (See figure 3.6) (Fanshawe 1979: 67) This is a reference to the pronunciation of the second syllable of the Latin word Deum (God.) Of course singers often have to exaggerate syllables in a way not familiar to ordinary speech but Fanshawe’s wording of the request once again appears to be gentle mocking of musical convention. As if to compound the hint of postmodern humour Fanshawe writes down the best comment possible on his own credo theme by observing that it is a variation on the tune of ‘Good King Wenceslas.’ (See figure 3.7) However there is again a deeper point to be found. On first listening to the passage it is not at all obvious that the famous carol melody is being quoted. It is quite apparent once you have read it will be. Perhaps Fanshawe is making something of the idea of drawing on Western musical influences just as he does African ones, his compositional practice being informed by his influences which are respected sufficiently so as not to be directly plagiarised.

Beyond liturgical orthodoxy

The fifth movement represents a clean break from the liturgy. It is a love song with a solo piano piece running alongside. The love song is from East Sudan and is quite beautiful. Fanshawe explains in a performance note that the intended concept is one of ‘a fluid relationship expanding out of the ostinato rhythms of the ‘Love Song.’ The piano is ordered to hold tempo with the song and the result is quite effective although marred slightly by the fact that the piano writing has a tendency to sound reminiscent of Jazz. The most remarkable part of this movement is the end which consists of a recording entitled ‘Bells and Desert Sounds’ (See figure 3.8) Fanshawe writes,

‘Bells ringing in the desert of East Sudan, 1969, signify the birth of a newborn son. In this context they herald the birth of Christianity to Africa.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 83)

This fresh burst of mystical insight is actually aesthetically appropriate. The bells have a sparkling timbre that reminds me of
the practice of ringing hand bells in church services to warn the congregation of the imminent consecration of the Eucharist. This is appropriate since the piece now returns to its liturgical foundations.

Figure 3.6. ‘Latin to sound a bit African’

Figure 3.7. ‘A note about Good King Wenceslas’
Figure 3.8. ‘Bells and Desert Sounds’
The sixth movement is ‘Et in Spiritum Sanctum.’ (I believe in the Holy Spirit.) The movement begins with a Capella voices singing the Latin text. The parts are virtually identical consisting chiefly of the same rhythmic figure sung in melodic sequence. It is simple but memorable and almost nowhere else does Fanshawe’s own music sound so beautiful nor indeed so reflective of the Western tradition of sacred choral music. So beautiful is it that it is somewhat annoying when it is interrupted by frogs. (See figure 3.9) Fanshawe requires the conductor to ‘ease in frogs’ but frankly the interruption is too stark to be subtle. Fortunately the sound of croaking African frogs is merely the start of a recording, the ‘Zande song of Flight.’ Fanshawe introduces this recording, again mid-score, writing,

‘Christian refugees from South Sudan decide which song to sing. Frogs croak in the swamps as the Zande family begin to praise their deliverer, Jesus Christ.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 85)

Figure 3.9. ‘Songs and Frogs’
This is intended to highlight the humanitarian ethos that forms part of Fanshawe's work. He has a setting of an affirmation of Christian faith that is vindicated with forceful eloquence by the singing of refugees, people who have been grievously ill treated and uprooted because of their faith. One need not be in possession of any religious beliefs to be angered and humbled in equal measure by this, doubtless what the composer intended. Fanshawe does not leave his audience to wallow in any sense of tragedy. The recording continues with a delightfully dexterous performance from the Mbira, the famous African thumb piano. The sound of this instrument, whose part is actually transcribed into western notation by Fanshawe, (See figure 3.10) is instantly familiar to anyone with even the remotest knowledge of African musical idioms. The presence of it is reassuring and it serves to make the movement far more joyous than readers of the anecdote might expect. Subsequently African voices begin their song, firstly a female voice who issues a call to which male voices respond. This upbeat singing is interspersed with passages from Fanshawe’s more serene ‘Et in Spiritum Sanctum.’ More than in any other movement of the piece, the interaction works sublimely.

Figure 3.10. ‘Mbira pattern’

Approaching the key ideas

The seventh movement is the ‘Crucifixus: Rain Song.’ This is arguably the most important movement for two reasons. First it
represents the Passion of Christ on the Cross, a longstanding subject in sacred art and music. The liturgy here represents a
great theological paradox, grief and anger expressed at the unjust
and awful slaughter of Christ but also the joy of knowing that
through this searingly radical act humanity and divinity are
joined together. It requires in musical terms a troubled beauty,
which has traditionally been expressed through the art of
lamentation. Fanshawe provides it. The second reason, directly
related to the first, is that the recording he chooses here is his
most famous and most poignant, namely the ‘Rain Song.’
Fanshawe explains why,

‘Rain song recorded in a thunderstorm in Gulu, Uganda 1969. It
is probably the most beautiful song I ever recorded in Africa. It
is sung by Latigo Oteng with his seven stringed ‘Enanga.’ Latigo
Oteng, who was a policeman in Gulu is feared dead (murdered).
He gave me his instrument.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 97)

Needless to say the parallels between this story and the biblical
accounts of the Passion (which include rain,) greatly add to the
sense of pathos. The song itself has a mournful beauty to it,
heightened by Fanshawe’s setting of Crucifixus which contrasts
dramatically. Strong piano and percussion parts add a sense of
terror to a vocal line that despite being restrained in terms of
tempo is instructed to sound ‘menacing.’ (Performance mark B
page 96 See figure 3.11) At performance mark H on page 101 the
instruction changes to ‘menacing and very dramatic.’ At this
point Fanshawe turns to heavily amplified lead and bass guitars
to ram home the emotional impact of the imagined scene writing
as a performance instruction,

‘Solo menacing: the guitars now represent an amplified
extension of the African harp.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 101)

Truthfully, I dislike this section a great deal. The use of
amplification not only seems to contradict the general theme of
music that is made closer to nature but it sounds, especially when
the piano joins in, completely at odds with most of the rest of the
piece. Perhaps though this section simply has not aged well since
it was written. It is also worth considering the possibility that
Fanshawe remembers the Theology of the Cross, which can lead
to an appreciation of sorrow and anguish as the path to
redemption. Fanshawe certainly orchestrates a maelstrom of
frenzied music with performance instructions calling for the
music to sound ‘warlike and martial’ and ‘metallic.’ Crescendos
in the percussion part on page 107 have the instruction ‘BASH
IT’ (See figure 3.12) written in the middle of the hairpin symbol and on page 108 a new recording is introduced that is called ‘War Dance.’ Fanshawe claims this represents ‘degradation and unjust suffering,’ presumably both of Christ on the cross and of far too many people in Africa. This war dance is powerful timbrally, being driven by agitated percussion. At performance mark M on page 110 the choral ‘Crucifixus’ returns with the instruction ‘driving on relentlessly.’ The relentlessness called for begins to die away very gradually. By page 120 the choir parts have rallentandi marked and at mark R the ‘chorale’ section begins with an ‘espress’ instruction. The reason for the calming of Fanshawe’s writing is the reintroduction of the ‘Rain Song’ that, after the percussive bombardment, sounds all the more eloquent. This movement then fades away, concluding with an R.I.P memorial from Fanshawe to Latigo Oteng (and I would infer, to the crucified Christ.)

Figure 3.11. ‘Menacing’
The eighth movement begins after an optional performance interval. The location within the work is not arbitrary. I feel it represents the period between Good Friday and Easter Sunday.
when Christ lay dead in his sepulchre. The evidence for this litters the score on page 124 where movement 8 begins. Firstly it is a return of the original Sanctus theme with the Bwala dance. (See figure 3.13) The return of familiar strains has a joyous and cathartic feel to it, which I feel is intender by Fanshawe to represent the Resurrection of Christ after his death and burial. The sense of triumph litters this movement. The performance instruction is ‘Full-Blooded and Ritualistic’ and Fanshawe is moved to write,

‘Holy, Holy, Holy Lord God of Hosts...After the Storm we Celebrate!’ (Fanshawe 1979: 124)

Figure 3.13. ‘Bwala Dance’
This is Easter music which means that movements 7 and 8 and the interval between them can, and in my view should, be interpreted as a musical meditation on the passion and Resurrection of Christ with the African recordings serving to illustrate the cross-cultural significance of the story.

The Sanctus theme returns

As in the original movement the Sanctus theme lasts for half a minute before the Bwala Dance comes in. The Sanctus theme returns repeatedly in this movement and the interplay between the two principal themes becomes increasingly faster with driving percussion and ostinati being the main features. The incessant nature of the repetition is not banal, partly because of the inclusion of interesting recorded excerpts of xylophone music that compliments Fanshawe’s percussion writing well. There is also a sense in which the performers should hardly be able to contain their excitement as the magnitude of the music and it’s meaning fully manifests itself. Fanshawe’s suggestion in the programme notes that performers and audience members should feel able to move freely to express themselves seems particularly apt at this point, indeed the theatricality of the music becomes more and more apparent. Fanshawe writes an instruction on page 136 for the piano to sound ‘honky tonk.’ If that seems ridiculous then consider that on page 142 Fanshawe writes that the tambourines should be ‘pop style with elbow strike and body reaction.’ In fairness he manages a more modest ‘Jubilant’ instruction at the top of the same page. Towards the end of the movement the evangelical nature of the music begins to sound not unlike that of ‘Jesus Christ Superstar’ which may well be appropriate but makes for a high point of excitement for which there needs to be a tonic.

Lamentation

The required tonic is provided in the ninth movement, which is a setting of the Lord’s Prayer. It begins, oddly, with a lamentation recording and, also oddly, continues in the English language. Fanshawe explains why:

‘On the shores of Lake Kyoga, Uganda in 1969 I recorded this-heart rending lamentation for a dead fisherman. It was stifling hot in the papyrus hut where his wife and mother grieved. As I stood there looking down upon the body, the words of Our Lord came into my mind. I have set the Lord’s Prayer in English as
many people from East Africa speak English.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 156)

Why have a lamentation? Why also write in English when Swahili is just as plausible an East African Lingua Franca? The answer I believe is that Fanshawe is aware that the vast majority of the people who will ever hear or perform this work will not be from Africa. He is writing, despite his explanation to the contrary, (see below) for his Western audience so that they can hear and fully understand his setting of the prayer which Christ himself taught in the Gospels. I am quite sure though that it is a genuine observation being made when he counsels that many Africans are able to understand and enjoy the Christian Liturgy. The lamentation reminds us that even after the events of the First Easter, humanity must still confront the realities of life and death and we have, in both music and religion, the metaphysical tools to express the nature of grief fully. Fanshawe himself hints as much by writing on page 157 (after he has allowed space for the recorded song.)

‘The Lord’s Prayer is composed as a response to the lamentation. It is an offertory or soothing song to the dead fisherman’s family.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 157)

His desire to provide a soothing aesthetic experience is expressed emphatically in his performance instructions. The choir are told at performance mark A to sound ‘simple and moving, the bass to sound ‘nice and round,’ the drum kit ‘soft and gentle, brushes,’ the newly included organ ‘very warm with a swell’ and the piano is again required to sound ‘simple and moving.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 157 See figure 3.14) There are dynamic changes to prevent monotony. At performance mark C on page 163 the instruction changes to ‘dramatic and rhythmical rock beat.’ From here the vocal lines both solo and choral leave behind their previous gentle meandering and develop a sense of urgency with many quaver and semi-quaver figures and bars that form a melodic sequence with their preceding bars. The percussion parts have numerous marcato points and the piano has a dramatic section of ascending scalar octaves (see pages 164-165.) At D on page 166 the original espressivo section returns and dominates to the end of the movement at page 171. It is I feel worth noting that Fanshawe’s aesthetic sense is literally dictated in this movement by liturgical concerns. The dramatic section occurs during the singing of the climactic part of the Lord’s Prayer, ‘Lead us not into temptation, but deliver us from evil. For thine is the Kingdom, the Power and the Glory.’ This line is
sung exactly by the solo soprano from mark C to the end of page 165 in a line that consists rhythmically of four crotchet notes per bar (with an occasional dot and quaver for variety See figure 3.15)) and melodically of a sequence rising by step each bar (with one downward anomaly.)

Figure 3.14. ‘Lamentation’
The overall sense of the movement is one with very little about it that is African. Once the recording of the Lamentation finishes it does not have any major impact, returning very briefly and
faintly as a fade-out at the end. Instead we are left with Fanshawe’s material that sounds almost exactly like a contemporary Western hymn tune of the kind composed by among others, Graham Kendrick. This movement is unique in the work. In every other one Fanshawe is asking of his beloved ‘Holy Africa’ to offer to western ears it’s musical treasures. In the ninth movement he does the opposite, composing a beautiful Western hymn tune to match the sounds of Africa and as a present to a dead fisherman’s family. I do not think it irrelevant that Christ’s apostles were fishermen and that the fish is as old a symbol of Christianity as the cross.

Chants

The tenth movement is simply called ‘Chants.’ The very first part of it is a short Latin a capella piece for S.A.T.B choir (with double alto line.) It sounds very much like a credible contemporary attempt at the Roman Catholic tradition of Gregorian chanting and is soft, subtle, slow and sonorous. So much so in fact that it comes of something of a shock when we quickly proceed into the first of four recordings. This first one is the ‘Masai milking song,’ about which Fanshawe writes,

‘The return to nature and the wilds of Africa. A Masai milking song and cattle songs PRAISE:’ (Fanshawe 1979:173)

This seems somewhat overblown in its romanticism, although it a very interesting piece. It is lead by a strong, young sounding female voice who is joined by an ensemble of male voices who sing not in unison but certainly tutti. The female acts as cantor issuing the call to which the men respond. The coherent structure and the liveliness of the singing make it possible to forgive the interruption of the Latin chanting. The joining in of the cow being milked gives the piece a genuine humour that feels absolutely right. The second piece is the ‘Song of the river in Karamoja, Uganda.’ Fanshawe writes above it place in the score,

‘Each song is beautiful, like a prayer. Each song is itself a Lord’s Prayer.’

If the idea of a Pastoral idyll called Holy Africa seems naïve given the sombre recent history of much of the continent then perhaps the point to be considered is that Fanshawe is calling us to a defiantly positive view of African life and is making the listener consider some of the innumerable good things of Africa. The ‘Song of the River’ is as delightful as it’s name suggests and
one of the most interesting recordings in purely musicological terms. Mostly instrumental, the voices and percussion form a supporting act to a polyphonic dance between three wind instruments (Fanshawe does not record their names.) Each is of a different range and timbre as one might expect of a Western wind ensemble and they each play a series of interlocking ostinato patterns that fully arrest the listener’s attention. (See figure 3.16) The ‘Turkana cattle song’ sounds very similar to the ‘Milking song’ and Fanshawe writes little beyond the date of it’s recording.

Figure 3.16. ‘Chants and Songs’

The final piece is the ‘Luo ritual burial dance from Lake Victoria,’ about which Fanshawe writes,
The Luo ritual burial dance, western Kenya, is the actual music of the Hippo Man’ front cover logo of African Sanctus. This vital dance signifies the tragic disappearance of traditional folk music in Africa.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 173)

The Hippo man is seen on the front cover of most scores and C.D’s of African Sanctus and is something of a talisman in Fanshawe’s autobiography. His dance has an air of sombre piety about it but still has an energy typical of Fanshawe’s recordings. Fanshawe’s concern for the future of African folk music is touching and he of course deserves a great deal of credit for the way in which he has contributed to the preservation of much of it. Every bit as eminent an ethnomusicologist as a composer, the cynic might say more so, Fanshawe here presents alongside his own worthy creation a set of living symbols of the beauty of African musical culture.

The Liturgy Returns

The eleventh movement is the ‘Agnus Dei’ (Lamb of God.) The text takes the form of a prayer used during the mass. It consists of three separate recitations of the phrase ‘Lamb of God, who takes away the sins of the world,’ followed the first two times by ‘have mercy on us,’ and the third time by ‘grant us peace.’ Fanshawe writes,

‘In the Agnus Dei a final Kyrie I reflect on my journeys that gave birth to African Sanctus. Man’s suffering, tribal differences and injustice are now represented by the sound of distant War Drums recorded in the desert of East Sudan: O Lamb of God, who takest away the sins of the world, have mercy upon us.’ (Fanshawe 1979:174)

The burial dance from the preceding movement fades in the start of this movement, which is the playing of the above-mentioned War Drums. This is a recording that fits undemonstratively around Fanshawe’s setting of the ‘Agnus Dei.’ This setting is an interesting one as Fanshawe insists that the choir sing together but happily grants them leave to not follow the tempo exactly, observing that every performance is bound to vary. This principle is certainly in keeping with his love of the ‘organic’ and semi-improvised nature of much of African music. The piano plays a part composed largely of steady pulsing quavers. Fanshawe suggests that the pianist recite the words silently so as not to
lose their way, exhibiting on a small scale the close relation in
African music between percussion and the Human voice. He also
writes a part for the lead guitar that consists chiefly of a series
of semibreves that are to played quietly and in a manner that is
‘very warm and sustained.’ The ‘War Drums can be heard in the
background for most though not all of the movement. Fanshawe’s
material has, as it’s main point of interest the soprano solo.
Beginning at performance mark B on page 179, this reaches its
melodious peak just after performance mark L on page 186
running to the end on page 188. Fanshawe writes above the line
that it is a ‘solo of triumph,’ which,

‘Must be very operatic, sung with dedication, conviction and
vision.’ (Fanshawe 1979:188)

The movement has no end as such but instead fades seamlessly
into the twelfth movement, which is a return of, the ‘Kyrie: Call
to Prayer.’ The ‘War Drums’ fade out as the Islamic muezzin
recording returns. In a performance note at the bottom of page
188, Fanshawe advises that,

‘If there is a slight delay during which the recorded War Drums
sound solo it does not matter, however, the Muezzin must enter
after Soprano solo and not before. The dramatic link from Latin
to Arabic reiterates the fundamental harmony of ‘AFRICAN
SANCTUS.’ (Fanshawe 1979: 188)

The point is well made and I would select the transition between
these sections as about my favourite part of the work. The
powerful drama of the contrast then gives way to a beautiful a
capella section toward the end of movement twelve.

Finale

The thirteenth and final movement is the ‘Finale and Gloria.’
This is essentially a reworking of movements one and eight,
albeit with more extravagant dynamics and a gradual accelerando
leading up to the climactic finish. The reciting of the Sanctus
theme with the ‘Bwala dance’ three times during the work is in
my view, symbolic of the Christian doctrine of the Holy Trinity.
Fanshawe is fond of such symbolism, pointing out that the
‘Sanctus Journey’ drew the shape of cross on a map of Africa and
the Middle East. (Fanshawe 1979: 2) The concept of a finale is
odd in a liturgical context but then this whole work is something
of a revolution against constraints, whether they are political,
religious or artistic.

66
The movement begins with the apt instruction, ‘with Power, Rhythm and Exuberance’ and continues in the reassuringly familiar way. The percussionists also join in with a slightly separate offering which might best be classified as ‘Afro-pop,’ which consists of drum rolls that are required to ‘augment the spirit of ‘Bwala.’ (See figure 3.17)

Figure 3.17. ‘The Spirit of Bwala’
There is little that the audience has not already heard and the final rendition has something of the feel of an audience-participation encore at the end of a theatrical production. However there is to be one last musical hurrah! At performance mark K on page 219 and continuing to the end is a grand recital of the text of the Gloria with the African tape still playing. The tempo slows down in order that the dynamics may increase to a majestic swell. (See figure 3.18)

Figure 3.18. ‘Triumphant expression’
The choir and percussion parts are all tutti and the piano has a series of marcato-headed octave spread chords to play. At performance mark L, ‘Gloria in excelsis’ is heard one last time followed by the last gesture of all (marked sforzando in every part,) ‘Sanctus, Sanctus, Sanctus Dominus!’ (Holy Holy Holy Lord.) Fanshawe writes on the last two pages,

‘Glory to the Acholi Bwala Dancers! Glory to Africa!... I love the World. David Fanshawe. (Fanshawe 1979: 223)

Each part also has a signature in the form of a drawing of a cartoon camel, chosen by Fanshawe as the emblem for his travels, representing the tiring journeys made on the back of a camel. (See figure 3.19) Figure 3.19.‘Finale and Cartoons’
Interpreting ‘African Sanctus’

So how can a conclusion to an examination of ‘African Sanctus’ be managed? If listeners take the view of cross-culturalism in music recommended to them by Steve Reich, then it will be tempting to dismiss Fanshawe’s work as a well-intentioned, even charismatic effort that fails to impress as a masterpiece because it lacks rigour and sophistication, not least in terms of it’s handling of African material. In my conversations with Geoffrey Poole we discussed this very issue and he admitted to being a little annoyed with the way that the African recordings were considered part of Fanshawe’s composition. Although they are folk material, they are, far enough back in time, somebody’s creation and it seems just a little disrespectful to overlook the fact. My own view which, as will become clear, is nowhere close to being as critical as it sounds is that ‘African Sanctus’ is a colossal mess of a piece that frustrates, subverts and confounds in nearly every movement.

Yet there is a problem with leaving a conclusion to rest with this ‘chaos theory.’ The problem is the international acclaim given the piece from its creation to the present day. The subject of a major B.B.C documentary and a book by Fanshawe, ‘African Sanctus’ has been performed many times around the world by august choirs and released on C.D by sensible commercial record labels. The piece has something about it or it would not enjoy such popularity. One might argue that it fits into a twentieth century tradition of the unorthodox, even radical oratorio. Examples of this sub-genre might fairly include Tippett’s ‘A Child of Our Time’ or Britten’s ‘War Requiem.’ It may very well also be that many listeners were impressed by the beautiful idealism of the works religious synthesis and exciting form of multi-culturalism. These two reasons combined will amount to a good understanding of the cause of the popularity of ‘African Sanctus.’ They do not however in my view do the work sufficient justice.

I should therefore like to advance a hypothesis for the interpretation of the piece. Which is, that it should be regarded as a work of theology. Not simply a religious work or a musical meditation but actually in its very substance a major work of theology. This view helps to explain the apparent oddness of the work beyond dismissing its composer as one of life’s eccentrics. There is something deeply unusual about ‘African Sanctus.’ The score is littered with anecdotes and musings and the material leaps across continents and faiths (not to mention tonalities) with blissful readiness. Despite all previous explanation for these things they remain hard to fathom if we think in purely
musicological terms. In contrast if the clues are filtered through
the exegetical methods of theology then a much clearer picture of
the work’s meaning may be arrived at. It is a potentially
controversial opinion and without wishing to indulge a major
tangent I feel that the foundation to the argument needs to be
well established.

Mythos and Logos

Ever since the dawn of the scientific revolution in Europe there
has been a tendency, admittedly not universal, but found both
among religious believers and sceptics to approach religion in a
vigorously academic, even empirical fashion. This has led to the
many unsavoury and unhelpful debates between faith and the
natural sciences, the most common being the seeming difficulty
between the theory of evolution and biblical account of creation.
However, an examination of the history of religious thought
reveals that in the pre-modern era there existed much more
subtle, nuanced and allegorical means of understanding religious
stories that were explicitly married to systems of ethical and
ritual activity. In short, religion was a symbolic, aesthetic and
practical discipline more akin to the language of the arts than to
the language of science and politics. Amid the modern scenarios
of trouble, debate and conflict between religions and between
faith and the secular age, one can still find plentiful examples of
the older religious ideas. It is my contention that ‘African
Sanctus’ is just such an example.

Really Means,’ the religious historian Karen Armstrong explores
some of these relevant ideas at great length with a view to
showing how many ancient metaphysical concepts could offer a
rich synthesis with our modern worldview. She writes,

‘In most pre-modern cultures there were two recognised ways of
thinking, speaking and acquiring knowledge. The Greeks called
them ‘Mythos’ and ‘Logos.’ Both were essential and neither was
considered superior to the other... Logos (reason) was the
pragmatic mode of thought that enabled people to function
effectively in the world... but it could not assuage human grief or
find ultimate meaning in life’s struggles. For that people turned
to ‘Mythos’ (myth.) Mythos helped people to live creatively in
our confusing world, though in a different way. It was never
intended as an accurate account of a historical event; it was
something that had in some sense happened but also happens all
the time. Put into practice, a myth was something that could tell
us something profoundly true about our humanity... religion
therefore is a practical discipline that teaches us to discover new capacities of mind and heart. (Armstrong 2009: 3-4)

One of the ideas that emerged from examining Geoffrey Poole’s writing was his attachment to the idea of the ‘primal cry.’ For all western music is intellectually sophisticated it sometimes seems to lack in its abstraction the raw, organic power of African music. In Fanshawe’s work this idea is taken further. African Sanctus is bursting with the vitality of traditional African culture, its music, dance, and social communion is heard and glorified. And, at the same time the rich heritage of sacred Western music, which is among the best of our cultural achievements, is heard also. In light of Armstrong’s remarks I will claim that ‘African Sanctus’ is a work of religious mythos. It sounds strange in an era when the western art music tradition is still at least in part, attracted to a broadly modernist, anti-romanticism paradigm. Yet, because Fanshawe appeals to human instincts beyond the purely rational, ‘African Sanctus’ works. It is the ‘magnum opus’ of the primal cry and this explains why I am so deeply moved by it even when its material is so clearly flawed.

Music as the Voice of God

I must still press my theological claim. Armstrong, in no way a musical scholar by training has this to say,

‘Music has always been inseparable from religious experience, because, like religion at its best, music marks the limits of reason... It is the most corporeal of the arts: it is produced by breath, voice, horsehair, guts and skins and reaches resonances in our bodies at level deeper than will or consciousness...it is also highly cerebral yet this intensely rational activity segues into transcendence. Music goes beyond the reach of words: it is not about anything... it brings both pleasure and insight. In music subjective and objective become one...Hence all art constantly aspires to the condition of music; so too, at its best, does theology.’ (Armstrong 2009: 6)

For Armstrong, and for Fanshawe music and religion both have their roots deep in the human psyche, an area where words cannot penetrate. Yet neither is inward looking exclusively, both are fully part of the world around us and the rich symbols they create are intended as our projection and expression of meaning and value. They point us to an awareness of reality at its fullest in a way that the sciences for all their undoubted grandeur cannot.
They amount to what the Greeks called ‘ekstasis,’ the stepping outside or transcending of oneself.

In light of this I will return to Fanshawe’s comment about his response to recording the four men in a trance chanting. His comment ‘in the wilderness I confronted God the Creator, and became very moved and was inspired,’ now has a clearer meaning. It is Fanshawe’s description of an ‘ekstasis,’ a mystical experience that makes sense at a level beyond rationality. Plainly he did not encounter God in the way that he encountered his friends at home. The traditions of Judaeo-Christian and Islamic theology all make clear that God is not a word that should be used to mean a large, powerful supernatural being but instead should be used as a symbolic signpost to an ultimate universal reality of what Armstrong calls ‘indescribable transcendence.’ (Armstrong 2009: 268) The creator that Fanshawe encounters is the source of all that is. The idea is hard to express in words as my attempt shows. Fanshawe does it with music.

Should this mean that we downgrade the significance of the African in ‘African Sanctus?’ I would argue not. What Reich called exoticism, is for Fanshawe a form of ekstasis, the encountering of something new and beautiful. In Africa he found a treasure trove of cultural riches that illuminated to him the possibility of a life lived more fully with nature and our fellow humankind. This re-imagining of ourselves in light of what we encounter in others is what the early theologians called ‘coincidentia oppositorum,’ a sense of paradox where we discover that differences between phenomena, that seem irreconcilable, have in fact a profound underlying unity. So, for my purposes, where the musicologist may baulk at the thought of the tonal, timbral, and formal chasms between African and European musical traditions being exuberantly thrown together, Fanshawe saw, in what I believe to be theological terms, a greater aesthetic collage. The throwing together of seeming opposites reaches its fullest sense in ‘African Sanctus’ when the singing of Christian and Islamic liturgy, both in praise of the same One God, is revealed to sound so harmonious, both musically and metaphorically.

Musical Pilgrimage

I also feel that Africa is for Fanshawe a great shrine for making musical pilgrimage too. Armstrong talks at length about the ancient idea of ‘Sacred Geography,’ the practice of treating a certain location with deep reverence and imbibing it with important ritual significance. Fanshawe’s ‘Holy Africa’ is a
modern incarnation of this idea and African Sanctus stands as the
testament of a pilgrim.

Of course there are many people of a secular persuasion who
will regard many of these ideas as incoherent and absurd. The
practice of music and religion both offer experiences that can
only be achieved through dedication. The euphoria experienced
by delivering a faultless performance of a masterpiece is not
available to those who have not dedicated significant time and
energy to musical training. The idea of God will make little sense
to anyone who does not think hard about what this actually
means.

So there are several levels at which people may appreciate
‘African Sanctus’ and it is not for anyone to say that any one of
them is superior to any other. Like other forms of scripture, it is
difficult to interpret but the attempt is worth it. Armstrong
describes how the early exegetes had a three-fold plan for
understanding a scriptural passage; the literal sense, which could
be plainly read by anyone literate, the moral sense, which was
open to those who appreciate metaphor as a tool for
comprehending the deeper lesson that the author was teaching
and finally the spiritual sense, which was only really accessible
to those who could feel that claims of a confrontation with God
the creator constituted far more than evidence of hallucination.

The literal sense of ‘African Sanctus’ is that it is a charismatic
and highly unorthodox oratorio that sits somewhere between
sacred music, neo-romanticism and the appreciation of folk music
traditions.

The moral sense of ‘African Sanctus’ is that it is a celebration
of many different musical and religious cultures coming together.
This contains radical, political ideas concerning notions of
justice and peace between nations and the need to conserve the
fragile treasures of nature and human culture.

The spiritual sense of ‘African Sanctus’ is that it may just be
that music is in some sense the voice of God. For the truth of this
claim I appeal to the first four and last four words written by
David Fanshawe in his score.

‘AFRICAN SANCTUS represents belief...I Love the World!’
(Fanshawe 1979: 223)

Comments on Cross-Culturalism in my own work

Having explored the works of other composers and
musicologists, it now seems reasonable and relevant to draw this
thesis to its conclusion by discussing my own work as a composer
and practicing musician and how it relates to the theme of cross-
culturalism. My first confession is that I am drawn to the exotic but not really to exoticism. By this I mean that I have a fascination with the sounds (and sights and smells) of other countries and cultures and a desire to understand what I am able to about ‘the music of the other,’ but that this does not provoke in me any wish to compose overtly hybridised ‘travelogue’ music. In fact although I am willing to listen to any music from anywhere in the world, the number of musics that I am interested in engaging with compositionally is limited. For instance although I find the Indian Raga and Tala fascinating, I cannot say for sure that I would know how to go about using them in my own work. Reich’s idea about confirmation does hold true. There are musics that excite me on general or anthropological grounds, provoking an ethnomusicological engagement, and those that excite specifically on compositional ones, provoking first the ethnomusicology, then compositional activity.

I am also impressed with Poole’s idea of identifying vocalities that speak to us as composers. I have had since childhood a tendency to think of musical instruments, melodies and rhythms in at least quasi-anthropomorphic terms and whilst it is of course not scientifically true that an instrument has a personality or a soul, I feel that the idea has a metaphysical and poetic beauty to it. And so, wherever I encounter a musical character that I am moved to work with, I shall try to do so. This approach is necessarily open to the possibility of cross-culturalism. It is blind to arbitrary lines drawn on a map and is, whilst sensitive the ethics of representation, inclined towards a libertarian, communal approach to ownership of cultural material.

There is another sense in which pursuing the ‘spiritual voice’ of musical material actively lends itself to cross-culturalism. This is the prevalence of ideas similar to it among Non-Western musical cultures. In West Africa for example there is a tradition known as ‘Talking Drums.’ This tradition is discussed by Terry E. Miller and Andrew Shahriari in ‘World Music: A Global Journey.’

‘In Ghana, drums are often used as surrogates for speech to give the words more power... Language is an integral part of music performance in Africa. Many African languages are tonal, meaning that the intonation of the voice is as important to the meaning as the phonemes used... In Ghana a drum capable of tone bending is used to imitate the rising and falling inflections of the voice... The messages conveyed by the ‘talking drum’ also have a deeper level of symbolic meaning that is unintelligible to cultural outsiders. The attempt to understand the extra-musical aspects of musical performance is one of the most fascinating
challenges of ethnomusicology.' (Miller and Shahriari. 2006: 236-9)

I dispute that the deeper meaning is unintelligible to outsiders. With dedication and practice the interested Western musician may well be able to discern to a limited extent the meaning. This of course requires a willingness to immerse oneself in the cultural realities of the music one admires; to whatever extent one is able. Following Poole’s line of argument I would claim that if a composer is drawn both to the aesthetic beauty and the cultural metaphysics of a music and can see how their creativity can be informed by it then they should be free to proceed. Poole certainly did as much in his composition ‘Two-Way Talking’ which involves a collection of Western classical ensembles playing alongside a partially improvising African master drummer. The reference to the ‘Talking drum’ is implied by the title whilst ‘Two-Way’ highlights the sonic and philosophical marriage of European harmony with African percussion.

I am personally inspired by the metaphysical richness of so much Non-Western music, which to reassert an earlier point, seems alive with religious, communal and environmental resonance. Furthermore I frequently find that some musical material affects me to the extent of wanting to collaborate with it in my compositional practice. It seems to me, a legitimate manifestation of influence.

Prelude and Meditation

To illustrate how my cross-cultural interests appear in my own music I will look at my composition ‘Prelude and Meditation,’ which constitutes the second volume of this thesis. The piece was composed for the Okeanos ensemble, which consists of Western and Japanese instruments. The precise line up I chose for the work was Shakuhachi, Clarinet in Bb, Viola, Koto and Shamisen. The Shakuhachi appealed to me because unlike the Western Flute, it does not seem to pitch notes exactly. There is a resonance about the instrument that for me is more reminiscent of human breath than the orchestral wind instruments. In terms of an instrument’s voice having a character, the Shakuhachi strikes me as being serene but melancholy and the melodic lines I wrote for it are intended as a reflective song or prayerful invocation upon which the rest of the piece is based. From conversation with the players there emerged a feeling that there must be a sensitivity shown to the Japanese instruments in terms of their cultural origin. It seems, that as with many other traditional Non-Western cultures, technological innovation and the abstraction of sound is
eschewed in favour, firstly of sounds more familiar in nature and secondly in the preservation of tradition.

The Shamisen is noted for being a popular instrument in traditional Japanese music. It is a three-stringed instrument whose timbre reminded me on first hearing it of the visually similar Russian Balalaika. It can produce an enjoyable buzzing noise alongside its attacking staccato sound. I felt it lent itself to a supporting role, at least in the early stages of the piece, acting as the punctuation between the Shakuhachi phrases. The Koto I would describe, far from expertly, as a horizontal harp. Its timbre is not as piercing as the Shamisen and so I felt that it might serve after the Shakuhachi as the provider of melody, its character seeming to be livelier. The Clarinet was used mainly to double the Shakuhachi line, not for any competitive reason but more simply that I enjoyed how the different timbres would sound together. In particular there are phrases and motifs where one seems to dominate the other. Finally the Viola was chosen to provide a thickening of the harmony and in places to add colour to the piece. It has, in my view, the required serene beauty to it.

Both harmonically and melodically the piece stays loyal to pentatonic modal tuning, (although the arrangement of some parts, especially the Shamisen, requires the scoring of ‘non-canonical’ notes for ease of reading.) The scale chosen is one of Japanese origin and it consists of the notes G, A, Bb, D, Eb. It is a partially flattened variant of the more ubiquitous scale D, F, G, A, C.

The piece is divided into two halves. The ‘Prelude’ lasts from bar 1-67 and the ‘Meditation’ lasts from bar 68 to the end of the piece. I have avoided any banal view of meditation as being something necessarily quiet, static and ethereal and have instead preferred what I hope is a more nuanced interpretation. Which is, that as an experience both physical and psychological, a meditation can be loud and have elements of drama and tension as part of the intended emotional transformation. In thinking this I perhaps demonstrated an unconscious support for David Fanshawe’s approach to musical meditation in ‘African Sanctus,’ which sees tension and clashes between different musical parts or passages as part of the spiritual process.

Therefore, the ‘Prelude is the least dramatic of the two halves. The original plan was to have seventeen distinct fragments based around the structure of the famous Japanese poetic form, the ‘Haiku,’ which has three lines of five syllables, seven syllables and five syllables. Imitating this structure musically would be a form of cultural integration that I imagine Steve Reich would be quite happy with since it need not directly affect the sound produced. This original plan has survived nearly intact, but not
quite. Complete pauses may well be acceptable in speech but in a musical piece such as this, which aims to create an ineffable atmosphere, complete interruption of sound does not work. Even in the original score, linking passages between the phrases had been devised and in the amended score I have sought to elaborate on these.

Each fragment is composed largely of a melodic phrase from the Shakuhachi. (See figure 4.1)

Figure 4.1. ‘Opening system with Shakuhachi phrase’

These phrases are short and were intended to be conceivably playable within one breath. Out of the respect for the effort required from the player, and in certain instances for aesthetic reasons, I have not made a dogmatic position of this and so both rests and slightly longer phrases appear in the score. (See figure 4.2)

Figure 4.2. ‘Extended Shakuhachi phrase’
The idea of one breath is derived from a desire to experiment with the previously mentioned idea of unique characters being contained within vocalities. I do not regard this piece as being abstract, rather it is intended that there is an emotional drama contained within it. This is not theatrical music and it does not describe a recognisable plot, but there is I hope a sense of linearity about it. Since meditation is an activity carried out by people, I mean the piece to carry the connotation of representing the activity being carried out. It is up to the individual listener whether they choose to imagine the meditation and spiritual reflection of a created character or whether they wish to listen to the music themselves in a meditative fashion. Each phrase or ‘breath’ is followed by short motifs from the Shamisen, sometimes just a single bar in length. (See figure 4.3) These are intended as punctuation at the end of the phrase, not in a precise grammatical sense but to make clear the distinction between phrases and the metaphor of the ‘breathing Shakuhachi. The ‘Prelude’ comes to an end with a diminuendo beginning at bar 64 and a rallentando also. The period of calm reflection in the ‘Prelude’ thus comes to an end, the ‘breathing exercise is finished and the gathered up energy can now be spent.

Figure 4.3. ‘Shamisen fragment’

The ‘Meditation’ transfers the task of being the busiest instrument to the Koto, which is handed almost continuous quaver patterns to play. The whole texture though is thickened out so all the instruments have much more to do. The role of the Shamisen in this section is broadly one of support for the Koto and the emphasising of some its material. (See figure 4.4) The Western instruments duty is one of providing colour in the piece.
I have not deliberately sought to marginalise Western instruments to favour Japanese ones but I do feel that there is a need for the Western composer (and the Non-Western composer too) to honour their ‘guests’ if they have a cross-cultural dialogue in their work.

Figure 4.4. ‘Koto quavers in Meditation’

The model of influence manifestation

In a sense I have combined the intellectual/aesthetic and cultural/aesthetic approaches in this single piece. Structurally, the piece has a sense of linear progression that is far more akin to Western music than traditional Japanese music. Indeed the ‘Meditation’ is in two halves, the first being a repeat of the second, with a concluding section at the end. Yet, whilst I have avoided stasis, I have to admit that this idea of cyclical repetition with varied dynamics and tempo in my music owes as much to my knowledge and enjoyment of the Balungan structure of Javanese Gamelan and the mesmerising discipline of West African percussion music, as it does to my conventional Western musical education.

In terms of the soundworld, the use of Japanese instruments and a traditional Japanese pentatonic mode gives the piece an Oriental flavour. However, any melody I create will owe a profound amount to my preference in Western music for pre-modernist and post-modernist tonal music. There is a particular motif I composed which I think stands out as a moment of purely Western melody. It appears frequently in the ‘Meditation,’ in particular being present in four parts in bars 84 and 85. (See figure 4.5)
This serves as a climactic high point in the piece (this in itself is a Western idea.) The motif works at this point, but in the concluding part of the piece in bars 104 and 105 the motif is heard just in the clarinet part. (See figure 4.6)

Divorced from strong dynamics and an almost tutti texture, the motif sounds obtrusively Western, so much so that in the amended score these two bars were the first I addressed. I suspect that the mix of instrumental timbres in bars 84 and 85 prevented the relationship between East and West becoming imbalanced and irritating.
So the aesthetics and ethics of cross-culturalism are such fragile treasures that even within two bars of music the results can constitute a success or a failure. I feel that ‘Prelude and Meditation’ works, both as an example of cross-culturalism and as a piece in general because I have not let either cultural tradition encroach upon the other. Synthesis between the two exists, as I have shown, at different levels. In the instrumentation, texture, structure and overall soundworld, East and West are both present, neither dominating the other, with my superior knowledge of Western music tempered by my desire to handle the Japanese elements with as much respect and good sense as possible.

Conclusion: Present day Assessments and Future Predictions

As this study comes to an end I must assess what value remains for my model of influence manifestation. Drawing on the work of Aubert, an eminent and contemporary ethnomusicologist, I sought to produce a model that was specifically related to engagements with Non-Western music by Western composers, rather than Westerners in general. The categorisation between intellectual/aesthetic and cultural/aesthetic pathways was based partly on my own inclinations as a musician and a student of both composition and ethnomusicology, and also on the writings or various relevant composers. It struck me that every single composer of cross-cultural music that I researched had felt some need to explain or even justify their interaction with Non-Western music, in some cases as though criticism or bewilderment was inevitable. For some of them, particularly Reich and Roosenschoon, there clearly is a sense of the polemical about their writings. It is because almost everyone involved with cross-cultural composition seems to have different ideas, sometimes radically so, about how good or bad a thing it is or how to go about doing it, that I thought it essential that all my chosen case studies were sent through some form of categorisation process in order to clarify what the schools of thought, however broadly defined might be.

Does my model work? The answer I feel is yes or no depending on how you approach it. The answer no might be justified because some of the pieces, especially the more recent ones I have considered, including my own piece ‘Prelude and Meditation,’ (2011) seem to transcend a sharp distinction between a Non-Western influence manifested in cognitive and structural terms and an influence manifested in the soundworld of a piece.
Final examples

Geoffrey Poole was, when I questioned him about it, of the opinion that the two approaches might exist within a single work. Indeed his 'Two-Way Talking' (1991) leans heavily towards the cultural/aesthetic approach in terms of soundworld, but is still a recognisable Poole composition with Western notation, dynamics and overarching structure all present. He even calls the piece a concerto, showing an acknowledgement of Western musical form. He is most precise in performance instructions about the layout of the instruments. (See figure 5.1)

Figure 5.1. ‘Layout for Two-Way Talking’

Despite this, he allows a considerable amount of leeway in terms of improvised material to the African master-drummer. (See
Figure 5.2) and includes some instructions that are reminiscent of Fanshawe's exuberant 'Africanisms.' (See figure 5.3)
Figure 5.2. 'Master Drummers semi-improvised part'
In his essay Poole talked about this piece, and the intended homage of the Westerner to African culture is made most manifest in the list of the names of the movements. (See figure 5.4)

Figure 5.4. 'Titles of movements'

1. AKOM (traditional master drummer plus ensembles).
2. TWO-WAY TALKING (organised improvised interaction of drums and groups).
3. MANY TONGUES ONE GOD (without drummer)
   a) rueful East European heterophony
   b) far-away strains of melody.
      Master drummer traditional song, ensemble responses.
4. TIGARE (traditional master drummer plus ensembles).
5. ROUND DANCE
   a) effect of Central African pentatonic horn ensembles processing in circle, with master drummer and double bass conversing.
   b) Kora effect from harp and xylophone, African falling melodies collapses into held chord for:
6. INVOCATION (traditional calling of the Chief of All Music).
7. FONTOFROM (traditional master drummer plus grotesque ensembles).
Again, Poole’s ‘Swans Reflecting Elephants,’ (2004) a commissioned piece for Orchestra with Javanese Gamelan leans, in my view, more towards the intellectual/aesthetic model. Once again, Poole is very precise about the layout of instruments (See figure 5.5.)

Figure 5.5. ‘Layout of Swans Reflecting Elephants’

Clearly the title and the instrumentation have a cultural resonance with Indonesia and the Gamelan tradition, but the piece itself, including the Gamelan instrumental parts, is scored for Western notation (see figure 5.6) and the tunings of all instruments are amended where necessary in order not to clash
(Slendro, for example, one of the two principal Gamelan scales is a pentatonic mode but one that does not fully align with Western tuning systems). (See figure 5.7) The structure of the piece is not littered with recognisable Javanese features such as Balungan and Gotro. On listening to the piece I am inclined to hear something more along the lines of a contemporary symphonic tone poem than any hybrid form of composition.

Figure 5.6. 'Gamelan parts in Western notation'
Notes

Tuning

Swans Reflecting Elephants makes use of both the sets of instruments used by Javanese Gamelans: Pelog (irregular 7 note scale) and Slendro (almost regular 5 note scale).

Gamelan players normally prefer numerical notation to pitch notation, as will be discussed below. This piece makes the assumption that 6 in Pelog and 6 in Slendro are tuned close to concert A flat. This is the case with the South Bank Gamelan and most Javanese gamelans in the UK, with the Manchester Gamelan some 20 cents sharper and the Javanese Embassy Gamelan 15 cents flatter than A flat (100 cents = one semitone; 20 cents deviation is acceptable).

The Western orchestra is required sometimes to play in normal diatonic tuning, and sometimes in unison with either Pelog or Slendro as indicated. Given the variety of tunings that might be applicable (not only to 6 but to the variety of relative tuning within each Gamelan built), I have decided against over-prescriptive microtonal indications in score and parts. The Western players will be given a tuning chart appropriate to the gamelan concerned for each performance.

The Gamelan parts are notated in staff notation for the benefit of the conductor and others reading the full score, but my thanks go to John Dawson for re-transcribing the parts into numerical notation.

The following notational conventions have been applied: it is important that they are properly interpreted by the conductor and all performers.

For the Gamelan in Pelog:
1 is notated in the score as D, 2 as E, 3 F, 4 G, 5 A, 6 B, 7 C.

For the Orchestra when directed to play in Pelog tuning:
Microtonal adjustments should be made by careful listening.
D must be tuned to the Gamelan's 1, F semi-flat to 2, E to 3, G sharp to 4, A to 5, B flat to 6.

C (or C semi-sharp) to 7.
Note that 4 and 7 are 'rogue' tones, seldom used in traditional music.

For the Gamelan in Slendro:
1 is notated in the score as E, 2 D, 3 E, 5 G, 6 A

For the Orchestra when directed to play in Slendro tuning:
C must be tuned to the Gamelan's 1, E-flat to 2, F to 3, A-flat to 4, D-flat to 5.
(Note there is an 'E' in Slendro)
The model seems to be inadequate if we attempt to apply it to these more recent pieces but in the case of Steve Reich the sharp distinctions are accurate. During the late 1960’s and early 1970’s when Reich was formulating his ideas on cross-culturalism he was firmly wedded to what I have called the intellectual/aesthetic approach. He only abandoned this approach in the sense that his compositional interests developed elsewhere, and so we never hear a Reich piece that would go as far as Geoffrey Poole in engaging with Non-Western timbres and traditions. As I have previously claimed Reich’s stance was founded partly on the fact that he was effectively pioneering contemporary cross-cultural composition. It was also the case that he had no real interest in following the music of the Classical and Romantic period. The musical culture in which he was raised was modernist and I would suggest that despite his strong criticism of serialism for example, he thought about Non-Western music in a manner not too distinct from how his teachers thought about Western music. I have claimed that in ‘African Sanctus’ David Fanshawe transcended what I have called the cultural/aesthetic approach. Yet if it has to be categorised, his work is closest to the cultural/aesthetic model and is utterly irreconcilable with Reich’s approach.

So my model of influence manifestation works best if it is considered as a historical, maybe even chronological tool for understanding the development of cross-cultural ideas amongst late twentieth century Western art music composers. To this end it is useful but, like Aubert, I am happy to acknowledge the limitations of my model and the scope for further research.

Conclusion

There is one final question I would like to address. At the beginning I argued that the interested composer should ask why there is any desire or need for cross-cultural music. I hope that I have managed to present the arguments and choose the sources necessary to demonstrate the validity of the practice and understand something of its nature and scope. But the question might be put in personal terms to me. Why do I wish to engage with Non-Western music so much? I am after all versed in the glories of the Western art music tradition and am not especially enamoured with any post-modern, left wing multi-cultural political theories.

The answer is that I believe every composer begins their musical career in childhood as an enthusiastic and curious listener to the
sounds around them. The best of them will never give up that habit of listening to new music enthusiastically. In my case I am the product of an increasingly diverse society and a world made smaller by technology. I refuse to make political statements on this point; rather I wish to simply acknowledge it as a fact. I do not have to travel far from my home, indeed I do not technically even need to leave it at all to be exposed to sounds from all over the world. Since childhood I have regularly heard church choirs singing sacred choral music and had piano lessons on the works of the great masters. In my teenage years I was exposed to rock bands and jazz musicians. Growing up in a large city I have heard buskers and street musicians, indeed it was there that I first heard the sounds of Africa. And at university it all began to assemble into a coherent whole. There is plenty of music that I do not like and plenty that I do but I have simply never felt any need to draw a line between Western and Non-Western music. The composers of the future will, I predict, find that plurality comes more easily to them than it did to their predecessors. They can travel more easily around the world in search of its music. And the music of the world can more easily come to them.
Bibliography


COMPOSING WITH ANTHROPOLOGY: THE MANIFESTATION OF INFLUENCE IN INTERACTIONS BETWEEN WESTERN AND NON-WESTERN MUSIC

RICHARD DASHWOOD

A thesis submitted to the University of Huddersfield
In partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Art by Research

The University of Huddersfield

August 2011

Volume II of II

‘PRELUDE AND MEDITATION’
List of Contents

‘Prelude and Meditation’

Original Score beginning on page 94
Amended Score beginning on page 101

With a supplementary CD
The wavy lines in the Shakuhachi part indicate ornamentation that is idiomatic to that instrument. The resulting sound is much like vibrato. Straight lines indicate a break in the use of this technique.

Prelude and Meditation.

Richard Dashwood.
The wavy lines in the Shakuhachi part indicate a ornamentation that is idiomatic to that instrument. The resulting sound is much like vibrato. Straight lines indicate a break in the use of this technique.

Prelude and Meditation.

(amended score)